JAMES HOGG'S FICTION AND THE PERIODICALS

Gillian Hilda Hughes

Ph.D.
University of Edinburgh
1981
I declare that this thesis has been composed by myself and that the work is also my own. Acknowledgements are made in the appropriate footnotes.

G. H. Hughes
Acknowledgements

I owe a debt of gratitude to many who have enabled me to present this thesis. My first thanks must go to Dr Ian Campbell, my supervisor, for the readiness with which he has always been available to give me the benefit of his advice and experience.

I am glad to acknowledge assistance from several libraries in addition. I wish to thank the staff of the Library of the University of Edinburgh, particularly those dealing with Inter-Library Loans and Rare Books, who were very helpful and patient in assisting me. I am grateful to the Trustees of the National Library of Scotland for permission to quote from the manuscripts in the library and from the attributions in the marked copy of The Spy there. The permission from St Andrews University Library to quote from the attributions in the marked copy of The Spy there is also much appreciated.

I would also like to thank various individual people for their help. Mr Douglas Mack very kindly allowed me to see material for a survey of letters by James Hogg, and, doubtless in addition to many others, I have found his scholarship an encouragement. Dr Elaine Petrie, besides the pleasure of our conversations together about Hogg, gave me an opportunity to read at my leisure her own copy of her thesis. Dr Robin Maclachlan generously allowed me to make a copy of his invaluable chronological bibliography of Hogg's prose. Miss Kirsty Ferguson gave me the benefit of her advice and taste on
several points regarding the physical presentation and neatness of my typescript. I appreciate the constant encouragement of Dr David Sweet, who also volunteered to perform the task of proof-reading my typescript.
## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acknowledgements</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Contents</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Abbreviations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter One: Becoming a Professional Writer</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Two: The Edinburgh Years and <em>The Spy</em></td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Three: The Effect of <em>Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine</em></td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Four: The Later Alternatives</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td>274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix: The Contemporary Reception of Hogg's Fiction</td>
<td>278</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>314</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviation</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Memoir or</td>
<td>James Hogg, Memoir of the Author's Life and Familiar Anecdotes of Sir Walter Scott, edited by Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh and London, 1972)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Familiar Anecdotes</td>
<td>Memoirs of James Hogg, the Ettrick Shepherd (Paisley and London, n.d.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Memorials</td>
<td>James Hogg, The Mountain Bard; consisting of Ballads and Songs, founded on Facts and Legendary Tales (Edinburgh, 1807)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wellesley Index</td>
<td>The Wellesley Index to Victorian Periodicals 1824-1900, edited by Walter E. Houghton and others (Toronto and London, 1966)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winter Evening Tales</td>
<td>James Hogg, Winter Evening Tales, collected among the Cottagers in the South of Scotland, 2 vols (Edinburgh and London, 1820)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ABSTRACT

A general preference for novels over shorter fiction has tended to obscure the extent to which James Hogg excels as a writer of short tales, many of which originally made their appearance as periodical contributions. Hogg wrote for various periodicals throughout his creative career, and in some cases the periodical version of a tale is to be preferred to that in collections of his work. This study examines the ways in which the periodicals of Hogg's own day influenced his tales in subject-matter, form, length, and quantity. In addition, the development of the periodical market is shown to have had a significant bearing upon the shape of Hogg's career.

Chapter One examines Hogg's upbringing and early self-education, and traces his earliest development as a writer of poetry and prose with particular reference to the influences of Scott and the Scots Magazine. Hogg's first important separate publication of 1807 is viewed as summarising the important features of this period of literary amateurism, and the section concludes with his decision to become a professional literary man.

In Chapter Two Hogg's efforts to make his way in Edinburgh as a professional writer under extremely unfavourable conditions are examined. Despite his apparent success as a writer of long narrative poems Hogg made several attempts at creating a periodical outlet for his work, the most significant of which is his own
periodical *The Spy*, in which he published his earliest known prose fiction. This periodical is seen as an individual variation of the well-known tradition of the British essay-periodical and as a forerunner of the weekly literary newspaper. Hogg's fiction for this paper is examined, and the relationship between it and the two first volume collections of fiction described.

The considerable effect of *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* on Hogg's fiction is the subject of Chapter Three. William Blackwood's adequate payments for magazine fiction increased the number of Hogg's periodical tales, and he was sometimes specifically identified with magazine fiction. As a representative of the newer type of magazine *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* provided Hogg with material for his writing, while its own local and intimate character made him appreciate the advantages for his fiction in a relatively informal narrator. Hogg's personality as the Shepherd and his fiction are discussed in the context of attempts in the magazine and by its chief contributors to define and support the national religion and the national character. Hogg's series 'The Shepherd's Calendar' is analysed within this magazine context.

Chapter Four details Hogg's attempts, only partially successful, to find an alternative periodical market for his tales during the last years of his life. The various limitations of the *Edinburgh Literary Journal* and *Chambers's Edinburgh Journal* in Edinburgh, and of the Annuals and *Fraser's Magazine* in London, are discussed for Hogg's fiction. As an imitation of *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* during its earlier years *Fraser's Magazine* was probably the most satisfactory of these, but none of the chief periodicals Hogg wrote for in his later years could replace it.
A substantial appendix gives a fresh account of the contemporary reception of Hogg's fiction, compiled partly by means of what may be deduced as to the sale of his fiction but chiefly consisting of analysis of reviews and comments in contemporary periodicals.
Though Hogg's connections with the periodicals of his day are often briefly acknowledged by critics of his fiction, they are not often given the weight and importance that is their due. Until the present century at least Hogg has been viewed almost exclusively as 'The Ettrick Shepherd', as a peasant poet in a category which was seen to include John Clare ('The Northamptonshire Peasant'), Robert Bloomfield ('The Suffolk Shoemaker'), and Allan Cunningham ('The Nithsdale Mason'). Similarly, Hogg was grouped with Cunningham, Gilfillan, Motherwell, and Tannahill, as a Scots poet writing songs and poems in imitation of Robert Burns with the hope of succeeding to his fame and place. Both of these classifications either ignore Hogg's fiction entirely, or regard it as peripheral to his real achievement. George Gilfillan's essay 'Allan Cunningham and the Rural Poets' may stand as a nineteenth-century example of this approach, but it has persisted down to the present as a study of 1973 demonstrates, which groups Hogg with Clare, Bloomfield, and Cunningham, and discusses only his poetry. Although much

twentieth-century criticism of Hogg's work has been much more favourable to his fiction, emphasis has generally been placed upon one longer work to the exclusion of some excellent shorter tales, many of which first appeared in contemporary periodicals. This stems largely from republications of Hogg's *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*, and from the fact that much of his other prose fiction is not readily available to the general reader. André Gide, while staying in Algiers in 1924, was sent a copy of T. Earle Welby's edition of that year, and naturally tended to see the work in isolation: he had difficulty in discovering information about Hogg from books or from friends, and so frankly admitted that he left 'to the learned the care of situating it in time and space, of finding parents for it, and of pointing out whence its roots derive'. His championship of the work gave it a reputation, but a reputation which tended to isolate it from the rest of Hogg's fiction. Gradually Hogg became widely recognised as a novelist as well as a poet, and *The Three Perils of Man; or, War, Women, and Witchcraft. A Border Romance* and *The Brownie of Bodsbek* were republished in 1972 and 1976 respectively. It is hoped that a modern, scholarly edition of Hogg's shorter fiction will eventually follow, and make a widespread reassessment of the entire body of Hogg's fiction more probable. Some of the best of


Hogg's tales are known widely only in bowdlerised versions, or have never been printed since their first appearance in various periodicals. Several scholarly studies of Hogg's work concentrate on his longer fiction, either alone or most usefully in connection with the poetry, some of them dealing only with *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*. Others deal with a wide range of the shorter fiction, but not specifically in the context of the periodicals in which much of it first appeared. Alan Lang Strout's work on Hogg and *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* stresses primarily Hogg's appearances there as the Shepherd of the *Noctea Ambrosianae*. Kilbourne's study of the role of fiction in the same magazine is illuminating on the commercial aspects of its subject, but favours the magazine's serials and series over its separate short

---

4 In this connection Douglas S. Mack's forthcoming selection of tales, to be edited for the Association for Scottish Literary Studies, will be a welcome beginning.

5 Robin MacLachlan, in 'The Literary Development of James Hogg' (unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, University of Stirling, 1977), places both poetry and prose in the context of the strengths and anxieties of Hogg's literary development, concentrating on these major works to achieve a separate publication. There are several studies treating of Hogg's best-known work of fiction alone, or placing it in a European context: examples of these respective approaches are Harry Bruder's 'Structuralism, Form, and the Individual Text: An Initial Reading of James Hogg's *Confessions of a Justified Sinner* (unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, University of Nebraska, Lincoln, 1976), and Susan Michelle Levin's 'The Art of Confession: A Study of Romantic Confessional Writing in France and in England' (unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, Columbia University, 1974).


7 A list of relevant publications by Strout will be found in the bibliography, pp. 336-37.
tales, and does not discuss Hogg's own fiction in any detail. Polsgrove's study contains a valuable discussion of the social and commercial reasons for the importance of short fiction in the magazines from 1820 to 1840, but in her section on Hogg she fails to relate the stories she discusses, those which appeared in *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, to their specific context of the magazine itself. It therefore seems worthwhile to consider the fiction Hogg wrote for various periodicals, not only that which appeared in *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, both in its commercial aspects and within the context of the aims and expectations of specific periodicals. Hogg wrote for periodicals throughout his creative career, from his first published piece, 'The Mistakes of a Night' in the *Scots Magazine* for October 1794, until the year of his death, and it is hardly surprising that the periodical market should have had an importance for his fiction that is worthy of detailed consideration.

Before proceeding to look at Hogg's earliest published work for the *Scots Magazine* it is helpful to look briefly once again at his education and life during the years preceding. Hogg's informal training in the traditions of the comparatively isolated Ettrick community has been properly demonstrated to be the foundation of almost all his later literary work, yet in some respects Hogg's

---


9 'The Mistakes of a Night', *Scots Magazine*, 56(1794), 624.
upbringing was unfavourable to his purely literary progress, and was felt to be restrictive. Elaine Petrie suggests that when Margaret Laidlaw told tales to her children, her traditional material was designed only to amuse and quieten them, while the repetition of psalms and texts was designed also for serious instruction. One of the earliest writers on Hogg says that Hogg's parents discouraged his amusements of music and poetry as much as possible, 'from an apprehension that too much indulgence in them would cause a levity in the after part of life, and in the mean time lead to a neglect of his master's business'. William Hogg makes the religious basis of this discouragement of Hogg's reading plain in saying that they 'dissuaded him powerfully from the perusal of every book that was not some religious tract or other; so that he had neither access to books, nor money to purchase them with ....' Hogg summarises his own situation during these early years in service in declaring that 'all this while I neither read nor wrote; nor had I access to any book save the Bible' (Memoir, pp. 6-7). Although Hogg was educated in the oral traditions of the community, the religious views

12 The abbreviation Memoir is listed before the text, and will be used throughout this study, for James Hogg, Memoir of the Author's Life and Familiar Anecdotes of Sir Walter Scott, edited by Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh and London, 1972). When the second text is referred to the abbreviation Familiar Anecdotes is used.
of his parents favoured his acquiring only such literary skill as was necessary to his religious improvement, viewing more as a distraction from business. Yet while Hogg did not then have access to a literate culture, he was also partially cut off from an oral one. Robin MacLachlan has shown that Hogg, unlike a ballad reciter, thought of the ballad as a set text in a literary way rather than as a variable performance of a singer who, having learnt a method of composition and a story, composes the text as he sings. In a later magazine article Hogg portrayed the easily evoked mistrust of the community towards a literary society of which he was a member, and the struggle in his mind between his ambition to shine at a meeting of the society, and the prudence which told him to return home to his master's sheep. Even at Willenslee, where he was loaned reading material, Hogg describes this as consisting chiefly of theological works, though it was here, as he records, that he first perused written Scots poetry, "The Life and Adventures of Sir William Wallace", and "The Gentle Shepherd". In the same passage he records that he regretted these poems were not in prose, or in similar metre to the psalms. At the age of eighteen than Hogg, through the religious influence exerted by his family, was more familiar with written prose than with written poetry. His familiarity with the English Bible used in the Church of Scotland meant that he was familiar with both English and Scots from an early

14 'The Shepherd's Calendar. Stornes', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 5(1819), 75-81, 210-16 (pp.213, 78).
age, but the one was associated more with speech and the other with reading and writing. Hogg needed to bring the two closer together, to gain a sense of his traditions as suitable literary material and to appreciate his Scots as a literary language. He moved in this direction during his ten year's service as a shepherd to Mr Laidlaw at Blackhouse in Yarrow. Mrs Garden declares that 'going to serve at Blackhouse was really the turning point in the life of James Hogg' (Memorials, pp.20-21). William Hogg, who also knew the Laidlaw family well, described the sense of freedom from the old restraints that Hogg found there, for 'as Mr Laidlaw himself had a natural desire for acquiring useful knowledge, even separate from that which constituted him master of his profession, he did not discourage James from reading, and this itself was sufficient to give the powers of his mind a new impulse'. Mr Laidlaw's sons were Hogg's companions in his self-education, and Hogg describes his own kindness to him as 'more like that of a father than a master' (Memoir, p.9). Now that he had the opportunity, Hogg seems to have read voraciously, for Mrs Garden says that 'he read all Mr. Laidlaw's books, and then subscribed to the library kept by Mr. Elder, in Peebles' (Memorials, p.24). It is difficult to establish what Mr Laidlaw's books were, though Thomson, writing many years later from the Memoir and information of Hogg's family and

The abbreviation Memorials is listed before the text, and will be used throughout this study, for Mrs Garden, Memorials of James Hogg, the Ettrick Shepherd (Paisley and London, n.d.). William Hogg, in a letter of 12 December 1813, in 'G.', 'Some Particulars Relative to the Ettrick Shepherd', New Monthly Magazine, 46(1836), 194-203, 335-42, 443-46 (p.445).
surviving friends, writes of his having from 1790 'the free use of an excellent domestic library, containing the poetical works of Milton, Pope, Thomson, and Young, the Spectator, several volumes of history and travel, and a considerable store of theological works, the sine qua non in those days of every Scottish reader and book-collector'. An account of Mr Elder's library is provided by Robert Chambers, however, himself a native of Peebles.

Alexander Elder's ordinary trade was a modest one in catechisms, alphabets, Bibles, and Testaments, to which he added the sale of stationery and penny chap-books. Behind his shelves the family cow quietly chewed her cud. His circulating library, however, besides a few treasures such as the translation of Virgil by Gavin Douglas, was probably composed chiefly of the standard works of the eighteenth century in literature and in travel. Chambers recalls that, as a boy, he had been familiar with 'the comicalities of Gulliver, Don Quixote, and Peregrine Pickle; had dipped into the poetry of Pope and Goldsmith, and indulged ... in books of travel and adventure ... scarcely less attractive than the works of pure imagination'. Hogg's reading at Blackhouse, it may be concluded, was chiefly in the literature of earlier periods than his own. This was probably due to the high price of new books then by comparison with the price of reprints of well-known works. Altick

describes how after 1780 especially the price of new books became prohibitive, and accounts for the popularity of the series of cheap reprints published by Bell and Cooke of British poets and dramatists.\textsuperscript{19} Bell's British Theatre series was issued in sixpenny weekly parts totalling twenty-one volumes between 1776 and about 1778, and Hogg refers to these volumes in an early letter to a friend, published in the \textit{Scots Magazine} in 1805.\textsuperscript{20} It was during these years at Blackhouse that Hogg first began to write, and his record of his earliest attempts reflects both his local limitations and his almost exclusive reading in the standard works of earlier periods. His first attempt at verse, an epistle to a divinity student, was mostly composed of 'borrowed lines and sentences from Dryden's Virgil, and Harvey's Life of Bruce' (\textit{Memoir}, p.82), while \textit{The Scotch Gentleman}, a longer work of these years, was founded on events of local interest, a trial at Selkirk of some persons accused of fishing in close-time. Hogg declares that much of the third act of the play is taken up with their examination, 'and many of the questions asked, and answers given in court, literally copied' (\textit{Memoir}, p.83). William Laidlaw, in recollecting the first meetings between Hogg and Scott, also indicates the local limitation of Hogg's art at this period. Though both Hogg and Scott were excellent mimics and born story-tellers, it was soon discovered that in such company 'Hogg's subjects were too local, and perhaps

\begin{flushright}
\end{flushright}
Hogg's finest work is also local, of course, but it attempts to discuss the local within a framework of universal significance and understanding. Hogg may have made contact during this period with some contemporary literature by means of periodical works. William Hogg records that 'he at this time published several pieces of poetry in the "Edinburgh Magazine", a publication he constantly read, all the time he resided with Mr Laidlaw'. An early writer on Hogg confirms this, remarking that 'previous to the 1799, he had published several pieces of poetry in the Edinburgh Magazine, of which he was a constant reader'.

As Hogg's apparently first published poem appeared in the Scots Magazine for 1794, it is reasonable to assume that he also read that publication, if only occasionally, during his stay at Blackhouse. Both magazines had a poetry section in each number, consisting of either voluntary amateur contributions to the periodical itself, or reprinted pieces, and the Edinburgh Magazine, until it was subsumed into the Scots Magazine at the end of 1803, also carried a short prose tale. Hogg would thus be able to read reviews of some contemporary works of literature, and these often included plot summaries and occasionally substantial extracts. The reprinted pieces in the poetry section of the Edinburgh Magazine included such

23 See note 9.
things as the odes of the poet laureate, and, a little later, poems from the Lyrical Ballads. Hogg's opportunities for contact with contemporary literature were still severely limited, however, and the work mentioned as having been contributed to the Edinburgh Magazine during this period has not been identified, either by signature or style. It would be odd indeed, though, if after publishing one poem in 1794 Hogg's next appearance in print should not be until 1801, as existing bibliographies of his work suggest. It can only be supposed that these pieces, if they do exist, are so derivative and unremarkable as to be lost in the sections of amateur poetry in which they appeared. Hogg's first separate publication aptly summarises the literary isolation and limitations of this period, a small shilling pamphlet, one thousand copies of which were apparently printed at his own expense. Of this Hogg later wrote, 'I knew no more about publishing than the man of the moon; and the only motive that influenced me was, the gratification of my vanity by seeing my works in print' (Memoir, p. 15). Not surprisingly the work attracted almost no attention from the periodicals.

Hogg first made a more than local reputation as a writer through the pages of the Scots Magazine, and his introduction there he owed, at least in part, to Scott. Hogg's contact with Scott was indeed to influence profoundly his subsequent career. Firstly, Scott's Minstrelsy of the Scottish Border seems to have shown him

the literary value of the traditional knowledge he possessed, and in one letter, in which he records his diligent perusal of the collection, he says 'in fact it is the remarks and modern pieces that I have delighted most in ....'.25 Hogg already knew many old traditions, but he was now learning what could be done with them. In September 1801 the Scots Magazine had come out with the name of Archibald Constable as publisher for the first time; and Hogg's first prose articles were ushered in with a letter by Scott, who on subsequent occasions was active in helping Hogg to get his works into print. The Scots Magazine, in the dearth of critical journals in Edinburgh, had an importance, though Curwen surely exaggerates this when he argues that at first Constable's new venture 'engaged ... a considerable share of his personal attention, and, aided by the talents of Leyden, Murray, and Macneil, its reputation as a critical journal was raised into some importance'.26 The magazine in fact remained very much as it had been, a repository of curious facts and miscellaneous information with a decided antiquarian bias, with approximately half of each issue devoted to a long chronicle section, providing domestic and foreign news, a list of new publications, tables, prices, births, marriages, and deaths. The first series of letters, introduced by Scott, appeared in six installments between October 1802 and June 1803. Apart from the fourth installment, which is not signed or

25 Hogg to Scott, 30 June [1802], in National Library of Scotland (hereafter N.S) MS 3874, f.114.
dated, all except the last are signed 'A Shepherd' and dated from Ettrick, while the last is signed 'The Ettrick Shepherd', Hogg's first recorded use of the well-known pseudonym. At first Hogg's poems in the magazine are generally also signed 'A Shepherd' and dated from Ettrick, or signed 'James Hogg' either with the pseudonym or the place-name to identify them as the work of the same man. The Scots Magazine did not usually contain prose fiction, so the fact that Hogg's early articles are mostly poems is partly explained by the nature of his periodical context. This may also explain the fact that his earliest prose is travel and literary criticism rather than fiction. The antiquarian and topographical articles of the Scots Magazine have their influence on what Hogg's narrator tells his reader in these letters. Firstly he is careful to record heights of mountains, distances from one place to another, and information on the capability for sheep-farming of the various districts through which he passes. Hogg's tone is formal and rational, in accordance with that of his old-fashioned periodical context, and probably also with that of many of the older essayists and writers he had studied during the preceding years at Blackhouse. Elaine Petrie has noted that, surprisingly enough, Hogg tends to take a dismissive or embarrassed attitude in this article in discussing the traditional state of his native community. It is

27 'A Journey through the Highlands of Scotland, in the months of July and August 1802', Scots Magazine, 64(1802), 813-18, 956-63, 65(1803), 89-95, 251-54, 312-14, 382-86.
true that Hogg seems less sympathetic to it here than in much of his later work, but this is more a question of literary presentation than of opinion. Hogg had not yet found his voice in prose, and his adopted one here leads him to create a personality for himself as narrator which is unhelpful in presenting the material that interests him most. For instance, in the passage where the narrator stands and reflects by the grave of Claverhouse at Killiecrankie, the traditional opinion of Claverhouse which he supposedly rejects, or at least modifies considerably, retains its power over his mind, and consequently that of the reader, and is not indeed replaced by the more experienced view which is intended to supplant it. After recollecting some of the local beliefs as to the diabolical nature of Claverhouse, Hogg recollects his own childhood belief in them:

How often, when a child, have I blessed in my heart, the soldier who, at the battle of Killicrankie [sic], seeing his master's affairs going to wreck, and that Claverhouse carried all before him, loaded his gun with a few sixpenny pieces, which were all the money that he had in the world, and lodged them in the heart of that bloody persecutor.29

After such plain but powerful writing the passage which follows, with its uncomfortable likeness to the sentimental writers in

29 'A Journey through the Highlands of Scotland, in the months of July and August 1802', Scots Magazine, 64(1802), 813-18, 955-63, 65(1803), 89-95, 251-54, 312-14, 382-86 (p.314). References to tales in a magazine will be given in full the first time a reference is made, while thereafter, in continuous discussion of the same tale, the page number in the magazine will be given in parentheses within the text.
imitation of Sterne and Mackenzie, can only fail to convince in its attempt to set the understanding of the man above that of the child. The clumsiness and archaism of such phrases as 'were I certain that thou didst act according to the dictates of thine own conscience' (p.314) cannot compare with the interest with which Hogg reflects on his childhood conviction. That, in its sense of intimacy between a shared and accepted account of the past and a physical landscape, prefigures The Brownie of Bodsbeck. Hogg allows the narrow but compelling experience of childhood to structure an emotionally forceful portrait of Claverhouse, reduced in outline almost to the archetypal. It is not surprising, then, that the subsequent sentimental address to the man in the grave, which refers to the Covenanters as 'some of the hot brained zealots, whose blood thou didst shed!' (p.314), should fail to carry conviction. The most successful parts of these letters represent Hogg as a man from a particular locality reflecting as such on the differing scene before him. One more example, though a slight one, is the narrator's confession that as a mountain-bred man he was at one point in his journey 'quite sick of travelling between two hedges!' (p.94), which conveys easily to the reader the difference in the landscape through which he passes. It is when his narrator separates himself most from this individual character and claims to be an experienced and undistinguished man of the world that Hogg's article most fails of its freshness and convincing tone.

Although Hogg had reached a point where he was, in his signed and therefore identifiable series of contributions to the Scots Magazine, beginning to try for a more than local reputation as a writer, he was almost certainly still an unpaid, and therefore an
amateur contributor. Scott's letter, introducing his first prose contributions to the magazine, referred to above, mentions no name even, and Hogg's contributions were referred to in the 'To Correspondents' section of the magazine even after that, the usual method of acknowledging anonymous and gratuitous literary favours.  
This impression of the status of Hogg's contributions would seem to receive confirmation from an editorial note in the number for August 1804, where the editor remarks that he is 'entirely ignorant of any particulars respecting the habitation, rank in life, or character of the Shepherd of Ettrick'. Hogg does refer, in a letter to Scott at the beginning of 1804, to his having received 'a very flattering letter from Constable', as a result of the kindness Scott has shown for him, and the historian of the publishing firm confirms that Constable's correspondence with Hogg began in 1804, but this probably refers to Hogg's wish, expressed in an earlier letter to Scott, to publish a volume of his songs and other poetry. Payment for the sort of periodical work Hogg could provide was extremely low at this time, however, even if he was paid. Constable's Edinburgh Review was well-known for its handsome payments during this period, but these were not made for poems, prose fiction, or travel articles, but for long reviews, and

30 'To the Editor of the Scots Magazine', Scots Magazine, 64 (1802), 812; see, for instance, 'To Correspondents', Scots Magazine, 66(1804), 320.
31 In Scots Magazine, 66(1804), 573.
32 Hogg to Scott, 1 January [1804], in NLS MS 3875, f.1; Thomas Constable, Archibald Constable and his Literary Correspondents, 3 vols (Edinburgh, 1873), II, 353; Hogg to Scott, 24 December 1803, quoted in Enid C. Batho, The Ettrick Shepherd (Cambridge, 1927), p.52.
Hogg lacked the right sort of formal education to earn money by writing these. Conditions for the Scots Magazine, like those for magazines generally before about 1815, were set by lax copyright conditions which meant that new magazine writing normally enjoyed no protection, and by a prevailing tone of amateurism. When magazines could be filled up by pirated material and gratuitous contributions from readers 'no publisher was willing to waste much money on original stories, poems, and essays, especially since the greater part of the magazine public found the dross as good as real gold'.

This state of affairs naturally limited the payments of the few professional writers employed in magazine work also. The rate of payment for periodical work was usually estimated in terms of the sheet of sixteen generally close-printed pages, so that when Curwen records that even in the most palmy days of the Monthly Review in the eighteenth century 'only four guineas a sheet were given to the most distinguished writers', and Ward suggests that the going rate for a reviewer before the days of the Edinburgh Review was only about two guineas a sheet, payment for magazine writing may be guessed to be pitifully unworthy of men of real creative gifts. Hogg could not at this time have afforded to devote more than his leisure hours to periodical writing anyway.

It was through the pages of the Scots Magazine that the

foundations of Hogg's literary personality were laid down during this period. Scott's introductory letter certified that the letters which followed 'are really and unaffectedly the production of a shepherd of Etterick [sic] Forest'. Hogg's observations were, at least in part, tactfully offered to the readers of the periodical as a curiosity, offering a view of familiar objects made anew by the freshness of the uncultivated mind which sees them. The inhabitants of 'the fields of knowledge' are distinguished from 'the uneducated and hardy intruder' who may 'while bewildering himself in unknown streets, and occasionally mistaking gewgaws and trinkets for real treasures, view nevertheless recesses untrod before, and discover beauties neglected by those who have been bred up among them'. Hogg partly acquiesces in this view in his own article, despite its formal style and narrator. Especially in the Edinburgh scenes of it he exposes himself to the reader as the countryman, unable to find his way across the maze of city streets to visit his friends, and when he reaches them so fatigued as to appreciate their drink at least as much as their conversation. Recounting his visit to the theatre to see The Heir-at-Law (1797) he says that although his knowledge of the play permits him to make few remarks on it 'as an illiterate countryman's opinions of the play and actors are very likely to be quite different from that of every other person' he will make his remarks nevertheless. Hogg's signatures to his

35 'To the Editor of the Scots Magazine', Scots Magazine, 64 (1802), 812.
36 'A Journey through the Highlands of Scotland, in the months of July and August 1802', Scots Magazine, 64(1802), 813-18, 956-63, 65(1803), 89-95, 251-54, 312-14, 382-86 (pp.961, 959).
various poems in the magazine also bear witness to his acquiescence in this view of himself. These gave rise also to a series of enquiries and replies in the pages of the magazine about his history and personality. J. Welch in his enquiry asked after Hogg's social rank, confidently asserting that 'the appellation of shepherd must be merely affected', to which 'A.H.B.' replied that he had heard 'from his own mouth, that he was bred a shepherd from his childhood', and proceeded to discuss the poet's lack of formal education.37 'A Constant Reader', in asking for details of Hogg's parentage, education, employers, and writings, obviously interested himself in the shepherd's history as well as that of the writer.38 In this spirit were written two articles of information signed 'Z.', of particular interest since the writer is thought to have been assisted, with information at least, by Hogg himself.39 These have several points in common with the earliest version of the Memoir. They give such incidents as Hogg's difficulty in writing at Willanslee when he was obliged to write a letter to his brother William, and the poetry competition between the four young shepherds.40 The foundation of this interest in Hogg as an unlettered shepherd-poet lies in a type of cultural primitivism, an

40 'Z.', 'Farther Particulars of the Life of James Hogg, the Ettrick Shepherd', Scotia Magazine, 67(1805), 501-03, 820-23 (pp.502, 820).
emphasis on the oracular and on subconscious association in poetic utterance, described in Frye's influential essay. Interest was expressed in the Hebrew poetry of the translated Bible and in ballads, while James Macpherson achieved a European success with his supposed discovery of the ancient Gaelic poetry of Ossian. Edward Young's *Conjectures On Original Composition. In a Letter to the Author of Sir Charles Grandison* (1759) summarises many of the features of this interest. Young distinguishes between two classes of composition, the original which imitates Nature and is of vegetable growth and the imitation which copies authors and is manufactured from pre-existing materials. Although he is careful not to decry learning openly, by implication the effect of learning may be seen as often harmful to originality:

But why are *Originals* so few? ... because illustrious Examples *engross*, *prejudice*, and *intimidate*. They *engross* our attention, and so prevent a due inspection of ourselves; they *prejudice* our *Judgment* in favour of their *abilities*, and so *lessen* the sense of our own; and they *intimidate* us with the *splendour* of their *Renown*, and thus under Diffidence *bury* our strength. *Nature's Impossibilities*, and *those of Diffidence*, lie wide asunder.

Young's essay naturally includes a compliment to his friend Richardson as an original genius who has rescued a corrupt and

immoral form of composition and turned it to purposes of virtue, but his other examples are drawn almost exclusively from poets, and in general there seems to have been a feeling that the nature of original genius was connected less with the primarily rational and discursive structure of prose than with poetry. This idea of the original genius had been deliberately courted by Burns in his Poems, Chiefly in the Scottish Dialect (1786), and besides the arguments of his preface the very title-page included the following unattributed verse to direct the expectations of the reader:

THE simple Bard, unbroke by rules of Art,  
He pours the wild effusions of the heart:  
And if inspir'd, 'tis Nature's pow'r inspire;  
Her's all the melting thrill, and her's the kindling fire.43

Mackenzie's influential, if misleading, review of the volume took up Burns's self-presentation and confirmed the way in which future generations were to regard him. Even the title added to this essay, 'Extraordinary Account of ROBERT BURNS, the Ayrshire Ploughman; with extracts from his Poems', stresses the peasant as much as the poet.44 Hogg's willingness to be fitted to the pattern is partly demonstrated by his life-long identification of himself with Burns. Burns had the motto 'Wood notes wild' on his seal, and Hogg had 'Naturae Donum', for example. Again, his

43 Quoted from Robert Burns, Poems, Chiefly in the Scottish Dialect, facsimile of the first edition (Kilmarnock, 1786; Glasgow, 1927).
revisions and additions to his public account of his life show that he tended increasingly to direct the reader towards the interpretation that he was an original genius and Burns's successor. As an account of his life Hogg's memoir is as deliberately selective a creative work as any of his poetry or prose, and indeed it seems hardly possible to misread it as some sort of unmediated account of events. Without impugning Hogg's veracity then, it is possible to declare that the 1807 version is the most historical of the three; Hogg's parentage, education, and the development of his literacy all follow on from one another towards the concluding explanation of the poems that follow in terms of his reading of the Minstrelsy of the Scottish Border. In the 1821 version one particular passage can hardly escape the construction of being designed to convince the reader of his condition as a peasant poet and original genius. Hogg says of his early attempts to support himself in Edinburgh as a literary man, '.... all this time I had never been once in any polished society — had read next to nothing ... and knew no more of human life or manners than a child. I was a sort of natural songster, without another advantage on earth' (Memoir, p.19). The exaggeration of his own ignorance both of men and books, culminating in a view of his art as the unconscious result of his own nature like the song of a bird, is plainly an artistic creation. The final version of the text not only brings the events of Hogg's life and the listing of his major publications up to 1832, but also redirects his account of his earlier years in line with his adopted personal mythology of the peasant poet and successor to Burns. Perhaps Hogg was influenced in this by the events of his London visit of 1832, which had included a literary dinner held in his
honour on the birthday of Burns. Firstly Hogg omitted from this version a substantial passage giving details of his early works, in which his imitation of Ramsay, Dryden, and Harvey is plain (Memoir, pp. 82-83). A sequence of events culminating in Hogg's resolve to become the successor of Burns was now added to the text in addition. Firstly there is the account of the boy running races against himself and losing his clothes, inserted to show that 'even at that early age my fancy seems to have been a hard neighbour for both judgment and memory' (Memoir, p. 5 with note 6). After this there is the charmingly written passage of his eight-year old admiration for the rosy-cheeked maiden Betty, which, with the subsequent account of how for many years after he began to write Hogg's compositions 'consisted wholly of songs and ballads made up for the lasses to sing in chorus' and how he was proud of their singing them and of 'the still dear appellation of "Jamie the poeter"' (Memoir, pp. 5, 10 with notes 8, 22), shows that in his case, as in that of Burns, a susceptibility to female charms accompanied and fostered imaginative and poetic development. The culmination of this added sequence is the scene where, during the summer immediately following the death of Burns, Hogg was met on the hill by a half-crazed man who recited one of Burns's poems to him and told him of its author. Hogg describes the experience in terms which others might reserve for a spiritual conversion, and it is in fact a sudden revelation of his true purpose in life. In his account it represents the point where the boy's unconscious predisposition towards being a poet and his transient motivation for composing songs are redirected by a conscious awareness of his calling and by a permanent ambition. Hogg declares that this experience 'formed a new epoch' in his life,
and that every day he 'pondered on the genius and fate of Burns'. Hogg considered that he might succeed Burns, and added, 'But then I wept again because I could not write. However, I resolved to be a poet, and to follow in the steps of Burns' (Memoir, p.11). Although there has been a good deal of critical dispute about this scene, taken in the context of the 1832 version of the account it seems clear that Mack is correct in saying that the incident might have taken place earlier, and been transferred to the period just after Burns's death for artistic reasons (Memoir, note 25 on page 12). In its fashion this version of the text has for its subject the growth of a poet's mind, as well as Beattie's The Minstrel; or, The Progress of Genius or Wordsworth's The Prelude; or, The Growth of a Poet's Mind.

The publication in 1807 of The Mountain Bard; consisting of Ballads and Songs, founded on Facts and Legendary Tales sums up many of the features of Hogg's literary progress to that time. In contrast to the obscure pamphlet of 1801 it was well supported as a publication, being recommended and supported by Scott and published by Constable. In his choice of a title and in including the first version of his account of his life in this publication Hogg also encouraged the wider reading public he might have expected to reach by these means to regard him as, above all, an uneducated shepherd-poet. In this respect Hogg chose to continue the presentation of his literary personality that had developed through the pages of the Scots Magazine. His account of his own life may be seen as a development of the interest created about him among the readers of the magazine. He also appeared here under the protection of Scott, to whom the whole publication was dedicated and to whom the letters
that composed the account of his life there were addressed, as he had less directly with his first prose contributions to the *Scots Magazine*. The poems themselves show the influence both of Scott and the magazine itself.

The first section of the work, headed 'Ballads, in Imitation of the Antients', shows most clearly the influence of Scott. Ballantyne had been directed by Scott to send a presentation copy of the third volume of the *Minstrelsy of the Scottish Border*, containing modern literary imitations of ballads, to Hogg as soon as it was printed. Hogg records that dissatisfaction with these set him about his own ballad imitations (*Memoir*, p. 16). Hogg's own imitations, however, are generally thought to be disappointing, for the creations of a man nurtured within a traditional community. In 1832 Hogg wrote of these that he 'selected a number of traditionary stories, and put them in metre by chanting them to certain old tunes' (*Memoir*, p. 16). This would seem to imply that Hogg's method of composition was to retell in verse the prose traditions he had heard, using his ear for music to help him in making the verse smooth and harmonious as well as suitable for singing like a ballad. Hogg certainly seems to have been more at ease with the generally chronological and sequential structure of prose than with the tightly-knit ballad, with its dramatic, central situation. And even where Hogg expands an existing ballad he spreads events out in time, favouring an analysis of a situation

in terms of the causative past and the future consequences to the chief actors. In 'The Twa Corbies', for instance, the birds' speech describes the figure of the slain knight and briefly presents the attitudes of the only creatures who know where he is and the ignorance of the mourners. This is the acknowledged basis for Hogg's 'Sir David Graeme', which has a detailed and lengthy time-scheme. The lady's dove flies away, and then the narrator tells of the broken tryst and its significance. The dove first reappears with a lock of her lover's hair, and then with his ring. Then the knight's hound comes, and persuades the lady to follow him to his master's corpse. A row of asterisks across the page signifies the passage of time, after which the knight's ghost appears to the lady, and the poem ends. 'The Pedlar' even includes an account of the discovery and punishment of the murderer after a lapse of many years from the main events of the ballad. Hogg is still more circumstantial here in giving two notes of further detail about the ghost's appearances, and another about Mr Boston's exorcism of it (Mountain Bard, pp.29, 30, 30-31). In fact the notes are perhaps one of the most interesting parts of the book. Hogg's attention had been caught by the notes to the Minstrelsy of the Scottish Border. The antiquarianism of that collection (and perhaps also that of the Scots Magazine) probably encouraged Hogg to write his own notes here, by making him realise that to the antiquary his

46 The abbreviation Mountain Bard is listed before the text, and will be used throughout this study, for James Hogg, The Mountain Bard; consisting of Ballads and Songs, founded on Facts and Legendary Tales (Edinburgh, 1807).

47 See note 25.
knowledge of local traditions and customs was not evidence of his lack of education and social status, but a unique source of fascinating information for an educated and literate audience. Previously such information must have seemed too familiar to Hogg himself, and too far removed from the concerns of a polite culture, for him to esteem them worthy of comment or remark. Elaine Petrie remarks of the notes to these ballads that they represent the sort of material that Hogg was to use later in his essays on country ways and beliefs, and remarks on 'Thirlestane. A Fragment' that the poem requires the notes but the notes can stand on their own — a reversal of what might be expected with a text and its notes. Some of the notes are indeed short essays in their own right, and in these Hogg displays a confidence which is absent from some of his introductory remarks to his ballads, where he is perhaps in awe of the rather overwhelming influence and success of Scott. Of 'Sir David Graeme' he defensively remarks on its origin in 'The Twa Corbies', 'that the original is not improved in the following ballad, will too manifestly appear upon perusal'. Again, he chose to verify Andrew Moore's knowledge of local traditions by declaring that he 'could repeat by heart every old ballad which is now published in the "Minstrelsy of the Border", except three, with three times as many' (Mountain Bard, pp. 3-4, 69). In his notes of local customs Hogg is more aware of the uniqueness of his understanding, and sometimes manages a more spontaneous and

conversational approach to his reader. Defending himself from the suspicions of those 'less conversant in the manners of the cottage', who may think he magnifies superstition to give countenance to his own ballads, Hogg adds, 'Therefore, as this book is designed solely for amusement, I hope I shall be excused for here detailing a few more of them, which still linger amongst the wilds of the country to this day, and which I have been an eye witness to a thousand times ....' (Mountain Bard, p.26). Hogg also suggests here the advantages of his upbringing rather than his educational deprivations. He acts as a witness to the prevalence of belief in superstition, and this permits him to transmit them to the sceptical reader without his personal assent in their truth being given or denied. At other times, unfortunately, Hogg becomes too much influenced by the sceptical assumptions of the reader, and destroys the atmosphere he has created or contradicts himself emotionally. For instance, after telling simply the tale of how Hab Dob and Davie Din trapped the devil with a network of red thread crosses and attacked him with their rowan staffs and Bibles until, falling headlong into a ravine, he was forced to save himself by turning into a bundle of skins, Hogg unfortunately seems to feel that he has been too extravagant and too much in earnest in his relation, and, in concluding with a sceptical jest, dissipates the robust and satisfying outline he has constructed, in adding that the bundle of skins 'was not those of stolen sheep we hope' (Mountain Bard, p.92). Similarly, his introductory note to 'Mase John' contradicts the mood of the ballad itself instead of supporting it. In the verse the Covenanters, steadfast in their religious belief despite the persecutions of men and of hell itself, root out evil
and rescue the girl from wicked enchantments. They are very
different from the Covenanters of the note, whom Hogg supposes to
have framed 'this whole story about the sorcery, on purpose to
justify their violent procedure in the eyes of their countrymen'
(Mountain Bard, p.70). In the notes to his ballads Hogg, though
more at his ease than in his prose articles for the Scots Magazine,
still occasionally makes the mistake of distancing his narrator too
much from the real interest and centre of what he has to
communicate, destroying much of the power of his material by
submitting to what he must have seen as a required scepticism and
rationalisation in the narrator.

The second group of poems in the collection, headed 'Songs
Adapted to the Times', shows the influence of the Scots Magazine
most clearly as the first does that of Scott. All of the poems in
this group had previously appeared in the magazine, with the
exceptions of Hogg's early success of 'Donald MacDonald' and 'Sandy
Tod', which last had previously been printed in the now defunct
Edinburgh Magazine. By comparison, only three of the ten ballads
in the first section of the poems had previously appeared in the
Scots Magazine. Although Hogg later preferred to class some of the
poems of this section with his early work in another collection,
they are an important feature of this volume of 1807, and show that
then Hogg was hoping to attract attention to his modern poetry as
well as appealing to a contemporary literary and antiquarian taste
for the ballad. One poem in this second category is especially
significant in retaining strong connections with the Scots Magazine
and in forwarding the accepted magazine view of Hogg as an
uneducated and peasant poet. Hogg's 'Epistle to Mr T. M. C.,
London' was the result of his perusal of the amateur poetry in the regular poetry section of the magazine. It had originally been printed there, addressed to Allan Cunningham's elder brother, who was another prominent contributor, and was subsequently answered by him with another verse epistle.\textsuperscript{49} The exchange illustrates the way in which the magazine acted as a connection and introduction between dispersed amateur Scots poets during these years, for Hogg states in a note to the poem in his collection that at the time of his writing the epistle he knew nothing of Mr Cunningham. Hogg relates in this poem how he has studied the poetry of the \textit{Scots Magazine}:

\begin{quote}
For mony a year, wi' eager een,
I've glower'd our Scotia's Magazine;
And oft, like zealots at a sermon,
Discoverin' beauties where there were none;
But never a' my life, till now,
Have I met sic a chiel as you; (Mountain Bard, p.172)
\end{quote}

There is also a hint in the poem of the pleasure Hogg took in literary companionship, a pleasure which later made \textit{Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine} so attractive to him, when he calls on Cunningham as an adopted brother to join causes with him and 'Let baith our buoyant brains combine To raise our country's Magazine' (Mountain Bard, p.173). He also writes of excelling all previous magazines by these means, and of outdoing Ruddiman in particular, a reference

\textsuperscript{49} 'To Mr T. M. C. London', \textit{Scots Magazine}, 67(1805), 621-22 was followed by Cunningham's 'Answer to the Ettrick Shepherd, August Magazine 1805', \textit{Scots Magazine}, 68(1806), 206-08.
presumably to the *Weekly Magazine*, to which the Scots poet Fergusson had contributed almost all his work in the early 1770s. Hogg was therefore conscious of writing within a periodical tradition even as early as this. The poem also supports his claim to be a poet of nature alone, in advertising Hogg's distaste for learning. He guesses that Cunningham has taken to the desk or college, and now slights 'the genuine school of nature', adding:

Sweet dame! she met me single handed;  
Yet, studying her, my mind expanded  
To bounds are neither rack'd nor narrow,  
On Ettrick banks an' bras of Yarrow. (Mountain Bard, p.175)

This may well be the defensive plea of a man conscious of his educational inferiority, but it is also an attempt to fit into the fashionable model of the inspired rustic poet.

Not surprisingly the whole collection was generally received as the work of an uneducated rustic poet, and this was a questionable advantage for Hogg in the publication of the first important separate collection of his work. Nine journals reviewed the volume before the end of 1809. Naturally enough, the *Scots Magazine*, wishing no doubt to advertise its own claims and to encourage the other contributors to its poetry section, praised Hogg's work, and pointed out that 'the Ettrick Shepherd ... has made himself

---

successfully known as a poet by his communications to the *Scots Magazine*. Other reviewers, however, were less whole-hearted in its praise. The *Annual Review* began its criticism by recognising the presence of 'another self-taught poet, who appears to have enjoyed fewer opportunities of mental cultivation than any one who has yet come under our cognizance!'. It attacked the foolish notion that the self-educated are especially original writers, and commented that, on the contrary, they are usually servile imitators of the few bad models with which they have come into contact. Hogg's sense was shown in his selection of the ballad, therefore. The review in the *Poetical Register* also took up Hogg's presentation of himself as a rustic bard, in its exasperated opening remark that 'the labouring class of society has, of late years, teemed with poets, and would-be poets. If it should much longer display the same fertility, there will not be a single trade or calling which will not have produced a bard'. The *Critical Review* placed Hogg as a peasant poet fourth below Chatterton, Burns, and Bloomfield, and pointed out in his ballads passages where he had supposedly imitated ideas and images from Scott's own poetry. This journal even went so far as to prefer Hogg's modern poems to his ballad imitations. However, if the reviews tended to qualify their praise

51 Anonymous review in *Scots Magazine*, 69(1807), 283-86 (p.283).
52 Anonymous review in *Annual Review*, 6(1807), 554-57 (pp.554, 555).
53 Anonymous review in *Poetical Register*, 6(1806-1807), 548-49.
54 Review in *Critical Review*, 12(1807), 237-44 (pp.244, 239-40).
The reviewer was probably Anna Seward — see her letter to Constable, 14 March 1808, quoted in Thomas Constable, Archibald Constable and his Literary Correspondents, 3 vols (Edinburgh, 1873), II, 16.
of the work with comments on Hogg's self-presentation as a rustic bard or on his imitations of Scott, the publication of this volume probably extended Hogg's reputation as a poet.

Indirectly the publication also showed Hogg's inability to manage his literary earnings in the form of large payments for separate publications successfully. Hogg failed to establish himself during this period as a successful farmer supplementing his profits with his literary earnings. After the publication of this work and one on the management of sheep Hogg was, by his own account, 'now master of nearly three hundred pounds'. This enabled him to farm on his own account, but through bad management and taking on two farms at once he became involved far beyond his capital, and 'blundered and struggled on for three years between these two places, giving up all thoughts of poetry or literature of any kind' (Memoir, p.18). From the beginning of 1807 until the end of 1809 Hogg seems to have written very little because of his farming commitments. Apparently he only published six poems and another series of letters about his travels in the Highlands during this period, although he may also have sent his prose tale 'The Long Pack' to the Sherborne Weekly Entertainer.55 When on the failure of his farming scheme Hogg returned to his native district he could no longer even find work as a shepherd, although from his earlier letters to Scott he seems previously to have found that such hired service made writing

difficult, anyway. In 1805, though settled with a master whom he regarded as a good man, Hogg had written to Scott expressing his frustration in this matter:

... but my flocks take up the whole of my attention so that I have not a moment to think of my favourite studies neither have I any convenience farther than writing on my knee upon the hill .... I am not unhappy far from it but I am somewhat vexed — not for being obliged to toil hard a whole year for such a small pittance but for the sake of that same small pittance to be obliged to forego all my favourite studies.

Hogg had apparently no choice in 1810, when even this somewhat unsatisfactory expedient of hiring himself out as a shepherd again failed him, but to try to support himself by his pen. Hogg's preference would probably have been for being his own master as a farmer, when he could have made his own arrangements for writing, without making that his sole dependance. Hogg's poetry had at first served him for amusement as a shepherd and led to his acquiring a reputation among the other amateur contributors to the Scots Magazine. Then it had won for him a fresh start as a farmer. His own financial ineptitude, among other causes, had forfeited this chance, and to depend upon his poetry for his whole subsistence seemed a dangerous undertaking. In Hogg's own account of his decision the apparent folly of his attempt to become a professional author is given full emphasis. Hogg describes the mood in which he decided to go to Edinburgh for this as one of 'utter desperation', and implies that the decision was taken only because no other

56  Hogg to Scott, 22 July [1805], in NLS MS 3875, f.93.
prospect opened to him. Writing that he had estimated his poetical
talent highly Hogg stated, 'but I had resolved to use it only as a
staff, never as a crutch; and would have kept that resolve, had
I not been driven to the reverse' (Memoir, p.18). It was indeed
doubtful if Hogg could make his way as a literary man at this time,
when the prevailing conditions for periodical writing were those of
amateurism, and when Hogg was known chiefly as the author of a
recent book of ballads imitating the work of Scott and as a rustic
bard without education.
CHAPTER TWO: THE EDINBURGH YEARS AND THE SPY

Hogg's doubts as to the wisdom of a sole dependence on literature as a means of support were shared by several contemporary authors, as Collins indicates in his study of literature as a profession during this period. He refers to Scott's early resolve to make literature his staff but not his crutch, and relates that Rogers, Coleridge, and Byron also at times expressed their conviction of the foolishness of trusting entirely to literature for an income. Byron, in advising Barton not to leave his bank to become a professional writer, gives Rogers as an example of a contemporary poet whose status is secured by his financial independence from his literary pursuits. Stressing Rogers's reputation as a poet and his social position of intimacy in the best circles, Byron adds 'the world (a bad one, I own) courts him because he has no occasion to court it'. Hogg's social as well as financial literary independence may have been placed at risk with the loss of even his humble separate occupation. A letter of 1811 suggests that Hogg tried to secure some paid employment aside from his literary pursuits. Hogg refers to his powers as factor to an English lady, and mentions valuing and re-letting farms at Langholm.

for General Dirom. However, he does not seem to have been very successful in this, for there are few references to the occupation and it is not even mentioned in Hogg's own account of these years in his autobiography, where his position as a struggling literary man is emphasised. It seems fair to suppose that Hogg was an eventually successful professional author during these Edinburgh years. Hogg describes his situation on arriving in Edinburgh in 1810 as a gloomy one, however, and this was perhaps due to the prevailing conditions of hack writing and amateurism in periodical literature.

On going to Edinburgh, I found that my poetical talents were rated nearly as low there as my shepherd qualities were in Ettrick. It was in vain that I applied to newsmongers, booksellers, editors of magazines, &c. for employment. Any of these were willing enough to accept of my lucubrations, and give them publicity, but then there was no money going — not a farthing; and this suited me very ill. (Memoir, pp.18-19)

It is clear that in 1810, and for several years afterwards, there were no opportunities for Hogg to make paid contributions to magazines or to literary miscellanies. Hogg records that about 1812 he was writing reviews, but the periodical to which he contributed these must have been relatively unimportant, and he

---

2 Hogg to William Hogg, 8 October 1811, in Memorials, pp.50-51; the abbreviation Memorials is listed before the text, and will be used throughout this study, for Mrs Garden, Memorials of James Hogg, the Ettrick Shepherd (Paisley and London, n.d.).

3 The abbreviation Memoir is listed before the text, and will be used throughout this study, for James Hogg, Memoir of the Author's Life and Familiar Anecdotes of Sir Walter Scott, edited by Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh and London, 1972). When the second text is referred to the abbreviation Familiar Anecdotes is used.
may not have been paid for those either. Referring to John Wilson's long poem *The Isle of Palms* (1812) Hogg remarks, 'I reviewed this poem, as well as many others, in a Scottish Review then going on in Edinburgh' (Memoir, p.29), but no such series of reviews by Hogg has ever been traced. Högg lacked the versatility and the more extensive formal education that made a successful reviewer of a man like Southey, in fact. Högg's known contributions of his original creative work to periodicals between his removal to Edinburgh in 1810 and the founding in April 1817 of what was to become Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, apart from those to his own paper *The Spy*, are also surprisingly few. Apparently these consist only of five pieces altogether, which appeared in the *Scots Magazine*. Högg was trying to gain an income by his writing during this period he probably wrote more periodical articles than there is now any trace of: if he was testing different, and probably obscure, periodicals to see if they would pay for his assistance the periodicals themselves may not have survived, or his work in them may not be readily identifiable.

By the end of 1816 Hogg certainly had a reputation as an author, but his fame had been earned by his separately published volumes of verse, and in particular by a series of longer narrative poems. The publication of *The Queen's Wake: A Legendary Poem* in 1813 made his name widely known and became the foundation of his reputation.

4 I have had no success myself in tracing the reviews Hogg claims here.
5 These are listed in Enid C. Batho, *The Ettrick Shepherd* (Cambridge, 1927), pp.188, 192, 194.
Although this work is apparently a long narrative poem, like those of Scott or of Southey, it is in fact a series of shorter poems with the connecting narrative of a poetic contest at the court of Mary, Queen of Scots. The work shows that Hogg clearly had been supplementing his reading of eighteenth-century works with those of his contemporaries, and, as Mack remarks, it shows Hogg responding to the best in contemporary poetry. Many of the details of the poem are consciously fashionable: the theme and symbol of the prize harp, for example, refers both to the ancient instrument and to a recent fashionable accomplishment, for according to David Johnson the harp did not reach Scotland until about 1810. Hogg also consciously presents himself as a natural genius in accordance with a particular poetic fashion. His self-portrait as a rustic bard 'In Nature's bosom nursed had been', and wears a darned and torn forest doublet and a shepherd's plaid, while his harp is wreathed around with wild flowers and has his motto of Naturae Donum. The introduction to the poem also refers to the poet's harp of the mountain as the gift of heaven, and praises 'the strains that touch the heart, | Bold, rapid, wild, and void of art'. The poem's success meant the wide circulation of this picture of Hogg. It was widely reviewed, being apparently the first of Hogg's works to be noticed in America. Hook mentions that it was published at New

8 James Hogg, The Queen's Wake: A Legendary Poem (Edinburgh, 1813), pp.106, 105-09, 1, 21.
York as early as 1813, and writes that almost all his writings after
it were favourably noticed in America. Of the two American reviews
of it that he mentions one is a reprint from a Scottish magazine,
but both, in their high praise of it as the work of a peasant poet,
show that Hogg's self-presentation affected its reception in this
respect. 9 According to Ward nine British periodicals reviewed the
work. 10 Hogg may have felt that he ought to despise the critics,
but he evidently looked for and read their reviews of his work. In
this case he resented the lateness of the notice in the Edinburgh
Review, and was well-informed enough to comment that 'every review
praised its general features, save the Eclectic, which, in the year
1813, tried to hold it up to ridicule and contempt' (Memoir, pp.26-
27). The success he met with evidently gave Hogg much confidence
in his abilities as a writer of long narrative poems, for he
apparently turned down an offer of five hundred pounds for the
copyright of his next one, preferring instead to take eighty pounds
for the edition. 11 A number of long poems followed, none of them
as successful as the first. The Pilgrims of the Sun: A Poem (1813)
was obviously created out of the ambitions Hogg derived from his
past success with 'Kilmeny', for it is a lengthy retelling of that

9 Andrew Hook, Scotland and America: A Study of Cultural
Relations 1750-1835 (Glasgow and London, 1975), pp.152-53;
the reviews are in Port Folio, 6(1815), 497-506, and Analectic
Magazine, 3(1814), 104-25.
10 Literary Reviews in British Periodicals, 1798-1820: A
Bibliography with a Supplementary List of General (Non-Review)
Articles on Literary Subjects, compiled by William S. Ward,
11 See a letter from Hogg to Mrs Izett, 26 October 1814, in Alan
Lang Strout, The Life and Letters of James Hogg, The Ettrick
Shepherd Volume I (1770-1825), Texas Technological College
story in four different poetic styles, those of the ballad, of Milton, of Dryden and Pope, and of Scott. This, though plainly designed to demonstrate Hogg's versatility, invites too ready a comparison with his masters in each style, besides giving his work a 'patch-work appearance', as one reviewer put it. 12 Mador of the Moor: A Poem, which followed in 1816, bears a resemblance to Scott's well-known The Lady of the Lake, which also concerns the wanderings of a Scottish king in disguise. Neither of these poems allowed Hogg the flexibility he had enjoyed through the structure of the poetic contest in The Queen's Wake: A Legendary Poem, and neither of them is equal to it as a whole, though both have enjoyable passages. Hogg and his literary friends do seem to have been mistaken in judging from his initial success that his proper medium was the extended poem. Incidentally, like those to his earlier collection of ballads, the notes to The Queen's Wake: A Legendary Poem make fascinating reading.

This success had a wholly fortunate effect on Hogg's fortunes as a literary man, however. Mrs Garden writes of his being then 'universally received into the guild of Poets', and gives a letter to him from Southey in support of her assertion (Memorials, pp. 73-76). Many years later Hogg wrote that it was after the year 1813 too that he was accepted into genteel society. 13 Hogg's influence with publishers was perhaps at its highest during this period, for Murray seemed willing to consider reviews by Hogg of Scottish works.

12 Anonymous review in Critical Review, 1(1815), 399-409 (p. 403).
for the *Quarterly Review*, and Wilson, the future mainstay of *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, even requested his assistance to get Murray to publish his own *The City of the Plague*. 14 Perhaps his extended reputation may additionally have recommended Hogg to the Buccleuch family as a worthy object of their patronage; in 1815 Hogg was given for his lifetime and effectively rent-free the little farm of Altrive. The value of the farm has been estimated by Gillies, an admittedly unreliable witness, as about eighty pounds per annum, while a later anonymous writer thought its value would be about thirty pounds per annum. 15 In either case Altrive, though probably not adequate to the demands of Hogg's hospitable way of life upon it, was a settled provision giving Hogg a measure of financial security and a settled home in his own country: even subsequently Hogg was dependent on his literary earnings, especially after he leased the large farm of Mount Banger, but he could now feel that he belonged to both literary and rural society, and that he was involved again both with farming and with literature.

Even during the Edinburgh years, however, when Hogg was making his reputation by his separate volumes of poetry there are several indications that a periodical context was still thought of for his work. By Hogg's own account it was his poetical pieces in *The Spy*


that made Grieve encourage him to 'take the field once more as a poet', and this encouragement led Hogg to produce The Queen's Wake: A Legendary Poem (Memoir, p.24). Also two of the separate volumes of poetry themselves suggest that in view of the dearth of periodicals that would pay for his work Hogg had considered creating his own. The first of these is the volume of songs called The Forest Minstrel: A Selection of Songs, Adapted to the Most Favourite Scottish Airs (1810). The volume reflects Hogg's pleasure in the sense of a literary community of interest between himself and his friends. Hogg's chief contributor to this volume was T. M. Cunningham, with whom he had made a literary friendship through the pages of the Scots Magazine.¹⁶ His anonymous contributor 'A' was plainly his old friend William Laidlaw, since Laidlaw's best-known song, 'Lucy's Flittin', is marked with that initial in the volume. The collection also has a direct relationship with the Scots Magazine, since well over half of Cunningham's sixteen contributions had previously appeared there, as well as about a quarter of Hogg's own.¹⁷ This sense of literary fellowship seems to have influenced Hogg always, from the literary brotherhood formed during his years as a shepherd, through the debating club of the Forum, to the social meetings of the contributors to Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine.

¹⁶ See Chapter One, page 30.
¹⁷ This estimate has been made by noting the separate songs attributed to Hogg and to Cunningham in the table of contents to the volume, and correcting this by reference to Enid C. Batho, 'Notes on the Bibliography of James Hogg, the Ettrick Shepherd', Library, 16(1935-1936), 309-26 (p.319). This was then checked against poetical contributions to the Scots Magazine between January 1802 and December 1809, volumes 64 to 71.
idea of this particular collection may perhaps have been suggested by Scott's plan of the previous year to publish two volumes of poetry by dead and living authors, to be entitled *English Minstrelsy*. Hogg's volume is at any rate a variation of the same idea, for the suggestion in its preface that it was intended merely as the first of a series of annual volumes of Scottish song seems also to prefigure in part the *Annuals* of the 1820s and 1830s, to which Hogg at a later period of his life contributed many of his verses and tales. Hogg argues that as the songs of Burns have become hackneyed and yet a Scottish audience still prefers 'the natural melody and exhilarating strains of our own national music' to 'Italian tirlie-whirlies', it would be both useful and desirable if 'a small collection of new songs were mutually furnished once a-year by the authors of the present day'. The preface also indicates plainly enough that Hogg thought of his purchasers of the volume as an educated and relatively well-to-do audience, for he rather defends the taste of the peasantry in song from the assumptions he believes an educated audience would make about it than addresses himself to the country folk themselves, in saying that 'for however evident it may appear to the literary part of the community, that the beauties of Campbell's songs are above the perception of these people, it is so far from being the case, that in that very class they are received with the warmest enthusiasm'.

---


does not seem to have been successful, as he recorded that he received nothing for it from his publisher (Memoir, p.19). There is thus no second volume published in the following year, though the collection has its affinities with one of Hogg's later ventures, The Poetic Mirror, or The Living Bards of Britain (1816), which also partly anticipates the Annuals. This was a book of parodies and imitations of contemporary poets, but it had been planned by Hogg as 'a poetical repository in Edin. to be continued half-yearly price 5/- One part of it is to consist of original poetry and the remainder to be filled up with short reviews or characters of every poetical work published in the interim', which like the earlier collection of songs was to be compiled 'in conjunction with some literary friends'.

Thus even in those years when Hogg's interest in volume publication alone is apparently most strong he was involved in planning a type of periodical work, in spite of the unfavourable conditions then prevailing in Edinburgh. It is natural that this should have been so, for Hogg needed an income. Probably he could not have afforded to pursue his plan of adopting literature as a full-time occupation at all had he not been assisted by John Grieve. Hogg dedicated his Mador of the Moor: A Poem (1816) to this friend, and recorded in his account of his own life the importance of Grieve's kindness and that of his partner Scott to him at this time, writing 'without this sure support I could never have fought my way in Edinburgh. I was fairly starved

20 Hogg to Southey, 4 June 1814, in National Library of Scotland (hereafter NLS) MS 2245, f.4.
into it, and if it had not been for Messrs. Grieve and Scott, would,
in a very short time, have been starved out of it again' (Memoir,
p.23).

Although Hogg's reputation was made during these years with
his long narrative poems, his own periodical The Spy was most
important for his fiction. A reviewer of the last of his long
poems remarked truly that in The Spy Hogg 'served an apprenticeship
to the trade of authorship'.21 The production of a weekly paper
meant that he could test the public response to his early attempts
in much the same way as he also used the Forum in these years to
let him feel 'the pulse of the public, and precisely what they would
swallow, and what they would not' (Memoir, p.23). As far as modern
scholarship has been able to ascertain the essays and stories in
this paper represent his earliest attempts at prose fiction.
Moreover, Hogg was proud of the venture, if one may judge from the
number of times he mentions it both in his autobiography and in his
anecdotes of Scott.22 Hogg's paper was written within a clearly
defined literary tradition, and one with which he and his readers
were extremely familiar moreover, the essay-periodical of Addison
and Steele, Johnson, and Mackenzie, and this tradition shapes his
writing for the periodical. Scott's reported remark to Hogg on
learning that he was to begin such a paper acknowledges this, for
he asked Hogg if he did not think it 'rather dangerous ground to

21 Anonymous review of Queen Hynde in Belfast Magazine, 1(1825),
230-43 (p.236).
22 For examples, see Memoir, pp.19-22, 51, 79-80 and Familiar
Anecdotes, pp.102-05, 115-16.
take after Addison Johnson and Henry McKenzie?" (Familiar Anecdotes, p.115). Hogg himself later described The Spy as 'a work conducted by a real Shepherd in imitation of Addison and the other great masters in periodical writing'. There was a copy of the Spectator in the library at Blackhouse, and Hogg had read the work or part of it by 1802, for he refers in a letter of that year to having seen a verse of one of his mother's ballads 'cited in the Spectator and another in Boswell's Journal'. Hogg may not have previously known the periodical essays of Johnson, but in describing the prose of his own Highland tours he refers to Johnson and Boswell as 'my great patterns'. But if Hogg did not know these when he began his paper he did four months later, for his 'New Year Paper' was plagiarised from essays by Johnson. Whether Hogg had read the Mirror and the Lounger by 1810 is more doubtful, although he could hardly have stayed in Edinburgh at this time without being aware of Mackenzie's high reputation as the Scottish Addison. Scott's supposed remark implies that all three essayists were well known and highly regarded, and indeed even if Hogg had not been able

23 See the letter from Hogg to Aitken, 15 January 1819, in the copy of The Spy in NLS Ry.II.B.6.
25 Hogg to Scott, 18 January 1805, in NLS MS 3875, f.39.
26 Hogg revised his 'New Year Paper', The Spy, 5 January 1811, pp.145-51 and it was reprinted as 'The True Art of Reviewing', Newcastle Magazine, 6(1827), 3-7. A reader of the Newcastle Magazine then complained to the editor of this, who found that the accusation was true — see 'The Ettrick Shepherd's Plagiarism', Newcastle Magazine, 7(1828), 499-500. The fault is that of the original article.
to read their essays in volume form, individual ones were very often reprinted in the magazines, as well as countless imitations of them. Mayo writes of a kind of repertory of work in the eighteenth-century magazine 'upon which lazy and indifferent editors could make unlimited drafts. The Spectator, the Rambler, the Adventurer, the Female Spectator, the Lounger, and the Mirror all made heavy contributions to this shadowy reservoir in the public domain ....'27 Besides being popular as entertainment the Spectator was also thought of as a model of style. Bond mentions that Hugh Blair in his lectures at Edinburgh University in the 1760s and 1770s 'not only praised Addison as the perfection of English style but set his students the task of analysing the essays and himself delivered "critical examinations" of four of them ....'28 Blair's influence was great, and these essayists seem to have become an obvious part of people's self-education. For instance, Allan Cunningham recommended a scheme of reading to one of his old country friends, presumably based on his own experience, which included the Spectator and the whole of Johnson's prose works.29 Perhaps Hogg's decision to work within this tradition is understandable, but it may not have been a wise one. Mayo, writing about a magazine tradition of fiction, sees the Spectator's position as central to it. Terning Addison and Steele 'the single most

29 Cunningham to M'Ghie, 1 August 1811, quoted in Rev. David Hogg, Life of Allan Cunningham, with Selections from his Works and Correspondence (Dumfries, 1875), pp.143-45.
important formative influence on eighteenth-century miscellany fiction', he explains that their example was reinforced by 'the whole syndrome of editor-reader-writer relationships', as well as by the pieces themselves and imitations of them. The essay-periodical was a prestigious literary form too, being associated with the great names of the eighteenth century, as Graham points out. This was probably an attraction to an ambitious man who still had his reputation to make. Nor was the form associated with the imitative, parasitic journalism of the magazines in the first place, but with the leisure pursuits of gentlemen. The Mirror Club, for instance, was composed of advocates and men of good family. However, though the essay-periodical was prestigious it was not particularly lucrative until it was republished in volume form as a collection of essays. Many were undertaken indeed with an eye only to the collected edition, and Cumberland's Observer of 1785, as an extreme example of this, was first published in book form without ever having appeared as a periodical at all. Perhaps this was due to the familiarity of bound volumes of past well-loved collections with a middle-class audience of a type that did not feel it was necessary to keep up with the latest publications. It was natural for Hogg to be attracted to the form, but that form was not likely to solve his immediate financial problems, for his profits

would be unlikely to be appreciable until after the separate publication of at least one completed volume of the weekly numbers. The audience for the essay-periodical might also present problems to Hogg. The Spectator and its followers were often treated as works of instruction rather than of amusement by readers. Jane Austen's Mrs Morland, who looks out a volume of the Mirror to cure her daughter's supposed dissatisfaction with the quietness of home after her long stay at Bath and at the house of wealthy friends, is no doubt a comic portrait of this type of reader.\(^{33}\) The essay-periodical was expected to be genteel and polite and to concern itself with good breeding and good manners. The Spectator was held up as a model of polite and amusing writing, at once elegant and instructive. Yet it would be dangerous for Hogg to imitate it too closely, for in the years between its publication and that of his own venture there had been a virtual revolution in manners, especially in female manners and in the proper treatment of sexual matters in polite society. Lawrence Stone explains the growth in the late seventeenth and in the eighteenth centuries of a set of manners and a culture in which the lady and the gentleman were immediately recognisable by a special set of behaviour traits. Sexual activity and excretion both became more private, and so delicacy and refinement, mental and physical, were the distinctive features of the polite and the genteel.\(^{34}\) These changes in manners

---


hardly affected the long-established conventional reputation of the Spectator for politeness, but they would influence the reception of any modern essay-periodical, especially perhaps one conducted by a man of little formal education who was widely known to be the product of a peasant society. Although in theory The Spy was anonymous, the name of the author gradually became known, and Hogg wrote that as this happened 'the number of his subscribers diminished. The learned, the enlightened, and polite circles of this flourishing metropolis, disdained either to be amused or instructed by the ebullitions of humble genius'. 35 Hogg was evidently disgusted and amazed when, after the appearance of a tale in which a young farmer seduces his housekeeper, 'no fewer than seventy-three subscribers gave up' (Memoir, p. 20). After all, the Spectator had included papers such as that on female chastity and the threats to it in the melting month of May: the ladies were warned of their danger in April so that they could have no excuse for being 'caught tripping'. Hogg's own attitude to matters of sexual conduct would seem to have resembled that of the Spectator. In replying to Francis Courtly's accusations of bluntness and coarseness of expression, a supposed correspondent of Mr Spectator had declared that 'Fornication and Adultery are modest words, because they express an evil Action as criminal, and so as to excite Horror and Aversion'. 36 In other words vice may, and even must,
be depicted in order to expose it to virtuous censure. If the moral inculcated by the depiction is correct, then it is neither wise nor necessary to good manners to lament that all mention of vice was not prevented. On the occasion mentioned Hogg's real opinion would seem to coincide with this, for he wrote to Scott, 'I was writing in the cause of virtue and had not the smallest apprehension of having made such a blunder'. Jane Austen, in a celebrated passage, shows how the real, if not the conventional, elegance of the Spectator had been eclipsed by the early years of the nineteenth century. She praises the reputedly low literary form of the novel as more suitable for a modern young lady's perusal than the famous essays:

Now, had the same young lady been engaged with a volume of the Spectator, instead of such a work, how proudly would she have produced the book, and told its name; though the chances must be against her being occupied by any part of that voluminous publication, of which either the matter or manner would not disgust a young person of taste: the substance of its papers so often consisting in the statement of improbable circumstances, unnatural characters, and topics of conversation, which no longer concern any one living; and their language, too, frequently so coarse as to give no very favourable idea of the age that could endure it.

Hogg, however, was understandably hurt that his papers should be singled out for attack as indelicate, and laid a plot to test the sincerity of his literary advisers. His own papers were passed off

37 Hogg to Scott, 28 September [1810], in NLS MS 3879, f.204.
as 'the productions of such and such gentlemen, famous for their literary abilities', while papers by Johnson and Addison were copied out as Hogg's own. Unsurprisingly, the papers actually by Johnson and Addison were found to be faulty, while those with celebrated names were approved of. Unfortunately, Hogg seems to have set this down to personal malignity against a literary outsider. It is thus doubtful whether he was even aware of at least a part of the dangers of his decision to write in the form of the essay-periodical.

Hogg's self-presentation as an original genius should never blind his reader as to the extent to which he taught himself by means of literary imitation. His first important collection of verse had been composed by imitating the literary ballads of Scott and his friends, and in his essay-periodical he learnt by imitation, sometimes quite close imitation, of the recognised masters in the form, and of the Spectator in particular. In fact the interest of the essay-periodical by the early nineteenth-century could hardly lie in an original or innovative literary manner because of its utter familiarity to both readers and writers. The success of an essay-periodical lay in 'its ability to provide amusing variations upon the familiar themes of the Tatler and Spectator'. Hogg's weekly paper should be considered in the light of his reader's expectations of a literary variation.

Naturally, Hogg treats many of the same subjects as his

39 'The Spy's Farewell to his Readers', The Spy, 17 September 1811, pp.409-15 (pp.409-10).
predecessors in this tradition: his 'Singularity Censured' parallels Number 576 of the Spectator, for example.\footnote{Compare 'Singularity Censured', \textit{The Spy}, 25 May 1811, pp. 305-11 with \textit{Spectator}, edited by Donald F. Bond, 5 vols (Oxford, 1965), IV, 569-71. Bond attributes this paper to Addison.} He also reworks particular conventions of the form to suit his own circumstances, and one of the most interesting of these is his adaptation of the familiar editorial persona to express his own literary isolation and troubled finances. Hogg's situation was a somewhat peculiar one. His paper was not the expression of a social or literary group, nor the considered scheme of an established writer, but the project of one man whose position in the society of Edinburgh was extremely insecure. His paper did not become successful as it progressed, for Hogg later remarked, 'after a year's literary drudgery, I found myself a loser rather than a gainer' (\textit{Memoir}, p. 21). Apparently \textit{The Spy} never sold well enough to be republished in volume form, even though Hogg in his last number promised that in a future edition errors would be corrected in the composition and printing and a list of contributors given in the index.\footnote{The Spy's Farewell to his Readers', \textit{The Spy}, 17 September 1811, pp. 409-15 (p. 411).} On commencing the paper Hogg had secured no real support for it: he had no established publisher for it, no solid literary support, and no significant list of subscribers. Scott had apparently refused to promise his aid, and later sent only one letter towards it enclosing two poems by John Leyden (\textit{Familiar Anecdotes}, p. 116), while Hogg recorded that he had 'begun it without asking, or knowing of any assistance' (\textit{Memoir}, p. 21). The literary connections
made while the paper was actually in progress also seem to have been limited. In his account of the venture in his autobiography Hogg names only six contributors, and apart from Mr and Mrs Gray their help seems to have been only occasional (Memoir, p.22). There are complete copies of the periodical existing in which Hogg marked the names of his contributors against their articles, and these suggest that about twenty named contributors assisted, though again of these it seems that only the Grays did so regularly and consistently.43 Caution should be exercised, however, in the use of these copies, for Hogg probably marked them several years after the papers themselves were composed and published. In the copy belonging to the library of the University of St Andrews reference is made several times, for example, to 'Sir Walter Scott' placing the notes after March 1820, while the comment 'Mr John Wilson Prof. of Mor. Phil' suggests the names were inserted after July of that year. The markings in the National Library of Scotland copy must be roughly contemporaneous with these, for against a remark on a young lady in 'Remarks on the Edinburgh Company of Players' Hogg had written 'now Mrs. Hogg', and his marriage did not take place until April 1820. Nor would there be a point in referring to one of the tales in The Spy as 'the original of Basil Lee' until the tale was brought out

43 I have examined two copies in which Hogg has marked the names of his contributors: that in the library of the University of St Andrews gives the names of twenty-one contributors, while that in the National Library of Scotland, Ry.II.b.6, gives the same list with the omission of one name. Mr James Sinton in an untitled communication to Scottish Notes and Queries, 7(1905-1906), 89-91 gives a list of twenty-five names with the number of contributions attributed by Hogg to each from a third copy at that time in his possession.
for the first time under that title in 1820. Even working by the assumption that these copies were marked by Hogg shortly after his revision of many of the tales of *The Spy* for his collection *Winter Evening Tales, collected among the Cottagers in the South of Scotland* (1820) anomalies exist. 'Affecting Narrative of a Country Girl', for example, was reprinted largely unaltered as Hogg's own in the collection, and attributed in the two marked copies to a Mr Black. It seems to be true from all accounts, however, that Hogg was not able to obtain much literary support for his paper. In a letter written shortly after the commencement of his paper Hogg revealed that he had begun it with Scott as his sole Edinburgh subscriber, and although the first few numbers secured an encouraging subscription list Hogg probably lost this advantage after a very few numbers by publishing supposedly indelicate articles (*Memoir*, p.20). The loss of these subscribers meant the failure of his attempt to persuade Constable to publish *The Spy* after the first quarter, and both of his actual publishers seem to have been of little importance in the trade. Hogg described Robertson as 'a bookseller in Nicolson Street, whom I had never before seen or heard of', and his second as 'proprietors of the Star newspaper' (*Memoir*, pp.20, 21). Hogg's literary isolation and troubled financial position in conducting *The Spy* are reflected in his use of the essay-periodical convention of the editorial persona. The first paper of the *Spectator* begins an account of the assumed personality

---

44 Hogg to Scott, 8 September [1810], in NLS MS 3879, f.184.
45 Hogg to Constable, undated, in Thomas Constable, Archibald Constable and his Literary Correspondents, 3 vols (Edinburgh, 1873), II, 354.
of the editor, Mr Spectator. Although he has withdrawn from active pursuits, this character is still essentially social, for despite his silence each class with whom he associates thinks the Spectator one of themselves. He has been taken for a Merchant upon the Exchange for above these ten Years, and sometimes pass for a Jew in the Assembly of Stock-Jobbers at Jonathan's. The Club of which he is a member is representative of British society: it contains the Clergyman, Will Honeycombs the man of fashion, Captain Sentry the soldier, Sir Andrew Freeport the merchant, Mr Temple the lawyer, and Sir Roger de Coverley the country squire. The function of Mr Spectator is to convince his audience that he can transmit a view of his society without the distortions that would arise from his being of one particular party or profession. The Mirror was in reality the product of a club of gentlemen, and therefore also social. Hogg's Spy is a far more ambiguous and disturbing reflector or observer of the social world in his first paper, which also explains his editorial personality.

Yet though this is a task incumbent on me, it has some fortunate circumstances attending it; for though there is scarcely a single individual in Edinburgh who has not seen me, as have great numbers in the country besides, yet not one of a thousand amongst them know who I am, or what I am about: so that though I am bound to tell the truth, I am not bound to tell the whole truth; and the omissions which I choose to make have very little chance of being discovered. 47

46 Spectator, edited by Donald F. Bond, 5 vols (Oxford, 1965), I, 4 (Number 1). This paper is attributed by Bond to Addison.
47 'The Spy's Account of Himself', The Spy, 1 September 1810, pp.1-8 (p.1).
Less secure socially than his predecessors, Hogg gently reminds the reader that the unknown and anonymous commentator may also be a threat. By not conforming to the habits and rules of any special group he retains his own private standards to judge them by. This is implicit in the more ominous title of the Spy, who also possesses the doubtful faculty of empathy given to the demonic figure of Gil-Martin in *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*, an ability to model his features after those of another person and so enter into his mind and thoughts. Despite the frankness of his self-description the Spy, in his capacity for deceit and moral ambiguity, is an interesting, socially-isolated variation of the *Spectator*’s plain observer. This is combined with a concern with authorship as a profession, which naturally springs from Hogg’s own troubled circumstances at the time he was writing his papers for *The Spy*, but may also reflect the concern of Johnson as a later periodical-essayist with similar topics. An unusually large number of papers included in the *Rambler* deal with the problems of authorship: there are essays on such topics as fame, patronage, dedications, and plagiarism, and even one rather more whimsical essay, Number 117, 'The Advantages of Living in a Garret', in which the lofty pretensions of the learned writers are gently and humorously equated with the high and airy dwellings they generally inhabit. 48 Hogg, as might be expected, attacks the bookseller rather than the patron, while the precarious position of

48 This paper, with details of sources and literary allusions, will be found in *The Works of Samuel Johnson*, Volume IV, Rambler, edited by W. J. Bate and Albrecht B. Strauss. (New Haven, Connecticut, 1969), pp. 258-64.
the author controls the meagre person of his editorial persona, a figure which remained largely undeveloped in Johnson's essays. The portly figure of Constable is contrasted with his own, when the Spy relates how the publisher's shopmen sneer at him as thin and underfed when he comes in to look over the newspapers and new publications. The Spy is persuaded that if it were not for 'some of the lean, hungry-looking d—ls as they call them, they would not in general be so fat', and in his indignation adds, 'Yes, my dear readers; would you believe it, there is a numerous race of beings in this world who feed themselves upon the brains of their own species'.

This picture of the underfed, dependent author is continued in a later paper, where the Spy hears his work discussed by two gentlemen in a reading-room. This is a variation on Number 218 of the Spectator where, sitting in a coffee-house in Aldgate, the Spectator hears himself described by men unknown to him as extravagant and unfit for any of the uses of life. There is a similar paper in the Mirror, where the writer hears himself described by one person as an advocate for Methodism and by another as a disciple of the doctrines of David Hume.

One of the gentlemen of Hogg's paper mistakes the other for the Spy on account of his meagre, starved appearance, while the true author turns his small legs and meagre hands to one side that the truth may not be

---

49 'The Spy's Account of Himself', The Spy, 1 September 1810, pp.1-8 (p.4).
50 Spectator, edited by Donald F. Bond, 5 vols (Oxford, 1965), II, 348-51. This paper is attributed by Bond to Steele. Mirror, tenth edition, 3 vols (London, 1794), I, 7-12 (Number 2).
Hogg himself of course was even exceptionally strongly-made and athletic, but here he was reworking a periodical convention to fit his theme of the unknown author and his hardships in a prosperous and relatively indifferent society.

Hogg's deliberate variation on the themes and concerns of the essay-periodical tradition also partially account for the two personalities of The Spy, those of the Spy and John Miller. Gifford has interpreted this as an example of the split between the Ettrick and the Edinburgh Hogg, saying that 'a polarity had been established; insecurity about his social position had created a mild form of split creative personality'. While it is true that Hogg's insecurity affects his writing in this periodical, the division between the Spy and John Miller is surely less an expression of Hogg's personal neuroses than it is a reworking of the essay-periodical convention of the urbane editor and his friend from the country. Miller is Hogg's equivalent to Sir Roger de Coverley or Umphraville, just as Scott's later creation of the Baron of Bradwardine also owes something to the tradition. There is a general division in this form in the eighteenth century between the values of the city and those of the country. Like Sir Roger John Miller has the function of representing an older and more traditional culture and of commenting on the fashions of the city from the viewpoint of the outsider. Miller is not an uncouth or illiterate rustic, for the Spy carefully describes him as 'the son

51 'A Dialogue in the Reading Room', The Spy, 29 December 1810, pp.137-42 (p.138).
of a poor school-master in a remote corner of the country; a good English and Latin scholar, yet uses the broadest dialect of the district, in his common conversation'. Miller unites country habits and values with formal learning and a knowledge of books, and while maintaining his connection with the speech, habits, and values of his country friends and relations has gained an education comparable to that of a middle-class gentleman. Hogg himself perhaps tried to maintain something like this position in later life as a public figure and literary man who was also a country farmer and a notable member of a local rural society. Miller promises to contribute to the paper 'anecdotes illustrative of country manners in general, delineations of many singular characters in Nithsdale and Galloway, old legends, and stories of ghosts and bogles'. In 'Remarks on the Edinburgh Company of Players' John Miller accompanies the Spy to the theatre, as Sir Roger had attended the playhouse with Mr Spectator. In each case the countryman betrays his simplicity by his remarks on what they see acted, but Sir Roger is more ignorant than Hogg allows John Miller to be. Miller represents not ignorance but natural taste uncorrupted by fashion or custom, and this appeal to nature is meant to move the reader away from the standards of Edinburgh to a more universal human sphere. The Spy carefully points out that Miller has read plays and considered how they should be acted, even though he had never seen one acted on the stage, and continues, 'consequently I knew that pure and simple

53 'The Spy's Encounter with John Miller', The Spy, 17 November 1810, pp.89-92 (pp.90, 92).
nature, who is a better monitor than many are aware of, or willing to believe, would direct his observations'. The appeal to nature moves the reader away from the values of the Spectator in effect, for in that urban standards are dominant. Sir Roger's honest simplicity and valuable feelings are treated with affection, but he falls far below the urbane understanding of the Spectator. Sir Roger 'could not imagine how the Play would end', and his emotions of pity and concern are roused for the characters acted, rather than his critical powers exercised in judging of the abilities of the actors. There are obvious echoes of Sir Roger de Coverley in John Miller: for instance, his reference to Pyrrhus as 'the old Fellow in Whiskers' is brought to mind by Miller's reference to the 'lang fellow wi' the coud breaks'. Hogg places a higher value on simplicity and nature, though, and this is indicated by the fact that although Miller's expressions are often seen as amusing his opinions are often shared by the Spy himself. When the Spy thinks that one of the actresses mouths her words in an unbecoming fashion Miller thinks that she gapes like a gorlin, or fledgling bird in the nest. The comedy arises from the contrast between the expected formality of expression and the pithy, accurate, homely Scots expressions of Miller.54 Hogg's individuality is manifested in this adaptation of the well-known conventions of the Spectator and its followers to his personal circumstances and the changed mood of

his own age. By comparison his contributors often seem merely to imitate them. James Gray's 'Duty of Servants and Masters', for instance, has the Spy describing the state of slavery in classical times, and then characterising the contrasting behaviour of two Edinburgh ladies of his acquaintance, Mrs Peevish and Mrs Harvey, towards their servants. It has little of the freshness of Hogg's approach to similarly well-worn topics.

Though in these respects The Spy is a variation of the essay-periodical it also tends to push the form in the direction of the miscellany or even in that of the weekly literary paper of the 1820s and 1830s for which Hogg was to write in later years. Hogg proposed in his first paper to add 'elegant, or comparative extracts, illustrative of the preceding subject' to fill up the sheet of paper on which his weekly essay was to be printed. In fact the paper regularly contained a slight section of original poetry by Hogg and his contributors, a feature typical of the old-fashioned magazine such as the Scots Magazine and one which was to exist later in such weekly literary papers as the Edinburgh Literary Journal. A contemporary writing on Hogg's venture seems to imply that this feature was an unusual one for the essay-periodical in saying that the work 'possesses one superiority over every other work of the same kind, in its poetry, of which the greater part is very beautiful'.

56 'The Spy's Account of Himself', The Spy, 1 September 1810, pp.1-8 (p.5).
Literary Amusement and Instruction', and while this does imply the tradition of the essay-periodical and recall Addison's declaration that he was ambitious to have it said of him that he had 'brought Philosophy out of Closets and Libraries, Schools and Colleges, to dwell in Clubs and Assemblies, at Tea-Tables, and in Coffee-Houses', it also suggests the more specialised literary paper of a subsequent period. Hogg is vague in surviving statements about his policy in conducting The Spy, and although he does not forget the essay-periodical's characteristic task of instruction in morals and manners he seems to place as much or perhaps more emphasis on simple entertainment. In a letter to Scott written not long after the commencement of the paper Hogg defends his fourth number with the declaration that he 'was writing in the cause of virtue', but he had also said, 'I imagined my light humourous [sic] papers would take best in a work intended for amusement'. In his opening number, where a statement of policy would be expected of him, Hogg merely wrote, 'As to my plan of conducting this publication, it must of course be ruled considerably by concurring circumstances'. In a subsequent paper it is implied that the Spy will make his paper whatever his readers wish it to be. Hearing his theatrical criticism praised the Spy resolves to have some account of the drama in each paper for the following weeks, only to reverse this sudden decision as suddenly on hearing another gentleman disapprove of the

58 *Spectator*, edited by Donald F. Bond, 5 vols (Oxford, 1965), I, 44 (Number 10). This paper is attributed by Bond to Addison.
59 Hogg to Scott, 28 September [1810], in NLS MS 3879, f.204.
60 'The Spy's Account of Himself', *The Spy*, 1 September 1810, pp.1-8 (p.5).
same article. This person presents the traditional view of the
function of the essay-periodical writer:

'The Spy's business should be, to note the literary tastes, the
genius and manners of the various classes of people throughout
the kingdom, and, as much as possible, to blend instruction with
amusement .... He should laugh at our foibles; reprehend our
vices; and, occasionally lead us to view their fatal
consequences, by narratives of misery and woe'.

Finally, the Spy leaves, resolving that as it is impossible for him
to please all his readers, he will at least try to please himself.
Perhaps as part of the theme of the impecunious author in an
indifferent society Hogg tended to make the power of pleasing his
first object in conducting The Spy, and this naturally had its
effect upon the essay-periodical form employed by him, pushing it
even further towards fiction than before.

In 'Singularity Censured' Hogg allows an interest in the comic
and the eccentric to take over and transform his model of the
Johnsonian essay, and the moral intent stands in second place.
Between a series of moral reflections partly drawn from Number 98
of the Rambler Hogg inserts a number of anecdotes about a supposed
friend, Lewis, who is noted for his singularity. Lewis refers to
bacon ham as sow and the whisky-measure as Jereboam the son of
Nebat. On one occasion he carved a goose so badly and violently
that the wing he intended for a young lady was hurled across the
table and struck her in the face, and when she complained he only

---

61 'A Dialogue in the Reading Room', The Spy, 29 December 1810,
pp.137-42 (p.139).
told her that she ought to have caught it with her teeth. These are amusing extravagances but not really examples of the evils attending the folly that the paper sets out to expose. Hogg does not describe Lewis's exclusion from society or affection, nor even the contempt excited by his affectations. Lewis himself seems relatively unaffected either by his curious behaviour or by its effects, and it is his companions who suffer, silently trembling in apprehension. If in this essay amusing anecdotes predominate, in 'On the Folly of Anger and Impatience under Misfortunes' the close observation of psychological quirks and oddities takes over the interest of the piece from the moralist. Gifford discusses this essay as showing the Spy's fascination for the results in action of mental disturbance and stress, and comments that Hogg is not being melodramatic ... but has a genuine interest in the real person ....' Hogg's portraits here are all those of eccentrics in some way; one is of a girl of defective memory who sings when something is about to go wrong and laughs once it has happened, and another is of a boy who is morbidly fascinated by death and putrefaction, while an African's mirth at a tragedy is remarked, together with the way that laughing and crying merge into one another with children. The viewpoint of older essay-periodical

Writers had generally been from a central standard, so that the portraits they drew to expose particular failings had deviated from an understood and accepted behaviour. They were generalised types and their deviation not their individuality itself was the feature the reader's attention was drawn to. Hymenaeus, for example, had written to the Rambler deploring his inability to find a sensible woman he might marry, and was answered by a lady, Tranquilla, who had experienced similar difficulties in finding a mate. Each of them described their former lovers under similarly characteristic names: for instance, one of Tranquilla's suitors, who was an expert cook and thought of nothing but eating, was named Dentatus. Hogg's portraits interest from their oddity, and not as illustrations of deviation from a generally accepted standard. In essays such as this Hogg's moral reflections and his anecdotes tend not to hang together well, and the amusing part has more interest for him and the reader than the instructive.

Hogg writes a more successful essay when his reflections proceed from the story instead of giving rise to it. 'Evil Speaking Ridiculed by an Allegorical Dream' is the best example of this. Although it is uncertain which parts of the paper are by Hogg (the two marked copies also suggesting a Rev. John Gray as an author), the inclusion of it with very little alteration in Winter Evening Tales, collected among the Cottagers in the South of Scotland of 1820 as well as its style suggests that Hogg was largely

responsible for the paper. The naive, well-meaning gentleman who attacks his back-biting friend in his sleep under the impression that he is assaulting the devil in person, and then is prosecuted for it, reflects on the affair in a way that is both morally appropriate and amusingly in character:

It is very hard that a man should be severely fined for resisting the devil when there are so few that give themselves the trouble to do it.

It is true, that owing to my country education, I am a little inclined to be superstitious; but I cannot help thinking, that the whole of the accident was a kind of judgment inflicted on us both for a dangerous error; on him for abusing so many of the human race behind their backs ... and on me for assenting implicitly to all his injurious assertions. Nay, I would even fain carry the mystery a little further, by alleging [sic], that a traducer and backbiter is actually a limb or agent of the devil ....

This paper moves confidently and naturally from absurd comedy to serious moral comment by placing the fiction first and allowing the moral comment to issue forth as part of it. Interestingly, it also moves further away from the polite and essentially urban world of the periodical essayists, and into that of some of the most characteristic of Hogg's fiction. The formal moral essay is seen through an atmosphere of warning dreams and providential judgements familiar from legend and from old-fashioned religious literature. Hogg's introduction of such matters here is not naive, however,

though of course his narrator is. The moral points are at once valid and amusing, as they are shown through the honest but simple-minded perspective of the narrator's mind. In the moral essays of *The Spy* Hogg redirects some of the traditional aspects of the essay-periodical towards fiction, showing an interest in the implied distance between author and character as well as in comic and fantastic anecdotes and in exploring unusual psychological states.

In addition to this Hogg also included in *The Spy* tales which relate to a fictional type more often, though not exclusively, found in the eighteenth-century magazine than in the essay-periodical. The sentimental tale had a tremendous vogue in the magazines, partly because in the hands of Sterne and Mackenzie it had a characteristic fondness for digressions, fragments, and *tableaux*, which made it easy to extract from and to reprint in sections, and easy to imitate in its freedom from tight structural controls. The reputation of the sentimental tale for politeness and morality made it acceptable as family reading-matter too perhaps. The only tale Hogg apparently published ... between the conclusion of *The Spy* and the commencement of *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* was a sentimental tale printed in an old-fashioned magazine, and not surprisingly he also experimented with this type of tale in *The Spy* itself.67 Hogg's personal fondness for tales of seduction and for themes involving the helpless state of abandoned girls and their illegitimate offspring does seem remarkable, but such themes were

also characteristic of some sentimental fiction. The story of
the seduction and marriage of Louisa Venoni in Numbers 108 and 109
of the Mirror is an example within the essay-periodical, and Thompson
points out that Number 375 of the Spectator is also a tale of
seduction with a happy ending. Hogg's 'Affecting Narrative of a
Country Girl' takes the form of a letter from 'M.M.', who relates
that she is one of the numerous children of a poor country farmer,
and was sent out to service in the family of a local gentleman
because her father could not make use of the services of his whole
family at home. She was seduced by the student son of her employer,
but eventually rescued from a further descent into vice. Besides
this simple plot of the betrayed maiden the tale also concerns itself
with the topics of community and religion. At the beginning of her
narrative the girl dwells on the happiness she enjoyed as a result
of early religious training, which united piety and a sense of
well-doing to family affection. Her home and family became
distasteful to her as she listened to her lover's protestations, and
they tried to warn her of her danger. Her sense of her own
wrongdoing separated her from the pious and protective community,
and this movement of social and spiritual isolation reaches a climax
when she escapes to the city to evade the censure both of her family
and the church because of her pregnancy. Wandering in the streets
she rashly despairs of the goodness of Providence, and resolves to
enter a house which she supposes to be a haunt of debauchery and

68 Harold William Thompson, A Scottish Man of Feeling: Some
Account of Henry MacKenzie, Esq. of Edinburgh and of the
vice. Her account of the events which followed her resolution demonstrates that her fall from innocence is the result of her wilful wrongdoing, of which the physical seduction is a symbol.

But never let the wretched despair, or for a moment suppose that the Governor of the universe sports with the miseries of his creatures. — Folly may indeed lead them to misery, but misfortune, for the most part, is only a more gentle name for imprudence. That protecting providence, of which I had just despaired, over-ruled my rash resolution, and directed me into the house of a poor, but benevolent woman .... 69

The narrator is as much a sinner as a passive victim here, separating herself as far as possible both from God and from her community. She feels that she has been rescued by an undeserved act of providential intervention. Aided by this woman and by her own brothers, who seek her out in Edinburgh, she writes from the house of a relation a few miles from the city, and is able, in contrast to her earlier curses, freely to forgive her seducer and to pray for his forgiveness by God, while reminding him of the accountability of all human creatures for their actions on the last day. Her emotive account of her errors, suffering, and restoration, gains the reader's sympathy, but in focusing attention on the perplexities of her mind and conscience and ignoring the erotic aspect it also gives the tale a moral or even spiritual emphasis, and makes it a type of confession.

In 'Misery of an Old Batchelor' the sentimental tale is not harnessed to concerns of Hogg's own but gently mocked. His main

---

character relates his youthful love adventures, exposing in the
process his own shiftless and unstable character as a lover. The
episodes he recounts oppose both the didactic and sentimental
rhetoric in which they are set. A brief introductory moral passage
describes the forlorn and miserable situation of the confirmed old
bachelor and apparently deplores the narrator's own failure to
marry when he has had several favourable opportunities to do so.
In opposition to this sententious tone, part at least of the
adventures themselves are highly comic, with the undignified narrator
cowering behind piles of old clothes and being dropped from upstairs
windows in his visits to court one girl. In an earlier episode he
relates his timid courtship of a girl of higher social position in
a flourishing sentimental style. This whole section of the tale
bears marks of a tradition of writing in imitation of Sterne. It
is heavily punctuated with dashes and exclamation marks, and has
such characteristic inversions of normal word order as 'said I'.
Expressions are employed, such as 'raptures of delight thrilled my
whole frame', which suggest the power of the emotions in the
composition of the narrator. The narrator's love for the girl is
ardent, but he is fearful of offending her and is concerned that she
may not return his affection. He meets her by chance one day in
her father's grounds, when she smiles at him and turns in to a little
summer-house. He hesitates to follow her, reflecting that perhaps
her smile was 'given only by chance — she was always smiling!'.
He discovers her lingering in the summer-house on this cold day with
a book in her hand and tears in her eyes, and soon discovers the
book to be Goldsmith's novel, The Vicar of Wakefield, almost a
manual of sentimentalism at this time. He reads with her, placing
his cheek against hers to see the page from a more convenient angle
and at intervals calling out the word 'now' for her to turn over the
leaves of the volume.

We came to the end of a chapter — Now, said I; but it seems I
had said it in a different way that time, for instead of
turning the leaf, she closed the book! ... I am weary of it,
said she. — 'Tis time, said I. I envied not the joys of
angels that day! when I, for the first time, found myself
alone with her whom I loved and valued above all the rest of
the world. I was so electrified with delight, that once for a
moment I believed it to be all a dream. I declared my violent
affection for her, in the most respectful manner I was capable
of. 70

Like Miss Walton in Mackenzie's The Man of Feeling, the girl here has
understood her lover's feeling and returned it before he spoke.
Later events reveal this sentimental scene to be ironic, however.
Hogg uses this love affair to take the measure of the possible gap
between the rhetoric of sentiment and the good sense of principle,
recalling to the modern reader Jane Austen's contrast between the
immoral behaviour and the lofty speeches and pretensions of the two
heroines of her early 'Love and Friendship'. The girl of Hogg's
tale is not really reticent and delicate, but frank and open with a
cheerful tolerance of her lover's failings. Her love is founded
not on the nobility of his character but on an even startlingly
realistic estimate of his anti-heroic qualities. She discovers
that he has been paying his court to others while engaged to her,
but readily forgives him, telling him that this does not surprise

70 'Misery of an Old Batchelor', The Spy, 15 December 1810,
pp.121-27 (pp.123, 123-24).
her, as she knows his disposition better than he does himself. Pressed to name their marriage-day, she leaves it entirely to himself to decide, when he puts the matter off from one day to another, and eventually neglects her altogether, whereupon she marries a more forthright man but continues to treat him with the frank cheerfulness of an old friend. The girl's exceptional composure and her refusal to disguise or extenuate her realistic estimate of her lover's failings, together with his eventual boredom, are in splendid contrast to the lofty style and tremulousness of their love-scene. Nor should this stylistic playfulness on Hogg's part seem surprising, for he was shortly to produce a volume of poetical imitations and parodies, and attempted a number of different forms and techniques in his prose fiction. For instance, in his best-known longer work, The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner, Hogg turned to his own ends the Gothic combination of an over-wrought, distressed first-person account of horrible and apparently supernatural events with an explanatory editorial narrative. Gifford also comments on the presence in one of Hogg's later and more extensive works of fiction of an 'Ossianic style' and of a sometimes blurred 'dividing line between straightforward presentation of romance and ironic comment upon it'.

In a number of his tales for The Spy, however, Hogg seems to have rejected both the sententious didacticism of the moral essay and the emotive didacticism of the sentimental tale. The separately

printed list of contents of The Spy contains the promise of some fiction not even barely disguised as example, warning, or illustration of a moral issue. Number 49, for example, allures the reader in a manner that recalls the title-pages of Defoe with 'History of the Life of Duncan Campbell, his difficulties, escapes, rencounter with a Ghost and other adventures'. Others are boldly entitled 'Amusing Story of Two Highlanders' and 'Story of the Ghost of Lochmaben'. Mackenzie's stories in the Mirror had retained their explicit links with moral instruction, even though they were innovative in their increased length. The moral point inculcated is stated first in the full title given in the contents pages of the collected edition. One example of such a title is 'Importance of religion to minds of sensibility; story of La Roche' for numbers 42 to 44 of the Mirror. In the case of Hogg's 'The Danger of Changing Occupations' the tale Hogg was probably intending to write as a simple illustration of the evil consequences of changing occupations spreads out beyond this purpose. Hogg's protagonist tells his own story, and there is less distance between him and the reader as a result. Hogg did not even choose to use the device of the older and wiser man discussing the folly of his younger self, which would have increased this distance. The narrator rather stresses the continuity of his personality, remarking on his digressive narrative that in this as in everything else he is 'still jumping from one thing to another', and commenting on his situation with his seduced housekeeper, 'as usual, I saw and lamented my folly, yet could not get quit of it'. Experience is not his teacher, for he is as well aware of his folly when it is committed as in later years. The tale also includes matter that seems rather
foreign to the purpose of illustrating a moral. Several incidents related are extremely ludicrous rather than disturbing in the way that they are written, for example. The hero sells cut tobacco for tea and snuff for Jesuit's bark, while his fast riding leads people to assume he must be on his way to fetch the doctor. Part of his story reads as a travel account too, when the narrator, in his flight to the coast to enlist as a soldier in the American wars, journeys through Ettrick and Yarrow and gives a description of the beauties of St Mary's Loch and the old church there. Again, towards the end of his account, on his return from America to Scotland, the narrator is landed on an unknown island and describes the manners, appearance, accommodation, and methods of agriculture of the inhabitants.72 Such digressive, descriptive commentary on what the narrator observes and is interested in seems more reminiscent of the novels of Defoe than of the essay-periodical.

The fiction of The Spy also anticipates the tales of country life and characters Hogg later contributed to important nineteenth-century periodicals, and more especially his magazine series under the title of 'The Shepherd's Calendar' in Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine. The alteration in social class and manners of the protagonists of Hogg's tales and sketches in his essay-periodical from the conventional one is described by Mayo, whose wide-ranging aims, however, do not permit him to analyse Hogg's achievement in detail, and who seems unaware of the degree to which Hogg was rather

extending a previously existing, though largely undeveloped, movement in the form than being totally innovative.

Hogg's subjects are characteristically not wealthy heiresses, young gentlemen of ancient family, upper middle-class eccentrics, and the spoiled beauties of polite society, but common shepherds like himself, tenant farmers, and misguided originals of humble background, who have a closer affinity with the subjects of the *Lyrical Ballads* than with those of the *Mirror*, the *Lounger*, the *Looker-On*, and *Literary Leisure*. 73

This statement requires some qualification, for the *Mirror* and the *Lounger* themselves move the essay-periodical away from the emphasis of the *Spectator* on urban values, and the world of wealth and fashion. Though Sir Roger de Coverley clearly represented the positive side of a rural life-style, his affectionately-drawn portrait was intended as a satirical demonstration that 'this combination of personal charm and political ineptitude represented an obsolete and wrong-headed type in English society — attractive and companionable, but not the sort to be trusted with the management of the country's affairs!'. 74 Several papers in the *Mirror* and the *Lounger* address themselves to the problems and feelings of the old-fashioned country gentry without much capital under the pressures created by the wealth and new standards of living introduced into Scotland by the *nouveaux riches* and by that section of the native aristocracy which chose to ape English manners and

---

ostentatious standards of living. Number 45 of the Mirror, discussing the thing that distinguishes the man of fashion, decides that once it was birth, but that now it is money. In number 28 Umphraville, the country gentleman, deplores the inhumanity and injustice of even the best-disposed men, like Colonel Plum, when placed as soldiers of fortune in India where their chief object becomes a desire to amass wealth. Even more significant here is a series of papers in the Mirror and the Lounger about the trials of a long-suffering countryman with a family of giddy daughters. John Homespun farms his own land and his wife is a useful housekeeper and manager, and John intends his daughters to be educated to marry and belong to similar establishments. Firstly his daughters are corrupted by fashionable relations, who alter the girls' simple and blooming appearance to the languor and pallor required by fashion. Then the lady comes to dinner, disarranges the household, and gives even the servants an affectation of gentility. Elizabeth Homespun enters into a sentimental correspondence with this lady, but finds on going to Edinburgh that her friendship is not valued there as it was in the country. In the Lounger papers in the series Homespun's family peace is threatened chiefly by his neighbour Mushroom's son, who has returned home from India with a fortune. It is interesting that Homespun is more annoyed at the interference of the upstart than at that of the lady. In describing this conflict of values in a

76 The Homespun papers are Numbers 12, 25, and 53 of the Mirror and Numbers 17, 36, 56, 62, and 98 of the Lounger.
manner that is sympathetic to the old-fashioned, rural gentry the
Mirror descends below the society portrayed in the Spectator and
partly repudiates its stress on urban values. This world, priding
itself on birth but defensive on questions of wealth, education, and
fashion, is lower than that of the Spectator and nearer to that of
Hogg's country characters than that is. Hogg's country fiction in
The Spy anticipates two important strands of his writing for the
periodicals of the 1820s and 1830s, just as it developed from the
notes to his own poetry and from his use of the essay form here.
Firstly, in even a limited piece like 'Description of a Peasant's
Funeral', he tried to explain the customs of a rural peasant society
to an urbanised, middle-class audience, and his characterisation is
bound down by the need to describe representatively. Then in
'Dreadful Narrative of the Death of Major Macpherson' there is an
early and crude example of the deserved punishment by apparently
supernatural means of a wealthy man guilty of oppression and
injustice towards the poorer common people.77 'History of the Life
of Duncan Campbell' combines the theme of justice and that of
depicting a rural society, for the plot concerns the restoration of
a missing heir in 'a tale of affectionate farewells and
recognitions', as one reviewer remarked when the tale was reprinted
in 1820.78 Not only is Duncan restored to his old father and to
the property to which he is the rightful successor, but the family

77 'Description of a Peasant's Funeral', The Spy, 17 November
1810, pp.92-95; 'Dreadful Narrative of the Death of Major
Macpherson', The Spy, 24 November 1810, pp.101-03.
78 'James Hogg', Newcastle Magazine, 1(1820-1821), 122-36
(p.127).
who rescued Duncan from vagrancy and educated him are themselves succoured by him when in need. The plot is combined with a strong feeling of the pleasures of childhood in the country, and Hogg also recounts legends like that of the pedlar of Thirlestane mill, and how the boys pulled the bedclothes up over their heads after hearing these tales. This tale was deservedly popular both with the buyers of chapbooks and of periodicals, for it was reprinted in both as well as in Hogg’s later volumes of fiction. Other tales in The Spy were less appealing, for while conducting a weekly paper undoubtedly taught Hogg to write with facility the physical strain of such an extended effort meant that the tales must often have been hastily written and clumsily constructed. Hogg later revised many of them, both for this reason perhaps, and to adapt the tales from their state as parts of an essay-periodical to that of stories in a volume collection. The practice of publishing his shorter fiction in periodicals and then collecting it up into the more durable form of the volume collection became almost habitual with Hogg, and the relationship between the periodical and the volume text of a particular tale is frequently of interest.

The relationship of The Spy to Hogg’s two earliest separate publications of fiction is an unusual one. Hogg was evidently planning a collection of fiction which would include some of his

79 ‘History of the Life of Duncan Campbell’, The Spy, 3 and 17 August 1811, pp.383-41, 351-408 [mispaged].
80 Two chapbook editions are listed in Enid C. Batho, The Ettrick Shepherd (Cambridge, 1927), p.199, and an example of a periodical version is ‘Duncan and his Dog’, Schoolmaster, 29 June 1833, pp.409-15.
work in *The Spy* as early as 1813, the year of his success as a poet with *The Queen's Wake: A Legendary Poem*. In a letter of April of that year he mentioned, in answering one from Scott of criticism on his poem, that he had materials enough for two volumes octavo of prose tales, adding, 'I have one will make about 200 pages alone some of the others you have seen in the Spy &c.'. Hogg apparently offered these to Constable in the following month, for he wrote of 'the rural and traditionary tales of Scotland', and mentioned that they would fill either two large octavo or four 12mo volumes. Apparently Constable was not even interested enough to reply to the offer, for Hogg wrote again in July, stating this and offering to let Constable publish 'one tale in the first place as an experiment to sound the public'. This too was seemingly refused. Hogg was not the only writer of Scottish fiction to experience difficulties in finding a publisher, for Constable in the same year also rejected what was to become John Galt's best-known work of Scottish fiction, *Annals of the Parish*. Scott's triumph with *Waverley* and its successors seems to have made publishers, and no doubt readers too, more receptive to the idea of Scottish fiction in general. Four years later Hogg offered Blackwood a collection entitled "Cottage Winter Nights", which was described as containing "The Rural and Traditionary Tales of Scotland". The

---

81 Hogg to Scott, 3 April 1813, in NLS MS 3884, f.122.
82 Hogg to Constable, 20 May 1813 and 12 July [1813], in Thomas Constable, *Archibald Constable and his Literary Correspondents*, 3 vols (Edinburgh, 1873), II, 356, 357.
84 Hogg to Blackwood, 4 January 1817, in NLS MS 4002, f.153.
similar subtitle suggests that this is fundamentally the same collection. Blackwood did not publish this collection, but in 1818 he did publish two volumes entitled The Brownie of Bodsbeck; and other Tales. Hogg suggested to Blackwood that something like the following announcement of the forthcoming publication should be made:

\[
\text{In the press and speedily will be published Vol's 1 and 2 of Mr Hogg's Cottage Tales containing The Brownie of Bodsbeck and The Wool-gatherer. These tales have been selected by him among the Shepherds and peasantry of Scotland and are arranged so as to delineate the manners and superstitions of that class in ancient and modern times &c &c.} 85
\]

Even apart from the similarity between this plan and the later scheme of The Shepherd's Calendar this is interesting for Hogg's use of the same terms here as in mentioning his former collection. It is possible that he made the same offer to Blackwood that he had earlier made to Constable, of allowing his publisher to issue a sample of the collection in the hope that the rest of the tales would then be required. Perhaps The Brownie of Bodsbeck itself may have originated even in that tale of about two hundred pages Hogg mentioned to Scott. Mack points out passages from the text of this tale which give it the character of a traditional tale told around the fireside in the country on long winter evenings, and makes most of the points above to suggest that the tale was probably composed, as Hogg had claimed, before Scott's Old Mortality (1816). 86

85 Hogg to Blackwood, 13 January 1818, in NLS MS 4003, f.86.
second separate publication of prose fiction would seem to proceed from this earlier collection too. It contains a number of tales from *The Spy*, and this continuity is implied in its full title of *Winter Evening Tales, collected among the Cottagers in the South of Scotland*. Hogg's own comment on this collection is extremely misleading, and was probably designed to attract to the tales the readers who enjoyed the self-portrait of Hogg as a peasant-poet in the autobiography, and to excuse the supposed lapses in standards of delicacy noted by reviewers of the work.

The greater part of these Tales was written in early life, when I was serving as a shepherd lad among the mountains, and on looking them over, I saw well enough that there was a blunt rusticity about them; but I liked them the better for it, and altered nothing. To me they appeared not only more characteristic of the life that I then led, but also of the manners that I was describing. As to the indelicacies hinted at by some reviewers, I do declare that such a thought never entered into my mind .... (Memoir, p.50)

In his letter to Constable of May 1813 Hogg says of his earlier collection, 'I have for many years been collecting the rural and traditionary tales of Scotland, and I have of late been writing them over again and new-modelling them ....'\(^87\) Several of the tales from *The Spy* were extensively revised between their publication there and their appearance in these volumes in addition. Hogg probably did collect his stories in his youth, but it is demonstrably untrue that he altered nothing in the literary treatment of those stories, however faithful he might have been to

---

87 Hogg to Constable, 20 May 1813, in NLS MS 7200, f.203.
his original outlines.

Hogg's two separately published collections of 1818 and 1820 probably appeared much later than Hogg had intended, because of his difficulties in finding a publisher for them. They were indeed only published after the appearance of Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine as an outlet for and influence upon Hogg's work in prose. Their character is therefore influenced to varying degrees by the characteristics both of the later periodical and of The Spy, so that any division of the tales by the influence exerted upon each by one of the two periodicals must seem somewhat arbitrary. For example, 'The Renowned Adventures of Basil Lee' in Winter Evening Tales has its origin in 'The Danger of Changing Occupations' in The Spy.88 However, it was almost certainly revised after the founding of Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine since Basil's boon companion during his adventures with the British army in America is an Irishman named Ensign Odogherty, one of the fictitious literary personalities of that magazine. Thomas Hamilton created this character, which was later taken up and developed by the Irishman William Maginn. The name is spelt Odoherty in the magazine, but the character of the two trickster ensigns is still substantially the same. Hogg, who received copies of the magazine regularly from William Blackwood, would have known Hamilton's three papers, the first of which

---

88 Compare 'The Danger of Changing Occupations', The Spy, 15 and 22 September 1810, pp.17-24, 25-32 with 'The Renowned Adventures of Basil Lee', Winter Evening Tales, I, 1-99. The abbreviation Winter Evening Tales is listed before the text, and will be used throughout this study, for James Hogg, Winter Evening Tales, collected among the Cottagers in the South of Scotland, 2 vols (Edinburgh and London, 1820).
appeared in Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine for February 1818.89 There are tales in both collections which had previously appeared in The Spy, while Winter Evening Tales includes tales which had either previously appeared in the magazine or been offered to Blackwood for that purpose, and The Brownie of Bodsbeck itself, despite its early date of composition, seems naturally to fit in with some of the concerns of the magazine.

Even bearing in mind these complications, it is still possible to trace the influence of The Spy on Hogg's first two separate collections of prose fiction, and to note the alterations and revisions made by him in moving from one medium to another. Of the first collection of 1818 only one tale, 'The Wool-gatherer', had previously appeared in The Spy, and it had been revised extensively.90 Some changes were obviously made to clarify the plot and to remove obscurities arising from those habits of hasty composition derived from producing a paper at only weekly intervals. For example, in the original tale a letter is produced from the eldest son of the family asking his brother to seek out and protect his wife, who is living with her father and sister, in the event of his early death. The residence of the wife at her home renders her


90 The tale had previously appeared as 'The Country Laird', The Spy, 9, 16, and 23 February 1811, pp.149-55, 157-64, 165-206 [mispaged].
flight incomprehensible by undoing the effect of the earlier explanation that she fled at his bidding, and also suggests that George would not have experienced the difficulty he claims in finding her. In the later version the wife left her home to join her husband, and when his regiment was sent abroad she was on her return to her sister's house when she gave birth to little George and died. Jane's change of residence to care for the infant then explains George's inability to find out what has become of his brother's wife. Other alterations seem to be motivated by a design to change the structure of the tale to make the delineation of rural customs and beliefs more prominent. Writing in *The Spy* Hogg was perhaps restrained by the polite connotations of the essay-periodical as a form as well as by the physical limits of two or three essay-length papers. In his collection of rural tales, on the other hand, Hogg could present to a polite audience a way of life distinct from their own, and not only interesting for its curiosity but also morally and socially valuable in its own right. The change in structure is partly achieved by making the hero and heroine more isolated in their gentility within the country world; this not only prefigures their marriage and makes it seem more fitting, but allows the couple to act as a substitute for Hogg's reader within the tale. In the original story the laird's mother is also a genteel character, is dignified, and says little. In the revised version she is of low birth herself, a gossip, a hard mistress to the servant lasses, and a scold. Hogg creates an excellent Scots speaker by this change, as well as isolating the hero on his own estate and preparing the reader for his marriage to Jane. In the story in *The Spy*, the old lady's reaction to her son's
remark that fishing is cruel as it is hard to take a precious life for a single mouthful, is to make a bland and uncomprehending statement that nobody cares for the life of a fish, before persuading him to take his father's tackle and go fishing. In the later version her statement is expanded, and given a rhythmical Scots vehemence that marks her vigour and roughness of manner.

"His presence be about us! Lindsey! what's that ye say? Who heard ever tell of a trout's precious life? Or a salmon's precious life? Or a god's precious life? Wow, man, but sma' things are precious i' your sent! Or who can feel for a trout? A cauldride creature that has nae feeling itsel; a greedy grampus of a thing, that worries its ain kind, an' eats them whenever it can get a chance."

The hero's isolation in his gentility is matched by the increased gentility of the heroine, Jane. In the account she gives of herself in The Spy Jane was brought up in the country at her aunt's house, where she was accustomed to work with the servants in country labour at all busy seasons. Her father neglects his business by mixing with low and irregular company, losing half of his daughters' modest fortunes in the consequent bankruptcy, and afterwards indulges in occasional excessive debauches, until one night he is brought home dead drunk from a sleep in the snow on Leith Links and dies of the exposure. In the later version the passage about Jane labouring in the country is omitted, and her father is unsuccessful

---

91 James Hogg, 'The Wool-gatherer', in The Brownie of Bodsbeck; and other Tales, 2 vols (Edinburgh and London, 1818), II, 89-228 (pp.95-96). References to tales will be given in full the first time a reference is made, while thereafter, in continuous discussion of the same tale, the page number will be given in parentheses within the text.
in business only through a mysterious despondency, nor does he waste his children's money. Jane speaks less Scots in this version, and is more embarrassed at the indelicacy of little George receiving presents from the hero. Jane and the hero alone speak English and share values outside those of the rural community, and as the other characters explain country ways to them the reader is instructed. Hogg may have learnt this technique from Scott, whose novels often introduce a well-bred young Englishman into Scottish scenes and habits, which are then explained for his benefit and that of the reader. The figure of the shrewd and ragged servant who befriends Jane is made more important in the later version of this tale, and his most prominent function is now to display and explain rural ways to the genteel couple, in addition to his earlier protection of the heroine. Gifford writes of Barnaby's information on folk belief, indeed, as establishing a set of rules that help the reader to understand the progress of many of Hogg's short stories. The boy relates to Jane the beliefs in supernatural matters of his own family, who represent the virtuous, religious, and contented household of the shepherds of Scotland in this tale. He shows the laird the rural sport of catching the trout with his own hands, or gumphing, and defends it against his educated objections of its unfairness. Through Barnaby Hogg can relate country customs and beliefs from the believer's point of view, and by this device he minimises the danger resulting from the gentility of his hero and heroine and from his own distanced authorial voice, that of making

his country characters seem merely odd or quaint. In using a narrative voice distanced from his subject-matter Hogg runs the risk of condescending to it, as he did in many of his prose writings for the *Scots Magazine*, where he sought to maintain an antiquarian tone.93 Petrie correctly states that through Barnaby Hogg can relate folk beliefs without being supposed simple-minded by his readers, but the course of the events related favours his belief rather than the heroine's scepticism, for his dream about the eagle and the corbie is clearly fulfilled when on Jane's marriage to the laird he is gradually promoted to become the laird's chief shepherd and the overseer of all his rural affairs.94 Even with this use of Barnaby as spokesman for the validity of the rural culture there are signs in the tale that Hogg is attempting something like genre-painting, describing something quaint to a mainstream culture rather than portraying a valid and central alternative to it. In describing one attitude, for instance, Hogg wishes 'much to consult ... David Wilkie, about it' (p.179).

The influence of *The Spy* is more apparent in Hogg's second volume publication of prose tales, for no less than eleven of the tales had previously appeared in it.95 Many of these were merely

93 See Chapter One, pages 13 to 15.
reprinted with very slight alterations designed to remove repetitions, clumsiness of expression, or references to concerns more relevant to 1810 or 1811 than to 1820. One example of this simple revision is 'Duncan Campbell'. Others, such as 'Love Adventures of Mr George Cochrane', are rather extensions of their originals than rewritings of what has already appeared in print. The closeness of the collection to The Spy was noted when it first appeared by a reviewer in The Scotsman, who hoped in a future edition to see the form of some tales altered, including some 'which appear as they had been addressed to the Editor of the Spy'.

Some tales were in fact altered to remove features appropriate only to the periodical context of The Spy. 'Adam Bell' is one tale that profited especially from this change of medium, being revised, as Gifford remarks, into a tauter and more open-endedly mysterious tale. The presence of 'the heavy-handed explanations' in The Spy, however, seems to be due not so much to Hogg's inexperience as a fiction-writer as to the heavier formal demands of the moral essay over the rural tale. The tale escaped the restraints of having to be directly instructive; so that Hogg could omit the essay opening of general comment on the passion for eminence and its particular dangers to the young, and need no longer direct the tale towards becoming an example of the ill effects of that passion. In The Spy the duel in which Bell was killed was

97 Anonymous review of Winter Evening Tales in The Scotsman, 29 April 1820, pp.143-44 (p.143).
98 Douglas Gifford, James Hogg (Edinburgh, 1976), p.73.
supposed to have been contrived as a convenient way of disposing of him by enemies who were aware of his passion for fame and eminence as a swordsman. The figure seen in Bell's house by the servant girl was then supposed to be one of the gang dressed in Bell's clothes to search his house for his cash and bills. Nothing in the atmosphere of the tale itself has prepared the reader for such an explanation, and its effect is rather to weaken the strangeness and mystery of the moonlight encounter, its gratuitousness and eerie violence.99 In removing the marks of periodicity from this tale for its appearance in a volume collection Hogg was able to preserve and emphasise its air of strangeness and ultimate refusal to give up all its significance to his reader.

In 'The Wife of Lochmaben', however, Hogg strengthens and develops the moral theme of his earlier periodical tale, and emphasises the original significance of it. This tale was presented in The Spy as one of the earliest contributions of John Miller, and therefore as part of an apprenticeship in literature. The occasional crudeness in plotting was thus accounted for, and the country nature of the tale deliberately pointed out to the reader from the beginning. In his later version Hogg has removed some of these roughnesses, and accounted for the rest by making his narrator tell the story at second-hand from the relation of a strolling gipsy, who removes some of the apparent responsibility from the real author in this context as John Miller did in the previous one.

99 'Dangerous consequences of the Love of Fame', The Spy, 27 April 1811, pp. 273-77 was revised into 'Adam Bell', Winter Evening Tales, I, 99-104.
Hogg apparently makes the tale more rationally accessible by his alterations. In the original tale it was perhaps unlikely that the wife's death should ever have been assumed to have been a suicide since her almost bed-ridden state would have made it improbable that she could have been able to walk to the lôch to drown herself. It also seemed strange that no wound was remarked on the body when it was discovered there, as the wife's skull had been smashed in with a bottle. In the later version her degree of bodily weakness is not so plainly specified, while her hair is described as carefully bound up in such a way as to conceal the wound from casual observation. Hogg also adds the judge's explanation that the appearance of the ghost is really the widow's way of realising in a dream the significance of the wound on her friend's body which she had previously noticed without being aware of it consciously. But if the maintenance of a teller between Hogg and his audience and his careful additions to the story's credibility seem to suggest that Hogg wished to make the tale more rationally acceptable, the most prominent additions to it deepen Miller's sense of the story as one exemplifying the operations of a justice determined by the laws of providence above the faulty and imperfect rules of human and social justice. In the original tale the ghost of the wife appears primarily to reveal the guilt of the murderer, and the theme of justice is actually incomplete, for the husband is acquitted for lack of evidence, and he and his paramour are only partly punished when the indignant local population make them ride the stang through the town. The couple escape from the continued anger of the local population by a flight into Cumberland. In the later version of the tale the justice for which the ghost appears is additionally
concerned, and perhaps more so, for the reputation of the dead wife as it affects the valuation of her religious beliefs in the minds of many, especially in that of her friend, the widow, to whom the ghost appears. The manner of the wife’s death now becomes crucial, for had she been a suicide she would have discredited her religion in abandoning her hopes of salvation by committing the ultimate act of despair, as Wringhim does in the later *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*. The wife and the widow are now described as godly folk, praying together each day and reading from the Bible and other religious works, in contrast to the profane and ungodly characters of the husband and his tinker mistress. The profligate folk say that no good can come of praying and canting, for despite all that the wife gave herself up to the devil at one blow, while the godly folk become dispirited and distrustful that her outward appearance could so belie her nature. Most seriously affected, however, is the widow, who shared in her devotions. She comes close to losing her faith and her trust in God’s goodness. The apparition comes to her in this version of the tale and reveals that her death was murder and not suicide not so much to bring the murderer to justice as to confirm the faith of the doubting widow. Indeed, in the later version it is never expressly stated that what the widow sees is a ghost, and she thinks herself that it may be a benevolent spirit sent to her in the dead woman’s likeness. The apparition presents itself after the widow has felt able to pray about her doubts:

Her faith was stunned, and she felt her heart bewildered in its researches after truth. For several days she was so hardened, that she dared not fall on her knees before the footstool of
divine grace. But after casting all about, and finding no other hold or anchor, she again, one evening, in full bitterness of heart, kneeled before her Maker, and poured out her spirit in prayer, begging, that if the tenets she held, were tenets of error, and disapproved of by the fountain of life, she might be forgiven, and directed in the true path to Heaven. 100

This passage, which clearly shows the religious theme of the revised version of the tale, is part of a structure of events and reflections which show that Hogg intended his reader to see the apparition as a kindly answer to the widow's prayer, ending her spiritual perplexities. The apparition ends its relation of the murder by assuring her that it is happy, and that their religious beliefs were true ones. In reinforcing his original tale with this religious theme Hogg strengthens his first theme of a supernatural intervention providing a more complete justice than that of limited human and social institutions. The country character of the tale is also brought out more by this addition of a structure which is reminiscent of the tales told by old-fashioned religious writers like Wodrow or Boston, who were popular among the community which Hogg describes and in which he was brought up. Both seek to testify to the care of an intervening providence, ready to warn, rescue, or sustain the godly in their trials and difficulties.

'The Renowned Adventures of Basil Lee' is apparently much further removed from its original in the periodical context of The Spy, yet there is also a marked continuity between the two different versions of 'The Wife of Lochmaben', in Winter Evening Tales, II, 223-31 (p.225). The original of this tale is 'Story of the Ghost of Lochmaben', The Spy, 29 December 1810, pp.142-44.
of the tale. This continuity is stressed by Hogg's note on the first page of the story in *Winter Evening Tales*, which maintains that the tale was sent in the form of a journal to Hogg as the editor of *The Spy*, in which paper a small part of it was published, but as that gave offence its publication was discontinued. Hogg claims to have heard of the writer only on occasion since then, and suggests that perhaps he was offended at this curtailment. Hogg also states that even in this collection of tales he has found it necessary to cancel a large portion of the original journal.\footnote{101}

This version develops further elements in the tale in *The Spy* already pronounced to be uncharacteristic of the moral essay. More purely comic scenes appear, such as the mistake the narrator makes in selling vitriol to an old Highland drover for whisky, and its unexpectedly light consequences. Not only does the old man not die, but after an interval comes back for more, saying that the drink was so good he needed no other meat or drink for a fortnight (p.12).

The element of a travel account is also retained, for while the account of Ettrick and Yarrow is omitted this is more than compensated for by a long account of the hero's stay in Lewis, and his relation of various apparitions he has sought out and experienced. The most important difference between the two versions is the introduction in the later one of a major new character, in the heroine, Clifford Mackay. The hero meets her on his voyage to America and she becomes his mistress, saves him from deserting the

\footnote{101 'The Renowned Adventures of Basil Lee', in *Winter Evening Tales*, I, 1-99 (p.1).}
army, and is his true friend until he plans to discard her. This she anticipates by marrying a wealthy old American gentleman, after which he realises that her affection and intelligence have created in him as steady an affection as his wavering mind would ever be capable of. Probably this part of the tale was intended as a replacement for the passage from the original tale, omitted here, where the hero comes home drunk one night, and, finding his scantily-clad housekeeper sitting up alone, persuades her to share his bed for the night. At the end of the original tale, the Spy, claiming to abridge from a correspondent's manuscript, summarises the remaining adventures of his hero on his return from America. The hero 'found the woman who was his housekeeper married to a richer and more respectable man than he himself ever was — the man who had taken his farm from his brother amassing a large fortune in it — and a fine boy, who bore his name and lineaments of feature, reared in another man's family'.

This is like Clifford's American marriage to the wealthy merchant and planter, for she also has a son, who is hinted to be Basil's child, though he is brought up as the merchant's heir. It seems not impossible that the figure of the pregnant housekeeper contains the germ of the characterisation of Clifford. Gifford contends that in developing the tale which in The Spy had offended Edinburgh taste Hogg was 'cocking a snook at his blue-stocking critics'.

There are differences, however, between the medium in which Hogg was working in 1810 and the one of

---

1820. In the first Hogg must have been aware of conventions of length and tendencies towards the polite, the genteel, or even the sentimental, whereas in a collection of country tales greater openness about sexual matters and the unheroic might very naturally seem more appropriate. Hogg was bound, in writing under the title 'The Danger of Changing Occupations', to comment on the moral significance of his hero's behaviour, whereas there seems to be no reason why in a rural tale he should not have avoided this entirely, and made his story wholly a series of picaresque adventures, by means of which an unusually unstable personality is delineated. Hogg chose to retain the moral commentary which introduces the tale, carefully revised, and he also added at the end of his tale another moral commentary, designed to correct the combination of moral laxity and false delicacy in society with respect to the fallen woman. Hogg wrote that he would gladly counteract the ungenerous and cruel belief that 'when a female once steps aside from the paths of rectitude, she is lost for ever', adding his conviction that he had 'known many who were timeously snatched from error, before their minds were corrupted, which is not the work of a day' (p.98). Hogg also provides a moral commentary in this version upon the faulty character of his hero, which is worse here than in the original tale. Basil courts the servant girl Jessie after her marriage, allows his elderly wife to drink herself to death, and is really a coward in the American wars where in the original tale his fears that he might prove so were groundless. The appropriate reaction to his errors is developed in the Scottish scenes of the tale, where Basil becomes increasingly isolated from the community, and increasingly viewed with mistrust and suspicion by the members of it.
In particular Hogg employs this device to display Basil's selfishness and arrogance, and their natural consequences. When as they help him Basil becomes even more negligent as a shepherd, the neighbouring shepherds combine, and Beattie, as their spokesman, advises his father to keep him hard at work to prevent him being careless and idle, and disgracing both his father and other people by running after women (pp. 9-10). Similarly, when his dissipated and careless ways lead to the unnecessary loss of his trade as a grocer, the comments of the local girls reveal his loss of status in the community (p. 13). On his foolish conceit of his own cleverness and his pretentious behaviour as a farmer, Basil comments that 'from the rugged freedom of the peasantry ... I got some severe rebuffs' (pp. 15-16). When, after his return from America, he gets into debt in Edinburgh and retires to live at his brother's house in the country to let his pay accumulate, Basil is received rather coolly even by his family, and he eventually reaches a state where he recognises that his future life may be one of total emotional isolation.

I saw I was going to place myself in a situation in which I would drag out an existence, without having one in the world that cared for me, or one that I loved and could be kind to; and the prospect of such a life of selfishness and insignificance my heart could not brook; never in my life did I experience such bitterness of heart. (pp. 94-95)

It is from this natural result of his selfish conceit that Clifford rescues him, arriving only just in time. Hogg's use of the rural Scottish community to express the isolation that results from the arrogance and error of his protagonist is also a feature of The
Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner, especially during the final tormented wanderings of Robert Wringhim. In both cases it supplies a form of indirect moral comment on the actions of the protagonist and on his self-absorption. Hogg's moral aims in this tale received the testimony of some contemporary reviewers, even if they judged that he had not been successful in fulfilling them. Hogg's continued interest in moral commentary in the later version of this tale is a feature which, with similar interests in comic scenes and travel, make it seem a true development of its original in The Spy.

The Spy is a periodical of importance to a true understanding of Hogg's prose fiction. Imitation, which holds an important place in the early stages of Hogg's writing in verse, is also seen as a significant feature of his earliest prose fiction: as the ballad-imitations of Scott were models for the one, so the essay-periodical tradition of the Spectator, Rambler, and Mirror influenced the other as a model. The connections between Hogg's volume publications and periodicals also becomes apparent here, when tales from The Spy appear, sometimes virtually unaltered, in one of Hogg's first two collections of fiction. Even where tales have been substantially revised the marks of periodicity may remain, or ideas generated by that context may be reinforced and expanded. Hogg's choice of the essay-periodical may not have been a wise one in view of his personal reputation and his talents, but it is seen as explicable in terms of his desire for prestige as an original

---

104 This is briefly discussed on page 288, in the appendix.
writer. His attempt at conducting his own paper is even more comprehensible in view of the small chance Hogg had at this stage of his career in finding an existing publication which would not only publish his work, but be prepared to pay for it. This lack of suitable outlets for his work in prose fiction may also account in part for the lateness of Hogg's turning to write in prose. His years as a would-be professional author in Edinburgh are indeed those of his long narrative poems, but he was seeking to connect his name even this early with a periodical and to see his fiction in print. After the financial failure of The Spy Hogg still vaguely thought of conducting a periodical with his literary friends, and it is evident from Hogg's account that other Edinburgh writers also felt the lack of an Edinburgh magazine of superior quality to the old Scots Magazine.

From the time I gave up 'The Spy' I had been planning with my friends to commence the publication of a Magazine on a new plan; but, for several years, we only conversed about the utility of such a work, without doing any thing farther. At length, among others, I chanced to mention it to Mr. Thomas Pringle; when I found that he and his friends had a plan in contemplation of the same kind. (Memoir, pp.41-42)

The existence of a magazine that would pay for prose fiction would have made a great difference to Hogg's writing of it during these years, it is more than probable, but unfortunately such an outlet for his shorter fiction was not yet available.
CHAPTER THREE: THE EFFECT OF BLACKWOOD'S EDINBURGH MAGAZINE

In 1817 an enterprising young Edinburgh publisher made a new venture into periodical publishing which was radically to alter not only Hogg's creative output, but also that of many other writers. By paying his contributors for fiction as well as for reviews and articles of information William Blackwood altered the character of much magazine fiction, and indeed helped to develop a different kind of magazine from the characteristic one of the eighteenth century; Charles Knight dated 'the new era of Magazines' from 1817 and the creation of Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, while Watts, found, as the editor of the New Monthly Magazine, that after the creation of the new magazine he and his publisher could not attract acceptable contributors 'except by addressing ourselves handsomely to their pockets, as Mr Blackwood was doing'. Modern literary critics and historians also stress the importance of Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine. Mayo sees the founding of the new magazine as the end of an era when, as magazine fiction became more lucrative, a new class of professional authors entered upon the scene. Hayden calls the same event of October 1817 'the most important event in the history

of the magazines during this period', of between 1802 and 1824, while Gordon goes so far as to refer to the magazine as arguably the most important literary journal ever to be produced.2

The original conception of Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, however, seems to have been far less revolutionary than the eventual reality. There is little indication that any great departures from the basic plan of the eighteenth-century magazine were intended by those first concerned with the publication, originally entitled the Edinburgh Monthly Magazine. One of the original editors, Cleghorn, was a farmer and writer on agricultural matters, who had presumably been engaged with the idea of making these topics prominent in the new periodical; this prominence would be more consonant with the idea of a periodical like Constable's Scots Magazine than that of the later Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine. The financial arrangement between the publisher and the editors of the magazine was, according to a paid contributor to the magazine of a later generation, 'apparently of a most peculiar kind', in that it did not specify who was to pay the contributors. It seems likely that the payment of contributors was not at this point considered an important item of expenditure to the conductors of the magazine, and this recalls the host of amateurs and poorly-paid hacks of the eighteenth-century magazine. The sales needed to provide the profits to be divided between editors and publisher was accordingly estimated as very low;

it was calculated that a sale of about two thousand copies would enable Blackwood to pay his editors jointly a sum of about fifty pounds monthly (Annals, I, 98-99). Writing to Blackwood just before the magazine passed into the control of the publisher Hogg reveals his expectations of the venture as moderate. He says that he has little time and less convenience for writing, only promising 'nevertheless to show the world that the redoubted Ettrick Shepherd is on your side I will inclose [sic] you in this one or two little poetical pieces of mine if I can light on any old thing worth publishing'. Hogg evidently did not consider the periodical important enough to demand fresh and specially composed work, but thought the use of his name and the publication of anything he had by him sufficient to ensure the publisher's gratitude. Evidently he considered this magazine and Constable's as immediate rivals, for he expected that both would turn out well as 'there is no excellence without emulation', and comforted Blackwood with the thought that although at first Constable's 'great guns' (presumably the contributors to the Edinburgh Review) might fire off a shot, they would 'disdain to continue writing for a two shilling Magazine'.

In keeping with this opinion Hogg's contributions to the volume which had been produced under the direction of Pringle and Cleghorn were very short and signed merely with the initial 'H.', which

---

3 The abbreviation Annals is listed before the text, and will be used throughout this study, for Mrs Oliphant, Annals of a Publishing House: William Blackwood and his Sons, their Magazine and Friends, second edition, 2 vols (Edinburgh and London, 1897).

suggests that he did not value them highly. Some at least of the poetry in this volume was evidently composed several years before. One was openly entitled 'Verses. Recited by the Author, in a Party of his Countrymen, on the Day that the News arrived of our final Victory over the French', suggesting a date of composition of 1815, while 'A Last Adieu' refers to the death of Hogg's mother in 1813 and may well have been composed around that time. Yet, though he still considered the new venture as another traditional magazine after its first six issues, Hogg in his advice to Blackwood singled out the two important features which ensured the success of Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, good rates of payment and anonymity for the contributors. These were the conditions on which Hogg premised that Blackwood's venture would be more likely to gain ground by degrees than Constable's:

... provided you offer a price to the writers per sheet which every man may demand if he chuses [sic]. There is a charm in this to writers from the highest to the lowest the idea that their labours are not entirely thrown away. Another thing quite necessary is that every part should be literally and strictly anonymous provided the author wishes it a miscellaneous writer has no freedom with contemporaries without this and of this the printers should be apprised.6

Hogg's three short prose contributions to the first six numbers of the magazine also indicate its old-fashioned and unremarkable

---

5 'Verses. Recited by the Author, in a Party of his Countrymen, on the Day that the News arrived of our final Victory over the French', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 1(1817), 72; 'A Last Adieu', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 1(1817), 169.

6 Hogg to Blackwood, 24 September 1817, in NLS MS 4002, f.157.
character at first. The series of three amounts to only about ten pages in the magazine altogether, and Hogg later revised it into one tale for a later collection.\textsuperscript{7} As he did in his earlier remarks on country beliefs and manners for the \textit{Scots Magazine}, Hogg presents himself as narrator here as a member of the educated urban class, a visitor to scenes which he describes in a detached way as curiosities for readers like himself. This narrator is certainly a comic figure at the wedding he attends, taking notes of the distance achieved by the shepherds at leaping and their good wishes for the happiness of the young couple, and attempting to correct the customs he records by a sort of empty logic. He objects to the customary use of a staff in leaping, and on hearing that there are two races, one on horseback for the bride's napkin and one on foot for the bridegroom's spurs, he remarks that 'the spurs would be the fittest for the riders, as the napkin would for the runners' (pp. 144, 248).

Petrie sees the narrator, indeed, as a deliberate parody of the amateur antiquarian.\textsuperscript{8} However, it seems as probable that Hogg is genuinely imitating the antiquarian tone of the older type of magazine, not having yet discovered an appropriate voice in which to

\textsuperscript{7} 'The Shepherd's Calendar. Storms and Country Wedding', in \textit{Winter Evening Tales, collected among the Cottagers in the South of Scotland}, 2 vols (Edinburgh and London, 1820), II, 152-204 partly contains the series under discussion, 'Tales and Anecdotes of the Pastoral Life', \textit{Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine}, 1(1817), 22-25, 143-47, 247-50. References to tales in a periodical will be given in full the first time a reference is made, while thereafter, in continuous discussion of the same tale, the page number in the magazine will be given in parentheses within the text.

tell his stories and being influenced by his old-fashioned periodical context here. Hogg loses much more than he gains in using such a narrator: his country people are seen chiefly from the outside, so that they occasionally appear quaint or clownish, or even wooden, and the external differences of clothing and manners are over-emphasised. The bridegroom, Peter Plash, was obviously intended by Hogg as his narrator's source for a whole series of 'Tales and Anecdotes of the Pastoral Life', for the narrator says that Peter 'told us strange stories of witches and apparitions, and related many anecdotes of the pastoral life, which I think extremely curious, and wholly unknown to the literary part of the community', adding later that he has had many conversations with Peter since their meeting and taken notes of these, saying that he must reserve for future communications 'the description of a country wedding, together with the natural history of the Scottish sheep, the shepherd's dog, and some account of the country lasses' (p. 25). The whet to the reader's appetite is surely Hogg's own as much as it is that of his narrator, while the list of future topics includes the wedding that follows, and another subject actually treated of in the following volume of the magazine. Indeed, the plan sounds like a clumsy version of the scheme of Hogg's later magazine series under the title 'The Shepherd's Calendar'. The use of such a clumsy device, of having a merely representative contributor to an old-fashioned magazine write up the tales and observations of a merely

representative shepherd, is unpromising. It is in fact a step backwards from the John Miller of *The Spy*, who, it will be remembered, was a decided character even to eccentricity, combining the advantages of a formal education with a preference for the habits, manners, and beliefs of the country people from whom he had sprung. Miller could criticise the Latin of a paper in an amusing Scots phrase, and was in many ways less limited potentially than either Peter Plash or the urban and educated narrator of this series.

Blackwood apparently decided to remove the direction of his new magazine from the hands of Pringle and Cleghorn because he was disappointed with the quantity and quality of the articles they contributed and collected. He was demanding more competent articles than appeared in the *Scots Magazine*, and was soliciting his own literary friends for these with the embarrassment of not being in a position to pay for what he asked, as he considered that the editors were responsible for furnishing articles for the magazine. Even with his efforts the magazine did not sell well, for it apparently 'had never reached the paying point' (*Annals*, I, 106). He also felt that he could not permit his literary friends 'to go on in this way for any length of time', unpaid.\(^{10}\) Once the magazine had passed under the effective control of William Blackwood it did earn a reputation for cleverness, and became successful. Although its contemporary reputation may seem to have been gained largely through its scurrilous manners and the prosecutions for libel which followed

---

on from these, the magazine had a fresh and lively atmosphere which presented a refreshment from the antiquarian sobriety and prosings of the *Scots Magazine*. Carlyle acutely summarises this freshness of atmosphere, and attributes its discovery to John Wilson. Noting in his journal the arrival of a bundle of copies of *Fraser's Magazine* he comments that they are 'on the whole such a hurly-burly of rhodomontade, punch, loyalty, and Saturnalian Toryism' as to exceed even Blackwood, adding that nevertheless it 'has its meaning — a kind of wild popular lower comedy, of which John Wilson is the inventor'. 11 In mere form *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* retained many old-fashioned features for some time after October 1817, such as a 'Notices to Correspondents' section, sections entitled 'Literary and Scientific Intelligence' and 'Monthly Register', and the practice of making up a number with a large number of short articles. In form the magazine developed only gradually: the real change was in the adoption of a sometimes extravagant, quizzical, and outrageous mood. This was symbolised in the form of the magazine by mingling together the different types of article which had formerly been kept distinct from one another, so that now a poem might be sandwiched between an article recommending modesty in dress to the Edinburgh young ladies, and one on natural history. 12 The rhyming 'Notices' in the front of the magazine for March 1818 defend jokingly the


new lack of arrangement from the attack made on it by a real or fictitious Berkshire rector, who 'hates, he says, from verse to prose to blunder. Our quick transitions seem to him derangement'. An impression of controlled madness was desirable; a stability and constancy in merriment which served to unite a mixture of lively contrarieties. The same impulse lay behind the celebrated Noctes Ambrosianae, even in later years when the tone of the magazine itself had become more sober and its articles longer and fewer in each number, sometimes no more than seven or eight in each (Annals, I, 224). Hogg wrote to Blackwood praising the 'intermixing all things through other' of the magazine as a bold and manly freedom, and arguing that 'a general miscellany should exactly be such an olio that when a man has done with a very interesting article he should just pop his nose upon another quite distinct but as good of its kind'. Hogg's correspondence, even after the magazine passed into the hands of the publisher, at first combines an appreciation of the differing spirit of the new magazine with a comparatively low estimation of magazines in general. On a visit to Abbotsford, probably made at the close of 1817 or during the first days of the following year, Hogg was evidently surprised to find Scott, the acknowledged head of Scottish letters, at work for such a concern as a magazine. His subsequent congratulations to Blackwood combine literary vanity and a sly jest at the publisher's impudence in expecting such a thing. He writes, 'I actually pop'd in on Mr Scott on Saturday in the very act of toiling for you; unconscionable being

13 Hogg to Blackwood, 19 October 1817, in NLS MS 4807, f.35.
that you are taking up all the poets and men of genius in the country
fuddling [...] at your small handwares!' 14 Blackwood, with his
views of his magazine's importance, would be more likely to take
this as a slight to his new venture than as the intended compliment
to his own abilities as its manager. It seems likely that Hogg
was some time in realising the potential of the new magazine as an
outlet for his creative work, in fact. Between William Blackwood's
assumption of the direction of his magazine in October 1817 and the
end of 1822 Hogg appears to have contributed only occasionally to the
magazine. He also carefully left the possibility of writing for
other magazines open, remaining on friendly terms with Pringle, who
after the break with Blackwood became editor with Cleghorn of
Constable's magazine, the title of which was then changed from the
Scots Magazine to the Edinburgh Magazine. Writing to Pringle in
August 1818 Hogg admitted to some involvement in the literary
persecution raised against him, but asserted that his intentions were
innocent, in saying 'I expected retaliation of the same nature, and
to acknowledge it to you, and crack over it ....' 15 It seems from
this letter that Pringle had recently sent Hogg a present of books,
so that probably he was also anxious to conciliate Hogg. The
Edinburgh Magazine treated Hogg kindly in inserting a series of
articles dealing favourably with his life and early writings, and
during the following summer two of Hogg's poems appeared in this

14 Hogg to Blackwood, 5 January 1818, in NLS MS 4003, f.84.
15 Hogg to Pringle, 21 August 1818, in Leitch Ritchie, The
Poetical Works of Thomas Pringle, with a Sketch of his Life
After this initial period, however, Hogg wrote regularly for Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine for many years, contributing some of his best work in both verse and prose to this periodical.

Financially it was probably very worthwhile for Hogg to devote much of his time to periodical fiction under the new conditions that William Blackwood helped to create for periodical fiction. It was during this period that the short story became a lucrative form of writing in Great Britain. Polsgrove describes how Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, the London Magazine, and the New Monthly Magazine paid their contributors for fiction, and so in the 1820s encouraged the short story collection, since the stories could appear firstly in the magazines and then be collected up for book publication, the writer therefore effectively being paid twice for his work. She suggests that the rate of payment for new writers in the better magazines seems to have been about ten guineas a sheet, and that this was probably equivalent to the rate paid for a first novel in volumes. Hogg, with his poor financial sense and his inability to manage to advantage large and irregularly-paid sums of money, must have found it especially tempting to be ensured of smaller sums at fairly regular intervals without losing the advantage

of an occasional larger payment. It is not possible to set alongside this general estimate the particular rates Hogg was paid for his fiction, but an approximate guess at them may be made from surviving records and letters. It would seem that William Blackwood's payments to Hogg, even as late as the appearance in the magazine of the series 'The Shepherd's Calendar', when he had long been a well-known and even a celebrated writer, are broadly consistent with a rate of payment of ten guineas a sheet. From an examination of Blackwood's payments for particular stories mentioned in letters to Hogg and from an examination of the number of pages covered by these stories in the magazine, it seems probable that Blackwood calculated the payment of Hogg's tales at ten guineas a sheet and then rounded the figure thus arrived at up or down to the nearest complete pound. 18 This is supported by his offer to Grieve of 1833 declaring that, should his quarrel with Hogg be made up, he would pay ten guineas per sheet for any of Hogg's articles inserted in the magazine. 19 This compares unfavourably with his probable

18 An instance of the surviving facts upon which this calculation is based is Hogg's 'A Horrible Instance of the Effects of Clanship', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 28(1830), 680-87, which occupies about seven and two-third pages in the magazine. Blackwood wrote to Hogg, 25 September 1830, in NLS Accession (hereafter Acc.) 5643, vol. 89, pp. 81-82, paying him five pounds for it. Another example might be 'The Shepherd's Calendar, Dreams and Apparitions, containing Smithy Cracks, &c. Part III', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 22(1827), 64-73, assuming Blackwood to have been slightly generous in his rounding. Blackwood wrote to Hogg, 30 June 1827, in NLS Acc. 5643, vol. 87, p. 173, paying him three pounds cash plus three pounds to account for this tale, covering about nine and two-third pages in the magazine.

payments to John Galt even in earlier years: Gordon mentions that Galt was paid ten guineas for each installment of the serialisation in the magazine of The Ayrshire Legatees; or, The Correspondence of the Pringle Family, and these ranged from under seven up to ten pages in length, whereas, of course, there were sixteen pages to a sheet of the magazine. In order to bring this magazine rate of payment into comparison with the payments Hogg received for his separately published volumes of prose fiction it is necessary to estimate both in numbers of words, although this cannot be done otherwise than approximately: the size and capacity of the sheets of the various volumes differ not only from those of the magazine, but even from one another. A sheet of sixteen pages of Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine contains roughly 12,880 words, which at ten guineas per sheet gives a rate of payment of approximately sixteen shillings and three and a half pence per thousand words. Hogg's three-volume novel The Three Perils of Man; or, War, Women, and Witchcraft, A Border Romance (1822) may be usefully taken for a comparison of the rate of payment for volume publication in his case, as it is the most fashionable length and Hogg relates plainly the price he received for it as one hundred and fifty pounds (Memoir, p. 55). By taking a sample of pages and numbering the words on

21 The abbreviation Memoir is listed before the text, and will be used throughout this study, for James Hogg, Memoir of the Author's Life and Familiar Anecdotes of Sir Walter Scott, edited by Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh and London, 1972). When the second text is referred to the abbreviation Familiar Anecdotes is used.
each, an average number of words per page of one hundred and eighty-eight was estimated; this produces, when multiplied by the number of pages, an approximate length of 214,884 words for the whole novel, giving a rate of payment of thirteen shillings and eleven and a half pence per thousand words, rather less than the estimated rate of payment for Hogg's fiction for the magazine. It must also be considered that payments for magazine articles were made on their insertion there, while the profits of a volume publication might be delayed or uncertain. For instance, Hogg was unable to recall ever receiving a payment for the first edition of The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner of 1824 (Memoir, p. 55). With regard to his poetry it may also have paid Hogg to write steadily for the magazines, for the slump in the publishing of imaginative literature in the middle years of the 1820s was especially severe with regard to poetry, as Jack indicates. In addition, there is the fact that Hogg's best work in poetry and prose is not usually his longest: he may have experienced difficulties in manipulating long structures. Hogg's most successful long poem, The Queen's Wake: A Legendary Poem (1813), is really a series of shorter poems united by the framework of the competition for the prize harp. It may be more than coincidence that Hogg effectively ceased to write long poems to be published separately once he was able to count on generally fair and steady payment for his periodical contributions. In prose Hogg's most successful novels are the shorter ones of The

---

Brownie of Bodsbeck and The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a
Justified Sinner. The device of the competition is repeated in
The Three Perils of Man; or, War, Women, and Witchcraft. A Border
Romance, where the main plot is supplemented by the scenes at
Aikwood where the members of the embassy tell tales for the prize of
the captive maiden and in fear of the forfeit of being eaten by the
others should this become necessary. From the general economic
situation and from his particular temperament and circumstances it
was probably wise of Hogg to write steadily for the magazines,
therefore. Hogg's daughter indeed accounts in this way for the
fact that despite Hogg's publishing speculations and his farming
losses he was able to support his family in later years (Memorials,
pp.277-78).23 By the end of his life Hogg was sometimes identified
with periodicals and periodical fiction as well as with his
separately published works. David Vedder, for example, presenting
a volume of his own verse to Hogg in 1832, writes of having for many
years followed Hogg's literary progress in the magazines as
elsewhere. He remarks a period 'since the day that you published
"Auld Ettrick John" in the old Scots Magazine, until your last
brilliant story in the Metropolitan' rather than one marked by Hogg's
volume publications.24

Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine is first of all important to
Hogg's fiction as the representative of the newer type of general

23 The abbreviation Memorials is listed before the text, and will
be used throughout this study, for Mrs Garden, Memorials of
James Hogg, the Ettrick Shepherd (Paisley and London, n.d.).
24 Vedder to Hogg, 5 April 1832, in NLS MS 2245, f.207, quoted in
magazine best known to him as a reader and as a writer. He received the magazine regularly from William Blackwood, and must have carefully kept his copies for he eventually had them bound into sets. During his quarrel with Blackwood of 1821 he particularly reproached the publisher with his meanness in discontinuing this particular attention of sending him the magazine. Hogg's earlier constant reading of the old Edinburgh Magazine and Scots Magazine, together with his efforts at self-education, would suggest that he valued the magazines partly as a means of information, using them to gain some knowledge of topics of contemporary interest and fashion. Indeed to a modern reader the contemporary magazines still give the best idea of the topical concerns of any particular year. Hogg often commented on articles in particular numbers of the magazine in his letters to William Blackwood, and he clearly read the magazines carefully and with interest.

In assessing the influence of other writers and other literature upon Hogg's own fiction the general influence of the magazines should not be forgotten. Carey explores a relationship between one work of contemporary German literature and Hogg's novel, The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner. He suggests that Hogg's novel may have been influenced in its composition by R. P. Gillies's translation of Hoffmann's Die Elixier des Teufels on the basis of a number of similar images and concerns between the two works, despite the fact that the translation was only published in the same month as

---

25 See Hogg to Messrs Blackwood, 28 February 1835, in NLS MS 4040, f.287; Hogg to Blackwood, 5 December 1821, in NLS MS 4007, f.44.
Hogg's novel. It may be true that Gillies, as one of Hogg's close friends, would have talked to him about his translation before its publication, for there certainly are striking resemblances between the two publications.26 In his reading of contemporary magazines, however, Hogg would have been aware of general themes and prevalent images and interests in contemporary German literature, in the same way that he would have been aware of the writings and style of Addison or of Sterne just from his reading of an older type of magazine. In Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, for instance, a series of papers on important works of German literature appeared under the title of 'Horae Germanicae', many of them written by Gillies or including excerpts translated by him. Gillies's work as a translator was discussed in the first of these, appearing in the number for November 1819, 'Horae Germanicae. No. I. Guilt; or, the Anniversary'. Hogg, in writing to Blackwood, expressed his pleasure at the praise as a translator given to his friend Gillies in the magazine.27 There are features in common between Hogg's novel and this magazine article as well as those noted by Carey between the two separately published works; this suggests the existence of a range of concerns common to several works of German literature of this period. One such feature is the theme of the deadly rivalry between an outcast and his more fortunate brother, whose envied situation he attempts to usurp by criminal and deadly means, and the consequent disintegration of the outcast sibling under the stress of

27 Hogg to Blackwood, 30 November 1819, in NLS MS 4004, f. 158.
guilt. One of the most striking and important images of the translation quoted in the magazine article occurs when Hugo, the outcast brother, describes his feelings after the murder of his friend and unknown brother, Carlos. He tells of a pious knight who forgets to cross himself in riding through an enchanted forest, where he meets a mysterious antagonist dressed as he is himself and whose features, he notices with horror during their combat, resemble his own exactly. The wounds that each combatant inflicts upon his opponent strangely take effect upon his own body, and Hugo describes his own mental state by analogy with this, saying that since he has come into Carlos's house he has fallen asunder 'into two separate beings, that support | A ceaseless warfare'. 28 The fraternal relationship, even though consciously unknown, is seen as a part of the speaker's personal identity, or as something which helps to secure that identity for him. The same is partly true of Robert Wringhim, who also kills his brother and succeeds to his inheritance, for in the periods of mental oblivion which follow he acts a gross parody of what he might conceive of as the life of a young cavalier like George — drinking, pursuing women heartlessly, and wearing gaudy clothes. In describing the wanderings which precede his suicide Robert also describes his self-division in terms of a warfare
directed against the self, saying 'I was become a terror to myself; or rather, my body and soul were become terrors to each other; and, had it been possible, I felt as if they would have gone to war. I dared not look at my face in a glass, for I shuddered at my own image and likeness'. Robert's first interview with the demonic Gil-Martin also relates to this image: he meets a stranger who resembles him exactly on a path through the field and wood of Finnieston. Robert also provokes the ill-omened attentions of the stranger, by his contempt of his fellow-creatures and then by neglecting to pray to God in thanksgiving as he had intended to do.29 The pattern of Robert's damnation is also suggested in the image, for every blow inflicted outwards upon his enemies recoils upon himself as the murder of a brother itself symbolically implies. One can then see features common to German literary works of the period in Hogg's novel, and his knowledge of such was probably formed at least in part from reading articles about them in contemporary magazines such as Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine.

Hogg may also have used the magazines' information upon matters immediately topical and fashionable to try to win a tolerance for his less conventional and acceptable fiction, that of a more fantastic and outrageous atmosphere. He was often ready to give his work a commercial appeal by taking in contemporary concerns: one example of this is the tale 'Some Terrible Letters from Scotland', written at the time of a cholera epidemic, and making use

of all its attendant terrors. The epidemic, for instance, made a
hasty disposal of the bodies of those who had died essential, while
at the same time 'death itself was followed by a mysterious rise in
body temperature and deceptive muscular movements ....'30 One of
the supposed first-person accounts in Hogg's tale relates how the
narrator was declared dead of the cholera while he was perfectly
conscious and only unable to move, and it was only by a fortunate
accident that he was revived before his burial. In the other account
two ghostly victims of their mother's perseverance in nursing cholera
victims return to claim her, body and soul presumably.31 Hogg's
aim is less purely sensational in his tales of exploration and of
adventure in exotic places. Books of travel and accounts of
exploration were widely popular, and Hogg's own early reading
probably included many such works. Robert Chambers and his brother
indulged by means of Mr Elder's library in Peebles their 'romantic
tendencies in books of travel and adventure ... scarcely less
attractive than the works of pure imagination'.32 The imaginative
appeal of accounts of journeys and of foreign lands must have been
all the greater in an age when few people had extensive opportunities
for travel. Africa, for instance, was at this time a relatively
unknown continent, and Hogg's 'A Singular Letter from Southern Africa'

30 Laurance James Saunders, Scottish Democracy 1815-1840: the
Social and Intellectual Background (Edinburgh and London,
1950), pp. 182-91, particularly page 183.
31 'Some Terrible Letters from Scotland', Metropolitan, 3(1832),
422-31.
32 William Chambers, Memoir of Robert Chambers with
Autobiographic Reminiscences of William Chambers (Edinburgh and
uses the contemporary interest in it in the service of fantasy.
The exploration and colonization by the British of parts of Africa
were treated of in a number of articles in *Blackwood's Edinburgh
Magazine*: the earlier articles are excited in tone and concerned
with discovery, while the later ones are more preoccupied with
the exposure of corruption and with economics. But even these
later papers, signed by James M'Queen of Glasgow, which deplore the
poor economic, social, and moral state of Sierra Leone in particular
and the British attempt to civilise Africa in general, contribute
evidence of an alert interest generally in the possibilities of this
relatively unopened continent.33 Hogg's own story is closer to
the mood of the earlier papers in the magazine, and in particular to
that of a two-part article of 1819 dealing with a mission from the
fort at Cape Coast into Ashantee, the first part of which was
printed in the same number of the magazine as the second part of
Hogg's own *'The Shepherd's Calendar. Storms'*, that for May 1819.
Hogg included in his African tale pieces of information in order to
substantiate it and give it an air at least of authority, and these
seem to have a basis in the knowledge of the day about Africa, which
was available in *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* among other sources.
Firstly, there is a description of the orang-utan in the magazine
article about the mission to Ashantee which agrees largely with the
role of the creatures in Hogg's tale as Wild Men, or primitives.
These apes have the 'cry, visage, and action' of very old men, and

33 James M'Queen, 'Civilization of Africa — Sierra Leone',
*Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, 20(1826), 872-92, 21(1827),
375-29, 596-624.
they imitate the natives by carrying heavy burdens through the forest, though without understanding that this is done for some end. They are also reported to build houses in imitation of men, though sleeping outside or on the roofs of them; they are said to carry their dead offspring about until even the remains putrefy away.\(^{34}\) Hogg turns this physical resemblance to humanity to account, gives the apes an intellectual as well as an imitative faculty, and indeed creates 'what must be the earliest version of the Tarzan story', as Gifford aptly expresses it.\(^{35}\) His additions and alterations to the description of these creatures all serve the purposes of a myth like this, really as ancient as the story of Romulus and Remus at least, and used by him again in 'Ewan M'Gabhar', where a lost prince is suckled and tended by a kindly goat.\(^{36}\) Hogg's apes are vegetarians, and have a tribal structure of soldiers, King, and queens. They are rational and even sensible, being genuinely concerned about the welfare of the little boy they steal to replace their queen's dead cub. Regretting their inability to teach him to speak, they cleverly kidnap his own mother to be his instructor. Their resemblance to humanity is emphasised by the narrator's preference for the looks of some of the young females over those of many negro savages he has seen.\(^{37}\) Hogg's creatures have in

---

\(^{34}\) R. Jones, 'Bowdich's Mission from Cape Coast Castle to Ashantee', *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, 5(1819), 175-83, 302-10 (p.309), attributed to this author in Bibliography, pp.53, 54.


\(^{36}\) 'Ewan M'Gabhar', *Fraser's Magazine*, 6(1832), 450-59.

common with those of the magazine article their physical resemblance to mankind, their love of imitation, and especially that devotion to their young which makes the old queen inconsolable for the loss of her cub. The main fantasy is preceded by a slightly incongruous comic episode, in which one of the local chiefs becomes enamoured of the narrator's wife and offers a high price for her in oxen to the husband. Interestingly, there is a parallel clash of British and foreign values over the worth and disposal of women in the magazine account of the mission to Ashante, when the gentlemen show a couple of Moors a miniature portrait of an Englishwoman, and amuse them by relating that the British women enjoy the sole affections of a husband, whom they have the privilege of choosing for themselves. The circumstantial topicality of this tale reminds the reader of Hogg's affinity with Defoe, while its appearance in Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine in the context of one of the topical concerns of that periodical even led some readers to suppose it might be a true history of events in Africa. Hogg must surely have been gratified as well as amused when he received 'not one but several letters, asking if the events related had really occurred' (Memorials, p.157).

A similar relationship would appear to exist between Hogg's comic and grotesque poem 'The p and the q; or, the Adventures of Jock M'Pherson' and its original setting of Blackwood's Edinburgh

38 [R. Jones], 'Bowdich's Mission from Cape Coast Castle to Ashantee', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 5(1819), 175-83, 302-10 (p.180), attributed to this author in Bibliography, pp.53, 54.
The narrator tells the ridiculous story of Jock, who goes to sea and visits the Pole, humorously remarking that the relations of Parry and Barrow are nonsense to what he has to tell of his hero, and jesting about Jock seeing the sockets that this pole runs in. The magazine itself carried many articles on voyages to and descriptions of the arctic regions, including one on Barrow by Hogg's acquaintance David Brewster. It is possible that Hogg's longer story 'The Surpassing Adventures of Allan Gordon' may also have been intended by him to make its appearance in the context of the contemporary interest in arctic exploration within Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine. One such article in the magazine, for example, describes the habits of the polar bear and the prevalent conditions upon an iceberg, while Hogg's story tells how Allan was shipwrecked in the arctic and made a devoted friend of a female polar bear. The tale, which was not apparently published before the 1837 collection of Hogg's tales and sketches, was dedicated to Brewster incidentally. However, the identity of this tale with an article by Hogg rejected by Blackwood for the magazine at the end of 1827 appears extremely doubtful. Blackwood refers to the rejected article by the title of 'Ancient Polar Curiosities', and Hogg's

39 'The p and the q; or, the Adventures of Jock M'Pherson', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 26(1829), 693-95 (p.694).
40 [David Brewster], 'Analysis of Mr Barrow's Chronological History of Voyages into the Arctic Regions', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 4(1818-1819), 187-93, attributed to this author in Bibliography, p.47.
41 [James Wilson?], 'Account of Captain Scoresby's Observations on the Greenland or Polar Ice', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 2(1817-1818), 363-69, conjecturally attributed to this author in Bibliography, p.33.
description of it suggests that it either was, or was intended by him to imitate, a series of historical episodes about arctic voyagers. He describes the article as an abridgement from several journals of old travellers and voyagers, none of whom he has heard of before 'save Columbus and Vasquez de Gama'; he also says that in shortening these accounts he has 'not altered a name nor a date'.

The tale published in 1837, on the other hand, relates the adventures of one man, who is picked up by a Dutch ship at the conclusion of his polar adventures in 1764.

Besides these connections with this magazine as an example of the more modern magazines of the 1820s, though, Hogg was also more directly linked with *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* in particular. This was perhaps because, though of sufficient importance to pay him adequately for his contributions, it was also in its early years comfortably local and intimate. Hogg's poetical contributions to the old *Scots Magazine* showed that he enjoyed a sense of literary friendship with his fellow contributors, and in at least one of his early prose contributions to *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* he exchanged gossip and capped anecdotes with his old literary friends Laidlaw and Scott. Scott had produced for the magazine for October 1817 a humorous paper consisting of a series of anecdotes describing, not the moral degeneration of man, but that of the brute creation itself, so that 'our very dogs and horses infringe the

42 See Blackwood to Hogg, 29 December 1827, in NLS MS 2245, f.110, and Hogg to Blackwood, 5 January 1828, in NLS MS 4021, f.271.

eighth commandment'. One of the best of these anecdotes is the story of the sheep-dog Yarrow, who was his master's assistant in sheep-stealing. The tone of the paper is one of easy after-dinner chat, such as Mrs Hughes recalls having heard at Abbotsford when Scott, Laidlaw, and Hogg met and told amusing stories about the local characters they remembered. A subsequent paper, by Laidlaw and Scott, refers directly to this conversational tone of the magazine; the narrator remarks in opening that he has often thought 'that a well-supported Magazine ... is very like a general conversation of well-informed people in a literary society, who have met together to give their opinions freely, for one another's mutual entertainment, without any particular subject being fixed upon for the theme of the evening'. Accordingly, this narrator will follow up the story of the first with one which places the sagacity of the shepherd's dog in a more favourable light. John Hoy, the shepherd of Chapel-hope farm, wished to listen to a sermon at a Cameronian sacrament although he was obliged to gather in the ewes to be milked at that time of day. The narrator tells how to the amazement of all present Hoy's dog Nimble gathered them all up herself without even the help of his directions. The story is said to have happened about forty-five years ago, so that 'though verging now upon traditionary story, is not as yet too old to be

44 [Walter Scott], 'Alarming Increase of Depravity among Animals', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 2(1817-1818), 82-86 (p.82), attributed to this author in Bibliography, p.30.
Hogg's own contribution to this conversation upon paper first of all authenticates the preceding one, Hogg remarking that Hoy was a close relation of his, having married his mother's sister. He then relates in an easy style both what he has heard from Hoy and his personal experience of the shepherd's dog, promising to relate in another paper the history of his own dog, Hector. In this piece Hogg is thus partly conversing with previous writers, and partly also with the Edinburgh editor and readers of the magazine: he speaks, for instance, of an achievement of Sirrah's as one which he 'cannot make an Edinburgh man so thoroughly to understand'. The implied intimacy of Hogg's narrator comes over in phrases like 'no such thing' and 'at which he was not slack', and this informality is calculated to convey the real experience of life in the pastoral community. In a sort of conversation with old friends Hogg is able to present himself both as a countryman and as a member of a group of literary contributors to a periodical. This intermediate position is a helpful one for his fiction, and represents a step forwards from the stiffness and formality of his narrator in previous prose articles for magazines. Scott's example and the influence of the atmosphere of Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine had assisted Hogg in appreciating an advantage he possessed.

The local nature of this magazine may have attracted Hogg for yet another reason. Apart from the fact that to a Border man

46 [Laidlaw and Scott], 'Sagacity of a Shepherd's Dog', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 2(1817-1818), 417-21 (p.417), attributed to these authors in Bibliography, p.34.
47 'Further Anecdotes of the Shepherd's Dog', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 2(1817-1818), 621-26 (pp.624, 625).
Edinburgh would be a natural centre for transacting all extraordinary business, William Blackwood was personally most attentive to Hogg. He regularly sent Hogg the magazine together with any new books of particular interest, sent him a game licence each year (Annals, I, 357), and on occasion acted on Hogg's behalf in financial matters. The attractions of this ready contact are obvious: Hogg would wish to see any periodical for which he wrote to assess the most acceptable subject-matter and manner of writing for it and to check which of his articles were used and paid for. He would thus be able to check that he received the proper payment due to him and to press for the return of unused work. In relating that he wrote for periodicals of every description 'sometimes receiving liberal payment, and sometimes none, just as the editor or proprietor, felt disposed' (Memoir, p.58), Hogg reveals that even under the recently-improved conditions of writing for the magazines an author's payment was by no means certain or automatic. A friendly, local editor was thus no small advantage to him.

Hogg's preference for Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine is shown in the scantiness of the work he produced for the rival Edinburgh Magazine during 1821, when he had quarrelled with William Blackwood. He had evidently been relieved to receive a letter from Constable's partner, Cadell, 'in a most friendly stile' inviting him to contribute to the rival magazine and 'promising equal if not better pay than Blackwood and an assurance of better treatment'. He had

48 See Blackwood to Hogg, 3 August 1820, in NLS MS 2245, ff. 42-43.
added that 'there is an old door re-opened for me should another
shut'. 49 However, the material Hogg sent to the rival magazine
during the period of his estrangement from Blackwood is not really
fresh or original. For example, he re-used several pieces from
The Spy. 50 His only entirely new prose tale seems to have been
'Pictures of Country Life. Nos. I and II. Old Isaac'. 51 Once Hogg
was again on good terms with Blackwood he does not appear to have
taken trouble to maintain his connection with the Edinburgh Magazine.
In later life Hogg was sometimes linked exclusively with Blackwood's
Edinburgh Magazine indeed. During his visit to London in 1832,
after another quarrel with Blackwood, Hogg wrote uneasily back to
him, 'I am exceedingly awkwardly situated for every one talks to me
of Blackwood and Blackwood's Magazine as if we were identified with
one another'. 52 Even in earlier years Hogg's occasional defection
to other periodicals seems to have rankled with the supporters of
Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine perhaps more than would seem entirely
reasonable. In the Clydesdale Magazine for July 1818 an article
had appeared defending Hogg from the charge of having written The
Brownie of Bodsbeck as an imitation of and answer to Scott's Old
Mortality. This was clearly written by one of Hogg's intimate
friends from his own account of the matter, and perhaps even at his

49 Hogg to Grieve, 3 October 1821, in NLS MS 2245, f. 48.
50 Compare, for instance, 'Satirical Directions to every Class in
Edinburgh, in what manner to keep the Sabbath', The Spy, 30
March 1811, pp. 241-46 with 'Hints for keeping the Sabbath',
Edinburgh Magazine, 10(1822), 205-09.
51 'Pictures of Country Life. Nos. I and II. Old Isaac',
52 Hogg to Blackwood, 5 February 1832, in NLS MS 4033, f. 123.
instigation, for it coincides with his own assertion in his account of his life (Memoir, pp.44-45), except in being more explicit in making Blackwood responsible for the fact that Hogg's tale was not the first one published.53 Hogg's early attempts to remain on good terms with the conductors of Constable's magazine, and the insertion in it of an article on his life and early works, have already been mentioned. In a scathing attack in Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine on Hogg's account of his life Wilson criticised Hogg's desire for publicity, remarking 'there are a good many lives of him in the Scots Magazine — a considerable number even in your own work, my good sir — the Clydesdale Miscellany was a perfect stye with him'.54 If Hogg was so very undesirable an associate, then why should his association with other magazines have been the cause of such resentment?

The answer to this must rest in the fact that Hogg was not just a contributor to the magazine, but also a personality within it. Hogg's position there is often seen as that of the magazine's buffoon and victim, and there is some truth in this view. A humorous review of a French conduct book is addressed to Hogg as a letter of advice, the original French being printed at the foot of the page and translated in the text of the article into what are supposed to be Hogg's social circumstances. On reading that over-

53 'Quivive', 'Literary Mistakes Rectified', Clydesdale Magazine, 1(1818), 133-35.
54 [John Wilson], 'Familiar Epistles to Christopher North, From an Old Friend with a New Face. Letter I. On Hogg's Memoirs', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 10(1821), 43-52 (p.43), attributed to this author in Bibliography, p.83.
perfuming is to be avoided, for instance, the reviewer tells Hogg that it will be sufficient if he avoids garlic at breakfast and uses the oil of thyme with moderation.\(^{55}\) In the popular series of *Noctes Ambrosianae*, more importantly, Hogg is also often presented as an uncouth figure of fun. The Shepherd interprets 'passim' as 'in passing' and pronounces 'encore' first as 'anchor' and then as 'hangcur'.\(^{56}\) Hogg is presented from the viewpoint of the gentleman who fastidiously notices all the roughness of the peasant. The more unfortunate side of this presentation of Hogg was that it could place him as a boor outside the code of mutual respect based on a deference to the concept of a gentleman. This feature of polite society had been noted in a discussion of politeness in a paper in the *Mirror*.

It ought, however, to be observed, that when we speak, even at this day, of good-breeding, of politeness, of complaisance, these expressions are always confined to our behaviour towards those who are considered to be in the rank of gentlemen; but no system of politeness or of complaisance is established, at least in this country, for our behaviour to those of a lower station. The rules of good-breeding do not extend to them ....\(^{57}\)

Despite the suggestion here that such an attitude is beginning to be thought offensive, it evidently persisted until at least the 1820s. One statement in the *Noctes Ambrosianae* proclaims that none of the

---

55 'Colin Bannatyne', 'To the Ettrick Shepherd', *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, 16(1824), 86-90 (p.88), attributed to William Dunlop in Bibliography, p.122.
new weekly literary papers will equal Jerdan's *Literary Gazette*
because 'Mr Jerdan is a gentleman, and is assisted by none but
gentlemen'. 58 The same consciousness is revealed in Lockhart's
sequential argument in asking Blackwood to show consideration for
an acquaintance who had written material for the magazine when he
says that 'the old man is a Gentleman, & is entitled either to
receive his MS back instantly (it is the only copy) or a promise
that it is to be printed in next No of Maga —'. 59 It may have
been unfortunate for Hogg that the presentation of his personality
in the magazine placed him outside this code of deference.
However, he had his defenders among those involved in the production
of the magazine. Ballantyne made it known that if one article on
Hogg was inserted in its original state in the magazine he would
feel unable to continue as the magazine's printer, while Moir was
uneasy enough about the revised version of the article that did
appear to hope that there was some previous understanding with Hogg
himself over its insertion. 60 It may also be noted that upon the
whole Hogg was not offended by his portrait as the Shepherd, since
his 1832 collection of verse is dedicated to the other magazine
personalities of the *Noctes Ambrosianae*, Christopher North and
Timothy Tickler, while his volume of songs published in the preceding
year includes several passages from as well as notes referring to

58 *Noctes Ambrosianae*, edited by R. Shelton Mackenzie, 5 vols
(New York, 1859), III, 67.
59 Lockhart to Blackwood, 30 January 1830, in NLS MS 4Q27, f.268.
60 For a series of notes which passed between Ballantyne and
Blackwood on this subject see *Annals*, I, 338-40; Moir to
Blackwood, 23 August 1821, in NLS MS 4007, f.194.
the series. 61

The emphasis in Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine on Hogg as a
peasant and uncultivated poet should be viewed in the context of the
magazine itself, the men who wrote for it, and the interests of the
publishing-house that produced it, before its true significance can
be appreciated. Both modern and contemporary critics have noted
an attempt by novelists whose work was published by William
Blackwood (some of whom also contributed to the magazine) to portray
a distinctively Scottish way of life. The recent study of Barnes,
for instance, demonstrates that between 1815 and 1830 a concern for
Scotland led to the development of types of character, structure,
and perspective in the work of Scottish novelists which asserted
that national characteristics could survive a period of immense
social change, and explains that there was an attempt to document a
distinctively Scottish way of life that was rapidly disappearing. 62
Among the novelists discussed are Hogg, Galt, Ferrier, Lockhart, and
Wilson. Hart makes more of the connections between these novelists
and Blackwood in entitling the first major section of his
influential history of the Scottish novel 'Blackwoodian Beginnings:
Gothic Romance and Provincial Manners', and he analyses a fiction
'partly conceived around an idea of the provincial'. 63 In 1823

61 For instances of this see James Hogg, Songs (Edinburgh and
London, 1831), pp.28, 37, 103; A Queer Book (Edinburgh and
London, 1832) is the work dedicated to North and Tickler.
62 D. F. L. Barnes, 'Some Attitudes to Scotland in Scottish
Fiction, 1815-1830' (unpublished M.Litt. dissertation,
University of Edinburgh, 1979), especially the chapter entitled
'The Age of Scott', pp.7-55.
Jeffrey commented antagonistically on some of the recent fiction published by the chief Edinburgh rival to the publisher of the Edinburgh Review under the title 'Secondary Scottish Novels'. All three of the writers whose work he discussed are also known to have contributed to Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine. Each novelist was considered as an imitator of some aspect of Scott's achievement as a novelist. Wilson and Lockhart were said to imitate 'generally, his innumerable and exquisite descriptions of the soft, simple, and sublime scenery of Scotland, as viewed in connexion with the character of its rustic inhabitants'. Viewing them as lacking the great novelist's invention, knowledge of the world, and good sense, Jeffrey described them as enlarging 'in a sort of pastoral, emphatic and melodious style, on the virtues of our cottagers, and the apostolical sanctity of our ministers and elders, the delights of pure affection, and the comforts of the Bible ....' 64 This is, naturally, malicious, but there are passages in Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine itself, as well as in related works by important contributors, in which a picture of a somewhat idealised natural community of simple and devout Scottish peasants, created under the mingled influences of Burns, Wordsworth, and Scott, does seem to exist. John Wilson's few tales in the magazine, for example, stress the devotion and hard work of the Scottish peasant through a series

64 [Francis Jeffrey], 'Secondary Scottish Novels', Edinburgh Review, 39(October 1823), 158-96 (p.161), attributed to this author in The Wellesley Index to Victorian Periodicals 1824-1900, edited by Walter E. Houghton and others (Toronto and London, 1966 —), I(1966), 465. This work will hereafter be referred to by the abbreviation Wellesley Index, which is listed before the text.
of references to the more domestic and sentimental side of Burns's work, and in particular to 'The Cotter's Saturday Night'. In 'The Elder's Death-Bed' Wilson's narrator, reflecting on peasant life, immediately recollects 'the skilful mother, making "auld claes look amaist as weel's the new"', and when the family join in a psalm around the death-bed the tune is naturally "Plaintive martyrs worthy of the name". Religion accompanies goodness and contented frugality in this tale in opposition to 'the deadening and debasing influence of infidelity'. Nature and religion are used in the service of Tory propaganda, and the infidelity of the elder's son made him neglectful of his children, even causing him to have horrid visions in which demons prompted him to murder them. Lockhart's account of a country sacrament in Peter's Letters to his Kinsfolk, a work which developed from the magazine, is also prompted by his interpretation of the picture given by Burns of the character of the Scottish peasantry. Morris wishes to determine 'how far the description, given in the Holy Fair of Burns, might be a correct one', and is told that although ludicrous circumstances do sometimes occur at sacraments 'the vigorous; but somewhat coarse pencil, of the Scottish bard' had outstepped the truth in this respect and omitted to do justice to the other elements of such a scene. His informant adds that this is odd, 'considering with what deep and fervent sympathy the poet had alluded, in "The Cotter's Saturday Night" ... to the very same elements, exerting their energies in a

65 'The Elder's Death-Bed', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 6 (1819-1820), 682-87 (pp.683, 686, 687).
Before Hogg's personality within the magazine is discussed in the context of this presentation of the Scottish peasantry, it is useful to demonstrate how far the linked attitude of the magazine towards the national religion helped to provide a supportive context for Hogg's fiction. Lang mentions several articles in which Lockhart eagerly defended the old-fashioned evangelical feeling of the nation and the national church from the at times excessively rational and sceptical opinions expressed in the pages of the Edinburgh Review. Thomas M'Crie, the author of the Life of John Knox (1811), had been an early contributor to the magazine, though interestingly he gave up writing for it on the grounds that it was evidently 'the design of the conductors to make religion a subject of discussion', and that he could not agree with their views. Several articles in the early numbers of the magazine place religion in a more traditional and emotional atmosphere, occasionally associating it with the innocence of childhood. In a discussion of the preaching of Chalmers, for instance, the preacher is compared to the poet in his power of producing an effect on the human passions, and the writer states that to the British people 'the spirit of religion is mingled with our earliest visions of innocent enjoyment'. He also describes the way in which the bustle of a

---

68 M'Crie to Blackwood, 5 January 1818, quoted in Annals, I, 176–77.
great city is hushed as the people meet for worship. In December 1817 an article defending the Covenanters from the attacks made by Charles Kirkpatrick Sharpe appeared which is of particular interest, in that it has been suggested that it is the work of Hogg himself. However, even if this is not so the magazine article presents a view of the Covenanters which is in essential agreement with that of Hogg in *The Brownie of Bodsbeck*. The writer quotes the opinion of a friend who argues that 'it must be evident to everyone, that at least the eminent Presbyterians of Scotland thought that they were in the right. A man can do no more for a cause than die for it ....' This is also the opinion of Wat of Chapelhope, Hogg's representative of sanity and common sense in his novel, who listens to the doctrinal and historical arguments of a party of fugitive Covenanters and comments, 'I couldn't follow them out at no rate; but I says, "I pit nae doubt, callants, but ye're right, for ye has proven to a' the world that ye think sae"' (*Brownie*, p.22). Although, as Mack has argued, Hogg's novel may have been composed as early as 1813 (*Brownie*, pp.xiv-xvii), it does also seem to fit naturally into the magazine attitude to religion around the time of

---


70 'A Letter to Charles Kirkpatrick Sharpe, Esq. on his Original Mode of Editing Church History', *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, 2(1817-1818), 305-09 (p.308), attributed to Hogg in Bibliography, p.33.

71 The abbreviation *Brownie* is listed before the text, and will be used throughout this study, for James Hogg, *The Brownie of Bodsbeck*, edited by Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh and London, 1976).
its first publication. Hogg's work associates the Covenanters with the old pattern of life in the country, and with a local landscape and local traditions, whereas their Royalist opponents are viewed as intruders, imposing themselves on the landscape and the people, and alien to the ways and the language of the locality. When Clavers examines the old shepherd, John of the Muchrah, for example, he is unable to understand the man's speech nor his account of his work as a shepherd, which Hogg says 'was much the same to him as if it had been delivered in the language of the Moguls' (Brownie, p.63). The troopers only spoil the country in their progress, tearing the lead from the tombs of the Scotts of Thirlstane and harrying the tenants of the turn-coat Sir James Johnston in a 'route of rapine and devastation' (Brownie, pp.82, 86). Clavers himself is associated with the devil or with that ill-omened animal the serpent. His deep grey eye 'more than the eye of any human being resembled that of a serpent — offence gleamed in it' (Brownie, p.56). The Covenanters utilise rather than oppose the beliefs, habits, and husbandry of the area, on the other hand. Their actions are mistaken for those of a brownie or a band of fairies, spiritual beings who were alien and dangerously capricious, but who had been known to help as well as to injure men. They in fact perform some of the functions of benevolent spirits, in preserving the innocence of Katherine, and in reaping corn and smearing sheep on the Chapelhope farm in return for their food and protection by the family. They are also compared to various hunted birds and animals, such as foxes (pp.10-11), partridges (p.118), and wolves (p.161). As Clavers is associated with the demonic, they are associated with the wildness and severity of nature itself. They are fearsome to the local people in the same
way that the more lonely part of their own landscape is fearsome. The 'haggard severity' of the Covenanters is paralleled by the physical conditions of their retreat in such a 'dismal wilderness' (Brownie, pp.23, 21). Their isolation in nature, however, is also implied isolation with Heaven when Hogg informs his reader that they 'were now so sorely reduced, that scarcely durst one show his face, unless it were to the moon and stars of Heaven' (Brownie, p.82). Although in one sense the Covenanters are strangers to the Border, Hogg shows that in another they belong there and form a part of it.

Given the favourable atmosphere of Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine with regard to old-fashioned evangelical religion it may seem surprising that few of Hogg's tales in the magazine itself concern themselves primarily with religion. Hogg's use of religious belief is particularly interesting, both as a historical part of the life of the community he was describing and for its frequent connection with a superstitious and providential view of the world. In 'Sound Morality' the familiar context of a shepherds' debate on the comparative religious merits of morality and faith is used as the setting for an enigmatic and fascinating tale, half realistic and half allegorical, which apparently attempts to distinguish the truly charitable person among a number of characters from the Gude town and the Bad town by means of their reactions to the distress of a widow and her child.72 The reader is made to shift his opinion on this question as fresh information and fresh reflections on the

72 'Sound Morality', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 29(1829), 741-47.
motivation of each character are presented to him, and is finally unable to decide it. If the tale has one didactic meaning it must arise from the author's manipulation of his reader's attitude, and stress the inability of men to judge accurately of each other's hearts. 'A Tale of the Martyrs' is more representative of those of Hogg's tales which deal directly with religious belief. Although like 'Sound Morality' it moves between realistic Scots speech and manners and a more timeless and universal allegory, this tale is less concerned with doctrine than with belief in the existence of a world beyond that of the senses and with the feelings of the persecuted. Religion is linked with superstition in Aggie's wish to relate her dreams to her friends so that "if ought turn out like it in the course o' providence, it may bring it to baith their minds that their spirits had been conversing with God". As her dream informs Jane about the fate of her husband the tale confirms her view of the spiritual nature of dreams. The dream is allegorical, a dignified subject and scene contrasting with Aggie's homely and irreverent wit. The rough-looking road that Aggie is reluctant to go along, though told it will lead her to one who will show her the road to heaven, is both a visualised landscape and the passage from life to death. The beasts who wish to prey on John Weir's corpse are also the fiends he has struggled against in life (p.49). On hearing that this place is called Faith's Hope, Jane realises that there is an actual place of that name in her neighbourhood and seeks

73 'A Tale of the Martyrs', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 26 (1829), 48-51 (p.49).
and finds her husband's body there, miraculously untouched by wild beasts as in the dream. The dream is therefore a prophetic message to the persecuted as well as an allegory about the means to salvation. Hogg's attitude as narrator in a tale like this one has much in common with that held by several popular Scottish religious writers and ministers of the past. The historian Wodrow, for example, concentrated in one of his works on telling of providential interventions in the lives of Christians: there are accounts of a murdered infant pointing his finger at his guilty father, of a fugitive minister preserved from capture by his horse refusing to go forward on a path, and of a stranger all in white being seen to sing in worship with Mr Shields unknown to him.74 In his history he is inclined to belief in direct demonic possession and inspiration: when the fanatic John Gib denounced the ministers and his eyes kindled Wodrow comments that 'Mr Gray of Chrystoun frequently used to say, he did take him at that Meeting to be possessed with a Devil'.75 The memoirs of Thomas Boston show that, although less inclined to the miraculous than Wodrow, he shared something of this sense of being in a world of satanic suggestion and kindly providential interference and warning. Boston gives instances of temptations put into his mind by Satan, and of events which were wisely ordered by providence though contrary to his inclinations at

the time they happened. For example, he was disappointed that at a time when his health was failing his son refused to become a minister, while the son of the vigorous and healthy Mr George Byres was able to help his father. Boston comments on this regret, 'But, 0!', the admirable conduct of Providence, challenging an entire resignation! The said Mr George Byres elder is now removed by death: and I am yet spared, doing my work, though in much weakness'. Hogg warmly approved of the religious writings of Boston, commenting that 'there are no such fervour and strength of reasoning to be met with in any modern composition, as predominate in his'. He owned in the 1837 version of *The Brownie of Bodsbeck* that Wodrow's history had been an important source for the work (*Brownie*, p.170). Such works were familiar to him, and congenial to his own exploration of the links between religion and superstition. They represent a more superstitious and less sentimental view of the national religion, however, than that of many articles in *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* and it is possible that this difference may in part account for the fact that, while the magazine formed a favourable context for tales of the devoutness of the Scottish peasant, few of Hogg's tales with a religious theme were printed there.

Hogg himself, however, was rather more firmly included in the depiction of the nature of the Scottish peasant in the magazine.

---

itself and in works related to it. William Ruddick describes how in *Peter's Letters to his Kinsfolk*, in which Lockhart was coming to understand the nature of Scotland's past and the national consciousness in art, Hogg was represented as a sort of Noble Savage, just as Henry Mackenzie was a literal survivor from a past age.\(^78\)

The two most important scenes in the work to involve Hogg, the dinner in honour of Burns and the rural excursion to Roslyn, display Hogg not just as an uncouth rustic but also as a manifestation in polite society of an older and more traditional way of life. In other words Hogg is presented as a Tory symbol for the survival of a past, distinctively Scottish culture. The role of the Shepherd in the *Noctes Ambrosianae* is not dissimilar. At least some of the interlocutors of this series, which supposedly represents the social gatherings of the magazine's chief supporters, are representative, after the fashion of the members of the Club in the *Spectator*. Just as Tickler is a representative old-fashioned Scottish gentleman, so the Shepherd is a representative peasant as well as a nature-inspired poet. This gives him a particular authority in speaking of country matters, folklore and the supernatural, and the views and habits of the Scottish peasantry. The Shepherd is, for instance, the authority on ghost stories among the group. On one occasion he recollects the way that his own soul was frightened by all kinds of traditionary terrors, and advises that if a real ghost is introduced into a tale it must appear but seldom and then only

---

for some great end which could have been accomplished in no other way. Speaking on politics, the Shepherd authoritatively proclaims that being a thinking people 'the great majority o' shepherds are Conservatives'. Once they get an insight into the workings of new contrivances they are willing to adopt them, 'yet a newfangle in their een's but a newfangle'. The rural population is thus described as naturally Tory, with a very small sprinkling of rural riff-raff, whereas in the great cities 'there are hale divisions hotchin' wi' urban riff-raff, and it's them ye hear at hustins routin' in a way that the stots and stirs o' the Forest would be ashamed o' theirsells for doin' ....' Hogg features so largely and so curiously in the early magazine because as a peasant poet he could be used as a symbol for the survival of the old rural Scotland despite innovations in politics and manners and despite increasing industrialisation. Through the portrait of him as the Shepherd Hogg became identified intimately with the political and literary views of Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine.

This public personality of the Ettrick Shepherd gave Hogg a literary status which covered his lack of formal education, as Petrie correctly indicates. Hogg felt himself to be in a strong position both as a critic and as an author on questions of the truth of an artistic representation to nature or of the characteristics of the Scottish peasantry. This confidence is shown, for example, in his

---

answer to Blackwood's complaint of the mixture of the ludicrous with solemn and fine religious feeling in the original of his poem 'A Sunday Pastoral'. Hogg reacted to this complaint of poor taste by retorting that 'the mixture of love and religion in it can only be objectionable to those who are ignorant of the pastoral life. Supreme Nature is there my monitor and I cannot alter or improve without violating her behests'. Despite this confidence in his own authority, however, the insistence on Hogg's peasant status by himself and others in general may have had negative results for his work. A man who could publicly declare, 'I am so ignorant of the world, that it can scarcely be expected I should steer clear of all inadvertencies' (Memoir, p.50), and who could tease his friends with his supposed ignorance of well-known works of literature (Familiar Anecdotes, pp.133-34), was open to having the propriety and style of his own writing very freely criticised, and even freely censored. However, as Petrie notes, Hogg seems to have been quite happy upon the whole to have his prose work corrected and edited by others, and censorship does not seem even to have affected his style or mode of composition since his work was continually subjected to it. Perhaps, as she suggests, Hogg's flexible attitude to the alteration and editing of his prose indicates that his viewpoint was a modification of that of traditional performers of folk material, to whom each performance was different though the story and the method

81 Hogg to Blackwood, 1 September 1830, in NLS MS 4027, f.192; for Blackwood's objections to the piece, see Blackwood to Hogg, 26 August 1830, in NLS Acc. 5643, vol.89, p.67.
of composition were similar. Literary reasons may also account for this in part, though, for reading aloud was probably much more usual in Hogg's time than it is now. Jane Austen's novels, for example, are full of allusions which suggest the prevalence of reading poems, plays, and novels aloud among a party of relatives or close friends. Reading a story aloud tends to emphasise the continuous movement of the narrative and the voices of the narrator and his characters above all else, and when reading aloud was common the popularity of a tale considered unsuitable for it would also have been potentially much more restricted. Anyway, on several occasions Hogg clearly wished to read his work aloud and obtain the reactions of a listener, sometimes one of his Edinburgh and sometimes one of his Border friends, before it was published. He records his abortive attempts to read *The Queen's Wake: A Legendary Poem* aloud to his friends the Grays before he offered it for publication (*Memoir*, pp.24-25), and again in writing to Blackwood of one of his tales for the magazine he said that 'it being a fearful and unnatural story' he wished to read it to Laidlaw before he sent it away. It might be thought that those of Hogg's tales which appeared in *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* itself, where his public personality as the Ettrick Shepherd was continually stressed, would

83 For instance, there is the comic scene where Mr Collins is asked to read a novel aloud to the Bennet ladies in *Pride and Prejudice*, edited by Frank W. Bradbrook, Oxford English Novels (London, 1970), pp.60-61 (Volume I, Chapter 14).
84 Hogg to Blackwood, 6 August [1828], in NLS MS 4719, f.167.
have been more subjected to censorship than his work elsewhere, but this is not the case. Some of Hogg's tales in the magazine, it is true, were censored both on sexual and religious grounds. MacLachlan points out that 'The Marvellous Doctor' was expurgated by Hogg's nephew, Robert Hogg, before it appeared in the magazine. In writing of this tale to Blackwood, Hogg mentions a likely difficulty in the publication of it in the magazine as 'matters of modern delicacy', which suggests that in this tale about the misuse of a love elixir the censorship was probably on sexual grounds. Blackwood later refused Hogg's 'On the Separate Existence of the Soul' for the magazine on religious grounds, arguing that the orthodox would be shocked to see the tale there as 'it is directly in the teeth of revelation to permit the soul to exist separately for one moment without at once having its eternal state fixed'. But a large number of tales seem to have been acceptable to Blackwood for insertion in the magazine which he subsequently decided would have to be expurgated for their appearance in volume form as part of The Shepherd's Calendar. Robert Hogg was employed for this and Hogg was probably not even consulted about at least some of the changes he made, for Blackwood, sending Hogg the

---


volumes of The Shepherd's Calendar in February 1829 after copies had been shipped to London and only days before publication, hopes at this time that Hogg will be pleased with the way his nephew "has arranged and corrected the whole". This is why the magazine version of several tales is to be preferred to that of the separate collection. Perhaps this difference of approach to the magazine and the collected versions of some of these tales is due to the fact that Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, though in one sense a general periodical, made few concessions to female taste in its early years. There were frequent allusions to and even quotations from classical authors, while politics rapidly became a staple fare of most numbers. Mrs Oliphant comments on the small number of female contributors to the early magazine (Annals, I, 493), and it seems likely that the magazine catered more particularly for the masculine reader. This being so, there was less need to be scrupulous here than in more generally read books of fiction or types of periodical.

In keeping with Hogg's public personality in the magazine almost all of the tales published in Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine are tales of country life and the rural Scottish community. Even those tales that have city settings tend to contrast the town by implication with the secure world of the country. The deception practised upon the narrator by the pretended Colonel Cloud, for example, is made possible by the nature of society in the city, where men tend to meet on the neutral ground of public places of

---

entertainment, so that their reputation depends only on their powers of conversation and persuasion, without reference to the knowledge of the community or the experience of the past. Hogg's first suspicions of his companion are aroused when they engage in the country sport of fishing on their journey to the Highlands, Hogg remarking that 'the mason word is a humbug; but the very first wave of a rod is sufficient between anglers'. Finally, on a visit to Cloud's native place he learns that his grand colonel is the son of a weaver. Similarly comic misunderstandings result from the society of the city in 'Trials of Temper', when an important business carried on by means of notes and messages results in the introduction of a wrong Miss Campbell to an elderly Dr Brown returning from India with a fortune and looking for a wife, and involves the right Miss Campbell in an attachment to an impoverished medical student.

Most of the rural tales Hogg published in Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine up to 1829 were collected and published in that year under the title of The Shepherd's Calendar. Only three tales in this collection had not previously appeared in the magazine, while of these the two taken from the rival Edinburgh Magazine were perhaps intended for Blackwood but for Hogg's quarrel at the time of their appearance with that publisher, for the general heading under which they appeared, 'Pictures of Country Life', resembles that of the

---

90 'Trials of Temper', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 23(1828), 40-46, to which Hogg adds a rhyming 'Moralitas' on page 47.
other magazine series, 'The Shepherd's Calendar'.\textsuperscript{91} There are signs that Hogg himself thought of the series of tales in the magazine as a unit. In writing to Blackwood of one number of 'The Shepherd's Calendar' he wrote of it as 'of no great value it is true, but at the same time forming a half link in a chain which would be imperfect without it'. His anxiety over the republication of the series in a collected form suggests the importance of the series in his own eyes; he was very far from being exclusively concerned with the possible profits arising from this when he wrote that there was 'an absolute necessity exclusive of all other concerns for the collecting of these varied pictures and details of pastoral life', adding that his conscience would not be at rest until this was achieved.\textsuperscript{92} If the collection of tales is more loosely organised than the similarly titled volume of poetry by John Clare of 1827, which actually does what the title immediately suggests and describes the sounds and sights appropriate to each month of the year in the country, then it is also more unified than Gifford suggests when he writes that it 'collects together tales which are only part of a country theme by the hair of their heads'.\textsuperscript{93} Hogg's own account of his collection is the most appropriate, for it describes the manners, occupations, superstitions, and history of his own Border country.


\textsuperscript{92} Hogg to Blackwood, 18 January 1824, in NLS MS 4012, f.180, and 5 January 1828, in NLS MS 4021, f.271.

This kind of fiction by Hogg, that describing the life, customs, and beliefs of the Scottish peasant has in part been ably discussed in previous studies. Polsgrove analyses Hogg's tales in *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, but her interpretation of several of them is limited as a result of the ambitious and wide-ranging character of her interesting thesis, which links the very different country tales of six authors in three magazines. This breadth has led her to study the *New Monthly Magazine* in detail as the type of the newer magazines which paid the authors of new fiction reliably and liberally, so that the particular character of *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* is not emphasised in the discussion of Hogg's traditional tales, which limits itself, furthermore, to those involving the supernatural.94 For similar reasons, though Petrie displays her awareness of the influence of the periodical market in general upon Hogg's fiction and gives a thoroughly sound and detailed analysis of the importance of the pseudonym of the Ettrick Shepherd to Hogg, her primary interest is in the relationship between the form and structure of Hogg's literary tales and that which is to be found in the traditional oral performance of folk material, and in the way that his prose tales in general treat themes of firstly superstition and religion, and secondly history and community.95 Hogg's tales in the series 'The Shepherd's Calendar', however, may be placed here

---

94 Carol Claxon Polsgrove, 'Short Country Tales in Great Britain: 1820-40' (unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, University of Louisville, 1973), particularly Chapter V.

in the context of the magazine in which the series appeared, and in that of other attempts to write a fiction of Scottish peasant life. The fiction of John Wilson is particularly interesting in this respect, for several of Hogg's remarks upon it have survived. He praised Wilson's novel *The Trials of Margaret Lyndsay* (1823) as a charming work, 'pure, elegant, and perfect; all save two or three trivial misnomers regarding the character of Scottish peasantry', which shows him secure in his authority as the expert on what that character was. 96 Wilson's first volume of fiction, however, was a series of tales, some of which had previously appeared in Blackwood's *Edinburoh Magazine*, entitled *Lights and Shadows of Scottish Life*. As the title itself suggests, the collection attempts to delineate the Scottish character and Scottish rural life. After praising the sentiment and fine writing of the collection Hogg added significantly that the work possessed 'very little of real nature as it exists in the walks of Scottish life. The feelings and language of the author are those of Romance ...'. 97 In a work of his own published during the subsequent year and described on its title page as a series of domestic Scottish tales Hogg seems jocularly to compare his own work with that of Wilson. Describing to the reader his division of his narrative into circles like those of the moon, he explains that this darkens the plot on one side of his hero and enlightens it on the other, 'thereby displaying both: the lights and shadows of Scottish life'. Hogg then proceeds to follow up this allusion to

---

96 Hogg to Blackwood, 13 April [1823], in NLS MS 4010, f.188.  
97 Hogg to Blackwood, 14 June 1822, in NLS MS 4008, f.267.
the title of Wilson's collection with the unflattering remark that he holds it as incontrovertibly true that 'the moon ... displays these lights and shadows in a much more brilliant and delightful manner, than has ever been done by any of her brain-stricken votaries. There we see nature itself; with these it is nature abominably sophisticated'. Wilson's narratives are humorously categorised as poetic madness, and an opposing standard of natural illumination and realism proposed. One of the more important faults of Wilson's tales lies in the character of his narrator, who is often exceptionally and even ludicrously distant from the material he pretends to treat. In 'The Snow Storm' Wilson describes a family in an isolated cottage, stressing their picturesque simplicity of manners and habits and keeping their economic insecurity and physical hardships in the background. Wilson's narrator is very plainly the leisured and well-to-do gentleman describing the contentment and virtue of the lower orders for the comfort of the equally well-to-do reader of the magazine. The narrator separates himself and the reader from the life he attempts to describe in remarking 'before we can know what the summer, or what the winter yields for enjoyment or trial to our country's peasantry, we must have conversed with them in their fields and by their firesides', and only then can their influence be estimated 'over all the incidents, occupations, and events that modify or constitute the

existence of the poor'. This is the interviewer's way to knowledge, and it is not remarkable that it should often sound like a written report. It has already been shown that in a very different degree (and unnecessarily in his case) Hogg had experienced this problem of the excessive distance between the gentlemanly narrator and his material in his earliest prose articles for magazines.

Two of Hogg's tales from The Shepherd's Calendar, though published first in different magazines, suggest a direct comparison with Wilson's fiction by their similarity of subject. A version of 'The Prodigal Son' was published in the Edinburgh Magazine in two parts in September and November 1821, during Hogg's quarrel with Blackwood. In this unusually weak tale the supposedly dying infidel and vicious son of a devout peasant family repents of his corruption of the aged minister's grandchildren and recovers his faith on witnessing how sincerely and disinterestedly the old man prays for him in his sickness. During the previous year Wilson had published 'The Elder's Death-Bed' and its sequel 'The Penitent Son' in Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, which also deal with the edifying piety of old age, and with death and the conversion to Christianity of the dissolute and unbelieving son of a pious peasant family.

Like Wilson Hogg wrote an article for Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine about the effects of a snow-storm on the countryfolk living among the lonely Border hills, and here he shows to far greater advantage in the comparison. Wilson's tale is about a young girl who nearly perishes in an unexpected snow-storm on her way to visit her parents: her father sets out to find her when the storm comes on while her mother lies in a faint at home, but she is fortunately rescued by her master's son, who loves her. On her winter's walk home across country the servant-lass Hannah becomes an insubstantial as well as an exotic creature when the narrator says, 'So stepped she along, while the snow-diamonds glittered around her feet, and the frost wove a wreath of lucid pearls around her forehead'. The prose is full of such contrived and unrealistic description, and of inversions of word order designed to give it a poetic air. The tale is excessively idealistic about the plight of the friendless in this society. The mother says that God always makes orphans happy, for they "make friends o' all the bonny and sweet things in the world around them, and all the kind hearts in the world make friends o' them". In fact, Wilson's tales are a curious dream of what the peasant life of Scotland should be. Hogg's tale also describes the way in which the wildness of nature provokes and maintains the devoutness of the Scottish peasantry and includes a description of the situation of 'a family sequestered in a lone glen during the time of a winter storm'; in the evening the shepherd goes out to

---

look at the weather and comes in to family worship to recommend his family to the protection of Heaven. The sense that he is dependent on the God who rules the elements is daily impressed on the shepherd's mind, and this 'contributes not a little to that firm spirit of devotion for which the Scottish shepherd is so distinguished'. Hogg denounces 'him that would weaken the bonds with which true Christianity connects us with Heaven and with each other'.

In such passages Hogg is in essential agreement with the Tory depiction in the magazine of a devout Scottish peasantry, but in relating his personal experience of such scenes his fiction is very different from that of a writer like Wilson. The article is signed with Hogg's name, and partly recounts his memories of his youth, so that the reader is not separated with the narrator as an observer of scenes in which he has no direct concern. On the contrary, he is reminded that as a Christian he is connected too with God and with other men. Hogg's article is more interesting than Wilson's in its treatment of the supernatural as well as of religion. The second part of Hogg's tale begins with a quotation from Burns for a motto, but this is significantly from 'Tam d' Shanter. A Tale' and not from 'The Cotter's Saturday Night'. Hogg uses the contrast between generations to describe a range of attitudes to superstition. The debating society of young men are clearly inclined to be sceptical, since a servant-lass overhears one of them declaring that there is no devil at all (p.215).

103 'The Shepherd's Calendar. Storms', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 5(1819), 75-81, 210-16 (pp.76, 77).
But the community in general is highly superstitious. A rumour spreads that the debating society provoked the punishment of the storm on the community by their attempts to raise the devil, simply because it is not generally understood why so many men should have met together at a lonely spot, and because it was at that spot that the storm centred. (p. 213). Hogg's mother attempts to discover the details of what actually happened, but as the narrator says is defeated by 'her own early prejudices in favour of the doctrine of all kinds of apparitions' (p. 215). Hogg's own attitude as a young man is wavering, and depends very much on the company he is in. Indeed, belief is seen very much as a social phenomenon: the narrator declares that 'these kind of feelings are infectious, people may say what they will; fear begets fear as naturally as light springs from reflection' (p. 214). When Hogg first hears the rumour that his associates have been raising the devil he wishes to be sceptical, but the story-telling abilities of John Burnet, his informer, and the belief of the other listeners influence his opinion, so that the narrator says, 'though I am ashamed to acknowledge it, I suspected that the allegation might be too true' (p. 214). However, when Hogg met with his brother, who had been present at the meeting of the society, he is easily convinced of 'the falsehood and absurdity of the whole report' (p. 215). As a member of the rural community Hogg is able to show the reader a range of reactions to the storm, using his younger self as an intermediary between the scepticism of the reader and the credulity of the greater part of the community he describes, and placing the superstitious effects of natural calamities alongside the more
generally acceptable ones. Petrie indeed argues that the affinity in Hogg's world between religion and superstition in general lies in the fact that both in some degree attempt to eliminate life's randomness and discover the causes of things and events.\textsuperscript{104} In this tale Hogg shows that the natural calamity of a storm evokes both devotion and superstition. In another respect, too, Hogg's view in this tale of the rural community is much less sentimental than that of Wilson. Strong common values and a respect for experience make the community a protective one, but they also ensure a narrowness and a fear of anything unusual. Hogg is grateful for his uncle's advice about the storm, but he also earns his anger for 'running up and down the country in such weather, and at such a season' (p. 78). The uncle's total lack of sympathy for Hogg's desire to meet his literary friends is echoed in the mistrust of the community in general that lies behind the devil-raising rumour. In passages in this tale, as in some others in his magazine series 'The Shepherd's Calendar', Hogg clearly is attempting to give a representative description of the Scottish rural community. For instance, an account of a shearing in one tale enlarges upon the subjects of conversation usual at such meetings. Hogg gives a conversation between two wrangling lovers at their work, and then states that the conversation depends on the bias of the speakers, 'some settling the knotty points of divinity; others telling auld world stories about persecutions, forays, and fairy raids; and some

whispering, in half sentences, the soft breathings of pastoral love'. Other passages in the series suggest the basic conservatism produced by this particular life-style. In a paper about the courting of rustic beauties, for example, the reader is told that hardly one of these girls turns out to be a bad wife. This is partly due to experience, whose 'maxims are carried down from father to son in all their pristine strength' so that 'that class of young men never flock about, or make love to a girl who is not noted for activity as well as beauty'. Hogg's aims in his magazine series, however, are wider than mere description of the habits of the rural community or analysis of its basic conservatism. His own work was, doubtless, acceptable for Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine because it suited well with the concern of the periodical with the depiction of a devout and contented Scottish peasantry, but it is not limited by this concern. In keeping with Hogg's status among the contributors to the magazine as the Scottish peasant he also includes in his magazine series tales on subjects of particular interest to shepherds, such as those on dogs and the lasses, and examples of the favourite tales of such men. Elsewhere in the series, as in his papers on storms, Hogg makes good use of personal recollection and of hearsay. Petrie emphasises the importance of the signature of the Ettrick Shepherd to Hogg in his career, in

lending him an air of detachment from contemporary society as a rural and homely moralist. As she also states, the narrator of many of the tales in *The Shepherd's Calendar* is identifiably Hogg himself. Of the range of settings in time of the various tales in the magazine series those which are closest to direct analysis of the typical features of the Scottish peasantry are also the closest to gossip, and tend to feature the recent past of Hogg's own youth. Examples of this are the papers on storms and dogs, and some parts of the papers on sheep and prayers. Hogg also tells stories about the well-known characters of his own district of a past age. For instance, in the section on odd characters the three most dwelt upon are Hogg's own grandfather and two people living in the parish when Boston was minister there, that is from 1707 to 1732. A different sort of personal recollection enables Hogg to relate a tale with supernatural elements without laying himself open to charges of easy credulity from his reader. Polsgrove comments that the device of telling the story himself by weaving in eye-witness accounts allows him to present the believer's view of such a tale forcefully while apparently remaining objective. In relating the dreadful fate of Mr Adamson of Laverhope, for example, Hogg recounts that as a youth he heard an account of what

happened to Mr Adamson from Rob Johnston, a shepherd on one of the
neighbouring farms who had been present at the fateful shearing.\textsuperscript{[110]}
This particular tale additionally satisfies the rationalist
expectations of the reader by containing material for an alternative,
though less satisfying, account of Adamson's death than that he was
providentially cut off in the midst of his wickedness. The clue
to this alternative interpretation lies in the apparently pointless
anecdote delivered by Hogg after the story of Adamson is ended, of
the death of Adam Copland of Minnigess. Copland was also out
shearing his flocks on the day of a storm and was killed by
lightning, but as he was 'esteemed by all who knew him' the
community is not provided with a context of superstitious
prejudgement and premonition for his similar fate, and the result
is a careful recollection by the only servant present at his death
of the attendant physical circumstances and details.\textsuperscript{(pp.639-40)}.

Rob Johnston and the other shepherds, Hogg makes it clear, were
expecting some sort of judgment to overtake Adamson for his ill
conduct long before there was any sign of a storm. On the day
previous to the shearing Mrs Irvine had denounced Adamson's
heartlessness to her family and prophesied that Heaven would punish
him (p.631). On the day of the shearing itself Rob Johnston,
provoked at his cruelty to an innocent orphan, declares that he will
not thrash Adamson but leave him to the one who has declared himself
the orphan's shield, and that he expects some testimony of God's

\textsuperscript{[110]} 'The Shepherd's Calendar. Class Second. Deaths, Judgments,
and Providences', \textit{Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine}, \textbf{13}(1823),
629-40 (p.639).
displeasure to come over the farmer for it (p. 632).

In other tales in the series the magazine's stress on religious feeling and disapproval of scepticism permits Hogg to plead for the supernatural as it is linked with devotion. In relating examples of prophetic dreams of evil and of good omen, Hogg declares that dreams prove 'to the unlettered and contemplative mind ... a distinct existence of the soul, and its lively and rapid intelligence with external nature, as well as with a world of spirits ...'.111 In relating a traditional fairy story he promises only to be faithful to what he has heard, and leaves the attempt to analyse the origins of the tradition to 'the professors of moral philosophy, in their definitions of pneumatology'. The pun applied in this referral is a severe one, for the term 'pneumatology' had of old signified a science or doctrine of spiritual beings, but was restricted towards the end of the eighteenth century in certain contexts to express something rather like the term 'psychology' today. The gibe ties in with the other remarks here against modern scepticism. The narrator intends to cherish 'the visions that have been, as well as the hope of visions yet in reserve, far in the ocean of eternity'. Without these the soul of man is diminished to 'a cold phlegmatic influence, so inclosed within the walls of modern scepticism, as scarcely to be envied by ... the beasts that perish'.112 In addition,

Hogg suggests that one supernatural tale may have its origins in religious history. Colin Hyslop's story partly shows how he was freed from the power and contamination of evil through his conversion to the Protestant religion. The scene of his trial contrasts the harshness of David Beaton, 'a severe and bigoted Papist', with the moderation and true wisdom of Mr Wishart, 'a learned man'.

Wishart, whose name Hogg spells 'Wiseheart' sometimes with obviously allegorical intention, is familiar with a sacred language and translates the inscription on Colin's vial, perceiving its spiritual significance as the cup of repentance. He also, when the community becomes convinced that Colin has been the object of a special divine care, prevents the Catholic part of the community from falling down and worshipping Colin (p.519). The names of Beaton and Wishart are actually placed in opposition to one another in the history of the Scottish church. George Wishart had been a teacher in Montrose, where he had taught his pupils to read Greek. After some years of exile from Scotland on account of a threatened prosecution for heresy, he returned and was active as a preacher for two years until in 1546 he was seized, condemned as a heretic by Beaton, and burnt at the stake. Beaton himself was assassinated shortly afterwards by a party of Wishart's supporters, partly in retaliation for this act. For the reader who does not care for superstition, the tale provides a fascinating legend based on religious history.

113 'The Shepherd's Calendar. Class IX. Fairies, Deils, and Witches', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 23(1828), 509-19 (pp.516, 518).
In contrast to the distance at which a writer like Wilson keeps his reader from his country subjects, Hogg insists in this magazine series on the closeness of the reader to what he is being told about. The gossip and personalities of the country fireside or workplace are stressed, but so are those of the magazine. In placing the dogs before the lasses in his calendar the narrator says that Christopher North will be amused at the preference, and attribute it to the shepherd's marriage having dampened his spirit of gallantry. In defence of his opinion he elaborates on the useful qualities of the dog, remarking, 'now that I have got on my hobby, I greatly suspect that all my friends at Ambrose's will hardly get me off again'.

115 Emphasising in his papers on storms the similar interest in gossip and rumour of the country folk and the reader of the magazine Hogg compares the excitement caused by the devil-raising rumour in the Ettrick community to the 'effects produced by the Chaldee Manuscript' on the literary society of Edinburgh.

116 In the paper which tells of the loss of Rob Dodds Hogg carefully distinguishes between an old-fashioned countryman's view of the world and a modern one by making a young tenant farmer in part represent the reader within his tale. Saunders in fact describes in his history of this period how the life of a successful farmer gradually shifted from the old communal, traditional pattern towards a simplified version of the life-style of the gentry, so that Hogg

115 'The Shepherd's Calendar. Class IV. Dogs'. Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 15(1824), 177-83 (p.177).
is probably accurate in making such an alignment. Hogg uses the ignorance of the young farmer about traditional attitudes and tales to inform the reader with him by means of the old shepherd's accounts of these. The identification between the two begins at the start of the tale where the bleakness of the winter's day gives the impression that the lonely shepherd is isolated in a desolate waste, or 'so his master thought; and any stranger beholding the scene, would have been still more deeply impressed that the case was so in reality'. Hogg then shows that to the shepherd himself the scene is full of the active purpose and presence of God. His traditional view of the world is not just a quaint and amusing preface to his fascinating tales of past times, as his master and the magazine reader are inclined to view it. The comfort of living in a world where everything is intentionally ordered and structured is pointed at in the two different ways of viewing the harsh scene, and this is expanded in the subsequent discussion between the two men on the present agricultural crisis. Where the farmer looks only at the apparently random immediate causes of the crisis and feels helpless, the shepherd lives in the security of perceiving a divine purpose (p.315).

In one of his tales in the series Hogg lays a trap to convince his reader that despite his rationalism he is as willing on one

level as the members of the rural community to believe in the existence of a ghost. The tale subtitled 'Smithy Cracks' centres on the gossip which leads the folk of the village and the reader to mistake a living man for a spectre. A swearing, hard-drinking laird recovers after an attempt upon his life by his evil son-in-law and thinks it advisable to allow everyone but a friend or two to think that he is dead for a short time. The superstitious preconceptions of these friends and the effect of their excited gossip about the appearances of the laird's ghost lead each of them to mistake the man's attempts to tell them of his survival for a ghostly visitation. The laird's swearing is interpreted as evidence of his damnation by his hearers. The laird's old toping companion, for example, thinks that he is talking to one of the damned when the laird addresses him familiarly with "Jamie Sanderson! O, Jamie Sanderson! I have been forced to appear to you in a d—d fearful guise." 119 Hogg laughs at the credulity of the village folk who, suspecting the manner of the laird's decease, make his person and expressions into those of an unhappy spirit; but the mockery also includes the magazine reader who has also caught eagerly at the parish gossip, wanting to exercise his imagination and be entertained. Part of the jest is that the laird's mare is not at all deceived, for when she hears his swearing she neighs for gladness (p. 70). Besides giving the generation of a ghost story here, Hogg identifies the magazine reader with the rural

community through his desire for imaginative release.

Several tales besides those which relate Hogg's personal memories benefit in some way from the use of a strongly characterised and informal narrator. Sometimes, as a local man, Hogg indicates his awareness of the physical setting of his tale. The reader is informed, for example, that the place where Colin Hyslop was set upon by the witches is 'called to this day the Satyr Sike'.

Polsgrove points out that, especially in the case of tales far removed in time from the present, the setting serves as a tenuous authentication of the story in acting as a surviving remnant of it. Besides absolving Hogg from personal responsibility for the literal truth of what he tells, such a mention of its traditional nature reminds the sceptical reader that it has a separate antiquarian value. In the story of George Dobson the Souter and his prophetic dream Hogg depends particularly on this interest. As the Ettrick Shepherd he describes the past features of his own community and unearths scraps of old songs from his memory to entertain his reader. The reader is given verses from one traditional song supporting the souters against the Earl of Hume, and from another supporting the Scots against the English. A song called 'Wap at the widow, my laddie' is also mentioned, and no less than ten verses and the chorus of a song called 'Sing Round About

---

120 'The Shepherd's Calendar. Class IX. Fairies, Deils, and Witches', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 23(1828), 509-19 (p.515).

Hawick, &c.' were printed in the magazine, with a footnote by the fictitious editor North to say that he believed this song had never been published before. Even separate from this, however, there are passages which stress that the narrator is a local man. In describing Mrs Wilson's recognition of George's personal and economic advantages the narrator says that she 'would not have denied him any of those good points more than Gideon Scott would to a favourite Cheviot tup, in any society whatever' (p.560). The very sunset is a local one when he says that 'long ere the sun leaned his elbow on Skelfhill pen' his hero was in love (p.561). This may be done partly to lay claim to an intimate knowledge of his subject, but the local narrator also specifically mediates between the mind of his countryman and the mind of his reader, thus allowing the outcome of the prophetic dream to be related sympathetically from a viewpoint close to that of the man who has experienced it and believes in it. This narrator frequently makes use of Scots words or turns of phrase, and of constructions or expressions which suggest the casual exchange of anecdotes or chat rather than a formal piece of writing. His description of George Dobson's thoughts and motivation thus often resembles speaking from the character's own mind, while he retains the advantages of a third person narrative for giving explanations to the magazine reader. On the occasion when George's dream begins to be fulfilled the narrator says that he

arrived at Mrs Wilson's at ten minutes past two 'to be as fashionable as the risk of losing his kale would permit' (p.561), where both the motive and the use of the word 'kale' for his dinner clearly represent George's own thoughts and language. When George enters the room and sees a gentleman who resembles the person in his dream the reader is asked to 'think of George's utter amazement, and astonishment, and dumfounderment, — for there is no term half strong enough to express it by, — ' (p.561). Again this informal past tense narration, except for its use of the third person, is close to the way in which a man like George would recollect his own experience.

Perhaps the least successful tale in the series is that in which Hogg has the least confidence in his firmly characterised narrator and emphasises most strongly the independence of a story which appears to be an embarrassment to him. Hogg stresses that this is 'an old story', states that he tells it on the authority of an informant, and corroborates it by reference to a printed account.123 He states at first that he cannot decide 'whether it is a dream or an apparition, as it partakes of the nature of both' (p.173), yet directs the reader explicitly towards the supernatural explanation of events in saying of the brothers that 'the most incredulous mind could scarce doubt that they had had communion with a supernatural being', and that they could draw no other conclusion themselves about it (p.181). Hogg's concluding sentence

shows the same division, freely admitting that the tale is 'little accordant with any principle of nature or reason', yet rather lamely trying to defend it as the truth on the grounds that neither are many other traditional tales, and saying that the thing to do is 'to admit their veracity without saying why or wherefore' (p. 185).

The tale is an entertaining one, and contains some excellent Scots speeches, particularly the racy ones of old Jane Jerdan as she expresses her preference for good land over the lawyer's chance of wealth by the breath of his lungs. The insecurity of the narrator is an important flaw, however: here he is neither relating the tale as an example of the beliefs appropriate to people of a particular time and locality, nor does his voice represent him as the sort of person who can give the tale the interest of belief through participating in its world himself to some degree. Rather curiously he insists on its truth while being embarrassed at its extravagance, and pushes his narrative towards a single interpretation of events after professing that he does not know how to categorise it.

In the tale in 'The Shepherd's Calendar' concerning witches Hogg gains from not insisting upon the literal and historical truth of the tale as he tells it. As Polsgrove notes, Hogg suggests here that the passage of time is itself responsible for the story's mystery. He compares himself, unable to restore the original structure of the events of his tale, humorously and unfavourably, to a Mr Blore who can delineate an ancient abbey from the smallest

---

With this acknowledged inaccessibility of meaning the tale can be told with the directness and simplicity of a fairy tale. After all his trials, for example, Colin is presented to 'the Queen Regent, who put a ring on his right hand, a chain of gold about his neck, and loaded him with her bounty' (p. 519). The imaginative and supernatural events of the tale are made acceptable to the sceptical reader in addition because they may be treated allegorically. When the witches in the shape of cats attack Colin, for instance, they are unable to touch him while his faith remains firm but fasten on him when he despairs (p. 515). This is both an episode in a supernatural tale and a Christian commentary on the way in which loss of faith and trust subjects man to evil.

Colin progresses in two directions in this tale: literally, he is freed from the persecutions of his enemies and gains wealth and his loved Barbara as his bride, while spiritually he is freed from the power and contamination of evil through his conversion to the Protestant faith. In much the same way Hogg's story of Mary Burnet's fate combines a fairy tale with moral commentary, and relies upon the inaccessibility of the original events of the tale due to the obscuring passage of time. The narrator assures his reader that unless he can for the time being accept the supernaturalism of the tale he will not be able to structure it, in answering his curiosity as to Mary's fate by saying that 'if she was not a changeling, or the Queen of the Fairies herself, I can make nothing

125 'The Shepherd's Calendar. Class IX. Fairies, Deils, and Witches', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 23(1828), 509-19 (p. 519).
Allanson's terrible death is indeed brought about through the intervention of unearthly powers, but it is additionally shown to be a direct consequence of his own evil conduct. The narrator remarks on what 'a beautiful moral may be extracted from this fairy tale!' (p.224), presumably for those readers who are not attracted to its supernaturalism. He carefully combines directions to the reader on interpreting the events of the tale with moral description. In treating Allanson's passion for the beauty at the fair, for example, he carefully explains that it lacks refinement and virtue and is 'not a ray from the paradise above, but a ... spark from the regions below. From thence it arose, and in all its wanderings, thitherward it pointed again' (p.222). This both analyses Allanson's feelings as immoral and prefigures his eventual destruction by supernatural means. Once more in this tale Hogg's local narrator proves his value in directing the reader. He presents the traditional, communal view of events quite naturally, dropping directions for interpreting the tale either in his own words or by presenting a view as the one held by a substantial part of the community. For example, on the confusing events surrounding the disappearance of Mary he relates that 'the whole country agreed, that it had been the real Mary Burnet who was drowned in the loch', and that the later appearance had been a fairy (p.219). Even where the narrator appears to distinguish his own views from the community's opinion, very often he is only trying to present it in

a rationally qualified version that would be more accessible to the reader. Allanson's depravity is regarded, for instance, by his rural neighbours as 'an earthly and eternal curse fixed on him; a mark like that which God put upon Cain, that whosoever knew him might shun him'. The narrator's own description of this does not have the same superstitious and biblical overtones, but is expressed in abstract terms of moral analysis, when he calls it 'a mania, that blinded the eyes of his understanding, and hindered him from perceiving the path of moral propriety, or even that of common decency' (p.220). Yet both express the opinion that Allanson's pursuit of women is obsessive and bodes ill for him.

'The Shepherd's Calendar' is a considerable achievement made by Hogg within the pages of Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine. Polsgrove rightly insists that Hogg's magazine tales of the supernatural had to take account of the scepticism of the contemporary reader, and upon the function of such tales in providing this reader with an imaginative release, but from an almost inevitable lack of the context of this specific magazine, due to the very wide-ranging aims of her able study, she occasionally misrepresents Hogg's practice. For example, not appreciating the influence of the Ettrick Shepherd upon Hogg's narrator she makes him too much like a reporter of the tales and not so local and intermediary a figure between what he describes and those to whom he describes it as he really is. In separating Hogg's tone from

the favourable atmosphere of the magazine with regard to religious belief she misses the particular effectiveness there of Hogg's attacks on a scepticism which he analyses as opposing the manifestation of the spiritual in religion as well as in superstition. Similarly, the concerns of Petrie's excellent study do not permit her to extend her analysis of the importance of the pseudonym of the Ettrick Shepherd to Hogg's fiction in general into a detailed examination of its particular significance in his work for the magazine in which his public personality came to play such a prominent part. 128

Although Hogg had previously used periodicals as outlets for his work, *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* gave his fiction as well as that of others a new economic importance. Taking this periodical merely as an example of the newer type of magazine, it is possible to see that such magazines could themselves provide a writer with contacts with the spirit and atmosphere of contemporary European literature. They were also useful as reading-matter in providing a writer such as Hogg with information on topical matters which he could use in the service of fantasy and myth in his fiction. The fresh and lively spirit of *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* in its early years taught Hogg to subordinate the antiquarian side of his work properly, and a change is visible from Hogg's early fiction to the exchange of anecdotes with writers such as Laidlaw and Scott, which led him into a more intimate relationship as a narrator with

---

his subject matter and with his magazine audience. The magazine, in its concern with the national religion and church and with the analysis of national character, favoured Hogg's use of the supernatural in his fiction. Hogg's earlier and continuing self-presentation as a peasant poet and natural genius was taken up in the mythology of Peter's Letters to his Kinsfolk and the Noctes Ambrosianae, and in this context Hogg became a recognised authority on the beliefs, customs, and character of the Scottish peasantry. John Wilson, among others, tried to depict the life and character of the Scottish peasantry in fiction, but Hogg could do this in a more detailed way, criticise the other attempts, and in addition demonstrate to the reader his own essential closeness to that world.

Despite all this the signs are that not long after the publication of these magazine tales as The Shepherd's Calendar the market for Hogg's tales in Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine was becoming less satisfactory than it had been. In 1831, for instance, only two of Hogg's prose articles appeared in the magazine, as opposed to five in 1828 or six in 1827. This may have been due partly to the magazine's preoccupation, as an important organ of the Tory party, with politics in the eventful period leading up to the Reform Bill of 1832. Writing to his son in India Blackwood indicated that his magazine was keeping his business going in what was otherwise a period of commercial stagnation (Annals, II, 104), and its popularity would presumably rest at this time on its considerably extended treatment of politics. At the end of 1831 Hogg quarrelled with Blackwood, and by the time that a reconciliation was effected in 1834, when Hogg's articles could again be offered
for the magazine, William Blackwood had only a few months to live. Kilbourne suggests that when his sons, Alexander and Robert, took over the editorship of the magazine the importance of fiction in it at first declined seriously, and that what fiction there was tended to be markedly genteel compared with the fiction published in the magazine during their father's editorship.129 But whatever their reasons were, Alexander and Robert were not interested in Hogg's fiction as their father had been.

It was not very likely that Hogg could compensate for this reduction in the publication of his shorter fiction by publishing more of his work in separate volumes. Evidently, from the number of publishers he applied to, he even experienced difficulties in bringing out a collected edition of his prose, and this would include his known and tried work in fiction as a definitive edition. Yet the final years of his life were ones of particular anxiety to Hogg, largely for financial reasons. He had lost heavily on the lease of the Mount Benger farm, and must have been conscious that his death would leave his very young family almost entirely unprovided for. Therefore he desperately needed to publish, and be paid for, his fiction and verse. As his market in Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine contracted what alternatives could he find?

CHAPTER FOUR: THE LATER ALTERNATIVES

In being obliged to seek alternative outlets to Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine for his fiction Hogg was so far fortunate that the number of periodicals being published was increasing rapidly during the last years of his life. During the 1820s the average year saw the birth of one hundred and ten new periodicals, and the annual figure increased to one hundred and seventy five in 1831, and again to two hundred and fifty in 1832.¹ One of the features of the period was the new importance of newspapers to literature, as Hogg himself realised. Writing of reviewers in a publication of 1834, he remarked that 'the occupation of the legitimate reviewer is gone, and has devolved entirely on the editors of newspapers; while the old-established reviews are merely a set of essays, such as these Sermons of mine are'.² As reviews in periodicals such as the Edinburgh Review or Quarterly Review only used the book reviewed as a starting-point for an essay on its subject by the reviewer, the business of surveying the whole range of newly-published works tended to devolve upon the weekly literary newspaper. Hogg's alternatives in Edinburgh itself to Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine

² James Hogg, A Series of Lay Sermons on Good Principles and Good Breeding (London, 1834), p.270.
during the last years of his life were, interestingly, variants of this kind of paper. Following the production of the Examiner, a sixteen-page Sunday paper begun by John and Leigh Hunt which gave unusual importance to literature in the 1810s, the weekly journal of belles-lettres assumed a fresh importance. One of the most important and successful of these was the Literary Gazette, begun in 1817 and initially published by Colburn. This paper placed even greater emphasis on literature, making the review section the leading article, and aiming, like the older types of review, to become an almost complete chronological record of published literary works. Its growing importance is shown both in early imitations of it, of which the Literary Chronicle (1819-1829) and the Literary Register (1822-1823) may be mentioned here, and in the reaction of that shrewd literary man William Maginn to an adverse mention of Jerdan, the paper's editor, in the Noctes Ambrosianae. In condemning this Maginn wrote to Blackwood that Jerdan had 'attained more influence over light literature than any man in London, and should rather be conciliated. The Gazette is doubling in circulation, & quarrelling with it is bad policy'.

The first of Hogg's Edinburgh alternatives, the Edinburgh Literary Journal, was partly a weekly paper of the same type as the Literary Gazette, published on Saturdays, and consisting of sixteen pages devoted to the interests of the readers and writers of books,

---


4 William Maginn to Blackwood, 2 September 1824, in National Library of Scotland (hereafter NLS) MS 4012, f.298.
or more fairly of fourteen pages, the last two being taken up with advertisements in general. Its price of sixpence was also comparable to the eightpence of the London journal. The paper also had affinities, however, with older types of periodical familiar to Hogg, and these are perhaps what made it an attractive vehicle for his own work. Firstly, it is reminiscent of the old Scots Magazine of Hogg's early years as a poet in acting as a medium of communication and focus of mutual identity for national and local Scots poets. Here too Hogg could publish verse epistles to his friends, for instance. In this context he naturally took his place as the famous senior to a band of aspiring young Scots poets. A Mr Thomas Dick addressed a song to him in the pages of the journal, and David Tweedie also addressed him in verse on the subject of a previous article written by Hogg himself, though appearing under Tweedie's name. Hogg's social engagements with the Six Feet Club and the St Ronan's Border Games were mentioned in its pages. The publication of two anecdotes concerning Hogg's earlier years also implies his status among the periodical's contributors to be that of a national literary figure, in this sense

5 Hogg's 'Epistle to Mr William Berwick', Edinburgh Literary Journal, 30 May 1829, pp.418-19 is evidently a reply to a poetic communication from 'Your William' to Hogg, 2 March 1829, in NLS MS 2245, f.140.

6 See Thomas Dick, 'The Shepherd Bard.— A Song', in 'The Editor in his Slippers; or, A Peep Behind the Scenes. No. IV', Edinburgh Literary Journal, 19 September 1829, pp.219-27 (p.222); also David Tweedie, 'Lines for the Eye of Mr James Hogg, sometimes termed the Ettrick Shepherd', Edinburgh Literary Journal, 10 April 1830, p.221.

one succeeding to something of the place Burns had held among amateur Scots poets. Hogg must have appreciated this kind of notice very warmly, and it may have affected significantly the number of his poetic contributions to the paper. In printing poems and tales weekly the journal also resembled Hogg's own early periodical *The Spy*, for the *Literary Gazette*, though it had an original poetry section regularly, did not usually print prose fiction, except for lengthy quotation in reviews. The local character of this weekly journal also perhaps resembled that of *The Spy*. If the particular character of the paper was likely to make it attractive to Hogg, the conductor of it, until early in 1831 Henry Glassford Bell, was careful to maintain in its pages an equally attractive tone of personal compliment. Referring to an enquiry from Hogg as to what subject his next communication to the paper should be on, the editor expressed his opinion that 'with the genius he brings to bear upon every subject, we do not think he can go wrong', adding that the only rule he has to suggest to Hogg is that 'the sooner he favours us the better'. The fourth volume of the periodical has for its frontispiece a specially commissioned engraving of the portrait of Hogg by Watson Gordon. The paper carried very favourable reviews of those of Hogg's separately published works produced between 1829 and 1831, and also sometimes made favourable mention of his


9 'To Our Correspondents', Edinburgh Literary Journal, 18 April 1829, p.324.
contributions to those Annuals which were reviewed. On at least one occasion the paper advocated a literary project concerned with Hogg's work which coincided to a remarkable degree with his own plan or scheme, and it seems quite possible that the paper's information may actually have been provided by Hogg himself. Whether this is so or not, however, it remains a proof of the intelligent concern and sympathy of the paper's conductors with regard to Hogg and his situation at this time. This was the journal's startlingly prompt advocacy of a collected edition of Hogg's tales. In May 1829 the Edinburgh Literary Journal, having learned that almost all of the Ettrick Shepherd's works were out of print, advocated 'a strictly corrected and refined cabinet edition of these tales', to be 'published in monthly numbers, neatly embellished, on the plan of the new edition of the Waverley Novels'. According to Hogg it was only 'in the spring of 1829' that he 'first mentioned the plan of the "Altrive Tales" to Mr. Blackwood in a letter' (Memoir, p.60). In a letter to Blackwood of 1828 Hogg merely refers vaguely to a plan for his 'tales in six vols'; his mention in May 1830 of a plan to retrieve his fortunes a little by the

12 The abbreviation Memoir is listed before the text, and will be used throughout this study for James Hogg, Memoir of the Author's Life and Familiar Anecdotes of Sir Walter Scott, edited by Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh and London, 1972). When the second text is referred to the abbreviation Familiar Anecdotes is used.
publication of his tales 'in numbers like Sir W Scott's' may or may not mean that this is the letter referred to in the Memoir, but in either case the early awareness and sympathy of the Edinburgh Literary Journal for his plan are undoubted, and must have been well received. The exceptional congeniality of the paper to Hogg is the important factor in discussing his work for it: he certainly ought to have been impressed by so much flattery and interest, and by the affinity between it and the periodicals of his earlier career. One surviving sign that he was so appears in the pages of the paper, when the editor expresses his satisfaction that the Ettrick Shepherd 'should have written to us these words, — "I'll defy Great Britain to get up as spirited, as amusing, and as diversified, a literary paper as yours!"'.

In fact it seems unlikely that Hogg was paid for his work for the Edinburgh Literary Journal otherwise than by these means. For one thing its circulation was probably quite small: an editorial in the eighteenth number claimed that 'the circulation of every number has considerably exceeded fifteen hundred copies, whilst that of several has extended to upwards of twenty-five hundred'. Mrs Oliphant, in writing of Blackwood's agreement with Pringle and Cleghorn to edit a magazine, says that no special provision was made for the payment of contributors, that the demand for the

13 Hogg to Blackwood, 28 January 1828 and 26 May 1830, in NLS MS 4021, f.273 and NLS MS 4036, f.102 respectively.
14 'The Editor in his Slippers; or, A Peep Behind the Scenes, No. II', Edinburgh Literary Journal, 30 May 1829, pp.408-13 (p.409).
magazine did not seem ever to have risen above two thousand five hundred copies, and that the magazine had never reached the paying point (Annals, I, 99, 106). Yet, in a letter to Hogg written shortly after giving up his connection with the paper, Bell said of the journal, 'It afforded a respectable return from the very first, and was a property of some value when I parted with it' (Memorials, p. 214). The implication of this statement, taken in conjunction with the small circulation of the journal, is that the payment of the contributors was even less of a significant feature than it had been in the arrangements between William Blackwood and his early editors. Robert Chambers, writing to Hogg for his aid with a later venture of his own, said that 'Bell's could pay not a stiver to its contributors', a statement which has some weight since Chambers himself had contributed to the paper. William Blackwood's annoyance that one of his paid contributors should be working gratis for another Edinburgh periodical is expressed in his letters to Hogg from time to time also. For instance, in response to Hogg's information that although he could have got a high price for one of his rejected articles in London he has sent it to Bell for immediate publication, Blackwood replied that if Hogg could

16 The abbreviation Annals is listed before the text, and will be used throughout this study, for Mrs Oliphant, Annals of a Publishing House: William Blackwood and his Sons, their Magazine and Friends, second edition, 2 vols (Edinburgh and London, 1897).
17 The abbreviation Memorials is listed before the text, and will be used throughout this study, for Mrs Garden, Memorials of James Hogg, the Ettrick Shepherd (Paisley and London, n.d.). Mrs Garden dates this letter wrongly as 25 May 1821, when it plainly should be 1831.
18 Robert Chambers to Hogg, 4 October 1832, in NLS MS 2245, f. 214.
indeed have received the price named for the article he would have been sorry to have kept it himself, and far less would have advised him to 'throw it away for nothing'. Extraordinary as it seems in view of Hogg's financial situation the surviving evidence suggests that his numerous contributions to the Edinburgh Literary Journal were understood to be voluntary and unpaid ones.

The reason for this surprising situation has been partly accounted for already, but in addition the ambiguous relationship between the Edinburgh Literary Journal and Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine itself may have played its part. Initially relations between the two were friendly, the prospectus for the weekly paper being pointed out and praised in the widely-read and influential Noctes Ambrosianae of the magazine for November 1828. Many of the chief contributors to the magazine also wrote, if only occasionally, for the journal. One early number boasts of the assistance of Wilson and Lockhart as well as that of Hogg. This may well have influenced Hogg's initial decision to write for the paper, for his career reveals a distinct preference for writing for periodicals which were Tory and to which others of William Blackwood's contributors would write. He could probably have contributed in these years, for example, to the Whiggishly inclined Tait's Edinburgh Magazine had he wished. As Ian A. Gordon has

19 Hogg to Blackwood, 4 January 1830, in NLS MS 4027, f.178; Blackwood to Hogg, 9 January 1830, in NLS Accession (hereafter Acc.) 5643, vol.88, p.484.
shown, John Galt was to publish some of his best shorter work in this periodical after the death of William Blackwood, as well as in *Fraser's Magazine.*

---

22 Hogg, characteristically, seems to have been on friendly terms with William Tait, the publisher; and Mrs Johnstone, the literary moving spirit of the concern, was an admirer of Hogg's work as well as that of Galt. Later she met many of Hogg's friends and acquaintances in the course of her summer visits in his countryside, returning to Edinburgh with something fresh to tell of him, which shows her interest. A previous periodical largely under the influence of Mrs Johnstone had praised Hogg's *A Series of Lay Sermons on Good Principles and Good Breeding* at length, and reprinted his short tale 'Amusing Story of Two Highlanders' from *The Spy* with an admiring note. However, Hogg seems to have contributed nothing to *Tait's Edinburgh Magazine* in these last years of his life.

Relations between Blackwood and the *Edinburgh Literary Journal* seem to have soured a little early in 1829 when, on account of recent unfavourable reviews of his publications, Blackwood refused to send the editor of the journal copies of his newly published works in future for review. The editor of the weekly paper seems to have discovered this on applying for a copy of *The Shepherd's Calendar,* and to have then seen fit to expose the details of the

---

24 This review is in Johnstone's *Edinburgh Magazine,* 1(1833-1834), 534-38; 'The Highlanders and the Boar', *Johnstone's Edinburgh Magazine,* 1(1833-1834), .60.
exchange and Blackwood's motivation publicly. 25 Blackwood could not have been pleased at this, and indeed he later described Bell to Hogg in another context as 'a person with whom I shall take good care never to come into contact'. 26 These relations probably influenced Hogg's own work for the Edinburgh Literary Journal, especially that in fiction. His poetry contributions seem to consist, with the exception of one or two pieces revived from The Spy and earlier collections, largely of work composed for the periodical itself, perhaps written under the warming influence and sense of a circle of young Scots poets in its pages. Perhaps only 'The Dominie' of his poetry in the paper was first offered to and rejected by Blackwood, though it is impossible to be certain. 27 The case is far different with his fiction; at least six of these contributions had been offered previously to Blackwood for his magazine and refused, while Hogg made two attempts at writing his own version of the Noctes Ambrosianae. Hogg wanted to get those tales which Blackwood had left lying on his hands into print even without payment, and he was, on at least one occasion, pleased to demonstrate by means of the weekly paper his independence of the control of Blackwood and the jealous restriction, as he saw it, of John Wilson. An idea had been formulated, probably by Wilson, of having an episode of the Noctes Ambrosianae consist of a flight in a hot-air balloon. Hogg

---

25 'A Few Words Concerning Our Own Affairs', Edinburgh Literary Journal, 14 March 1829, pp. 241-43 (pp. 242-43).
27 'The Dominie', Edinburgh Literary Journal, 26 March 1831, p. 199; Blackwood had returned this to Hogg with a letter of 26 February 1831, in NLS Acc. 5643, vol. 89, pp. 154-56.
had liked the plan, written such a paper himself, and sent it to Blackwood for insertion in the magazine. When his paper was rejected on the grounds that Wilson had wished it to be kept back so that it did not interfere with a favourite idea of his own, Hogg was understandably hurt and angry; he retorted, accurately as it turned out, that Wilson never would write such an article, and that he had transferred his own paper to Bell 'to be published next week', so that 'it shall appear before any other aerial tour at any rate'. The paper in question was indeed published as quickly as possible by Bell.28 Apart from helping Hogg in his demonstration against Blackwood and his literary friends, though, the receptiveness of the Edinburgh Literary Journal to Hogg's fiction allowed him a more purely literary freedom. It is doubtful whether Bell truly appreciated these prose tales, or whether he merely realised that he was lucky to be able to have the unpaid services of a well-known Scottish literary man, and gratefully received whatever Hogg chose to send him, good or bad, for the sake of his name. His necessarily laudatory remarks made years later on the occasion of the inauguration of Hogg's monument combined praise of Hogg's tales with the important assertion that 'it was not as a prose writer, however, but as a national poet, that Hogg chiefly excelled'.29 Be that as it may, Hogg's object was achieved and his confidence

28 This account is from letters — Hogg to Blackwood, 4 January 1830, in NLS MS 4027, f.178, and Blackwood to Hogg, 27 March 1830, in NLS Acc. 5643, vol.88, pp.555-56; 'Dr David Dale's Account of a Grand Aerial Voyage', Edinburgh Literary Journal, 22 January 1830, pp.50-54.

29 Quoted from Charles Rogers, Ettrick Forest, The Ettrick Shepherd and his Monument (Edinburgh, 1860), p.13.
presumably supported by it.

Hogg firstly used this receptiveness to add to and to direct the paper's presentation of him as a literary personality. He figures in a part of his contributions as a teller of amusing anecdotes, entertaining the reader with his own personal experience as well as with the tales he has heard from others in the course of that experience. 30 He also engages in the presentation of his own literary personality to the reader in several more lengthy contributions which alter and adapt the persona of the Shepherd of the Noctes Ambrosianae of Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine. It is the poeticising side of the Shepherd which largely disappears from the portrait. In 'Noctes Bengerianae. No. II', for instance, the Shepherd plays the part of the short-hand recorder, noting down the conversation of the maids and men of the Mount Benger farm as the speeches of the Shepherd himself were supposedly written down by Gurney. His personal appearance at the end of the piece is as a bluff, Scots-speaking farmer, who promises 'a good fairing' from himself and the editor of the paper to whichever of the speakers tells the best tale next week. 31 In the first 'Noctes Bengerianae' the Shepherd was also portrayed as a humorous, bluff countryman going about his farm. The article had taken the form of a letter written to the editor of the paper to relate a visit paid him by a strange and eccentric being, and their conversation together. Here

the whimsicality of the mysterious wanderer, Lord Archibald, is set against the rough, good-humoured common sense of the Shepherd, whose humorous Scots remarks deflate the extravagant rhetoric of the stranger. In one of his rhapsodies, for instance, Lord Archibald melodramatically refers to himself as a madman in contrasting his present state and sufferings with his past position, and is at once undercut by the Shepherd's kindly request to him to moderate his vehemence, supported as this is by the naive remark, 'Ye're no just a madman, Gude be thankit, but only a wee thing crazed in the head; an' I'm really sorry for't.....' The Shepherd goes on to ask the stranger to tell him his love adventures, as he is 'mad fond' of those sort of tales.  

This Shepherd is a kindly and tolerant personage, eager to find amusement in the absurd and in the strange and to communicate his enjoyment to the reader, even at his own expense. In 'Dr David Dale's Account of a Grand Aerial Voyage' a similar contrast is made between the tolerant sanity of the Shepherd himself, and the eccentricity of Dale who invents an incredible, rhapsodic account of his adventures with an imaginary Ettrick Shepherd.  

The homely plain sense of the Shepherd is contrasted here, as elsewhere, with madness, eccentricity, and the grotesque, whereas in the Noctes Ambrosianae itself it is the Shepherd who represents poetical and social extravagance.

The idea of the Ettrick Shepherd created by Hogg upon the

33 'Dr David Dale's Account of a Grand Aerial Voyage', Edinburgh Literary Journal, 22 January 1830, pp.50-54.
willingness of the **Edinburgh Literary Journal** to treat him as a national literary figure and a personality was useful to Hogg in publishing his fiction in the journal, especially that dealing with the eccentric, the grotesque, and the magical. The avidity of the Shepherd for pure entertainment and his enthusiasm for strange characters and extravagant relations would amply cover the telling of these tales, while his evident homely sense reinforced the reader's faith in the narrator, if not in the tales. The tales in the paper which come under this description were mostly offered first to William Blackwood and refused by him; however, they found their appropriate medium of transmission in this paper and so, in a sense, belong there and are a part of its atmosphere. 34

‘Wat the Prophet’ is a carefully and even delicately accomplished character study of a noted local eccentric, a visionary who believed that he conversed with the martyr Stephen and that he had been divinely gifted with the spirit of prophecy. As with some of the tales of ‘The Shepherd’s Calendar’, the narrator indicates that what he has to relate is not from personal knowledge but an interpretation of the surviving evidences of documents and of the recollection of friends. He frequently draws attention to his consequent shortcomings and marks the limitations of his knowledge; for example, he says that 'there is no doubt that this is a confused

---

account of the prophet's sublime vision, it being from second hands that I had it; and, for one thing, I know that one-half of his relation is not contained in it. For the consequences I can avouch.35 Thus the reader's confidence in the narrator is strengthened, even while his description of the vision as 'sublime' allows him to relate the prophet's experience in a sympathetic and inward fashion, bringing out both its curiosity and its relation to acceptedly normal human values. The narrator, for example, points out the way in which the prophet's sayings are couched in Biblical language (p.210), and part of the sympathy of his account is to do this himself too. When he relates how the vision changed his subject's way of life, for example, he says that 'he mixed no more with the men of the world, but wandered about in wilds and solitudes' (p.209). In describing Wat in terms of the Old Testament prophets whose successor he believed himself to be, the narrator both explains his motivation and pays a delicate deference to his opinions. Besides bringing out the leading feature of his subject's eccentricity sympathetically by means of his language, the narrator is also helped by the old-fashioned past countryside setting of his tale. The folk who met Wat were often impressed by his simple solemnity and belief in what he asserted and were partly willing to be convinced of the truth of his prophecies, even though they were

35 'Wat the Prophet', Edinburgh Literary Journal, 12 September 1829, pp.207-10 (p.209). References to tales in a periodical will be given in full the first time a reference is made, while thereafter, in continuous discussion of the same tale, the page number in the periodical will be given in parentheses within the text.
sceptical enough of some part of his belief, such as his idea that he would not taste of death like other men (pp. 209, 210). Indeed the prophet’s vision itself is partly a commentary on the conflict in a changing Border society between a cold rationality and the belief which fosters imaginative beauty, for the martyr himself remarks that 'worldly wisdom is all and all with the men of this age', and that 'the gift of prophecy is denied and laughed at; and all revelation made to man by dreams or visions utterly disclaimed' (p. 208).

Wat’s choice of belief is reflected in the narrator’s method of relating it, both stressing the enrichment of the imaginative and extra-rational world. The narrator, however, carefully rounds out his portrait with details of the social as well as spiritual life of Wat, stressing his kindly and inoffensive disposition in his care of his fat little pony, his gifts of fish to the poor people, and his excellence at work or in study (pp. 209, 207-08). He takes account of the social and the rationalistic view, while allowing the imaginative power of the spiritual to inform his account and render it a fully sympathetic analysis.

The next piece of work in the journal in this category of the eccentric and grotesque is something between a character analysis and a review of an 1830 Blackwood publication in two volumes, The Life of Alexander Alexander, written by himself and edited by John Howell. The work had been reviewed more conventionally in the paper some months before Hogg’s article appeared.36 ‘Some Remarks on the Life of Sandy Elshinder’ was avowedly written with the

purpose of conciliating the author's father, but in fact Hogg was
plainly attracted to the work by the out-of-the-way character of the
author himself, and the variety of his adventures, which caused Hogg
to write that 'when it gets among the common people, it will be read
with as much avidity as Robinson Crusoe or the Pilgrim's Progress'.37
Hogg's narrator enjoys the strange perversion of mind which made the
author, sitting on an ass in a pool in the middle of a thunderstorm,
conceive that 'he was dead, and that his soul, for his stupidity,
was condemned to sit on the back of that cuddy till the day of
judgment!' (p.282). As vivid as the description is the picture of
the narrator himself enjoying it, laughing 'till the tears ran down
on the spectacles' (p.281).

In 'A Story of the Black Art', though Hogg exercises his usual
cautions in avoiding statements which would directly lead the reader
to assume his own unquestioning belief in the supernatural, the
reader is more frankly invited to revel in the magical and in the
grotesque. The opening sentence of the tale suggests the formality
of the fairy tale, with its simply and modestly stated patterns and
its initial vagueness of period. The tale opens in a timeless
sphere, with the words 'there was once a beautiful lady in the
north of Scotland, whose beauty exceeded that of all others',38
and this is combined with a scarcely more specific sense that the
narrator is claiming to tell real events about historical persons,

37 'Some Remarks on the Life of Sandy Elshinder ', Edinburgh
Literary Journal, 30 October 1830, pp.280-82 (p.282).
38 'A Story of the Black Art', Edinburgh Literary Journal,
25 December 1830, pp.396-99 and 1 January 1831, pp.10-12
(p.396).
changing their names and not providing any concrete historical background. After asserting the real existence of the lady, for example, Hogg says that he will call her Lady Elizabeth 'for the present' (p. 396). He claims to know the family names of the noblemen concerned in the tale, but chooses to keep these back and mention them only by their Christian names, since, though his supposedly traditional account is, he believes, 'founded on truth, and the greater part of the incidents literally true', yet they may not be so (p. 396). Although Hogg wishes to say that he believes the tale to have an original historical reality, he does not insist upon it. It is the tale itself, with its evocative and timeless magical setting that is of first importance. This mood recalls that of Hogg's earlier three-volume novel of magic and Border warfare, and in that context it has been analysed succinctly by Gifford.39 To the same end Hogg is equivocal about the origins of the power possessed by the lady Elizabeth. Offering the reader a choice of analyses as to 'whether the lady Elizabeth had the power of ventriloquism ... and the art to disguise her person and voice so completely as to personify any acquaintance, or whether she had a familiar spirit who appeared at her command, in the persons of these acquaintances' (p. 398), Hogg asks only that her power of personification itself is accepted. It is the story itself that is to interest, and either of the explanations is there solely to gain the reader's formal assent to it. The tale falls naturally into

the two parts of its appearance in the paper, the first comic and the
second curiously wistful in tone. The first concerns the comic
discomfiture of the rude captain Johnnie Lesley by lady Elizabeth
and his wife Jenny Elphingston, for Jenny's freedom to wait upon her
mistress without the restraint of minding her husband's affairs and
in revenge for Johnnie's light words about his wife's virtue. At
every turn and in every place Johnnie is confronted with the
reproachful figure of his wife, Jenny, until in ludicrous
desperation he offers the somewhat ambiguous explanation to his
comrades that 'it is na ane weef, nor twae weefs, that I hae, but I
hae a weef in ilk ane house I dit the deir of' (p. 398). Jenny then
has public support in her refusal to live with such a wicked and
licentious man, while he thinks better of explaining his real
meaning at the risk of being meddled with further by a being of
apparently evil and supernatural powers. The second part involves
the successful plot of the lady Elizabeth to gain a powerful
Catholic nobleman for her husband. By working on his superstitious
and imaginative temperament by means of her collusion with Jenny,
as well as by her own high beauty and accomplishments, the lady
Elizabeth creates in Earl George an obsession with her form and
personality reminiscent of that of the Laird of Birkendelly in
'The Mysterious Bride', or perhaps even more of that of the hero of
'The Renowned Adventures of Basil Lee'. 40 The obsession is
expressed in the magical terms of the first of these tales: the

40 These tales may be found in James Hogg, Tales and Sketches,
6 vols (Glasgow, 1837), IV, 335-52 and III, 49-131
respectively.
beautiful maiden, dressed in green, suddenly meets a man out of doors and engages him in conversation, disappearing after she has exchanged vows with him and given him a piece of jewellery as a love-token. Like the second of these tales, however, the obsession turns out for the good and not the harm of the man, and it contains a scene where he, because of his preconceptions, fails to recognise his beloved when she is actually before him. Earl George is called out from his mournful wedding feast to see 'his lovely countess, standing in the same green habit and green veil in which he had first beheld her' (p. 12). He returns with her into the chamber and renounces his bride for her sake, only to discover his own ring on her finger. Common to both the comic and the love episodes of 'A Story of the Black Art' is the sturdy personality of Hogg's narrator, who in the expectation of the reader of the Edinburgh Literary Journal is already endowed with an eager interest in tale and anecdote and with a curiosity after the eccentric, the odd, the humoursome, and the exotic together, while being himself an acceptably homely, rational, and mentally robust personality. Hogg in this spirit ended his tale by reminding the reader of this story-telling personality, only apparently gullible yet still warmly enthusiastic, with a vague promise for his future entertainment. The 'many other curious stories' about the two women 'being quite distinct from this, can be told by themselves at any time'. This promise is united with a suggestive reminder of the quality of his interest in the magical and with an allurement, when he says that it appears the two 'when combined, could almost have effected any thing, which all the country weaned to have been done by the black art' (p. 12). Treated flatteringly as a national literary figure
of significance in this Edinburgh weekly paper, Hogg was enabled to create a story-telling figure in its permissive atmosphere. His use of this figure and the unusual fact of the journal's conductors being dependent upon him rather than he upon their payments, allowed him to print an interesting portion of his fiction, which was rejected by his usual Edinburgh outlet as unsuitably extravagant.

Hogg's second alternative in Edinburgh during his later years was also a weekly paper, though of a different type. With Chambers's Edinburgh Journal too, Hogg's personal connections seem to have influenced his becoming a contributor. Robert Chambers seems to have known Hogg since around 1823, when he was collecting and preparing his Traditions of Edinburgh, although the older brother, William Chambers, first met Hogg as late as 1831. The brothers came originally from Peebles, and Robert had recommended Tibbie Shiel's inn to the public in 1827, which shows his intimate knowledge of Hogg's countryside at a later date. Robert Chambers had also been friendly with Hogg's favourite nephew and literary assistant Robert since the two had been at school, and Robert Hogg himself contributed some pieces to the venture. Lastly, Robert Chambers as well as Hogg himself had contributed frequently to the Edinburgh Literary Journal, so that the two men had a fairly

accurate, though probably not an intimate, working knowledge of each other. When Robert Chambers wrote to Hogg in October 1832 to solicit his aid for the new periodical he may not fully have realised that he was at the beginning of a new phase of popular periodical literature. The movement of the late 1820s towards cheaper books, analysed and described briefly and succinctly by Altick, naturally soon spread into the market for periodicals. Chambers's Edinburgh Journal, at three-halfpence for eight pages, was a cheap weekly paper that aimed at the comparative novelty of high respectability, and consequently could be distributed through the normal literary, shop-keeping channels without difficulty. Its price compared favourably with that of the preceding weekly papers, such as the sixpence of the Edinburgh Literary Journal or even the fourpence of The Spy. Little wonder then that in his letter to Hogg written about eight months after the first number had been published on 4 February 1832 Robert Chambers could boast of a sale of 'from twenty to thirty thousand copies in Scotland and about the same quantity in England'. Hogg was invited to write tales for this thriving new publication, and was offered initially two guineas for each one. Evidence for the actual payments he received is scanty, for there is no regular correspondence with this publisher preserved as there is with William Blackwood, but Hogg was certainly paid only the price named for his tale 'The Watchmaker'.

45 Robert Chambers to Hogg, 4 October 1832, in NLS MS 2245, ff. 214-15.
which consists of about three thousand five hundred words. This may usefully be compared perhaps to the Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine rate of payment offered to Hogg of ten guineas per sheet, a sheet of the magazine consisting of about twelve thousand eight hundred and eighty words of Hogg's fiction. For each guinea paid to Hogg for his fiction Chambers's Edinburgh Journal would on this reckoning expect some one thousand seven hundred and fifty words and the magazine only some one thousand two hundred and eighty-eight. Thus the proffered payment would appear to be a reasonable and fair one, perhaps a little lower than Hogg would have expected from William Blackwood. On the other hand the circulation of the journal at the end of 1832 was probably as high as fifty thousand copies, whereas that of Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine at the end of the previous year has been estimated at something over a mere eight thousand copies. Miss Mitford, another reputable and reasonably well-known writer for the periodicals, thought it worthwhile to write for the journal herself in 1835 and spoke of it as excellent, although she seemed to think it remarkable that a cheap paper could afford her services. Despite her willingness to contribute, however, and its circulation, enormously large by the standards of

47 See Chapter Three, pages 112 to 113.
49 Mitford to Miss Jephson, 3 September 1835, in The Life of Mary Russell Mitford, Related in a Selection from her Letters to her Friends, edited by Rev. A. G. L'Estrange, 3 vols (London, 1870), III, 33.
that day, *Chambers's Edinburgh Journal* was probably a far less prestigious paper to write for than any of the well-known monthly magazines. This was no doubt partly due to the eternal belief of the snob that the inexpensive and popular must necessarily be inferior to the costly and the rare. However, it may also have been a result of the nature of the cheap paper in the preceding age: apart from the horrors of a debased and scandalous fiction and the similar accounts of dreadful crimes and confessions, the cheap papers had included hotly radical politics. It was this sort of 'cheap and offensive' publication that prompted Knight's initial idea for the *Penny Magazine* by his own account, those 'unstamped weekly publications, which in some degree came under the character of contraband newspapers, and were nearly all dangerous in principle and coarse in language'.

It can hardly be coincidence that both the *Penny Magazine* and *Chambers's Edinburgh Journal* were first published in the year of the Reform Bill, with its intense atmosphere of political contention. The newer cheap papers doubtless retained something of the flavour of this odium in the eyes of conservatives. This may be behind the discussion in the *Noctes Ambrosianae* of November 1832, for instance, where North and Tickler express the view that the working man had better pay his weekly penny to a friendly society, or rather spend it on home comforts, than indulge in the useless expense of a cheap paper.

---


Even apart from this legacy of mistrust inherited by the newer cheap papers, however, there are reasons why the writer of imaginative literature might have found them uncongenial markets for his work. In several respects indeed the tone of the new papers was markedly unfavourable to such work. A monthly magazine was for the recreation of the gentleman primarily, but these papers were intended in the first place to be instructive, to impart a smattering of culture to the lower orders. *Chambers's Edinburgh Journal* was frankly a commercial venture, not linked to any society as the *Penny Magazine* was to the Society for the Diffusion of Useful Knowledge, but the brothers took the responsibility of their low price extremely seriously. While the *Penny Magazine* contained no fiction, the brothers did make provision for a weekly story, but the initial editorial address to the public stated plainly that 'the grand leading principle by which I have been actuated, is to take advantage of the universal appetite for instruction which at present exists; to supply to that appetite food of the best kind ....' 52 That prose seemed to them more amenable to this purpose than poetry is suggested strongly by the fact that, given Hogg's contemporary reputation as primarily a poet and song-writer, he was asked specifically for tales for the new publication. 53

The reputation of the new cheap papers for entertainment has been rather low. The contemporary novelist Edward Lytton Bulwer amusingly remarked that the operative found the *Penny Magazine*

---


53 See note 45.
amusing because he was not engaged in a career of indolence, but that 'to the rich man it is the most wearisome of periodicals'.

Millar, in his literary history of the early years of this century, remarked of Chambers's Edinburgh Journal that 'for many years the journal had little more than a bowing acquaintance with literature in the higher sense of the term'.

An early number of the paper implies that the element of lighter literature was necessary to the commercial success of the paper rather than being highly valued in itself. It declared that Mr Chambers 'would be happy, for his own part, to make the work exclusively of a useful cast, but he fears that what might be added to its solidity would detract from its circulation, and, consequently, lessen its real usefulness'. The 'frivolous matters of lighter literature' were there to serve an end as the wings of certain seeds were useful to scatter them abroad. Fiction and the anecdotal were more especially pointed at in this special pleading when it was asserted that 'the reader may be led through the portico of a droll anecdote into the solemn temple of religion, or the groves of the academy'.

In a subsequent article the audience for this material were obviously viewed as the lowest element of the paper's readership in the statement that 'common minds are in the first place attracted by the stories and paragraphs which more refined understandings will generally pass over with a

In all this there is no idea that the imagination is anything more than a convenience for catching at the dormant rational powers of the reader. There may be, however, significant qualifications to be made with regard to this avowed attitude of Chambers's Edinburgh Journal. Firstly, it may well have been necessary that the paper should adopt a defensive tone over its inclusion of such material. There are indications of attacks upon the journal by the serious-minded for not being sufficiently earnest. Chambers mentioned that for a period of about twenty years after its inception it was subject to a persecution because its character was not overtly religious, and the same thing had happened to Miller's Cheap Magazine about twenty years before. A respectable cheap paper was evidently expected by some to help to settle society by strenuously advocating the cause of the Christian religion, and by this means openly to dissociate itself from the dangerous radical press. Secondly, Chambers, admittedly writing many years after the inception of the journal, claimed a motive in beginning it distinct from those of either amusement or useful, rational instruction. This purpose was a domestic one, making the paper, he thought, especially suitable for families, 'to touch the heart — to purify the affections'. He says that the desire of the editors 'it will be perceived, was to cultivate the feelings as much

---

as the understanding. Hence the endeavour to revive, in a style befitting the age, the essay system of the last century'. 59 This was not entirely a retrospective claim, for a note in one paper of 1834 also declared that one of the objects of the work was an adaptation of the old essay-system to the present age, though without detailing the purpose of this. 60 Once again a new outlet for Hogg's fiction is seen to have common ground with his early venture of The Spy. Many of these essays in the paper actually refer, however, to the correct practical and social running of a lower middle class family establishment, by at times humorously commenting on the defects of imaginary households' entertainments and dinners, management of servants, payment of formal calls, and so on. Despite the appeal to the shades of Addison and Steele it is fair to say that in general the recognised function of imaginative fiction in the paper was not especially dignified or prestigious. It remains to be seen how Hogg's fiction in particular was affected by this medium.

In an early number of Chambers's Edinburgh Journal, written before Hogg was asked to contribute to the paper, Robert Chambers gave his opinion of Hogg's talents and his works. In mentioning Hogg's scheme for a collected edition of his prose tales, he wrote of 'the amusing nature of these stories, disfigured though they be by numberless instances of false taste, and the most glaring

improbability', yet thought that such a collection would certainly be popular.61 Careful directions were given to Hogg for writing acceptable fiction for the paper, but not to him alone apparently, since it was claimed that the paper's original articles were either prepared by the editors themselves 'or under their direction, and expressly designed and fashioned' for appearing in the journal's pages.62 This, however, does not necessarily controvert the view that the directions to Hogg were very detailed on account of his reputed lapses from their standards in taste and subject matter. Some specimens of the journal were sent to Hogg with this invitation, and Chambers's own contributions to these were suggested as possible models for him. The sort of tale that was required was described as 'a rural tale or so, constructed as much as possible with a moral or useful object, and chiming in with the tone of our work'.63 It was unfortunate that the tone of the work was opposed categorically to a subject which informs one of the richest and most important areas of Hogg's work in fiction, that is, superstition, embracing the supernatural, the demonic, and the otherworldly. The policy of the journal was to exclude 'every thing that tends to keep alive the recollection of the superstitions, savagery, and darker vices of the past'.64 This is

61 [Robert Chambers], 'Popular Information on Literature. Second Article', Chambers's Edinburgh Journal, 19 May 1832, p.122, claimed by this author in a letter to Hogg, 4 October 1832, in NLS MS 2245, f.215.
63 See note 45.
illustrated in an article in the paper on Sir Michael Scott, which compares the historical personage with the magical figure of tradition, in order to observe 'the strange liberties which ignorance in the first place, and finally popular report, are apt to take, through a series of unenlightened ages, with those whose pursuits are at once above the comprehension of the public mind, and patent to its observation'. In other words, the article seeks to dispel the darkness of the tradition — a tradition of which Hogg had made so much in his The Three Perils of Man; or, War, Women; and Witchcraft. A Border Romance (1822). Denied the supernatural Hogg tended to fall back in his writings for the paper to the position of the enlightened observer, reminiscent of his early prose articles for the old Scots Magazine. 'Nature's Magic Lantern' is perhaps the most suitable example of this approach, where the narrator drops quickly from the humorous and colloquial relation of his earlier personal experiences of apparitions to an antiquarian and scientific method and use of language. There are, indeed, clear signs of loss of confidence in this sketch. The relation of his unusual experiences with his own reflections upon it are usually sufficient for both Hogg and his reader, but in this atmosphere he feels he has to verify his own experience by copying out from a note-book accounts of the similar experiences of others. For instance, after relating his vision of a horde of cattle, Hogg adds, 'In justification of myself, I must here copy two or three

sentences from my note-book; but from whence taken, I do not know'. His mistrust of his usual approach is revealed in the assertion that he was 'always so fond of those romantic and visionary subjects' that he has 'added thousands of lies to them', with his consequent attempt to make the reader trust him by declaring that in this case he will not deviate even one word from the narrative of the original writer, his authority. His conclusion, in which he talks about his own and the separately recorded experience of strange sights, is strangely pompous and stiff in its attempt to be rationalistic, with phrases like 'by some singular operation of natural causes thus expressively imaged on the acclivities of the mountains'.66 This comes down to a mere assertion that Hogg wishes to believe in the accidental and natural explanation of all these appearances: his interest so obviously lies in reality in their strangeness, and in the psychological effect they have on the person who experiences them, and not in the scientific explanation. This lack of interest is reflected in the clumsiness of his language.

Hogg sent the paper at least one rural tale, as requested, constructed as much as possible with a moral or useful object, entitled 'The Watchmaker'. The tale is apparently designed to caution young girls against the dangerous folly of marrying a confirmed drunkard by relating the sad experience of Peg Ketchen, a lively and shrewd Border lass, who marries the drunken watchmaker against her better judgement and is brought down to poverty and

unhappiness by his careless intemperance. Other papers pointing out directly or indirectly the evil consequences of intemperance to the working man appeared from time to time in the paper, and one article was even entitled 'The Drunkard Reformed'. There may well have been some agreement between the modern view of the Chambers brothers and the more traditional one of the old Ettrick community of Hogg's childhood with respect to intemperance. Neither advocated total abstinence from alcohol, but the one regarded intemperance as an obstacle to the moral and intellectual self-improvement of the working man, and the other was that of a society which valued industry and thrift, and had been shaped in the past by an old-fashioned even puritanical Presbyterianism that regarded all excessive self-indulgence as sinful. Robert Chambers's amused comments on Hogg's tale, however, show that in spite of the plainly expressed moral point to the story the real centre of the author's and reader's interest did not lie there:

It is really a droll sketch, and you have given it a somewhat moral turn at the end, though I fear your humorous [sic] genius is apt to make rather a wry face when attempting anything of that kind, and is disposed to put its tongue waggishly in one cheek, while attempting to look very serious with the other. I hope, by the bye, the article is not so personal as to give offence to any living character.

Even apart from the compliment to Hogg's power of characterisation implied in the doubt expressed at the end of the passage, the tone

68 Chambers to Hogg, 17 May 1833, in NLS MS 2245, f.220.
is tolerant and appreciative, and the article was inserted in the paper. Chambers is correct in referring to Hogg's genius in the tale as a humorous one, slyly grimacing at the moral attached. Even in the conclusion to the tale, where the moral is obtruded most plainly, Hogg is forced to admit to having 'mixed two characters together in these genuine and true sketches', and indeed except at the beginning and end of them attention is focused on the drunken watchmaker himself far more than on the plight of his wife, who does not even appear in most of the scenes. The tale really concerns the sly trickster Davie and the shifts and deceits he is put to to obtain drink for himself and his drouthy cronies. He cheats the butcher out of a shoulder of mutton for the money for drink in one episode, and deceives an innkeeper into giving him credit in another, but the most profitable of his deceptions is to board himself out at the house of a wealthy old man as the Colonel Maxwell wanting comfortable accommodation (and plenty to drink) during the shooting season. Given the underlying nature of the tale it is remarkable that the paper printed it, especially as in a later number it was stated that, among other things, 'the drolleries of ordinary bacchanalian fellowship, we regard as objectionable, as tending to foster only the lower propensities of our nature'. Hogg made other attempts to mould his work to fit the prevailing ethos of the paper, but in general these were not

---

successful. For instance, the paper contained a number of essays on moral and social questions, some of them written by Robert Chambers and including a characterisation of his own wife as Mrs Balderston, the middle-class lady of the household described in a number of them. It was doubtless in emulation of such articles that Hogg sent the paper a portion of a long lay sermon he was writing 'on the common Courtesies and civilities of life'. This was not even printed in the paper. The concern of the paper with emigration, especially in its first years with describing the situation and prospects of the emigrant to North America, may perhaps have prompted Hogg to send in an article of his own entitled 'Emigration'. This was something between a representative sketch and a personal opinion of the phenomenon: besides telling a tale of how an old packman charitably paid the fares of an emigrating Borderer's older sons so that they could go with him and help him to clear his farm, it emphasises the sorrow of the emigrants in parting with their friends and their native country, and gives the writer's observations on the current emigration from Scotland. The farewell to the old country is made more of than the prospect of advantages in the new one, and this was sufficiently unlike the tenor of the other articles on the general topic in the paper for there to be an editorial note appended to Hogg's article stating that 'though the prejudice of place should never interfere to a great extent with the prospects which an individual may have of bettering

himself by emigration, it cannot be denied that there is a sentiment of a sacred ... kind, in one's attachment to his native country'.

Hogg writes primarily as a Borderer, briefly mentioning and dismissing the question of emigration from the Highlands. His concern is that 'the whole of our most valuable peasantry and operative manufacturers are leaving us', and he deplores the loss of 'the brave and intelligent Borderers', giving numbers of emigrants from Hawick and Galashiels, and regretting the loss of members of his own family. In the 'Letter from Canada to the Ettrick Shepherd' Hogg tries to exploit a subject of topical interest in the paper, and to turn it to the service of fantasy and the comically improbable. The supposed writer of the letter is a young doctor, who gives his friend the Shepherd a long account of his bringing back to life first an Irishman and then part of a tribe of native Indians who had lain torpid under the snow. Hogg's tale is sufficiently improbable in itself, and told in such ludicrously exaggerated terms, that not even the most simple-minded reader, one might think, could possibly take it as a literal relation of events at Goderich. For instance, the narrator in his search for the buried tribe sails down a river called the Liars, commenting that Hogg will doubtless think this a very appropriate name. When he revives some of the natives they regard him as the ogre of the fairy tale, 'as an enormous giant, come to eat them all up'.

a note of warning was published with the tale. This also claimed that the tale 'may be shrewdly suspected as a satire on the extravagant desire for dissection which animates the modern school of surgery' (p.383). Perhaps it may, but it is certainly a piece of playful grotesquerie founded on the paper's own fondness for details of Canadian life and adventure. The note shows a distinct failure in appreciation of this side of Hogg's work.

*Chambers's Edinburgh Journal* also included topographical and travel articles, like the old *Scots Magazine*, and Hogg again took up his pen to write along these lines. His 'Adventure of the Ettrick Shepherd' is partly a relation of his past attempt to explore to the sources of the river Dee, and his experience is used as a corrective to other articles describing the same scenes in the paper. For instance, as he describes the chief of the two streams of the Dee, Hogg comments, 'You say the hills are some miles asunder, but in the Garchary, which is at least five miles in length, they are in many places not above a bow-shot asunder'. The article falls too easily into mere enumeration and description, varied far less by anecdote and incident than the title would seem to promise. It resembles Hogg's first published travels in the Highlands, but with perhaps less freshness, less of the feel of the local personality viewing the differing scene before him. Linked to

75 Compare 'A Journey through the Highlands of Scotland, in the months of July and August 1802', *Scots Magazine*, 64(1802), 813-18, 956-63, 65(1803), 89-95, 251-54, 312-14, 382-86 (pp.94-95).
the theme of the description of Highland scenery is that of Highland manners, and in 'An Old Minister's Tale' this is combined with a story in which circumstantial evidence is used to convict a man of the murder of his friend: only on the day of execution is he proved to be innocent, and saved. The role and use of circumstantial evidence was another interest of the paper, incidentally. William Sawn M'Nicol, for example, is both the comic Highlander of numerous anecdotes, and a source of information for the reader on Highland expressions and characteristic ways of thinking, as the principal witness in the trial scene. When he defines very near as 'not above two or three miles' his examiner, presumably a townsman, remarks that he would call that a great distance; M'Nicol says that this is not so in the Highlands, and adds that if the parties had been closer they would have been together. This is comically expressed, but points out an essential difference between the density of population in a town and in the rural Highlands in the very use of a common language.

As a cheap periodical Chambers's Edinburgh Journal might also be supposed an unfavourable outlet for a proportion of Hogg's fiction because of the comparative strictness of its censorship. There were 'numberless topics and expressions which the conductors of hardly any other periodical work would think objectionable' which nevertheless were so in this context. The conductors declared, 'we hardly ever receive a contribution from the most practised writers, 

---

which does not require purification before we deem it fit for insertion'. 77 As few manuscripts of Hogg's tales survive, the most clear indication of this censorship lies in comparing the texts of two of his articles in Chambers's Edinburgh Journal with earlier versions previously published in the Edinburgh Literary Journal. In the case of 'Anecdotes of Highlanders', several of the stories were omitted altogether, and fresh ones introduced from other sources. 78 The alterations to 'A Story of the Forty-Six', apart from one or two stylistic improvements, consist of the removal of a comic reference to the pursuit of a couple of dragoons by a kilted Highlander on horseback, he riding 'rather awkwardly, with his bare thighs upon the saddle' in the original, and merely 'very awkwardly, as might be supposed' in the version in this paper. Presumably the mention of thighs made the passage indecorous and vulgar. A comment by the English officer which reveals that he thought the ladies' outraged screams might have been the result of a sexual attack was also deleted in this version. 79 It is only possible to conjecture what alterations were made for the sake of propriety in those of Hogg's tales in the paper which do not exist for comparison in any earlier state.

If the limitations of Chambers's Edinburgh Journal are

79 Compare 'A Story of the Forty-Six', Chambers's Edinburgh Journal, 10 May 1834, p.118 with the text in Edinburgh Literary Journal, 26 December 1829, pp.421-22 (pp.422, 421).
considered, with respect to fiction in general and to Hogg's tales in particular, it no longer seems surprising that so little of his work was printed there in spite of the brothers' willingness to pay him adequately for his contributions. Nor should the generally inferior standard of those contributions be necessarily taken as a sign of Hogg's failing powers in the final years of his life; on the contrary, if his contributions are examined in the context of the periodical it becomes evident that he was quickly resourceful in adopting its characteristic tones and topics in his work. The truth is merely that the ethos of the paper was too antithetical to the outlook upon which he based his tales, and that even the ingenuity and resourcefulness Hogg had developed in his long years of writing for the periodicals were inadequate to the task of reconciling the two.

In all then Hogg's Edinburgh alternatives to Blackwood's *Edinburgh Magazine* as outlets for his fiction in these last years were far from satisfactory. He found the context of the first weekly paper suitable and stimulating, but received no desperately needed monetary payment for his contributions to it. The second would and did pay him adequately, but was an uncongenial context for his work. It is interesting to note that in this admittedly limited connection it is the less popular paper that seems to have been the one preferred by Hogg; more of his tales were printed in the weekly paper of a more restricted circulation, higher selling price, and more localised character. The *Edinburgh Literary Journal* was simply a more old-fashioned paper, and this seemed agreeable to Hogg. As he was a writer of comparatively low social origins this may seem curious, but as a man and an author
for whom the imaginative and visionary power was a vital distinction of the human soul he was naturally opposed to that popularising spirit of his later years which seemed at times only to acknowledge the rational or useful intellect in man. In addition, it may be doubted whether he ever understood the economics of the cheap literature movement. In grumbling to Lockhart in 1833 about his precarious financial position, Hogg added that 'these cheap publications have rendered legitimate literature not worth a sixpence'. The same letter relates his perplexity about the offer made to him for his collected tales by 'a Glasgow subscribing Co.', who, according to Hogg, calculated that they could sell twenty thousand copies of his twelve volume tales in numbers, but offered him only one twelfth of the retail price. Hogg had planned a collected edition of his tales in imitation of that of Scott, which at five shillings a volume had been selling so well that only thirteen days after the publication of the first novel, Waverley, in this format Cadell raised the number of the printing to twenty thousand copies. Hogg too wished to take advantage of the changing conditions which meant that publishers were now prepared, after the abnormally high price of new books during the previous decade, to make enlarged returns compensate them for diminished profits. Under the older methods the author would expect to receive a high proportion of the profits of a small edition for his labour, and in these circumstances Scott apparently had advised

80 Hogg to Lockhart, 17 September 1833, in NLS MS 934, no. 104.
Hogg 'long ago ... that if the edition were above 2000 and sold the author's moiety of the profits always amounted to nearly one fifth but if the impression was below that to one sixth'. Hogg was therefore startled when Blackie and Son, the Glasgow firm, refused him his usual proportion as profit, and in this letter he stresses that he never got less than a sixth of the retail price of the edition. Hogg seems not to have appreciated the fact that substantially increased sales of his tales might have paid him a higher price in the end, even if he accepted a lower proportion of the price of the edition. John Blackie was experienced in selling cheap publications, and specialised in selling books in numbers, that is, section by section to subscribers who were not well off, or who lived in small towns or country districts far from the regular bookshops. It might be supposed that such an old-fashioned, rural audience would have been an appreciative one for Hogg's tales, but Hogg put off accepting the firm's offer for these financial reasons and in the event their edition of his tales was a posthumous one.

By around 1830 there are signs that Edinburgh was no longer the literary centre it had been, and Hogg's later years show him turning to London for markets for his fiction. The economic crisis of 1825 seems partly to have weakened confidence in Edinburgh: the expansion of the city seems to have been arrested, while the control of the Edinburgh Review, for instance, passed from Constable to

82 Hogg to Blackie and Son, 11 February 1833, in NLS MS 807, f.19.
83 Agnes A. C. Blackie, Blackie and Son 1809-1959 (London and Glasgow, 1959), pp.5-6.
Longman. Writers of a newer generation, of whom Carlyle may be
taken as an example, were finding Edinburgh an uncongenial place in
which to work. With improving communications the periodicals
of Edinburgh grew closer than before to those which had previously
served markets in the south. Charles Knight describes how, earlier
in the 1820s, he was reading Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine in London
at a time of the month when the magazines of the metropolis were
'just getting on their outer garments'. In 1810, when he had
experienced setbacks in his farming speculations Hogg had gone to
Edinburgh and tried to earn a living by literature: in 1830, after
his losses with the Mount Benger farm, he wrote enquiringly to
Blackwood, 'Do you not think that in London I could be well employed
in some literary capacity'. When the rupture with Blackwood of
December 1831 meant that Hogg's usual outlet for his fiction closed,
he set off at the end of that same month for London with the object
of arranging a collected edition of his tales to improve his
financial standing.

The earlier of Hogg's more significant opportunities to publish
his fiction in the London periodical market came through the
development of a new type of publication altogether. It is not
absolutely clear that the Annuals of the 1820s and 1830s should be
classed as periodicals rather than as books, but as the more

---
84 See David Craig, Scottish Literature and the Scottish People
85 Charles Knight, Passages of a Working Life During Half a
Century: with a Prelude of Early Reminiscences, 3 vols
(London, 1864-1865), I, 269-70.
86 Hogg to Blackwood, 28 April 1830, in NLS MS 4027, f. 185.
popular of these yearly volumes formed an annual series, of which back numbers were sometimes purchased, and as each Annual had an editor who was responsible for seeking contributions as well as selecting pictures to be engraved, they may fairly be considered as a type of periodical publication. Mrs Garden describes these works as 'prettily bound and daintily illustrated collections of prose and verse' (Memorials, p.158), while an article in one of them aptly describes them as works which 'combine the original contribution of the German annual with the splendid binding of the Christmas English present'. Referring to the continually increasing lavishness of their binding and production the same writer ironically anticipates that 'we shall soon arrive at the millenium of souvenirs. Instead of engravings, we shall have paintings by the first masters; our paper must be vellum; our bindings in opal and amethyst ....'87

As competition stiffened between these gift-books their bindings went from tinted paper to silk, velvet, and even embossed Morocco leather. Their attraction was as drawing-room publications, displaying to the visitors of a well-to-do household the family's wealth and elegant taste, and consisting of a literature read intermittently and without any intellectual strain, which would not stamp the young lady reader with the unwelcome character of a bluestocking. That the development of the Annual followed upon the heels of the development of the steel plate engraving, stresses again its visual importance. Steel plates were so much more durable than

87 'Pocket-Books and Keepsakes', Keepsake (1828), pp.1-18 (pp.11, 1).
copper that they permitted hundreds of impressions to be taken without deterioration. Several of the Annuals were connected directly with the print-selling trade, as might be expected. The engravings of the Annuals were of a high quality, and specialist printers were often employed in their production. Pictures by many of the most celebrated artists of the day were reproduced in the Annuals, and it is not surprising to learn that 'to the excellence of their embellishments the Annuals owe the greatest portion of their popularity'. In the case of both the Forget Me Not and the Literary Souvenir it was reported that sets of the engravings sometimes sold at a later date for more than the cost of the entire volume. 88 In an age when even a comfortable middle-class home in a provincial district probably contained few pictures, when the chance to see exhibitions was a rare one, and when many splendid pictures were in private hands, the engravings in the Annuals were especially enjoyable. Charlotte Bronte, as a girl at Haworth, was impressed by them, for she wrote detailed notes on the engravings of the Friendship's Offering for 1829. It has been suggested that the Annuals indeed 'supplied a real craving in Charlotte's nature', through her sensitivity to the visual arts. 89

88 Iain Bain, 'Gift Book and Annual Illustrations: some notes on their production', in Frederick W. Faxon, Literary Annuals and Gift Books: A Bibliography 1823-1903. Reprinted with Supplementary Essays by Eleanor Jamieson and Iain Bain (Pinner, Middlesex, 1973; reprinted from 1912 edition), pp. 19-25 (pp.19, 22-23); 'Preface', Forget Me Not (1832) pp.3-6 (pp.4, 5); A. A. Watts, 'Preface', Literary Souvenir (1828), pp.v-xvi (pp.vi-vii).

importance of the Annuals has its influence both upon their
circulation and upon their literary content.

Firstly, with such embellishments the Annuals were naturally
for the luxury market. Most of them sold at twelve shillings, while
the Keepsake and the Anniversary, which paid more for engravings
reputedly, each sold at a guinea. Even at these prices an
extensive sale, by the standards of the day, was necessary to meet
the costs of production. Only two engravings in the Literary
Souvenir for 1829, for instance, had cost less than a hundred
guineas to produce, while some apparently cost as much as a hundred
and seventy guineas for the copyright and printing. It was
calculated that 'a circulation of less than from eight to nine
thousand copies of the LITERARY SOUVENIR for 1829, would entail a
serious loss upon its proprietors'.\textsuperscript{90} In turn as competition
stiffened increasingly splendid embellishments became a condition of
the success of a particular work. S. C. Hall, the editor of the
Amulet, wrote of one volume which cost the publishers nearly twelve
hundred guineas for embellishments, adding that 'strange to say,
that was the only volume of the whole series ... that yielded a
profitable return upon the capital expended and the labour bestowed'.
Hall estimated that during the fashion for Annuals the public spent
a hundred thousand pounds a year in buying them.\textsuperscript{91}

The wide diffusion of the Annuals as drawing-room books for the

\textsuperscript{90} A. A. Watts, 'Advertisement', Literary Souvenir (1829), pp. vii-
xii (p.viii and note).
\textsuperscript{91} S. C. Hall, Retrospect of a Long Life: From 1815 to 1883, 2
fashionable and would-be fashionable undoubtedly also had its literary effects. The lonely Forget Me Not of 1823 was one of nine Annuals by 1825, and one of sixty-three by 1832. With a number of works all competing for a largely seasonal market it might be supposed that by the late 1820s or early 1830s a writer could dispose of his work there to advantage, besides giving a display of the attractions of his writing to a relatively large audience of readers who certainly could, if they chose, spare money to purchase books. Ten thousand copies of the Forget Me Not for 1826 had been printed, for instance, and this large impression exhausted some time before Christmas, the season for which it was primarily intended.

As a contrast, the first edition of Hogg's The Brownie of Bodsbeck: and other Tales (1818) was of fifteen hundred copies, and sales had effectively ceased by October 1821, before even that small number of copies was exhausted. It is possible that an author like Hogg may have widened the audience for his work a little through the Annuals, especially as at least one of them was translated into another language. On the other hand, Jack brings forward the opinions of Southey and Wordsworth to suggest that the Annuals adversely affected the sales of volumes of poetry which would otherwise have been sold for presents. There can be no doubt,

93 'Preface', Forget Me Not (1827), pp.iii-vi (p.vi).
94 See appendix, page 283.
95 'Preface', Forget Me Not (1828), pp.iii-v (pp.iv-v).
however, of the subordinate position of literature within the Annuals themselves. This is plainly shown in the almost universal habit of asking the literary contributors to write material in illustration of the engravings, and not, as might be expected, using these as adjuncts to the letterpress. Hogg was asked to illustrate a plate in this way by Shoberl for the *Forget Me Not* for 1834, and in this case as in others evidently complied with the request.97 Careless editors sometimes failed to keep up the universal pretence that the pictures were illustrations of the text, and the reader might find appended as an illustration to a tale of no very marked excellence, a design distinctly and obviously intended by the artist as an illustration to some well-known incident from the Waverley novels such as the glove scene in the library, from "Rob Roy".98 Such lapses serve as a further reminder of the importance of the pictures in these publications, though it would be unjust to say that they performed no useful literary service. The Annuals firstly gave young and unknown writers the chance to make a name for themselves, though they would probably not be paid for their contributions. Renier points out that Tennyson's early poetry appeared in this way in the early 1830s.99 Well-known writers might receive a handsome fee for allowing a few short scraps from their pens to be printed there for the first time. Moore was supposedly offered six hundred

97 See 'Scottish Haymakers', *Forget Me Not* (1834), pp.327-35, in connection with the answer given by Hogg to Shoberl in his letter of 2 March 1833, in NLS MS 1809, f.85.
pounds in 1828 by the editor of the *Keepsake* for a hundred and twenty lines of either prose or poetry. If he indeed refused such an offer he was almost alone among those literary men of high repute who held a low opinion of the Annuals. In between the high-paid contributions of famous literary men and the gratuitous ones of the hopeful young unknowns were the writings of the reputable but not universally acclaimed authors such as Hogg himself. It may easily be perceived from this that payment went by the fame of the author’s name rather than the quality of his contributions to the Annuals or by any standard rate for literary contributions to them. Allan Cunningham paid Hogg twenty-five pounds, for example, for his contributions to the *Anniversary* of 1829. He tells Hogg that he has printed the poetic contribution sent in response to his offer of a pound a page for such, and also a tale, explaining that he ‘cannot afford to put prose on an equality with verse’, that the tale is twenty-two pages long, and that he owes Hogg twenty-five pounds. It is interesting that he was willing to pay more for poetry than for prose, and the possibility that this was a common distinction made by the editors of the Annuals makes it difficult to tell exactly what he was paid by other editors, who do not provide a breakdown of their payments as Cunningham did. He also remarked that he believed he gave higher prices than most of the Annuals with the exception of the *Keepsake*. As these two Annuals sold at the higher price of a guinea there may probably be some truth in his

101 Cunningham to Hogg, 9 October 1828, in NLS MS 2245, f.128.
statement. As Hogg never contributed to the *Keepsake* Cunningham's payment for the tale will therefore be taken as representing perhaps the highest estimate of the payments Hogg received for his fiction in the Annuals. Deducting eight pounds from the twenty-five for the eight-page poem, Hogg was paid seventeen pounds for 'The Cameronian Preacher's Tale', a story of approximately six thousand two hundred words. For 'A Horrible Instance of the Effects of Clanship', a tale of about the same length, Blackwood had paid Hogg five pounds. Even taking account of the circumstances that Cunningham considered his payment higher than those of other editors of Annuals, and that Hogg considered this payment from Blackwood to be rather a low one (it is in fact almost an exact one at a rate of ten guineas per sheet), it would appear that Hogg was paid very handsomely for his prose fiction in the Annuals. Hogg's accusation to Blackwood of relatively poor payment in the course of their quarrel at the end of 1831, that 'every London publisher has this last year paid me triple what you have done', has always been read as a piece of angry rhetoric, but here is one London editor who can be proved to have paid Hogg triple what Blackwood had on occasion paid him for his fiction.

As a medium for Hogg's fiction the Annuals were much more

---


103 Hogg to Blackwood, 6 December 1831, in NLS MS 4029, f.268.
restrictive than a magazine like Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine. This is true even in point of length, for the Annuals, being designed far more for casual and intermittent perusal, tried to present a large number of short tales and poems. Cunningham's Anniversary of 1829, for example, contained sixty pieces of poetry and prose in three hundred and thirty-six of its small pages. Hogg's tale in the volume, already mentioned as some six thousand two hundred words long, was one of his longest prose contributions to any Annual. More typical in this respect is the three thousand five hundred words or so of 'A Sea Story'. By comparison many of Hogg's later papers in the series 'The Shepherd's Calendar' in Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine were in excess of eight thousand words, occupying ten pages or more in the magazine's closely-printed double columns. Similar restrictions as to extent operated upon Hogg's poetic contributions to the Annuals. Hogg wrote to Shoberl, for example, that a poem he had been writing for him had grown to above seven hundred lines, and was now, he feared, too long for an Annual. Allan Cunningham, declaring that Hogg's tale and poem were too long for his space, went on to remark, 'but this I can manage without injuring them in any little abridgement which I make'. This stress on brevity presumably not only restricted Hogg himself but subjected his work to alterations made by editors of Annuals in

104 Rev. David Hogg, Life of Allan Cunningham, with Selections from his Works and Correspondence (Dumfries, 1875), p.281.
106 Hogg to Shoberl, 21 April 1834, in NLS MS 10998, f.176; Cunningham to Hogg, 26 May 1828, in NLS MS 2245, f.120.
addition. The greatest difference between the Annuals and the magazines, however, was in censorship of contributions. A periodical like Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine assumed an audience that was mature and, primarily, masculine: the Annuals on the other hand were addressed to an audience that was feminine and, primarily, youthful. This is not to say that Hogg's contributions to the Edinburgh periodical were not subject to Blackwood's censorship, for he refused several pieces on grounds not of their inferior literary quality but because they would seem offensive to readers. Articles were modified or returned for their sexual or political unreserve, but perhaps the chief ground of complaint was the unorthodoxy and unusual use of religion by Hogg in some of his work, both in verse and prose. Blackwood objected, for example, to the mixture of ludicrous elements with religion in the original of 'A Sunday Pastoral', and refused to print 'On the Separate Existence of the Soul' because 'it would awfully shock the Orthodox' if he were to do so, though he considered the tale one of Hogg's very cleverest things. 107 However, a magazine seems to have had an acknowledged freedom from censorship where the Annuals did not. Pringle, in refusing a ballad Hogg had sent him for the Friendship's Offering, explained that, 'Were it for a magazine or some such work I should not feel so particular but for these "douce" & delicate publications the annuals I think it rather inappropriate'. 108 This distinction may partly have been due to

107 Blackwood to Hogg, 26 August 1830 and 17 September 1831, in NLS Acc.5643, vol.89, pp.66-67 and 225 respectively.
108 Pringle to Hogg, 28 May 1828, in NLS MS 2245, f.122.
the avowed policy of the Annuals on the kind of literature they represented. Watts described the contents of the *Literary Souvenir* to his publisher as 'Poetry, the Arts, etc.; in short, polite literature'.109 The very titles of these publications, *Literary Souvenir*, *Forget Me Not*, and *Friendship's Offering*, as well as their function as keepsakes or Christmas presents, suggest tenderness and sentiment as their essential characteristics. Not surprisingly, then, the reader is reminded of 'the more quiet graces of a literature combining simplicity of style with elevation of sentiment, and possessing a salutary moral tendency in its general effect', or told of the attempt 'to encourage the higher and nobler feelings of our nature'.110 Certain tones would be out of place in such a context, and the reader's expectations of an Annual were probably responsible for the failure of a publication like *Janus*, which attempted a more serious, intellectual approach in several of its papers. These, 'which might have been perused with interest in a Quarterly Review, were, however, the means ... of hurrying it to that bourne from which no book, whatever may be its hidden merits, was ever known to return'. Watts's satire on his literary enemies was also incongruous in such a delicate and polite publication.111

But besides their character of tender and decorous sentiment, the

---


110 'Preface', *Friendship's Offering* (1832), pp. v-vii (p.v); 'Preface', *Forget Me Not* (1835), pp. 3-6 (p.4).

Annuals avoided certain subjects, tones, and expressions because of contemporary views of the nature of their audience. Quinlan describes how 'a set of manners and attitudes distinctive to women was to surround them with an aura of protection and mystery'. Attributing this to Evangelical interpretation of Pauline teaching on the position of women, he instances Hannah More's *Coelebs in Search of a Wife* (1809) as perhaps the best literary description of a pattern young lady of the middle classes. Eight editions of this dreary novel were bought up in two months. A distinction was made between reading matter for the father of a household in the seclusion of his closet or study, and the heavily censored and restricted material that could be read aloud to the mixed audience in the drawing-room in the plan of Bowdler's *Family Shakespeare* (1818). Bowdler himself might be described as a cultivated man, a doctor and a fellow of the Royal Society and of the Society of Antiquaries, and his aim was not to destroy the original texts of the plays, which he expected men to still read privately, but to present a text that could be read aloud to the family. Jaeger, in her comments on his treatment of *Twelfth Night*, demonstrates his avoidance of passages which might endanger faith in the spiritual nature of female love, as well as a caution about religion so excessive that the word 'God' is regularly replaced by 'Nature' or 'Heaven'.

the Annuals had to comply with these narrow standards of inoffensiveness, though as books including prose fiction, poems, and prints of a tender and even voluptuous nature they were clearly not catering for strict Evangelicals. In many ways they were reading for the young lady of accomplishments, though she would be affected by the increasing propriety demanded of the model female. Pringle in describing his editorial policy for the Friendship's Offering shows his consciousness of this standard in the declaration that he made it a rule 'to admit not a single expression which would call up a blush in the Cheek of the most delicate female if reading aloud to a mixt company'.\footnote{Pringle to Hogg, 28 May 1828, in NLS MS 2245, ff.122-23.}

Hogg's own attitude to this was one of bored and slightly contemptuous indifference. Grumbling to Shoberl about the Annuals, he wrote that 'there are none of those things about which mankind are so newfangled ever stand the test', describing the situation as one of 'an overstocked market and often of such vapid lady stuff'. To S. C. Hall he openly dissociated himself as a writer from modern standards of propriety, in directing him to "Take every liberty of pruning adding or diminishing" to suit the fastidious taste of the day for I am like Gallio I care for none of those things'.\footnote{Hogg to Shoberl, 2 March 1833, in NLS MS 1809, f.85; Hogg to S. C. Hall, 17 April 1829, in NLS MS 1002, f.104.} As Hogg was obliged to conform to this taste to get his work printed, he chose to express his indifference to it by allowing his editors to make alterations instead of making them himself. Financially, however, Hogg probably thought the Annual craze worthwhile. Apart

---

114 Pringle to Hogg, 28 May 1828, in NLS MS 2245, ff.122-23.
115 Hogg to Shoberl, 2 March 1833, in NLS MS 1809, f.85; Hogg to S. C. Hall, 17 April 1829, in NLS MS 1002, f.104.
from his very frequent contributions to the London Annuals, he once
thought of starting one himself in Scotland: a paragraph appeared
on the suggestion that he should do so in the Edinburgh Literary
Journal, and Hogg himself wrote to William Blackwood about it.116
Hogg's attitude to the Annuals slightly resembled that of other
literary men of the Blackwood circle. There was a feeling that it
was beneath the dignity of a magazine writer to be known as a fre-
quent contributor to them. Lockhart wrote to Blackwood,
asking him to use his influence with Wilson another year to persuade
him to stop parading his name about in the Annuals and making himself
cheap, adding that even Delta, the magazine's writer of pretty
sentimental verses, should be above it. MacNish held the same
opinion in declaring that he would write nothing further for the
Annuals, thinking that a writer appeared before the public more
respectably by confining himself to one periodical work than by
writing for all the slight periodicals that asked him.117 Hogg's
disparagement of the Annuals may therefore itself be partly one of
fashion. He certainly valued some of his contributions to them
highly; his 'Invocation to the Queen of the Fairies' was inserted,
after it had been sent for the Literary Souvenir for 1825, into the
sixth part of his epic poem Queen Hynde.118 Hogg also included
several of the ballads he had contributed to Annuals in his

116 Hogg to Blackwood, undated, in NLS MS 4021, f.283; 'Literary
Chit-Chat and Varieties', Edinburgh Literary Journal, 16 May
1829, pp.387-88 (p.387).
117 Lockhart to Blackwood, 15 December 1826, in NLS MS 4017, f.
199; MacNish to Moir, 5 November 1828, in NLS MS 583, No. 760.
118 Hogg to Watts, 2 February 1825, in NLS MS 1002, f.102.
collection of *A Queer Book* (1832). Writing to Blackwood about the selection of ballads for this work, Hogg detailed "Superstition and Grace" (see Bijou) "Some in the Amulet" as among those that struck him as superior ones. On the other hand, several of the poems and songs Hogg sent to the Annuals had been printed before, one of them even coming from the long-forgotten pages of *The Spy*. Two only of Hogg's prose contributions were reprinted after their appearance in the Annuals by his possible choice, while none of the tales had previously been printed. The greater freshness of Hogg's prose contributions to the Annuals is perhaps surprising, and probably shows the comparative difficulty of getting his fiction into print. Even among the Annuals themselves the Bijou and the Gem were apparently willing to take only Hogg's verse. His more widely accepted reputation as a song-writer and as the bard of 'Kilmeny' was plainly the one they found useful. Moir advised Watts that if Hogg was to contribute to his Annual he should be asked for a song, considering that 'in that department lies his real strength'.

Despite his awareness of the limitations of the Annuals then, Hogg was prepared to contribute work that he considered to be of high quality, and his prose contributions were on the whole more fresh than those in verse. The editors of the Annuals perhaps welcomed

---

119 Hogg to Blackwood, 9 March 1831, in NLS MS 4029, f.249.
120 Compare 'A Scots Luve Sang', *Friendship's Offering* (1830), pp.185-86 with 'Scotch Song', *The Spy*, 8 December 1810, p.120.
121 'A Tale of Pentland' and 'The Cameronian Preacher's Tale' were reprinted in *Tales and Sketches*, 6 vols (Glasgow, 1837), I, 317-32 and II, 339-54 respectively; 'The Fords of Callum; an Ower True Tale' was not reprinted until a later collection, which Hogg could have had no hand in selecting.
122 Moir to Watts, 2 July 1827, in NLS MS 1809, f.152.
his lyrical songs more than his rougher and more unusual tales.

Even though Hogg was willing to accept the necessary restrictions on his work that writing for the Annuals entailed, he still tended to step over the boundaries of their conventions. Pringle advised him to 'take Mrs Hogg's counsel as to the subjects and phraseology' of his contributions, because she would know 'better than you what will suit a lady's work table ....', while in the commentary to his verse satire Watts was able to sneer at the coarseness both of Hogg and of the editor of a rival Annual in saying that Hogg's 'Seeking the Houdy' was not altogether adapted for drawing-room perusal. 123 In fact the tale has nothing improper about it, despite the reference to a midwife in the title; it is an illustration of old-fashioned Scottish customs, and an eerie relation of a supernatural appearance. At the close of the tale Hogg laments the passing of an old way of life, that 'no future old shepherd shall tell another tale of SEEKING THE HOUDY!'. He recollects for the reader the merry gossip of the midwife and her cronies, and the 'store of capital stories and gossip circulated' at a birth. The husband's hurried nocturnal ride to fetch the houdy is especially associated with strange stories, so that 'it would appear, that there hardly ever was a midwife brought, but some incident occurred indicative of the fate or fortunes of the little forthcoming stranger; but, amongst them all I have selected this as the most remarkable'. 124 The tale itself is an instance of the

124 'Seeking the Houdy', Forget Me Not (1830), pp.399-413 (p.413).
general belief in the peculiar nature of these excursions, the
narrator having heard the story of the night of Helen Grieve's birth
from the father at a time when the child was only about seven years
old, and when he lived in the family himself as a servant lad (pp.
407, 412). Hogg first heard the story, then, from the person who
experienced the apparition presaging the fate of his daughter at a
time when neither of them could be aware of what the conditions of
her adult life would be. Afterwards, that 'the midwife's short
history of herself has turned out the exact history of this once
lovely girl's life', and that Robin does meet the mysterious figure
for the second time shortly before his own death as she had told him
he would, confirm the wonderful nature of his nocturnal experience
(p. 413). In this tale Hogg combines the relation of wonderful
and supernatural experience with the description, for an English as
well as a Scottish audience, of characteristic rural Scottish customs
and beliefs. This was a fruitful approach for his contributions to
the Annuals, where he was writing in London publications for a,
partially, English audience, to whom he would be known chiefly as a
protege and follower of Sir Walter Scott, or as the Ettrick Shepherd
of the Noctes Ambrosianae. Hogg was able to utilize this limited
reputation in some of his fiction for the Annuals. Above all, the
example and popularity of Scott was probably what permitted writers
like himself to find a market in polite London publications for
Scottish subjects and customs, and tales written partly in Scots, at
all. In the first of his tales to appear in the Annuals Hogg
creates a deliberate analogy between his hero and a well-known
character from an early Waverley Novel, in order to justify his
writing about Border characters and customs, which might otherwise
seem too local and restricted in interest for his audience. Hogg later wrote in his recollections of Scott's character that he considered Guy Mannering, with Old Mortality, to be the keystone of the splendid arch of Scott's fiction (Familiar Anecdotes, pp.120-21). His Charlie Dinmont of 'The Border Chronicler' bears a family relationship to the Dandie Dinmont of Charlie's-hope of that novel. Both are types of the old-fashioned store-farmer whose rough, good-humoured speech and manners illustrate the Border life that had begun to disappear under the pressure of more modern manners. Hogg's Charlie proffers the Edinburgh radical the same hearty welcome and plentiful hospitality as Scott's Dandie gives Bertram, and both fictions have scenes in Edinburgh where the Borderer's attitudes and manners are contrasted humorously though affectionately with those of the city-folk. Bertram's visit to Dinmont's farm is used by Scott to describe the sports, households, and character of the class of Border farmers of whom he is the representative. Hogg alludes to this Scott novel then, but he does not merely slavishly copy Scott's insights and scenes. The recollection is rather to remind the English reader of a suitable context in which to read Hogg's tale, and to signal to him the common purpose of the two writers in creating such a character—to explain to an audience unfamiliar with them the worth of the manners and people of the Borders of the recent Scottish past. Hogg also partly utilizes and partly corrects in this tale the public personality created for him in the minds of an English audience through the Noctes Ambrosianae. The tale is a development of a contrast in characterisation made by Hogg in his old periodical The Spy. The narrator is a Border man himself, like
Hogg and the well-known Shepherd, but one who has been for some time accustomed to city scenes and manners. Like the Spy, he makes the reader aware of the countryside past that enables him to make a close and special contact with the man of more unaltered and unmediated Border speech and manners. The narrator was able to claim a previous acquaintance with Charlie on seeing him in town, and 'soon drew him into a conversation about Border tales and Border manners'. Two characteristic Border tales were told by Charlie to the narrator and these are used by him to entertain the readers of the Literary Souvenir for 1826, the narrator declaring at the end that he has 'a great many more of Charlie's instances noted down, which shall be forthcoming in the next volume of the Literary Souvenir' (p.279). Although the promised sequel did not appear, the plan seems rather like Hogg's earlier one, where the Spy, having met John Miller in Edinburgh, goes with him to a coffee-house, and, though he fails to dissuade John from becoming a literary man, gains an insight into his character, which is peculiarly that of a native, Scots-speaking Borderer for an educated man. The Spy engages John to furnish him with 'a great number of anecdotes illustrative of country manners in general, delineations of many singular characters ... old legends, and stories of ghosts and bogles'. The first of the tales supposedly written by John Miller then follows. The tales Charlie tells are also in support of the belief in

125 'The Border Chronicler', Literary Souvenir (1826), pp.257-79 (p.263).
126 'The Spy's Encounter with John Miller', and 'Description of a Peasant's Funeral', The Spy, 17 November 1810, pp.89-92 (p.92) and 92-95 respectively.
Hogg distinguishes the narrator as an aspect of his own personality from the teller of the tale, who implicitly believes in the supernatural, so that the tale can be told more simply and yet the reader will not be able to accuse the author of excessive credulity. The initial conversation between the two men also helps towards this understanding, when they compare the lost spirits of the countryside with the Edinburgh prostitutes, the lost souls who haunt the closes of the city. Charlie suggests that each place has its dreadful warnings, and that even the reassuring figure of the nightwatchman could be frightening in the unfamiliar setting of a country corner. (pp. 266-68). The tale of 'Gillanbye's Ghost', which Charlie claims to relate from personal experience, may thus seem too bizarre for truth in itself, but in his mouth and in the setting he gives it is convincing, and the reader, as Hogg intends, is carried along with the travellers who are lured towards a watery grave in the Solway by the devil in old Gillanbye's likeness, and rescued by an angelic presence riding a white horse. This tale is in the best range and manner of Hogg, not Scott; in directing the reader to the significance of his tale through his familiarity with Scott's novel, Hogg is yet achieving something peculiarly his own. Hogg's use of his reputation is less fortunate in 'Scottish Haymakers'. His imagination may have been limited by the need to write for the picture provided by his editor, but this story of the pranks of Hogg and his cronies on a spree, though it contains some amusing passages, is inconsistent in tone. One discordant element is the narrator's account of the fate of his ventriloquist friend's victim, an unfortunate haymaker who is made to hear the smothered cries of
an infant among the load of hay he is carting. His bewilderment as he turns off his hay and rakes it through only to discover that there is no child there is too light-heartedly related, and his motives too natural and conscientious, for the reader to pass over as lightly the information that on a repetition of the cries 'he fled all the way to the highlands of Perthshire, where he still lives in a deranged state of mind'. Their brief amusement has cost him dear, and the reader must feel this in the careless juxtaposition of ideas here. Another unfortunate discord in the tale is the narrator's unnecessary emphasis on the fame and talents of his companions, where these are not an essential part of the tale. Hogg is too quick to tell the reader that the actor Terry and 'the two celebrated Naesmiths' were of the party, and his relation of the conversation of the painters on the view is a digression, as he admits after he has given in to the temptation of relating it (pp.327-29). Hogg merely assumes in this tale that his public personality as the boon companion of the famous is entertaining; he does not use it and make it serve any end of his own.

If Hogg was at a disadvantage in writing for the Annuals because they were fastidious, he was advantaged by their concern for respectability when it favoured a moral and religious tone and subject matter. Some Annuals even specialised in catering for the entertainment of more serious, religious persons, and the Amulet, edited by S. C. Hall was one of these. Thomas Hood, in giving its

127 'Scottish Haymakers', Forget Me Not (1834), pp.327-35 (pp.330-32).
distinguishing characteristic, write that 'the "Amulet" On preaching is intent'. Hall, in trying to persuade Hogg to write for his magazine, had told him that 'religious readers are now-a-days the great buyers of books'. 128 Quinlan demonstrates the firm belief of Evangelicals in Providential interference, and this must have been congenial to Hogg, brought up as he had been in an older belief in it. 129 The Amulet was a suitable medium for Hogg's work about the Covenanters, and besides some poetry on them, 'A Tale of Pentland' was printed there. This is a well-written, adventurous historical tale, but as it reworks material already used by Hogg in The Brownie of Bodsbeck in the scene where Walter Laidlaw, returning unexpectedly to his house at night, sees his daughter apparently murdering but really nursing a dying man, it need only be mentioned briefly here. 130 The tale contributed by Hogg to the Anniversary is also a tale of incidents depending upon a pervasive and old-fashioned religious atmosphere, and the finest of the tales he contributed to the Annuals, perhaps because of his sense of the friendly and appreciative interest of his old friend Allan Cunningham, the editor of the publication. Cunningham knew the Border setting of the tale and had long been an admirer of Hogg's work: Hogg had apparently made literary friendships with

128 This passage from 'The Battle of the Annuals' is quoted from Alaric Alfred Watts, Alaric Watts, A Narrative of His Life, 2 vols (London, 1884), II, 155; Hall to Hogg, 8 April [1829], in NLS MS 2245, f.145.
Cunningham's elder brothers James and Thomas, and he himself relates his first meeting with Allan and visits to the Cunningham family at Dalswinton, owning, 'I ... never missed an opportunity of meeting with Allan when it was in my power to do so' (Memoir, p.73). Cunningham apparently also knew Farley, the Cameronian preacher of the tale Hogg sent him, and must have been an especially interested and informed audience in himself for the tale. Hogg uses the sympathetic Cameronian preacher, Mr Farley, as a means to provide the reader with the appropriate mood of Providential guidance and judgement essential to the structure of the tale. As a man of intelligence and presumably of education too, Farley is a narrator who appeals to the more rationalistic reader of the Annual, while his old-fashioned faith permits him to structure the tale by traditional values. His interpretation of the events he relates is the reader's framework for them, forming an instance of 'those terrible sermons which God preaches to mankind, of blood unrighteously shed, and most wondrously avenged'. His voice colours the events with moral discriminations, as for instance when on the subject of the enmity of Macmillan and Johnstone despite their many similarities of disposition and pursuits he comments that 'bargain making and money seeking narroweth the heart and shuts up generosity of soul' (p.171). The archaic word 'narroweth' is a

131 Rev. David Hogg, Life of Allan Cunningham, with Selections from his Works and Correspondence (Dumfries, 1875), pp.7, 11.
part of Farley's pastoral Biblical discourse, which is reminiscent of Hogg's mastery of such language in the creation of Robert Wringhim. Farley, however, is a genuinely good man, instinctively respected and liked by almost everyone with whom he comes into contact. His opinion is essentially that of the community with respect to the death of Johnstone, and subsequently of his slayer, Macmillan. The notion of a divine judgement on Macmillan for the death of Johnstone is present to all sections of the community: the judge at the trial tells Macmillan that he has been saved from man but not from God (p.175), while Macmillan himself remembers these words on the night of his own death and shows trepidation in approaching the scene of Johnstone's death (pp.176-77). Farley in his sermon on the death of Macmillan both agrees with the common interpretation, and structures the past satisfyingly for the community. The succession of events that lead up to Farley's discovery of Johnstone's widow are told in accordance with this supernatural interpretation: Howatson's visionary revelations are confirmed by the property of Johnstone being found where he said it would, and Farley's accidental discovery of the widow's house seems a further evidence of Providential intervention in events without human and rational means being deployed. The final part of the tale is interesting, for there the minister has a rational account of past events to set beside the legendary and supernatural one, though that is not discredited by it. Without essential deceit he manipulates the superstitious expectations of the countryfolk, though as I have demonstrated he tends to share them himself. In order to spare the feelings of Macmillan's innocent family, he creates the legend of a Good Spirit, who appeared to the widow,
and 'had disclosed where her husband's murdered body lay, had
enriched her with all his lost wealth, had prayed by her side till the
blessed dawn of day, and then vanished with the morning light' (p. 191).
Farley's appearance and manner had suggested to the piper that he
was the ghost of a persecuted Covenanter risen from the grave to
right injustice; Farley, overhearing this, speaks solemn words that
at once minister to these suspicions and express his own real sense
that on this occasion he is a divine messenger: he suddenly
declares, 'For a wise purpose am I come; to reveal murder; to
speak consolation to the widow and the fatherless ....' (p. 189).
In this fictive world the rational and the supernatural bear
witness together to the divine care, and a truly wise man can read
the message of them both.

Hogg was not always so fortunate in finding in the Annuals so
congenial a medium for his fiction. He was much less successful
in the tales he wrote for the juvenile Annuals, for the recent
restrictions on reading-matter intended for children were even
greater than on that intended for women. Renier mentions that the
literary contents of these juvenile Annuals 'closely adhered to the
model set by the general run of didactic books for children such as
Mrs Sherwood's The Fairchild Family ... or Maria Edgeworth's Early
Lessons, written to banish the insidious fairy-tale'.134 These
expensive publications were often addressed rather to the adult
purchaser than to the child reader. Ackermann's Juvenile Forget Me

---

134 Anna Renier, Friendship's Offering: An Essay on the Annuals
Not sought to recommend itself to the parents, guardians, and friends of youth 'who wish to put into the hands of the latter an elegant miscellany ... containing nothing but what is conducive to moral improvement, combined with pleasing instruction and innocent amusement'. Moral improvement was often a more prominent feature of the fiction in these volumes than amusement: a characteristic form was a dialogue between an older person and a child in the course of which the child was instructed morally. In 'Impulse and Amiability' Jane's tutor, Mr Tyndale, tells her several stories with this aim, and she discusses their significance with him until she has reached understanding and can gratefully exclaim, "Thank you, dear Sir. Now I understand what amiability should be, and shall in future be careful not to obey mere impulse". Hogg imitated such a dialogue in 'What is Sin?', in which little Jessie asks her sister to go to the nutwood with her against mamma's orders. Ellen replies that it would be a great sin to disobey mamma, and the word 'sin' provokes an examination of the concept. At the end of the discussion Ellen invites her sister to think how their widowed mamma has tended her helpless infancy, and Jessie, promising to make her sister her example, exclaims, 'O, dear sister, do not break my heart, and I promise never to do it again'. The poetry in these volumes was often concerned with the edifying

135 'Preface', Ackermann's Juvenile Forget Me Not (1830), pp.iii-v (p.iii); Isabel Hill, 'Impulse and Amiability', Juvenile Forget Me Not (1831), pp.84-100 (p.100).
136 'What is Sin?', Ackermann's Juvenile Forget Me Not (1830), pp.223-27 (p.227).
spectacle of death or mortality, or consisted of hymns. Hogg's familiarity with the Bible, sermons, and extempore prayers made the composition of prayers and hymns for children easy to him, and several of these appear in the juvenile Annuals. Presumably these were valued as highly as his delightful celebration of childish freedom and play in 'A Boy's Song'. Although the Annuals took Hogg's religious pieces it would seem that they wished to avoid offending any particular religious sect, for a comparison of the surviving portion of the manuscript with the printed version of 'The Two Valleys, a Fairy Tale' shows the excision of an anti-Catholic element in the fable. In the manuscript the inhabitants of the peaceful and happy valley of Luran are Protestants, and those of the wicked and vicious valley of Dual are Catholics, whereas in the printed version the difference is that the inhabitants of the one are bred up in true religion and those of the other cannot read their Bibles. The triumph of the well-bred little girls of Luran, with the aid of a good fairy, over the poor, ragged, and brutal boys of Dual in the original might have estranged parents who were not Protestants and Tories, and either Hogg himself or the editor of the Annual must have removed this level of meaning from the tale before it could be published in a juvenile Annual.

137 An example of a deathbed poem is Moir's 'Young William's Deathbed', Ackermann's Juvenile Forget Me Not (1830), pp. 219-22.
139 Contrast 'The Two Valleys, a Fairy Tale', Remembrance (1831), pp. 121-32 (pp. 121-23), with the text in NLS MS 1704, ff. 65-66.
Although a fairy-story is promised in the title, May-lily of Rainbow-hill is not one of Hogg's magical, eerie presences, but 'a beautiful little lady, dressed in green satin, with a wreath of roses and flowers on her head' (p.123), whose magical powers are as extraneous to her personality as a conjuring trick. She is a fitting companion for the genteel maidens of Luran in their battle against the ragged boys of Dual. Apart from this kind of tale, allegorical rather than magical, the juvenile Annuals presented in their fiction an entirely rationalistic world, without ghosts, giants, or fairies. What ghosts there were had been produced by ordinary enough circumstances acting upon the weak credulity of mismanaged children, and one tale warns parents to 'keep a watchful eye that servants do not instil pernicious feelings into the breasts of their offspring'. Watt's son explained to his Victorian readers the principles on which his mother had excluded from her juvenile Annual 'all apocryphal personages, giants and fairies': children of that age, he argued, were more credulous and less able to reason than the children of the present generation, so that their reasoning powers needed to be exercised most. Reading about such beings for them was not a healthful exercise of the imagination, as they 'were quite capable of believing to their prejudice, and not to their profit'.

This exclusion of ghosts and magical beings was a severe handicap to Hogg, who was naturally attracted to such subjects.

and generally masterly in the creation of an unearthly and brooding atmosphere. A modern editor might well share Mrs Hall's feeling that a tale of seduction was unsuitable for children, but surely not her reluctance to 'send the little darlings tremulously to bed after perusing the very perfection of ghost stories' that Hogg had sent her. Owning that this tale had kept even her awake half the night, she thus entreated him: 'Pray, pray write me a simple tale, telling about your own pure and immortal Scottish children — without love — or ghosts — or fairies'.

There is a fundamental difference between the lady who sees evil in the prospect of children going to bed frightened, and the writer who knows that they enjoy it, one that is partly a difference between two generations. Hogg no doubt was influenced by recollections of his own childhood, when the visions of superstition made a boy 'All breathless stand, unknowing what to fear; / Or panting deep beneath his co'erlet lie'.

Mrs Hall's idea that children should read about other children must have seemed relatively uninteresting to Hogg. In 'The Poachers' he did write a story for children about the adventures of another child, though Senjy, the hero, is not a cared-for middle-class nursling, but an orphan faced with the problem of living by his wits in an indifferent or positively hostile society. Perhaps Hogg intended to justify his treatment of such a subject by indirect reference to the respectable precedent of Scott, for his hero resembles the

141 Anna Maria Hall to Hogg, 2 April 1830, quoted in Memorials, pp.198-99.
similarly-named widow's son in Redgauntlet. Scott's Benjie, though an amusing enough scapegrace, is less of a victim than a rogue. He is deceitful and selfish, acting as a spy upon Darsie Latimer who has shown him kindness. His actions often seem the result more of his natural inclinations than of his helpless position in society. Hogg's Benjy, on the other hand, seems far more of an indictment of his society, because he is portrayed as a naturally good and affectionate boy who is impelled towards wrongdoing by severe outward circumstances. Benjy's father becomes a poacher because he is not paid for the work he performs for the baronet, and after his death 'nobody seemed to regard or care for poor Benjy. He was abandoned to a lonely and lawless life; and when it was discovered that he still occupied his late father's shieling, no sympathy was evinced for the young outlaw'. Eventually Benjy is rescued from this friendless state where he must poach or do nothing by old Adam Little, who first tries to get the baronet to help Benjy. The baronet sends Benjy to school, but orders Cocket, the dog that assists Benjy in his depredations on the game, to be killed. The boy's affection towards his only friend, and his resolute defence of him, move Adam to offer him and Cocket a home with his brother-in-law, and Benjy's tearful gratitude leads Adam to see that 'his heart was in the right place, and that he had a desire to be good and virtuous, if Providence would open a path for him to virtue and goodness' (p.115). Benjy, under more favourable circumstances,

turns out well, becoming a minister with an allowable fondness for sport on the moors in season (pp. 115-16). This is the most interesting of Hogg's tales for the juvenile Annuals, and also the one that oversteps most their usual limitations of subject matter. It tells of the reformation of an erring child, but, unusually, refuses to rest the whole of the blame for the error upon the child's sinful nature. It also steps outside the nursery circle of the carefully nurtured and shielded child to cultivate an awareness of the isolation of the poor and friendless in society. Lastly, the tale is dramatic and full of exciting incident: even the scene where Benjy becomes aware that his father is dead is more dramatic than edifying, when the three rough-looking men burst in to arrest the father sleeping with Benjy in his arms, and Benjy realises as he tries to get up that he is covered in the blood of his father, who has died of his wounds in the night (p. 103).

Hogg's advantages in writing for the Annuals were rather personal than artistic. Although they were not prestigious publications among literary men, work published there would reach a larger audience than Hogg could reasonably hope to address in his separately published volumes of fiction. Writing for the Annuals was financially an advantageous way for Hogg to print his fiction, and from about 1830 onwards, when he was finding it difficult to induce William Blackwood to print his fiction if not at first his verse, it must have been especially pleasant to Hogg to be praised and solicited as a contributor. Writing for the Annuals also allowed Hogg to renew and strengthen friendships with Annual editors who were also expatriate Scottish literary men, like Thomas Pringle and Allan Cunningham. Artistically there can be little doubt that
the Annuals were unduly limiting outlets for Hogg's work. Their nature placed restrictions on the length of his fiction, and on its tone, and even subject-matter. Hogg was expected to comply with a modern standard of fastidious delicacy to which he was himself indifferent or even contemptuous, and in the juvenile Annuals his ghost and fairy tales were prohibited or severely restricted by the morally educative and rational tone of the publications. The editors of the Annuals do not seem to have exercised much literary discrimination, however, fastidious though they were. As MacLachlan points out, editors of lesser periodicals were often willing to publish inferior work for the sake of Hogg's name. It may be said for Hogg, though, that the context of the Annuals was itself responsible for at least part of this inferior work being written at all. It is extremely doubtful whether 'What is Sin?', for instance, would ever have been written had not the juvenile Annuals preferred moral dialogues to the ghost stories Hogg could write well, and his moral dialogue fits the standard set by the others in such publications. Hogg's reputation also influenced the detailed content and style of his tales for the Annuals at times. He was less known personally in London than in Edinburgh, and his appeal would be as the follower of Scott and as the Ettrick Shepherd of the Noctes Ambrosianae. Sometimes this was helpful to him, and he was able to defend his practice as a writer or rapidly make his reader familiar with his aims and methods by an allusion to some

feature of Scott's accepted and acclaimed achievement in fiction. At other times, Hogg unfortunately allowed himself to rest on his sense of his reputation as a known literary man and as the friend of those whose names would be well-known to the readers of the Annuals. Editors were also affected by Hogg's reputation as the Ettrick Shepherd, and tended to favour the verse that best fitted the conception of a peasant poet over the prose tales. The emphasis in the Annuals on religion and the existence of Annuals for more serious people fostered one important part of Hogg's work in fiction, however; his well-written tales concerning the traditional Scottish atmosphere of religion were acceptable, whether they dealt with the historical Covenanters, or with a more recent sense of the judgements of Providence. This was the chief encouragement to produce work of a high literary quality that Hogg gained from writing for the Annuals, which generally formed an unsuitable market and medium for his work in fiction.

Hogg was more at ease with the atmosphere of Fraser's Magazine, which appeared on the London literary scene at an opportune time for him. Early in January 1830 Hogg had applied for a renewal of the lease on his larger farm of Mount Benger, and the refusal of the Duke of Buccleuch's agent made it obvious to the world as well as to Hogg himself how far he had lost in unprofitable farming there. By April Hogg was writing mournfully to William Blackwood about the forthcoming sale of his effects, and entreating his silence to others

145 See letters from Hogg to Scott, 7 January and 7 March 1830, in NLS MS 3912, ff.27 and 219 respectively.
on the subject 'as it is rather hard to have to begin the world anew
at 60 years of age'. Galt's letter, written at the desire of the
editor of the new magazine and asking Hogg to become a contributor
of verse or prose, arrived at this financial crisis and must have
been, therefore, especially welcome. Others of William Blackwood's
friends were to write for the new periodical, and the intention was
'to do the handsome thing' by the contributors. Fraser's
Magazine was not only an alternative to Blackwood's Edinburgh
Magazine in fact, but also imitated it in more respects than its
handsome payments and use of some of the same contributors. The
effective editor, William Maginn, had been an important and trusted
ccontributor to the Edinburgh periodical until about 1829, when some
difference had occurred between himself and Blackwood, and his
ccontributions to it virtually ceased. Mackenzie had heard that
Maginn considered himself ill-used by Blackwood, and speaks of his
desire to have a magazine under his own control to be spared 'such
annoyance and mortification as had been recently caused by Mr
Blackwood's frequent return of articles to him, on the assigned plea
that they were "extremely clever, but not exactly adapted to the
Magazine"'. Maginn realised that the Edinburgh magazine was
becoming too sober and staid towards the end of the 1820s to find
his papers still acceptable; writing of his articles to Blackwood
in 1826, he said, 'I cannot think of any just now which would be

146 Hogg to Blackwood, 28 April 1830, in NLS MS 4027, f.185;
Galt to Hogg, 6 February 1830, in NLS MS 2245, f.156.
147 Miscellaneous Writings of the late Or Maginn, Volume V,
Fraserian Papers, edited by R. Shelton Mackenzie (New York,
1857), pp.lxii-lxiii.
likely to suit you. I am afraid you have given up the old view of the Magazine — and yet I cannot help thinking it was a good — at all events an original one'. 148 Fraser's Magazine, with its imitations of many features of the Edinburgh periodical including even an account of the recent doings of a set of literary men written in the chapter and verse of the Bible, attempted to capture the scurrilous merriment and freedom of Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine as it had been in its earliest years rather than as it was in 1830, as Maginn explained in defending his new magazine from a correspondent's accusation. Admitting that the two works did resemble each other, but attributing this to their use of the same writers, he added, 'There was once a time, indeed, when our northern model, as the blockhead calls Blackwood, bore a nearer resemblance to ours than he does now: we allude to the high and palmy days, the days of Ebony's juvenescence ...,', alluding to the men of high genius now lost to Blackwood and secured to himself. 149

Considering this obvious derivation of Fraser's Magazine from Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, it is perhaps useful to consider Maginn's attitude towards Hogg in the context of the older periodical as well as the new. Firstly, he had been willing to

148 Maginn to Blackwood, undated but postmarked 6 November 1826, in NLS MS 4018, f.11.
149 'The Book of JASHUR. (From the Aethiopic.)', Fraser's Magazine, 5(1832), 643-48; [William Maginn], 'Regina and her Correspondents', Fraser's Magazine, 6(1832), 255-56 (p.255), tentatively attributed to this author in Wellesley Index, II (1972), 334. This abbreviation is listed before the text, and will be used throughout this study, for The Wellesley Index to Victorian Periodicals 1824-1900, edited by Walter E. Houghton and others (Toronto and London, 1966 —).
ridicule Hogg's poetry and literary character, and was the author of the article 'Scotch Poets, Hogg and Campbell, Hynde and Theodric', which Blackwood had thought might seriously annoy Hogg himself. However, he was anxious to stop short of ridiculing Hogg to an extent that would cause him to stop his contributions to the magazine. When Wilson's cutting review of one of Hogg's works of fiction was delayed Maginn thought Blackwood had prevented its insertion in the magazine and was pleased, remarking that Hogg was 'too good a man for the concern to be seriously annoyed'.

The attitude of Fraser's Magazine itself towards Hogg was a curious mixture, the result of a desire at once to enjoy Hogg's tolerance of ridicule and to rival the Edinburgh magazine. One article, pretending to correct a false and popular estimate of Hogg, at once states that he is 'a remarkable man, and worthy to be talked of ... in terms less vague than serve to create a laugh in a bantering periodical, and with due reference to what he has done hitherto as a poet and a public man of sundry literary pretensions', and draws an imaginary picture of the Shepherd dancing, commenting, 'if he would not wallop like a satyr, we are deaf and know nothing: and then with what grace might he allemand in a quadrille, with his frieze coat and shepherd's brogues'.

The tone of this description is not so different from Wilson's own, and undercuts the

151 Maginn to Blackwood, 22 September 1823, in NLS MS 4011, f.43.
pretence of defending Hogg's literary reputation from the ridicule of him in Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine. In addition to this ludicrous treatment of Hogg, the magazine was quite prepared to take sides against him in any literary quarrel. When Hogg's personal recollections of Scott were published, Lockhart was deeply offended, writing of Hogg, 'of the fellow himself I can scarcely express my contemptuous pity, now that his Life of Sir W. Scott is before the world', adding that 'Dr Maginn has handled Hogg in his own way in Fraser's Mag'. Maginn's long attack on the work was so trenchant that a recent editor of it felt it was advisable to meet some of his criticisms. It is not possible to say that the review was written at Lockhart's instigation, but it pleased him and may well have been written with that intention. Perhaps the feelings roused towards Hogg by this literary quarrel also found expression in the review of another Hogg work in the preceding number of the magazine; Hogg's A Series of Lay Sermons on Good Principles and Good Breeding was not only attacked but deliberately misquoted and misrepresented, although it was brought out by the publisher of the magazine. The review is so cleverly managed that on a superficial reading and without comparing the reviewer's extracts with the original text it seems to be a kindly review of a grossly personal and vulgar book. It has been attributed to Allan Cunningham indeed, whose simple honesty and warm friendship

153 Lockhart to Blackwood, 18 August 1834, in NLS MS 4039, f.83, quoted without a date in Annals, II, 123-24; Maginn's attack is in Fraser's Magazine, 10(1834), 125-56; Douglas S. Mack meets some of his criticisms in his footnotes in Familiar Anecdotes, pp.101-02, 107, 128.
for Hogg would not have permitted him to write it. The review ends, for example, with ten maxims supposedly taken from Hogg's sermon on the text 'It is better to marry than burn'; they all illustrate his supposed lapses from delicacy of language and idea in discussing sexual concerns, and are given references to pages subsequent to page 352. Hogg's book, however, ends at page 330, and his earlier sermon on the text decorously treats the marriage state as a companionable one, and discusses a proper conduct to be observed in it by the husband. Besides this unfair invention, the reviewer also alters Hogg's existing text to make personal and scandalous allusions to Lord Grey, to emphasise the naive and limited experience of the Shepherd, and to present a picture of a jolly convivial man trying to express himself in moral terms essentially foreign to his nature. The magazine was by no means as respectful to Hogg as a literary man as it pretended to be at times in asserting its superiority to Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine. However, it was relatively receptive to Hogg's fiction, though little is said of his fiction in the pages of the magazine and he was obviously considered there as elsewhere primarily as a poet. In an early article there is a slight tribute to 'his prose tales, which, with all their faults, give indication of no mean talent', but a more interesting factor is the magazine's readiness

154 See Wellesley Index, II(1972), 343.
155 For specific instances of such distortions compare the differing versions of the relevant passages in the review in Fraser's Magazine, 10(1834), 1-10 (pp.5, 6, 6) and in James Hogg, A Series of Lay Sermons on Good Principles and Good Breeding (London, 1834), pp.32, 34, 205.
to make allowances on occasion for what many contemporaries saw as
coarseness or indelicacy in Hogg's work. Besides the fact that a
magazine need not be so cautious in such matters as other types of
periodical, Fraser's Magazine was prepared on one occasion to state
boldly that Hogg 'was a moral man and a Christian; but his
morality was no more affectation than his religion was cant', and to
defend his plain speaking at length. There is little indication
of what Hogg was paid for his contributions, for the magazine's
archives apparently no longer exist and the surviving correspondence
between Hogg and James Fraser consists of a mere five letters. The
letters Hogg wrote to his wife from London in 1832 record a payment
of ten pounds from Fraser, and a subsequent ten pound payment may
also be Fraser's, but Hogg does not mention the articles that these
represented. It seems probable that Fraser's Magazine would
emulate the payments of its Edinburgh model, and perhaps pay a
little higher to secure the services of Maga's contributors. For
the same reasons it cannot be known how far the London magazine
altered or rejected Hogg's tales. There are indications, however,
that this magazine printed fiction which had been previously
rejected by William Blackwood or by the editors of the Annuals,
which suggests it was in some respects more catholic than either.
Pringle writes that his publisher and literary friend did not

156 'Literary Characters. — By Pierce Pungent. No. I. James
Hogg', Fraser's Magazine, 1(1830), 291-300 (p.300); 'The
Ettrick Shepherd's Last Tale. Helen Crocket', Fraser's
157 Hogg to Margaret Hogg, 21 January and 17 February 1832, in
Memorials, pp.251 and 257 respectively.
consider one prose tale Hogg had sent him suitable for the
Friendship's Offering; he writes, 'its humour, they say, was too
broad. So I sent the MS., agreeably to your instructions, to
Fraser, where it was printed long ago. I sent Fraser at the same
time all that I had from Allan Cunningham, as you directed me to
do'. These contributions were presumably too long or too
outspoken for the Annuals, so that in publishing at least some of
them the magazine was performing a real service to Hogg as a writer.
Blackwood's correspondence with Hogg reveals the fact that of the
tales printed in Fraser's Magazine at least four had previously been
offered to him. There are no suggestions in the letters as to the
reasons for Blackwood's rejection of 'Strange Letter of a Lunatic'
or of 'Ewan M' Gabhar'. From Blackwood's remarks on 'A
Remarkable Egyptian Story', however, it is possible to guess that
he did not think it was of low literary quality, but was anxious
that his readers might object to its treatment of sexual matters.
He wrote that although he liked it very much in many respects he
feared it would not please, and added that he had thought it might
be inserted in the magazine if revised by Hogg's nephew.
Robert Hogg had excised indelicate passages from Hogg's previous

158 Pringle to Hogg, 1 June 1831, in Memorials, p.225.
160 'A Remarkable Egyptian Story', Fraser's Magazine, 7(1833), 147-58; the original was returned with a letter from Blackwood to Hogg, 11 October 1828, in NLS Acc. 5643, vol. 88, pp.71-73.
work for Blackwood, and it is probable that Blackwood was thinking he would do the same for this tale, which relates the Joseph-like rise to power in Egypt of Bela the Hebrew; involved with his rise by means of his gift of prophecy is that of his beautiful daughter, Ada, who, resisting the enemy prince Abdallah's attempts to force her and the Egyptian prince Aperias's attempts to bribe her compliance, retains her virginity and eventually becomes Queen of Egypt. 'On the Separate Existence of the Soul' was rejected by Blackwood because he thought the religious readers of his magazine might object to it as doctrinally unorthodox, 'for to speak seriously which the good folk would do, it is directly in the teeth of revelation to permit the soul to exist separately for one moment without at once having its eternal state fixed'.

London might allow greater freedom in religious matters than Edinburgh, but still Fraser's Magazine showed itself more receptive to certain areas of Hogg's work than Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine as well as more receptive than the Annuals. With this in mind, it might be supposed that Fraser's Magazine gradually superseded the Edinburgh publication as the most important outlet for Hogg's fiction in the last years of his life. From the commencement of the magazine in February 1830 thirteen of Hogg's tales were printed there, excluding the more disjointed and anecdotal 'A Very Ridiculous Sermon'; in the same period only six tales appeared in Blackwood's Edinburgh

Magazine, if the discursive 'A Screed on Politics' is excluded. However, in Hogg's opinion it would seem that the old magazine may have retained its superiority as an outlet for his work, at least for a time. In June 1831 he expressed to Blackwood the frustration he felt at his articles being rejected, declaring, 'I fear it is needless for me to attempt any thing farther for Maga without giving up writing for the London Magazines which I would with great pleasure do could I please you'. Hogg seems to have felt he was particularly successful when he attempted to write for Blackwood, for in the same letter he remarks of his pieces, 'Those I write for you are always best received [sic]'. Hogg evidently liked to write within the context of a specific periodical work, and Blackwood for years provided Hogg with a monthly copy of his magazine. In the case of Fraser's Magazine the difficulties of a free communication over an increased distance at first prevented him from receiving the necessary copies of the work. In exasperation he wrote to Blackwood in the autumn of 1830, 'You are surely keeping up Fraser's Mag. I have received none since No 1'. Not only could Hogg be sure of receiving the Edinburgh periodical more regularly, but on his frequent visits to the city he could make an arrangement or discuss an idea person to person. If this ready and convenient communication with Blackwood had not diminished during these last years perhaps Fraser's Magazine would not have received so many more of his tales. Before Hogg's quarrel

162 Hogg to Blackwood, 29 June 1831, in NLS MS 4029, f.255.
163 Hogg to Blackwood, 30 September 1830, in NLS MS 4027, f.194.
with Blackwood, he was complaining of the magazine's rejections of his work, and yet slightly more tales were printed there between February 1830 and the end of 1831 than in the new magazine during the same period. The importance of Fraser's Magazine to Hogg's fiction in these last years may well be a consequence of the recent deficiencies of the nearer and accustomary Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine as well as of its own character.

The gains and losses of a writer of fiction in moving from one publisher to another can be considerable. Gordon has shown, for example, how Galt's success with his separately published volumes of fiction was curiously dependent on the luck he had with his publishers. It may be supposed that the new medium of Fraser's Magazine had an effect on Hogg's fiction, in allowing him to publish tales that had been deemed unsuitable elsewhere, as well as perhaps in fostering and discouraging certain aspects of his work. On the negative side, the magazine published tales which were simply insufficiently revised and which, one feels, Hogg would have been asked to go over again by William Blackwood. In 'The Turners' there are discrepancies between the information Hogg gives his reader in one part of the tale and in another. For example, Maysie in discussing Auntie Margaret's financial independence when her allowance is so seldom paid her remarks that 'it is thought that the unhealthy lad that boards wi' her supports her gayan well'; later, when the mysterious stranger applies to lodge with her, though,

164 This topic is a significant theme in Ian A. Gordon, John Galt: The Life of a Writer (Edinburgh, 1972).
Auntie Margaret tells him that 'she never had taken in any boarders, and never intended doing so'. The succession to the Hollinshaw estate, which allows William at the end of the tale to discount the claims his predecessor had given the rascally attorney Evans on the property, is explained in a confusing way in two separate portions of the tale, and altogether, though the tale is an interesting one, it bears marks of being insufficiently revised and corrected. A more critical publisher or editor, or even more adequate discussion of Hogg's fiction within the magazine, might have encouraged Hogg to avoid such carelessness. Hogg's essential loneliness in writing his fiction for the magazine is also perhaps partly responsible for his failure to achieve unity of tone in a tale like 'The Mountain-Dew Men'. The moral muddle of the contradictory lights in which the narrator presents the actions of the characters makes this tale too seem insufficiently thought-out and indeed something of an artistic muddle. The course of its events shows the harm done to Turner by the presence of an illicit distillery on his farm. He has foolishly had too much to drink when he goes out in a snow-storm to rescue his sheep, and the smugglers, their intellects and moral perceptions disordered by their own whisky, are careless of his fate and eventually suffer him to perish in the snow, while his anxious wife is left alone in the farmhouse with her children, not knowing whether her husband is dead or alive. At times Hogg points this meaning clearly, writing of Jock and John,
the mountain-dew men, that 'they were just in a state that they
cared not what they did. They would readily have done a good or
kind turn, if it had come in their way, but they would just as
readily have done a foolish or wicked one. They little thought all
this while of the agony of poor Lizzie'. In then treating the
drunken maudlin grief of these men when they finally dig out
Turner's corpse as merely an entertaining spectacle for himself and
the reader to relish, Hogg betrays the earlier voice of moral
discrimination underpinning his narrative. The end of the tale is
also incongruous, with the maid Jane, who seemed earlier so
sensible of the men's wrongdoing in leaving the unconscious Turner
buried in the snow, marrying one of the smugglers and Turner's widow
the other, so that they are able to keep their distillery going.
Hogg, if he had made his narrator's attitude more consistent, could
have told his tale as an illustration of the absence of the
sentimentalist's heroic virtue among his characters, and stressed
their constant living by expedient and the present moment; this is
a feasible alternative to the more obvious point of his narrative
about the evils arising from the illicit distillery. As it stands
the narrator shifts his viewpoint as much as any of the characters
and leaves the reader rather confused as to his final intentions for
the tale. The failure of an adequate criticism either in the
magazine itself or from the editor or publisher of it may account
for the appearance of a tale such as 'The Frasers in the Correi', an

166 'The Mountain-Dew Men', Fraser's Magazine, 6(1832), 161-70 (p.168).
attempt to create a comic Highlander tale from the antiquarian material he had used years before. The verses with which the tale concludes had previously been used in the second of his volumes of Jacobite songs. The result is a mixture of historical scraps about the clan Fraser and amusing instances of the comical and thick-headed fearlessness of Ewan Sorb. Two disparate myths about the character of the Highlander exist in the tale, for Ewan represents the comic figure of the eighteenth-century anecdote or play, and his master and the intruding Campbell the loyal, haughty but heroic Highlander of a more recent date.

It might be supposed that in writing for Fraser's Magazine Hogg would miss Blackwood's old interest in a decidedly Scottish rural fiction, and in writing for London would feel it was less acceptable to write in Scots, if not (after the success of Scott's novels) about Scottish subjects. 'The Barber of Duncow — A Real Ghost Story' is, however, as Gifford indicates, 'one of Hogg's finest extended pieces of Scots'. Hogg uses the fact that every tale is a personal or communal interpretation of events to hide his own personality as the teller in that of the old tinkler's wife, Raighel. This protects him from possible charges of credulity, allows him to use a more dense Scots in narration as well as dialogue, and provides him with the means of teasing and tricking

---


the reader in exploiting the relationship between himself and her. The effect of the tale is to create a series of parallels between the magazine readers and the fireside listeners to Raighel, both tellers making use of the dependance of the tale on the limits set for it by the teller. The apparently sceptical Hobby is in reality prepared to hear a ghost story, while the less superstitious magazine reader, in perusing a tale with such a title, tacitly agrees to suspend his scepticism for the time and also anticipates the appearance of a ghost. Both tellers then use this expectation to tease their audience, by presenting a false ghost before the appearance of the true one. Bess the blinker, intending a practical joke on the Cameronian wife, pretends to be such a spiritual messenger to Grizel, though the reader does not know this until later. The language of the pretended ghost is rather rough and homely for its attempted elevated and Scriptural style, when on being conjured to speak it answers with the words "Blest be the tongue that axes the question ... for it has gien me liberty to speak my yirrant" (p. 176), so that Hogg does provide the reader with sufficient evidence to arouse his dormant scepticism. However, the gipsy girl's rough and pithy approximation of the religious ideas and expressions she has often heard but which are foreign to her own character and habits is very similar to that of Hogg's narrator Raighel, who speaks earlier of the Covenanters as 'thee auld world fo'ks, that grane, an' whine, an' preach i' tents' (p. 174). The reader, expecting a ghost, puts the rough expressions used by Bess down to the transmission of the tale through Raighel's mouth, and believes in a ghost readily where Hogg does not even ask him to. Within the tale the barber and May Fiddes also play on Grizel's
superstitious feelings when they dress up as witches to give her a fright. Raighel plays an artful game with Hobby, full of devices to create fear and comic anti-climaxes, strengthened by her strategically-placed warnings about the ghost's appearance. Hogg participates, in presenting his magazine reader with a comic tale, full of jokes and horseplay on the part of both his characters and his narrator; it is a real ghost story, but Hogg also artfully manipulates his reader's pleasure in being properly frightened, and teases the sophisticated for their gullibility under the disguise of the teller of an old-fashioned ghost story. His necessary pose of naive story-teller must have been especially effective in the context of the presentation of James Hogg in the magazine. Besides this fine example of his writing in Scots, Hogg also printed in Fraser's Magazine tales which explain Scottish customs and beliefs, or portray the reaction of members of an old-fashioned community towards strange events. This explanatory role may even have been emphasised rather than diminished by the removal from Edinburgh to London. In relating the two supernatural occurrences of 'Anecdotes of Ghosts and Apparitions' Hogg declares at one point, 'I like always best to tell a story with which I was some way connected, for in that case a man writes with more freedom and certainty'. Hogg claims to have been an intimate friend of the hero of the first story, and to have discovered the body of one of the two principal characters of the second, besides formerly knowing both of them.

slightly. Hogg's personal involvement with the characters of his tale is intended to win the reader's confidence in his knowledge, and through the figure of his younger self he can relate more directly the way in which the people of the community he describes interpret what takes place. In the first tale, for instance, the conversation between David and the younger Hogg shows their agreement as to the significance of Phemie's appearances, and so tells the reader how he should interpret them (p. 106). In 'The Unearthly Witness' the interpretative personality is not that of the author, but an Episcopal clergyman who narrates the story in a letter to a clerical brother. Walker is useful for he addresses an outsider as Hogg addresses the reader of the magazine. He is also a member of the community he describes without unreservedly identifying his opinions with those of either the gentry or the common people. For example, he relates that the gentry respected William Tibbers as a useful and clever man of business, and that the people detested him as deceitful, selfish, and unscrupulous. The people accused Tibbers of dreadful though unspecified crimes, which Walker moderately says may have been the result of the violence of their prejudice against him. Having proved himself a judicious, fair-minded man, his own experience carries more weight with the reader when he says that he knows one thing, 'and there is no worse mark of a man — he was abhorred by his servants'.

170 Walker's strongly marked personality adds to the mystery of the tale he

170 'The Unearthly Witness', Fraser's Magazine, 2(1830-1831), 171-78 (p. 171).
tells even while it guides the reader in interpreting it. His obvious credibility as a narrator and his refusal to relate more than he knows to be true or can repeat on the authority of another person makes a distinction between the lost events themselves and the known public observation and recollection of them. Referring to a gap in his narrative as a missing passage in an old ballad he says, 'My narrative must grow confused, because the real events are not known to me, nor, as far as I can gather, to mortal man' (p. 172). The partial knowledge of the community and the narrator is contrasted by him with the full knowledge of God, 'whose eye never either slumbers or sleeps', and whose hand 'was manifestly extended to punish William Tibbers', though for what crimes Walker dares not infer (p. 174). The form of the tale is thus ordered and satisfying while the connections between events remain hidden from the community and the reader. Tibbers's crimes are all the more dreadful in imagination for never being named and never treated except in their effects on the chief persons of the tale. Often scenes are told from the viewpoint of an observer in a crowd, who marks gestures and expression without hearing what the chief actors say to one another. Twenty people witness the young baronet's triumph and Tibbers's horrified mental and physical collapse, though none hears the words that were whispered. The subsequent bargaining between the two takes place in the sight of hundreds in the town on market-day, but none of the details of it are known (p. 173). Even the appearance of Tibbers in court at the end of the tale dispels neither the inexorable logic of the tale nor its haunting atmosphere of brooding uncertainty and watchfulness. Through his narrator Hogg is able to focus the reader's attention on
the community of the town itself during the process of interpreting a series of strange events, and this accounts for its peculiar and successful atmosphere.

As unusual is Hogg's 'Extraordinary History of a Border Beauty', which tackles in a picaresque style material he deals with elsewhere in a sentimental one. The story is told in the first person by a middle-aged or elderly woman, who recalls the incidents of her youth in a frank and curiously revealing tone, rather laughing at her past follies and embarrassments than repenting of them. She explains her reason, as a wealthy lady with a social position to maintain, for telling such anecdotes of herself to the public, saying, 'I had a longing for notoriety, which I could not resist; and the circumstance of my writing this letter to you is a proof that it remains in my nature to this day'. 171 This character allows her to describe feelings that it would be improper for a more conventional, sentimental heroine either to feel or to mention, when she is attacked by the wiles of various seducers. Mary is not a wicked or heartless girl, for she returns her doting father's affection, and, as her cousin's Aunt Gibbs herself says, nurses that old lady with more kindness and anxiety than she had ever met with from any of her own family (p.105). However, she can laugh rather than avert her eyes when her would-be seducer flees half-naked over a dunghill at Leicester to escape a horse-whipping, and can take the precaution of leaving a door open and peeping out when she wants

to hear an interesting conversation (p.108). She is also frank about the mixture of gratified vanity and sexual feeling that leads her into error: when she learns that Henry has taken her to a brothel instead of to his mother's house as he pretended she says, 'Even his behaviour to me in his pretended mother's house rather endeared him to me than otherwise; it being all out of sheer love for my person, which had put him beside himself, so that he did not know what he was doing' (p.102). The frankness and irony of the older woman also permit Hogg to voice his criticisms of the contemporary education given to young ladies. In his book of sermons of 1834 Hogg attacked the superficiality of such an education in aiming more at command of temper and the power of pleasing than at solid improvement of the understanding, and recommended an intelligent scheme of Bible study. 172 Mary's education consists principally of showy accomplishments and housewifery, without her being given substantial information, nor, most essentially to a man of Hogg's upbringing, proper instruction in her religious and moral duties. She reads the Bible very indifferently, and would prefer a more polite list of names to those of its heroes, 'a set of old, ignorant, vulgar rascals who lived five thousand years ago'. She even refuses to read parts of her Bible altogether, 'on account of their indelicacy, that having become a fashionable phrase at that period' (p.97). Her errors are seen by her older self as a result of her having been brought up as a beauty, and her mind stored with vanity and romance (p.110). Her

unsentimental characterisation permits this self-analysis to be worked out thoroughly, in a way that would not have been possible within the context of a more fastidious and delicate periodical such as an Annual.

In Fraser's Magazine Hogg seems to have felt free to include in his tales elements more directly advocating the Tory policies of the periodical, in a way that he did not seem to do in his work in fiction for Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine. Artistically, this is more successful the more unobtrusively it is done. In 'On the Separate Existence of the Soul', for example, which had previously been offered to William Blackwood, the new agricultural ideas and modern scepticism of the young laird are set against the traditional life-style and faith of the elderly shepherd Robin Robson. Robin is triumphant because both politically and spiritually the universe described in the fiction does indeed accord with his principles. A miraculous transposition of their souls proves the truth of Robin's religious tenets, while the law of the land also supports his retention of the Gillian Brae estate, deprecating the attempts of a person who seems to be an old shepherd to gain control of 'a gentleman's property ... which had descended to him through a long line of ancestors'.173 In 'The Ettrick Shepherd's Last Tale. Helen Crocket', however, an attack on Catholics in accordance with the general atmosphere of Church-and-State Toryism in the magazine is used merely as a means of joining together two separate tales,

the comic one of the practical jokes of the two old crones upon their country neighbours and the mysterious story of seduced Helen's killing of her lover and escape from the law. The tale opens with Eppy wondering to Nans what has become of Helen Crocket, and that is all the reader hears of the girl who gives her name to the story for about half its length, when she is abruptly reintroduced in this way: 'At the very time of this dialogue, who should enter the two old women's cot but Helen Crocket, the girl whom I mentioned at the beginning of this tale'. Apart from this crude device the plots are linked only by Eppy's possession of unearthly powers, and by abuse of Roman Catholicism. Nans begins this with a long string of Biblical references interpreted by her as texts denouncing popery, which she equates also with witchcraft. She also refers to Ireland, asking Eppy rhetorically if that can be a good religion which leads to such ignorance and cruelty (pp.430-31). At this point Eppy professes her indifference to the Protestant zeal of Nans, declaring that she is not a Christian of any denomination; later, however, she is shocked at the lack of modesty Helen shows in intending to confess to the priest every one of her sins with her lover, and urges her not to confess and then elope with Murphy, but to stand her ground at home and 'face the world, the minister, the kirk, an' the session' (pp.431, 436-37). No real understanding of Catholicism is shown in the tale, while the attack upon it makes Eppy seem inconsistent. In addition, this political strand is

insufficiently woven into the material itself to unite what would have been much better told in two distinct parts for the comic and the wonderful use of Eppy 's powers, in the same manner as Hogg's 'A Story of the Black Art'.

Despite some failings, however, Fraser's Magazine was evidently a more suitable periodical market for Hogg's fiction in his later years than any of his other alternatives. He was almost certainly paid well for his work, and he was less restricted in tone and subject-matter than when he wrote for either the Annuals or for Chambers's Edinburgh Journal. Here he found a magazine less fastidious about his treatment of religious or sexual material than either the Annuals or the more recent Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine. This enabled him to print work of literary value that had been rejected by these periodicals on other grounds, and also must have encouraged the more ironic, humorous, and racy side of his work.

Nor did he have to abandon his use of Scots or treatment of Scottish subjects in writing for the London market, for Scott's success had given these an appeal, and the increased distance may possibly even have emphasised Hogg's explanatory role. Fraser's Magazine, though, shows signs of having been less critical of Hogg's fiction in a positive sense than William Blackwood had been, through the presence in the magazine of fiction by Hogg which contained over-crude political elements or was insufficiently written over and revised. Its attractiveness and usefulness to Hogg was probably

due as much as anything to the fact that it was indeed a later alternative to the Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine of the 1820s, being in some respects intentionally designed as its replacement.
CONCLUSIONS

An understanding of the periodical context of Hogg's work is shown to be necessary to gain a true appreciation of the shape of his career and to see what the real pressures he experienced as a writer of fiction were.

A commonly-held opinion has it that it was unfortunate that Hogg was financially dependent upon his work for contemporary periodicals. It is true that Hogg became dependent upon his periodical work during the 1820s and 1830s, partly as a result of publishing conditions and partly because of his personal temperament and circumstances, but his early work for the Scots Magazine and his later contributions to the Edinburgh Literary Journal, both of which were almost certainly unpaid, show that writing within a periodical context had other attractions for Hogg than the welcome payments he received. Throughout his life Hogg was attracted by the idea of membership of a band of literary brethren, and a feeling of literary intimacy was important to him as a writer.

Hogg's career as a writer spanned a period of rapid and important development in the nature and variety of British periodicals: at one end of it he was writing in the Scots Magazine under the generally amateur conditions characteristic of the eighteenth century, while at the other, in writing for Chambers's Edinburgh Journal, he was brought into contact as an established
writer with the movement towards a popular literature, with its emphasis on a great circulation and wholesomeness of tone. In tracing any pattern in Hogg's writing of fiction these developments should be taken into account, for they demonstrate among other things his versatility and invention. Hogg's relatively late turning to fiction is probably not unconnected with the fact that, until the success of Scott, publishers were not eager to publish Scottish fiction, while, until Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine altered the economic situation, magazine fiction was neither prestigious nor financially viable. Similarly, the assumption that Hogg's fiction of the last years of his life is of poorer quality than his work of the 1820s needs to be placed within the context of publishing conditions and the periodical market, which presented a number of alternatives to Hogg each of which was less satisfactory for his work than Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine had been during the earlier period. Analysis of the precise difficulties of Hogg's working conditions only deepens critical appreciation of his powers.

In some cases the influence of the periodical market did deform Hogg's fiction by making him cater to the taste of the day, yet this statement alone is hardly a fair representation of its effect upon his work. It ignores the considerable continuity between the tales that appeared in periodicals, such as The Spy and Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, and the two most successful of Hogg's separately published collections of his shorter fiction, Winter Evening Tales, collected among the Cottagers in the South of Scotland (1820) and The Shepherd's Calendar (1829). In addition, Hogg developed his confidence in the informal narrator who is so crucial to the success of his fiction within the framework of the
periodicals. The movement in Hogg's writing career in prose from the formal to the colloquial accompanies the changing expectations and form of contemporary periodicals.

Within the periodical context, as outside it, a detailed examination of Hogg's work shows that his self-presentation as an uneducated peasant poet and natural genius should not blind the reader to that awareness of, and indeed familiarity with, formal literary conventions of which it is itself a proof. In particular, Hogg's familiarity with the classic literature of the eighteenth century, substantially acquired during his years at Blackhouse, is demonstrated in his work for The Spy. In this periodical he gently ridiculed the conventions of sentimental fiction, and created an individual and personalised variation on the dominant themes of the essay-periodical tradition originating in the Spectator.

Finally, in their reviews the periodicals give another indication of the real pressures on Hogg's work in fiction by showing how his volume publications offended or pleased contemporary sensibilities. As the discussion in the body of this study of Hogg's fiction and the periodicals has proved relevant to some of his separately published works as well as to the fiction published within the periodicals themselves, so in the appendix to it reviews of his separate publications reveal that in some respects the pressures that existed there were the same ones Hogg had been obliged to encounter in his periodical fiction. Contemporary reviews and Hogg's practice in writing for the periodicals both reveal the presence of an occasional watchfulness over his use of
superstition and the supernatural, and that he was suspected of offending against religious as against sexual standards of propriety. The appendix also confirms in its discussion of contemporary reviews that Hogg was sometimes specifically associated with Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine and what was known as the Edinburgh school of novelists. An account of the sales of the separate volumes of Hogg's fiction confirms the contention of the thesis that after periodical fiction began to be paid for adequately the magazines probably served Hogg better financially than his separate publications. And what finer tribute could there be to Hogg's matchless powers as a story-teller of both magazine and separately-published fiction than the surviving confessions of contemporary readers who found, despite the disgust inspired by their prejudices of taste and education, that they could not lay aside one or other of his stories until they had read to the end of it?
APPENDIX: THE CONTEMPORARY RECEPTION OF HOGG'S FICTION

The contemporary reception of Hogg's work has been analysed very slightly indeed by his modern critics, although his reputation in his own day as a writer both of volume and of magazine literature is of crucial and self-evident importance to any discussion of his literary development. The sales of his work, the opinions of both critics and other creative writers of it, were probably of far more importance to Hogg than he cared to admit openly. Several of his letters as well as his published memoir mention reviews of his poetry, despite his frequently expressed contempt for reviews and reviewers.¹ Of the earlier studies of his work, Batho's specifically excludes 'unimportant contemporary reviews' from its list of authorities, and mentions only a few reviews of the poetry or accounts of the poet's early life, giving no account of the contemporary reception of his fiction.² Simpson mentions comments by creative writers of Hogg's own day upon his work to show that he was considered by them to be a writer of power and originality, and adds that most of the comments

¹ Contrast, for example, his mention of reviews in his Memoir of the Author's Life and Familiar Anecdotes of Sir Walter Scott, edited by Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh and London, 1972), pp. 26-27, 36, 41, 50, and 103, with his advice to all young men of imagination 'never to read a work of criticism, ancient or modern', in his A Series of Lay Sermons on Good Principles and Good Breeding (London, 1834), p. 281.

that exist altogether on Hogg deal with his verse. This is reasonable enough, but on at least one occasion Simpson ventures an unsubstantiated comment on the contemporary reception of one of Hogg's works of prose fiction, saying that 'The Brownie of Bodsbeck was a popular novel in its day'.\(^3\) In fact it did not sell well, for at the end of 1821, three years after publication, Blackwood wrote to Hogg that Murray had about a hundred or a hundred and fifty copies of the work remaining, and that he himself had sold off his remaining copies at a trade sale in October of that year for about the cost of the paper and printing charges for them, a sign that the sale of the edition of fifteen hundred copies was considered to have virtually ceased.\(^4\)

Gifford tends to concentrate in his study upon the reception of Hogg's fiction in *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* alone. Doubtless Hogg's personal connections with this magazine and its conductors would make comment there especially important to him, but even a brief account of the wider critical approach to Hogg's fiction would be helpful when one of the chief arguments of this study is that in Hogg's later years his critics, though they could not destroy him as a creative writer, did 'distort his work completely'.\(^5\) I therefore make no apology for including as an appendix to this study of Hogg's fiction and periodicals a brief account of the contemporary reception of the fiction, partly compiled by means of reviews and comments in periodicals of the

---

time, and partly by means of what may be deduced as to the sale of his fiction.

The popularity and critical reputation of that part of Hogg's fiction which appeared in or was written for various periodicals is necessarily the most difficult to estimate. A periodical sells on the general quality of each number, and that of successive numbers, and not usually on the articles of one contributor. Apparently the large circulation of some of the periodicals in which Hogg's tales appeared would suggest that these reached a larger audience than those of his volume fiction: the sale of Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine has been estimated as six thousand five hundred copies in 1828, rising to over eight thousand in 1831,\(^6\) while a usual edition of Hogg's volume fiction was probably only about fifteen hundred copies. However, as the circulating libraries would probably buy the volume fiction Hogg's readers in this case would be often many more than his purchasers. Also in the case of a volume publication, the tales of which had previously appeared separately in periodicals in part, it is impossible to determine the effect of this, whether positive or discouraging upon the volume sales. It may be stated more positively that contemporaries such as David Vedder plainly remembered Hogg's tales from their appearance in the magazines.\(^7\) Moir, too, in his letters to Blackwood during this period, commented on the suitability of Hogg's tales for the publisher's magazine, though clearly he preferred the


\(^7\) See Chapter Three, page 115.
poems and songs to them. The theme of many of his comments is the absurdity and inconsistency of many of the tales, combined with an honest recognition of their freshness and originality, and of Hogg's obvious, natural powers as a teller of tales. Writing of one early paper in the magazine, Moir declares, 'See where Campbell or the London could find its match'; despite evident faults, then, Moir considered at least one of Hogg's shorter tales as excelling the articles of the same kind in the magazine's chief London rivals. He admitted to the publisher his preference for literature of taste over literature of power without taste, and this would tend to prejudice his judgement against Hogg's productions, yet he honestly confesses their compulsive power. Moir wrote of one tale, 'We read and smile, and say this will never do — and yet read on — and when we come to the end, say well done Hogg, and are pleased in spite of our teeth'.

A further indication of the reputation of Hogg's magazine fiction in his own lifetime is the fact that a number of these tales, as well as others from his separately published collections, were reprinted by less important periodicals, presumably without permission, to add to the interest of their pages. An unpopular writer would hardly have been worth pirating, surely. More of this sort of reprint now seems to exist from the shorter tales once they had been collected up into volumes than from their original periodical appearances; that less reprintings from other periodicals exist, however, may be accounted for without assuming that the volumes were

---

8 Moir to Blackwood, 19 February [1824], in NLS MS 4012, f.340.
9 Moir to Blackwood, 9 April [1823], in NLS MS 4011, f.80; Moir to Blackwood, 26 September 1828, in NLS MS 4022, f.160.
necessarily the more popular. Less instances survive, certainly, but then the less reputable magazines in the early nineteenth century would be more likely to take their material directly from other magazines, especially widely-circulated ones, and the less reputable magazines would be less likely themselves to be collected up and bound, to survive into the present century. As a single instance of this type of reprinting of a Hogg tale from one periodical into another, however, it may be noted that 'The Brownie of the Black Haggs', which first appeared in Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine for October 1828, was reprinted in Philadelphia in the same year. 10

Surviving evidence of the probable sale of Hogg's volume fiction makes its popularity a little easier to estimate. His best-selling separate work of fiction appears to have been the collection of shorter tales Winter Evening Tales, collected among the Cottagers in the South of Scotland (1820), for he wrote to William Blackwood that 'Oliver & Boyd [sic] have sold 1500 copies of my tales in five months and have already given me a letter for the price of the next edition'. 11 Initial sales of the collection which he had planned as the first volume of his collected prose fiction may also have promised well — partly, one suspects, because of the recent publicity given to Hogg himself and to the work through his recent visit to London, and supported by an introductory account of his life in the volume itself. The publisher of the volume became bankrupt shortly after its publication, which makes it difficult

10 See Andrew Hook, Scotland and America: A Study of Cultural Relations 1750-1835 (Glasgow and London, 1975), note 123 on page 172.
11 Hogg to Blackwood, 20 November 1820, in NLS MS 4005, f.169.
to assess its real popularity; on the one hand Hogg had difficulty in finding another publisher for the series, but on the other his terms may have been too high and his affairs perhaps injured by publicity connecting him with the bankruptcy; Cochrane himself said that 'it is in the very nature of the Trade to look with coldness & neglect upon every Author whose affairs are thus thrust upon their notice'.

It is likewise only possible to guess at the popularity of *The Three Perils of Man; or, War, Women, and Witchcraft*, *A Border Romance* (1822) and *The Three Perils of Woman; or, Love, Leasing, and Jealousy*, *A Series of Domestic Scottish Tales* (1823). Probably the sale of these works was adequate to the publisher's expectations, for the firm of Longman's was willing to deal subsequently with Hogg for another work of fiction; yet neither of the works reached a second edition in Hogg's own lifetime.

Apart from these doubtful cases and the success already mentioned it seems probable that none of Hogg's volumes of prose fiction sold at all well. Blackwood sold off the remainder of his share of the fifteen hundred copies of the first edition of *The Brownie of Bodseck; and other Tales* (1818) for about the price of its paper and printing in October 1821, showing that the sale of it had virtually ceased by that time.

*The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner* (1824), now probably considered his best longer work in prose, would seem to have fared even worse, for by September 1826 the share of the profits due to Hogg probably

12 Cochrane to Hogg, 10 December 1832, in NLS MS 2245, p.216.
amounted to only about two pounds; his excellent collection of shorter prose, *The Shepherd's Calendar* (1829), fared no better, and apparently Hogg never received a payment for either work, for as late as 1833 this forms a part of his denunciation of William Blackwood. Hogg tells Grieve to 'ask him if ever he gave me a farthing ... for the Justified Sinner ... for the Shepherd's Calender'. Perhaps by the time the latter work was under consideration for separate publication Hogg himself hardly expected his prose to sell very extensively, for he wrote that 'the circulating libraries ... will be almost the sole purchasers of the work'. The sale of his last work of fiction was also small, for though *Tales of the Wars of Montrose* was probably only published in February 1835, by June of the same year the publisher was writing 'I have sold about 300 copies & there it sticks — Sam [?] writes me that the sale has been very poor in Scotland'. In terms of sales therefore, only one of Hogg's separately published works of prose fiction can certainly be called really popular.

An author may, however, have a reputation among literary men and among other writers without his works selling extensively. This was very much the case with Wordsworth during the period under discussion. Simpson has shown that important writers and poets of Hogg's own day commented favourably on the man and his work, and

15 Hogg to Grieve, 16 March 1833, in NLS MS 4036, f.100.
16 Hogg to Blackwood, 12 February 1828, in NLS MS 4021, f.275.
17 Cochrane to Hogg, 18 June 1835, in NLS MS 2245, f.262.
contemporary reviews of the various works reveal more about Hogg's reputation as a writer of fiction among literary men. Two general discussions exist of the contemporary reception of Hogg's work in Germany and in America, and each of these has some mention of reviews. Reviews of Hogg's fiction in contemporary British periodicals are of primary interest however in assessing his reputation, and lists of these and of reviews of Hogg's poetical works up to 1826 may be found in two compilations by Ward. Those reviews mentioned by Ward and available in Great Britain of the various separately published works of fiction have been examined, to assess Hogg's reputation as a fiction-writer and the comparative reputation of the works themselves. In addition to these, I have attempted to include reviews of the works of fiction published after 1826, and those articles not mentioned by Ward which include comment on Hogg's powers as a tale-writer or analysis of a particular work or works of his fiction; these articles are listed at the end of this appendix, with comments where necessary upon their content.

Hogg believed that with his first volume publication of fiction, The Brownie of Bodsbeck; and other Tales (1818), he 'suffered


unjustly in the eyes of the world with regard to that tale, which was looked on as an imitation of the tale of "Old Mortality", and a counterpart to that' (Memoir, p. 44). 21 The novel was indeed judged in the context of Scott's masterpiece, and therefore politically, as a Whig answer to what was viewed as partly an exercise in Tory propaganda. The Scotsman championed the novel thus, praising it for revealing the government before 1688 'in all its native deformity', and making comparisons between old and new European persecutions of subjects' freedom of conscience. Scott's portrait of the times is 'distinguished for striking lights and vigorous outlines', where Hogg's besides a characteristically national sweetness and amenity displays 'all the minuteness and fidelity of the Dutch masters'. 22 The Clydesdale Magazine, assuming the same object in Hogg, remarked that the novel in fact did nothing to defend the Covenanters from the supposed attacks of the Unknown, and that Davie Tait's prayer was calculated to scandalise the godly and hold their forefathers up to ridicule. 23 Only the British Critic concentrated in the first place upon literary qualities, mentioning the model of Scott as having a deleterious effect in this respect and advising Hogg to write instead of this sort of fiction 'a series of tales, illustrating the manners and scenery of his country, as they exist at present, and have come under his own observation'. 24

21 The abbreviation Memoir is listed before the text, and will be used throughout this study, for James Hogg, Memoir of the Author's Life and Familiar Anecdotes of Sir Walter Scott, edited by Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh and London, 1972).
22 Anonymous review in The Scotsman, 16 May 1818, pp. 158-59 (p. 159).
23 Anonymous review in Clydesdale Magazine, 1(1818), 75-78, 121-25 (p. 125).
24 Anonymous review in British Critic, 10(1818), 403-18 (p. 418).
tales were more generally approved of, even the magical and fantastic 'The Hunt of Eildon' surprisingly.

Hogg also comments interestingly in the Memoir on his next work of fiction. His claim that 'The Bridal of Polmood', in this collection, 'has been acknowledged by all who have read it as the most finished and best written tale that I ever produced' (Memoir, p.45) may be an exaggeration, but it is not so entirely without any foundation as it might at first appear to be. The British Critic thought it one of the best tales of the collection, and so evidently did the London Magazine, while The Scotsman said that 'the Bridal of Polmood, which should have been placed at the head of the work, might, with a few corrections, and a little retrenchment, been [sic] rendered an almost perfect tale'.25 Hogg also defends himself from accusations of indelicacy brought against the Winter Evening Tales, and this is the latest of his publications of fiction to be so publicly defended.26 He begins by stating that the greater part of the tales were composed during his early life as a shepherd, and then proceeds both to support them on the ground of their authenticity, and to excuse them on the ground of his own ignorance of the world. He claims to have altered nothing in these early tales, saying 'they appeared not only more characteristic of the life that I then led, but also of the manners that I was

25 Anonymous reviews in the British Critic, 13(1820), 622-31 (p.624), in the London Magazine, 7(1820), 666-71 (p.669), and in The Scotsman, 29 April 1820, pp.143-44 (p.143).

26 The abbreviation Winter Evening Tales is listed before the text, and will be used throughout this study, for James Hogg, Winter Evening Tales, collected among the Cottagers in the South of Scotland, 2 vols (Edinburgh and London, 1820).
describing', adding that he never thought of the indelicacies that some reviewers hinted at, and that it is wrong to look for these 'without calculating on what is natural for the characters' with whom the reader is conversing (Memoir, p.50). He excuses any harm in the tales as the unintentional effect of his ignorance of the world, then. The contemporary reviews were generally more favourable to the collection than this defence might suggest, however. Only a very few reviews objected to the collection as a whole as being coarse or immoral, and generally this objection was confined to the first tale, 'The Renowned Adventures of Basil Lee', which included an account of the hero's relationship with an Inverness prostitute. Even so, his attempt to introduce a moral into this tale was noted; the Newcastle Magazine remarked this, merely adding that 'it would have been more considerate to female readers to have kept the intercourse of Basil and Miss Mackay a little more in the background', while the Monthly Review commented that with the exception of this one tale the stories contain 'nothing that can give offence to the best regulated modesty'.27 A few reviews also objected, curiously enough, to Hogg's use of the supernatural; the British Critic disliked those tales about dreams and apparitions included in the collection, while both the Lonsdale Magazine and the London Magazine and Monthly Critical and Dramatic Review thought that while there was no harm in a work 'intended merely as a history of popular Scottish superstitions', Hogg went too far in relating these as if he actually

---

believed and advocated them himself.\textsuperscript{28} Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine obviously liked Hogg's treatment of the supernatural however, extracting one episode about a ghost and remarking that Hogg is always at home in the clouds and darkness of superstition.\textsuperscript{29} Many of the reviews praise Hogg's portrait of the Scottish peasantry or his details of the shepherd's life, even the most severe on him in other respects. The British Critic thought his pictures of the peasantry admirable, and though objecting to his use of the supernatural, and on account of their impropriety feeling unable to recommend the tales to its readers for general circulation, expressed itself 'really anxious to meet Mr. Hogg again in this his new line of composition'.\textsuperscript{30} Hogg's argument in the Memoir that the supposed indelicacies of the tales were really a natural and authentic part of the life he had experienced and was engaged in describing was therefore acutely based upon an aspect of his work which had been very generally praised, and where his authority was in any case superior to that of his critics. Overall, Winter Evening Tales was welcomed by the critics of the day, although one or two of them did suggest that this peasant poet would do better to continue to write

\textsuperscript{28} Anonymous reviews in British Critic, 13(1820), 622-31 (p.623), in Lonsdale Magazine, 1(1820), 307-12 (p.307), and in London Magazine and Monthly Critical and Dramatic Review, 1(1820), 638-44 (p.639).

\textsuperscript{29} (John Wilson?), 'Hogg's Tales', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 7(1820), 148-54 (p.154), conjecturally attributed to this author in Alan Lang Strout, A Bibliography of Articles in Blackwood's Magazine, Volumes I through XVIII, 1817-1825, Texas Technological College Library Bulletin, 5 (Lubbock, Texas, 1959), p.67. This work will hereafter be referred to by the abbreviation Bibliography, listed before the text.

\textsuperscript{30} Anonymous review in British Critic, 13(1820), 622-31 (p.631).
verse.31

In the case of his next work of fiction, *The Three Perils of Man; or, War, Women, and Witchcraft*, a Border Romance Hogg did not attempt to justify his plan, but admitted to the fault most commonly pointed out in the reviews, merely alleging in extenuation that he 'began and finished in the course of a few months', because he was impatient for his publisher's money (*Memoir*, p.55). Hogg may have finished the work in a hurry, but, as MacLachlan suggests, the writing may have occupied him for nearly three years.32 In the memoir written in 1832 Hogg says that he 'mixed up with what might have been made one of the best historical tales our country ever produced, such a mass of diablerie as retarded the main story, and rendered the whole perfectly ludicrous' (*Memoir*, p.55). Almost all the reviews of the work object to the 'mass of diablerie' of the events at Aikwood; most of this material comes in the last two volumes of the work, and the *Literary Gazette* said of these that they 'excite little besides pity at the perversion of mind, which could suppose such a jumble of extravagance capable of amusing any rational being'.33 The scriptural language of the gospel Friar was also objected to as tasteless or irreverent by a few reviews.34 Less

---

33 Anonymous review in *Literary Gazette*, 6 July 1822, pp.419-20 (p.419).
34 Anonymous reviews in *Literary Chronicle*, 22 and 29 June 1822, pp.385-88, 409-12 (p.409), in Monthly Censor, 1(1822), 467-69 (p.469), and in *New European Magazine*, 1(1822), 63-66 (p.65).
generally objected to were the trifling and cruel characterisation of the Princess Margaret, and the device by which the Warden and his men take the castle of Roxburgh by entering it disguised as a drove of cattle.35 Once again Hogg's work suffered by being brought into direct comparison with Scott's; his Michael Scott was seen as a degraded version of the wizard in The Lay of the Last Minstrel, and the whole work viewed by at least one periodical as 'an endeavour, by a person of great natural genius, to perpetuate that school and style of novel-writing of which the author of "Waverley" is professor and founder'.36 Though disposed to like the work, the review could therefore only praise it in the inferior category of an imitation of an original. This review, and those of the European Magazine and Literary Chronicle are exceptions in generally praising the work (it may, however, be suspected from his vagueness and lack of detail that the critic of the European Magazine had not even read it). The Literary Chronicle probably gave it the highest praise in terming it 'a clever work of its kind not inferior to the "Brownie of Godsbeck"; and, though less elegant and forcible in its style to some of the Waverley novels, yet it is more interesting in its narrative'.37 If the comparison with Scott's novels was generally to the disadvantage of the work, so was the comparison with Hogg's

35 Anonymous reviews in Literary Register, 17 and 24 August 1822, pp.97-98, 117-19 (pp.98, 118), and in Monthly Review, 99(1822), 439-40 (p.440).
36 Anonymous reviews in New European Magazine, 1(1822), 63-66 (p.65), and in Literary Register, 17 and 24 August 1822, pp. 97-98, 117-19 (p.119).
37 Anonymous reviews in European Magazine, 82(1822), 62, and in Literary Chronicle, 22 and 29 June 1822, pp.385-88, 409-12 (p.412).
own previous works of fiction. The critic of the New European Magazine confesses to very disappointed expectations of the work, as he explains. 'From his Winter Evening Tales, and his Brownie of Bodbeck, we had thought that his chief talent lay in telling stories', so that having expected his longest work of fiction to be the best, 'we have suffered a proportionate disappointment in finding it by far the worst of any thing which that gentleman has hitherto published'.

Hogg's fiction by this time was beginning to suffer by his personal connection with the Toryism of Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, and this is displayed effectively by means of some of the comments other periodicals made upon his next separate publication of fiction, The Three Perils of Woman; or, Love, Leasing, and Jealousy. A Series of Domestic Scottish Tales. The British Critic, for instance, admitted to being severe upon the work, but argued that this was a necessary corrective to the 'perpetual puffings which the Northern trumpeters adopt respecting each other', and that as Hogg's pretensions have been so boldly advanced they should be as boldly examined, and that false delicacy should not prevent the expression of opinion where they are found wanting. The Literary Chronicle referred to Hogg as following the late custom and fashion of the 'Edinburgh novel-writers to interlard their fictions with appeals to the Deity and the services of the church', an unfriendly reference presumably to the recent work of

---

Lockhart and Wilson. Comment on this work also reinforced the idea, gained from comment on Hogg's first separately published work of fiction, that the historical disputes and factions of Scotland's past were viewed in indisputable connection with the present, so that a historical novel's portrait of past times was sometimes regarded with all the heat of partisan feelings. The British Magazine singled out for attack the second tale, or more properly the second group of tales, in this work for its treatment of the Jacobite cause in 1745. It is amusing to note how, after blaming Hogg for advocating Jacobitism after the Stuarts have ceased to exist, the review indignantly declares that 'the injustice of the pretensions upon which the Stuart family's claim to the crown of England was founded is notorious; it can only be equalled by the base and contemptible character of the persons in whose favour so much brave blood was spilled'. The review reprobrates Hogg's supposed attempt to suggest that the government soldiers were guilty of 'sanguinary cruelty', and expresses his disbelief in the passage of the tale where a Jacobite smith and twelve men rout one thousand five hundred soldiers.

Hogg's own comment on the whole work, though brief, indicates that it was not successful, and seems to acquiesce in this decision of the reviewers and the public. He admits that there is 'a good deal of pathos and absurdity in both the tales of this latter work'.

39 Anonymous reviews in British Critic, 20(1823), 357-61 (p.361), and in Literary Chronicle, 27 September 1823, pp.615-16 (p.615).
40 Anonymous review in British Magazine, 1(1823), 364-74 (p.374).
but in extenuation adds that he was 'all this while writing as if in desperation, and see matters now in a different light' (Memoir, p.55). Most of his reviewers preferred what Hogg refers to as the first tale of the collection, the tale of Gatty Bell, and it is of interest to note that Hogg was generally praised for his ability to portray natural and pathetic emotional scenes while he was derided for his absurdity. Hogg's admission of failure thus has its positive side. The British Magazine declared that 'in passages of simple pathos he is always powerful, because he is always purely natural', while admiring especially the affecting scene where the convalescent Gatty is introduced to the child she has borne in her years of lunacy, 'which is worth all the book besides; and to introduce which we cannot but think all the rest was written'. Other reviews also commented favourably on one or another of the pathetic scenes of the work: even the hostile Edinburgh Magazine remarked on the death of Cherry as 'touching and beautiful'. The characterisation of the simple and noble-minded Cherry was praised, but so, surprisingly, was that of the comic and boorish Dick Rickleton, and the comic scene where he is unwittingly insulted by several gentlemen at M'Ion's dinner-party was praised and quoted from. The chief points of objection to the work were the irreverence of Daniel Bell's prayers for the recovery of his

41 Anonymous review in British Magazine, 1(1823), 364-74 (pp.365, 369), and 'Scotch Novels of the Second Class. No. II. Hogg's Brownie of Bodsbeck — Winter Tales — Three Perils of Man — Three Perils of Woman', Edinburgh Magazine, 13(1823), 485-85 [mispaged] (pp.483).

42 Anonymous reviews in Literary Gazette, 30 August 1823, pp.546-48 (pp.546-47), and in Northern Observer, 17 September 1823, pp.69-75 (pp.72-74).
daughter, allusions to women of ill fame, and the disgusting nature of Gatty's illness and her giving birth in a state of idiocy.43 Two reviews also discussed the inconsistency of several of the characters between one part of a story and another, so that 'in one page they are guilty of the most childish rustic simplicity, and in another manifest the noblest sentiments of refinement'. Cherry, Gatty, and Sally Niven were the characterisations thought especially faulty in this respect.44 The general verdict on Hogg's work was far from favourable. The British Magazine and the Lady's Magazine would seem to be alone in giving the work moderate praise overall, the first of these even preferring it to the previous work, remarking that these Perils 'are tolerable — The Perils of Man were not to be endured', while the latter, recognising Hogg as unquestionably a man of talent, rested content with the remark that 'his tales are not so good as to claim strong recommendation'.45 The tone of the unfavourable comment may be surmised from the coolness and qualifications of the more favourable: several reviews expressed the opinion that ladies should not read it, nor a man's family, because of its indelicacy or indecency, and at least one critic thought it hard reading as well, saying that 'it is no small exertion of charity, on rising from his pages, to content ourselves

43 Anonymous reviews in British Critic, 20(1823), 357-61 (p.360), in Literary Chronicle, 27 September 1823, pp.615-16 (p.616), in Literary Gazette, 30 August 1823, pp.546-48 (p.547), and in Northern Observer, 17 September 1823, pp.69-75 (p.75).
44 See anonymous reviews in Emmet, 18 October 1823, pp.25-27 (p.26), and in Literary Gazette, 30 August 1823, pp.546-48 (pp.547, 548).
45 Anonymous reviews in British Magazine, 1(1823), 364-74 (p.364), and in Lady's Magazine, 4(1823), 707.
with a hope that they may soon be forgotten'. 46

Hogg's next work, The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner, was more widely reviewed than critics have hitherto believed, and these reviews, besides containing separate points of interest, also correct one misleading impression given by Hogg himself as to the fate of the work. Hogg wrote of it that 'it being a story replete with horror, after I had written it I durst not venture to put my name to it: so it was published anonymously, and of course did not sell very well' (Memoir, p.55). The poor sales of the work, however, could not have been for the want of Hogg's name, as it was very generally attributed to his pen as soon as it appeared, and in one case a critic felt himself called upon to question this report, which shows its prevalence. 47 Those periodicals which correctly named Hogg as the author often interestingly characterise his style in support of the assertion, and this is often seen as an incongruous mixture of the strongest powers with the strongest absurdities. The novel was 'a work of irregular genius, such as we might have expected from Mr. Hogg', or exhibited 'the characteristic ingenuity and extravagance of the highly-gifted, but eccentric writer'. The Examiner said that 'a surprising lack of probability, or even possibility, is accompanied with a portion of mental force and powerful delineation, which denote the conception and the hand of a master'. 48

46 Anonymous review in British Critic, 20(1823), 357-61 (p.357).
his individual works being greatly admired perhaps, Hogg nevertheless was recognised as having considerable power and talents for writing fiction.

The theological aspect of the novel was commented on in several periodicals, the *Monthly Critical Gazette* even choosing to review it under the heading of 'Theology'. This review saw the novel as a satire of a perversion of Calvinist doctrine, and gave it high praise.
an angry or an unfair attempt to portray or to degrade the
sectarians of a past age, reading it largely through the eyes of
Hogg's Editor, whose sympathies are Tory, or even Jacobite. 51

Objections were made to what are now taken to be the deliberate
ambiguities of the novel: annoyance was expressed at the
inconsistency of the work between giving the phantoms of
superstition a real, external being and presenting them as existing
in the diseased imagination of the supposed writer. Similar to
this was the complaint that it was not easy to tell if the hero or
his demon were guilty of horrid crimes, that the reviewer did not
understand Hogg's precise meaning, and that judging from a comment
of the supposed editor upon the work, neither did Hogg himself. 52
The characterisation of the devil was also generally deemed faulty.
Some critics suggested that the damnation of such a miserably
inferior character as Robert Wringhim hardly required the presence
and assistance of the devil in person. 53 The devil was viewed as
a vulgar being by comparison with the unrivalled demon of Goethe,
'the exclusive perception of a madman, instead of a being of the
poet's mind, created for an object and an end'. One critic did,
however, praise the devil's power of personation, which was used
with effect, especially in the description by an eye-witness of the
scene of George's murder, and in the scene where the two women

51 See, for instance, an anonymous review in News of Literature
and Fashion, 17 July 1824, pp.95–96.
52 Anonymous reviews in Westminster Review, 2(1824), 560–62
(p.561), and in Literary Gazette, 17 July 1824, pp.449–51
(pp.449, 451).
53 See, for instance, an anonymous review in British Critic, 22
(1824), 68–80 (p.72).
recognise the features of the murdered George in those of Robert's companion. Both the New Monthly Magazine and the Westminster Review complained about the double narrative of the work, but the Universal Review, though remarking that the interest of the confessions was forestalled by the attractive and clever relation of the Editor, was also constrained to admit that 'the repetition is dressed up with the peculiar shades and impressions of the sufferer's experience — is spread out more into detail, and amplified by the introduction of other circumstances'.

Several reviews paid willing or unwilling tribute to the tremendous power of the novel over the imagination, and in doing so testified to its success in terms of literary quality, if not in those of commercial popularity. The work was compared to Lockhart's recent The History of Matthew Wald (1824) in its power of evoking unpleasant sensations in the reader, the review declaring that 'like "Mathew" [sic] it produces nothing but pain and aversion in the perusal; and ... the producing of that pain is the end and not the means — no useful admonition, and no moral lesson results from it'. The Universal Review speaks of Robert's sufferings towards the end of his journal, 'his description of which hangs like a nightmare upon the reader's imagination'. The same review acts as a convenient summary perhaps of the more

---

54 Anonymous reviews in Examiner, 1 August 1824, pp.482-83 (p.483), and in Universal Review, 2(1824-1825), 108-12 (pp.109-10).
56 Anonymous review in News of Literature and Fashion, 17 July 1824, pp.95-96 (p.95).
favourable criticism in the periodicals of recent Hogg fiction, in expressing the opinion that 'in all this there is force, but it is unnatural and deformed force. Not doubting the writer's ability, we extremely doubt the taste which has guided his pen, and hope to see him adopt some subject less remote from human feelings'.

Hogg says nothing about his next work of fiction in his Memoir: it has already been shown that The Shepherd's Calendar probably had a poor sale, though this is surprising, not on account of its high literary quality, but because the contemporary reviews of it were on the whole extremely favourable. Perhaps the sale was affected adversely by the tales being known already from the separate publication of most of them previously. The Literary Gazette explained the nature of the work in remarking that 'most of the tales having appeared in Blackwood's Magazine, they have already been pretty generally circulated: they bring the welcome of old familiar friends, who for the first time we have an opportunity of collecting together'. This review ended its praises of the work with adding 'we dismiss the Ettrick Shepherd with cordial commendations'. Both the Athenaeum and the Edinburgh Literary Gazette thought this the best of Hogg's prose works. The reasons for this praise and preference are of considerable interest,

57 Anonymous review in Universal Review, 2(1824-1825), 106-12 (pp.110, 112).
58 Anonymous review in Literary Gazette, 14 March 1829, pp.173-74 (pp.173, 174).
59 Anonymous review in Athenaeum, 18 March 1829, pp.162-63 (p.162), and 'The Life and Literary Progress of James Hogg, the Ettrick Shepherd', Edinburgh Literary Gazette, 27 June 1829, pp.97-99 (p.98).
for they both limit the extent of Hogg's abilities and defer to his authority in some respects, in praising the work as a real and factual account of the pastoral life of a shepherd. The limitations of such an attitude are seen firstly in the Athenaeum, which began its account of the work with a long comparison between the genius of Burns and that of Hogg; the reviewer asserts that 'Burns was a man of genius, Hogg is a shepherd of genius', that the one would have been as great in any other situation in life, whereas the other 'would lose much of his real, as well as of his factitious importance'. The review naturally goes on to say that in this work Hogg shows good judgement, for 'in some of his novels it was impossible not to feel that the Ettrick Shepherd was quite out of his element, that he was dealing with subjects which he had not imagination to grasp. But in the narratives which these books contain, he is thoroughly at home'.

The Spectator, holding a similar attitude, even discriminates within this collection, dividing it into two categories. The 'anecdotic tales similar to those at the end of the Brownie of Bodsbeck and the Winter Tales' were regarded as the inferior class, although good in themselves, and such that 'we read them with pleasure, and then, with critical ingratitude, observe that Mr. HOGG might have done better'. The reviewer hoped 'from the title of this his last production' that Hogg had 'confined himself to the recording of the real experience of a shepherd's life', and acting on this documentary principle he

---

60 Anonymous review in Athenaeum, 18 March 1829, pp.162-63 (p.162).
distinguishes three chapters 'entitled Sheep, Snow-storms, and Dogs; they are chapters full of interest both to the naturalist and the philanthropist, as well as to the general reader'. Hogg is thought to be at his best when he is merely recording what he has seen and experienced himself, but on the other hand as the Ettrick Shepherd his testimony on such matters is beyond question authoritative. The Edinburgh Literary Journal emphasised Hogg's 'double advantage' in this work, of genius and of experience, so that the chief merit of these sketches is 'that the reader is made to feel that in every page is set down, forcibly and well, what shepherds actually do, say, think, and believe'. Their occasional vulgarity is a part of their truthfulness. It is worth noting that, out of the twenty-one tales of the collection, quotations are most frequently made in these contemporary reviews from 'Sheep', 'Odd Characters', 'Snow-Storms', and 'The Shepherd's Dog'. Despite this emphasis on the factual, however, Hogg's excellent tales of the supernatural did receive some praise; though this was partly as 'stories, illustrative of the superstitions prevalent among that class which he is describing', the critic was also obliged to admit that they possessed a more emotional and literary power over the reader, and refers to Hogg's superiority in imparting to them 'so thrilling an air of authenticity and truth'. Persons of weak nerves should not read certain of these stories alone at

61 Anonymous review in Spectator, 28 March 1829, pp.203-05 (p.203).
midnight. One critic distinguished 'Mary Jurnet' as an excellent fairy tale, while the praise of the Edinburgh Literary Gazette clearly shows enjoyment of the more imaginative supernatural tales with the others, in describing the work as one in which 'the author shines forth in all the variety of his powers. In some parts he is the honest, sagacious, and somewhat credulous chronicler; and in others the magician who can raise rainbow structures from the materials furnished by imagination'.

There is almost no comment in contemporary reviews of Altrive Tales: Collected among the Peasantry of Scotland, and from Foreign Adventurers on the actual tales which the volume contained. Attention was all but exclusively focused upon the latest version of the author's memoirs prefixed to the volume. This is understandable, for Hogg's recent stay in London had created more than the usual interest in him as a personality, and also this volume was intended as the first of a series, to be published at regular intervals and to form Hogg's complete prose works. A reviewer would therefore expect to be able to discuss the tales themselves in a review of any of the later volumes. Fraser's Magazine, for instance, expected that there would be 'many opportunities hereafter' for this, and comment on the tales is brief and flippant. The critic remarks 'that the story of Captain Lochy ... is one of Hogg's best, being, indeed, a very

happy imitation of De Foe; that the Pongos is, we believe, pleasant — but as we have not read it, we are not quite sure ....'64 The Monthly Review is only slightly fuller, in saying that the three tales of the volume are all 'distinguished by a wildness of imagination', and that the two shorter of them 'are calculated to afford a favourable specimen of the compositions by which they are to be followed'. 'Adventures of Captain John Lochy, written by himself' is characterised as furnishing abundant evidence of the author's teeming fancy, though the hero's adventures on the continent 'follow each other with so much rapidity, that it is difficult to remember them', and the reader is interested rather by the number than the attractiveness of the incidents.65

Comment on Tales of the Wars of Montrose, the last of Hogg's separately published works of fiction to appear in his lifetime, is fuller, and divides about equally between praise and blame. Only one periodical is 'of opinion that if they do not raise Hogg's reputation, they will certainly not detract from it'.66 The Athenaeum thought the tales 'loose, rambling, and extravagant', the incidents being told as if from personal experience and yet being also highly improbable, the effect was an unpleasant 'mixture of reality and romance'. Unkindly, the critic expressed the opinion that 'the worthy Shepherd must have been nodding, when he indited

64 [William Maginn?], 'The Altrive Tales', Fraser's Magazine, 5 (1832), 482-89 (p.482), conjecturally attributed to this author in Wellesley Index, II(1972), 332. This abbreviation is listed before the text, and will be used throughout this study, for The Wellesley Index to Victorian Periodicals 1824-1900, edited by Walter E. Houghton and others (Toronto and London, 1966—).
65 Anonymous review in Monthly Review, 2(1832), 82-100 (pp.82-83).
66 Anonymous review in Monthly Magazine, 1(1835), 528-29 (p.529).
these volumes'. The Spectator, also severe in its verdict, thought that though the tales were readable, with a homely interest and a dry sense of humour, they lacked 'the higher qualities of imagination, and of a nice perception of character, whilst they exhibit small excellence in constructive skill'. The Times went so far as to say that they were 'totally unworthy of the reputation which from his former productions it might be expected he should still support'. This review proceeded, however, to quote two passages from 'Some Remarkable Passages in the Life of an Edinburgh Baillie', a description of the old Marquis of Huntly and one of a baronial dinner, and to praise both.67

Favourable reviews exist as well as the severe, however; these see Hogg's tales as faulty in certain respects, but as after all eminently readable. Hogg, wrote one critic, 'always contrives to carry us on with him to the end', while another describes how in reading a work of Hogg's he is annoyed and teased for the first hundred pages by coarseness, abruptness, lack of style, and rudeness, 'and yet we cannot lay down the book; though we may throw it from us, we are sure to take it up and go on even to the end ... and having got over our annoyances, we have leisure and temper to call to mind the earnestness — the energy — the literary zeal of our Scotch author'.68 This is honest, amusing, and acute. In writing a series of tales set in this period Hogg naturally drew down upon

68 Anonymous reviews in Literary Gazette, 21 March 1835, pp. 179-80 (p.179), and in New Monthly Magazine, 44(1835), 237-38 (p.238).
them the comparison with the historical novels of Scott. Oddly, several reviews thought Hogg's work too dryly historical and not imaginative enough. Referring to his 'doughtily daring to venture upon a path not all untrodden by Scott' at the commencement of his review, one critic states in his conclusion that Hogg 'has been somewhat too much of the historian and too little of the poet': another did not think 'that his more correct history is any equivalent for his deficiency of vigour of description', though also thinking Hogg's traditionary account of the termination of the battle of Philiphaugh is horrible in his description, he contradicts himself, at least in part.69

A more kindly reference to Scott in connection with these tales was made when the New Monthly Magazine congratulated 'the Shepherd of Ettrick upon his being again, like Rob Roy, upon his native heath', and another periodical also praised the tales as 'national, picturesque, and animated'.70 In general the favourite tale would seem to have been 'Julia M'Kenzie', and the least popular 'Some Remarkable Passages in the Life of an Edinburgh Baillie'. Fraser's Magazine praised Hogg's heroines enthusiastically and at length; pronouncing his verdict on the collection as a whole, this critic said, 'we cry out a good report, and say that they are good — excellent in subject (always excepting the passages in the life of

69 William Maginn?, 'A Decade of Novels and Nouvellettes. 5. Wars of Montrose', Fraser's Magazine, 11(1835), 597-600 (pp. 597, 600), conjecturally attributed to this author in Wellesley Index, II(1972), 347; also anonymous review in Monthly Magazine, 1(1835), 528-29.

70 Anonymous reviews in New Monthly Magazine, 44(1835), 237-38, and in Literary Gazette, 21 March 1835, pp. 179-80 (p. 179).
the stupid bailie), and written with a great deal of natural power and very little care'. The tales 'may disappoint a few of his most expectant admirers, but they cannot fail of affording pleasure to the general reader'. Other periodicals also commended the tales to public favour. 71

Summarising the contemporary reception of Hogg's fiction, it is possible to say much more about the reception of his separately published works than about those tales which appeared in the pages of various periodicals. All that can be said really of this last part of his work is that some of it was remembered and praised, that Hogg throughout the latter part of his life was solicited by editors and proprietors of various periodicals for contributions, and that the less important periodicals were willing to reprint Hogg's work, without permission presumably, to add to the attractions of their pages.

Sales of the separately published works give some indication of their popularity: however, there is no evidence of the sale of some works, while in the case of others particular circumstances may have had an undue effect upon it. As far as it is possible to judge, Winter Evening Tales was Hogg's only really popular work in terms of sales, and the novel now considered to be his masterpiece, and what is arguably his best collection of short tales hardly sold at all.

71 William Maginn, 'A Decade of Novels and Nouvellettes. 5. Wars of Montrose', Fraser's Magazine, 11(1835), 597-600 (p.600), conjecturally attributed to this author in Wellesley Index, 11(1972), 347; anonymous reviews in Literary Gazette, 21 March 1835, pp.179-80 (p.180), and in New Monthly Magazine, 44(1835), 237-38 (p.238).
An examination of reviews and other articles in periodicals reveals a rather different picture of the contemporary reception of Hogg's works of prose fiction. Though his fiction was often regarded as of secondary interest to his poems and songs, it did excite interest in itself. Critically Winter Evening Tales and The Shepherd's Calendar were probably Hogg's most acceptable works — that is, those which were most obviously written by the Ettrick Shepherd, and were held to describe peasant ways and beliefs. Hogg's authority as a narrator was seen as unquestionable here, because of the circumstances of his life. Sometimes a preference for this type of tale could lead to unfairness with regard to Hogg's other tales, but his more experimental and extravagant stories were also occasionally praised. As expressions of contemporary opinions of the earlier collections of fiction the reviews may be interestingly compared with passages relating to the collections in Hogg's Memoir, for they can help to show the basis of Hogg's defence or extenuation of his work. The reviews also show in which respects Hogg's fiction offended against the prejudices and standards of contemporary society. Historical subjects, for instance, were surprisingly sensitive for the writer of fiction, the parties of conflicts in the church and state in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries being often recognised as the ancestors of the modern ones. Hogg tended to be treated as a supporter of the Whigs when he wrote sympathetically about the Covenanters, and as a staunch Tory when he wrote of the Jacobites. The reception of Hogg's later fiction was clearly, even if slightly, affected by the identification of his work with Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, and with what was termed the Edinburgh School of novel-writers, a term carefully
phrased, one may suspect, to avoid the inclusion of Scott in the vituperation bestowed on writers such as Lockhart and Wilson. Hogg offended as much against religious as against sexual standards of decorum in his fiction, according to the reviews. The rationalism of the day was also occasionally opposed to the method and subject-matter of his supernatural tales.

In general Hogg was widely admitted to have genius as a writer of fiction, but to lack taste. He was also often criticised for the wildness or extravagance of his work. Hogg was occasionally compared to Burns, but as a writer of fiction far more often and more aptly to Scott, despite his poetic and self-advertised image of the natural genius. In spite of his numerous defects as a prose writer in the eyes of his contemporary critics many of them paid tribute to Hogg’s matchless power as a story-teller, and his ability to carry the reader along with him through the most improbable adventures and the most faulty expressions and style. These honest admissions are a feature of contemporary comment both on his fiction for the magazines and that published separately, and they testify to the ultimate basis of Hogg’s fiction, his talents as a teller of tales.

Additional Reviews, and Articles commenting on Hogg’s Fiction

Four articles may be mentioned here which add to an impression of the critical reception of Hogg’s fiction published before 1826.

There is an anonymous review of *The Brownie of Bodsbeck*; and other
Tales and one of Winter Evening Tales too in The Scotsman. An article in the Newcastle Magazine discusses The Queen’s Wake: A Legendary Poem as Hogg’s first important poem, together with Winter Evening Tales as his most recent original work, and regrets Hogg’s association with the Blackwood set. An article of 1823 gives an interesting general character of Hogg as a prose-writer, with brief comments on each of his fiction publications and a more lengthy review of the latest of them.

An article published before the appearance of The Shepherd’s Calendar attempts to defend Hogg’s character from the misrepresentations of it in Blackwood’s Edinburgh Magazine, gives an account of a visit paid by the reviewer to Hogg’s brother William, and describes Hogg’s character as a man, a poet, and a prose-writer. Another general article published after the appearance of that collection of tales comments on Hogg’s works of fiction in the course of detailing his literary progress. Hogg is viewed as mistakenly attempting to write novels for the English market with The Three Perils of Man; or, War, Women, and Witchcraft. A Border Romance, and as returning to home ground and his proper themes only with his most recent publication. I have found four reviews only:

72 See The Scotsman, 16 May 1818, pp. 158-59, and of 29 April 1820, pp. 143-44 respectively.
of The Shepherd's Calendar, though doubtless there are more to be found, and these are all in the same type of periodical, the weekly literary newspaper. The reviews of the early nineteenth century only exceptionally contained articles on Hogg's work, but he was more generally recognised by the monthly magazines, so that their apparent omission of this work is curious and interesting.

Altrive Tales: Collected among the Peasantry of Scotland, and from Foreign Adventurers seems to have been quite widely reviewed as a volume without there being any significant discussion of the tales in it. One or two Scottish journals of a purely local and provincial importance reviewed the volume (probably on account of the extracts to be made about Hogg's personality and literary and social relationships from the account of his life which it contained), but also more widely-read literary weekly papers and general magazines which carried literary reviews. However, only one of the old-fashioned, comprehensive type of reviews, and one new magazine gave even the briefest comment on the tales themselves.

Tales of the Wars of Montrose was also widely reviewed, though

---


76 Anonymous reviews in Athenaeum, 14 April 1832, pp.235-37, in Day, 23 April 1832, p.386, in Ladies' Museum, 3(1832), 226, in Literary Gazette, 31 March and 7 April 1832, pp.199-201, 214-16, in Literary Rambler, 11 May 1832, p.6, and in Mirror, 21 April 1832, pp.254-56.

77 Anonymous review in Monthly Review, 2(1832), 82-100; [William Maginn?], 'The Altrive Tales', Fraser's Magazine, 5(1832), 482-89, conjecturally attributed to this author in Wellesley Index, II(1972), 332.
more briefly than Hogg's previous volume. Apart from the daily and weekly literary newspapers (which could afford to give more space to such works than the more general magazines), the collection was given only a paragraph or two of comment in most of the periodicals which noticed it. The exception to this was, significantly, in a magazine to which Hogg was a regular contributor, and then it was treated in one section of a long article dealing with ten recent works of fiction.

One remarkable feature of a survey of contemporary reviews of Hogg's fiction is the fact that although other magazines to which he contributed reviewed Hogg's fiction on the whole in a kindly way, as he would have expected them to do, Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine frequently neglected or abused it. There are no separate reviews of The Brownie of Bodsbeck; and other Tales (published by William Blackwood), of The Three Perils of Man; or, War, Women, and Witchcraft, A Border Romance, of The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner, or of any of Hogg's separately published works of fiction after this last-mentioned one. What comment there was on the earlier volumes in this magazine tends to occur in the papers of Noctes Ambrosianae, and is really not considered or serious enough to be properly termed criticism.

---


79 [William Maginn?], 'A Decade of Novels and Nouvellettes. 5. Wars of Montrose', Fraser's Magazine, 11(1835), 597-600, conjecturally attributed to this author in Wellesley Index, 11(1972), 347.
are the collections after *The Shepherd's Calendar* mentioned even here. However, for the sake of completeness in this account of the contemporary reception of Hogg's fiction, it may be mentioned that there are comments on *The Three Perils of Man; or, War, Women, and Witchcraft*. A Border Romance in the first, sixth, seventh, and fifteenth numbers of the *Noctes Ambrosianae*, comments on *The Three Perils of Woman; or, Love, Leasing, and Jealousy*. A Series of Domestic Scottish Tales in the seventh and twelfth numbers, comment on *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner* in the fifteenth number, and on *The Shepherd's Calendar* in the forty-second number of the series. It seems surprising that this magazine should not mention Hogg's last volumes of fiction, published at a time when he was on not unfriendly terms with both John Wilson and the publishers of the magazine, though his previous collection probably remained unnoticed because at the time of its publication he had quarrelled with William Blackwood and was neither a contributor to the magazine nor a character in the *Noctes Ambrosianae*.

---

BIBLIOGRAPHY

MANUSCRIPT MATERIAL

A copy of The Spy (1810-1811), containing Hogg's manuscript notes on the authorship of articles in the paper, in St Andrew's University Library

A copy of The Spy (1810-1811), containing Hogg's manuscript notes on the authorship of articles in the paper, in the National Library of Scotland, Ry.II.b.6

Manuscripts in the National Library of Scotland

MS 580, f.123
MS 583, no.760
MS 590, f.281
MS 786, ff.55, 57
MS 790, f.128
MS 791, pp.299, 386, 488, 497, 506, 513, 578
MS 807, ff.16-20
MS 811, ff.3-5
MS 860, ff.1-5, 12, 22, 50
MS 869, f.189
MS 877, f.243
MS 924, nos.79-87
MS 934, no.104
MS 1002, ff.102, 104
MS 1024
MS 1554, ff.75, 77
MS 1704, ff.65-66
MS 1809, ff.85, 91, 152
MS 1870, ff.1-22, 24-39
MS 2245
MS 2530
MS 2956, ff.159-63
MS 3218, ff.37-38
MS 3369
MS 3395, ff.5, 7, 13, 17, 21
MS 3551, f.33
MS 3813, f.64
MS 3874, f.114, 248
MS 3875, ff.1, 35, 39, 55, 93, 150, 161, 163, 172, 230, 250
MS 3878, f.97
MS 3879, ff.184, 204
MS 3884, f.122
MS 3893, ff. 122, 159, 181
MS 3902, f. 105
MS 3904, f. 31
MS 3912, ff. 27, 219
MS 4001, ff. 207, 209, 266-270
MS 4002, ff. 153-159
MS 4003, ff. 84-103
MS 4004, ff. 152-162
MS 4005, ff. 148-170
MS 4007, ff. 24-48, 194
MS 4008, ff. 265-269
MS 4010, ff. 184-189
MS 4011, ff. 43, 80
MS 4012, ff. 179-187, 298, 340, 353
MS 4013, f. 189
MS 4014, ff. 287-291
MS 4017, ff. 138-141, 199
MS 4018, ff. 11, 47
MS 4019, ff. 185-198, 254
MS 4020, ff. 15, 21, 29, 35, 47
MS 4021, ff. 271-284
MS 4022, ff. 131, 140, 146, 160
MS 4024, ff. 290-297
MS 4025, ff. 184, 190
MS 4027, ff. 178-205, 268
MS 4028, ff. 66, 70, 78
MS 4029, ff. 249-271
MS 4030, f. 202
MS 4033, ff. 119-126
MS 4036, ff. 98-103
MS 4039, ff. 30-36, 79, 83
MS 4040, ff. 287-290
MS 4719, ff. 153-203
MS 4807
MS 4808
MS 4937
MS 7200, ff. 197-214
MS 8887, ff. 36-38
MS 9657, f. 80
MS 9819, f. 163
MS 10495
MS 10998, ff. 176-178
Accession 5187, pp. 288-289
Accession 5393
Accession 5643:
  vol. A2, pp. 174-175, 197-203
  vol. B2, pp. 214-216
  vol. B3, pp. 134-135
  vol. B5, pp. 43-44
  vol. B6, pp. 163-165, 385-387
  vol. B9, pp. 66-68, 81-82, 154-156, 225, 268-269
  vol. B10, pp. 80-83
REVIEWS OF WORKS BY HOGG

Reviews are anonymous unless otherwise stated, and because of this, and the fact that they often appear only under the publication details of the work or some variant of these, they will be listed by the periodicals in which they appear, under the title of each work reviewed.

Reviews of The Mountain Bard; consisting of Ballads and Songs, founded on Facts and Legendary Tales (Edinburgh, 1807)

Annual Review, 6(1807), 554-57
Critical Review, 12(1807), 237-44. The reviewer was probably Anna Seward — see her letter to Constable, 14 March 1808, in Thomas Constable, Archibald Constable and his Literary Correspondents, 3 vols (Edinburgh, 1873), II, 16
Scottish Register, 6(1806-1807), 548-49
Poetical Register, 6(1806-1807), 548-49
Scots Magazine, 69(1807), 283-86

Reviews of The Queen's Wake: A Legendary Poem (Edinburgh, 1813)

Analectic Magazine, 3(1814), 104-25
Eclectic Review, 9(1813), 647-53
Edinburgh Review, 24(December 1814), 157-74, attributed to Francis Jeffrey in Wellesley Index, I(1966), 453
Port Folio, 6(1815), 497-506

Review of The Pilgrims of the Sun: A Poem (Edinburgh and London, 1815)

Critical Review, 1(1815), 399-409

Reviews of The Brownie of Bodsbeck; and other Tales, 2 vols (Edinburgh and London, 1818)

British Critic, 10(1818), 403-18
Clydesdale Magazine, 1(1818), 75-78, 121-25
The Scotsman, 16 May 1818, pp.158-59

Reviews of Winter Evening Tales, collected among the Cottagers in the South of Scotland, 2 vols (Edinburgh and London, 1820)

Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 7(1820), 148-54, conjecturally attributed to John Wilson in Bibliography, p.67
British Critic, 13(1820), 622-31
Caledonian, 1(1820-1821), 25-27
Gentleman's Magazine, 90 part 2(1820), 611-13
Ladies' Monthly Museum, 13(1821), 39
London Magazine, 1(1820), 666-71
London Magazine and Monthly Critical and Dramatic Review, 1(1820), 638-44
Lonsdale Magazine, 1(1820), 307-12
Monthly Magazine, 49(1820), 555-56
Monthly Review, 93(1820), 263-67
New Hibernian Magazine, 1(1820), 9-16
New Monthly Magazine, 14(1820), 92
The Scotsman, 29 April 1820, pp. 143-44

Reviews of *The Three Perils of Man; or, War, Women, and Witchcraft. A Border Romance*, 3 vols (London, 1822)

European Magazine, 82(1822), 62
Literary Chronicle, 22 and 29 June 1822, pp. 385-88, 409-12
Literary Gazette, 6 July 1822, pp. 419-20
Literary Register, 17 and 24 August 1822, pp. 97-98, 117-19
Monthly Censor, 1(1822), 467-69
Monthly Magazine, 54(1822), 152
Monthly Review, 99(1822), 439-40
New European Magazine, 1(1822), 63-66

Reviews of *The Three Perils of Woman; or, Love, Leasing, and Jealousy. A Series of Domestic Scottish Tales*, 3 vols (London, 1823)

Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 14(1823), 427-37, attributed to John Wilson in Bibliography, p. 113
British Critic, 20(1823), 357-61
British Magazine, 1(1823), 364-74
Edinburgh Literary Gazette, 10 September 1823, pp. 257-58
Emmet, 18 October 1823, pp. 25-27
Lady's Magazine, 4(1823), 707
Literary Chronicle, 27 September 1823, pp. 615-16
Literary Gazette, 30 August 1823, pp. 546-48
Northern Observer, 17 September 1823, pp. 69-75

Reviews of *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner* (London, 1824)

British Critic, 22(1824), 68-80
Examiner, 1 August 1824, pp. 482-83
Ladies' Monthly Museum, 20(1824), 106
Literary Gazette, 17 July 1824, pp. 449-51
Monthly Critical Gazette, 1(1824), 436-38
New Monthly Magazine, 12(1824), 506
News of Literature and Fashion, 17 July 1824, pp. 95-96
Universal Review, 2(1824-1825), 108-12
Westminster Review, 2(1824), 560-62
Review of Queen Hynde (London and Edinburgh, 1825)

Belfast Magazine, 1(1825), 230-43

Reviews of The Shepherd's Calendar, 2 vols (Edinburgh and London, 1829)

Athenaeum, 18 March 1829, pp.162-63
Edinburgh Literary Journal, 14 March 1829, pp.243-46
Literary Gazette, 14 March 1829, pp.173-74
Spectator, 28 March 1829, pp.203-05

Reviews of Altrive Tales: Collected among the Peasantry of Scotland, and from Foreign Adventurers (London, 1832)

Athenaeum, 14 April 1832, pp.235-37
Day, 23 April 1832, p.386
Fraser's Magazine, 5(1832), 482-89, conjecturally attributed to William Maginn in Wellesley Index, II(1972), 332
Ladies' Museum, 3(1832), 226
Literary Gazette, 31 March and 7 April 1832, pp.199-201, 214-16
Literary Rambler, 11 May 1832, p.6
Mirror, 21 April 1832, pp.254-56
Monthly Review, 2(1832), 82-100

Reviews of A Series of Lay Sermons on Good Principles and Good Breeding (London, 1834)

Fraser's Magazine, 10(1834), 1-10
Johnstone's Edinburgh Magazine, 1(1833-1834), 534-38

Reviews of Tales of the Wars of Montrose, 3 vols (London, 1835)

Athenaeum, 18 April 1835, p.297
Fraser's Magazine, 11(1835), 597-600, conjecturally attributed to William Maginn in Wellesley Index, II(1972), 347
Literary Gazette, 21 March 1835, pp.179-80
Monthly Magazine, 1(1835), 528-29
New Monthly Magazine, 44(1835), 237-38
Spectator, 18 April 1835, p.377
The Times, 9 May 1835, p.7

General articles on Hogg which include comment on his fiction

'James Hogg, the Ettrick Shepherd', Athenaeum, 26 February 1828, pp.145-47
'The Life and Literary Progress of James Hogg, the Ettrick Shepherd', Edinburgh Literary Gazette, 27 June 1829, pp.97-99
'Scotch Novels of the Second Class. No. II. Hogg's Brownie of Bodsebeck — Winter Tales — Three Perils of Man — Three Perils
THESES CONSULTED


Hepker, Dale Bertram, 'Early Nineteenth Century British Author-Publisher Relations: A Study of Murray's, Longman's, Blackwood's, and Taylor and Hessey's Relations With Selected Authors' (unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, University of Nebraska, Lincoln, 1978)


Merry, William J., 'James Hogg. An Attempt at a New Estimate, with an Account of his Place and Importance in Scottish Literature' (unpublished D.Litt. dissertation, University of Glasgow, 1922)


WORKS BY JAMES HOGG

'Adventure of the Ettrick Shepherd', Chambers's Edinburgh Journal, 19 October 1833, pp. 298-99

'Affecting Narrative of a Country Girl', The Spy, 26 January 1811, pp. 169-75

Atrractive Tales: Collected among the Peasantry of Scotland, and from Foreign Adventurers (London, 1832)

'Amusing Story of Two Highlanders', The Spy, 22 December 1810, pp. 132-34

'Anecdotes of Ghosts and Apparitions', Fraser's Magazine, 11(1835), 103-12
'Anecdotes of Highlanders', Chambers's Edinburgh Journal, 12 April 1834, p.88

'Anecdotes of Highlanders', Edinburgh Literary Journal, 24 October 1829, pp.293-95

'Aunt Susan', Fraser's Magazine, 3(1831), 720-26

'An Awfu' Lesin'-like Story', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 30 (1831), 448-56

'The Barber of Duncow — A Real Ghost Story', Fraser's Magazine, 3 (1831), 174-80

'The Border Chronicler', Literary Souvenir (1826), pp.257-79

'A Boy's Song', Remembrance (1831), pp.74-75

'The Brownie of the Black Haggs', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 24 (1828), 489-96

'The Brownie of the Black Haggs', Casket, 2(1828), 558-64


The Brownie of Bodsebeck; and other Tales, 2 vols (Edinburgh and London, 1818)

'The Cameronian Preacher's Tale', Anniversary (1829), pp.170-91

'A Child's Hymn for the Close of the Week', Juvenile Forget Me Not (1831), pp.78-80

'The Country Laird', The Spy, 9, 16, and 23 February 1811, pp.149-55, 157-64, 165-206 [Misspelled]

'Dangerous consequences of the Love of Fame', The Spy, 27 April 1811, pp.273-77

'The Danger of Changing Occupations', The Spy, 15 and 22 September 1810, pp.17-24, 25-32

'Description of a Peasant's Funeral', The Spy, 17 November 1810, pp. 92-95

'A Dialogue in the Reading Room', The Spy, 29 December 1810, pp.137-42

'The Dominie', Edinburgh Literary Journal, 26 March 1831, p.199

'Dr David Dale's Account of a Grand Aerial Voyage', Edinburgh Literary Journal, 22 January 1830, pp.50-54

'Dreadful Narrative of the Death of Major Macpherson', The Spy, 24 November 1810, pp.101-03
'Duncan and his Dog', Schoolmaster, 29 June 1833, pp.409-15

'Eastern Apologies', Forget Me Not (1829), pp.309-23

'Emigration', Chambers's Edinburgh Journal, 18 May 1833, pp.124-25

'Epistle to Mr William Berwick', Edinburgh Literary Journal, 30 May 1829, pp.418-19


'The Ettrick Shepherd's Last Tale. Helen Crocket', Fraser's Magazine, 14(1836), 425-40

'Evil Speaking Ridiculed by an Allegorical Dream', The Spy, 27 July 1811, pp.377-82

'Ewan M'Gabhar', Fraser's Magazine, 6(1832), 450-59

'Extraordinary History of a Border Beauty', Fraser's Magazine, 9 (1834), 97-110

'Fanny Lively's Letter on the impropriety of the Ladies withdrawing from Table', The Spy, 13 October 1810, pp.51-55

'The Fords of Callum: An Ower True Tale', Friendship's Offering (1830), 187-96

'The Frasers in the Correi', Fraser's Magazine, 9(1834), 273-78

'Further Anecdotes of the Shepherd's Dog', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 2(1817-1818), 621-26

'Grizel Graham', Edinburgh Literary Journal, 24 and 31 December 1831, pp.374-77, 385-87

'The Highlanders and the Boar', Johnstone's Edinburgh Magazine, 1 (1833-1834), 60

'Hints for keeping the Sabbath', Edinburgh Magazine, 10(1822), 205-09

'The History of an Auld Naig', Chambers's Edinburgh Journal, 10 August 1839, p.232

'History of the Life of Duncan Campbell', The Spy, 3 and 17 August 1811, pp.383-41, 351-408 [mispaged]

'The History of Rose Selby', Scots Magazine, 74(1812), 179-83

'The Honourable Captain Napier and Ettrick Forest', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 13(1823), 175-88

'A Horrible Instance of the Effects of Clanship', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 28(1830), 680-87
The Jacobite Relics of Scotland; Being the Songs, Airs, and Legends, of the Adherents to the House of Stuart, Second Series
(Edinburgh and London, 1821)

'A Journey through the Highlands of Scotland, in the months of July and August 1802', Scots Magazine, 64(1802), 813-18, 956-63, 65(1803), 89-95, 251-54, 312-14, 382-86

'A Last Adieu', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 1(1817), 169

'A Letter about Men and Women', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 26 (1829), 245-50

'Letter from Canada to the Ettrick Shepherd', Chambers's Edinburgh Journal, 28 December 1833, pp.383-84

'A Letter from Yarrow', Edinburgh Literary Journal, 15 November 1828, pp.9-10


'Letter signed Alice Brand', The Spy, 13 October 1810, pp.49-51

'A Letter to the Ettrick Shepherd. Signed Alice Brand', Amulet (1836), pp.212-25

'Letters on Poetry', Scots Magazine, 67(1805), 352-54, 68(1806), 17-18

Mador of the Moor; A Poem (Edinburgh and London, 1816)

'The Marvellous Doctor', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 22(1827), 349-51

'Mary Melrose', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 25(1829), 411-20

Memoir of the Author's Life and Familiar Anecdotes of Sir Walter Scott, edited by Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh and London, 1972)

'The Mermaid. A Scottish Ballad', Edinburgh Magazine, 4(1819), 400-01

'The Minister's Annie', Edinburgh Literary Journal, 26 March 1831, pp.189-92

'Misery of an Old Batchelor', The Spy, 15 December 1810, pp.121-27

'The Mistakes of a Night', Scots Magazine, 56(1794), 624

The Mountain Bard; consisting of Ballads and Songs, founded on Facts and Legendary Tales (Edinburgh, 1807)

'The Mountain-Dew Men', Fraser's Magazine, 6(1832), 161-70

'The Mysterious Bride', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 28(1830), 943-50

'New Year Paper', *The Spy*, 5 January 1811, pp. 145-51

'Noctes Bengerianae', *Edinburgh Literary Journal*, 27 December 1828, pp. 87-90

'Noctes Bengerianae. No. II', *Edinburgh Literary Journal*, 21 March 1829, pp. 258-60

'An Old Minister's Tale', *Chambers's Edinburgh Journal*, 29 June 1833, pp. 173-74

'On the Changes in the Habits, Amusements, and Condition of the Scottish Peasantry', *Quarterly Journal of Agriculture*, 3(1831-1832), 256-63

'On the Folly of Anger and Impatience under Misfortunes', *The Spy*, 16 March 1811, pp. 225-30

'On the Principle of Curiosity', *The Spy*, 4 May 1811, pp. 281-83

'On the Separate Existence of the Soul', *Fraser's Magazine*, 4(1831-1832), 529-37

'The p and the q; or, the Adventures of Jock M'Pherson', *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, 26(1829), 693-95

'The Pedlar. A Scottish Ballad in Imitation of the Ancients', *Scots Magazine*, 66(1804), 855-56

*The Pilgrims of the Sun; A Poem* (Edinburgh and London, 1816)


'Pictures of Country Life. No. III. The School of Misfortune', *Edinburgh Magazine*, 9(1821), 583-89


*The Poetic Mirror, or The Living Bards of Britain* (Edinburgh and London, 1816)


*The Queen's Wake: A Legendary Poem* (Edinburgh, 1813)

*A Queer Book* (Edinburgh and London, 1832)

'A Real Vision', *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, 28(1830), 63-65

'A Remarkable Egyptian Story', *Fraser's Magazine*, 7(1833), 147-58
Remarks on the Edinburgh Company of Players', The Spy, 24 November 1810, pp. 97-101

The Royal Jubilee. A Scottish Mask (Edinburgh and London, 1822)

'Satirical Directions to every Class in Edinburgh, in what manner to keep the Sabbath', The Spy, 30 March 1811, pp. 241-45

'Scotch Song', The Spy, 8 December 1810, p. 120

'A Scots Luve Sang', Friendship's Offering (1830), pp. 185-86

'A Scots Mummy', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 14(1823), 188-90

'Scottish Haymakers', Forget Me Not (1834), pp. 327-35

Scottish Pastorals, Poems, Songs, &c. mostly written in the Dialect of the South (Edinburgh, 1801)

'A Screed on Politics', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 37(1835), 634-42

'A Sea Story', Forget Me Not (1831), pp. 19-31

'Seeking the Houdy', Forget Me Not (1830), pp. 399-413


A Series of Lay Sermons on Good Principles and Good Breeding (London, 1834)

The Shepherd's Calendar, 2 vols (Edinburgh and London, 1829)

'The Shepherd's Calendar. Storms', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 5(1819), 75-81, 210-16

'The Shepherd's Calendar. Class Second. Deaths, Judgments, and Providences', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 13(1823), 311-20


'The Shepherd's Calendar. Class IV. Dogs', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 15(1824), 177-83

'The Shepherd's Calendar. Class V. The Lasses', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 15(1824), 296-304, 17(1825), 180-86


'The Shepherd's Calendar. Dreams and Apparitions, containing Smithy Cracks, &c. Part III', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 22(1827), 64-73


'The Shepherd's Calendar. Class IX. Fairies, Brownies, and Witches', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 23(1828), 214-27

'The Shepherd's Calendar. Class IX. Fairies, Deils, and Witches', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 23(1828), 509-19

'A Singular Letter from Southern Africa', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 26(1829), 809-16

'Singularity Censured', The Spy, 25 May 1811, pp.305-11

'Some Passages in the Life of Colonel Cloud', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 18(1825), 32-40

'Some Remarkable Passages in the Remarkable Life of the Baron St Glo', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 27(1830), 891-905

'Some Remarks on the Life of Sandy Elshinder', Edinburgh Literary Journal, 30 October 1830, pp.280-82

'Some Terrible Letters from Scotland', Metropolitan, 3(1832), 422-31

'Songs' (Edinburgh and London, 1831)

'Sound Morality', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 25(1829), 741-47

'The Spy's Account of Himself', The Spy, 1 September 1810, pp.1-8

'The Spy's Encounter with John Miller', The Spy, 17 November 1810, pp.89-92

'The Spy's Farewell to his Readers', The Spy, 17 September 1811, pp.409-15

'Stanzas Addressed to a Comet. A Night Piece', Edinburgh Magazine, 5(1819), 30

'Statistics of Selkirkshire', Prize-Essays and Transactions of the Highland Society of Scotland, 3(1832), 281-306

'Story of Adam Scott', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 28(1830), 41-46
'A Story of Good Queen Bess', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 29 (1831), 579-93


'A Story of the Forty-Six', Edinburgh Literary Journal, 26 December 1829, pp.421-22

'A Story of the Forty-Six', Chambers's Edinburgh Journal, 10 May 1834, p.118

'Story of the Ghost of Lochmaben', The Spy, 29 December 1810, pp. 142-44

'Strange Letter of a Lunatic', Fraser's Magazine, 2(1830-1831), 526-32

'A Strange Secret', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 23(1828), 822-26

'A Sunday Pastoral', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 28(1830), 737-41

'A Tale of Pentland', Amulet (1830), pp.219-41

'A Tale of the Martyrs', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 26(1829), 48-51

'Tales and Anecdotes of the Pastoral Life', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 1(1817), 22-25, 143-47, 247-50

Tales and Sketches, 6 vols (Glasgow, 1837)

Tales of the Wars of Montrose, 3 vols (London, 1835)

The Three Perils of Man: or, War, Women, and Witchcraft. A Border Romance, 3 vols (London, 1822)


The Three Perils of Woman: or, Love, Leasing, and Jealousy. A Series of Domestic Scottish Tales, 3 vols (London, 1823)

'To Mr T. M. C. London', Scots Magazine, 67(1805), 621-22

'Trials of Temper', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 23(1828), 40-46

'The True Art of Reviewing', Newcastle Magazine, 6(1827), 3-7

'The Turners', Fraser's Magazine, 13(1836), 609-19

'The Two Valleys, a Fairy Tale', Remembrance (1831), pp.121-32

'The Unearthly Witness', Fraser's Magazine, 2(1830-1831), 171-78
'Verses. Recited by the Author, in a Party of his Countrymen, on the Day that the News arrived of our final Victory over the French', Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, 1(1817), 72

'A Very Ridiculous Sermon', Fraser's Magazine, 11(1835), 226-31


'Wat the Prophet', Edinburgh Literary Journal, 12 September 1829, pp.207-10

'What is Sin?', Ackermann's Juvenile Forget Me Not (1830), pp.223-27

Winter Evening Tales, collected among the Cotagers in the South of Scotland, 2 vols (Edinburgh and London, 1820)


Works by Hogg with Others

and others, The Forest Minstrels: A Selection of Songs, Adapted to the Most Favourite Scottish Airs (Edinburgh, 1810)

and William Blackwood, To the Editor of the Glasgow Chronicle (Edinburgh, 1818)

[and William Maginn], 'The Shepherd's Noctes, and the reason why they do not appear in Fraser's Magazine', Fraser's Magazine, 8(1833), 49-54, attributed to these authors in Wellesley Index, II(1972), 338

OTHER WORKS

Articles by writers other than Hogg in the chief periodicals treated of in this study are referred to in the relevant footnotes, though not individually mentioned here.

Anon., 'Biographical Sketches of the Ettrick Shepherd', Scots Magazine, 67(1805), 14-16
Anon., 'The Ettrick Shepherd's Plagiarism', Newcastle Magazine, 7 (1828), 499-500

Anon., 'Ghost Stories. By the Old Sailor', Ackermann's Juvenile Forget Me Not (1832), pp.13-30

Anon., 'Mr Hogg and Blackwood's Magazine', The Scotsman, 11 November 1820, p.367

Anon., 'Pocket-Books and Keepsakes', Keepsake (1828), pp.1-18

'A. H. B.', 'Some Information Respecting the Ettrick Shepherd', Scots Magazine, 66(1804), 744

Acknowledgements

Adam, R. B., Works, Letters and Manuscripts of James Hogg, "The Ettrick Shepherd" (Buffalo, 1930)


Batho, Enid C., The Ettrick Shepherd (Cambridge, 1927)

Batho, Enid C., 'Notes on the Bibliography of James Hogg, the Ettrick Shepherd', Library, 16(1935-1936), 309-26

Bauer, Josephine, The London Magazine 1820-29, Anglistica, 1 (Copenhagen, 1953)

Bertram, James, Some Memories of Books, Authors and Events (London, 1893)

Blackie, Agnes A. C., Blackie and Son 1809-1959 (London and Glasgow, 1959)


Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine, volumes 1-38 (1817-1835)

Borland, R., editor, James Hogg, The Ettrick Shepherd. Memorial
Volume (Selkirk, 1898)

Boston, Thomas, Memoirs of the Life, Times, and Writings of the
Reverend and Learned Thomas Boston (Edinburgh, 1776)

Boyle, Andrew, An Index to the Annals (Worcester, 1967)

Bulwer, Edward Lytton, England and the English, second edition, 2
vols (London, 1833)

Burleigh, J. H. S., A Church History of Scotland (London, 1960)

Burns, Robert, Poems, Chiefly in the Scottish Dialect, facsimile of
the first edition (Kilmarnock, 1786; Glasgow, 1927)

Bushnell, George Herbert, 'XVIII. "The Spy": James Hogg's Adventure
in Journalism', in From Papyrus to Print: A Bibliographical
Miscellany (London, 1947), pp. 147-54

Campbell, Ian, 'Author and Audience in Hogg's Confessions of a
Justified Sinner', Scottish Literary News, 2(1971-1972), 66-75

Campbell, Ian, 'Hogg's "Confessions of a Justified Sinner"',
Liturgical Review, 2: no. 2 (November 1972), 28-33

Campbell, Ian, editor, Nineteenth-Century Scottish Fiction: Critical
Essays (Manchester, 1979)

Chambers, William, Memoir of Robert Chambers with Autobiographic
Reminiscences of William Chambers (Edinburgh and London, 1872)

Chambers's Edinburgh Journal, volumes 1-4 (1832-1835)

Clive, John, Scotch Reviewers: The Edinburgh Review, 1802-15
(London, 1957)

Cockburn, Henry, Memorials of His Time, edited by Harry A. Cockburn
(Edinburgh and London, 1909)

of Author to Patron, Publisher, and Public, 1780-1832 (London,
1928)

Constable, Thomas, Archibald Constable and his Literary Correspondents,
3 vols (Edinburgh, 1873)

'A Constant Reader', 'Farther Inquiries respecting the Ettrick
Shepherd', Scots Magazine, 67 (1805), 203-04

Craig, David, Scottish Literature and the Scottish People 1680-1830
(London, 1961)

Craig-Brown, T., The History of Selkirkshire or Chronicles of Ettrick
Forest, 2 vols (Edinburgh, 1886)
Cunningham, T. M., 'Answer to the Ettrick Shepherd. August Magazine 1805', Scots Magazine, 68(1806), 206-08

Curwen, Henry, A History of Booksellers, the Old and the New (London, [1873])

Douglas, Sir George, The 'Blackwood' Group (Edinburgh and London, 1897)

Douglas, Sir George, James Hogg (Edinburgh and London, 1899)

Dunlop, John, The History of Fiction: Being a Critical Account of the most Celebrated Prose Works of Fiction, from the earliest Greek Romances to the Novels of the Present Age, 3 vols (London, 1814)

Edinburgh Literary Journal, volumes 1-6 (1828-1831)

Elwin, Malcolm, Victorian Wallflowers (London, 1934)


Forget Me Not (1824-1840)

Fraser's Magazine, volumes 1-14 (1830-1836)

Friendship's Offering (1824, 1831, 1832, 1835, 1836)

Froude, James Anthony, Thomas Carlyle: A History of the First Forty Years of his Life 1795-1835, 2 vols (London, 1882)

Frye, Northrop, 'Towards Defining an Age of Sensibility', ELH, 23 (1956), 144-52

'G.', 'Some Particulars Relative to the Ettrick Shepherd', New Monthly Magazine, 46(1836), 194-203, 335-42, 443-46

Galt, John, Selected Short Stories, edited by Ian A. Gordon (Edinburgh, 1978)

Mrs Garden, Memorials of James Hogg, the Ettrick Shepherd (Paisley and London, n.d.)


Gilfillan, George, *A Gallery of Literary Portraits* (Edinburgh, 1845)


Mrs Gordon, 'Christopher North': *A Memoir of John Wilson*, 2 vols (Edinburgh, 1862)

Graham, Walter, *English Literary Periodicals* (New York, 1930)


Hadden, J. Cuthbert, *George Thomson: The Friend of Burns: His Life and Correspondence* (London, 1898)


Hill, Isabel, 'Impulse and Amiability', *Juvenile Forget Me Not* (1831), pp. 84-100

Hogg, Rev. David, *Life of Allan Cunningham, with Selections from his Works and Correspondence* (Dumfries, 1875)


Hughes, Mrs. of Uffington, *Letters and Recollections of Sir Walter Scott*, edited by Horace G. Hutchinson (London, 1904)

Hypocrisy Unveiled, and Calumny Detected: *In a Review of Blackwood's Magazine* (Edinburgh, 1818)

Jaeger, Muriel, Before Victoria (London, 1956)

Jerdan, William, Men I have Known (London, 1866)

Jerdan, William, The Autobiography of William Jerdan with his Literary Political and Social Reminiscences and Correspondence during the last fifty years, 4 vols (London, 1852-1853)


Juvenile Forget Me Not (1831)


Kirkton, Rev. James, The Secret and True History of the Church of Scotland, from the Restoration to the year 1687, edited by Charles Kirkpatrick Sharpe (Edinburgh, 1817)

Knight, Charles, Passages of a Working Life During Half a Century: with a Prelude of Early Reminiscences, 3 vols (London, 1864-1865)

Knight, Charles A., 'The Created World of the Edinburgh Periodicals', Scottish Literary Journal, 6 no. 2 (December 1979), 20-36


Lang, Andrew, The Life and Letters of John Gibson Lockhart, 2 vols (London, 1897)

The 'Life' of the Ettrick Shepherd Anatomized: In a Series on the Autobiography of James Hogg, prefixed to the first volume of the 'Altrive Tales', By An Old Dissector (Edinburgh, 1832)

Literary Souvenir (1825-1834)

Lively, Cheryl, 'Truth in Writing: The Standard of Realism for the Novel in Fraser's Magazine 1830-1850', Victorian Periodicals Newsletter, 6 nos. 3-4 (December 1973), 3-10


Lounger, sixth edition, 3 vols (London, 1804)


Madden, R. R., *The Literary Life and Correspondence of the Countess of Blessington*, 3 vols (London, 1855)

Miscellaneous Writings of the late Dr Maginn, Volume V, *Fraserian Papers*, edited by R. Shelton Mackenzie (New York, 1857)


Mirror, tenth edition, 3 vols (London, 1794)

The Life of Mary Russell Mitford, Related in a Selection from her Letters to her Friends, edited by Rev. A. G. L'Estrange, 3 vols (London, 1870)

The Modern Athens: A Dissection and Demonstration of Men and Things in the Scotch Capital (London, 1825)


Moir, D. M., 'Young William's Deathbed', *Ackermann's Juvenile Forget Me Not* (1830), 219-22

Noctes Ambrosianae, edited by R. Shelton Mackenzie, 5 vols (New York, 1859)


'Quivive', 'Literary Mistakes Rectified', *Clydesdale Magazine*, 1(1818), 133-35


Rogers, Charles, *Ettrick Forest, The Ettrick Shepherd and his Monument* (Edinburgh, 1860)


Russell, James, *Reminiscences of Yarrow* (Edinburgh and London, 1886)

'S. W.', 'To the Editor of the Scots Magazine', *Scots Magazine*, 64 (1802), 812 [Walter Scott]

*Scots Magazine*, volumes 64-71 (1802-1809)


Sinton, James, untitled communication on *The Spy*, *Scottish Notes and Queries*, 7 (1905-1906), 89-91


*Spectator*, edited by Donald F. Bond, 5 vols (Oxford, 1965)

*The Spy* (1810-1811)

Stephenson, Henry Thew, *The Ettrick Shepherd: A Biography*, Indiana University Studies, 54 (Bloomington, Indiana, 1922)


Strout, Alan Lang, 'Concerning the Noctes Ambrosianae', *Modern Language Notes*, 51 (1936), 493-504

Strout, Alan Lang, 'James Hogg's "Chaldee Manuscript"', *PMLA*, 65 (1950), 695-718

Strout, Alan Lang, 'James Hogg's Forgotten Satire, John Patterson's Mare', *PMLA*, 52 (1937), 427-60

Strout, Alan Lang, 'James Hogg's the Spy, 1810-1811', *Notes and Queries*, 180 (1941), 272-76

Strout, Alan Lang, 'The Noctes Ambrosianae and James Hogg', Review of English Studies, 13(1937), 46-63, 177-89

Strout, Alan Lang, 'Purple Patches in the Noctes Ambrosianae', ELH, 2(1935), 327-31

Tallent-Bateman, Charles T., 'The "Forget Me Not"', Papers of the Manchester Literary Club, 28(1902), 78-98


Watts, A. A., 'The Conversazione', Literary Souvenir (1832), pp.222-51

Watts, Alaric Alfred, Alaric Watts. A Narrative of His Life, 2 vols (London, 1884)

Walch, J., 'Inquiry Concerning the Ettrick Shepherd', Scots Magazine, 66(1804), 572-73

The Wellesley Index to Victorian Periodicals 1824-1900, edited by Walter E. Houghton and others, (Toronto and London, 1966 —)

Willis, N. P., Pencillings By the Way, second edition, 3 vols (London, 1836)

Wodrow, Robert, Analecta; or, Materials for a History of Remarkable Providences Mostly Relating to Scotch Ministers and Christians, edited by M. Leishmann, Maitland Club, 4 vols (Edinburgh, 1842-1843)
Wodrow, Robert, The History of the Sufferings of the Church of Scotland, from the Restoration [sic] to the Revolution, 2 vols (Edinburgh, 1721)


'Z.', 'Farther Particulars of the Life of James Hogg, the Ettrick Shepherd', Scots Magazine, 67(1805), 501-03, 820-23