TONALITY IN WAGNER'S DER RING DES NIBELUNGEN

I certify that this thesis is my own unaided work

A.H. LAING
TONALITY IN WAGNER'S DER RING DES NIBELUNGEN

How is the harmonic direction of the music determined by non-musical considerations?

A.H. Laing

Ph.D.

University of Edinburgh

1973
ABSTRACT OF THESIS

Name of Candidate  A.H. LAING

Address  12 RAYMOND AVENUE, CANTERBURY, KENT

Degree  Ph.D.  Date  1st August 1973

Title of Thesis  TONALITY IN RICHARD WAGNER'S DER RING DES NIBELUNGEN - How is the harmonic direction of the music determined by non-musical considerations?

The thesis examines the extent to which considerations other than those derived from "purely musical" concepts of harmonic architecture determine the movement of tonalities in the Ring. Reference is made to Wagner's own theoretical and biographical writings and to his correspondence, and extensive reference is made to the original sketches of the Ring music (now housed in the Richard-Wagner-Archiv, Bayreuth). Although reference is made to other Wagner works, the thesis is concerned particularly with the Ring; the structure of complex Motiv manipulation and the Stabreim verse construction being peculiar to that work. The examination is divided into five sections.

In the first of these, the relationship between particular musical Motive and particular tonalities is exhaustively investigated. From this investigation it is evident that certain Motive do have a very close link with a particular tonality, and that the use of these Motive (particularly in response to mention of an object or character in the text) is instrumental in the determination of the harmonic direction of the music. Other Motive display relationships of varying consistency and type; and these are classified accordingly.

The second section examines the Ring for similar relationships between characters or emotions and tonality. Less conclusive and more variable relationships are here established.

The third section is concerned with the way in which these various relationships are used to influence the harmonic structure of the Ring beyond the simple device of direct object-Motiv association. Here extensive reference is made to the technique of "Foreboding and Remembrance" expounded by Wagner in Oper und Drama (1851), by which musical Motive not explicit in the text would be introduced to form a musical drama complementing and extending that on the stage. This section also examines the use of dramatic recapitulation of more extended sections of music in the same terms.

The fourth section examines the ways in which variation of the relationships established in the preceding sections may lead to further situations in which the drama can be felt to be influencing the harmonic architecture. In particular, the dramatic significances of diatonicism and chromaticism are discussed. An examination of Wagner's technique of underlying the drama
by combination of two or more Motive into a single musical unit (as suggested in his *Über die Anwendung der Musik auf das Drama* of 1879) reveals little of significance in terms of the drama itself influencing harmonic direction.

The final section is concerned with the influence of the verse of the *Ring* poem itself upon the harmonic architecture. Wagner's adaptation of the Old High German Stabreim verse is related to his concept of the "poetic-musical-period" (introduced in *Oper und Drama*), and sections of the *Ring* are analysed to illustrate the extent to which this procedure, in which musical modulation is determined by the movement of emotions and changing of alliterative sounds in the text, was applied. A comparison is made with the major analysis of the *Ring* made by Alfred Lorenz in the 1920's which, though concerned with the "poetic-musical period", approaches the analysis more from a musical than a dramatic standpoint. The material of the preceding four sections is here utilised to illustrate the way in which predetermination of tonality, and even actual moments of modulation, were already implicit in the verse of the *Ring* poem, independent of any considerations of abstract, "purely-musical" harmonic architecture.
CONTENTS:

INTRODUCTION AND NOTES: p. 4
1. Siegfrieds Tod 9
2. The Ring sketches 9
3. Abbreviations 9
4. Translations 9
5. Nomenclature of Leitmotive 9

FOREWORD 19

I THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN MOTIVE AND TONALITY 26
1. The principles of Motiv-tonality relationship 27
2. The classification of Motive 33
3. Conclusion 63

II OTHER TONALITY RELATIONSHIPS 67
1. Character and tonality 68
2. Emotion and tonality 84
3. A note on transposition 89
4. The choices of tonalities for extended sections of the Ring 103

III ABNUNG UND ERINNERUNG ("FOREBODING AND REMEMBRANCE") 111
1. The theory as it appears in Oper und Drama 112
2. The extension of the Oper und Drama theory in the Ring 119
3. Investigation of the extent to which the use of the technique affects tonality in the Ring
   i) "Foreboding" without "Remembrance" 124
   ii) "Remembrance" without "Foreboding" 131
   iii) "Remembrance and Foreboding" 142
IV CHROMATICISM, MOTIV-ADAPTATION AND -COMBINATION. 187

1. The dramatic significances of diatonicism and chromaticism 188
2. The technique of harmonic/emotional intensification of Motive 203
3. Motive-combination 220
4. A note on the use of key-signatures in the Ring 236

V THE STABREIM AND THE DICHTERISCH-MUSIKALISCHE PERIODE 245

1. The Stabreim
   i) The Stabreim in Old High German verse 246
   ii) Wagner's adoption and adaptation of the Stabreim 249
2. The dichterisch-musikalische Periode
   i) Wagner's poetic-musical theory 261
   ii) The theory in practice in the Ring 266
3. Analysis of Siegfried Act I Sc.1 and comparison with the Periode analysis of Alfred Lorenz
   a) Some details in Mime's soliloquy 283
   b) The large-scale analysis of the remainder of the scene 289
4. Conclusions 301

APPENDICES 307

1. Table of Motive 308
2. Classification of Motive 321
3. The relationship between character and tonality 325
4. The Periode structure of the Ring 326

BIBLIOGRAPHY 332

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS 337

ERRATUM

"Eulenburg" (Miniature Scores) is misspelt "Eulenberg" throughout.
The existing Wagner literature falls into the following main categories:

i) musical
ii) biographical
iii) concerning the poems and their philosophy and psychology
iv) concerning performance

These may comprise separate volumes or form the constituent parts of a general study of Wagner. It is however notable that the first of these aspects, the musical, has had comparatively little space devoted to it. Such literature as concerns itself with musical commentary or analysis comprises:

a) the separate references or single chapter within a book basically concerned with biography or with some aspect of the drama. In this category may also be included collections of essays, and articles.

b) the continuous commentary: a retelling of the story, but with musical illustration and comment.

c) the exhaustive study of some single aspect or aspects of Wagner's work, taking up an entire volume.

While the first of these, the short chapter or article, may contain material of importance, it generally suffers from its brevity in relation to the size of Wagner's output unless the matter with which it is concerned is extremely limited. The second, by its nature, generally does not have the scope to examine issues in detail.
Of the exhaustive studies of Wagner's works, one thing is immediately apparent – the reluctance of authors to deal with Wagner's musical language. There exists a monumental study of the formal construction, and investigations into the purely musical structure (particularly of Tristan), but very few indeed have ever attempted to relate the musical content of the works to the standpoint of Wagner's own statements on the matter. The fact that these statements are extremely few and far between in his voluminous and frequently obscure writings may account for this, especially as such statements are concerned with music related to drama, rather than with music itself.

Few but the most casual readers of the Ring score can however fail to have been struck by the fact that certain elements of the musical matter appear to be strongly associated with particular tonalities. The most obvious of such relationships is that between the Motiv of the fortress Walhall and the key of D flat major. Wagner himself however makes no mention in his writings of anything concerning harmonic construction down to the details of individual tonalities, and the significances of individual tonalities have not been exhaustively investigated by the analysts.

My original intention had been to examine Wagner's harmonic structure from the starting point of such relationships between dramatic elements and the tonalities associated with them (with reference, as far as is possible, to the statements in Wagner's theoretical works), and then to relate this examination to the larger construction. This large-scale construction of the mature works had been fairly exhaustively investigated by Alfred Lorenz.
in the 1920's, although he did not generally attempt to account for the way in which various tonalities were used in the structure, a structure which he derived from Wagner's concept of the dichterisch-musikalische Periode. In fact, Lorenz largely ignored that part of the Periode theory which was concerned with modulation within that unit of construction, and he further applied the term, (conceived by Wagner with particular reference to the Ring) to all the mature works, using it merely to denote a musical paragraph of a certain type. He ignored for this purpose the origin of the term in Oper und Drama (1850-51), where it was directly related to the Stabreim verse construction peculiar to the Ring. It was immediately apparent that in the internal structure of the dichterisch-musikalische Periode was an area which had not been the subject of any major study and which, together with the principle of Motiv-tonality association, and with the principles set down in Oper und Drama (in particular the device of "foreboding and remembrance"), could be shown to be the basis of the harmonic structure of the Ring on the scale of each musical/textual phrase. The means of harmonic organisation of such individual phrases have never been accounted for.

That this area was completely uncharted in Wagner scholarship was confirmed by Dr. Joachim Bergfeld, Director of the Richard Wagner Gedenkstätte, Bayreuth, the library of which houses over 20,000 volumes and is the world's most important collection of secondary literature concerning the composer. Dr. Bergfeld further pointed out that Wagner's Stabreim verse had not been the subject of any investigation since the time of those works concerned primarily with linguistics dating from the turn of the century. I am indebted to Dr. Bergfeld for giving me
the benefit of his very extensive knowledge of the immense Wagner literature.

If investigating the use of tonality in the Ring in these terms were to be more than a mere detailing of the procedure as it appears in the printed score, it would be essential to divine what significance (if any) Wagner himself attached to particular tonalities. In addition to surveying the prose works and the correspondence in which he mentions his music, it would be necessary to investigate the form in which Wagner originally conceived the musical elements of the Ring. Wagner's musical sketches have been largely ignored by analysts of his works; in general, earlier versions of the music were not relevant to existing investigations. Any alterations in tonality in the development of the Ring music in Wagner's mind would however here be of paramount importance, and accordingly I consulted the various sketches (detailed elsewhere in this volume) which comprise part of the Richard-Wagner-Archiv in Haus Wahnfried, Bayreuth. I am particularly grateful to the present Director, Frau Gertrud Strobel, widow of the first Wahnfried archivist, Otto Strobel, for the benefit of her intimate knowledge of the Wagner sketch material, and for many kindnesses during my study period in Wahnfried. In the light of alterations occurring in these sketches it became evident that certain tonalities did indeed have definite significance for Wagner, and that he had tried, so far as was consistent with the musical flow of the work, to reach these keys at appropriate moments in the course of the drama.

The establishment of these various facts led me to narrow the scope of my study to the extra-musical influences on the tonal
construction of the Ring: namely i) the significance of certain tonalities in the dramatic scheme, ii) the effect of the dramatic device of "foreboding and remembrance" and iii) the influence of the Stabreim verse on harmonic movement throughout the cycle. These are areas which separately and collectively have not been explored in the field of Wagner scholarship.

In the text which follows, extensive reference is made to the Ring sketches and to Wagner's collected correspondence and literary writings. The following notes concern the sources to which most frequent reference is made.
NOTES

1. SIEGFRIEDS TOD

Wagner's original conception of the material concerning the death of Siegfried had been of a single drama entitled *Siegfrieds Tod*. The poem of this work (which corresponds approximately to the dramatic material which eventually formed Götterdämmerung) was written in 1848. In 1850 Wagner attempted the composition of some of the music for the work, but quickly abandoned this, setting out instead on the writing of his major theoretical work *Oper und Drama* ('Opera and Drama'). In this he discussed the problems of operatic composition, problems which clearly had come to light through his experiences with the *Siegfrieds Tod* poem and music.

A drama entitled *Junger Siegfried* ('Young Siegfried') was written in 1851, as a prelude to *Siegfrieds Tod*, and the project finally extended to include *Das Rheingold* and *Die Walküre*. The title *Siegfrieds Tod* however was retained for the final work of the cycle until more than half of the tetralogy had been set to music; it is not until June 1856 (*Die Walküre* was completed in April 1856) that any mention is found of the title *Götterdämmerung*. 
For the Ring Wagner adopted a method of sketching different from that used for his earlier works, in which the draft had taken the form of a complete 'vocal score', from which the orchestration could then be made. Such was the complexity of the orchestral texture which he envisaged for the Ring that he committed to paper only the very barest outlines; these served as a reminder and the detailed texture was carried in his head. He himself observed that if, for any reason, he was obliged to leave the sketch for a period of more than a few days, he had great difficulty in picking up the threads again from this outline. The scoring was carried out directly from this Kompositionsskizze (for the last two dramas of the Ring an intermediate sketch (the Orchesterskizze) was also made).

The various sketches for the Ring, referred to in the following pages, fall into four categories: the Einzelskizzen, the Kompositionskizzen, the Orchesterskizzen and the Partiturschriften; these names were coined by Otto Strobel, Wahnfried archivist until his death in 1953. The manuscripts form part of the Richard-Wagner-Archiv in Haus Wahnfried, though the following are not to be found in the collection:

a) Siegfrieds Tod – a few pages of this work were composed in 1850. These sketches are in the Library of Congress in Washington. A neat copy of the first 150 bars of the work is in private hands in France.
b) The Partiturschriften of Rheingold and Die Walküre disappeared in Berlin in 1945 during the War. Their whereabouts (assuming they still exist) are unknown.

The various sketches take the following forms:

The Einzelskizzen: the original rough jottings of single ideas - a collection of single sheets of paper, both music paper and ordinary writing paper, with only one or two fragments scribbled thereon, and perhaps labelled (e.g. "Fafner"). Some of these sheets were clearly taken from the Kompositionsskizzen and used as rough paper, since they bear rejected portions of the Ring music, overwritten with new, unrelated ideas. They do not generally bear any dates, and are frequently very confused, being written variously in both ink and pencil.

The Kompositionsskizzen: the basic sketches of the Ring music - a collection of single small sheets of paper gathered together in folders. They comprise a complete sketch of the Ring in barest outline, generally indicating only the vocal line (with words) and a bass. At several points there stands a bass line by itself which has been crossed out, suggesting that perhaps the harmonic structure was sometimes set down before the vocal melody. Only two staves (and occasionally three) are used at a time, full harmony being occasionally indicated, and important appearances of Motive sometimes included. These sketches were originally worked in pencil and overwritten in ink for permanence (a large part of Götterdämmerung was not inked over).
A page from the Kompositionsskizze of Rheingold. (By courtesy of Frau Gertrud Strobel, Richard-Wagner-Archiv, Bayreuth.)
Although there is considerable alteration in both pencil and ink (making the work indecipherable in places) they are more than half way to being fair copies, the rough compositional process already having taken place in Wagner's mind. Wagner used the piano only to check over what he had already conceived in outline. He told Cosima in 1874 that he used the keyboard "only to recall things — no new idea occurs to me there". Some passages extend for several pages with no alteration at all, but the music of some sections is totally different from the music finally adopted, and other parts are very sketchy indeed (e.g. the Funeral Music consists of odd pairs of bars written all over the page). The beginnings and ends of acts are dated, sometimes with humorous comments, and there are additional dates and comments throughout.

The Orchesterskizzen: neat copies of the entire texture, written on between three and six staves. All motivic detail is included and there are a few indications of instrumentation. They are again dated and are extremely legible, written in ink and mostly in the copperplate hand for which Wagner was famous. Where differences exist between the Kompositionsskizze and published score, the Orchesterskizze almost always contains the final version. Where there are alterations, both versions are legible in all but a few cases. The pages are gathered into volumes of large format, and expensively bound.

The Partiturschriften: the original pencil and ink full scores. The instrumental staves are not in the traditional order (flute at the top, basses at the bottom), but were added as and when required upon whichever stave was convenient or
available. Some pages clearly are neat copies, with the staves labelled in the usual pattern, and free of all alteration. Even the rough pages represent however a final version, and carry instructions to the copyist or engraver regarding transposing instruments and the allocation of staves. Dates of commencement and completion are added, and the volumes are again bound in velvet.
3. Abbreviations

In the following pages, abbreviations are employed for the works to which most frequent reference is made.

i) The Ring dramas are referred to by the formula
Work/Page in Eulenberg score / Bar number on that page.
Thus, W/493/7 denotes Die Walküre; p.493; bar 7.

ii) GS (followed by volume and page number): Richard Wagners Gesammelte Schriften und Dichtungen herausgegeben von Julius Käpp. 14 Bände (Leipzig n.d.)

iii) ML Richard Wagner, Mein Leben. 2 Bände (München 1911)

iv) WL Briefwechsel zwischen Wagner und Liszt. 2 Bände (Leipzig 1887)

v) WU Richard Wagners Briefe an T. Uhlig, W. Fischer und F. Heine (Leipzig 1888)

vi) WA Richard Wagners Briefe ausgewählt und erläutert von W. Altmann. 2 Bände (Leipzig n.d.)

All other references are given in full.
4. TRANSLATIONS

All translations from the German are by the author except:

i) The English versions of quotations from the Gesammelte Schriften und Dichtungen are based on the translation by William Ashton Ellis 1.

ii) The translations of extracts from Mein Leben are adapted from the anonymous "official" translation 2.

iii) Translations of the Ring poem are not offered where extended sections of this are quoted for analysis, or where the quotation is added merely to make a reference clearer. In the longer sections which are analysed, the structure is examined with particular reference to the German language, and a translation would only confuse the argument. The translation printed in the Eulenberg score (to which reference is made) adequately conveys the gist of the text at these points.

iv) The German term Motiv (pl. Motive) is used throughout to refer to musical Leitmotive. Where the English word 'motif' is used it does not refer to Leitmotiv, and the context of its use makes the meaning clear.


2 Richard Wagner, My Life (London 1911, reprinted 1963)
5. NOMENCLATURE OF LEITMOTIVE

A complete table of Motive is given in Appendix I. The names used are those which are most familiar, even when these are somewhat fanciful. For the most basic Motive, the English names (e.g. sword-Motiv, gold, spear etc.) are used, but where a German proper name is involved the German (e.g. Walhall-Motiv) is retained. The German names for such phrases as Vernichtungs-arbeitmotiv and Wälsungenwehthemata are similarly retained as these are less cumbersome than an English rendering, and are the terms most familiar for the music in question. An English translation of such names is included in the Appendix.
TONALITY IN WAGNER'S DER RING DES NIBELUNGEN

How is the harmonic direction of the music determined by non-musical considerations?
The construction of Wagner's Der Ring des Nibelungen has fascinated many musical commentators, and has led to countless "analyses" of the giant work, but the great majority of these do little more than retell the story and quote some of the Leitmotive. The one really major and exhaustive study, that of Alfred Lorenz published in 1924, applies itself to the formal structure of the Ring (and in subsequent volumes to Tristan, Die Meistersinger and Parsifal) from the standpoint of phrase-length, numbers of bars, various formal units (the Bar, the strophic song etc.), and the whole within a context of the dichterisch-musikalische Periode — a concept drawn from Wagner's own theoretical writings. Joseph Kerman speaks of Lorenz's analysis as being "with the aid of fantastic special pleading, and at length dreadful to contemplate; [the] work is all the more infuriating as a reductio ad absurdum of certain valid insights"; and talks of the procedures of his analytical method as "questionable". Ernest Newman confined his description of the work to the double-edged adjective "remarkable".

1 Alfred Lorenz, Das Geheimnis der Form bei Richard Wagner — Band I: Der musikalische Aufbau des Bühnenfestspieles Der Ring des Nibelungen (Berlin 1924; reprint Tutzing 1966)
2 Joseph Kerman, Opera as Drama (New York 1956), p. 206
3 Ibid, p. 16
The great value of Lorenz's monumental (though somewhat laborious) study lies in his exposition of the formal structure of each Periode. He did however omit to consider the organisation of tonality within the Periode except to acknowledge that modulation took place and to place each Periode in a particular key. He made little attempt to account for the modulations themselves in either dramatic or purely musical terms, and it is this omission which leads his study into occasional suspect formal conclusions concerning the "periodic" structure.

Wagner's system of key organisation (if such should exist) is a subject which has been avoided by the most distinguished of analytical commentators. Some tantalising illustrations from the writings of Tovey will suffice:

... I began to appreciate a fact ... that there is at least as much of recapitulation and balance of form in the later Wagner operas as there is in any classical symphony ....

..... A mature Wagner Opera is organised as highly, and almost as purely musically, as a Beethoven Symphony. Its organisation is on totally different lines; and any analysis that attempts to apply symphonic terms to Wagner is doomed to fantastic abstruseness. But the analysis of Wagner's music into hundreds of short themes associated with dramatic incidents and thoughts carries us no farther into his principles of composition than the compiling of a dictionary of his words. The music is no more built from these details than the drama is built from its words.

..... I conceive the project of analysing Wagner's Ring as a piece of absolute music.

1 See for example: Lorenz, Op. cit. p. 294
2 D.F. Tovey, Essays and Lectures on Music (London 1949) p. 171
3 Ibid. p. 218
4 D.F. Tovey, Musical Textures (London 1941) pp. 87-88
Tovey reiterated in all his writings that the mature Wagner works could be analysed in some way, but he never carried through any such analysis himself, with the exceptions of the Vorspiele and the "bleeding chunks", nor did he lay down the principles upon which such large-scale analysis would be based.

In fact, as the following pages will show, Tovey was wrong to dismiss the "analysis of Wagner's music into hundreds of short themes" as irrelevant to an understanding of Wagner's principles of composition. They do in fact ultimately have a strong bearing on the tonal organisation of the larger structure.

Formal analysis in the traditional sense is certainly of little help in establishing the existence of any harmonic scheme in the Ring, and although Wagner himself produced volumes on his theories of drama and its relationship with music, he penned remarkably little concerning the music itself. The established relationships between keys and the varying significance of these relationships (e.g. tonic-dominant in simple binary form; tonic-mediant in the Waldstein Sonata) are of minimal interest in a work of the size of the Ring, and in one of such advanced harmonic substance.

It is similarly unproductive to refer to first and second subjects, subject and countersubject, or even to melody and accompaniment in any sense reminiscent of traditional analysis, and it is therefore necessary to establish other criteria in order to determine points of reference for key-movement, both on the small scale within a phrase, and on increasingly larger scales to embrace whole musical paragraphs, and even whole scenes or acts.
The element which is most immediately appropriate for investigation in these terms is the celebrated device of Leitmotiv. This is a term which has been grossly misused, and which was not even originated by Wagner, but by Hans von Wolzogen, the first commentator on the Ring, and editor of the notorious Bayreuther Blätter. Wagner acquiesced in its use, though he avoided the term himself: in his essay Über die Anwendung der Musik auf das Drama ('On the Application of Music to Drama') written in 1879, he refers to the "so-named by one of my younger friends — Leitmotiv" but observes that Wolzogen, the non-musician, had viewed the Motive in terms of their "dramatic significance" ("dramatischen Bedeutungskeit") rather than their "utilisation for musical construction" ("Verwertung für den musikalischen Satzbau"). Wagner contrasts this with the attitude of contemporary academics who decried the "wild confusion of my movements" without contemplating the dramatic significance of their content. The implication is that the organisation of the "musikalischer Satzbau" is dependent on the use of the Leitmotive in the service of the drama; in which case, these Motive would themselves have some significance in the tonal scheme. This can be shown to be the case.

The situation in which the all-embracing use of the term Leitmotiv has come to mean anything from a two-note figure to a sixteen-bar tune needs some clarification. Wolzogen's original group of ninety Motive have been increased in number by subsequent

1 Hans von Wolzogen, Thematischer Leitfaden durch die Musik zu Richard Wagners Festspiel Der Ring des Nibelungen (Leipzig 1876)
2 GS XIII 291 ("von ihm sogenanten 'Leitmotive' ")
3 GS XIII 291 ("die Verworrenheit meines musikalischen Satzes" — Ellis translates this as "wild confusion of my periods", but the term "period" (Periode) has a much more definite connotation: see Section V.2.)
analyses in the century since the term was originated, and the majority of these are certainly not motifs in the real sense of the word. Wagner never used the term himself; he generally used the simple word Motiv in his correspondence, though in 1867 he referred to \textit{Hauptmotiv} when discussing Heinrich Porges' analysis of \textit{Tristan}. He otherwise referred to \textit{Hauptthemen} (1851) and \textit{Grundthemen} (1879). These two references, one written before the \textit{Ring} was begun, and one after it was completed, are most illuminating regarding the significance which he attached to these \textit{Themen}:

\begin{itemize}
  \item[i)] Jede Hauptstimmung musste, der Natur des Stoffes gemäss, auch einen bestimmten musikalischen Ausdruck gewinnen, der sich der Gehörempfindung als ein bestimmtes musikalisches Thema herausstellte. Wie im Verlaufe des Dramas die beabsichtige Fülle einer entscheidenden Hauptstimmung nur durch eine, dem Gefühle immer gegenwärtige Entwicklung der angeregten Stimmungen überhaupt zu erzeugen war, so musste notwendig auch der, das sinnliche Gefühl unmittelbar bestimmende, musikalische Ausdruck an dieser Entwicklung zur höchsten Fülle einen entscheidenden Anteil nehmen; und dies gestaltete sich ganz von selbst durch ein, jederzeit charakteristisches, Gewebe der Hauptthemen, das sich nicht über eine Szene (wie früher im einzelnen Operngesangstücke), sondern über das ganze Drama, und zwar in innigster Beziehung zur dichterischen Absicht ausbreitete.\footnote{GS I 151–2 (1851)}
\end{itemize}

(Each principal mood, in keeping with the nature of the material, had also to gain a definite musical expression, which should display itself to the ear as a definite musical theme. Just as, in the course of the drama, the intended depth of a decisive principal mood was only to be reached through the development (continuously presented to the feeling) of the individual moods already roused, so the musical expression (which directly influenced the feeling) had necessarily
to take a decisive share in this development. This took place, quite of its own volition, in the network of Hauptthemen, which not only spread themselves over one scene (as hitherto in separate operatic 'numbers') but which, in intimate association with the poetic intention, spanned the whole drama.)

ii) Die neue Form der dramatischen Musik muss, um wiederum als Musik ein Kunstwerk zu bilden, die Einheit des Symphoniesatzes aufweisen, und dies erreicht sie, wenn sie, im innigsten Zusammenhange mit demselben, über das ganze Drama sich erstreckt, nicht nur über einzelne kleinere, willkürlich herausgehobene Teile desselben. Diese Einheit gibt sich dann in einem das ganze Kunstwerk durchziehenden Gewebe von Grundthemen, welche sich, ähnlich wie im Symphoniesatz, gegenüberstehen, ergänzen, neu gestalten, trennen und verbinden: nur dass hier die ausgeführte und aufgeführte dramatische Handlung die Gesetze der Scheidungen und Verbindungen gibt, welche dort allerursprünglichst den Bewegungen des Tanzes entnommen waren.¹

( In order to become a truly musical art-work again, the new form of dramatic music must have the unity of the symphonic movement: and this it attains by spreading itself over the whole drama in the closest relationship with it, not merely over single, smaller, arbitrarily selected parts. This unity is produced by a network of Grundthemen pervading the whole drama which are contrasted, complemented, reshaped, separated and linked with each other as in the symphonic movement; only that here the needs of the dramatic action dictate the laws of parting and combining, laws which in the symphony were originally derived from the physical movements of the dance.)

¹ Wagner clearly regarded the Grundthemen as the element (or one of several) which gave the work cohesion. In this context their function is comparable with the melodic subjects in the classical sonata, and it would therefore be of importance to examine their tonal associations over the breadth of the Ring.

¹ GS XIII 290-1 (1879)
Of the terms Leitmotiv, Hauptmotiv, Grundthema and Haupthema, the first of these has become established as the collective term for Wagnerian association-themes. There seems no reason to abandon this term in favour of Wagner's own, although Leitthema might be more appropriate in the case of some of the longer themes - Wagner himself refers to the Walhallthema (which contains four distinct Motive). The term Thema will accordingly be used for longer tunes which contain several Motive possessing an existence of their own.

Since the creation of the poem and music of the Ring spanned over a quarter-century, it is not surprising that there are differences between the character of the Motive which make their appearance early in the cycle, and those which do not appear until the later stages. This is of significance in the determination of the tonality associated with any given Motiv: whereas the Rhinemaidens' song"Weia! Waga!" is clearly a tune in A flat major, it is not quite so simple to attach a single key-label to the music associated with the Norns, which is more of a texture than a melody; nor to the murder or fate Motive. It is however possible to consider all Motive/Themen in the light of the consistency (or lack of it) of their relationship with the tonality or pitch of their initial statement.
I THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN MOTIVE AND TONALITY
1. THE PRINCIPLES OF MOTIV-TONALITY RELATIONSHIP

It becomes immediately apparent that the motivic manipulation which forms the texture of the *Ring* exists on four main levels:

a) as what Debussy and Saint-Saens called the "visiting card" - the system working at its crudest, the word "Schwert" (sword) at once conjuring up the appropriate music, or the arrival of a character on stage occasioning the sounding of his theme in the orchestra.

b) the subtler use in which the *Motiv* is used to make clear to the audience a situation not made explicit in the text.

c) the use of a *Motiv*, or music derived from it, to supply the texture of the orchestral web by repetition and development.

d) as a result of the use of the technique of *Ahnung und Erinnerung*.

The tonalities which *Motive* assume for their statements in the first two of these circumstances will be of greater significance than those assumed in the third. In this latter situation, in which the *Motiv* is merely being used to supply the texture of the accompaniment, it will not (unless the harmony is entirely static) retain one pitch-level throughout, but will appear at various pitches as determined by modulations which may themselves

---

1 The technique of *Ahnung und Erinnerung* ("Foreboding and Remembrance") is dealt with in Section III.
be determined by other factors. The Motive do not in these circumstances appear as the principal thematic material, in contrast to those rhetorical statements of Motive which comprise a large proportion of the statements in a) and b).

The first three of these types of Motiv manipulation are clearly illustrated by reference to appearances of the sword-Motiv:

a) in response to the text at frequent mentioning of the word "Schwert" or illustrating its physical manifestation on the stage.

b) in answer to Siegmund's question "was gleisst dort hell im Glimmerschein?"2 ("what is glinting there in the gloom?") where it informs the audience without the meaning being clear to Siegmund himself.

c) in the passage immediately following ("Nächt'ges Dunkel deckte mein Aug' ") where it is used as an element in the orchestral accompaniment to the vocal melody.

In b) and on frequent occasions in a) the sword-Motiv assumes the tonality of C major, the key in which it first appeared. In the case of c) however it appears at various pitches, depending upon the modulations followed by Siegmund's melody.

The sword-Motiv is in fact the most frequently used Motiv in the Ring, appearing as the dominant element in the texture.

1 For the fourth, Ahnung und Erinnerung. See Section III  
2 W/99  
3 W/100-111
on over a hundred occasions, in well over half of which it appears in C major. It is one of that group of Motive (which includes the gold and the ring) which are little more than a broken chord, and are thus able to fit in with any harmony which may have occurred at the point in the drama where the Motiv was required. Whereas the ring-Motiv appears in six different relationships to the bass note in the first scene of Rheingold alone 1, and proceeds to six more in the next two scenes 2, the sword-Motiv has a definite, though inconsistent association with C major. Its very first appearance 3 establishes without a doubt its relationship with C major by the way in which the music moves dramatically into that key from the prevailing D flat:

\[ R/714/1 \]

---

1 11th, 12th in minor key, minor 7th, major 9th, 12th in major key.
2 Octave, min. 9th (2 versions), min. 7th, dim. 7th.
3. See pp. 126-7
and then out again to D flat within the space of a bar:

The consistency of its use in C major, occasioning modulations of the distance and suddenness of those quoted above, does not however preclude its use in D flat major (with considerable emphasis) a few pages later, nor its consistent use in D major at the end of the sword-forging scene in Siegfried:

in both of these instances its function is as part of the overall orchestral texture. Its appearance however in D major as the dead Siegfried raises his hand menacingly towards Hagen in Götterdämmerung Act III is of dramatic rather than textural cast. The use of D major here enabled Wagner to introduce the Götter-
dämmerungmotiv at this point at its accustomed pitch, and it

1 R/739-740
2 S/363-443
3 G/1226
4 See p.59
could have been this factor which determined the modulation chosen, since the strange harmonic shift into D major is considerably less natural than a move into C would have been at this point.

However, the vast majority of appearances of this Motiv are in C, and the effect of the importance which Wagner clearly attached to this key can be seen even in the moments where the Motiv itself does not appear in the final version of the music. In the final version of the music of Wotan's great monologue in Act II of Die Walküre the words

gegen der Götter Rache
schützt ihm nun einzig das Schwert
(against the vengeance of the gods
he has only the sword for protection)

only occasion the figure

\[\begin{array}{c}
\text{C} \\
\end{array}\]

in F minor, merely suggesting the sword; but in the Kompositions-skizze there stands a much more elaborate version of this music, in which the sword-Motiv is explicitly included. Though the Motiv was excised in the final version, its influence still remained in the C major of Wotan's line:

\[\text{W/396}\]
2. THE CLASSIFICATION OF MOTIVE

It is possible to draw up a complete classification of Motive according to the consistency with which they assume a particular tonality over the entire breadth of the Ring (or in some cases, portions of it). Motive fall into one of the following groups:

i) Motive and Themen which have a definite association with a particular key, but which do not appear exclusively in that key.

ii) Motive and Themen which appear in one key only throughout the Ring.

iii) Motive and Themen which approximate to a particular pitch-level.

iv) Motive and Themen with no apparent key association at all.

Motive and Themen which fall into the first two of these categories will generally, by their appearance in response to the text, determine the harmonic direction of the music at that point. Those in group iii) will have some bearing on modulation, and those in iv) none at all.

It is also necessary to consider a few complete musical textures which act as Motive. Two examples will suffice:

1 Motive are classified under these headings in Appendix 2

2 The complete list of such textures is included in the classification in Appendix 2
a) The Walkürenritt. This texture is very closely associated with the key of B minor, and violent modulations are sometimes required to bring the music to this key at the appropriate point. The arrival of Waltraute in Götterdämmerung Act I occasions such a modulation:

\[ G/77/5 \]

The Walküren music has a second element: that of the war cry "Hojo-to-ho!", which always occurs on the augmented triad G–B–D sharp. This pitch is maintained by modulations of considerable distance when necessary, though the chromatic nature of the augmented triad facilitates the engineering of the texture at its accustomed pitch. In the following example the D sharp is changed to E flat (in the original appearance the bass note is B), and although the whole texture has been raised by a major 3rd, the augmented triad is the same. As a result of the ambiguous nature of this chord, appearances of the figure do not occasion such drastic modulation as can be seen to occur in certain

1 See p.160n.

2 There is in fact one exception: W/663–665, but this occurs in the course of a symphonic development of the musical figure.

3 W/642
examples of the use of the Walkürenritt.

b) The texture surrounding Hägen's cry "Hoi-ho!" dominates the whole of Götterdämmerung, and the music returns constantly to the Motiv of the falling semitone D flat - C over an F sharp bass. The use of the F sharp as bass note associates it with the Motiv of the curse, and the two do in fact occur simultaneously at the moment of Siegfried's murder:

1 See p. 58
The dramatic effect of the arrival of Siegfried's body in the Gibichung Hall is in a large measure due to the turn of harmony brought about by the presence of the "Hoi-ho!" texture with its F sharp bass note:

This bass note then continues beneath the C major Gibichungen horn call, adding to the sinister atmosphere:

1 See pp. 61-2, 87
The complete classification of Motive, Themen and whole textures is to be found in the Appendix, but examples of each type of association, and of the effects of these relationships, reveal the extent to which such considerations affected the harmonic structure of the Ring.

i) **Motive** which have a definite association with a particular tonality, but do not appear exclusively in that key.

(The sword—Motiv, already discussed, falls into this group.)

The **Urmotiv** and the **Erda-Motiv**

The so-called **Urmotiv** develops from the very first thematic idea of the **Ring**, which is a close approximation to the sounding of the natural harmonic series on eight E flat horns (the out-of-tune fifth, seventh and ninth harmonics being omitted). This figure is reduced to a smaller melodic range, in which form it constitutes the Motiv associated with the bottom of the Rhine:

![Musical notation]

This theme is used extensively throughout the cycle, though without any clear association with character or situation being firmly established. It forms the background texture of the whole of the

---

1 The versions in the **Einzel-** and **Kompositionsskizzen** differ slightly: in the first a simple arpeggio over two octaves; in the second only a continuous undulating quaver movement in E flat is indicated. See p.189n.
prelude to Siegfried Act III, and in its inversion becomes associated with the downfall of the gods. Moreover, it appears at some stage in the Ring on every degree of the chromatic scale. This would be of negative significance, were it not for the fact that the Motiv is also associated with the character of Urmutter, Erda.

Whenever it appears in connection with Erda, this Motiv adopts the key of C sharp minor. Under no circumstances does it appear in that key without reference to her being made in the text, or by her actual presence on stage.

Whether or not it is possible for the listener to differentiate between a C sharp minor statement of the theme (= Erda), and a purely textural one in, say, C minor, is not really important. As in any work of this time-scale, the return of the music to certain keys after a very prolonged absence from them has perhaps more significance for the composer than for most listeners.1 Unless the composer chooses particularly to draw attention to the return of a key by a distinctive modulation to ensure that in a very long work an impact will be made on his audience, he cannot guarantee that this return will be registered as such, especially where the work is spread over several days, as Tovey observed:

... Wagner's [harmonic relations] are perfectly cogent across his four days' tetralogy of the Ring. But these long-distance effects were not produced by harmonic abstractions, and the composers and critics who believe that they can recognise such abstractions by ear are attaching an enormously exaggerated aesthetic importance to a sense of absolute pitch which they may or may not possess. 2

1 See also pp. 92–4
2 D.F. Tovey, Beethoven (London 1944) p. 27
Tovey never elaborated on the nature of these "cogent harmonic relations" in the Ring; he does here acknowledge that such relations were not the result of "harmonic abstractions", but does not enlarge upon this tantalising thesis.

Wagner frequently made a point of assisting the listener in this matter by attaching a particular tone-colour to a Motiv or texture which ensured that, if that instrumental texture was retained, the original pitch-level would appear with it, (e.g. the various horn calls ¹). In the case of the C sharp minor Erda-Motiv, he usually endeavoured to make that key stand out in relief by the nature of the modulation which approached it. Thus, at the very moment at which the Motiv becomes associated with Erda, the music is violently twisted from F minor to C sharp minor:

¹ See pp. 61-2
(In the Kompositionsskizze, this original appearance of the Erda-Motiv was in F sharp minor (with C sharp minor key-signature), only later appearing in C sharp minor. In the sketch this was then all crossed out, but no alternative offered (the crossing out presumably occurring when the final version was placed in the full score). The rest of Erda's first utterance is also different, and has been struck out without an alternative being given. ¹)

¹ The passages which differ between Kompositionsskizze and final version are R/625/1-5 and R/626/4 - 628/4
In Siegfried, Erda's materialisation at Wotan's command similarly occasions a modulation towards C sharp, this time from G minor. Here however the 4-sharps key-signature does not appear, only a cancellation of the two flats. (In the Kompositionsskizze there is no key change at all, Erda's first 27 bars being written using accidentals):

The impact of harmonic moves as far-reaching and as sudden as these serves to throw the Motiv into considerable aural relief. It was clearly of importance to Wagner that the key of C sharp minor should be reached at these points, and no other key: both key-shifts (they can hardly be called modulations) are distant in the extreme, and it is their abruptness which draws attention to the Motiv itself.
The same effect is achieved in *Die Walküre*, though in less dramatic form, by the instantaneous change from the C sharp major (= D flat of the Wallhall-Motiv) to C sharp minor at mention of Erda ("Die alles weiss, was einstens war . . . . "): 

The Urmotiv itself (unassociated with Erda) cannot however be linked with the E flat major in which it first appeared. That key is assumed at the Motiv's reappearance on two occasions in the Immolation Scene: emerging from B double flat major at "Mein Erbe nun nehme ich zu eigen" ("I now take my heritage" (i.e. the ring)) - the musical quotation being justified by the reference which follows to the returning of the ring to the depths of the Rhine:

1 See pp. 49-56.
and at its very last appearance in the cycle: "Denn der Götter
Ende dämmert nun auf" ("For the end of the gods is at hand"). In
this instance the E flat appears only as a passing tonality between
D major and G flat (as the sub-dominant of D flat), but it does stand
out from both these keys:
These two occasions are however the exceptions: the key of E flat does not otherwise reappear with the Motiv in such convincing dramatic context 1. This contrasts strongly with the way in which the Erda version in C sharp minor is used as a harmonic building block at appropriate moments throughout the cycle.

1 The Motiv does appear in E flat at two other points –
   i) in Siegfried III at the Wanderer's "Alles ist nach seiner Art" (S/518). The reason for its introduction here is not clear. Although in the final version the key signature here changes to E flat, there is no change in either the Kompositionsskizze or Orchesterskizze.
   ii) In Siegfried's Rhine Journey (G/176): the effect of the arrival of the theme in E flat is sabotaged by its appearance in A major immediately preceding. The Kompositionsskizze of the Rhine Journey is spread all over the page in odd pairs of bars, and it is not possible to decide in which key the Motiv was first intended to appear.
ii) a) **Motive** which to all intents and purposes appear in one key only throughout the Ring.

Very few **Motive** indeed never appear in another key from that in which they were first stated, and those which do display such consistency are not generally of great dramatic significance (e.g. the Winterstürme song, which reappears in B flat in Die Walküre Act II \(^1\); and the Sword Song \(^2\) in Siegfried Act I, which reappears in D minor in Act II \(^3\)), but a number of **Motive** display a consistency which is only upset by one or two insignificant statements.

The Renunciation-Motiv

From the very first appearance of the Renunciation-Motiv in the first scene of Rheingold as the setting of the words "Nur wer der Minne macht versagt...." ("Only he who foreswears love ....") this **Motiv** is very strongly associated with the key of C minor, and with the texture of trombones and Wagner tubas. It is the first appearance of these tubas in the Ring and this helps to strengthen the association between the **Motiv** and that unique tone-colour. There are two occasions on which the **Motiv** occurs in a key other than in C minor, but it is notable that in both of these cases the distinct brass texture is absent. In the first of these: Fricka's "... verspielst du ... Liebe und Weibes Wert?" ("... would you stake... love and woman's worth?") \(^4\) it is

---

1  W/293 (Original appearance W/152)
2  S/328-350
3  S/259)
4  R/207/4
evident that the Renunciation-Motiv was inserted as an afterthought—in the Kompositionskizze there stands only the vocal line with a D minor chord indicated, and this statement of the Motiv can therefore be discounted in considerations of the importance which Wagner attached to Motiv-tonality associations at the moment of the original conception of the music. In the second of these instances: Wotan's farewell to Brünnhilde, "Denn so kehrt der Gott sich dir ab" ("for so the god turns from thee"), reference is not to the renunciation of love for the gold, but to Wotan's renunciation of his favourite daughter, an application which has little connection with the Motiv's original connotation. A similar apparently irrelevant use of the Motiv (but in C minor this time) is found in Die Walküre Act I at the moment where Siegmund pulls the sword from the tree (is the tree renouncing the Sword?). Robert Donington suggests that these statements of the Motiv can be dramatically justified if the Motiv is regarded as one of 'acceptance of destiny'. Wagner himself referred to the Motiv as that of the Liebesfluch (curse on love).

1 It is most unlikely that Wagner merely indicated a harmony and remembered that he wished to introduce the Motiv over that harmony. Motiv appearances of such distinctiveness were always inserted in the sketch.

2 W/1004

3 W/214


5 In the Kompositionskizze of Rheingold the orchestral transition from Scene 1 to Scene 2 does not appear in the version found in the final score. It begins with a diminished 7th chord (not the C minor 6/4 chord which was eventually adopted at R/166/4), and the following passage of figuration (starting at R/171/3 and lasting for 20 bars) is completely different, being based on chromatic semiquavers in the cellos. The sketch then introduces the Renunciation-Motiv, and over the top is written: "Liebesfluch (= Renunciation) – dann Welterbes (= the ring) – endlich Walhall".
which suggests that he did not even regard it in the general terms of "renunciation", let alone of 'acceptance of destiny'.

The Tarnhelm music

Just as the Renunciation-Motiv was associated with the distinctive texture of Wagner tubas, so is the music of the Tarnhelm associated with the texture of 'stopped' horns. This Motiv's initial triad nearly always appears with this instrumentation, and in the key of G sharp minor; the horns being almost invariably pitched in E. The first appearance of the Motiv sets the pattern of unusual harmonic movement by which it is generally approached.

On some occasions only the second phrase of the Thema (for it really contains three Motive) is used, but this too begins with the G sharp minor triad. It is this triad, frequently sounded
in contradiction to the preceding harmony, which is the distinctive feature of the Motiv. So distinctive is this chord, that the extraordinary use of a G sharp minor triad in the slow movement of the very early C major Symphony (1832) seems to transport the listener instantly to the world of the Ring:

The distinctiveness of this triad in the context of the Ring is a result of the consistent use of the texture of stopped horns at a particular pitch level. So frequently does the triad contradict the preceding harmony when the Motiv is introduced into the Ring, that the pitch level adopted and the contradiction between the dominant seventh chord in C major and the A flat minor triad (= G sharp) in the Symphonie produces the same effect, even though here the texture is of woodwind instead of stopped horns. The occasions in the Ring on which the Tarnhelm triad appears in keys other than G sharp minor are very few indeed, and these are mainly by way of textural filling. One prominent statement appears in G minor but the reason for the

1 Richard Wagner, Symphonie in C dur (Max Brockhaus, Leipzig 1911) Full score p. 39

2 e.g. G/606-7 in C sharp minor and E minor
choice of this key can be divined by reference to the musical context: in the third scene of Rheingold, Mime recounts to Wotan and Loge how he made the Helm for Alberich; this narration is in G minor ("Sorglose Schmiede ... "\(^1\)), and the Motive of the Tarnhelm is introduced merely in passing, to accompany Mime's "ein Helmgeschmeid hiess er mich schweissen", the G minor presumably being a near enough approximation to G sharp (the horns are at this time pitched in E flat instead of E) \(^2\). The flow of the G minor music was presumably of more importance here than the assumption of the key associated with the Motiv.

ii) b) The use of a double tonality relationship

The Walhallthema

Of the Motive which make up the Walhallthema, it is the first which is generally used throughout the Ring to represent Walhall the place:

\[ \text{[R/184/1]} \]

the remaining Motive being used much more infrequently, and in much

1 R/400-420
2 R/409
vaguer contexts, more generally appearing in the music of Wotan himself. In considering key-relationships of the Walhallthema it is this first Motiv which is the important one. This Motiv grows directly out of the ring music, in the transition from the bottom of the Rhine to the mountain-top, and could even be considered as one of the many variations of the ring-Motiv itself. Whereas the ring music has no tonality association, it is however possible to attach to the Walhall-Motiv a tonality — or rather, two tonalities: those of D flat and of E.

\[D \text{ flat major is established at the very first appearance of the Motiv}, \text{ and it is the consistency of this relationship which determines the key of the final pages of Götterdämmerung through the fact that the music at that point is based upon the Walhallthema. Frequently throughout the Kompositionsskizze a key-signature of five flats is written in neatly at the appearance of the Walhall music; several of these key-signatures were eliminated in the final versions and accidentals inserted instead, but the fact that they were originally inserted at all reinforces the impression of the importance that this key must have held for Wagner. (The same process can be seen in the music of Fafner, where an F minor key-signature was used in the Kompositionsskizze at points were it was later eliminated.}\]

1 See p.44n.
2 It is in fact listed in the variations on p.29n.
3 B/184
4 See pp.78n., 240
Numerically there are more statements of the Walhallthema out of D flat than in it ¹, but it is the dramatic significance of the large number of those which do occur in that key which is important here. The gravitation towards D flat can produce striking modulations:

Eliminating the statements which are merely used to fill up the texture, for example, the accompaniment to Loge's narration ² in

¹ 20 statements in D flat; 6 in E; 26 in other keys (most of the latter filling in texture)
² R/252. The initial textural statement even here in in C sharp (= D flat)
or are undergoing some sort of "intensification",¹ the exceptions are mostly to be found in Die Walküre. Here the association with D flat is switched to E for more than half the appearances of the Walhalla music. This is first seen at Siegmund's "den Vater fand ich nicht" ("I did not find my father") at which point the orchestra intimates that Wälse and Wotan were one and the same:

¹ See Section IV.2.
The consistency of this E major is such that it involves distant and sudden modulation when the Motiv is summoned up by Sieglinde's recollection that she and Siegmund have met before:

![Musical notation]

The use of the key of E major could be explained had the whole musical texture been transposed up an augmented second after composition, but such an unlikely explanation is complicated by the appearance, in addition, of three prominent statements in D flat. What can be concluded about the statements in E is that

1 i) W/363: Wotan's "der Burg die Riesen mir bauten" ("the fortress which the giants built for me").

ii) W/492 (3rd Motiv of Theme): an instrumental section, the D flat is used as the dominant of F sharp, but using the flat key-signature within a section of three sharps.

iii) W/508 Todesverkündigung scene: Brünnhilde recounting to Siegmund the joys of Walhall.
they all refer to events in the past, and are associated with Wotan as the father of Sieglinde, rather than with Walhall; the D flat statements being more generally linked with mention of the fortress itself. This hypothesis is supported by reference to an E major statement in Götterdämmerung, where it is the young Wotan, not Walhall, who is the subject matter

In addition to these E major statements of the Motiv, there remain five prominent appearances in other keys which are not by way of symphonic development: three in E flat, one in C and one in G flat. With the exception of the latter, these keys are close to D flat, and could have been the result of the transposition of a few bars after they had been conceived, but it is evident from the Kompositionsskizze that three of these appearances were in fact added to fill out the texture at a later moment.

Wagner himself, at the 1876 rehearsals of the first Bayreuth Ring illuminated the difference, as he saw it, between various statements of the Walhall music, with regard to the impression they should make on the audience:

1 "Ein kühner Gott trat zum Trunk" ("a dauntless god came to drink") (G/16)
2 C – (involving a harmonic wrench to get there) W/503; E flat – S/821, 853, R/661 (incomplete); G flat R/422-3. A further statement in C (R/205) uses only the second half of the Thema.
3 namely R/205, R/422-3, S/821. The other two do appear clearly in the sketch.
Das Walhallthema, an allen jenen Stellen wo es als Ausdruck der gegenwartigen Situation erscheine in grossem Style, langsam und mit breiter Tongebung vorzutragen sei; während es dort, wo es nur als Erinnerungsmotiv im Orchester ertönt, wie z.B. in der "Walküre" in Sieglindes Erzählung, ein wenig schneller, und mit nicht so scharfer Hervorhebung der rhythmischen Akzente, etwa mit jener mehr lässlichen Betonung gespielt werden solle. 1

(At all those moments where the Walhallthema appears as an expression of the present situation it is to be played in the grand manner, slowly and with broad phrasing. When it however appears as a "remembrance" (as, for example in Sieglinde's narration in Die Walküre) it is to be played in a more subdued manner, a little faster and without such prominence being given to its rhythmic accent.)

This comment illuminates the dichotomy between on one hand, the D flat statements, and on the other those appearances in E major and in other keys. Here Wagner refers directly to the Sieglinde scene as being something apart from the main statements of the Thema. It is, in fact, generally the case that the D flat statements are the ones which are played in the grand manner, with full brass instrumentation, and which appear in connection with the present situation in the drama, (as for example, at Brünnhilde's outbursts in Götterdämmerung Act II 2). The E major statements appear in the drama as "remembrances" of past events, and are not in the rhetorical style which characterises the D flat statements.

It is thus possible to account, in terms of the drama, for all but a handful of the tonalities adopted for the Walhall music throughout the entire Ring:

1 Heinrich Porges, Die Bühnenproben zu den Bayreuther Festspielen des Jahres 1876 (Chemnitz 1881) p. 13. Porges' statement is a précis of Wagner's edict.

2 e.g. G/762
a) In D flat – in the grand manner, and as an underlining of the present dramatic situation.

b) In E major – as remembrances of Wotan

c) In various keys – of little dramatic significance, and chiefly as a filling out of the texture.

d) A very few prominent examples appearing in the key of the moment.
iiii) Motive which always approximate to a certain pitch-level.

As has already been seen ¹, certain Motive, although fixed to a certain key, occasionally approximate to that key. A large group of Motive do not exhibit a single invariable tonality relationship, but always appear on a set of pitch levels within, say, the range of a minor 3rd. One of these pitch levels may be a "preferred" level which appears much more frequently than the others. The instruments with which such Motive may be associated frequently have an important bearing on the range of tonalities selected.

The Vernichtungsarbeitmotiv

This is the Motiv associated with Alberich's desire for revenge upon Wotan, who relieved him of the ring, and upon its subsequent owners. In its initial appearance in Rheingold ² it has as its bass note C sharp. The harmony is merely a diminished 7th, but the rhythm is unmistakable:

1. See p.49 ¹ (Tarnhelm-Motiv - G minor instead of G sharp minor)
2. R/563
The instrumentation in which this Motiv appears is virtually invariable throughout the cycle: low clarinets (often written in the bass clef), cellos and stopped horn. It is this texture which accounts for the pitch level adopted: if the pitch were lower, the diminished triad would go off the bottom of the clarinets' range, and if higher, the distinctive chalumeau quality would be lost. On the few occasions where this latter does occur, doubling is added to the clarinet tone\(^1\). The great majority of statements of this Motiv thus occur within the range (bass note) A to C sharp (although on a few occasions the relationship between the clarinet chord and the bass note is changed).

The Curse-Motiv

This too is associated with a particular instrumental tone-colour, in this case, three unison trombones. In its initial statement\(^2\) its first note is F sharp, but this is later varied to F, E and E flat. The statements of the curse-Motiv frequently appear in pairs, in which case the second statement (usually beginning a bar after the first is completed) is pitched a tone lower than the first: thus the use of the pitch levels F sharp - E; F - E flat can represent only two levels instead of four. Apart from two manifestations beginning on G\(^3\) which take the trombones rather high, and one on A (which is transferred to the horns), all other main statements\(^4\) of the Motiv (excluding those used merely as texture in symphonic working-out) begin on F, F sharp, E or E flat.

---

1 e.g. G/765 with stopped horns doubling the clarinets.
2 R/564
3 S/527, G/527. A G appearance at G/298 is on horns instead.
4 Forty-one main statements all together, 20 of these on F sharp.
The Wurm-Motiv

The Motiv particularly associated with Fafner as dragon appears in the lower instruments only, in the very lowest reaches of the double basses or tubas. This produces a set of pitch levels between E flat and F sharp. 1

The Götterdämmerungmotiv

The Motiv associated with the downfall of the gods always appears with its first note as A or A flat where the statement is intended to have dramatic significance. The choice of this pitch level could have been determined by the writing of the flute parts, even though this instrument is not here used in the distinctive manner of, say, the chalumeau clarinents or unison trombones mentioned above. Wagner never took the flutes above top A in the Ring (in spite of his recommendation, made in 1873, that the flute part in Beethoven's 9th Symphony should be adapted to include the top B, which Beethoven had avoided even to the extent of dropping the part an octave in places 2). This could have been a factor in the determination of this pitch relationship; the harmonic move to A or to A flat is frequently distinctive, though the latter often appears in conjunction with the Walhall music, where the Götterdämmerungmotiv fits naturally above the D flat harmony.

1 Apart from two appearances in low woodwind, all the non-textural and non-symphonic statements of the Wurm-Motiv in the Ring are made up as follows: lower strings - 8 statements on E, F or F sharp; tubas - 12 statements on E flat, F or F sharp; there is one distorted specimen on G (G/1102)

2 GS IX 139
The use of particular instrumental tone-colour to produce a certain set of pitch levels can thus lead to the adoption of a "preferred" level, to which the Motiv approximates (e.g. the curse-Motiv, preferred level F sharp), or merely to the adoption of a certain range of levels without a single preferred pitch (e.g. the Wurm-Motiv). The decision whether to adopt the preferred level, or just to approximate seems largely to have been an arbitrary one. In the case of the curse-Motiv, it would appear that if an emphatic appearance of the Motiv was required, a distinctive modulation to the F sharp level would be assumed; but if no particular emphasis was intended other than to add a sinister background, the music would flow naturally into one of the E flat – G levels, the shortest route being taken; for example:

\[
\begin{array}{c}
\text{Ich bleib ihm Rast} \\
\text{Durch mich Siegfried}
\end{array}
\]
There seems to be a slight parallel between the use of this F sharp level and the use of the D flat tonality with regard to the Walhall music: when the curse-Motiv appears prominently it is on F sharp, when subtly woven into the texture and not played in rhetorical fashion it assumes one of its other levels; but it is not possible to formulate a ruling in this case to the degree that was possible with reference to Walhall.

There are two instances in which this use of a particular instrument in association with a Motiv leads, in certain dramatic circumstances, to the use of a consistent single pitch-level.

The two principal horn calls, those of Siegfried and of the Gibichungen are associated with horns pitched in F and in C respectively:

1 See pp. 53-6
Although the Gibichungen horn call does not play a significant part in the musical structure of the Ring, Siegfried's horn call (as a horn call, rather than as a mere musical Motiv) dominates the texture at several points in the latter half of the cycle, and in some of these the use of the F horn can be seen as the deciding factor in the choice of tonality:
3. CONCLUSION

By the establishment of the existence (or lack of existence) of such Motiv - key/pitch-level relationships, it becomes possible to account for a large number of small-scale "tactical" harmonic moves in the Ring in which the Motiv in question is summoned up by the text, or in elaboration of the text. The domination of a particular Motiv within an extended section of music may then be responsible for the overall tonality of that section, though such instances of a mere Motiv determining this "strategic" harmonic direction are rare (examples are the C minor transition music between Rheingold Scenes 1 and 2, derived from the C minor Renunciation-Motiv; and the prelude to Die Walküre Act III, based on the B minor Walkürenritt.)

There is however a danger in attaching too much importance to such relationships on the evidence of the printed score alone: the so-called Redemption-Motiv, for example, first heard in Die Walküre to Sieglinde's ecstatic "O hehrstes Wunder! Herrlichste Maid!" (and then absent until the closing pages of Götterdämmerung) is totally absent in the Kompositionsskizze of Die Walküre.

---

1 W/799-800
Not only is the Siegfried-Motiv here not in its final form, but the Redemption-Motiv is only in the very vaguest form prefigured in a version which is very lame in comparison with the soaring melody eventually adopted. There are several similar examples.
of such an absence of Motiv in the Kompositionsskizze, though this is one of the more spectacular omissions. When examining the Ring, one must not take too seriously Wagner's blithe assurance (made to Karl Galliard in 1844) that

Ehe ich daran gehe, einen Vers zu machen, ja eine Szene zu entwerfen, bin ich bereits in dem musikalischen Dufte meiner Schöpfung berauscht, ich habe alle Töne, alle charakteristischen Motive im Kopfe, so dass, wenn dann die Verse fertig und die Szenen geordnet sind, für mich die eigentliche Oper ebenfalls schon fertig ist und die detaillierte musikalische Behandlung mehr eine ruhige und besonnene Nacharbeit ist. 2

( Before I set out to write some verse or to sketch a scene, I have already been steeped in the musical atmosphere of my creation. I have all the sounds, all the characteristic Motive in my head, so that when the verse is prepared and the scenes are all set out, for me the opera already exists, and the detailed working-out is more of a quiet, contemplative polishing).

This was, of course, written nearly ten years before the music for the Ring was begun, and it is quite conceivable that as far as Rienzi and Der fliegende Holländer (which were at that stage complete) were concerned, it was perfectly possible for the small number of important Motive utilised in those works to be decided upon in advance. Wagner could not have decided upon all the motivic material of the Ring before commencing Rheingold. 3

1 At this stage Wagner was working on Tannhäuser and had completed the first act.

2 WA I 134

3 Compare this with letter to Uhlig p. 76 and letter to Liszt p. 259
In only a very few cases can the overall tonality of a scene be seen to have been determined by the tonal associations of the Motiv or Thema which dominates it. Although such relationships are indeed responsible for a very large number of small-scale harmonic moves, their contribution to the large-scale movement of key-centres is small. Such movement must generally be determined by other factors. The most consistent dramatic factor which spans the whole cycle is that of the personages of the characters themselves, and it is therefore of importance to examine what tonal associations these characters (as distinct from any Motive associated with them) may exhibit.
II. OTHER TONALITY RELATIONSHIPS
I. CHARACTER AND TONALITY

Several associations between Motiv and tonality are clearly responsible for the determination of the keys of various scenes in which the character associated with the Motiv is dominant (Walküren - B minor, Erda - C sharp minor) but it is equally clear that in certain cases Wagner attached a tonality to a character, even when he was not clear what Motiv that character would carry, or when there was to be no such Motiv at all. The Einzelskizzen, being Wagner's first rough jottings of ideas which were to be carried into the Ring, give clear indication that even from the very earliest stages of his preoccupation with the Siegfried story, some of its characters evoked particular keys in his mind.

i) Alberich

Alberich enters the Ring in the key of G minor as a grotesque, but at this stage innocent, participant in the drama. His amorous advances being met with contempt, however, he rapidly becomes enraged and embittered, and as this happens there is a distinct move of tonal centre to B-flat minor.

1 R/41
Wolg. Floßh.

Ha ha ha ha ha!

Alberich

Kalter gräßiger Fisch! Scheiße nicht schöner niedlich und reckisch.

Wolg. Buegg.

Wie billig am Ende vom Lied! Ha ha ha ha ha!

he!

We-he! ach We-he! O Schmerz! O Schmerz!
Following this scene of Alberich's attempts at seduction, the key of B flat minor is absent from the drama (as is Alberich himself, with the exception, of course, of the second half of the scene) until the descent into Nibelheim, at which point it becomes the principal key, both of the descent itself, of the following scene between Alberich and Mime; and of Alberich's reappearance after the arrival of the gods. Alberich's summoning of the Nibelungen in Scene 4 similarly moves decidedly from the regions of E minor into B flat minor:

1 R/358-72
2 R/373-95
3 R/421-38
It is important here to draw the distinction between the use of a key in association with the appearance of a certain character on stage, and the use of that key when mention is made of him in the text in his absence. If the B flat minor were to appear at mention of his name, this would be equivalent to the regarding of that tonality as an Alberich-Leitmotiv - thus, for example, the section concerned with Alberich in the course of Wotan's monologue in Die Walküre Act II ¹ at no time adopts B flat minor.

In fact, the B flat minor tonality comes to be associated with the Nibelungen in general, rather than with just Alberich in particular - the prelude to Siegfried is placed in B flat minor to accord with the following scene for Mime alone which is in that key, and similarly, the second soliloquy delivered by Mime (following Siegfried's exit ²) is placed in B flat minor.

Alberich's confrontation with the Wanderer at the opening of Siegfried Act II is not placed in B flat minor however but in F minor (although there are passages in the former key). Although it could be argued that it is Wotan, not Alberich, who dominates this scene, the choice of F minor reflects more the over-riding influence of Fafner (as yet unseen), F minor being the key associated with the character of the giant (see below). Once Fafner is dead the key of B flat minor is resumed for the scene in which the two Nibelungen argue over the gold. ³

1 W/361, 375, 398
2 S/149-53
3 S/636-56
Alberich's dream appearance to Hagen in the first scene of *Götterdämmerung* Act II adopts the B flat minor tonality for the entire passage. Within this B flat minor, Hagen's music centres on E flat minor, and the earlier "Hagen's Watch" scene is also in that key. (These are the only moments in Hagen's music where E flat minor dominates, but they are the moments where he has the stage to himself - Alberich being merely an apparition - and both are built from the same chord, in the same rhythmic figure.)

Following this dream scene Alberich vanishes from the drama, and the key of B flat minor disappears from the *Ring* with him.

ii) The Giants

The association between the characters of the giants (and particularly Fafner) and the key of F minor is no less striking. The Motiv originally associated with the giants is no more than a rhythmic figure which could not be said to have tonal associations:

```
[Music notation]
```

1 For a great deal of this scene the key-signature is that of B flat major, though at no point is that key actually used, and the key-signature is constantly contradicted by additional flats as accidentals. The reason for its use is far from clear. In the Kompositionsskizze the scene is partly in five flats and partly without key-signature. It is difficult even to regard the B flat major signature (which appeared for the first time in the Orchesterskizze) as a compromise, for the music virtually never moves to the sharp side of B flat.

2 G/545-86

3 G/353-72 The key signature is again two flats.
but in Rheingold Scene 2, F minor suddenly emerges from E minor with the arrival of the giants to this figure:

The key of F (this time major) is again adopted for the exit of the giants later in this scene, and the greater part of the scene between these two points is also in F (minor and major). The greater part of Scene 4, in which the giants reappear, is in F minor (although the key signature is that of C minor) but the death of Fasolt is placed in B minor, this key having been determined by the presence of the curse-Motiv. However, the choice of F minor for the opening of Siegfried Act II was dictated by that key's relationship with Fafner, whose presence, both seen and unseen, dominates the whole of the earlier part of the act, during which F minor remains the predominant key.

---
1 R/591-624. The key-signature in the Kompositionsskizze is also C minor.
2 R/646-54
3 S/499-53, 470-500, 514-17, 527-8, 591-623. The key-signature is not always four flats, and there are of course modulations within these sections.
The origin of this F minor tonality is to be found in the earliest Einzelskizzen for the Ring, written on odd sheets of plain writing paper with music staves ruled in ink. Upon these sheets occur the following fragments, some of which Wagner labelled:

Einzelskizzen
Of these examples, the first three are written on the reverse of a discarded page of a letter bearing a couple of lines in French, in which there is mention of a M. Ph. Philipront and of Lohengrin. Liszt wrote to Wagner in July of 1851 about the possibility of a production of that work in Brussels, in which M. Philipront would be concerned; Wagner's letter fragment mentions this recommendation and it is thus almost certain that these Fafner fragments date from mid-1851; two ideas from these sketches did in fact eventually find their way into the Ring music. In the September of 1851, Wagner wrote to Uhlig:

Ich gehe nun an die Musik. [...] Den Anfang habe ich schon im Kopfe. Auch einige plastische Motive wie den Fafner.

(I am now beginning the music [...] I already have the beginning in my head, as well as some of the tangible Motive, like that of Fafner.)

It was in May and June of 1851 that Wagner had written the poem of Junger Siegfried, and these sketches of the "Fafner" themes can safely be assumed to date from that period. The significant factor is that the F minor tonality, which characterised all these sketches (though there is no way of dating all the "Fafner" jottings) was carried directly into Siegfried in 1856-7. In the Siegfried Kompositionsskizze a key-signature of F minor

1 WL II 317 This letter is also in French

2 Theodor Uhlig was a violinist in the Dresden orchestra during the period when Wagner was Kappellmeister. He was the recipient of some of the most interesting Wagner letters, but died in 1853 at the age of thirty.

3 WU 99
Sheet from the Einzelskizzen in ink and pencil bearing fragments of the Fafner and Woodbird music (by courtesy of Frau Gertrud Strobel, Richard-Wagner-Archiv, Bayreuth)
is sometimes adopted for Fafner's utterances, even when the music which follows is not in that key. Such key-signatures were mostly eliminated in the Orchesterskizze. The association which clearly existed in Wagner's mind between Fafner (as dragon) and F minor most probably affected the choice of key for the appearance of Fafner (as giant) in Rheingold. (There are no Einzelskizzen of the Rheingold giants' music.)

iii) The Woodbird

On the same sheet of paper as some of the "Fafner" sketches appear some jottings for the Woodbird music, which almost certainly date from the same era. The music of Siegfried was not commenced until September of 1856, but the E major tonality which characterises the Woodbird music in the Ring is clearly prefigured in the sketches, including a pentatonic melody reminiscent of the Rhinemaidens' song:

\[
\text{Einzelskizze ['waidvogel']}\]

\[
\text{Einzelskizze ['waidvogel']}\]

1 e.g. S/512/3 at Fafner's first words, S/592/5 at Fafner's first words to Siegfried. See also p. 240
In *Siegfried* the Woodbird's several Motive appear in various keys, but the music of the Woodbird itself is always placed in E major. At the first appearance of the Woodbird's music in the *Siegfried Kompositionsskizze* ¹ there is written a clear key-signature of four sharps. By 1856 Wagner was frequently dispensing with key-signatures in the Kompositionsskizzen, sometimes inserting them as an afterthought squashed between notes, or placed over a bar-line, but here it was neatly written in, clearly before any notes were set down. Similarly, but more interestingly, the very first suggestion of the Woodbird music after the dragon-slaying ² was again neatly prefaced by four sharps, even though the music does not begin in that key (in the Orchesterskizze this key-change was delayed four bars to where it stands in the published score).

Wagner's process of retaining the tonality in which music originally occurred to him can be seen in several other instances, though it is not of course possible to date all the sheets of the

¹ S/571
² S/664, and similarly at S/724 and 730
Einzelskizzen, and it is thus possible that some of the ideas were scribbled down immediately in advance of their being introduced into the Kompositionsskizze. Most of the Einzelskizzen sheets are overwritten several times with different ideas, and as a result of this are sometimes indecipherable. One sheet however bearing the dates 27th January, 1863 and 14th November, 1864, carries fragments which were used in Siegfried Act III, and although that work was not begun until March 1869, the tonalities in which the ideas appear in the rough were all retained in the Kompositionsskizze. The 1863 date stands beside an idea in E flat lasting for eight bars which is not found in the Ring (or any other known work) and the 1864 date appears before eight bars of the E major "Idyll" music which found its way into Siegfried Act III. This "Idyll" music originated in the Starnberg Quartet intended for Cosima and conceived in the summer of 1864 1. It is quite possible that the Act III jottings date from much later, but if that were the case, it is slightly strange that fragments from beginning, middle and end of the act should all appear together (the Act III sketches are all in a similar style of writing, in pencil whilst the "Idyll" sketches are in ink):

\[ \text{Einzelskizze} \ [5/758/2] \]

\[ \text{[Staff notation]} \]

---

1 See also p.269 and note.
This latter is clearly an earlier version of the love theme:

which actually makes its appearance in Siegfried\(^1\) a semitone lower than this, in A flat. (In the Kompositionsskizze the theme is found in G, but the surrounding music is totally different. It

\(^1\) S/850
was in the Orchesterskizze that the final version was adopted.¹)

Several of the Einzelskizzen sheets represent "working-out" of a passage rather than rough jottings of original ideas, and the lack of dates upon them adds to the confusion as to which is which. One other sheet does however carry a date: "Im Asyl, 1 Mai" (no year indicated). Wagner moved into the Asyl in the grounds of the Wesendonk villa in Zürich in April 1857, so the fact that the house and date are mentioned leaves little doubt the he refers to May 1st of that year. The sheet carries a few sketches of parts of Tristan and a version of the combination of the Motive of the Wurm and Siegfried's Horn Call ² which occurs in Act II of Siegfried. Since Act II was not begun in the Kompositions-skizze until the 22nd May, this combination was presumably worked out in advance of the moment at which it was required, and then transferred, at that pitch, though not in the form in which it was originally sketched, into the Kompositions-skizze ³.

These examples in which the Einzelskizzen prefigure the tonality adopted in the eventual composition of the Ring, generally refer however to specific moments in the cycle, rather than being the early assumption of tonalities which were later to become associated with characters. Further such character-tonality

---

¹ Of this moment in Siegfried Wagner commented at the 1876 rehearsals in Bayreuth: "Es muss klingen, wie die Verkündigung einer neuen Religion" ("It must sound like the annunciation of a new religion"). The melody was, in fact, originally intended for the Buddhist drama Die Sieger (The Victors'), as Wagner himself informed his biographer, Glasenapp.

² S/590-1

³ The Horn Call appears in F major as usual. See also pp.226-8
associations (e.g. Gutruné - G major, Gibichungen - B minor, Loge - F sharp minor/A major) are not suggested by the surviving fragments of the Einzelskizzen.

1 e.g. G/1238-9.
2. EMOTION AND TONALITY

It is evident that both Motive and characters do exhibit relationships with certain tonalities, but an examination of the way in which Wagner used tonality in certain types of emotional or atmospheric context is much less conclusive. The only positive conclusions to be drawn relate to the already established 1 relationship between the forces of darkness and the extreme flat minor keys (F minor – Giants, B flat minor – Nibelungen, E flat minor – Hagen). This is however a character-key relationship rather than a relationship between atmosphere and tonality, and as already observed, these keys are almost totally absent from the drama when the characters in question are not present on the stage.

The second and third acts of Siegfried make extensive use of the key of E major. This stems originally from the music of the Woodbird through which Siegfried learns of the existence of Brünnhilde, but it could also be seen as originating in Die Walküre Act III, being the key in which Wotan left his daughter asleep on the mountain-top. 2 Prior to that moment the key had been almost totally absent for any stretch of music longer than a single phrase (e.g. the E major Walhall statements in Die Walküre Act I). The key is also totally absent in Siegfried Act I, and does not appear in Götterdämmerung at all as the principal key of a musical paragraph, except in that moment where the dying Siegfried recollects the Woodbird music from Act II of Siegfried. 3

1 See pp. 68-78
2 W/974-1069
3 G/1107-17
Although this key could thus be regarded as a Siegfried/Brünnhilde love-key, such an assumption is contradicted by the total absence of the key in the Götterdämmerung Vorspiel, and at other points where it might have appeared in such a context.

In contrast with the use of the flat minor keys in association with the evil elements in the drama, there exist a number of passages concerned with purity and innocence which seem consciously to adopt the key of C major. The first of these depicts the gold in its pure, untouched state, prior to Alberich's plunder of it, but the most extended section in C major occurs at the end of Siegfried 1 (which key seems to have been decided in advance according to rough jottings in the Einzelskizzen 2). The two moments of wedding music in Götterdämmerung Act II move dramatically into C major from other keys, and it might be legitimate to regard the idea of a wedding as being associated with simple, joyful innocence in the lives of the Gibichungen. C major does not occur in association with evil or corruption except at the conclusion of Act II of Götterdämmerung, at which point it grows out of the preceding C major wedding music (and also out of Hagen's falling tritone (C–F sharp) and "Hoi-Ho!" figure (D flat – C)).

Such considerations would be unimportant unless they could be seen to affect the tonal structure of the work, and in this the C major sections are interesting. The first appearance of the gold in Rheingold does not draw undue attention to the C major, emerging as it does from a series of diminished 7ths, but the arrival of C major for the concluding section of Siegfried is thrown into

1 S/1143-63
2 See p.81
considerable relief by the preceding forceful cadence in B major:

\[5/114-3/1\]

Brühnh.

A similar impact is obtained in Götterdämmerung in the way in which the C major wedding music emerges from A major:

\[6/831/1\]

Siegfried:

Munter, ihr Mann-nem!
However, it is more likely that the choice of C major for the wedding music was determined by the use of the Horns in C for the Gibichungen Horn Call 1, although, curiously, at the end of Götterdämmerung Act II the call (though sounded in C) appears on off-stage horns pitched in F 2. The choice of the C-Horn is however not nearly as consistent as the (invariable) choice of the F-Horn for the Siegfried Horn Call, and it is not in fact until Götterdämmerung Act III 3 that the C-Horn is utilised for the Gibichungen call.

C major does however seem to have had a basic meaning for Wagner where trumpet and horn calls were concerned. The Lohengrin trumpet calls 4 are in C, as are those at the end of the first act of Tristan 5. Hunding's Stierhorn is pitched in C 6, as is Hagen's in Götterdämmerung Acts II 7 and III 8. The fanfare preceding the entry of the masters in Die Meistersinger is in C 9, though that had already been established as their key as early as 1861 (the work was finished in 1867), when part of the overture was sketched, 10 but the fanfares in Tannhäuser are

1 See pp.61-2
2 G/924/1
3 G/933, 934, 1067-8, 1196
4 Lohengrin, Eulenberg score p. 17 and elsewhere
5 Tristan und Isolde, Eulenberg score pp. 304-9
6 W/559 (tubas), 573 (tubas – in the Kompositionsskizze they adopted a skeleton of Hunding's rhythmic figure), 575-9 (Stierhorn), 586-8 (Stierhorn – in the Kompositionsskizze a horn in C entered at 585/3 on B flat, but it then went on to play the notes of diminished 7th.)
7 G/628, 636
8 G/933-4
9 Die Meistersinger, Act III, Eulenberg score pp. 419-20 and elsewhere
10 See ML II 906
written for trumpets in H\textsuperscript{1} (B natural) and in other keys\textsuperscript{2}. C major fanfares are also found in Das Liebesverbot. C major does not however appear to be used in the Ring in any consistent way in opposition to the "evil" keys, and neither are the sharp keys so used to represent the forces of "good".

\textsuperscript{1} Tannhäuser, Eulenberg score pp. 344-84

\textsuperscript{2} Ibid. pp. 197-8, 260
3. A NOTE ON TRANSPOSITION

Any significance which it would appear Wagner attached to certain tonalities would be affected, had any of the passages discussed in the preceding pages undergone transposition at any stage. Upon the matter of transposition Wagner left very few remarks, but it is clear from those that do exist that particular tonalities did hold certain significances for him. In 1878, whilst Wagner was working on Parsifal, Cosima recorded in her diary:

"Um Abend sagt er, er müsste alles umarbeiten, was er am Morgen gemacht. Er habe eine Tonart gesucht, und das mechanische Transponieren sei ihm unmöglich! "Ich bin ein schöner Musiker" lacht er, nur wenn er unreflektiert schaffe, stünde ihm Alles zu Gebote, wenn er aber überlege, wie ein Thema in eine andere Tonart zu bringen sei, verwirre er sich."

(In the evening he said that he would have to rework all that he had written that morning. He had been trying to reach a particular key, and mechanical transposition was just not possible for him. "I'm a fine musician" he said laughingly; only when he works spontaneously does everything fall into place, but when he tries to work out how a theme is to be engineered in another key, he gets muddled.)

This suggests that the natural process of composition did not necessarily lead to the appearance of material in the key required, and consequently that the use of certain tonalities held some significance for him. (There are however a few sections in the Ring which, between the Kompositionsskizze and the final

1 'Aussprüche des Meisters aus den Tagebüchern der Meisterin'; Bayreuther Blätter, 1936, p. 170 (13th January, 1878)
score, have undergone "mechanical" transposition ¹ without any apparent reason in terms of the significance of the tonalities involved.)

Cosima further recorded in her diary, several months later, a problem which had troubled Wagner during the composition of Parsifal Act II:

Richard arbeitet, und sagt bei Tisch, eine Stelle habe ihm viel Not gemacht, bis er sich entschlossen habe zu transponieren: "dummer Kerl, nicht D-moll, C-moll muss es sein", dann sei Alles in Ordnung gewesen. ²

( Richard was working, and said at mealtime that one particular spot had been causing him a great deal of trouble until he decided to transpose it: "Idiot - it has to be C minor, not D minor", then everything fitted in properly.)

In neither of these extracts from Cosima's diary are we told to what passages of music Wagner refers, but in the case of the D minor - C minor it is possible to surmise to which section the passage applied since a week earlier Cosima had recorded:

R. sagt mir: "Weisst du wie Kundry Parsifal ruft?" Er singt mir die so eindringlich zärtliche Benennung: "zum ersten Mal wird der Name ausgesprochen, und so hat seine Mutter ihn gerufen! Das kann nur die Musik". ³

---

¹ E.g. W/828-31. The transposition must have been occasioned by the reworking of the preceding Walküren passage (W/825-8) which in the Kompositionsskizze is only very roughly indicated, and which there ended a tone higher than in the final version. The adjustment to rejoin the original for Wotan's "So wisst den Winselnde" is engineered in the unison figure at W/831/1-2.

² 'Aussprüche des Meisters aus den Tagebüchern der Meisterin'; Bayreuther Blätter 1937 p.4. (9th June, 1878)

³ Ibid. p. 4. (31st May, 1878)
(R. said to me: "Do you know how Kundry calls Parsifal's name?" He sang me the passage in which she hauntingly and tenderly calls his name: "That is the first time his name is spoken; his mother had called him in exactly the same way! Only music can achieve that.")

Since Wagner, as a rule, worked straight through from beginning to end when composing, the D minor – C minor transposition probably refers to a passage later in the second act than Kundry's call to Parsifal (the second act was finished in the October). The only such extended C minor passage reaches its climax in Parsifal's "Erlöser! Rette mich ...", at which point the Motiv

\[ \text{[Parsifal p.1]} \]

\[ \text{[Parsifal p.1]} \]

\[ \text{[Parsifal p.1]} \]

(which opened the prelude to the whole work) is heard again at its original pitch. This pitch reappears shortly afterwards at the hushed moment "Ich sah Ihn", and again, in a strange enharmonic modulation, in the third act: "Das ist Charfreitags Zauber, Herr". It appears in addition at this pitch at the conclusion of the first act and at the end of the entire work. Although the Motiv does appear at other pitches in the course of the work, this is the one which is used at several important dramatic points, and it

1 Parsifal – Eulenberg miniature score Act II pp. 242-3
2 Ibid. Act II p. 264
3 Ibid. Act III p. 110
4 Ibid. Act I p. 277
5 Ibid. Act III p. 206
would seem possible that that pitch held significance for Wagner in such context; had the music been in D minor it would have been extremely difficult to introduce the Motiv at its original pitch, whilst in C minor it flows naturally from the preceding music. The transposition was occasioned by the desire to maintain a particular key for a particular Motiv.

Of Wagner's attitude to transposition of sections in performance, there exist more numerous records. From these it appears that the tonal organisation of the music-drama was, for Wagner, more of compositional importance than of importance to the listener's understanding of the work, when circumstances dictated that transposition of a passage in performance was the only alternative to heavy cutting. In a long letter to Liszt concerning the Weimar production of Tannhäuser, Wagner states that it is "inconsequential" whether Walther von der Vogelweide sings his song in B flat or C, merely observing that if it is sung in C, the impact of Tannhäuser's C major entry immediately following would be lost; but that he himself had sanctioned such a rendering in Dresden.

In contrast, one of Wagner's chief concerns about the Lohengrin which (due to his exile in Zürich) he had never heard, was that, without his supervision, the work might be mutilated by transposition, rather than cut judiciously. His faith in Liszt led to the sanctioning of an excessive number of cuts in the Leipzig production of 1854 (which Liszt and Julius Rietz prepared);

1 WL I 175 (29th May, 1852)
these cuts were then taken to have the composer's approval, and became standard. As early as 1850 Wagner had remonstrated with Liszt following the number of cuts which had been introduced into the work's first performance: "if my Lohengrin can only be kept going by the sacrifice of the artistic unity that was my plan in writing it ... then I give up opera entirely" 1. A year after this he had been forced to appeal to Liszt to restore the mounting quantity of music which he had been cutting in Tannhäuser 2; though by 1875, Wagner was in a position to refuse to countenance performances of Tannhäuser and Lohengrin in Vienna unless the "standard" cuts were set aside.

In the mature works however Wagner came to insist on cutting instead of transposition. He had no qualms about lowering the finale of Der fliegende Holländer a semitone (from the moment "Segel aus! Anker los!") in his Munich production of 1864 in order to accommodate the artists; but he preferred to lower the high notes in the vocal line, or ultimately cut passages completely when a prospective Bayreuth Wotan (Siehr) expressed concern about the vocal range 3, or when the Vienna Tristan (Anders) proved unequal to the task. In the case of the latter, in addition to a cut of

1 WL I 84-5

2 Amongst these cuts was one which Wagner himself had introduced in the Act II finale in Dresden as a result of the tenor Tichatscheck's lack of dramatic gift, which had meant that he had been inaudible against the chorus and orchestra. For the Paris production it occurred to Wagner that the choral parts could be excised, and the passage was therefore restored as a tenor solo for Niemann. (See also Über die Aufführung des Tannhäuser (1852) GS IX 26n.; Meine Erinnerungen an Ludwig Schnorr von Carolsfeld (1865) GS II 150, 156).

3 Siehr eventually sang Hagen.
142 bars in Act III monologue, Wagner in desperation sanctioned transposition of passages up or down an octave, but only in order that the inadequate Anders could at least deliver some of that act. (Wagner had suggested as early as 1859 to Schnorr (whom he wanted to play the first Tristan) that he would not insist on the third Act being given uncut.) The Vienna production did not take place, but shortly afterwards Cosima confided to Malvina Schnorr 1 (the Isolde in the Munich Tristan) that Wagner would be prepared to allow heavy cuts in the work, to the extent of excising the "curse on love", the Act III monologue (which had already proved so troublesome in Vienna), and even to sanction the removal of the third act in toto. This hardly seems credible, but Wagner clearly was prepared to allow some cutting in the light of the Vienna fiasco. Certainly he became aware that he had expected too much of the voices, and at a later date declared that the love duet had been too heavily scored against the vocal parts, and that the trombone parts should be removed. Transposition however was apparently not to be considered in these works since tonality was too much a part of the dramatic structure.

The Kompositionsskizzen of the Ring reveal, through the examples of transposition found therein, the importance which several tonalities held for Wagner when he was composing the cycle:

1 The letter is reproduced in König Ludwig und Richard Wagner. Briefwechsel V pp. xxix-xxx
i) The Rhinemaidens' song

The pentatonic tune with which Woglinde opens the cycle:

![Pentatonic Tune]

does not, with the exception of its appearance in the closing pages of Götterdämmerung:

![Pentatonic Tune]

appear to adopt consistently the tonality of its original statement, but the Kompositionsskizze of Rheingold reveals a major alteration affecting this Motiv which suggests that the A flat tonality had initially more significance for Wagner than is evident from the published version of the Ring.

Loge's narration of the loss of the gold from the depths of the Rhine reintroduces the pentatonic melody:
though here it appears in A major. In the Kompositionsskizze this A major version is written over an earlier version of the same melody which is in A flat. The over-writing is very heavy indeed, and the original is difficult to decipher, but the earlier version would seem to have accomplished the modulation from B minor to A flat thus:

Kompositionsskizze [R/281/3]

Lose

klagen mir ih-re Not: der Nibe-lung
In the later version the change of key-signature was eliminated, "A-dur" written over the top, and the earlier version obliterated for several bars in Indian ink, the note heads being written in a style much heavier than the spidery hand in which the Kompositions-skizze is otherwise written.  

Although the details are unclear, it is evident that Wagner here originally attached some importance to the use of A flat, to the extent of placing it in a position where that key emerged straight out of B minor. The modulation must, on reflection, have proved unsatisfactory although it is not possible to determine the date at which the alteration was made, the original Partiturschrift

---

1 It has been suggested that the overwritten version is in the hand of Mathilde Wesendonk, and although the notes themselves are similar to Wagner's style, the accidentals are written differently. Wagner met Mathilde sometime in 1851, first mentioning her in a letter to Uhlig early in 1852. The little Piano Sonata "für das Album M.W." was written in June 1853. Clearly by the time Wagner came to write Rhinegold, they were on intimate enough terms for her to be entrusted with such alterations. The Kompositions-skizze of Die Walküre, which contains the many 'coded' messages to Mathilde (e.g. "G.S.M." = "Gesegnet sei Mathilde") was begun on 28th June, 1854.
The Kompositionsskizze of Rheingold, p. 14. The alteration from A flat to A major. (By courtesy of Frau Gertrud Strobel, Richard-Wagner-Archiv, Bayreuth)
having been lost, 1 (the Kompositionsskizze was made between November 1853 and January 1854). In April of 1854 Wagner wrote to Liszt:

Die Instrumentation des "Rheingoldes" geht vorwärts –
jetzt bin ich mit dem Orchester nach Nibelheim hinabgestiegen. 2

(The orchestration of Rheingold is proceeding –
I have now descended into Nibelheim with the orchestra)

although this refers only to the rough Partiturschrift. Wagner further wrote to Liszt in June:

Die Reinschrift der Partitur des "Rheingoldes" muss ich noch warten lassen. Zunächst soll's an die "Walküre" gehen. 3

(The neat copy of the Rheingold score will have to wait. On to Walküre!)

The rough full score had in fact been finished in May, and the neat copy was completed in September and sent to Bülow to be copied and to have the piano arrangement made. 4 The alteration must therefore precede this latter date, and it would seem likely that it occurred in the rough copy of the full score, whereupon the Kompositionsskizze was adjusted accordingly. At this stage Wagner would have been more concerned with the overall flow of the music than with the details of Motiv and tonality. There are several examples of such alteration between the Kompositionsskizzen and the final full score. 5

1 See p. 11
2 WL II 19
3 WL II 32
4 See WL II 68
5 An earlier statement of the Rhinemaidens' melody in A major (R/146) appears quite clearly in the Kompositionsskizze, though this was during a passage of continuous modulation, and did not have dramatic significance.
ii) The Renunciation-Motiv

As already observed, this Motiv has a consistent relationship with the key of C minor. In contrast to the example of transposition quoted above, in which Wagner removed a tonality which had been occasioned by considerations of Motiv-key association, there exists in the Rheingold Kompositionskizze an alteration in the music of Alberich where the music has been transposed in order to introduce a Motiv in the key with which it is associated. In the final version of the work, the Renunciation-Motiv, used to underline Alberich's

Wie ich die Liebe abgesagt
Alles, was lebt, soll ihr entsagen!

(as I renounced love, so shall all living things renounce it)

appears in C minor. In the Kompositionskizze however it appears:

Kompositionskizze [R/45]15

\[\text{\textit{Kompositionskizze}}\]

![Musical notation image]

1 See pp. 45-7
The modulation to the D flat major required for the appearance of the Walhallthema is then accomplished as follows:
With the exception of the writing of five flats over the double bar line, and the elimination of the bar indicated, there is no further alteration on the sketch. The eventual transposition of this passage down a semitone presumably occurred in the rough Partiturschrift, though unlike the transposition of the Rhinemaidens' melody, the alteration was not then written into the Kompositionsskizze. Whereas, in that alteration Wagner was probably more concerned with musical flow than with the tonality in which Motive appeared, in this case the transposition of no fewer than thirty-four bars can only have been due to a desire to place the Renunciation-Motiv in C minor. The C sharp minor of the original probably emerged from the preceding A major passage without Wagner having considered the details of the introduction of the Motiv. At this stage too, he would of course have been unaware of the consistency of the relationship which the Motiv was to establish with C minor later in the cycle, as he was conversely unaware of the lack of key consistency the Rhinemaidens' tune was to exhibit.
4. **THE CHOICE OF TONALITY FOR EXTENDED SECTIONS OF THE RING**

It is now possible, in the light of relationships established between Motive, character, emotion etc., and tonality, to account in terms of the drama for the keys selected for the greater part of the *Ring* music. There remain a few scenes which adopt a tonality which is otherwise generally not used in the cycle, and these are marked with an asterisk (*) in the table below. The keys listed below are generally those of an overall section of music (within which there may be considerable modulation), rather than short passages which adopt a tonality occasioned by motivic reference within the larger tonal context. The key-signature does not always correspond to the section's overall tonality. 1

### RHEINGOLD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PP.</th>
<th>Keys</th>
<th>Remarks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>105 - 183</td>
<td>C major/minor</td>
<td>Gold (= purity)/renunciation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>184 - 196</td>
<td>D flat major</td>
<td>Walhall</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>218 - 235</td>
<td>F minor</td>
<td>Giants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>249 - 269</td>
<td>F sharp minor/A major</td>
<td>Loge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>315 - 326</td>
<td>F minor</td>
<td>Giants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359 - 438</td>
<td>B flat minor</td>
<td>Nibelheim</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>444 - 454</td>
<td>F sharp minor/A major</td>
<td>Loge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>455 - 458</td>
<td>D flat</td>
<td>Walhall</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>459 - 461</td>
<td>B flat minor</td>
<td>Alberich</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>461 - 467</td>
<td>A major/F sharp minor</td>
<td>Loge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>476 - 498</td>
<td>A major/F sharp minor</td>
<td>Loge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>524 - 539</td>
<td>B flat minor</td>
<td>Nibelungen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>563 - 578</td>
<td>B minor</td>
<td>Curse</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>591 - 624</td>
<td>F minor</td>
<td>Giants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>625 - 636</td>
<td>C sharp minor</td>
<td>Erda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>647 - 656</td>
<td>B minor</td>
<td>Curse</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>663 - 684</td>
<td>B flat</td>
<td>Donner’s call to mists *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>685 - 695</td>
<td>G flat</td>
<td>Rainbow Bridge *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>696 - 751</td>
<td>D flat</td>
<td>Walhall</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 See also pp.236-44
2 This was originally all in A major/F sharp minor — see pp. 100-102
3 In spite of the key signature — see p. 73
Such considerations here account for 545 pages out of 750 in the score, which indicates that something of the order of two-thirds of the music of *Rheingold* has its overall tonality determined by the factors discussed in the preceding pages.

**DIE WALKÜRE**

**Act I**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pp.</th>
<th>Key</th>
<th>Character</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 - 40</td>
<td>D minor</td>
<td>Siegmund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42 - 92</td>
<td>C minor</td>
<td>Hunding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>92 - 112</td>
<td>C major</td>
<td>Sword</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Act II**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pp.</th>
<th>Key</th>
<th>Scene</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>266 - 281</td>
<td>B minor</td>
<td>Walküren</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>282 - 344</td>
<td>C minor¹ and G sharp minor *</td>
<td>Fricka/Wotan scene</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>461 - 569</td>
<td>F sharp minor ²</td>
<td>Todesverkündigung *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>598 - 618</td>
<td>D minor</td>
<td>Siegmund's death</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Act III**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pp.</th>
<th>Key</th>
<th>Scene</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>619 - 735</td>
<td>B minor</td>
<td>Walküren</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>803 - 828</td>
<td>D minor</td>
<td>Storm music (compare W/1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>879 - 891</td>
<td>B minor</td>
<td>Walküren</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>974 - 1068</td>
<td>E major</td>
<td>Abschied *</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is clear from this that little of *Die Walküre* depends for its choice of tonality upon the relationships between Motive (or character) and a particular key. The only consistent association

---

¹ The C minor originates in the association with Hunding, who is here the subject of Fricka's argument with Wotan. See for example quotations from Hunding's own music (W/286/2-5, from W/44/8-11; W/285/4-5, from W/42/9-10) in the Fricka scene.

² This derives initially from the statement of the Todesverkündigung Thema in F sharp minor, but the Thema is not thereafter used consistently in that key (see for example W/860-7 various keys; G/23 G minor; G/31 A flat minor; G/394-8 various; amongst others).
is that of the Walküren with B minor; the D minor – Siegmund and C minor – Hunding relationships are much less distinct, though they could be considered to affect the choice key of the Fricka and Wotan scenes in C minor and D minor indicated above. The absence of associations is paralleled by an almost total absence in the musical material of the use of the Motive characteristic of the rest of the cycle, and the lack of material which might carry tonal association results in the adoption of tonalities which from this standpoint seem largely arbitrary, the Die Walküre music itself being largely made up of material which does not occur in the rest of the cycle.

SIEGFRIED

Act I

```
PP.
1 - 30 B flat minor Nibelungen music
149 - 153 B flat minor Nibelungen music
181 - 186 F minor Giant's music
188 - 197 D flat major Walhall
```

Act II

```
449 - 528 F minor Fafner
559 - 586 E major Woodbird
587 - 591 F major Horn Call
591 - 623 F minor Fafner
626 - 635 E major Woodbird
636 - 656 B flat minor Nibelungen
664 - 668 E major Woodbird
718 - 755 E minor – major ¹ Woodbird
```

¹ In the Kompositionsskizze Wagner originally wrote "E dur" over the bar line at 5/718/2-3. This was later altered to "E moll".
From this it is evident that a very large proportion of the second act of Siegfried (about two-thirds) relies upon the relationships between character and tonality, as dictated by the drama, to determine the harmonic architecture. The only passages in this act which cannot be explained in these terms are the arrival of Siegfried and Mime before Fafner's cave (scene in D minor - initially derived from the D minor sword-forging melody in Act I), and the scene following Fafner's death between Siegfried and Mime.

The choice of tonalities in the first act is not so predictable however, and the third act contains virtually no such harmonic pre-determination whatever, with the exception of Siegfried's journey through the fire:

Act III

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>pp.</th>
<th>Key</th>
<th>Remarks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>757 - 868</td>
<td>G minor</td>
<td>Wotan-Erda scene</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>940 - 958</td>
<td>F major</td>
<td>Horn Call</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>960 - 972</td>
<td>E major</td>
<td>Siegfried's arrival on the mountaintop. Key derived from Die Walküre Act III, sc. 3.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1004 - 1053</td>
<td>C major</td>
<td>Brünnhilde's awakening. C major = purity?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1093 - 1104</td>
<td>E major</td>
<td>&quot;Idyll&quot; music</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1133 - 1144</td>
<td>B minor</td>
<td>Walküren</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1144 - 1163</td>
<td>C major</td>
<td>Duet (The C major originates in the Einzelskizzen)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 See p. 45
2 The G minor originates in the Einzelskizzen; see p. 80
3 The E major "Idyll" music dates from 1864, five years before the composition of Act III. See pp. 80, 269
GÖTTERDÄMMERUNG

Vorspiel

1 - 64  E flat minor  Norns* 1
158 - 170  F major  Horn Call
174 - 192  E flat major  The Rhine 2

Act I

199 - 214  B minor  Gibichungen
234 - 238  B minor  Tarnhelm/Gibichungen
241 - 256  F major  Horn Call
257 - 284  B flat major  Gunther
285 - 298  G major  Gutrune
306 - 346  B flat major  Gunther
353 - 372  E flat minor  Hagen
378 - 392  B minor  Walküren
392 - 478  C minor/F sharp minor 3 Waltraute scene *
479 - 484  B minor  Walküren
495 - 500  F major  Horn Call
502 - 543  B minor  Tarnhelm/Gibichungen

Act II

545 - 587  B flat minor/E flat minor  Alberich/Hagen
598 - 627  G major  Gutrune
627 - 636  C major  Gibichungen Horn Call
712 - 724  B flat major  Gunther

1 The E flat minor is derived from the Kompositionsskizze for Siegfrieds Tod. See pp. 178-83.
2 See p. 44n.
3 The F sharp minor key-signature is used more extensively in the Kompositionsskizze than in the final version.
Act II (Cont'd)

724 - 727  G major  Gutrune
818 - 820  B minor  Walküren
832 - 840  C major  Gibichungen Horn Call
920 - 930  

Act III

933 - 1069  F major  Horn Call/Rhinemaidens
1109 - 1126  E major  Woodbird
1149 - 1162  C major - A major  Quotation from Siegfried III
(1277)1336 3 - 1361  D flat major  Walhall

In Siegfried Act III and in Götterdämmerung the amount of pre-
determination of tonality decreases: in Siegfried Act III only
about a quarter of the music can have its tonality traced back to
character considerations, and in Götterdämmerung the proportion is
similar (in Act I it is less than half, in Act II something under
a third and in Act III under a quarter). This is probably due to
the fact that (as in Die Walküre, in which such predetermination
was also reduced 4) both Siegfried Act III and Götterdämmerung

1 The Vengeance Trio (G/844-930) is framed by these two C major
passages. In addition, the Trio itself centres around C major,
due largely to the presence of Hagen's Motive (see p.85)
though it rarely actually adopts that key itself.

2 It is evident from the Enzelskizzen which contain many sketches
of the Götterdämmerung Rhinemaidens' music, that the key of F
major had been determined for this scene some time in advance
of the writing of the Kompositionskizze. (See pp.176-7)

3 It is extremely difficult to decide at which point the D flat
tonality becomes the "home" key. Lorenz (Op.cit. p. 205)
suggests that it begins as early as G/1226/1. D flat actually
appears as the tonality of the final section at G/1336/1, but
at points prior to this the music has gravitated towards that
key at climactic moments.

4 See pp.104-5
utilise a considerable amount of material which is new to the cycle. In addition, (as discussed elsewhere 1) the musical texture of the latter part of the *Ring* depends less upon the restatement of familiar material; and the increased chromatic freedom of the post-*Tristan* music to some extent leads the music without reference to any character/tonality relationships.

A considerable portion of the music of the *Ring* can thus be seen to depend for its harmonic organisation (on the scale of the extended musical paragraph concerned with one character or group of characters) on the relationships discussed in the preceding pages. That Wagner did not apply these tonalities rigorously to the entire cycle was only natural; to have done so would have reduced the whole act of composition to a mechanical process. In fact Wagner did adopt the appropriate tonality for virtually all scenes where character— or *Motiv*—tonality relationships existed. The chief occasions on which he did not adopt the tonality which might have been expected can be briefly detailed:

**Die Walküre**

pp. 256 - 261  
C minor-major instead of B minor-major 2 *(Walküren)*

**Siegfried**

Sword-forging scene:  
D minor-major instead of C major 3 *(Sword)*

**Götterdämmerung**

pp. 170 - 174  
A major instead of E flat *(The Rhine)* 4 

p. 1226  
D major instead of C major *(Sword)* 5

---

1 See pp. 134–7
2 Though the C tonality is dictated by Hunding's Horn Call (See p. 160n.)
3 The D minor originates in the *Einzelskizzen* where it appears as the key of sketches labelled *Amselschlag* (“anvil-strokes”).
4 See p. 44n.
5 See pp.30-1
The remainder of the harmonic moves on the larger scale are not obviously dependent on any such considerations, and although this does not mean that further tonalities did not have significance for Wagner, any such significance in relation to the drama is not apparent.

The effect of the relationships now established has been examined with relation to appearances of Motive or character mentioned in the text, or appearing on stage. However the effect of the Motive and character—tonality relationships is carried further than this in the Ring through the use of the technique of Ahnung und Erinnerung ("Foreboding and Remembrance") in which the quotation of Motive or of longer passages of music actually play a part in the furtherance of the drama itself, rather than being merely a musical extension of the text.
III AHNUNG UND ERINNERUNG — the participation of the music in the drama itself and the effect of this on tonality.
1. THE AHNUNG UND ERINNERUNG THEORY AS IT APPEARS IN
OPER UND DRAMA

Wagner's largest theoretical work "Opera and Drama" 1 was written between October 1850 and February 1851. This places it after the writing of the poem of Siegfried's Tod, but prior to the writing of the Junger Siegfried poem.

Wagner used Oper und Drama to discuss virtually every aspect of the aesthetic background to his work and, to a very much lesser extent, the musical-dramatic theory behind it in technical terms. The aesthetic considerations are primarily concerned with the relationship between music and drama in a historical context and in the light of Wagner's own beliefs on the subject, and are not pertinent here; but the small sections on his principles of musical-dramatic organisation are of importance to any attempt to examine the harmonic structure of the Ring.

In Oper und Drama Wagner discusses at length the manner in which the new art-work would be dramatically constructed, and then proceeds to consider the important part which the orchestra would play in this scheme in its relation to the sung "Verse-melody" of the characters on stage:

Der lebengebende Mittelpunkt des dramatischen Ausdruckes ist die Versmelodie des Darstellers: auf sie bezieht sich als Ahnung die vorbereitende absolute Orchestermelodie; aus ihr leitet sich als Erinnerung der "Gedanke" des Instrumentalmotives her. Die Ahnung ist das sich ausbreitende Licht, das, indem es auf den Gegenstand fällt, die dem Gegenstande eigentümliche, von ihm selbst aus bedingte Farbe zu einer ersichtlichen Wahrheit macht; die Erinnerung ist die gewonnene Farbe selbst, wie sie der Maler dem Gegenstande entnimmt, um sie auf ihm verwandte Gegenstände überzutragen. 2

1 Oper und Drama comprises GS XI.
2 GS XI: 298
The life-giving focus of dramatic expression is the "Verse-melody" of the performer. The absolute orchestral melody anticipates it as a "foreboding" and out of it grows the "thought" of the instrumental motif as "remembrance". The "foreboding" is the ray of light which, falling on an object, illuminates the tint peculiar to that object and conditioned by its substance, into a visible truth; the "remembrance" is the tint itself, which the painter borrows from the object, in order to transfer it to related objects.

The gist of this is that the orchestra will be used to draw parallels between related situations by means of quotation from the "Verse-melody" (i.e. the melody to which the poem is set in the vocal line), either in anticipation, or retrospectively.

Wagner did not read Schopenhauer until 1854, three years later, as he recounts in letters to Bülow 1 to Liszt 2, and in Mein Leben 3, but certain passages in Oper und Drama correspond closely to Schopenhauer's views as to the significance of music in drama. Wagner was greatly impressed by the philosopher's writings, remarking fourteen years later to Nietzsche that Schopenhauer was the only philosopher who had recognised the real essence of music, and acknowledging how much he, Wagner, owed to him. Schopenhauer however greatly preferred Rossini to Wagner: he was more impressed by the quality of the paper upon which the copy of the Ring poem, which Wagner sent to him in 1854, (inscribed "in reverence and gratitude") was printed than by the poem itself. He took particular exception to Wagner's treatment of the German language, and after seeing a performance of Der fliegende Holländer declared that Wagner did not know what music was. Many years later (1878) Wagner

1 WA I 338 (letter of 26th November, 1854)
2 WL II 45 (letter of 16th December, 1854)
3 ML II 603-5
remarked to Cosima, concerning the representation of the "will" in the character of Wotan:

Ich bin überzeugt, Schopenhauer würde sich geärgert haben, dass ich dies gefunden, bevor ich seine Philosophie gekannt. 1

(I am convinced that Schopenhauer would have been annoyed that I had discovered this before I became familiar with his philosophy.)

Wagner was clearly very proud of his discovery of Schopenhauer's ideas prior to actually having read any of the philosopher's work. Thomas Mann crystallised the situation in his *Leiden und Grössen*

**Richard Wagners:**

Niemals wahrscheinlich in aller Seelengeschichte hat die Bedürftigkeit des dunklen, des getriebenen Menschen, des Künstlers nach geistiger Stütze; nach Rechtfertigung in Belehrung durch den Gedanken eine so wundervolle Befriedigung erfahren, wie es diejenige war, die Wagner durch Schopenhauer zuteil wurde. 2

(Probably never in the spiritual history of mankind has the need of the artist (that dark and hunted human being) for intellectual support and justification been so wonderfully satisfied as was Wagner's need through Schopenhauer.)

However, in *Oper und Drama* it is apparent how close Wagner's theories were to Schopenhauer's own conception of the relationship between music and drama as set out in the latter's *Die Welt als Wille und Vorstellung* 3 ('The World as Will and Idea')..

---


Schopenhauer's veneration for Rossini was based upon his opinion that, in that composer's setting of words, the music "spoke its own language so distinctly that it required no words at all and therefore produced its full effect even when rendered by instruments alone". In this, Schopenhauer's conception of music-drama differed radically from Wagner's: both regarded music as the essential means of conveying the emotion underlying the text in drama, but Wagner could not consider the elimination of the text, since the music and words were emotionally and dramatically interdependent.

Das Orchester ist die Einheit des Ausdruckes jederzeit ergänzende Sprachorgan, welches da, wo der Worttonsprachausdruck der dramatischen Personen sich, zur deutlicheren Bestimmung der dramatischen Situation, bis zur Darlegung seiner kenntlichsten Verwandtschaft mit dem Ausdrucke des gewöhnlichen Lebens als Verstandesorgan herabsenkt, durch sein Vermögen der musikalischen Kundgebung der Erinnerung oder Ahnung den gesenkten Ausdruck der dramatischen Personen derart ausgleicht, dass das angeregte Gefühl stets in seiner gehobenen Stimmung bleibt, und nie durch gleiches Herabsinken in eine reine Verstandstätigkeit sich zu verwandeln hat.

Beachten wir aber wohl, dass die ausgleichenden Ausdrucksmomente des Orchesters nie aus der Willkür des Musikers, als etwa bloss künstliche Klangzutat, sondern nur aus der Absicht des Dichters zu bestimmen sind.

1 Schopenhauer, Op. cit., I p. 309. Schopenhauer further condemned the too-close joining of words and action to the music and the use of bass lines which moved by semitones.

2 GS XI 307
(The orchestra is the vocal organ which completes the unity of expression. Wherever, for a plainer definition of the dramatic situation, the level of expression of the word-music-language of the dramatis personae reduces itself to a point at which its connections with language as a rational means of everyday communication are unmistakable, there the orchestra will compensate for this decline in the expressiveness of the dramatis personae by its power to convey musically "remembrance" or "foreboding", so that the awakened feeling remains in its uplifted mood and never has to reduce itself to the purely intellectual function of explanation, occasionally necessary for the definition of dramatic events.

Let us not forget however that such compensating moments of orchestral self-expression are never to be determined by the caprice of the musician indulging in pure music, but only by the poet's intention.)

From this, and from other passages, it is very evident that Wagner could not consider the existence of the music without the text, and although he himself was responsible for the concert versions of some of the extracts from his works, the music and text were for him generally completely inseparable.

Wagner further condemned the use of "absolute musical embellishment", "ritornelles" and "interludes" as being totally invalid in the world of the new drama, and totally incompatible with the principles above. After considerable length of argument, corresponding quite closely to Schopenhauer's view of the complementary functions of words and music in drama, Wagner arrives at two examples of dramatic situations to illustrate these ideas.

A girl dismisses her lover and waves goodbye to him. The orchestra at this point sounds the music associated with an earlier moment in the drama at which she welcomed his arrival.

1 GS XI 327-8
Wagner emphasises that this musical recollection would be totally invalidated if there had been no words of welcome in the text of the earlier moment (and distinctive music associated with these words) which the orchestra could here call to memory; and also if the girl were not by her actions to be seen to be bidding him goodbye, but were merely to stand in the foreground as he went out. In this situation, Wagner opines that the passage might as well be cut: without the factors of text and gesture, recall of the earlier music would be no better than a ritornello, a device which is merely a servant of the "self-glorification of music".

This example is almost certainly drawn from Tannhäuser, representing the parting of Elisabeth and Tannhäuser in Act II, in which the stage directions instruct Elisabeth to follow Tannhäuser with her eyes, whilst the orchestra sounds the music with which she had first greeted him ("so stehet auf ... ").

The second example is clearly drawn from Lohengrin: although Wagner does not acknowledge this in Oper und Drama, he does name the source in a letter to his old Dresden friend, Theodor Uhlig. He describes a situation just brought to a satisfactory close with all obstacles set aside (Lohengrin and Elsa about to enter the church at the end of Act II). The composer however wishes to indicate to the audience that all is not well, that the serenity

---

1 Tannhäuser, Eulenberg Score p. 336
2 Ibid. pp. 289-90
3 GS XI 329
4 WU 142
of the characters is self-delusion. He therefore directs that another character (Ortrud) whom the audience has come to associate with sentiments unsympathetic to the other characters, make a threatening gesture towards them. This fills the audience with "foreboding" (Ahnung), and the orchestra, by summoning up a "remembrance" (Erinnerung) (that is, of a Motiv already associated with the words of a threat earlier delivered 1) explains the threatening gesture; the moment thereby becomes a prophecy of doom. 2 Wagner emphasises that without the gesture, the sounding of the Motiv would be not only redundant, but would be a "fantastic caprice" on the part of the composer. This unambiguous statement did not prevent Wagner, in the Götterdämmerung wedding procession (a moment almost identical dramatically to the Lohengrin example which he had quoted as a model), from shattering the C major wedding music with the Motive of Hagen and of revenge 3, without any physical gesture being indicated in the score. (The threat had certainly been already adequately conveyed in the preceding Vengeance Trio, although it could however be similarly argued that Ortrud's threat was already explicit without the melodramatic gesture of raising her arm towards Elsa.)

1 Lohengrin, Eulenberg score pp. 339-40
2 Ibid. p. 568
3 G/931
2. **THE EXTENSION OF THE **Oper und Drama** THEORY IN THE **RING**

Many examples of the use of "foreboding and remembrance" in the *Ring* develop the technique considerably further than was suggested in 1851. Examples of the use of the full-technique (i.e. simultaneous "foreboding" and "remembrance") are understandably few in *Rheingold*; of necessity that work acts as an exposition of material, and it is not until *Siegfried* that the system can be consistently observed in its full application. Similarly, in the closing section of the cycle, the frequency of the use of the full technique declines, there being no action left to forebode.

The strict theory of *Ahnung und Erinnerung* as expounded in *Oper und Drama* is therefore found, for the purposes of tonality investigation, to require extension to include:

i) "Foreboding" without any suggestion of "remembrance".

This is found almost exclusively in the earlier part of the cycle: the sounding of a Motiv or distinctive musical device which has bearing on the future drama, but without actual explanation in the text. (Such explanation would constitute Motiv-association rather than foreboding).

ii) "Remembrance" without suggestion of "foreboding".

Conversely, this is found in the latter parts of the cycle: the sounding of a Motiv or distinctive musical device, the significance of which is already established, and which acts as the fulfillment of foreboding already expressed, but without simultaneously pointing further forward.

---

1 *Oper und Drama* was written in the winter of 1850-51. The *Siegfrieds Tod* poem was written in the summer of 1848 and the full *Ring* poem completed in 1852. The music to *Rheingold* was begun in November, 1853.
Not only does Wagner, in the *Ring*, depart from his previously stated theories to the extent of using foreboding and remembrance separately, but he also deviates to a large extent from his strict requirement that all examples of Ahnung und Erinnerung should be made explicit in the text or by physical gesture on the stage, and in fact, the technique is rendered more dramatically powerful as a result of this omission.

In combination with the device of the *dichterisch-musikalische Periode* 1 ("poetic-musical period") also expounded in *Oper und Drama* as the basis of the harmonic structure of the new music-drama, the concept of Ahnung und Erinnerung is the most significant single theoretical factor in the organisation of the music within the music-drama. In the context of this technique, Wagner does not mention tonality at all 2, and though he viewed Ahnung und Erinnerung as a purely dramatic device, in the *Ring* it becomes of far greater significance, linking the movement of tonality directly to dramatic action. In *Oper und Drama* Wagner had stated that the device would be particularly employed at moments when the text was concerned with narrative or explanation, and would be used to maintain the emotional intensity through such moments. Where the voice itself carried the emotional expression, the orchestra would merely support the melody. Wagner was however fully aware that the use of remembrances and forebodings in those moments in which the voice ceased to carry the emotional matter would of itself produce a musical form:

1 See Section V.2.
2 Though in the *Tannhäuser* example quoted earlier the music in question appears in A flat in both instances.
Diese melodischen Momente, in denen wir uns der Ahnung erinnern, während sie uns die Erinnerung zur Ahnung machen, werden notwendig nur den wichtigsten Motiven des Dramas entblüht sein, und die wichtigsten von ihnen werden wiederum an Zahl denjenigen Motiven entsprechen, die der Dichter als zusammen- 
gedrängte, verstärkte Grundmotive der eben so verstärkten und zusammengedrängten Handlung zu den Säulen seines dramatischen Gebäudes bestimmte, die er grundsätzlich nicht in verwirrender Vielheit, sondern in plastisch zu ordnender, für leichte Übersicht notwendiger geringerer Zahl verwendet. In diesen Grundmomen, die eben nicht Sentenzen, sondern plastische Gefühlsmomente sind, wird die Absicht des Dichters, als eine durch das Gefühlsempfängnis verwirklichte, am verständlichsten; und der Musiker, als Verwirklicher der Absicht des Dichters, hat diese zu melodischen Momenten verdichteten Motive, im vollsten Einverständnisse mit der dichterischen Absicht, daher leicht so zu ordnen, dass in ihrer wohldrängten wechselseitigen Wiederholung ihm ganz von selbst auch die höchste einheitliche musikalische Form entsteht, - eine Form, wie sie der Musiker bisher willkürlich sich zusammenstellte, die aus der dichterischen Absicht aber erst zu einer notwendigen, wirklich einheitlichen, das ist: verständlichen, sich gestalten kann.

(These melodic moments - in which we remember a "foreboding", whilst they turn our "remembrance" itself into foreboding - will necessarily have blossomed only from the most important moments of the drama. The most important of such moments in turn will correspond in number to those dramatic motifs which the poet has taken as the concentrated and strengthened basic motifs of a strengthened and concentrated action, and which he has planted as the pillars of his dramatic edifice, employing them, in principle, not in bewildering profusion, but tangible disposing them in a number small enough to allow of easy survey. In these basic dramatic motifs, which are no mere pronouncements but tangible emotional states, the poet's intention is most clearly seen as realised through its translation into feeling. The musician, as the realiser of the poet's intention, has to take these dramatic motifs (already condensed to melodic moments) and order them so deftly, and in fullest accordance with the poetic aim that their necessary play of repetition will entirely by itself furnish him with the highest unity of musical form - a form which previous composers have put together arbitrarily, but which only the poetic intention can shape to a necessary and true (i.e. understandable and logical) unity.)
Prior to Rheingold, Wagner's use of the Leitmotiv technique had not been notable for its subtlety, nor for the flexibility or inventiveness of its application. In both Tannhäuser and Lohengrin there are a few examples which move beyond the idea of the "visiting card", but they are isolated examples and do not set a pattern. In contrast, although the Ring does have its share of mere object association, the Motive are frequently used in far more complex dramatic relationships. This increased sophistication of technique is not only limited to the Motive: in the context of Ahnung und Erinnerung whole paragraphs come to be treated as Motive and are thereby utilised to provide some of the musically most dramatic effects in the Ring, as well as to determine the direction of harmonic movement on a larger scale than could be achieved by the manipulation of Motive of only a few bars' length.

Generally, the Motive best suited for exploitation by Ahnung und Erinnerung are those which do not have a direct physical representation, but are expressions of emotions, desires or events (e.g. the Motiv of the curse or the Götterdammerungsmotiv). Equally appropriate are those Motive which have a double, or deeper significance (e.g. those of Walhall or the sword). Those Motive connected only with a physical object or person are less appropriate (being unable to do more than appear at the moments dictated by the text) although the technique can be used to bestow upon such material greater significance than merely the object they represent (e.g. the Motive of the Tarnhelm and of Hagen's magic potion which are used extensively to represent the dramatic result of their application; the placing of the curse upon the ring imparts to that object a new significance, which is reflected in the context in

1 This is the case with the Tannhäuser example quoted earlier.
which its Motiv is applied).

In an examination of the extent to which the use of the technique of Ahnung und Erinnerung affects the harmonic direction of the music of the Ring, it is necessary to discover the frequency with which the use of recalled or foreshadowed music results in the adoption of tonalities which have been, or will become, associated with that music. Whereas in the case of simple object-Motiv association, the adoption of the appropriate Motiv was already implicit in the poem, the appearance of a Motiv as remembrance or foreboding is a dramatic device applied during the process of composition. This may or may not affect the harmonic direction of the music. Simple direct object- or character-Motiv associations are accordingly not considered in the following investigation, having been examined in the section dealing with the relationships between Motive and tonality 1.

The following investigation of the extent to which the dramatic use of the technique of Ahnung und Erinnerung affects the harmonic direction of the music of the Ring is for convenience divided into the classifications:

i) "Foreboding" alone

ii) "Remembrance" alone

iii) Simultaneous "Foreboding" and "Remembrance".

1 See Section I
3. THE INVESTIGATION OF THE EXTENT TO WHICH THE USE OF
THE TECHNIQUE OF \textit{AHNUNG UND ERINNERUNG} AFFECTS TONALITY
IN THE \textit{RING}.

i) "Foreboding" without simultaneous suggestion of "Remembrance".

Although there are several instances in the \textit{Ring} of
the \textit{Motiv} associated with an object or character appearing in
advance of the physical manifestation of that object or character,
there are very few examples where the introduction of a \textit{Motiv}
takes the form of a purely musical intimation of events to come, that is,
without any elaboration in the text whatever, to account for this
(previously unheard) musical figure.

As already observed, the degree to which such fore¬
bodings could affect the harmonic direction of the music would
depend upon whether or not Wagner had already in his mind attached
a particular tonality to the music in question. It has been esta¬
ablished \footnote{See pp.74-82} that when he finally sat down to compose \textit{Rheingold} in
1853 the tonalities of certain musical ideas were more or less fixed;
thus it would seem that the first appearance of the essential dotted
rhythm associated with the giants (sounded in advance of their arrival,
and without any explanation in the text \footnote{R/197/8}) was an instance of tonality
being affected by a "foreboding", since the note chosen for the timpani
was F. The \textit{Motiv} is however absent in the \textit{Kompositionsskizze}, and
so it is not possible to declare conclusively that Wagner's associ¬
ation of the key of F minor with the giants was here responsible
for the harmonic shift:
Even if the choice of the note F were coincidental, the tone colour (timpani) and the rhythm are a clear foreboding of the arrival of the giants. This simple anticipation is however not the sense in which Wagner originally used the term Ahnung, and the anticipation of the chromatic music of Loge in advance of his arrival ¹ is similarly more an example of premature character-association than a musical device calculated to fill the audience with Ahnung.

In the real sense, the first suggestion of this Ahnung does not occur until after Wotan's appropriation of the ring where the Vernichtungsarbeitmotiv (the rhythmic figure associated with Alberich's revenge ²) appears for the first time. This Motiv is here not accounted for textually at all— in fact it is never expressly explained, but appears consistently at those points at which the drama is concerned with Alberich's avenging himself for the loss of the ring. In this sense it acts as constant foreboding of the deaths of all those who come to possess the ring, and in its use the range of pitch levels with which it is associated brings about modulation, although the "approximate" nature of this Motiv-key relationship means that it is not possible to declare that its

¹ R/214, 217
² R/563
effect on tonality is as great as in the case of some of the audibly more impressive forebodings.

Of these, by far the most imposing is the famous first statement of the Motiv of the sword, in which the music moves abruptly from D flat major to C major. This is the first foreboding which has had a decisive influence on the tonal structure of the music. As at the first appearance of the Vernichtungsarbeitsmotiv there is no indication in text or stage direction to explain the significance of this most distinctive musical figure, nor its relevance to the present situation in the drama. Wagner was clearly worried that, although the significance of the first statement of the sword-Motiv would become clear in the next of the Ring dramas, the appearance of the Motiv at this point would not be understood as a foreboding at all, in spite of Wotan's stage direction: "Wie von einem grossen Gedanken ergriffen, sehr entschlossen" ("as if seized with a great thought, very resolute"). Not satisfied with Wotan's resolution at the rehearsals of the first Bayreuth production in 1876, Wagner instructed that he should seize a sword fallen from the hoard and raise it aloft. This action does violence to the meaning of the moment in which Wotan conceives not the idea of the conquering sword, but of Siegfried himself, the hero who will redeem the gods. By associating the Motiv with the sword itself at this point, Wagner reduced a most impressive foreboding to mere object-association. In May 1876, Cosima recorded in her diary:

---

1 R/715. See example on p. 29.
Nach Tisch überlegt sich R., ob er nicht den Wotan im "Rheingold" wie er Walhall begrüßt ein Schwert aufraffen lässt, welches Fafner, weil es nicht von Gold, verächtlich vom Hort weggeschoben. Es wird das Schwert welches Wotan in die Esche einstößt. 1

(After dinner, R. debated whether or not in Rheingold he should make Wotan, as he greets Walhall, seize a sword which Fafner had angrily discarded from the hoard because it was not made of gold. This would become the sword which Wotan would plunge into the ash-tree.)

The fact that Wagner even thought it worth mentioning to Cosima that this sword would then become the sword in Die Walküre, emphasises that in his original conception of Rheingold there was never any suggestion of anything other than Wotan's "grosser Gedanke" at this point 2. However, as Gerald Abraham observes 3, Wagner was never averse to making things over-explicit, rather than leaving them to the audience's imagination, and trusting to their intelligence. Further examples of this habit are the altered conclusion (1852) of Der fliegende Holländer, and the three different versions of the close of Tannhäuser (1845, 1846 and 1847).

An apparently equally majestic foreboding is the first appearance of the so-called Redemption-Motiv at the announcement of Siegfried's name to Sieglinde 4. Indeed, so distant is its next appearance 5, that it is difficult to regard this as a foreboding at all, and in the Kompositionsskizze the Motiv is totally absent at this point 6. It is thus unlikely that at the time of

---

1 'Aussprüche des Meisters aus den Tagebüchern der Meisterin'; Bayreuther Blätter 1936, p.5.
2 No less an analyst than Tovey went so far as to record his amazement in his copy of the score that this Motiv appeared here at all, dismissing it as a coincidence. Tovey could not have been aware of Wagner's own concern with the device, nor with his 1876 solution of the problem.
3 Gerald Abraham, 100 Years of Music (London 1938) p. 101n.
4 W/797-8
5 G/1305
6 See pp. 63-4
the composition of *Die Walküre*, Wagner could have looked upon this moment as a foreboding. In any case, no tonality is associated with the Motiv, and it merely occurs in the G major of the moment.

In contrast to this very long-distance relationship, the intensive use of the murder-Motiv in the second act of *Götterdämmerung* produces a cumulative sense of foreboding, but without the exact intimation of what is being foreboded being made clear until later on in the act. The Motiv first appears in the Alberich-Hagen dream scene \(^1\), but it is not until Siegfried sings part of his "Helle Wehr" oath to this melody:

"Wo Scharfes mich schneidet,
schneide du mich;
wo der Tod mich soll treffen,
trefle du mich ..." \(^2\)

("If a weapon should pierce me,
let it be thee:
if death should strike me,
thine be the stroke ..."

that the implication becomes clear. The significance of the Motiv is then reinforced by Brünnhilde's text, set to the same music at the same pitch \(^3\), and it is finally sealed in the trio which concludes the act where, again at the same pitch, the Motiv is used for Brünnhilde's:

"Siegfried falle.
zur Sühne für sich und euch" \(^4\)

("Siegfried shall fall –
atonement for the guilt of all")

---

1 G/568
2 G/803-5
3 G/814-5
4 G/895
The murder-Motiv is associated with an "approximate" set of pitch levels (the first note is nearly always F sharp, G or A flat), but apart from these instances in the second act of Götterdämmerung, no single pitch is used consistently. The Motiv is not carried through to the actual event which it forebodes, only reappearing in the third act after Siegfried's death to introduce Hagen's "Ja denn! Ich hab' ihn erschlagen"¹ ("Yes – I slew him") where it is used as a remembrance, though here the pitch is different from the Act II pitch mentioned above.

The device of foreboding is of course in addition an essential ingredient of the orchestral prelude to each act. In general, these preludes make use of material, the significance of which has already been established, though in Oper und Drama Wagner wrote:

Das Orchester drückt die erwartungsvolle Empfindung selbst aus, die uns vor der Erscheinung des Kunstwerkes beherrscht, je nach der Richtung hin, wo es der dichterischen Absicht entspricht, leitet und erregt unsre allgemein gespannte Empfindung zu einer Ahnung, die eine als notwendig geforderte, bestimmte Erscheinung endlich zu erfüllen hat. ²

(The orchestra gives voice to the very feeling of expectancy which possesses us before the appearance of the art-work: in a manner corresponding to the work's poetic intention the orchestra guides our indefinite feeling of suspense and works it into a "foreboding" which necessarily calls for a definite phenomenon finally to fulfil it.)

In view of this, Wagner further opined that the customary operatic overture would be better played at the conclusion of the opera than as a prelude, since instead of leading the listener into the opera

¹ G/1214-15
² GS XI 302
by arousing foreboding, it itself fulfilled any sense of foreboding which it engendered by introducing other material from the drama to follow. The audience were not therefore drawn irresistibly into the beginning of the drama itself. This statement of course condemns Wagner's own earlier operatic overtures, a fact which he himself acknowledged. Referring to the Tannhäuser overture, he confided to Uhlig:

Aber im Konzertsaal ist ihr Platz, nicht nur vor der Oper im Theater: dort würde ich, wenn ich es bestimmen dürfte, nur das erste Tempo der Ouverture ausführen lassen – das Übrige ist – im glücklichen Falle des Verständnisses – zu viel vor dem Drama, im anderen aber zu wenig. 1

(But it belongs in the concert-hall, not only as a prelude to the opera in the theatre. In that situation, if I had any control over it, I would have only the first section played; the remainder is, in the happy circumstance of anybody understanding it, too much before the drama, otherwise, it is too little.)

In Lohengrin Wagner did not repeat this mistake of writing an "overture". In the prelude to Act-II for example the musical material is new, consisting of two sinister Motive later to be associated with Ortrud's conspiracy against Elsa, neither of which are actually elucidated until later in that act (the Frage-verbots-Motiv is also present). This is thus also foreboding without clarification. It was the second act of Lohengrin which was written last (in 1847) and its prelude furnishes one of the best examples in all Wagner's works of a foreboding, the exact signi-

1 WU 173-4 Wagner refers of course to the original version of the overture. The phrase "if I had any control over [the situation] " refers to Wagner's exile from Germany, during which he was not in a position to supervise productions of his works.
ficance of which is none too clear, the sense of anticipation being therefore the greater.

In the Ring, the prelude to Siegfried Act II is of similar cast. The Fafner music (with the exception of the Wurm-Motiv which appeared in Rheingold) is new, and is only later directly associated with the dragon, but the presence of the already familiar curse-Motiv makes the context specifically evil. Appropriate tonalities are adopted.

ii) "Remembrance" without simultaneous suggestion of "Foreboding"

In discussing "remembrance" it is important to distinguish between recollections of earlier music used to further the drama (as fulfilments of prophecies), and the use of motivic material merely precipitated by actual recollection in the text of events, objects or situations (for example, when— as frequently occurs in the Ring— a story is being retold). In this latter case the reappearance of the Motiv is by simple association with the text, and such use of Motiv has already been discussed. ¹

All such "remembrances" (without "foreboding" simultaneously implied) divide equally between those which affect tonality and those which do not, this division being largely the result of the Motiv-tonality associations (or lack thereof) already established. In addition, there are several important recollections of larger paragraphs of music (the longest such is thirty-three bars, not including formal recapitulations which serve little dramatic purpose,

¹ See Section I and p.123
e.g. Mime's "Zwangvolle Plage ..."\(^1\), which have a noticeable effect on tonality.

Wagner was occasionally guilty of using earlier material implying remembrance in an irresponsible manner, as many commentators have noted. The most celebrated example of this is found in \textit{Siegfried}, where Wotan's departure from Alberich occasions a quotation from the moment in \textit{Die Walküre} when Wotan left Brünnhilde. The use of the Abschied melody at this point was not even an afterthought—it appears in the \textit{Kompositionsskizze}\(^2\):

![Abschied melody from \textit{Siegfried}](image)

Wagner was equally careless with the love Motiv from \textit{Die Walküre} Act I, introducing it at three rather irrelevant moments in the \textit{Ring}\(^3\). The Motiv also occurs prominently in \textit{Meistersinger}:

\(^1\) S/15-18 = S/27-30

\(^2\) Robert Donington (\textit{Op. Cit.} p. 174) suggests that this appearance of the melody can be justified if the Motiv is regarded as having been, in the \textit{Die Walküre} manifestation, an expression of Wotan's acceptance of the need to sublimate his own ego and surrender Brünnhilde to Siegfried. In \textit{Siegfried} Act II, Donington then regards the Motiv as expressing Wotan's acceptance of the need to recognise the power of his shadow self, Alberich. (Wotan does refer to himself as \textit{Licht-Alberich} (S/189) and to Alberich as \textit{Schwarz-Alberich} (S/177, 143).)

\(^3\) S/860; G/118-9, the moment which particularly offended Newman, where the Motiv is related to Brünnhilde's affection for her horse; G/825
These moments have no effect on tonality, but generally the number of genuine "remembrances" which affect the harmonic direction of the music, though few, are significant. The largest group is of those concerned with the demise of a character or idea, or with their last appearance in the cycle, at which point an earlier prophecy is fulfilled. The three main instances are the last appearances of Siegmund, Wotan and Siegfried.

a) Siegmund's death

As Siegmund dies, all the Motive which have been pointing towards this moment gather in remembrance; the Walküren ¹ (in their B minor); the sword (initially in the "wrong" key but then in C – in the minor, musically illustrating its destruction by the spear, the Motiv of which is simultaneously sounded ² and which represents Wotan's oath to Fricka); the Wälsungenweh melody ³ (in the key of D minor); the Motiv of Hunding's obligation ⁴ (also in D minor); and the Motiv

---

¹ W/595  
² W/596  
³ W/598/6  
⁴ W/604/13
of fate (also in D minor). The use of D minor at this point is probably derived from the D minor associated with Siegmund in Act I, though that cannot be stated conclusively.

b) Wotan's last appearance in the cycle

Wotan last appears in the Ring, as the Wanderer, in the third act of Siegfried. Several remembrances are occasioned, but only a very few indeed of these are seen to affect the tonalities adopted. However, Wagner's approach to the use of Motive in Siegfried Act III differs from that in the earlier part of the cycle and in this, the chronology of the composition of the Ring dramas is important.

Acts I and II of Siegfried were completed in the Kompositionsskizze on 30th July, 1857. The popular tale, that Wagner put aside Siegfried at the moment when the hero settles beneath the lime tree prior to killing Fafner, and at which point was written in the Kompositionsskizze "Wann seh'n wir uns wieder??" ("when shall we see each other again?") is incorrect. In the sketch, that moment is dated 26th June, 1857, and the date of the 27th is appended to the comment. The music however continues (with the date 11th July), and the act was completed on the 30th of that month. The Orchesterskizze of the second act was finished on the 9th August. Although the rough full score of Act I was completed in March 1857, that of Act II was not begun until October 1864 (whilst Wagner was contemplating Meistersinger) and completed

1 W/604 (three times)

2 The famous and very moving letter to Liszt telling him of the suspension of work on Siegfried is dated the 28th June. (WL II 175)
in December, 1865. In October, 1861 Wagner wrote to his publisher:

Von den zweiten 1 "der junger Siegfried" sind ebenfalls 2 Akte bereits vollendet. Das Ganze mit dem dritten ("Siegfrieds Tod") könnte im Laufe zweier Jahre leicht vollendet sein. 2

("Of the second [drama] Der junger Siegfried, two acts are already finished. The whole [work], with the third [drama] (Siegfrieds Tod) can easily be finished in the course of two years")

The third act of Siegfried was not in fact begun until March, 1869.

This break between Acts II and III, during which Tristan and Meistersinger were written, is most obvious in the matter of orchestral texture. In that part of the Ring prior to Tristan the trombones are not used extensively, their contribution being (apart from reinforcing loud passages) in supplying distinctive tone-colour to various Motive (particularly those of the spear and the curse). It is immediately evident from a glance at the score of Siegfried Act III however that the trombones are now used extensively throughout to give the chordal support previously supplied by the "blanket of horns", the horns thus being freed to pursue melodic lines of their own, and to double the string parts in a virtuosic manner. In the Kompositionsskizze of the prelude to Siegfried Act III there are long stretches where only the sequence of trombone chords is indicated. The other figurations and melodies were added in the Orchesterskizze.

---

1 Wagner of course regarded Die Walküre as the first drama of the cycle, Rheingold was merely a prelude.
Alongside, and partly as a result of this more general use of extended chordal passages to support melodic and textural elements, is a far more expansive span of phrase; whereas Acts I and II of Siegfried have within their scenes very many formal subdivisions, the musical paragraphs in Act III are far broader and consequently fewer in number, reducing almost to:

- i) Wanderer – Erda
- ii) Wanderer – Siegfried
- iii) Siegfried alone
- iv) Awakening of Brünnhilde
- v) Brünnhilde
- vi) Duet

The music in each of these sections (and especially in the first) is largely of one texture and tempo, without the constant changes of material found earlier in the cycle. As a further consequence it is noticeable that there are far fewer instances of the texture being held up for rhetorical statements of Motive, and the frequency with which the Motive appear declines dramatically, the manner of appearance becoming more as building blocks for texture behind the voice, than in their being related to every detail of the drama and line of the text. A similar construction is found in Götterdämmerung.

This in turn leads to a decrease in the frequency of examples of "remembrance" which bear upon tonality; their use is more sparing, and generally, when they do affect the tonality of the music, it is on a larger scale than hitherto – that is, the quotations tend to be of larger sections of music rather than of single Motive.
However, these quotations more often occur in the key of the moment than in the key of their previous manifestations if the adoption of the earlier key would upset the larger span of the musical phrase.

The prelude to Act III of Siegfried thus sets the style of the music to come. Its phrases move in gigantic arches made up of small Motive expanded into long lines. The addition of the spear-Motiv does not halt the flow of the music for two bars as was previously the case, but merely becomes a contrapuntal element. The 'Wanderer' chord-sequence, moving in large sequential steps, supplies the harmonic direction, but it does not assume the tonality it had established with Wotan's arrival in Act I and which had been reinforced in Act II, where attention had been drawn to the progression by the way in which its B major emerged from F major:

1 S/154
The appearances of Motive in the Wanderer-Erda scene are mainly inspired by the text (e.g. mention of the Norns \(^1\), the Rhine \(^2\)). The Walhall-Motiv appears with reference to Wotan \(^3\) but does not adopt D flat or E \(^4\) as this would seriously have upset the flow of the music. The striking modulation at the musical recollection of Brünnhilde's sleep is to A major, not to E major as would have been dramatically appropriate. Both A and E are remote from the E flat of the moment, but the A is made to flow more naturally out of E flat via a half way point of C major \(^5\).

The reappearence of the fire music \(^6\), in the form and in the key and orchestration in which it was originally heard in Die Walküre \(^7\) is however a remembrance proper, rather than a mere textual reference: it is the recollection of the moment in which the idea of the fire was conceived, rather than of the fire itself. The modulation to D major is dramatic and most unexpected:

1 S/814-5 E major/C sharp minor (= Erda).
2 "was die Tiefe birgt" S/807 - a sudden tonal side-slip to E flat
3 S/821 Of this moment Wagner said at the 1876 rehearsals: "mit weichster Tongebung zu spielen" ("to be played with the gentlest phrasing"), - this corresponds with his other statements concerning the various manners in which the Walhall music is to be played (see also p.3).
4 See pp. 52-4
5 S/823
6 S/922
7 W/962
Siegfried's journey through this fire is not in the E major which could have been expected (that being the key with which Die Walküre ended) but in F, that key being determined by the presence of the horn-call. It is however in the E major that the music comes to rest as Siegfried arrives on the mountaintop, the presence of the Siegfried-Motiv fulfilling the prophecy of the last words of Die Walküre: "Wer meines Speeres Spitze fürchet, durchschreite das Feuer nie!" ("He who fears the point of my spear shall never pass through the fire") which were set to that Motiv.

1 S/960, 966, 971, 978-89
2 W/1032-40
c) Siegfried's death

In the same way as Siegmund's demise was used as a gathering point for the Motive which had pointed forward to his death, the death of Siegfried himself brings about a succession of remembrances, amounting almost to recapitulation, having no further sense of foreboding, and being in some cases the last appearance of a particular musical figure in the cycle.

Initially, the harmonic affinity between the Motive of the curse and of Hagen (already suggested at the beginning of Götterdämmerung Act III) is, as Hagen attacks Siegfried, made explicit:

This instant is the culmination of all previous forebodings of Siegfried's death. There is now nothing left to which this music could point forward, and it is not heard again, except as a remembrance at the arrival of the funeral procession in the Gibichungen Hall. In each case the "Hoi-Hoi!" figure continues to dictate the tonality.
Siegfried's recollection of the awakening of Brünnhilde (which follows) leads to the quotation of the music from that moment, in the tonality of the original. This is more than mere text-association: Siegfried's recollection of the awakening is in a delirium, it is only the music which is a true remembrance. This quotation 1 lasts for a full thirty-three bars, the longest "remembrance" in the Ring; the orchestration is almost identical in each case 2.

The following Funeral Music is tonally self-contained and is harmonically unaffected by the quotations of the various Motive associated with Siegfried, with the exception of the climax of the movement, which is derived from the exposition of the E flat augmented horn call in the Vorspiel 3 (the curse-Motiv also assumes its accustomed F sharp pitch). At this point in the Kompositions-skizze Wagner originally included the Siegfried Motiv itself to conclude this reminiscence of the Siegfried music. These bars were retained in the Orchesterskizze and not eliminated until the Partiturschrift. They brought about a full C minor cadence to conclude the Trauermusik, instead of the interruption finally adopted:

1 G/1149-59 = S/1010-21
2 Tovey states (Essays and Lectures on Music p. 359) that whilst scoring Göttterdammerung Wagner wrote to his publisher, Schott, urgently requesting scores of the earlier Ring dramas which he did not have to hand, "so that he can get parallel passages to tally". No such letter exists in the collected correspondence between Wagner and Schott. It is possible that Tovey hurriedly mistranslated Wagner's request (written whilst scoring Götterdämmerung) for the earlier scores, in order that he could have the Götterdämmerung score bound in matching style. (See Richard Wagner's Briefwechsel mit seinen Verlegern (Wiesbaden 1971) II p. 178, letter of 9th September, 1874)
3 G/1180-6 from G/70-72
The instances of "remembrance" alone having a significant influence on the harmonic direction of the music are however very few when set beside the number of such examples of combined Ahnung und Erinnerung. These, by contrast, play a significant part in the dramatic existence of the work, drawing together events past and events still to occur.

iii) "Foreboding and Remembrance"

The 'correct' use of the technique, as explained in Oper und Drama, comprises the use of a Motiv (or distinct musical passage) which, by reference to the significance of its previous context, combined with the present circumstances, points forward to, and even predicts, future events in the drama.
There are many examples of this technique in the *Ring*, and almost without exception, they can be seen to have a distinct effect on the harmonic direction of the music.¹

The exceptions:

The examples in which the tonality of the music does not seem to have been affected by the appearance of a quotation are generally (but not exclusively) those in which the quotation did not itself have any particular key association. Thus the moments of foreboding/remembrance brought about by the use of the Siegfried/Brünnhilde love themes as an ironic comment on Siegfried's oath before the Gibichung Vassals ², or in the Vengeance Trio following this ³ where they combine with other themes and change in character, do not affect the harmonic structure.

In a similar way, the appearances of the *Vernichtungsarbeitmotiv* (by virtue of its approximating to a set of pitch levels), do not generally affect harmonic direction to a measurable degree. It is however one of the most important *Motive* in the scheme of foreboding/remembrance, being the more effective for never having been directly associated with an actual text. Its use underlines the importance of events which in the text are recounted only as events (e.g. Wotan's account of Hagen's birth ⁴, and the moment in which Brünnhilde betrays Siegfried's weakness ⁵) but it does not figure significantly in the harmonic architecture.

---

¹ There are over seventy such examples
² G/820/4 - 831
³ G/857-8, 865-6, 871
⁴ W/413-4
⁵ G/868-9
These examples in which tonality is not affected are however far outweighed in number by significant examples which do bring about modulation.

The Curse- and Vernichtungsarbeitmotive

A large group of Motive point forward to Siegfried's death in particular, but the Motiv of the curse is used much more generally to forebode ill upon various characters. As already mentioned 1, its appearance in response to the text occasions some dramatic modulations. Its use in the foreboding/remembrance context is no less significant, underlining the dramatic consequences of certain actions, as at the moment where Wotan acknowledges that his desertion of his grandson means that Alberich's son may well become the master of the world: "tugend verrathen wer mir traut ... " 2. Most impressive of all, is its use to underline the disastrous consequences of the oath with which Siegfried swears allegiance to Gunther: the curse-Motiv is here thrown dramatically into relief by the manner in which it is torn from a very diatonic B flat major texture: 3

1 See pp. 60-1
2 W/402
3 B flat major is strongly associated with Gunther in Acts I and II (See p.107)
The curse-Motiv, (together with the Vernichtungsarbeitmotiv), is the most direct in its sinister implication, being one of the most distinctive Motive in the Ring. The two Motive together, at the moment of Fasolt's death, provide the first real "remembrance and foreboding" in the cycle. Here the use of the Vernichtungsarbeitmotiv in a diatonic context directly associates the curse-Motiv (which preceded it) with Wotan himself: "was gleicht Wotan, wohl deinem Glücke" - the apparent safety of the diatonicism being undermined, although no particular tonality is adopted.

The shadow of Alberich's curse, responsible as it is for the destruction in turn of Fasolt, Siegmund, Fafner, Mime, Siegfried, Gunther, Hagen and finally Wotan himself, is always to be felt in the moments where the music is used to point forwards to fresh disasters to come, even when the material utilised is not that of the Motiv itself. Thus the music of Alberich's own re-

1 R/653-6
2 See Section IV. 1.
collection of the moment of his downfall in *Siegfried* Act II is identical harmonically to, and at the same pitch as, music from the earlier curse scene in *Rheingold*, but the quotation (pointing forward to Wotan's own downfall) is so well integrated into the large scale harmonic flow that it is impossible to declare to what extent the overall harmonic progression was affected by it. The earlier statement was in an A minor key-signature context and the second in F minor, which involves the use of a number of accidentals.

The Potion-Motiv

The vague foreboding of Siegfried's death pervades the whole of *Götterdämmerung* (with the exception of the Brünnhilde/Siegfried scene in the prelude), and a number of Motive are harnessed to add, throughout the work, an instrumental drama parallel to that in the text, pointing forwards to the moment of his death.

The first explicit details of Hagen's plan come with his mention of the magic potion: "Gedenk des Trankes im Schrein ..." but even prior to this there has been intimation of his scheming in musical terms, prefiguring by five pages the detailing in the text. The second half of the Tarnhelm-Motiv (used here rather freely to depict Nibelungen magic rather than the object itself) is suddenly heard (on the habitual G sharp minor chord) emerging from a particularly healthy diatonic passage in B flat major.

---

1 S/479-80, see R/549
2 G/232
3 Though it could be taken to refer to Hagen's specific use of the Tarnhelm itself as the agent of deceit, by which he means to bring about Siegfried's death.
4 See p. 144n.
At once this Motiv dissolves into the first statement of the Potion-Motiv, at the pitch which the latter is to assume throughout the remainder of the work:

This statement of the Tarnhelm-Motiv is thus a recollection of dramatic importance independent of any text. When the Motiv reappears a few pages later as an introduction to the Potion-Motiv, the figure associated with female beauty (originally heard in connection with Freia) is added, producing a musical picture of Hagen's plan:

1 There are a very few exceptions, but the initial chord is almost invariably G – D sharp – C – G; see pp. 149–50
Later the relationship between the Motive of the Tarnhelm and the Potion is made clearer with Brünnhilde's "Wer drang zu mir?" ("Who has forced his way to me?") - the moment towards which the earlier association of the two Motive has been pointing - they are now clearly and consistently used together to represent the double character of Siegfried-Gunther and in doing so retain their own habitual tonalities. In the Kompositionsskizze the passage preceding the Tarnhelm-Motiv at this point is not written out in full:

Kompositionsskizze [G/501]

Ver-rath!

Wer drang zu mir?

Also at G/504, 505 (different pitch), 508-9, 514-5, 531, 540-1
The use of the Potion-Motiv throughout Götterdämmerung to forebode Siegfried's impending death nearly always occasions telling shifts of tonality (they can rarely be termed modulations). For example, at the moment in which Siegfried actually drinks the Potion, the Motiv emerges out of a recollection of the Siegfried/Brünnhilde love music (set in the E flat of their duet earlier in the act, within the scene's context of G major) and the Weltbegrüßungsthema (not in its original C), which then merges into the G major Gutrune music. The adjustment in Siegfried's mind from Brünnhilde to Gutrune is clearer in the music than in the text:

\[ G/287/6 \]
By the end of Act II the Potion music has become so much a part of Hagen's character that its use no longer stands out, although its appearance in the middle of the Vengeance Trio (again at original pitch), emerging from A flat minor, occasions a considerable enharmonic modulation, linking Hagen's text; "den der Treulose büßen sollt" ("for which the traitor shall atone") to the earlier point in the drama in which Hagen conceived the plan which would result in Siegfried's perjury:

The Oaths sworn by Siegfried

Siegfried's doom is finally sealed by his swearing of the oath: "Helle Wehr ...". Brünnhilde's immediate recapitulation of this music is too soon to be regarded as "remembrance".

1 G/801-6
but in the original version, this passage was also given the character of a foreboding, in that Hagen's tritone (at its accustomed C - F sharp pitch) was added to Brünnhilde's version of the music, reinforcing the significance of his engineering of the swearing of an oath as the means of bringing about Siegfried's death. In the Kompositionsskizze the music stands thus:

```
\begin{music}
\begin{staff}
\begin{system}
\note{\textit{Beides Speeres Spire}}
\end{system}
\end{staff}
\end{music}
```

This reference to the Hagen music was eliminated in the Orchester-
skizze.

The further recollection of this Oath Music after Siegfried's death ("Ja denn, ich hab' ihn erschlagen ... " ¹) is not in the key of the oath in Act II, but appropriately in that of the oath sworn in the Vengeance Trio where the melody had reappeared to the text:

¹ G/1216
The orchestral texture of both these moments is also the same.

The earlier oath, by which Siegfried had bound himself to Gunther ("Blutbrüderschaft schwören wir ein"), is also introduced into the Vengeance scene to add to the sense of doom. Both strains of its melody assume their original tonalities, the passage radically shifting the key-centre from F to D flat, and then enharmonically emerging in B minor. The earlier key signature of two flats is also assumed for this passage, and then cancelled immediately it is finished.

The Motive of Hagen

Casting their shadow over the whole of the second act of Götterdammerung are Hagen's Motive:

These are frequently used in combination with each other. At Brünnhilde's "Verrath, wie noch nie er geträumt" ("Treachery beyond all revenge") they are further combined with the Motiv of revenge, and the "Hoi-Ho!" figure passes into Brünnhilde's vocal line, the first time that the figure has been given to another character:

1 G/916
2 G/887 = G/318-9; G/888 = G/320
By passing this musical shape to Brünnhilde, Wagner makes clear in the music her becoming party to Hagen's intrigue, and at the moment of Gunther's acquiescence in the plot, the "Hoi-Ho!" figure passes in turn into his vocal line as well. In this latter case however, the pitch is a tone higher than usual (immediately prior to this it had appeared a semitone lower than usual, the flow of the music being here of primary consideration) whereas in the former case, Brünnhilde's use of the figure led to considerable harmonic dislocation.

The most momentous use of the Motiv in the context of "foreboding and remembrance" occurs at the moment in which this figure actually passes into the line of Siegfried himself, in a

1 G/906
modulation dramatically engineered out of A major:

Very shortly afterwards, Gunther's music foreshadows Siegfried's death in a similar tonal moment:
The sense of foreboding induced by all these moments culminates in the scene of Siegfried's narration of his past exploits. It is not until the narration reaches the recollections concerning Brünnhilde that it becomes more than a recapitulation of material previously associated with various events. Immediately following Hagen's "dass Fernes nicht dir entfalle ... " ("... so that distant memories should not escape you ... ") the Potion-Motiv merges imperceptibly into music from Siegfried Act III, assuming the established E major for the Woodbird music which follows:
musically illustrating the return to Siegfried's memory of his
discovery of Brünnhilde, whilst retaining the atmosphere of impend-
ing doom.

Siegfried's account of his arrival on Brünnhilde's
rock ¹ does not however musically follow that event as it originally
happened, but assumes the music of Hagen's earlier account of
Brünnhilde's situation to Gunther ². Thus the recapitulation is
as if heard through Gunther's ears, a dramatically sophisticated
device; and although the recapitulation is in fact a tone higher
than the original, the expected C major does appear at the recol-
lection of the actual moment of awakening ³.

The preceding examples (all from Götterdämmerung)
associated with Siegfried's death and the circumstances leading
up to it are generally examples of "foreboding and remembrance"
applied to a particular event, and are generally (with the
exception of the "Hoi-Ho!" figure which is always waiting round the
corner in Götterdämmerung) musically single references to this
event to come. The device of cumulative use of foreboding en-
gendered by repeated use of a musical figure can however be seen
to span the greater part of the cycle, while the "Hoi-Ho" Motiv
is limited to the latter part of Götterdämmerung.

¹ G/1127-9
² G/211-12
³ G/1138 (= S/1008)
The Göttterdammerungmotiv

This Motiv had established for itself a preferred pair of pitch-levels (A or A flat as the first note) in Rheingold and Siegfried ¹, and in Göttterdammerung the Motiv only twice assumes a pitch other than these in an important appearance ². It is used on a much subtler level than the rather rhetorical Walhall-Motiv, quietly pointing forward to the end by underlining the consequence of various actions. Its appearance as the Wanderer parts from Siegfried underlines the significance of Wotan's decision: "Zieh' hin! Ich kann dich nicht halten!" ("On your way, I cannot stop you"), whilst occasioning a distinctive side-slip modulation from C minor to D flat major:

and the recount of this event in the Norn's scene in Göttterdammerung further emphasises the importance of that moment in the use of this Motiv, this time over the D flat Walhall harmony, thrown into relief by the approach 'out of B major:

¹ See p.59
² G/62 on G, and G/1278 on E
Later in the same scene the D flat Walhall and A natural Götterdämmerungsmotive are combined in one phrase:
and the textual recollection of these words at the end of the drama occasions the same harmonic movement in an extended form:

The use, in these two instances, of the A natural instead of the A flat version of the Götterdämmerungmotiv throws the Motiv into far greater relief than if it had merely been placed in A flat over the D flat Walhall harmony.

The Motive associated with Hunding

The abstract character of the Obligation-Motiv makes it ideal for use in the foreboding/remembrance structure, and its use with the Motiv of Hunding himself and its rhythm (associated with a repeated note C), produces a cumulative effect of foreboding, pointing forwards to Siegmund’s death from the prelude of Die Walküre

1 See for example: W/286, 422; both in C minor (from W/44)
Act II \(^1\) until the fight itself.

Many other Motive are used in this manner, and the tonalities associated with them frequently affect the harmonic direction of the music, even though the text had not at that point suggested explicitly that that Motiv should have appeared. Far more dramatic however and of more extended harmonic effect, are the quotations of whole sections of music in the context of "foreboding and remembrance."

Mime, Siegfried and Fear

Such quotation of non-motivic material is seen on a small scale in the use of the melody originally heard to Wotan's "Nur wer das Furchten nie erfuhr ... " \(^2\) ("Only he who has never experienced fear ... "), which is engineered at the original pitch during Mime's attempt to explain fear to Siegfried ("Das Furchten lernt' ich ... " \(^3\)) and again in the Forging Scene ("Das Furchten zu lernen ... " \(^4\)):

---

1 The use of the Hunding rhythm on this note C in the Act II prelude can perhaps be used to explain the fact that the Walkürenritt theme first appears in the Ring in C minor (W/260) instead of in the B minor in which it was originally conceived and in which it otherwise consistently appears. The B minor Ritt melody comprises one of the very first sketches for Siegfrieds Tod appearing along with the original sketches of the opening of that work now in Washington, and also on a sheet of paper given by Wagner to Robert Radeke in 1851. There exists a further sheet, bearing the melody in a neat copy, and labelled "Altstimmen", written in the alto clef and in B minor, signed and dated "Zürich, 12th November, 1852", with the heading Gesang der Walküren.

2 S/233-4
3 S/265
4 S/380-1
In the midst of Mime's attempt to explain fear, there appears a foreboding of the means by which Siegfried will in fact discover it, in the Motiv of the Magic Sleep¹. This melodic reference to the sleeping Brünnhilde is further expanded by reference to the Fire Music² in which the violins' (and only the violins) momentarily adopt the E major key signature of the close of Die Walküre.

Mime's death is heralded by various musical quotations associated with his relationship with Siegfried: in their final scene together the Motiv associated with the poisoned soup re-appears at its original pitch³; the "complaint" music is recalled (though not in its original F minor); the ironic reappearance of the music of Mime's "Jammernd verlangen Junge ...", whilst Mime abuses Siegfried, brings about a reversion to the tonality with which that theme first appeared⁴; and as Mime's death rapidly approaches, quotations of the Woodbird music remind Siegfried to listen to the hidden meaning in Mime's words.

¹ S/276 – the description (by various commentators) of this shape as a Furcht ("fear") Motiv (despite its earlier appearance in Die Walküre) demonstrates a lack of appreciation of the Ahnung/Erinnerung technique, without reference to which the appearance of the Motiv is, at the least, mystifying.

² S/281

³ S/670, see S/368

⁴ S/685 is at the same pitch as S/83; a further quotation at S/694 is not.
The quotations of more extended sections

There are repeated quotations of six more extended sections of music for the purposes of "foreboding and remembrance."

a) The distinctive combination of the Motive of the spear, sword, of Hagen and the falling octave "Oath" figure which occurs several times in Götterdämmerung was possibly conceived whilst Wagner was working on Siegfried, since it appears in the Einzelskizzen alongside some discarded ideas for the Forging music (labelled Amselschlag):

The combination first appears in the Ring a semitone lower than this, conforming to the prevailing B flat tonality (the sword-Motiv is absent):
This is the moment in which Siegfried swears blood-brotherhood with Gunther, and the passage emphasises, throughout the remainder of the work, the consequences of the swearing of this oath. As Siegfried = Gunther claims Brünnhilde at the close of Act I of Götterdämmerung, the passage reappears at the pitch at which it is found in the sketch; even the melodramatic gesture required for foreboding/remembrance as decreed in Oper und Drama is here present as Siegfried raises Nothung aloft:
Similarly, Siegfried is called upon to indicate his sword ("auf sein Schwert deutend") for the next appearance of the passage, in which the quotation is slightly compressed, though still at its original pitch. The modulation by which this pitch is attained is striking:

The passage appears for the last time (now a semitone higher, the key being determined by the immediately preceding quotation of the blood-brotherhood music) in recalling the moment at the close of Act I: "Nothung ... wahrte der Treue Eid", which statement Brünnhilde then uses to engineer the swearing of the "Helle Wehr" oath with which Siegfried's fate becomes finally sealed:
The cumulative effect of the repeated use of this passage contributes to the sense of inevitable doom in the final drama, and at the same time, its use does have an effect on the tonal structure.

b) The use of sections of music from Wotan's monologue in Die Walküre Act II carry the sense of apprehension further back into the cycle. The first of these derives from the orchestral texture supporting the outburst "O heilige Schmach ...". This texture (used as an expression of helplessness and frustration) returns in Siegfried, adopting the original pitch, upsetting the F major diatonicism:

1 W/348
and it further appears in the Waltraute-Brünnhilde scene in Götterdämmerung to express Waltraute's helplessness before the stubbornness of her sister 1. The key of the quotation is however here a semitone higher, conforming to the key of the scene (F sharp minor). In each case it is the inability of the character in question to alter the course of events (initiated by Fricka's championship of Hunding's cause) which occasions the quotation 2.

1 G/473-4

2 A further quotation connected with Wotan's desperation: "Was ich liebe muss ich verlassen" ("I must forsake that which I love") (W/400-2) returns in Mime's soliloquy: "des Nibelungen Neid ... " (S/152-3). The pitches are different in these instances and the dramatic reason for the quotation (apart from that of simple frustration or the imminent arrival of Wotan in Mime's cave, in which lives the one whom he had forsaken) is none too obvious.
c) A more frequently recurring major quotation from the monologue originates in the text:

"Wenn der Liebe finstrer Feind
zürnend zeugt einen Sohn,
der Sel'gen Ende
sämt dann nicht!"  

This is the combination of the Motive of Walhall (melody), the gold, and the ring (harmony), of which Wagner himself was so proud, quoting it as he does in his essay Über die Anwendung der Musik auf das Drama:  

This figure is treated as a Motiv associated with Erda's prophecy quoted above. Shortly after this first statement, the agent of the downfall of the gods is named as Alberich's son, to whom Wotan bequeathes his power:

---

1 W/413-4
2 GS XIII 292-3
This is a tone higher than the initial statement, and a third appearance of the figure, a few bars later, raises the pitch a further semitone.

The figure thus comes to represent Hagen (unnamed) though no consistent pitch level is established. It is totally absent in Siegfried, but reappears in Götterdämmerung at the moment in which Hagen rejoices in the knowledge that the fulfilment of his mission is at hand: "Ihr dient ihm doch, des Nibelungen Sohn" ("You shall all serve the son of the Nibelung"). The harmonic approach to the quotation this time leaves no doubt as to the importance which Wagner attached to quoting it at the original pitch:

In the following scene, Waltraute's recollection of the Wanderer's return to Walhall with the broken spear, occasions further soundings of the combination, the first two at arbitrary pitch levels (they are only marked mf), and the third at the original pitch, though with "intensified" harmony:

---

1 W/420
2 W/421; 422
3 See Wagner's comment on the varying significance of recollected Motive, p. 55.
4 See Section IV, 2.
The final statement of the passage 1, in the final act of the cycle, is again of "intensified" nature, but at the raised pitch of Wotan's curse: "So nimm meinen Segen ..." 2 instead of the original pitch. There seems to be no conclusion to be drawn as to Wagner's intentions regarding the apparently arbitrary pitching of this passage, though it does appear to approximate to its original pitch level.

d) The music of the coda of the Walküre Wotan-Brünnhilde scene in which Wotan storms away, leaving Brünnhilde alone, reappears following Siegmund's death at the same pitch as before despite a different key signature 3. The dramatic significance of this remembrance is obvious, and at the same time it points forward to the scene between Wotan and Brünnhilde in the next act.

1 G/1030
2 W/418
3 W/605/9 - 608 from W/429/3 - 431; and W/612/3 - 616/1 from W/440/3 - 444/1
e) This foreboding is duly fulfilled in the third act with Wotan's arrival on the Walküren rock. The key of his arrival is again determined by the D minor of the close of Act II, and a quotation of music from that earlier moment dramatically joins the two moments in time, in spite of the intervening scene. This quotation is identical in shape to its previous appearance (though slightly truncated 1). The music reappears yet again in the final scene of Die Walküre, as Wotan remembers his despair in Act II 2. In all cases the orchestration is almost exactly the same, and each refers the listener back to Wotan's decision: "Sieg mund falle ... " in which moment the fate of Siegmund was finally sealed, and from which moment originate all subsequent events in Die Walküre.

f) The final large section of music which is used cumulatively to induce foreboding is based upon the Motiv of Atonement (heard by rising degrees over a pedal bass); it is first heard in the scene of the blood-brotherhood oath in Götterdämmerung Act I:

1 W/814/5 - 817/3 from W/437/3 - 443/4
2 W/928 - 9 (starting on a different inversion of the diminished seventh chord.)
As the drama progresses, this passage comes to be used as a reminder of that oath and of the consequences of breaking it. It is repeated almost at once: "mein Blut verdüren euch den Trank"; here the pitch is identical (pedal E) though the orchestration is different, the Atonement-Motiv passing to the horns — a tone colour which is then adopted for most future appearances. Shortly afterwards, as Gunther and Siegfried depart together, the close succession of the Motive of Enticement, the Walküren and Atonement illustrate musically the success of Hagen's plan. The adoption of the E natural pedal note brings about modulation (the usual second statement of the Motiv is absent here):
It is not until the next act, and the swearing of the "Helle Wehr" oath that this passage returns to reinforce the significance of the two oaths in combination with each other, and to point to the inevitable death of Siegfried as a result. The modulation to attain the pedal E is sudden and dramatic, from A flat minor to A minor ¹:

¹ G/799 – 800/1. 10 bars, see G/324/6 – 331/2
A statement shortly after this is content with an approximation to the original pedal E, adopting an E flat, which hangs over from the preceding music. The use of the passage casts a dark shadow over the preceding C major wedding music, and the telescoping of the E flat and E natural statements into one extended passage in the following Vengeance scene reinforces Hagen's attempt to persuade Gunther of the necessity of Siegfried's atoning for the apparent breaking of the oath. Another E natural statement follows closely after this and is preceded by a sinuous texture (from the revenge-Motiv) which is used to wind the bass down to the E for over an octave by semitone steps. (The pitch of two later statements of this Atonement music in the Vengeance scene on F sharp and G pedal notes are determined by the flow of music past those notes at that particular point, but these are exceptions to the E/E flat rule.)

Finally, the very moment of atonement itself, fulfilling the previous forebodings: "Hagen, was tatetst du?" produces the last statement of this section to have as its bass note E or E flat:

1 G/845-6
2 G/872-3
3 G/881-2
4 G/889-90
5 G/908-10
There remain two later appearances of this music:

Hagen's "Meinem Speer war er gesparrt ..." ("To my spear he was assigned ...") on a pedal G⁰ corresponds dramatically to the only other statement on G, Günther's and Brünnhilde's "Söhn' er die Schmach, die er mir schuf"² ("Let him atone for the shame he brought upon me"); and Hagen's "Der bleiche Held ..."³ is an exact recapitulation of Alberich's original curse: "Kein Froher soll seiner sich freun"⁴, both of these being over an F sharp bass (this last example differs from the others harmonically).

---

1 G/1217-8
2 G/908-10
3 G/1201-2
4 B/565
"Instrumental Drama"

The use of the Atonement music is one of the most imposing examples of the participation of the musical material in the drama itself, supporting, as it does, the sense of menace not always explicitly experienced from the words alone. Only in the musical sections which are completely without text (preludes and interludes) can the music itself be considered to become drama more effectively than this. Such passages of purely instrumental drama do not fall strictly within Wagner's original definition of Ahnung und Erinnerung as they are not associated with any visible gesture or action on stage, but they are worthy of examination in that they do provide examples of a different aspect of the technique, which in this form can also be seen to affect the harmonic structure of the music, whilst being dramatically more subtle and striking than the original conception of the theory, in which foreboding and remembrance were linked directly to gesture and action.

The interaction of Motive (or passages of music already familiar) in the prelude to a scene can, by remembrances, be used to produce foreboding while the curtain is still down. The prelude to Die Walküre Act II introduces the music of elements in the drama to follow, though without resolving the conflict between them. The atmosphere of the prelude to Siegfried Act I is of anticipation rather than of foreboding, since most of its material is new (with the exception of the recapitulation of the gold-piling scene in Rheingold). The prelude to the second act of Siegfried

1 See also pp. 129-31
2 R/527-36 = S/4-8. The scoring is identical except for the absence of woodwind.
does however produce a real sense of foreboding by its recollections of the scene in which Alberich's curse was enunciated; within the F minor context of the Fafner music various elements appear at their accustomed pitch levels, and the climax of this introduction is an extended quotation of music from Rheingold, with identical instrumentation (the voice part being transferred to the bass trumpet). This music had not been heard since that moment in Rheingold, and its combination with the Motive of Fafner, Mime and the curse produces a miniature drama in the orchestra. (The quotation adopts the original pitch from Rheingold despite a different key signature - B minor in Rheingold, F minor and B minor in Siegfried - though the actual music is identical). This instrumental foreboding of Fafner's death is shortly reinforced by the text, and the foreboding is then turned also in the direction of Walhall: "Walhalls Höhen stürm' ich mit Hellas Heer ... " ("I storm the heights of Walhall with the host of hell") at which point the quotation is heard again at the original pitch, though this time emerging from an E minor key signature.

The prelude to Act III of Götterdämmerung, with its answering horn-calls, serves a similar purpose, the tonalities again being dictated by previously established associations. As with the introduction to Act I, this prelude was written at a later stage than the opening of the act itself. Act III was begun on 4th January, 1872, and an extra sheet was later inserted in the Kompositionsskizze carrying the introduction (the original began

1 The quotation lasts 19 bars: S/455/7 - 458/5 (see R/566-8)
2 The clarinets are in B flat instead of A
3 S/493-99
with the Rhinemaidens' "Fraw Sonne" though clearly Wagner intended to add an introduction at a later stage).

The "Fraw Sonne" song was one of the earliest sketches for Götterdämmerung, and exists in many versions in the Einzel-skizzen, always appearing in F major. As is the case with nearly all Motive (and longer passages of music) conceived in advance of the moment when they would be required for the Ring music, the tonality in which the idea first occurred to Wagner was carried into the Kompositionsskizze, and the introduction to the act then composed to correspond to that key. The recollection of the answering horn-calls (now combined with the curse-Motiv, and again using the established tonalities) instrumentally rekindles the feeling foreboding (which was first aroused in the prelude of the third act) in the interlude between the first and second scenes later in the act.

The postlude to an act is also used by Wagner to point forward to fresh actions to come in the next act or drama. This can be seen in the closing scene of Siegfried Act II, where the Tristanesque altered version of the Magic Sleep Motiv (which has come to be associated with the means by which Siegfried will learn fear

\[ \text{[5]} \]

\[ \text{[6/943]} \]

1 See p. 161n.

2 See p. 161n.
returns to its original form (as in Die Walküre) and to its original key (E major) in answer to Siegfried's question: "kann ich erwecken die Braut?" ("Can I awake the bride?"), anticipating the final scene of the following act.

An additional capacity of the music for the prelude (or postlude) to a scene is its ability to view past events in the light of more recent occurrences. Such manipulation produces some of the most imposing examples of purely instrumental "foreboding and remembrance" in the Ring.

The depression of the recollection of Brünnhilde's awakening which opens Götterdämmerung, from E minor/C major to E flat minor/ C flat major (with the same orchestration) could be seen as a combination of tonalities, viewing the moment of earlier exultation (beginning with the E minor triad) in the light of Hagen's machinations (by the use of the E flat minor later to become associated with him). In fact, the choice of E flat minor originates in the sketches for Siegfried's Tod, the opening section of which was set down sometime between 27th July and 12th August, 1850.

1 G/738
2 S/1004-15
3 G/1-5
4 See p. 72
6 On 27th July Wagner wrote to Uhlig that he was about to begin the sketch (WU 45)
7 12th August is the date on the neat copy (in ink) of the first 150 bars of the original sketch to which Ernest Newman had access. It is now in private hands in France, but is reproduced in L'Illustration (11th February, 1933) pp. 166-8, and elsewhere.
In this sketch the Norns' scene is written in E flat minor and in the 6/4 time which is also found in the Götterdämmerung prelude. Apart from a smooth quaver movement the music however bears no resemblance to that of Götterdämmerung:

This sketch runs for about 190 bars, covering the transition into the scene between Brünnhilde and Siegfried and the opening of their conversation as far as the words "Brünnhilde zu erwecken!". The repeat mark in the opening bar of the sketch (see above) is very clear and implies that there was to be an introduction and in the neat copy of the opening, the E flat minor chord in the first bar is tied back into this bar.

1 Wagner began the Siegfrieds Tod sketch in 12/8 time, but after 20 bars changed to the 6/4 metre found in the neat copy.
2 i.e. the copy now in France, see pp. 10, 178n.
In 1851 Wagner recorded the circumstances of these sketches in *Eine Mittheilung an meine Freunde*:

... Im Herbst 1848 dachte ich an die Möglichkeit der Aufführung von "Siegfrieds Tod" gar nicht, sondern sah seine dichterisch technische Vollendung, und einzelne Versuche zur musikalische Ausführung nur für eine innerliche Genugtuung an, die ich, zu jener Zeit des Ekels vor den öffentlichen Angelegenheiten und der Zurückgezogenheit von ihnen, mir selbst verschaffe. 1


(In the Autumn of 1848 I did not even think of the possibility of performing *Siegfrieds Tod*, but merely regarded the technical completion of the poem and isolated attempts at a musical setting as nothing more than private satisfaction, which I allowed myself at that time of disgust with public affairs and of withdrawal from them.

After returning [to Zürich (1850)], I once more deceived myself with the thought of executing the musical setting of *Siegfrieds Tod*. Half despair was still at the root of this decision, for I knew that I should be writing this music only for paper. This unbearable knowledge filled me with disgust for my purpose, and feeling that, in all my efforts so far, I had mostly been so utterly misunderstood, I returned to prose writing, and wrote my book *Oper und Drama.*

1 GS I 160
2 GS I 167
Many years later, in *Mein Leben*, Wagner further recalled the sketching of these pages of *Siegfrieds Tod*:

Noch ermüdet von meiner angestrengten Arbeit an "Oper und Drama", angegriffen von so Manchem, was mein Gemüt kummervoll betraf, setzte ich mich seit langer Zeit zum ersten Male wieder an meinen ... HärteTschen Flügel, um zu versuchen, wie ich mich zur Composition meines schwer wiegenden Heldendramas anlassen würde. Ich entwarf in flüchtiger Skizze die Musik zu dem in jener ersten Fassung nur andeutend ausgeführten Gesange der Nornen; als ich auch Brünnhildes erste Anrede an Siegfried in Gesang übersetzte, entsank mir aber bald aller Muth, da ich nicht umhin konnte mich zu fragen, welche Sängerin im nächsten Jahre diese weibliche Heldengestalt in das Leben rufen sollte. 2

(Still weary from my strenuous labour on Oper und Drama, and worried by many things which had a depressing effect on my spirits, I seated myself for the first time for many months at my ... HärteTs grand piano to see whether I could set myself to composing the music for my weighty drama. In rapid outline I sketched the music for the song of the Norns, which in this first draft was only roughly suggested. 3 But when I attempted to turn Brünnhilde's first address to Siegfried into song my courage failed me completely, for I could not help asking myself which singer would be able to bring this heroic female figure to life next year.)

In *Mein Leben* Wagner places the *Siegfrieds Tod* sketches after the completion of *Oper und Drama* (which was not finished until 1854 ), whereas, in the earlier *Eine Mittheilung an meine Freunde* he had said that the writing of *Oper und Drama* was the

1 By the standards of the *Ring* sketches, the *Siegfrieds Tod* sketch is in fact very complete in texture.

2 ML II 551-2

3 See note 1
result of his disillusionment with the Siegfrieds Tod project. R. Bailey suggests ¹ that in Mein Leben Wagner deliberately confused the chronology in order to avoid the embarrassment of dictating the intimate details of the Jessie Laussot affair to Cosima. It seems certain that Oper und Drama did represent an attempt to grapple with the problems which Wagner encountered with the Siegfrieds Tod material.²

Although, as recounted in Mein Leben, Wagner quickly realised that the time was not right for Siegfrieds Tod, certain elements of the material already conceived for it found their way into the Ring. The spear-Motiv appears in the sketch (though merely as a bass line), and the E flat minor tonality of the Siegfrieds Tod Norns' scene clearly produced an atmosphere which Wagner wished to retain. Similarly, the E flat major used for the Siegfried - Brünnhilde scene in the Götterdämmerung Vorspiel is prefigured in the Siegfrieds Tod sketch where it appears after about a hundred bars as the key of the transition from the Norns' scene (though the following fragment between Brünnhilde and Siegfried is placed in A flat). Although R. Bailey is of the opinion ³ that by the time he came to write Götterdämmerung Wagner was no longer in possession of the Siegfrieds Tod sketches, some of the melodic lines in the Götter- dämmerung Vorspiel bear a slight resemblance to the lines in those sketches.

² For further discussion on the dating of these sketches see R. Bailey, Op. Cit.; C. von Westernhagen, Vom Hollander zum Parsifal; E. Newman, Life of Wagner; and Wagner's letters of 1850–51 to Liszt (WL I 70), F. Heine (WU 388), W. Fischer (WU 283), Liszt (WL I 115), E. Avenarius (Familienbriefe von Richard Wagner p.173), and Billow (WA 259). See also ML II 552.
When Wagner came, in October 1869, to begin *Götterdämmerung*, he began not with the orchestral introduction, but with the first words of the Norns' scene 1. The introduction was added to the *Kompositionsskizze* three months later 2 and the tonality of this was dictated by the scene already composed. The form of this introduction is of the music of Brünnhilde's awakening but with the Rhine music now replacing the string passages between the horn/woodwind chords 3. This Rhine music provides the first bar of the *Kompositionsskizze* 4 and the use of the minor of the key in which the tetralogy had begun could have been an additional factor in the selection of the E flat minor tonality, thus drawing together tonally the opening of the cycle, the awakening of Brünnhilde, and the prophecy of doom about to be delivered by the Norns.

The music of Brünnhilde's awakening is again heard in the transition into the Waltraute scene where the C major Weltbegrüßungsthema 5 is heard against the rhythm of the Vernichtungsortmotiv; and the adoption here of the original tonality of the "Idyll" music as it merges into the Potion-Motiv (a semitone lower than usual) produces an effect harmonically eerie, casting a dark foreboding over the preceding bright music.

1 Actually G/7/l. The sketch is dated 2nd October, 1869.
2 Dated 9th January, 1870.
3 Had the transposition of this passage been much more than a semitone there would have been an additional problem in reproducing the previous orchestral sonority.
4 i.e., G/7/l
5 G/373
But most imposing of all the examples of the use of Ahnung und Erinnerung which result in predetermination of the harmonic direction of the music, is the concluding scene of Götterdämmerung Act I. The arrival of Siegfried-Gunther through the fire takes place in F major, paralleling Siegfried's original journey through the fire in Siegfried Act III. This F major leads directly into the Potion-and Tarnhelm-Motive which appear at their customary pitches while the F from the preceding music continues underneath. Here Brünnhilde's remembrance of Siegfried's earlier arrival on the rock is cruelly shattered by the foreboding produced by the Tarnhelm and Potion music, and these elements in turn lead into the Gibichungen theme (in its established B minor) which then modulates in a tortured manner back into G sharp minor for the reappearance of the Tarnhelm triad. The sequence is then repeated:

1 The use of the F major horn-call across the Fire Music results in the transposition of the original version of this music (from the end of Die Walküre where it appeared in E major) up a semitone.

2 S/940
It is these Motive (at their original pitches ¹) which dominate the whole of the following scene, and which conclude the act:

It can thus be seen that the decision to involve the orchestra in the drama, by using its resources to induce foreboding, by reference to remembrances of Motive or of longer passages of music associated with earlier events (complete with the tonality used earlier), frequently results in harmonic displacement which had not been determined by purely musical 'symphonic' considerations.

¹ There are two exceptions: the Potion (G/505) a semitone lower to fit with the B minor Gibichungen music, and a semitone higher (G/515, presumably to fit the harmonic flow, see p.278)
The possibility that such sections and Motive were introduced merely because the key associated with them had been achieved by some musical progression must be considered, but the dramatic significance attached to the elements utilised to induce foreboding, and the frequent abruptness of the modulations involved, rule out such an explanation in the great majority of cases.
IV. CHROMATICISM, MOTIV-ADAPTATION AND -COMBINATION
1. THE DRAMATIC SIGNIFICANCES OF DIATONICISM & CHROMATICISM

Having established the existence of a relationship between Motive and tonality, and the way in which such relationships are used in the service of the drama, it becomes necessary to examine methods by which these harmonic relationships (of varying degrees of permanence) are varied, and the reason for such variation. The alteration of motivic shape or of the harmonic shape of a musical section is almost always the result of increased chromaticism, resulting in an emotional intensification of the Motiv or music in question. Such intensification may be for dramatic reasons or for reasons independent of the drama, being perhaps the result of musical flow or of the necessity to reach a certain key by a certain point. The origin of the extraordinary modulation:

\[G/503/10\]

Can be traced to the necessity to modulate from B minor/D major to G sharp minor on account of the dramatic importance attached to the Motive demanding these tonalities. Many instances of similar unexpected chromaticism cannot be accounted for by modulatory necessity, nor by any purely musical consideration, and must be explained by reference to the progress of the drama itself.

1 See pp. 184-5
The most immediately obvious conclusion to be drawn is simply that, in general terms, the more evil a character or deed, the more chromatic will be the music associated with it. This hypothesis can be extended to account for the increasing chromaticism applied, throughout the progress of the drama, to an idea which was originally very diatonic. In both Tristan and Meistersinger the conflict between the diatonic and chromatic elements in the music (in Tristan diatonic/chromatic = day/night with all its Schopenhauarian connotations, and in Meistersinger Walther's chromatic music is contrasted with the diatonic harmony of the reactionary masters) is an essential factor in the drama, and the same conflict can be seen to a lesser extent in Tannhäuser (chromatic element - Venus), in Lohengrin (chromatic element - Ortrud), in Der fliegende Holländer (chromatic element - the Dutchman) and in Parsifal (main chromatic element - Klingsor).

Rheingold begins with a shape that is even less than diatonic - it is a sounding of the natural harmonic series (with the out of tune harmonics omitted ¹), and the innocence of the Rhinemaidens is portrayed by a pentatonic tune:

¹ The E flat Rhine music is absent in the Kompositionsskizze. There is merely the indication 6/8 with three flats and a vague quaver figuration, over which stands the instruction: "Voraus: langsame Vorbereitungen auf das Rheingoldmotiv" ("From here on: slow preparation for the Rheingoldmotiv" (i.e. the tune of the Rhinemaidens' song)). A semiquaver figuration, roughly indicated, and different from that ultimately adopted (R/8/8, cellos), contains chromatic passing notes, but is only indicated for a few bars. On February 7th, 1854, (a few weeks after completing the Rheingold Kompositionsskizze) Wagner wrote to Liszt: "Jetzt führe ich das "Rheingold" sogleich in Partitur aus, mit der Instrumentation; ich konnte keine Weise finden, das Vorspiel (die Rheines-Tiefe) als Skizze deutlich aufzuschreiben; so verfiel ich sogleich auf die volle Partitur" (WL II 10) ("I am now executing the Rheingold in full score. I could find no method of clearly indicating the music of the prelude (the depths of the Rhine) in a sketch, so I proceeded at once to the full score").
This pentatonicism is shortly expanded to simple diatonicism, but with a marked preference for melodic shapes based on a broken chord:

and when chromatic notes appear for the first time they are merely as aids to modulation to the closest of keys:
The arrival of Alberich on the scene however has a marked effect on this innocent diatonicism. His entrance is heralded by the first dissonance (acciacature apart) in the cycle:

and the arrival of the music in G minor for Alberich's first utterance is achieved without actual modulation. (This transition to G minor is absent in the Kompositionsskizze. There is merely the instruction: - 16 - (meaning 16 bars of similar figuration) and then the beginning of the G minor music ¹.)

Chromatic notes (as appoggiature) now appear in the figuration for the first time and the first chromatic chord (a diminished seventh) appears almost at once ², the music of the

¹ i.e. R/37-40 are not indicated
² A previous diminished seventh (R/36) had been decidedly in the key of G minor, and not chromatic in nature.
Rhinemaidens themselves being for the first time other than diatonic:

The diatonic innocence of the Rhinemaidens is thus at once corrupted by the arrival of Alberich, who arouses in them feelings of loathing, and these emotions increase in intensity as the scene proceeds.

In 1879 Wagner himself commented:

Es war mir ... in der Instrumental-einleitung zu dem "Rheingold" sogar unmöglich, den Grundton zu verlassen, eben weil ich keinen Grund dazu hatte, ihn zu verändern; ein grosser Teil der nicht unbewegten darauf folgenden Szene der Rheintöchter mit Alberich durfte durch Herbeiziehung nur der allernächst verwandten Tonarten ausgeführt werden, da das Leidenschaftliche hier erst noch in seiner primitiven Nativität sich ausspricht. Dagegen leugne ich nicht, dass ich dem ersten Auftritte der Donna Anna, in höchster Leidenschaft den frevelhaften Verführer Don Juan festhaltend, allerdings bereits ein stärkeres Kolorit gegeben haben würde, als Mozart
nach der Konvention des Opernstiles und seiner, erst durch ihn bereicherten Ausdrucksmittel, es hier für angemessen hielt. 1

(In the instrumental introduction to Rheingold ... it was impossible for me to depart from the fundamental note, simply because I had no reason to change it; a great part of the not unanimated scene (which follows) between the Rhinemaidens and Alberich could be executed by introducing only the most nearly related tonalities, since the passionate element expressed itself here only in its most primitive simplicity. On the other hand, I do not deny that I should have given to the first entry of Donna Anna – denouncing the shameless seducer Don Juan in the height of passion – a stronger colouring than Mozart held appropriate to the conventions of the operatic style and to those means of expression he himself was the first to enrich.)

This rationalisation of the process of arriving at the harmonic structure of the first scene of Rheingold was written a quarter of a century after the work had been completed. The account of the conception of the opening of the tetralogy, and of its static harmony, recorded in Mein Leben (privately printed in 1870) placed this process in a more inspirational light:

Am Nachmittage heimkehrend, streckte ich mich todmüde auf ein hartes Ruhebett aus, um die lang erschriebe Stunde des Schlafes zu erwarten. Sie erschien nicht; dafür versank ich in eine Art von somnambulem Zustand, in welchem ich plötzlich die Empfindung, als ob ich in ein stark fließendes Wasser versank, erhielt. Das Rauschen desselben stellte sich mir bald im musikalischen Klange des Es-dur-Akkordes dar, welcher unaufhaltsam in figurirter Brechnung dahin wogte; diese Brechnungen zeigten sich als melodische Figurationen von zunehmender Bewegung,

1 GS XIII 292. Wagner did in fact compose a new introduction to Donna Anna's aria for a performance of Don Giovanni in Zürich in 1851. The score of this is lost however, presumed destroyed in the fire which demolished the theatre in 1890. (In the quotation above, Wagner refers not to this aria however, but to Donna Anna's very first entry: "Non sperar, se non m'uccidi ...")

(Returning in the afternoon, I stretched myself, totally exhausted, on a hard couch to await the long desired hour of sleep. It did not come; but I fell into a kind of somnolent state, in which I suddenly felt as though I were sinking in swiftly flowing water. The sound of the water formed itself in my brain into a musical sound: the chord of E flat major, which continually surged in figurations which seemed to be melodic passages of increasing motion; yet the pure triad of E flat major never changed, but seemed by its continuance to impart infinite significance to the element in which I was sinking. I awoke in sudden terror from my doze, feeling as though the waves were sweeping far above my head. I at once recognised that the orchestral prelude to the Rheingold, which must have long lain latent within me without my being able to locate it precisely, had at last been revealed to me and I quickly realised also how things lay with me: the stream of life was to flow to me, not from the outside, but from within myself.)

Wagner wrote to Liszt on 12th September, 1853, telling him of the visit to Spezia upon which this dream occurred, but did not mention the music of Rheingold at all. In fact, the Kompositions-skizze was not begun until the 1st November, which left two months in which Wagner could have contemplated the details of his dream.

1 ML II 591-2
2 WL I 273-5
The Kompositionsskizze version of the prelude does in fact contain more movement than the final version.

In the latter half of the scene between Alberich and the Rhinemaidens, Wagner did not however hesitate to add chromatic notes, in particular, semitone appoggiature, and this preoccupation with the interval of the semitone results in a passage of almost atonal character as Alberich begins to chase the Rhinemaidens:

This moment occasions the work's first change of key-signature and within two bars all twelve chromatic notes are sounded. In this moment all pretence of diatonic innocence is abandoned in the music of Alberich, though the Rhinemaidens still basically retain

1 See p. 189n.
2 See also p. 275
their diatonic tunes (in spite of augmented and diminished triads in the accompaniment). Alberich's agonised falling semitone figure (almost a parallel of Hagen's "Hoi-Hoi") culminates in the chromatically descending chords:

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{and the following Rhinemaidens' "Walala" song, strongly diatonic in character, serves to throw into further relief Alberich's following tortured utterances. The transition into the 'gold' music, in spite of the use of changing key signatures, appears to be without tonality:}
\end{align*}
\]
The return to the broken chord figuration as the gold is illuminated represents only a temporary respite: another symbol of purity for Alberich to ravish, and the very mention of the power which the gold contains seduces the Rhinemaidens from the confined diatonic melodies which have been theirs hitherto:

Alberich's approach to the gold is musically paralleled by increasing chromaticism in the figuration, climaxing in the chord of the seventh (originating in the ring-Motiv) which assumes great importance in Götterdämmerung (in fact the "Tristan chord", differently spaced):
It is through this chord that the ring-Motiv merges imperceptibly into the Walhall-Motiv.

1 In the Kompositionsskizze this passage is not worked out. Over the Renunciation-Motiv (R/179) is written "Liebesfluch - dann Welterbes - endlich Walhall", and the sketch proceeds at once to the D flat Walhall music.
The melodic closeness of identity of the Motive of Walhall and the ring leaves no doubt as to the similarity of their dramatic significance. In the context of what Walhall represents (world domination), rather than the fortress itself, it becomes more difficult to differentiate between the two Motive as the cycle progresses.

The second scene of Rheingold is built upon a similar disintegration of diatonicism, the apparent diatonic solidity of the Walhall music being gradually undermined by the chromatic scheming of Loge (and to some extent, Fafner) and by the music of the ring, seriously upsetting the diatonic stability of both Wotan and Fasolt. Fricka's initial arioso rapidly upsets the D flat stability, and at the first mention of Loge the (then) prevailing D major tonality is suddenly clouded by a chromatic melodic line derived from Loge's music:

![Musical notation](image)

---

1 e.g. R/721
The music of the two giants exhibits the same conflict. The straightforwardness of Fasolt is counteracted by the chromatic cunning of Fafner, whose affinity with Loge in this matter is musically expressed:

\[ \text{Ge-hweister Bruder, markst du Trost nun Be-hung?} \]

In the same way as Alberich's vocal lines are fragmented and angular in comparison with the Rhinemaidens, and Loge's in comparison with Wotan's, so is the music of Fafner when compared with the span of melody (unusual in Rheingold) allotted to the music of Fasolt:

\[ \text{Neue Weid, that sonst unster Niblung} \]

Loge's actual arrival (to appropriate harmonically mobile music) leads to the recounting of the loss of the gold in the light of the power it can command. The chromatic alteration of the "Rheingold" song here is one of the first examples in the Ring of the "intensification" of the harmony of a Motiv occasioned by dramatic events. This in turn leads to the Motiv of Freia being adapted to a chromatic form, musically representing the situation in which she now finds herself:

---

1 See pp. 203-11

2 See also Fricka's music at R/297 in which this Motiv is further chromatically altered.
This process of the addition of chromatic elements can be followed through the scene until the descent into Nibelheim, and apparently total chromaticism:

In the opening two scenes of the cycle it is thus possible to see the basis of a technique of applying the dramatic conflicts between characters and events to the harmonic drama, a technique which can be superimposed upon the immediate musical
interplay between Motive of established tonalities, and upon the significance of remembrances by chromatic alteration of the remembered music in the light of dramatic events. A similar effect can also be seen in short-term reminiscence, as in Mime's "Sorglose Schmiede ... ", the diatonicism of which is immediately destroyed when the narration reaches the point of Alberich's domination:

In Götterdämmerung, Hagen's chromatic music has a similar effect on the naïve diatonicism of the Gibichungen.
2. THE TECHNIQUE OF HARMONIC/EMOTIONAL "INTENSIFICATION"

OF MOTIVE

Well over a dozen Motive are subjected to this treatment and they are almost invariably those which in their original appearances were conspicuous by their straightforwardness and diatonicism. Of these, the Rhinemaidens' song "Rheingold!":

\[
\text{[R/113]}
\]

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{Rhein - gold! Rhein - gold!}
\end{align*}
\]

Can be traced through the cycle in more than thirty variations of the simple diatonic idea, illustrating musically the corruption caused by the originally harmless gold, through the first stirrings of Alberich's dreams of world domination by use of its power, to its part in the destruction of the whole order of life at the end of Götterdämmerung. In the course of this development it becomes indistinguishable from the Motiv associated with Mime's misery and sometimes regarded as a separate "Weh" ("woe") Motiv:

\[
\text{[R/394/2]}
\]
and from the extension of this, sometimes called the Motiv of Servitude:


It has an obvious affinity with Hagen's "Hoi-Ho!" call.

In the above adaptations the melodic element of the falling tone is reduced to a falling semitone, but this alteration cannot be seen as justification for regarding the semitone version as another Motiv altogether. Loge's narration of the theft of the gold contains the chromatically intensified version of the original:


though here the falling note is still a tone. Four pages later the Motiv reappears, but the falling interval is now a semitone. In the former of these two moments the more pungent chord beneath the melodic A – G characterises the distress expressed in the words, and in the latter the alteration of the melodic A – G to A – G sharp intensifies
this yet further, whilst directly linking the semitone version with the original. It is thus appropriate to view all the semitone versions (with the possible exception of the "Hoi-Hoi") as further developments and intensifications of this Motiv, the more so since even dramatic contexts not directly associated with the gold itself are clearly associated with the direct result of its loss to the Rhinemaidens and with its transformation into the symbol of world domination. In its last appearance in Rheingold, in the music of the Rhinemaidens themselves, the "Rheingold!" figure is heavily altered in layout, the falling octave greatly increasing the feeling of strangeness:

```
\[R/134/1\]
\[R/447/12\]
```

Whilst the use of such chromatic variations of the Motiv emphasises the Rhinemaidens' desolation, in Nibelheim the Motiv has already been adapted to more sinister forms:
The use of this semitone version of the Motiv makes the Motiv modulatory in character, whereas originally it was harmonically static. Even the early variations of it were merely chromatic decoration of a basically diatonic idea; but as soon as the Motiv becomes involved with the forces of darkness the increased chromaticism (especially by the addition of the moving bass instead of a pedal note) results in the Motiv becoming an agent of modulation. This can be seen more and more as the cycle progresses, and especially in Götterdämmerung (where the Motiv takes on the same relationship to the schemes of Hagen as it did to those of Alberich in Rheingold), from the adaptation placing the dominant seventh in the bass, to the use of the first chord alone, "intensified" and without resolution.

By the time this latter occurs the chromatically altered versions of the original dominant ninth chord and resolution:

\[ R/112/1 \]

\[ G/512/2 \]

\[ G/505/3 \]

have become so familiar that the sounding of the first chord by

1. e.g. R/280, 284
itself is sufficient to convey the impression of the complete (intensified) Motiv. It can thus be used as a pivot chord to produce one of the most strikingly dramatic modulatory twists in the Ring:

\[ \text{[G(55)]} \]

That Wagner himself was aware of the possibilities opened up by the application of the drama to the harmonic language of the music, can be seen in his article Über die Anwendung der Musik auf das Drama (published in the Bayreuther Blätter in 1879, three years after the first complete production of the Ring cycle). Of this "Rheingold!" Motiv he wrote:

Es dürfte dieses in mannigfaltig wechselndem Zusammenhang mit fast jedem andern Motive der weithin sich erstreckenden Bewegung des Dramas wieder auftauchende, ungemein einfache Thema durch alle die Veränderungen hin zu verfolgen sein, die es durch den verschiedenartigen Charakter seiner Wiederaufrufung erhält, um zu ersehen, welche Art von Variationen das Drama zu bilden imstande ist, und wie vollständig der Charakter dieser Variationen sich von dem jener figurativen, rhythmischen und harmonischen Veränderungen eines Themas unterscheidet, welche in unmittelbarer Aufeinanderfolge von unseren Meistern zu wechselvollen Bildern von oft berauschender kaleidoskopischer Wirkung aufgereiht wurden. Diese Wirkung war sofort durch Störung der klassischen Form des
Variationensatzes aufgehoben, sobald fremde, vom Thema abliegende Motive hineinverflochten wurden, womit etwas dem dramatischen Entwicklungs- 
gange Ähnliches der Gestaltung des Satzes sich bemächtigte und die Reinheit, sagen wir: Ansicht-
verständlichkeit des Tonstückes trübte. Nicht aber das bloße kontrapunktische Spiel, noch die
phantasiereischste Figurations- oder erfinderischste Harmonisationskunst konnte, ja durfte, ein Thema,
indem es gerade immer wieder erkenntlich bleibt, so charakteristisch umbilden und mit so durchaus
mannigfaltigem, gänzlich verändertem Ausdrucke vorführen, als wie es der wahren dramatischen
Kunst ganz natürlich ist. Und hierüber dürfte
eben eine genauere Betrachtung der Wiedererscheinungen
jenes angezogenen einfachen Motives der "Rheintöchter"
einen recht einsichtlichen Aufschluss geben, sobald
es durch alle Wechsel der Leidenschaften, in welchem
sich das ganze viertelige Drama bewegt, bis zu
Hagens Wachtgesang im ersten Akte der "Götterdämmerung"
 hin verfolgt wird, woselbst es sich dann in einer
Gestalt zeigt, die es allerdings als Thema eines
Symphoniesatzes - mir wenigstens - ganz undenklich
erscheinen lässt. 1

(One would have to follow this uncommonly simple theme (recurring in widely varying alli-
ance with almost every other Motiv in the drama's widespread movement) through all the changes which it receives from the diverse nature of its re-
appearances, to see what type of variations the drama is capable of engendering; and how completely the character of these variations differ from those based on digressions of harmony, rhythm or figuration which our masters ranged in immediate succession to construct pictures of an often intoxicatingly kaleidoscopic effect. This effect was destroyed at once, and with it the classic form of variation as soon as motifs foreign to the theme were woven into it - a process in which something similar to a dramatic development took over the shaping of the material, thus destroying the purity and integrity of the piece. But neither the mere play of counterpoint, nor the most inventive harmonisation nor imaginative arts of figuration could, or indeed ought to, transform a theme so radically and present it in such varied and entirely altered modes as is natural in true dramatic art. Nothing could afford plainer proof of this than the tracing of the simple Motiv of the Rhinemaidens' song through all the changing passions of the four-part

1 GS XIII 294-5
drama right through to Hagen's Wachtgesang in the first act of Götterdämmerung, where it takes on a form which (to me at least) makes it inconceivable as the theme of a symphonic movement.)

Wagner clearly regarded his treatment of the "Rheingold!" theme as exemplary in this context. The variation of the Motiv in Hagen's Wachtgesang to which he refers is the version:

Undoubtedly, the most spectacular examples of the intensification of any Motiv are to be seen in the progress of this theme through the cycle, though the examples of its having effect on the harmonic direction of the music are limited to its more extreme adaptations: often as an appogiatured chord; or in rising sequences over a pedal bass (thereby introducing new relationships between the chords themselves and the bass note) - here removing the music from A minor to F minor:
or by overlapping use to produce a modulation from E flat minor to D minor:

These chords gradually form the new 'murder' Motiv by the extension of the melody and alteration of the accustomed resolution:

The murder of Siegfried is thus seen to be an inevitable outcome of the gradual change in the gold's significance: from plaything to the servant of an evil imagination.

In the midst of such intensification of the Motiv, the appearance of the original simple version can be used to transport the listener back to the original state of innocence. This possibility is utilised as Siegfried emerges from Fafner's cave with the ring. Wagner was in fact quite proud of this moment, writing of it in 1869 to Ludwig:
Während er [Siegfried] hervortritt, hört man unheimlich ... das Motiv des Ringes durch die Begleitung sich winden: jetzt geht es, mit höchster, geisterhafter Weichheit, in das Thema der Rheintöchter, am Schlusse des Rheingoldes — über "Rheingold, reines Gold, Ach! leuchtetest du noch in der Tiefe". Dieses lassen jetzt zu dem leisen Zittern der Saiteninstrumente, sechs Hörner, wie aus einer fernen Natur-Traumwelt her, vernehmen. 1

(As he [Siegfried] steps out [of Fafner's cave] the Motiv of the ring can be heard sinisterly winding its way through the accompaniment. The music then merges with ethereal softness into the theme of the Rhinemaidens' song from the end of Rheingold where they sing "Rhine-gold, purest gold, Ah! would that you still shone in the depths". Over a soft tremolo on the strings, six horns sound this as if from a distant nature-dreamworld.)

The modulation thereby occasioned is unexpected but not laboured:

The application of harmonic "intensification" is not confined to Motive of a basically chordal nature, being equally applicable to the intervallic structure of purely melodic Motive.

That of the Walsungenweh undergoes many alterations in the course of the cycle, from the original diatonic:

1 König Ludwig und Richard Wagner: Briefwechsel. II 257 (letter of 23rd February, 1869)
to the chromatically altered version in which Mime recounts Sieglinde's death:

The Motiv goes through several further metamorphoses in keeping with the fate of the Wälsungen, particularly with regard to Siegfried himself, in connection with whom the following modulatory versions are introduced:
In the last of these (from the Trauermusik) the interval of the rising 6th becomes a 7th, a parallel of the adaptation of the rising 6th of the Siegfried-Motiv, which became a 7th as Siegfried prepared to pass through the fire to awaken Brünnhilde. Some of the adaptations of the Wälsungenwehthema merely follow an already conceived harmonic progression in which the Motiv is more figuration than the main element, but in many, and in the examples quoted above in particular, it is the new direction taken by the melody in its attempt to express more fully the situation in the drama, which is responsible for the harmonic movement of the music.

The technique is applied to further melodic Motive, though it is clear that in many cases Motive have had their shape adapted to fit the already existing harmony. This is the case with many appearances of the sword-Motiv where it is used to fill in texture. Here the last note has been altered to fit the new chord:

1 S/936/1-2
2 See for example S/990
In the case of the example above, the Motiv is in fact absent altogether in the Kompositionsskizze, where only the vocal line and harmony are indicated. The sword-Motiv was added only to match the mention of Nothung in the text when the Orchesterskizze was made. By contrast, the major/minor version of the Motiv:

serves a clear dramatic purpose, underlining Siegfried's supposed deceit, centred around the disputed contribution of Nothung in the honouring of Siegfried's oath to Gunther, and occasioning in the process an instantaneous modulation from C major to A flat. The passage clearly caused Wagner some trouble, for there are several versions of it in the Einzelskizzen, but in the Kompositionsskizze it appears clearly 1.

The other Motiv most frequently subjected to this treatment is a chordal one; that of Walhall, the diatonic and rhythmic stability of which is reduced as the influence of the ring increases. In the Norns' scene the fall of Walhall from its position of authority is seen by the adaptation:

1 In the Kompositionsskizze there is no change of key-signature at this point.
which begins in the minor and then goes further astray. Here the Motiv is not in its original key, and it is not possible to say whether it is the altered Motiv which determines the harmonic direction to be taken, or whether it was the Motiv which was adapted in order to modulate from the E flat minor triad to the Norns' chord. Walhall's disintegration is further seen during Waltraute's account of the situation there:

and in Alberich's outbursts in Hagen's dream scene in which he dismisses Wotan as a factor of any importance any longer
the Motiv has been altered almost beyond recognition.

This was of course no unconscious compositional device; just as Wagner thought his adaptations of the "Rheingold!" theme worthy of mention, he commented upon the metamorphosis of the Walhall-Motiv. He considered that the great combination of the Motive of the gold and of Walhall originating in Wotan's monologue in Die Walküre ¹ was a calculated dramatic device which would have been totally out of place in an operatic overture:

¹ W/414
² At these points Wagner quotes the Motiv in question.
³ GS.XIII 293-4
In the course of the drama the simple nature-Motiv of the gold (first heard at the earliest gleam of the shining Rhine-gold) and the no less simple Motiv of the gods' fortress Walhall (originally heard as the castle was seen shining in the dawn) had undergone mutations in the closest sympathy with the rising passions of the plot. By means of intensifications \([\text{strange yet derivative adaptations}}\) of the harmony, I could present them knit together in such a way that (more than through Wotan's words) this single musical figure would give to us a picture of the terrible desolation in the soul of the suffering god.)

Being written in 1879, this represents a retrospective view of the compositional process of the Ring. There exists also however a passage written in 1852, the year of the completion of the Ring poem, and the year prior to that in which Wagner began the music of Rheingold, in which he had explained his approach to the construction of his earlier works. Here he referred to his manner of treating thematic material in order that it should reflect and complement the drama on stage:


1 GS I 150-1 (Wagner's italics)
I by no means set out on the principle of the theoretical innovator, to destroy the prevailing operatic forms of Aria, Duet etc; but the omission of these forms followed naturally from the very nature of the dramatic material, for I was exclusively concerned with finding the means of expression required to portray this material in a way intelligible to the emotions. An involuntary knowledge of the existence of those forms still influenced me so much in my Fliegende Holländer that any attentive reader of the score will recognise how often this knowledge governed the arrangement of my scenes. Only gradually in Tannhäuser, and yet more decisively in Lohengrin (as I gained more insight into the nature of the material and the means necessary for its presentation) did I extricate myself from these formal influences and more and more decidedly shape the musical structure according to the requirements and peculiarities of the dramatic material itself and of the situations arising from that drama. This procedure, dictated by the nature of the poetic subject, exercised a quite specific influence on the texture of my music as regards the characteristic combination and ramification of my thematic motives.)

The importance of this passage from Oper und Drama is two-fold: it acknowledges that the "peculiarities of the dramatic situation" directly influenced the structure of the music, and that the "nature of the poetic subject" influenced both the adaptation of Motive and their combination. The passage further sees in Wagner's early works a process of development, which can be assumed to continue into the music of the Ring. The use of Motiv-combination as a means of musical structure is also mentioned at other points in Wagner's writing, and its use must therefore be examined in order to establish whether such manipulation of Motive, "dictated by the nature of the poetic subject", had any effect on harmonic structure.
3. **MOTIV-COMBINATION**

In the works prior to the Ring any combinations of Motive are rare and of a fairly simple nature, and though they serve to illustrate a conflict between two characters or forces, the combination is not made the instrument of harmonic movement, the Motive being adapted as necessary so that they fit with one another:

![Musical notation](image)

Indeed, in the later works (other than the Ring) Motiv-combination is equally unusual; the gleeful combination of themes of various elements in the prelude to *Die Meistersinger* (masters, apprentices, prize-song) reflects the situation in which Walther will find himself, but one must suspect that the combination is there more because Wagner discovered that the themes actually fitted together so beautifully rather than for dramatic reasons, even if, as Curt Sachs observes,

The simultaneous sounding of two or more Motive is however used very extensively in the Ring to express a conflict (or coincidence) of two ideas, aspirations or emotions in the mind of one or more characters. It is a direct function of the unconscious emotional drama proceeding within the characters themselves, and the manner and degree to which one Motiv influences another in such combination usually results in harmonic alteration of one or the other Motive with an effect similar to that in which the "intensification" technique is used to increase emotional impact.

As Wagner acknowledged in the passage quoted above, such combination can be observed in the earlier works, though in an unsophisticated manner when compared with the grand dramatic conflict expressed in music by the grand combination of Motive of which Wagner himself was so proud ¹.

¹ Quoted in GS XIII 293
Early in Rheingold appear two examples of Motiv-combination which illustrate two types of dramatic amalgamation: first, the sounding of the gold-Motiv in the harmony of a diminished seventh (at this stage in the drama all chromatic sounds tend to have associations with the power of the ring) – that is, one Motiv sounded in the harmony of another:

and second, the extreme harmonic clash (F sharp, G, A, B flat sounded simultaneously) produced by the combination of the Motive of the apples and of the gold, musically expressing the conflict in Fasolt's mind between his desire for Freia and his greed for the gold and its power. In this case the amalgamation consists of the sounding of two Motive simultaneously, each retaining its own harmonic essentials:
Understandably, it is not until a large number of motivic elements have been established that any great degree of combination can be effected. In Rheingold this largely takes the form of alteration of one Motiv to fit with another, suggesting in dramatic terms which is the dominant Motiv (that being the one which exerts its influence on the other, itself remaining unchanged). In the following example the Motive of Freia and of the "Rheingold!" song are both chromatically altered to fit with one another while the gold-Motiv remains unchanged. The addition of descending chords, which produce considerable dissonances against the gold-Motiv, add to the expression of the conflict between Freia and the gold in Fasolt's mind:
In *Die Walküre* the frequency with which Motiv-combination occurs drops considerably, in line with the fact that most of the music is based on material generated within that work. Such combinations as do here appear (with the exception of the example quoted earlier and by Wagner himself \(^1\)) are almost exclusively the sounding of one melodic Motiv against another which is of basically textural nature:

\(^1\) i.e. W/414 See pp.221-2
In such a combination, any modulation is determined by the dominant Motiv, the other adjusting to fit with it:

In contrast, Siegfried abounds in Motiv-combination, from the very first pages. In such a passage as:
it is difficult to decide which **Motiv** is determining the harmonic direction, as it appears that the 'brooding' **Motiv** is being used to introduce a chromatic element to the tuba melody.

In such moments, reference to the **Kompositionsskizze** often reveals that only one **Motiv** was originally set down, the textural **Motiv** being added later. This is the case in the two examples from **Die Walküre** quoted above; and in the **Siegfried** example above it is evident, by reference to the **Einzelskizzen**, that it was in fact the **Wurm** theme which came first. In the case of the multiple combination (**Ritt**-, spear-, **Wanderer**-, Erda-, **Götterdämmerungmotive**) which open **Siegfried** Act III the **Kompositionsskizze** contains only the **Wanderer** chords (in semibreves) for considerable stretches; most of the other elements were not added until the **Orchesterskizze**.

A version of the apparently bi-tonal moment of **Fafner**'s appearance in answer to **Siegfried**'s horn-call is to be found upon a sheet in the **Einzelskizzen** dated 1st May, 1857. **Siegfried** Act II was not begun until the 22nd of that month, though it does not necessarily follow that the **Siegfried** fragment (on a sheet containing **Tristan** sketches to which the date more probably refers) was actually penned before that act was begun. In this sketch however the combination is based on the version of the **Wurm-Motiv** found in **Rheingold**, which was copied note for note, at the same pitch, and onto which the horn-call was then grafted:

---

1 This is the sheet marked "Im Asyl". See p.82
2 R/481-2
This was clearly abandoned because it would bring the climax in G minor (as in Rheingold), and what was required here was F minor for the Fafner scene, this key having been already established in connection with the character of Fafner. In the Kompositions-skizze there is a key signature of F minor at the moment of Fafner's

1 See pp. 74-8
first utterance ¹, but in the Orchesterskizze this key-signature was drawn forward to the moment at which the Wurm music ends ² (in the Partiturschrift this was changed to one flat). The adoption of F minor meant that the end of the Wurm music had to be altered. However the fact that the twenty-six bars of Wurm music were originally taken exactly from the Rheingold version (i.e. starting on E flat) and the horn-call then placed against them, illustrates an unusual type of combination where two ideas in conflicting keys, are placed against each other, almost regardless of the harmonic effect.

Siegfried's journey through the fire produces the combination of the Motive of the fire, the Magic Sleep, the "Rheingold!" song, the horn-call, the Woodbird and of Siegfried himself. It is the Siegfried-Motiv which determines the direction of modulation ³, and although the striking chromatic alteration of the Woodbird-Motiv (representing the fulfilment of its prophecy) steers the music towards the E major in which Wotan left Brünnhilde asleep on the rock, it is not the combination of the Motive which actually cause this modulation:

¹ S/592/5
² S/592/1
³ S/940-71. In the Kompositionsskizze S/945/1-2, 946/2, 950/1-3, 952/3 - 954/2 are absent, and 965/4 - 969/3 are in a compressed form, lasting only four bars. Thus, in the original the harmony was always moving, instead of settling on various chords, as it does in the final version.
Similarly, in *Götterdämmerung* very few combinations can be said actually to cause modulation, except in terms of the music adopting a tonality associated with one of the Motive:
(Here the Hoard and smithing Motive are combined, adopting the B flat minor of the latter, associated with the Nibelungen.)

(Here Atonement and an altered version of one of the love themes are sounded at arbitrary pitches, then Revenge and "Hoi–Ho!", the latter determining the pitch level towards which the Atonement–Motiv is directed.)

The final and most spectacular combination in the Ring is that of the final paragraph of the entire cycle. There exist four complete versions of this music 1 (and two more of just the final two pages) – one in the Einzelskizzen, two in the Kompositions-skizze and another in the Orchesterskizze. This latter formed the eventual ending, though even here there are further adjustments in the closing bars.

In all these versions, the one constant factor is the adoption of the key of D flat for the initial statement of the

1 Some of these variations were examined by Dr. Curt von Westernhagen in 'Die vier Fassungen des symphonischen Schlussatzes der Götterdämmerung'; Neue Zeitschrift für Musik, July 1972.
Walhall-Motiv, while the other Motive are fitted in at various pitches around this:

i)

Einschnitt

\[\text{\textit{Kompositionsskizze}}\]

[Musical notation image]

ii)
The remaining versions of this section correspond more closely to that eventually adopted. The reason for the non-adoption of the versions quoted above is most probably to be found in the modulations occasioned by the Siegfried-Motiv, which are dubious in the extreme as an approach to what would have been the final tonic chord of the entire work. It is clear that the Motive were here subservient to the necessity of bringing about a totally satisfactory final arrival in D flat. To this end an attempt was made which eliminated both the Redemption-Motiv and the troublesome Siegfried-Motiv:

but these last five bars were then crossed out and another ending substituted, restoring the Siegfried-Motiv, and placing it at the pitch at which it does finally appear. The Götterdämmerungmotiv was then added. There are several further alterations to the

1 In the example ii) above from the Kompositionsskizze, the Walhall music had, by that point, modulated to F major. This does not happen in the final version.
These many attempts (and they are not all quoted here) at the combination of various Motive are the one exhaustive example available of the process of working out of a combination. They show what can only be suspected from previous examples; that the combination of Motive was in no way intended to be a device of modulation in which the act of combination would determine harmonic direction in the same way as the use of harmonic "intensification" can actually bring about modulation. Thus, when Wagner spoke of the effect of the "combination of Motive" on the "texture of my music" ¹ this effect is not the same as that caused by the "ramification" of Motive. It is clear that in combination, one Motiv

¹ See pp. 218-19
will dominate harmonically, or that the predetermined necessity of attaining a certain tonality at a certain point will determine the manner in which the combination will be manipulated.
4. A NOTE ON THE USE OF KEY-SIGNATURES IN THE RING

An examination of the use, or absence, of key-signatures in the Ring (especially in the Skizzen) in the light of associations already established between Motive (or character, or atmosphere) and tonality further underlines the importance which Wagner attached to such tonalities.

In the final published versions of the Ring scores some of the detailed key-signatures found in the Skizzen were eliminated in favour of an overall signature for a major musical paragraph. Conversely (and much more frequently) music originally sketched in an all-embracing key-signature which had covered a long paragraph might eventually be split into shorter passages of various key-signatures for convenience of notation. These differences between first and last versions of the music can be used to throw further light on the importance attached to certain tonalities by Wagner, without regard for the overall musical architecture.

The later addition of key-signature to facilitate the work of writing out the music without use of excessive numbers of accidentals is illustrated in the first rapidly modulating section in Rheingold ¹, where in the Kompositionsskizze the key-signature of E flat was assumed in the initial section, but later changed to D, and the following section ² then placed in an "open" key-signature (i.e. no key-signature at all, but not necessarily meaning C major or A minor). The D major was finally made to serve for this latter

¹ R/98-100
² i.e. from R/100/3
section as well, replacing the "open" signature.

The greater number of key-signatures are in fact indicated in the Kompositionsskizzen either explicitly or by written indication (e.g. "B-moll" over a bar-line), or are implied by the absence of certain accidentals. Wagner appears to have used a form of shorthand in these sketches to indicate key-signature repetition at the beginning of a new line of music, whereby a scribbled two flats indicate a flat key signature assumed, and two sharps a sharp one; though for the greater part of the Ring sketch the note B is assumed to be flat, and a natural sign occasionally precedes this note, even when there is a key-signature in sharps. In the neat Orchesterskizzen, new key-signatures are almost invariably inserted at the beginning of a line of music rather than at the point at which they would naturally appear to belong, though in some cases, a double bar inserted in the previous line denotes the back-dating of the signature to that point, perhaps with an added written indication of the name of the key. This latter is not however always the case, and the moments of change of key-signature arrived at by insertion at the beginning of lines of music were frequently carried over into the full score.

It is possible to trace the majority of changes of key-signature in the Kompositionsskizzen up to the end of Siegfried Act II, but in that part of Siegfried written after Tristan it becomes almost impossible to trace key-signatures at all. It would appear that by this stage Wagner carried the signature in his head whilst composing, not even putting down the odd reminders, as he had done in the earlier part of the Ring sketch. In the latter part of the
Ring sketch the only indication of key-signature is usually the lack of certain sharps or flats as accidentals. In such confusion, such signatures as do appear in the sketch become of correspondingly greater significance, though by Götterdämmerung these are even fewer still, and, such as they are, precede the more extended, obviously diatonic passages (e.g. the Rhinemaidens' song in Act III). It is still possible however, by a process of elimination, to determine the approximate, or occasionally the exact, moments of change of key-signature, though these will not necessarily correspond to the change in the printed score.

However, an examination of those key-signatures which do appear in the Kompositionsskizzen reinforces the impression that the significance attached by Wagner to certain tonalities did affect the harmonic construction of the work.

The Walhall - D flat relationship is the most obvious of such associations in the Ring, and the use of the five flats key-signature in the sketch indicates that the decision to use the Motiv was often made well in advance of the moment in the music where it was to appear. Thus the appearance of the key-signature of D flat, following the F sharp major cadence at Brünnhilde's appearance before Siegmund, is remarkable in that the Walhall-Motiv (which appears after six bars) actually arrives in B flat major, thus contradicting the key-signature just set down. The Motiv then modulates to G flat, the key from which (as F sharp) the passage had begun, at which point the F sharp (minor) key-signature is resumed. These signatures were carried from the Kompositionsskizze into the final score.
There are a few examples in the Kompositionsskizzen of a new musical section being begun on a new line of the music paper, even though the preceding line was only half-way completed. In these cases the staves are set out with clefs (not normally used at all), maybe inset an inch and with neat key-signatures on each stave (again very unusual). Sometimes the linking modulation is not executed at all in the Kompositionsskizze, and the two sections do not thus join up. These examples provide for a very few moments in the Ring irrefutable evidence that Wagner intended to use a certain key for a certain passage and that the choice of key was not merely the result of immediately preceding modulations.

Such a moment is the beginning of the Todesverkündigung scene ¹ which was, for reasons known only to the composer, preordained to be in F sharp minor. The only other extended passage in this key in the Ring is the Brünnhilde-Waltraute scene in Götterdämmerung ².

In the Kompositionsskizzen of both these F sharp scenes the key-signature of three sharps was used much more widely than in the final versions, in which the extensive use of accidentals (due to modulation from the F sharp minor) is replaced by varying ³ (and even simultaneous ⁴) key-signatures. The signatures which are adopted are not those of the tonality of the moment, but a notational compromise covering several modulations.

---

¹ W/491 (The version of the Todesverkündigung melody in the Kompositionsskizze is different, though still in F sharp minor.)
² G/419-486
³ Whereas W/432-442 are in three sharps throughout in the Kompositionsskizze, the final version includes four changes of key-signature.
⁴ W/443 - Brass in E flat, strings in F sharp minor.
Similarly, the key-signature of F minor is more extensively used in the Kompositionskizze versions of the Fafner scenes in Siegfried than in the Partiturschrift, where other signatures are adopted for convenience of notation 1:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Siegfried Page No.</th>
<th>Kompositionskizze</th>
<th>Orchesterskizze</th>
<th>Partiturschrift</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>470</td>
<td>$b^b_b^b$</td>
<td>$b^b_b^b$</td>
<td>$b^b_b^b$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>491</td>
<td>$b$</td>
<td>$b^b$</td>
<td>$b$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>492</td>
<td>$b^b$</td>
<td>$b^b$</td>
<td>$b^b$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>494</td>
<td>$b^b_b^b$</td>
<td>$b^b_b^b$</td>
<td>$b^b_b^b$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>496</td>
<td>$b^b$</td>
<td>$b^b$</td>
<td>$b^b$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>500</td>
<td>$b^b_b^b$</td>
<td>$b^b_b^b$</td>
<td>$b$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>502</td>
<td>$b^b_b^b$</td>
<td>$b^b_b^b$</td>
<td>$b^b_b^b$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>503</td>
<td>$b$</td>
<td>$b$</td>
<td>$b$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>505</td>
<td>$b$</td>
<td>$b$</td>
<td>$b$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>506</td>
<td>$b$</td>
<td>$b$</td>
<td>$b$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>512</td>
<td>$b^b_b^b$</td>
<td>$b^b_b^b$</td>
<td>$b^b_b^b$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>514</td>
<td>$b^b_b^b$</td>
<td>$b^b_b^b$</td>
<td>$b^b_b^b$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>518</td>
<td>$b$</td>
<td>$b$</td>
<td>$b$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>520</td>
<td>$b$</td>
<td>$b$</td>
<td>$b$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>526</td>
<td>$b$</td>
<td>$b$</td>
<td>$b$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>527</td>
<td>$b^b_b^b$</td>
<td>$b^b_b^b$</td>
<td>$b^b_b^b$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>529</td>
<td>$b$</td>
<td>$b$</td>
<td>$b$</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 See also pp. 227-8
2 See p. 243
3 crossed out to one flat
4 See pp. 241-3
The B flat minor key-signature associated with the Nibelungen was similarly used originally throughout the Mime-Alberich scene in Siegfried, though in the Orchesterskizze A flat, C and B flat major are also to be found.

The parallel between the E major of the close of Die Walküre and of the later arrival of Siegfried on the rock is more clearly seen in the Kompositionsskizze than in the final score. In the former, the E major key-signature is retained for the whole of the sequence of the awakening of Brünnhilde, but in the Orchesterskizze no fewer than ten changes of key-signature were introduced into this passage and these were retained in the Partiturschrift. The importance of E major to Wagner in this context can thus been seen in the sketch, even though he ultimately modulated so far from that key as to necessitate the use of so many more signatures within it.

There are further examples of such all-embracing key-signatures in the Kompositionsskizzen, generally those already established as having a strong link with a certain character (e.g. the Walküren – B minor; Woodbird – E major). Even the music of the curse originally occasioned more extended use of a key-signature of B minor than could be suspected from the published score. In one moment which clearly caused Wagner considerable trouble, the arrival of the Motiv of the curse caused immediate assumption of a B minor key-signature, even though this had then to be partly contradicted by the Motiv itself:

1 S/636-57
2 S/971-1003
3 S/526
The Motiv here appears at its accustomed pitch, though the interval of the augmented fourth in the last bar (C - F sharp) does not seem to fit, and this was overwritten:

In the Orchesterskizze the curse-Motiv was dovetailed into the preceding vocal phrase:

and this was then further refined:
Finally, in the Partiturschrift the B minor key-signature was dropped altogether, having been relevant only for these three bars.

This automatic use of a B minor key-signature alongside the curse-Motiv is further seen in the Skizzen at an earlier moment in Siegfried 1, where the music itself differs from the ultimate version, the curse-Motiv here being in the vocal line, which itself contains words later eliminated. (In the Orchesterskizze these eleven bars were initially retained, but then were reduced to the six found in the score by sticking another piece of paper on top bearing the new version):

![Graphical representation of music notation]

The B minor key-signature was finally removed when the vocal statement of the curse-Motiv was eliminated.

The key-signatures in the printed version of the Ring cannot thus be used as indications of harmonic architecture. In Götterdämmerung Wagner set down a key-signature of two flats and then

---
1 S/490-1
proceeded to write music in E flat minor both in Hagen's Wachtgesang and (to a slightly lesser extent) in the Hagen-Alberich dream scene; it is not possible to divine any convincing reason for these signatures. Lorenz, in his enormous study of all Wagner's mature works, sometimes mistakenly assumed that key-signature indicated the tonality of the Periode which he was analysing. Frequently they are the same, but there are several examples in which a key-signature is only used for convenience of notation, and the further Wagner worked through the Ring (and especially in that section of it written after 1869) the more he used key-signatures as a compromise between two or more keys (for example, a signature of four flats for the Siegmund-Sieglinde scene in Die Walküre Act II, which in fact hovers between C minor and B flat minor without ever touching F minor or A flat major). The key-signatures of the Ring provide valuable clues as to Wagner's process of constructing the work, but do not, in their final form, give an accurate picture of its actual harmonic structure.

1 G/353-72
2 G/555-9; 564-76; 580-82
4 See Section V.
V THE STABREIM AND THE DICHTERISCH-MUSIKALISCHE PERIODE
1. THE STABREIM

i) The Stabreim in Old High German Verse

The only surviving fragment of Old High German epic poetry is the Hildebrandslied, written around 800 A.D. This date places it just before the Christian era in old German literature, and it was one of the last works to be written in the alliterative style then current, before the end-rhyme technique replaced it about 860 A.D. ¹. After this the alliterative form vanished from German literature for nearly a thousand years (although in England and in Scandinavia it survived into the sixteenth century), a fact which has been attributed to the accession of Charlemagne's son, Louis the Pious (814–40). Whereas Charlemagne had wished to record the old epics for future generations, it seems certain that his son affected an austere Christianity and supressed the old verse form along with its alliterative construction.

The alliterative technique, as seen in the works of the ninth century, was governed by strict conventions. Alliteration was permitted only between like consonants; more complex sounds which were similar in nature (e.g. sp, st, sch) were not used together alliteratively, though all vowels could alliterate with each other.

Such alliterations were invariably placed at the beginning of words ², hence the name Hauptreim ("head-rhyme") or Stabreim ("stem-rhyme"; differentiating the technique from that of Endreim ("end-rhyme") ³. The Endreim is not found in the alliter- ¹ Otfrid's Evangelienbuch (c. 860 A.D.) was the first major work to use Endreim instead of alliteration of the initial sounds. ² or, in German, the beginning of the word stem: e.g. gewesen ³ Whereas the Endreim linked two or more lines together, the Stabreim was used within the single line to link the two half-lines.
ative verse except on very rare occasions, and in such instances as it does appear it was in no way a feature of the construction of the verse. The weight of the alliterative verse was thus thrown onto the accents within the line, rather than onto the end of it. Each half-line would have two main accents (or 'lifts'), with the main accent always on the first lift in the second half-line. It would be the first sound of the word occurring on this lift, vowel or consonant, which would determine the sound to be rhymed in the whole line. In the usual line this *Hauptstab* sound would then be placed in the first half-line on one or both accents therein.

Thus, if 'a' represents the *Hauptstab* and 'x' the second lift in the second half-line (which was normally a non-alliterative sound), then only three possibilities of alliterative structure existed:

i)  aa : ax

ii) ax : ax

iii) xa : ax

Andreas Heusler, in his major three-volume study *Deutsche Vers-Geschichte* ¹, lists the relative frequency with which these forms occur in various *Lieder* of the period. In most, (including the *Hildebrandslied*) the second form ax:ax predominates. The third form xa:ax is very rare. Examples of these three forms are:

**aa : ax**

*frinnan in sehhe / daz ist rehto paluuic dink* ²

**ax : ax**

*want her do ar arme / wuntane bauga* ³

---

1 A. Heusler, *Deutsche Vers-Geschichte* 3 Bände (Berlin 1956) Band I deals with the *Stabreim.*
2 Muspilli (early 9th century) line 26
3 Hildebrandslied line 33
xa : ax

prut in bure / barn unwahsan

The forms aa : aa and xa : aa were also very occasionally used:

aa : aa

'ben zi bena / bloat zi bluda

xa : aa

thu biqoulen Sinhtgunt / Sunna era suster

In longer lines a double Stabreim was also possible, though rarer. Where 'b' represents the second Hauptstab:

ab : ab

'spenis mich mit dinem wortun / wili mich dinu speru werpan

ba : ab (very rare indeed)

Lucas endi Johannes / sia warun gode lieba

Heusler considered that where such second Hauptstäbe did occur, they were almost accidental, and quoted for comparison lines of similar appearance, but with apparent alliteration on unaccented consonants, alliterations which by definition could not be part of the Stabreim structure.

---

1 Ibid. line 21
2 Merseburger Segen line 13
3 Ibid. line 7
4 Hildebrandslied line 40
5 The Heliand (Old Saxon c. 850 A.D.) line 19. In Old Saxon the letters j and g could alliterate. The version of this work found in Deutsche National-Litteratur, Band I: Die Älteste deutsche Litteratur (Berlin n.d.) gives this line as "Lucas endi Johannes/ sia warun lieba gode" which turns it into ab:ab.
All these rarer forms and adaptations of the standard Stabreim pattern represent only a very few lines in the surviving literature. When the Stabreim verse disappeared in the mid-ninth century, it took with it the structure of half-lines integral to its organisation; but when rediscovered a millenium later, it was only the idea of alliteration which survived, and the rigid patterns of accented and unaccented Stäbe were largely forgotten.

ii) Wagner's adoption and adaptation of the Stabreim

Wagner's decision to adopt the Stabreim for the Ring originated in his study of the reworked versions of the old sagas which appeared in modern German verse in the first half of the nineteenth century. Amongst these were the Deutsches Heldenbuch (published by Simrock, 1844), J. Grimm's Deutsche Mythologie (1844), Fouqué's Sigurd (1808), and Uhland's Lied von Siegfrieds Schwert (1812). To Ludwig, Wagner made particular mention of the Simrock publications, which had made some use of a modern alliteration:

Was ... ich ... benützt habe sind ausser den Nibelungen und der Edda (Simrock) selbst, Wilhelm Grimms "Deutsche Heldensaga" und Mones "Untersuchungen zur Heldensaga". Ausserdem, sehr wichtig, eine Übersetzung der "Volsungasaga". 1

(In addition to the Nibelungenlied and the Edda (Simrock) themselves, I used Wilhelm Grimm's Heldensaga and None's Untersuchungen zur Heldensaga. In addition - very important - a translation of the Volsungasaga.)

---

1 Richard Wagner und König Ludwig - Briefwechsel II 257 (23rd February, 1869). Wagner provides a more exhaustive list of his sources in a letter to Franz Müller of Weimar, written in 1856.
Wagner's researches on the subject of the old epics were thorough. In 1851, while expanding the poem of Siegfrieds Tod, he had written to Uhlig (who was still a member of the Dresden orchestra) asking him to smuggle the copy of the H. van der Hagen version of the Wölsungasaga out of the Dresden Royal Library adding:

Jene "Wölsungasaga" möchte ich nun noch einmal haben, nicht um nach ihr zu bilden ... sondern um mich Alles wieder genau zu erinnern, was ich an einzelnen Zügen schon einmal konzipirt hatte.  

(I would like to see once again that Wölsungasaga, not in order to copy it, but to remind myself accurately of those individual features of which I had already conceived.)

The earliest mention that Wagner makes of the Stabreim appears in his essay Die Wibelungen (The Wibelungs) written in the summer of 1848, which is a record of his first deliberations on the problems surrounding the material which was ultimately to be distilled to form the Ring poem. Here Wagner invokes the Stabreim to account for the fact that the names "Welfen und Nibelungen" had become "Welfen und Wibelungen" in German folk-lore.

1 Wagner was by no means consistent in his references to the title of this work. He variously refers to the Volsungasaga, the Wölsungasaga; but to the Wölsungen race.  
2 WU 118 (12th November, 1851)  
3 WU 120 (12th November, 1851)  
4 Die Wibelungen, Weltgeschichte aus der Sage In GS VI  
5 GS VI 108
Immediately after completing the Wibelungen essay, Wagner wrote the prose sketch proper — Der Nibelungen-Mythus als Entwurf zu einem Drama ¹ ('The Nibelungen Myth as sketch for a drama'), and the poem of Siegfrieds Tod was written the same autumn. Its opening furnishes the first example of Wagner's Stabreim verse:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Erste Norn</th>
<th>In Osten wob ich.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Zweite</td>
<td>In Westen wand ich.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dritte</td>
<td>Nach Norden werf ich.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Was wandest du im Westen?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zweite</td>
<td>Was wobest du im Osten?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erste</td>
<td>Rheingold raubte Alberich, Schmiedete einen Ring, Band durch ihn seine Brüder.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A year later, after his flight from Dresden, Wagner was working on Das Kunstwerk der Zukunft ('The Art-work of the Future') in which he detailed his conception of the working of the Stabreim in verse construction:


1 GS VI 139

2 Siegfrieds Tod. GS VI 150-1. The first five lines of this scene reappear at three points later on in it. This suggests that Wagner had the idea of a rondo-type form for this scene already in his mind, and in the Kompositionsskizze these returns of the text are merely indicated by "3 Takte". The rondo form found its way into the Götterdämmerung version of this scene where the text "Weissst du, wie das wird?" and the Todesverkündigung theme fulfil the same function.
erst wirklich zum Reime ab, indem zwei stab-
verwandte Worte erst durch das Hinzutreten
oder Erzeugen des Dritten zum vollkommenen
Reime erhoben werden ... Ohne dieses dritte
Glied die beiden ersten nur zufällig vor-
handen sind. Wie in diesem Reime die Wirkung
von hinten nach vorn, von dem Schlusse zu dem
Anfange zurückgeht, so schreitet sie aber mit
nicht minderer Notwendigkeit ebenfalls umgekehrt
vor: die Anfangsglieder erhalten durch das
Schlussglied wohl erst ihre Bedeutung als Reim,
das Schlussglied ohne die Anfangsglieder ist
aber an und für sich gar nicht erst denkbar.

(If fashion or usage permitted us to
take up again the genuine and true style of
speech and writing, and write tichten for
dichten [= to compose, especially verse],
then we would gain in the group of names of
the three basic human arts: Tanz-, Ton-
und Tichtkunst [dance, music and poetry] a beauty-
ful image of the nature of this trinity of
sisters, namely a perfect Stabreim, such as
is native to the spirit of our language. This
Stabreim would moreover be especially appro-
priate by reason of the prominent position
which it gives to poetry: as the last member
of the rhyme, this word alone would turn it
into a rhyme, since two alliterative words
are only raised to a perfect Stabreim by the
addition or creation of the third. Without
this third member the earlier pair are merely
accidental. But just as the effective opera-
tion of this rhyme works backwards from the
end to the beginning of the line, its effect
also moves forwards in the reverse direction
with no less necessity: the opening members
may gain their significance as rhyme only
through the advent of the closing member, but
the closing member is simply unthinkable without
the earlier pair.)

Two years later, whilst writing the poem of Junger
Siegfried, Wagner wrote in Eine Mittheilung an meine Freunde ('A
Communication to my friends') of the necessity of applying this
Stabreim verse to the Siegfried project.

1 GS X 109-10
Als ich den "Siegfried" entwarf, fühlte ich ... die Unmöglichkeit, oder mindestens die vollständige Ungeeignetheit davon, diese Dichtung im modernen Verse auszuführen.

Wie diese Mensch [Siegfried] sich bewegte, musste aber notwendig auch sein redender Ausdruck sein; hier reichte der nur gedachte moderne Vers mit seiner verschwebenden, körperlosen Gestalt nicht mehr aus; der phantastische Trug der Endreime vermochte nicht mehr als scheinbares Fleisch über die Abwesenheit alles lebendigen Knochengerüstes zu täuschen ... Den "Siegfried" musste ich geradeswegs fahren lassen, wenn ich ihn nur in diesem Verse hätte ausführen können. Somit musste ich auf eine andere Sprachmelodie sinnen; und doch hatte ich in Wahrheit gar nicht zu sinnen nötig, sondern nur mich zu entscheiden, denn an dem urmythischen Quelle, wo ich den jugendlich schönen Siegfriedmenschen fand, traf ich auch ganz von selbst auf den sinnlich vollendeten Sprachausdruck, in dem einziger dieser Mensch sich kundgeben konnte. Es war dies der, nach dem wirklichen Sprachakzenten zur natürlichsten und lebendigsten Rhythmik sich fügende, zur unendlich mannigfaltigsten Kundgebung jederzeit leicht sich befähigende stabgereimte Vers, in welchem einst das Volk selbst dichtete, als es eben noch Dichter und Mythenschöpfer war. 1

(When I was sketching my Siegfried ... I felt the impossibility, or at least the total unsuitability of executing that poem in a modern verse form.

Just as this human being [Siegfried] moved, so must his spoken utterances be. There was no room here for the merely-calculated verse with its limbless ethereal body. The fantastic deception of the end-rhyme could no longer cover the total lack of living bone structure by its cloak of seeming flesh. I would have to have abandoned my Siegfried project if I had been able to set it only in such verse. I had therefore to think of a quite different form of speech-melody; but in fact I did not have to contemplate, only to decide; for at the primal mythic spring where I had discovered the fair young Siegfried I also

1 GS I 157–8
discovered a mode of utterance, pleasing to the senses, which alone could announce his emotions. This was the Stabreim verse which, following the accents of speech, accommodates itself to the most natural and lively rhythm; readily able to express every shade of meaning — that Stabreim in which the Volk itself once composed when it was still both poet and myth-maker.)

Although Wagner thus felt that by recourse to the Stabreim (which he ultimately adopted for the whole of the Ring poem) he was forging an unconscious link with an earlier age in German history, his use of the form differed considerably from that of the ninth century. His Stabreim verse does at times adopt the pattern of the original Old High German, though almost invariably following the double Hauptstäbe pattern:

\[
\begin{align*}
ab : ba & \\
\text{Durch des Rheines Wasserfurth} & \\
\waten die Riesen & 1 \\
\text{Ein Gatte gewinnt} & \\
\text{ihre weibliche Gunst} & 2 \\
ab : ab & \\
\text{Wie lauter und hell} & \\
\text{leuchtetest hold} & \\
\text{du uns} & 3 \\
\text{Verfluchtes Licht!} & \\
\text{was flammt dort die Luft?} & 4 \\
\end{align*}
\]

1 R/324
2 W/872
3 R/727-8
4 S/237
These examples, corresponding to the old forms, are however heavily outnumbered by Stabreim patterns of Wagner's own invention, in particular an aa : bb pattern across the two half-lines:

aa : bb

Zur Ŀeckenden Ŀohe
mich ľieder zu ľandeln

Da ľleicht die ľute
das ľicht erlischt

aa : abb

Leuchtende ľust
wie ľachst du so ľell und ľehr

aaa : bcb : cdd : ada

Weiche, ľotan, ľeiche!
Flieh des ľinges ľuch!
Rettungslos ľunklem Verderben.
Weiht ľich sein ľewinn.

In the last of the above examples can be seen Wagner's predilection for the carrying of one or more particular sounds across a longer span than the mere pair of half-lines. In a few examples this is carried to considerable length, binding a very large section.

1 R/721-2
2 W/111-12
3 R/114
4 R/625
together with one small group of sounds:

(ab:ac:dx) : (bx:ba:dc) : bd : be : ee : ff : (bb:bg) : (bb:bg) :
be : bb : aa : ae : xax :—

Aus dem Wald fort
in die Welt ziehn:
immer kehr' ich zurück!
Wie ich froh bin,
dass ich frei ward,
ichts mich bindet und zwingt!
Mein Vater bist du nicht;
in der Ferne bin ich heim;
dein Herd ist nicht mein Haus;
meine Decke nicht dein Dach.
Wie der Fisch froh
In der Flut schwimmt,
Wie der Fink frei
sich davonschwingt:
flieg' ich von hier,
flute davon,
wie der Wind übern Wald
weh' ich dahin,
dich, Mime, nie wieder zu seh'n!

In this example, so many alliterations occur in addition on unaccented syllables, that an impression is created of the entire passage being dominated by a handful of sounds — in particular in this example the 'a' and 'b' elements of the structure (the sounds "w" and "f"/"v" — which are themselves quite closely linked in the German language). Wagner frequently increased this impression by using the end of the word to produce additional alliterative sounds, for example:

---

1 S/138–44 The positions of the underlinings (indicating rhyming consonants) are based on the accentuations produced by Wagner's musical setting.
Tat - Tand
rief - Ruf
lass' - los
Knechte - erknet

and in the Siegfried example above, additional smaller groups are produced by a slight adaptation of one element (e.g. the sound "f" changed to "fl"). The use of half-lines with single, triple or even more accents was a device of Wagner's own invention ¹, owing very little to the old German original; and his use of rhyming vowels alongside the Stabreim produced an extremely closely knit verse structure indeed:

die Liebe lüsse ich nie,
mir nähere nie sie die Liebe ... ²

Although Wagner, in his major theoretical work, Oper und Drama, was to link the use of Stabreim very closely to the musical structure of the work still to be written, he regarded this resurrection of the verse form of the epic poem as epic poetry in its own right, and arranged dramatic readings of the Ring texts before selected groups of Zürich friends. Many of his contemporaries did not share his regard for the intrinsic value of the verse: Hanslick spoke in 1870 of the "stammering and stuttering alliterations" ³

¹ Curt von Westernhagen (Vom Holländer zum Parsifal p. 50) suggests that the reason why so much early Wagner is in 4/4 time is his preoccupation with Iambic and Trochaic metre. The use of the Stabreim verse freed Wagner from this restriction and led to much more extended use of 3/4.

² G/469-70

³ Hanslick, Music Criticisms 1846-99 (London 1953) p. 132
and of "indigestible German ... offered as poetry" ¹, and the rest
of the press was equally uncharitable:

Dieses holperige Alliterations-
geklapper ... soll das Muster sein,
nach welchem von nun an und in die
Zukunft hinein die Sprache des Dramas
gehandhabt werden müsse. ²

(This stumbling alliterative
rattle - is this supposed to be the
model after which from now on, and
into the future, the language of the
drama will have to be shaped?)

Even Liszt couched his praise of the poem in the vaguest terms,
and never directly commented upon the verse at all:

Du bist wahrlich ein Wunder-Mensch
und deine Nibelungen-Dichtung ist gewiss
das Unglaublichste was Du bis jetzt
geschaffen. ³

(You really are a wonder-man ⁴ and your
Nibelungen poem is certainly the most in-
credible thing that you have so far produced.)

¹ Ibid. p. 146
² J.C. Lobe, 'Richard Wagner als Dichter'; Konsonanzen und Dissonanzen
(Leipzig 1889) reprinted in Wörterbuch der Unhöflichkeit (Ed. Wilhelm
Tappert) (München 1967) p. 17
³ WL I 221
⁴ There is almost a suggestion here of the idea of the alter
Zauberer (old magician) which personifies Wagner in Nietzsche's
Also sprach Zarathustra; of Debussy's image of the "ghost of old
Klingsor - alias R. Wagner"; of the supposed sorcerer Richard der
Wagner in R. Strauss's Feuersnot or of Chausson's "red spectre".
Lizst was never however that deeply under the spell of the magician.
Despite Wagner's protestations that the Ring poem could perfectly well exist by itself, he seems nevertheless to have written it with the musical structure in his mind. Immediately after completing the Kompositionsskizze of Rheingold, Wagner wrote to his old revolutionary friend Röckel (then incarcerated in the Schloss Waldheim jail for his part in the Dresden uprising of 1849), in the course of the letter telling him how he could not now (naturally enough) contemplate the poem without the music; though as early as June 1852 (whilst still working on the Ring poem) he had written to Liszt:


(My Walküre is turning out to be frightfully beautiful! I hope to be able to lay the whole poem of my tetralogy before you before the end of the summer. The music will then proceed easily and quickly, for it is only the execution of what already exists.)

---

1 This in spite of an earlier statement (1844) that subject matter "ought only to be selected which is capable of musical treatment only — I would never take a subject which might be used just as well ... for a spoken drama" (letter to Karl Galliard of 30th January, 1844: WA I 134). Wagner later retreated somewhat from his opinion that the poems could stand by themselves: see for example his letter to Mathilde Wesendonk of 15th April, 1859 (Richard Wagner an Mathilde Wesendonk pp. 125-6).

2 WA I 326

3 WL I 180 (Wagner's italics) See also Wagner's letter to Uhlig of 2nd September, 1851 (WU 99).
It is clear from Oper und Drama, which had been written more than a year before this letter to Liszt, that the musical structure and the verse were linked in Wagner's mind prior to his actually setting out to write the music itself. In Oper und Drama Wagner follows his discussion of the Stabreim with the exposition of the theory of the dicterisch-musikalische Periode, a system which in 1850 he saw as the basis of the music for Siegfrieds Tod, of which only a rough sketch of less than two hundred bars then existed.

Since Oper und Drama was written after the composition of Siegfrieds Tod had been abandoned, it is more than possible that it was written in the light of his experiences with the Siegfrieds Tod music, though this musical sketch is too short for any real examination in the terms of any theory propounded in Oper und Drama.

1 See pp. 178–82
2. THE DICHTERISCH-MUSIKALISCHE PERIODE

i) Wagner's poetic-musical theory.

The basis of the Periode construction was to be one of tonality linked to emotional expression. In the oft-quoted passage in Oper und Drama Wagner explained the device at some length by considering the Stabreim couplet:

die Liebe bringt Lust und Leid

doch in ihr Weh auch webt sie Wonnen

(Love brings delight and lamenting
but in her woe she also weaves wonders)

Here the Stabreim group "Lust und Leid" links two opposite emotions and this group would therefore become an incentive for musical modulation, following the emotional modulation from "Lust" to "Leid". Conversely, the phrase:

Liebe gibt Lust zum Leben

(Love gives delight to living)

would, since there is no change of emotion within the line, give the composer "no natural incitement to step outside the once-selected key". ¹

The second line of the couplet quoted above, by reversing the emotional modulation of the first, would reverse the musical

¹ GS XI 260
modulation occasioned by the original "Lust" - "Leid" Stabreim group. The word "webt" ("weaves") would be the point at which the modulation would be initiated.

Wagner then imagined (but did not illustrate) this couplet being greatly expanded to express "the most manifold gradation and blend of intermediate emotions ... until the return of the chief emotion". Here "the musical modulation would have to be led across to, and back from, the most diverse keys, but all ... would appear ... in relation to the primary key". This larger structure he then denoted the dichterisch-musikalische Periode, this unit being characterised by the domination of one main tonality ("wie sie sich nach einer Haupttonart bestimmt"), from which the composer would depart to a degree determined by the emotional content. A Periode would not necessarily contain only one Stabreim group, but each group, in producing an emotional modulation, would be responsible for the individual musical modulations which together made up the tonal structure of the Periode.

In this explanation Wagner could not point to examples of the technique in use (as he had done in his explanation of Ahnung und Errinnerung for which he had quoted from Lohengrin and Tannhäuser) as it was at this stage a purely theoretical notion (although he could have made reference to the Siegfrieds Tod sketch in which most Stabreim groups do occasion modulation). However, the "Lust und Leid" Stabreim group is to be found in the Ring:

1 See pp. 116–8
Here the two Stabreim groups initiate the two modulations (from G sharp minor to E major, and thence to C sharp minor) but the emotional arch form envisaged in Oper und Drama is not present, and the music accordingly does not return to the original key but modulates further. In order to find the emotional/tonal arch form it is necessary to examine longer passages.

The phrase "Lust und Leid" also appears in Siegfried Act II. In this instance the "Weh - Wonne" group is also present, but the emotion is totally static, and there is accordingly no modulation at all except in the context of the music which follows and precedes the passage:

1 W/519-21.
The above passage (both text and music) does occur in the Einzel-skizzen and so was to a certain extent predetermined quite independently of any theoretical considerations.

There remains one further example of the "Lust und Leid" Stabreim group, though it is not to be found in the Ring at all, but on a sheet of manuscript now in the Richard-Wagner-Archiv, Haus Wahnfried, Bayreuth. In April 1875 Ludwig had requested that Wagner set to music that section of the poem of Brünnhilde's Immolation Scene which had been struck out in 1872 during the composition of Götterdämmerung (beginning with the words "Verging wie Hauch der Götter Geschlecht"). Although Ludwig further requested

---

1 See pp.78-9
that this setting be included in the general rehearsal-cum-performance which he was to attend in Bayreuth in early August 1876, Wagner managed to avoid mutilation of the end of the cycle by delaying the production of the fragment until the 21st August when it was sent to Ludwig as a birthday present. Its concluding bars take the form:

Here, in accordance with the non-modulating phrase quoted in Oper und Drama ("Liebe gibt Lust zum Leben") this passage does not modulate and stays in C major throughout. The whole of the manuscript, using Motive from the Ring, is however generally a most unconvincing page of mature Wagner and was (particularly the final 6/4 – 5/3 cadence) clearly set down with the minimum of effort having been expended upon it. It cannot be regarded as a model illustration of any theory.
Since the average Stabreim group in the Ring is larger and more complex than any of these "Lust - Leid" examples, it is only in an examination of the larger Stabreim groups and complexes of groups within groups that the musical construction can be seen to be linked to the verse. Here can also be seen the musical advantage of Wagner's larger verse units over the Old High German Stabreim form.

ii) The theory in practice in the Ring

Wagner's longer Stabreim groups allowed more gradual modulation across a large tonal canvas than would have been possible in the Oper und Drama system using the simple Stabreim group linked across one pair of half-lines. This would be particularly important in passages of faster music where the longer groups could span the time which in slower music would be covered by one or two shorter, simpler groups. Thus, the setting (to fast music) of the long and very complex group quoted earlier, although lasting for thirty bars, becomes almost the temporal equivalent of a slow basic grouping such as:

Nur Todgeweihten
taugt mein Anblick!

Wer mich erschaut,
der scheidet vom Lebenslicht. 2

Whereas this slow example contains three modulations, the longer passage, containing nineteen lines, encompasses only seven, all of

1 See p. 256
2 W/494-5
them closely associated with $B$ flat:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>German Text</th>
<th>English Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Aus dem Wald fort</td>
<td>B flat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in die Welt ziehn:</td>
<td>$\downarrow$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>nimmer kehr' ich zurück!</td>
<td>dominant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wie ich froh bin</td>
<td>B flat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dass ich frei ward</td>
<td>$\downarrow$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>nichts mich bindet und zwingt!</td>
<td>dominant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mein Vater bist du nicht</td>
<td>by sequences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in der Ferne bin ich heim</td>
<td>from the</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dein Herd ist nicht mein Haus</td>
<td>dominant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>meine Decke nicht dein Dach</td>
<td>and back to it</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wie der Fisch froh</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in der Flut schwimmt</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wie der Fink frei</td>
<td>$\downarrow$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sich davonschwingt</td>
<td>B flat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>flieg ich von hier</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>flute davon</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>wie der Wind übern Wald</td>
<td>$\downarrow$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>weh' ich dahin</td>
<td>sub dominant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dich Mime, nie wieder zu sehn!</td>
<td>B flat</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above passage, when taken with the section which precedes it, constitutes a complete Periode. There is no emotional arch here in the Oper und Drama sense, but the basis of the text is of an impression of increasing exultation suddenly brought to a close by the long line almost devoid of the Stabreim link: "dich Mime, nie wieder zu sehn!". Within very confined limits, the passage leaves the key of B flat as Siegfried's excitement increases, and returns abruptly to that key for its conclusion. Although there is no emotional arch, the passage is concerned with the continuous development of one emotion, and this is closely reflected in the music.

1 See p.298
The keys to which modulations are made in the *Ring* are to a large extent dictated by the various factors discussed in preceding chapters, but it is the *dichterisch-musikalische Periode* theory which largely determines the patterns of these modulations; and, in association with the *Stabreim* groupings, the rate at which the harmonic shifts occur. Since not all modulations in the *Ring* take place to keys predetermined by the relationships already discussed, there is room for manoeuvre in between the predetermined moments, the frequency of modulation and its distance from the home key being dictated by the verse and the changing emotions it expresses. These modulations head towards keys which are deemed to be appropriate to the drama at various points throughout the cycle, points sometimes closely spaced in time, and sometimes (especially in *Die Walküre*) spaced a very long way apart.

The *Periode* are normally characterised by the dominance of a particular key as a tonic, which will be assumed at the close of the *Periode* (as in a sonata movement) although the return to this key may only be transient as the music enters the next *Periode*. Sometimes the return to the home key is omitted altogether in favour of a modulating passage leading into the next *Periode*, perhaps paralleling a continuing emotional development in the text. These *Periode* may then themselves be further seen to form larger units encompassing whole scenes and thereby forming larger tonal structures related to the dramatic structure of the poem.

It was this aspect of the *dichterisch-musikalische Periode* which formed the basis of Lorenz's vast study, *Das Geheimnis der Form bei Richard Wagner*. Lorenz split the entire *Ring* into *Periode*,
analysing them according to musical phrase structure. These Periode are for the most part self-evident as such, but Lorenz occasionally set the dividing point between Periode so as to produce a set of miniature forms (Barform, Bogentform, Strophenbau, Refrainform), rather than at the point at which the music and drama themselves seem to divide, and he was not generally concerned with the tonal structure of each Periode, except to place each in a key of its own.

The degree to which Wagner himself followed the Oper und Drama theory varies throughout the Ring. The theory clearly could not be applied to sections of music which were not settings of text (e.g. preludes and interludes), nor to those few sections where the text was fitted to music already composed, chief of which is the "Idyll" section of Siegfried Act III where the text was adapted to fit the two melodies originally sketched for the 1864 Starnberg Quartet. In fact, Wagner was not averse to adapting or even rewriting a text to fit music. The most spectacular example of this occurred in Die Meistersinger where the original version of the music of the prize-song preceded the text: shortly after completing the Meistersinger poem Wagner wrote to Mathilde Wesendonk that he had written the verses of this song to fit the melody which was in his mind. The third stanza of this poem did not fit the melody already composed, but did happen to fit the E major melody in the overture (which was written in advance of the opera); Wagner

1 The details of the textual alterations necessary to make the original poem fit these melodies are found in Newman's Life of Wagner, Volume III, pp. 271-5.
2 Richard Wagner an Mathilde Wesendonk pp. 301-2
had shown this melody to Wendelin Weissheimer as early as February 1862 (the third act, which contains the prize-song, was not completed until 1867). The original version of the prize-song was then completely abandoned, and a new melody written for the first two stanzas. The E major tune (transposed to C major and in 3/4 instead of 4/4) was retained for the final stanza. As late as October 1866 Wagner wrote to Ludwig that "I am well into the third act now and one of these days I shall have to write the words for Walther's prize-song" 1. In the Kompositionsskizze of the dream scene in the earlier part of Act III, Sach's interjections appear in full, but the prize song melody stands without words. Further examples of such reversal of the words/music relationship can be found in the revised Tannhäuser (new German words fitted to the melody composed to a French text); and in the Siegfrieds Tod sketches, where words not found in the original poem were added to fit the music. Although these are isolated examples they show that occasionally the music was more important than any theory about word-setting.

In his theoretical writings other than Oper und Drama Wagner made no further mention of the dichterisch-musikalische Periode. In September 1851 he wrote to Uhlig, mentioning his "new comic opera text" (i.e. Junger Siegfried) and adding:

1 Richard Wagner und König Ludwig – Briefwechsel II pp.98–9
Das, was Du Dir gar nicht vorstellen kannst, macht sich ganz von selbst! ich sage Dir, die musikalischen Phrasen machen sich auf diesen Versen und Perioden ohne dass ich mir nur Mühe darum zu geben habe; es wächst Alles wie wild aus dem Boden. ¹

(That which you cannot imagine is happening quite of its own accord. I tell you, the musical phrases make themselves for these verses and Periode without my even having to take pains with them - it all grows, as if it were wild, out of the ground.)

Here it is however more likely that Wagner was using the term Periode to mean merely a musical paragraph. He did occasionally use the word in this sense, mostly when referring to the works of other composers ².

In 1860 however he did suggest that his works were certainly not written according to abstract theories:


¹ WU 99
² See for example: GS VII 29 (Bellini, 1835), GS VII 152 (Ein glücklicher Abend, 1841), GS VIII 76 (HALWELLY - from the Gazette Musicale, 1842), GS VIII 163, 167 (Beethoven, 1870);

See also p.22n.
meine kühnsten Schlüsse auf die zu ermöglichte
dramatisch-musikalische Form mir dadurch sich aufdrängten, dass ich zu gleicher Zeit den Plan zu meinem grossen Nibelungen-Drama, von welchem ich sogar schon einen Teil gedichtet hatte ["Siegfrieds Tod"], im Kopf trug und dort in der Weise ausbildete, dass meine Theorie fast nicht anderes als ein abstrakter Ausdruck des in mir sich bildenden künstlerisch-productiven Prozesses war. Mein eigentliches System, wenn Sie es so nennen wollen, findet daher in jenen drei ersten Dichtungen nur erst eine sehr bedingte Anwendung. 1

([My] first three works: Der fliegende Holländer, Tannhäuser and Lohengrin were written, composed and (with the exception of Lohengrin) produced upon the stage before I commenced my theoretical writings. I mention this merely to draw your attention to the great mistake which people make when they believe that they must assume that these works were deliberately written according to abstract rules which I had drawn up myself. Let me tell you that even my boldest conclusions as to the dramatic-musical form which I wished to make possible forced themselves upon me as a result of the fact that I was, at the same time, carrying in my head the plan for my great Nibelungen drama, a portion of which I had written even then [Siegfrieds Tod]. I was shaping it in such a fashion that my theories were no more than an abstract expression of the productive process developing within me. Hence my system proper (if you choose to call it that) is only in a special sense used in those first three works.)

In spite of Wagner's claim that the theories—as written down were merely the verbal expression of a subconcious process, the whole of the Periode structure of the Ring does correspond to a remarkable degree to the technique as explained in Oper und Drama. The earlier parts of the cycle illustrate particularly well the dichterisch-musikalische Periode theory of modulation in practice,

1 GS I 205-6 (Zukunftsmusik)
and although the first act of *Siegfried* shows the system at its most refined, it can be observed immediately in the first scene of *Rheingold*.

The opening scene of *Rheingold* comprises two large *Periode*: one in E flat major and one in C (beginning major, ending minor ¹). As already observed, Wagner did not wish to modulate very far afield in the first scene ². The E flat of the prelude shifts momentarily to A flat for the first phrase of the Rhinemaidens' song, and the first long *Stabreim* group merely occasions modulation back to E flat:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>E flat</th>
<th>A flat</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Wogline, du Welle!</td>
<td>Wagalaweia!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Welle zur Wiege!</td>
<td>Wallala weiala weia!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wogline, wachst du allein?</td>
<td>Wagalaweia!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mit Wellgunde wär' ich zu zwei.</td>
<td>Lass sehn, wie du wachst.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sicher vor dir.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The following lines, though comprising a *Stabreim* group, remain in E flat, and the music arrives in C minor after the group is completed:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>E flat</th>
<th>C minor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Heiaha weia!</td>
<td>Flosshilde schwimm!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wildes Geschwister!</td>
<td>Woglinde fliht:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hilf mir die Fliehende fangen!</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

and the following group steers the music to the dominant (B flat):

¹ In the context of the harmonic architecture of a whole scene, Wagner more frequently seemed to regard the tonic minor key as the "relative minor" than the submediant minor.

² See pp. 192-3
Des Goldes Schlaf
hütet ihr schlecht;
besser bewacht
des Schlummernden Bett,
sonst büsst ihr beide das Spiel!

C minor
B flat

Here it can be seen that the three modulations in this opening trio are all linked with a Stabreim group, though in this instance (and untypically for Rheingold) they do not all occur directly in parallel with the group. There is no emotional development within the passage and the modulations are correspondingly close to E flat.

The arrival of Alberich upsets this static atmosphere and the music moves at once to G minor. In the following pages the modulations closely follow the Stabreim grouping:

He he! Ihr Nicker!
Wie seid ihr niedlich,
neidliches Volk!
Aus Nibelheims Nacht
naht' ich mich gern,
neigtet ihr euch zu mir.

G minor
dominant

Hei wer ist dort?
Es dämmert und ruft.

G minor
diminished 7th

Lugt, wer uns belauscht!
Pfui! der Garstige!
Hütet das Gold!
Vater warnte
vor solchem Feind.

F minor
dominant

Ihr, da oben!
Was willst du dort unten?

Störr' ich eu'r Spiel,
 wenn stauwend ich still hier steh'?

sub-dominant

Tauchtet ihr nieder,
mit euch tollte
und neckte der Niblung sich gern!

dominant of C minor
Mit uns will er spielen?
Ist ihm das Spott?

Wie scheint im Schimmer
ihr hell und schön!

Wie gern umschlänge
der Schlanken eine mein Arm,
schlüpftte hold sie herab!

Nun lach' ich der Furcht:
der Feind ist verliebt!

Der lüstere Kauz!
Lasst ihn uns kennen!

Die neigt sich herab.
Nun nahe dich mir!

In the whole of this exchange, there is not a modulation which is not paralleled by a Stabreim group, nor a group which does not cause modulation. Naturally, each key to which modulation is made does not necessarily have time to establish itself fully, and may only be implied. The modulations become more distant from the home key of E flat as Alberich's utterances become more animated, culminating in B flat minor at "schlüpftte hold sich herab", from which point the music is returned abruptly to E flat by Flosshilde's "der Feind ist verliebt" which adopts the playful innocent attitude of the earlier music.

The section which follows this, in which Alberich chases each of the maidens in turn, begins in E minor. This key is immediately remote from the E flat, as is dramatically appropriate (though the key of E minor has no particular significance) in view of the fact that Alberich is now no longer in a playful mood. Here again the modulations follow the Stabreim groups exactly, the distance from E flat being directly linked to the intensity of Alberich's growing
fury, reaching D major at his first disappointment \(^1\) ("O Weh! du entweichst ... ") and to B flat minor at the third \(^2\) ("Falsches Kind ... "). The furthest point of all is the ultimate moment of deception in B double flat major and G flat minor \(^3\) ("Holder Sang: singt zu mir her" \(^4\)). Following this, the E flat major returns for the mock-innocence of "Wie thörig seid ihr, dumme Schwestern ... " \(^5\), but only appears in passing, and Alberich's last cry of frustration: "Wehe! ach Wehe!" \(^6\) is again in B flat minor. From this point on, the E flat/A flat of the opening is resumed. Throughout the passage the distance which the modulations carry the music from the home key is directly linked to the intensity of Alberich's ardour (and latterly fury).

This produces the overall tonal structure:

```
E flat
  ↓
E minor
  ↓
G flat minor

E flat
  ↓
B flat minor

E flat
```

- Opening section: Alberich's innocent questioning
- The teasing of Alberich: first playful, and then increasingly vicious
- Return to mock-innocence
- Alberich's final outburst
- Return to opening music

---

1 R/54
2 R/67
3 In the Kompositionsskizze the passage involving double flats in the final version is partly written in sharps.
4 R/71
5 R/72
6 R/83
Apart from the existence of a home key (E flat) in this Periode, none of the tonalities used have of course any particular significance attached to them at this stage of the drama, and so the choice of key toward which the Stabreim-induced modulations are directed is, apart from the dramatic significance of their relationship to E flat, dictated by purely musical considerations. This can be seen to be less and less the case as the cycle progresses. The first example of such extra-musical determination of the direction of modulation appears in the second Periode.

The second Periode follows the same emotional direction as the first, that is from innocence to corruption \(^1\), the Stabreim groups being used to carry the music from C major to the distant flat keys. From this point the music does not however return to C major, but to C minor, which key has, earlier in the Periode, become associated with the Renunciation-Motiv. The final C minor emerges out of E minor (which key is here adopted as the key of the ring-Motiv — a relationship which is not however respected after the end of this scene):

\[
\begin{array}{c}
\text{Der Welt Erbe} \\
gewänn' ich zu eigen durch dich? \\
\text{Erzwäng' ich nicht Liebe,} \\
\text{doch listig erzwäng' ich mir Lust?}
\end{array}
\]

\[
\begin{array}{c}
\text{C major} \\
\text{E minor} \\
\text{C minor}
\end{array}
\]

The Renunciation-Motiv and its tonality of C minor then dominate the music until the transition into the Walhallthema. This series of modulations produces the first example in the Ring of the combined use of Stabreim-related modulation and Motiv-key relationship.

\(^1\) See Section IV.1.
In the above four lines of text the music is already implicit in material, in tonal structure and even in the very moments of modulation, predetermined by the Stabreim groups.

Clearly such a total predetermination of the musical content of the Ring to this extent is only possible at a very few moments in the earlier part of the cycle, although as more relationships between Motive and tonality become established, the possibility of engineering such moments increases. One of the longest of such sections occurs in Götterdämmerung:\footnote{G/503-10. See also pp. 148, 184-5.}

\[\begin{array}{ll}
Brünnhild! Ein Freier kam, & G\text{ sharp minor} \\
den dein Feuer nicht geschreckt. & Tarnhelm-Motiv \\
Dich werb' ich nun zum Weib; & C\text{ minor} \\
du folge willig mir! & Potion-Motiv \\
Wer ist der Mann, & B\text{ minor} \\
der das vermochte, & (Gibichungen key) \\
was dem Stärksten nur bestimmt? & \\
Ein Helde, der dich zählt, & B\text{ minor} \\
bezwingt Gewalt dich nur. & Potion-Motiv, \\
Ein Unhold schwang sich & C\text{ sharp major} \\
auf jenen Stein! & (modulations in the direction of G sharp minor) \\
Ein Aar kam geflogen, & D\text{ sharp minor} \\
mich zu zerfleischen! & \\
Wer bist du, Schrecklicher? & G\text{ sharp minor} \\
Stammst du von Menschen? & B\text{ minor} \\
Kommst du von Hellas & C\text{ minor} \\
nächtlichem Heer? & Potion-Motiv \\
Ein Gibichung bin ich, & B\text{ minor} \\
und Gunther heisst der Held, & (Gibichungen key) \\
dem, Frau, du folgen sollst. & \\
\end{array}\]
Here the Motive of the Tarnhelm, of the Potion and of the Gibichungen dominate and consistently assume their own tonalities within the context of Stabreim-initiated modulation. The choice of Motiv is determined more by considerations of Ahnung und Erinnerung than by direct reference to the text.

The increased chromaticism and consequent lack of definition of the actual moments of modulation (or even distinctness of tonality at all) in those parts of the Ring written after Tristan, sometimes make it extremely difficult to say whether the system has been applied or not. The following example comprises one Stabreim group:

\[ G/205 \]
but the difficulty with such a passage lies in stating categorically in what key it is at any given moment. It clearly begins in G major, and ends on the dominant of A minor, but though the vocal line could be regarded as finishing in the key in which it had begun, the accompaniment by that stage appears to be decidedly moving out of G.

More difficult to deal with than this are the passages in which tonality is apparently suspended by the persistent and extended use of diminished sevenths or other ambiguous chords. There may be passing suggestions of keys, but these may not have time to register as such:

Mit blasser Wange, du bleiche Schwester, was willst du Wilde von mir? (A minor)
An deiner Hand, der Ring, er ist's: hör meinen Rat:
für Wotan wirf ihn von dir!
Den Ring? Von mir?
Den Rheintöchtern gib ihn zurück! (A minor)
Den Rheintöchtern, ich, den Ring?
Siegfrieds Liebespfand?
Bist du von Sinnen?

In the above passage \(^1\), apart from an A minor briefly established 'just before Waltraute's reference to the ring, and again (registering in the mind by the repetition of a bar) with the repeated words "Den Rheintöchtern ... ", the whole section appears to be constantly shifting tonally, and it is not possible to say decisively of any Stabreim group that it initiates modulation from key X to key Y; it can only be stated that modulation (albeit continual key-movement) does take place.

\(^1\) G/451-6
Against this existence of Stabreim groups within a harmonic context of a complexity never envisaged during the writing of Oper und Drama, there do occur in Götterdämmerung occasions where the absence of any Stabreim in the text is paralleled by a total lack of modulation, as deemed appropriate by the original theory:

though there are also a very few occasions where a lack of Stabreim in the verse did not inhibit the composer's desire for harmonic movement.

Wagner did sometimes ignore a Stabreim verse pattern, either in the interest of producing rounded musical phrases, or in the placing of a text over a section of music drawn from earlier in the drama:
**Alberich:** O schändliche Schmach, dass die scheuen Knechte, geknebelt selbst mich erschaun!

Dorthin geführt, wie ich's befehlt!

All zu Hauf schichtet den Hort!

Helf' ich euch Lahren?
Hieher nicht getaut!

Rasch da, rasch!
 Dann führt euch von hinnen:

dass ihr mir schafft!
Fort in die Schachten!

Weh euch, find' ich euch faul!
Auf den Fersen folg' ich euch nach. **B flat minor**

---

Generally, such departures from the original theory linking modulation with Stabreim group are no more frequent in those sections written after Tristan than in the rest of the cycle. It is in the increased difficulty of the determination of what the actual modulations are, and where they actually occur, that the latter part of the cycle is difficult to analyse according to the theory.

---

1 R/527-38 The music is a development of the Nibelungen music in Scene 3.
3. ANALYSIS OF SIEGFRIED ACT I Sc. 1 AND COMPARISON WITH THE PERIODE ANALYSIS OF ALFRED LORENZ.

An analysis of the first scene of Siegfried, as well as revealing further examples of departures from the theory as originally set down, illustrates some of Wagner's most perfect dichterisch-musikalische Periode. Further, a comparison between analysis of this scene according to Wagner's principles and the analysis achieved by Lorenz in 1924 illuminates the problems of analysing a work in which an innate musical/dramatic inspiration, rather than theoretical or purely musical concepts, must ultimately have been the guiding force.

a) Some details in Mime's soliloquy

The prelude to Siegfried, derived from the Nibelungen music and the Motiv of the hoard, is in B flat minor, a key which already has established associations with Mime. As the curtain rises, Mime states the problem which faces him: the child Siegfried smashes every sword which is forged for him. The music to which this is set is harmonically simple and remains close to the original key. Mime then conceives the answer to his problem and the music modulates slightly to accommodate the sword-Motiv in C major:

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{Es gibt ein Schwert,} & \quad \text{B flat minor} \\
\text{das er nicht \underline{zerschwänge}:} & \quad \text{dom. of F minor (=} C \text{ major for the sword)} \\
\text{Nothungs Trümmer} & \quad \text{dom. of B flat minor} \\
\text{zerbrozt' er mir nicht,} & \quad \text{(no modulation).} \\
\text{könnt' ich die starken} & \quad \text{}\text{Könnt' ich's dem Kühnen schmieden} \\
\text{Stücken schweissen,} & \quad \text{meiner \underline{Schmach} erlangt' ich da \underline{Lohn}! (dim. 7th chord)} \\
\text{die meine Kunst} & \quad \text{daß ich der König der} \\
\text{nicgt zu kisten weiss!} & \quad \text{mein Land? (dom. of C major)} \\
\end{align*}
\]
It then dawns upon Mime that he might be able to use Siegfried to slay Fafner, and thereby seize the hoard for himself; and the diminished seventh chord upon which the above extract finishes is accordingly followed by the Motiv of 'brooding'. The Kompositionsskizze makes no mention of this Motiv here \(^1\) and proceeds directly to the "Fafner, der wilde Wurm ..." text and a statement of the Wurm-Motiv beginning on F. However, the later insertion of the brooding-Motiv brought the music back from the diminished seventh chord mentioned above to B flat minor; this was not Wagner's original harmonic intention, it is clear from the sketch that the music was not to return to that key until later. In the final version of this passage, the harmonic implications of the two melodic lines (Mime/bass instruments) are ambiguous throughout, and it is consequently difficult to relate the modulations to the two Stabreim groups:

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{Fafner, der wilde Wurm,} & \quad \text{Single note C} \\
\text{lager im finsten Wald;} & \quad \uparrow \\
\text{mit des furchoten Leibes Wucht} & \quad \downarrow \\
\text{der Niblungen Hort} & \\
\text{huetet er dort.} & \quad \text{B flat minor}
\end{align*}
\]

In the Kompositionsskizze at this point not only is the voice in a different relationship to the Wurm-Motiv, but harmony is included (the chords were retained in the Orchesterskizze, but eliminated in the Partiturschrift), and this illuminates somewhat the progression implicit in the bare bass line:

---

\(^1\) The brooding-Motiv is absent in the Kompositionsskizze at several moments where it is found in the final version, having been added in the Orchesterskizze. (e.g. S/19/3-8; S/22/4-6.)
This version must in turn have been directly derived from one of the "Fafner" fragments in the *Einzelskizzen*, the last three bars of which contain the same progression 1:

The second four bars of this example show that the harmony was grafted onto the bare line of the Wurm-Motiv found in the first four bars.

1 This progression reappears (very slightly altered, but at the same pitch) at the moment of Fafner's death (S/618-9).
In Siegfried Wagner clearly just placed a vocal line on top of this melody, without necessarily taking any regard for theories of modulation. With the exception of the appearance of the Wurm-Motiv in Rheingold ¹, this is its first full statement in the cycle, and Wagner would here probably have had in his mind the music of Fafner (beginning on the note F) as it appears in the pages of the Einzel-skizzen. However the E flat statement of the Motiv ², which appears in the Orchestersizze but not in the Kompositionsskizze, was the result of the addition of the brooding-Motiv, and this, almost incidentally, made this manifestation of the Motiv (starting on E flat) parallel the Rheingold statement (and also a later statement in Siegfried Act II ³). This phenomenon of an extended melodic Motiv taking over the direction of harmonic structure from any Stabreim considerations can also be seen in connection with the Wälsungen- and Wälsungswelthemen (amongst others) but in those cases the compositional process cannot be followed as clearly as in this Siegfried example.

Following this exposition of the Wurm-Motiv, Mime becomes increasingly excited at the prospect of disposing of both Siegfried and Fafner and gaining the ring for himself. The more agitated he becomes, the further the modulations carry the music from B flat minor. The sudden realisation that he cannot attain this dream without the forging of Nothung brings the music dramatically back to the home key:

1 R/481
2 S/21/5
3 S/591. See pp. 226–8
This is one of the most perfect examples of the expansion of the idea of a dramatic parallel between text and tonality originally illustrated by the "Lust/Leid" - "Weh/Wonnen" Stabreim pattern, here expanded to the full-scale Periode advocated in Oper und Drama; the whole of Mime's soliloquy (with the prelude) forms a complete Periode.

Thus, in the first section of this scene, so long as emotion remains fairly static the lack of harmonic movement mirrors this; but as agitation increases so does the extent of the modulations, and the return to the initial emotional state is paralleled by the return to the original key.

As Wagner had decreed that it was the word which actually led from one emotion to another which should initiate the modulation, so it is the F natural of the words "kann's nicht schweissen ..." which, acting as a pivot (F having the initial effect of an E sharp following the F sharp in the orchestra), wrenches the music back from D major to B flat minor:

1 The sword-Motiv is absent here in the Kompositionsskizze.
2 In the Kompositionsskizze, this is D minor. The sudden return to the key of Mime's desolation is all the more dramatic from D major, which key was adopted in the Orchesterskizze.
The Periode concludes with a literal recapitulation of the opening ten lines, the final return to B flat minor being telescoped into the next Periode in G major. Although this B flat minor Periode illustrates Wagner's extension of his theory to cover a large paragraph of music, the possibility of the further extension of the concept to cover a whole scene can be seen in the sections which follow this.
b) Analysis of the remainder of Siegfried Sc. 1

Siegfried's arrival on stage with the bear in Act I comprises a G major Periode. Lorenz noted this, but then proceeded to denote the whole of the following scene, up to the moment of Siegfried's demand that Nothung be forged anew as a Periode in G minor, subdividing this giant Periode into four Hauptsätzte and three Zwischensätzte. This produced the symmetrical pattern of tonal construction:

```
G minor
  | F minor
  |   | D minor
  |   |   | G minor
  |   |   |   | D major
  |   |   |   |   | G minor
  |   |   |   |   |   | D minor
  |   |   |   |   |   |   | F minor
  |   |   |   |   |   |   |   | G minor
```

The aesthetic attractiveness of this plan is not however borne out quite so exactly on investigation of the music. Lorenz's Sätzte are in fact generally Periode in their own right, with their own arch-form constructions according to the principles of Oper und Drama. The musical matter of each Satz was detailed by Lorenz.

1 S/31-44
3 S/137
but this in itself seems to illustrate the musical and dramatic
self-sufficiency of each unit which would be sufficient to justify
the labelling of each of them as Periode. As will be shown, Lorenz's
labelling of the actual tonalities of the Sätze is also open to dispute.

The tonal construction of each of these Periode can clearly
be followed in parallel with their emotional and dramatic content:

Periode 3  (2) G minor (S/44-53)
Key-signature   two flats
G minor         Siegfried smashes the sword and launches a furious tirade
                against Mime, of increasing vehemence. The emotional
                (though not the dynamic) climax of this is Siegfried's
C flat          threat to break both Mime and the sword in pieces.
G minor         From this point the music returns rapidly to the original
                key of G minor

Periode 4  (Transitional Periode) D minor (S/53-62)
Key-signature   two flats
Lorenz did not consider this to be a separate section, and included
it in the preceding G minor Satz. It has however an existence of its
own, and, in spite of the G minor key-signature 3, once the music has
modulated out of G minor it remains centred on D minor. The Periode
is concerned with Mime's reply to Siegfried's tirade.

1 See p.300 for the essential details of Lorenz's analysis of this
scene. The formal divisions of the Ring arrived at by Lorenz are
investigated (in Lorenz's own terms) by J.L. Rose in his Wagner's
Musical Language (London Ph.D. thesis 1963), which further dis¬
putes Lorenz's over-neat analysis.

2 Periode 1 and 2 are the preceding ones in B flat minor and G major.

3 There is no key-change in the Kompositionsskizze at this point.
i) Transition  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>G minor</th>
<th>Mime replies to Siegfried's tirade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>D minor</td>
<td>(S/53-7)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ii)  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>D minor</th>
<th>Mime's particular grumble about Siegfried's attitude to the food prepared for him</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B flat</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D minor</td>
<td>(S/57-9)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

iii) Transition and modulation to next Periode  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>D minor</th>
<th>Mime's outburst: &quot;Das ist nun der Liebe schlimmer Lohn ...&quot;</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>F minor</td>
<td>(S/59-62)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Periode 5  F minor (S/63-70)

Key-signature four flats

F minor  

Mime's "complaint". As Mime becomes more bitter about his lot the music moves gradually flat-wise — returning abruptly to the home key as he collapses sobbing

D minor (S/70-86)

Key-signature one flat

This Periode is made up of four smaller D minor Periode each one of which corresponds to a particular train of thought in Siegfried's mind, but they are all bound together dramatically by being an outpouring of loathing:

Transition: modulation from the preceding F minor.

Siegfried's general dislike of Mime (S/70-1)

i) D minor  

Siegfried's dislike of Mime's housekeeping (S/71-4)

E flat  

D minor

ii) D minor  

Siegfried's dislike of Mime's appearance (S/74-8)

C minor  

D minor
Siegfried compares his love for the animals with his hatred of Mime (first appearance of Siegfried love theme).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Mode</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>iii)</td>
<td>D minor</td>
<td>Mime explains the meaning of filial love.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>↓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C major</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>↓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D minor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Lorenz only acknowledged the first section of the above as being in D minor (i.e. the transition and section i). The next two sections (ii and iii) he denoted as G minor, and then included the last section (iv) in the following D major Satz. It is very difficult to discern the justification for these labels except to produce a neat Bogenform. The section which Lorenz denotes as G minor has no connection whatever with that key — as shown above, it consistently returns to D minor at the end of each dramatic section. It is equally difficult to explain the bringing forward of the D major section; the D major Periode being Siegfried's answer to Mime's preceding D minor passage (i.e. section iv above). This D major section would be more appropriately regarded as the final section of the D minor Periode, being the emotional height of the whole scene, built from material derived from the preceding D minor section and in the same tempo. The change from minor to major reflects Siegfried's change of attitude: from total hostility to Mime to an overwhelming desire to learn of his parents.

---

1 Lorenz, Op.cit. p. 224
**Periode 6a** (coda of Periode 6) **D major** (S/86-94)

Key-signature two sharps

D major  
C major  
D major

Siegfried enquires after his mother. The music is harmonically very static, remaining very much within the orbit of D major. As Siegfried becomes more animated the music moves farther afield, relaxing with the soft question "... dass ich es Mutter nenne?"

Lorenz further extended this **D major Satz** to include the first three sections of the following **Periode 1**. The justification both for this tonality label and for the division is not clear - both dramatically and musically, as well as in tempo, there is a dividing line at the question: "... dass ich es Mutter nenne?". Had Mime proceeded at once to answer this question, Lorenz's division would be dramatically easier to explain, but Mime avoids producing an answer for a considerable time.

**Periode 7** **G minor** (S/95-107)

Key-signature still two sharps, later two flats ².

In this **Periode** Siegfried attempts to discover who his parents were.

It is in five sections:

1) **G minor** Repeat of a few bars of Mime's "complaint" ³.  
B minor  
G minor  

(S/95-6)

---

1 i.e. up to S/101

2 In the Kompositionsskizze key-signatures do not appear at all around this point in the music. For no apparent reason, (except perhaps to remind himself of the key-signature) Wagner added the words "G moll" at two points in the **Periode** (S/101/3, 104/3); the first of these corresponds with what Lorenz deemed to be the beginning of the Satz, the second is in the middle of an interrupted cadence into C flat. In the **Orchesterskize** there is however a distinct two flats key-signature at S/95/3 (the actual point at which **Periode 7** begins), though this was eliminated in the **Partiturschrift** and delayed until S/96.

3 F minor (the "complaint"-key) is not adopted here. It would have been easy enough to engineer, though this would have upset the flow of the music into G minor.
ii) G minor Siegfried observes that parent and child look alike (S/97-8)
   E flat
iii) G minor As the Siegfried-Motiv appears (for only the second
c      time in Siegfried), it dawns on him that Mime can-
c      not be his father (S/98-100)
   C minor
iv) G minor Siegfried becomes more agitated at this realisation,
c      and the music moves forward by sequences in parallel
   C major
   A flat minor
   v) G minor Siegfried seizes Mime and demands to know who his
   E flat minor parents were with ever increasing vehemence. The
   G minor final question "Wer ist mir Vater und Mutter?"
   returns abruptly to the home key. (S/105-7)

Periode 8 F minor (S/105-32)
Key-signature three flats, later 'open', four flats, three flats.

This is an extended and complex Periode which encompasses a very
considerable range of emotion and modulation. It is in three sections
comprising Mime's account of Siegfried's birth:

i) F minor Mime is nearly choked by Siegfried. After feel-
c      C flat ing particularly sorry for himself he agrees to
      dominant of F
tell the story of Siegfried's birth (S/108-11)

Lorenz placed both this and the following section in D minor 1. Again,
there can be no possible explanation for this except to engineer in
his analysis the symmetrical form of which he was so fond. There
is no suggestion whatever of the key of D minor, with the exception
of two unaccompanied vocal bars 2 out of the total of the sixty which
he declares comprise the Satz. In the Kompositionsskizze there is a

   115/8 inclusive.)
2 S/112/2-3
distinct key-signature of one flat at the beginning of the following section ¹, but this was cancelled after eight bars and replaced by two sharps, which were in turn cancelled six bars later. In the Orchesterskizze all signatures were eliminated.

ii) (C major)

Mime tells the story of Siegfried's birth ...

D minor

... of Sieglinde's agony

B minor

E flat minor

D flat minor

F sharp minor

... of Siegfried's birth

D flat major

... of Sieglinde's death

C flat

Mime tells how he took Siegfried to care for him, and begins again the "complaint", this time in its own key of F minor.

(S/111-16)

The above section includes one of the most dramatically moving modulations in the whole Ring, in which the Stabreim group: "So starb meine Mutter an mir?" carries the music, in one move, from D to D flat (though the chord in the orchestra belongs to F minor):

[S/115/3]

¹ i.e. S/111/7
iii) This section is based on the "complaint" tune, the key of the Periode having presumably been dictated by the presence of that Motiv. It is violently interrupted by Siegfried three times as he demands the name of his father and proof of Mime's tale:

```
F minor
  \downarrow
C flat
  \downarrow
F minor (S/117-9)
  \downarrow
G flat minor
  \downarrow
F minor (S/119-23)
  \downarrow
B: flat minor
  \downarrow
C minor
  \downarrow
F minor (S/124-30)
```

Mime finally produces the sword (S/130-2)

Lorenz included the last part of the above Periode in the following Satz, which he placed in G minor, beginning with the change of key into three flats. In the Kompositionsskizze however the words "Es dur" were added here at a later stage, though the following Lebhaft has only two flats. In the Orchesterskizze three flats were set down at this point, but one of these was then eliminated, and then the whole signature changed back yet again to three flats. Thus although in the Kompositionssizze there was no need to change to two flats for Siegfried's exit, (that key had already been established), in the

1 S/128/2
2 S/132/8
3 S/138/1
4 S/132/8 For a diagrammatic representation of this confusing passage see p. 300
Orchesterskizze a change was necessary from three flats to two.

Wagner clearly was in some doubt as to what key-signature was appropriate here. The final section (from "Und diese Stücken ...") was originally sketched in two flats, and the three only later inserted; this is clear in the Kompositionsskizze. The words "Es dur" probably refer to a change of key-signature, which (as has been noted) would not necessarily be the same as a change of key; E flat major does not occur in this passage, though C minor is very much in evidence. The "Es dur" is presumably therefore an instruction to reduce the four flats to three as an interim measure pending reduction to two for the final section.

The problem which Wagner clearly experienced here illustrates the occasional difficulty in any analyst's attempt to ascribe particular key-labels to particular passages. Lorenz made no reference to the Skizzen, and sometimes did decide the dividing point between Periode or Sätze by the key-signature changes in the printed score. His placing of the final section of the above Periode in G minor is not really justified by the music, especially since he includes in it the whole of that passage concerned with the production of Nothung, which is very solidly placed in F minor with no suggestion of anything approaching G minor.

1 S/132/8
2 S/132/8
3 See Section IV.4
4 i.e at S/132/8
5 From S/128/2
It would be more in accordance with the dramatic structure of the scene to regard the whole of Siegfried's ecstatic outburst as comprising a B flat _Periode_ (Lorenz makes the last short 3/4 section a separate B flat _Periode_), though it has to be acknowledged that, if the scene is to be split in this manner, there could be an ambiguity as to where the division should be. Dramatically the final section begins with the words:

"Und diese Stücken sollst du mir schmieden: dann schwing' ich mein rechtes Schwert!"

and Mime's production of the sword as proof of the story he had told could be regarded as belonging dramatically to the preceding section concerning Siegfried's parentage rather than to the section concerned with Siegfried's joy. The B flat _Periode_ is more appropriately regarded as encompassing this whole final passage from the moment that the key of B flat is first established, with change of time-signature, distinct cadence into that key, and another full B flat cadence eight bars later:

**Periode 9**  B flat major (S/132-49)
Key-signature three flats, later two flats

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>B flat</th>
<th>Siegfried's demand that Nothung should be forged anew by Mime</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C minor</td>
<td>Mime's question &quot;was willst du noch heut' mit dem Schwert?&quot; and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G minor</td>
<td>Siegfried's ecstatic reply and exit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B flat</td>
<td>(E flat)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B flat</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

1 From S/132/8
2 From S/139/1
3 The first cadence into B flat is at S/132/8 and the second at S/133/5
4 This section is investigated on p.267
Periode 10  B flat minor (S/149-54)

Key-signature five flats

This short passage, though constantly modulating, centres around B flat and leads into the first Periode of Scene 2.

The table on the following page compares the key-signatures in Scene 1 used in the Kompositions- and Orchesterskizzen and the Partiturschrift, and also compares the above Periode analysis with that of Lorenz. (In that part of the scene in which Lorenz's division of Sätze is open to question, timings are indicated 1, although there is in fact no conclusion to be drawn regarding equality (or otherwise) of temporal length of the formal units.)

It is significant that the area of doubt as to the positions of the boundaries of the Periode begins at the same moment as Wagner's own indecision (revealed in the Skizzen) as to what key-signature should be adopted. Lorenz's division seems at times to follow Wagner's final key-signatures more closely, but the music and the dramatic situation seem (as demonstrated in the preceding pages) to contradict this interpretation, and Wagner's original key-signatures (i.e. the Kompositions-skizze) correspond more closely to the analysis according to the principles of modulation set down in Oper und Drama. Wagner's later adaptation of the key-signatures probably represents an attempt at economy regarding the number of accidentals required.

1 The timings are from the Decca recording SET 242-6
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key-Signature</th>
<th>Periode</th>
<th>Lorenz Periode and Sätze</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>K.S.</td>
<td>O.S.</td>
<td>P.S.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5♭</td>
<td>5♭</td>
<td>5♭</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#</td>
<td>#</td>
<td>#</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2♭</td>
<td>2♭</td>
<td>2♭</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4♭</td>
<td>4♭</td>
<td>4♭</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2♭</td>
<td>b</td>
<td>b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2♯</td>
<td>2♯</td>
<td>2♯</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>? 2</td>
<td>2♭</td>
<td>2♭</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;G Moll&quot;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;G Moll&quot;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2♭</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3♭</td>
<td>3♭</td>
<td>3♭</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b</td>
<td>b</td>
<td>b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2♯</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>♭</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4♭</td>
<td>4♭</td>
<td>4♭</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Es Dur&quot;</td>
<td>3♭</td>
<td>3♭</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2♭</td>
<td>2♭</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2♭</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2♭</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 In Eulenberg score
2 Unclear
3 Added as an afterthought
4 See pp. 296-7
5 See pp. 296-7
4. Conclusions

The preceding analysis demonstrates the difficulty which frequently occurs in attempting to detail Wagner's Periode structure. The complete analysis of the Ring in such terms reveals this problem in varying degrees throughout, but with a marked increase in ambiguity in the latter part of the cycle.¹

That the Periode structure exists there is no doubt, and that its basis is Stabreim-initiated modulation linked to emotional content is also beyond question. It is due to Wagner's genius as a composer of continuous music, to what he called his "art of transition", that such difficulty arises:

Meine feinste und tiefste Kunst möchte ich jetzt die Kunst des Überganges nennen, denn mein ganzes Kunstgewebe besteht aus solchen Übergängen: das Schroffe und Jähe ist mir zuwider geworden; es ist oft unumgänglich und nöthig, aber auch dann darf es nicht eintreten, ohne dass die Stimmung auf den plötzlichen Übergang so bestimmt vorbereitet war, dass sie diesen von selbst forderte. Mein grösstes Meisterstück in der Kunst des feinsten allmählichsten Überganges ist gewiss die grosse Scene des zweiten Actes von Tristan und Isolde.²

(My most subtle and profound art I would like to call the art of transition, for the whole texture of my art-work consists of such transitions. The abrupt and sudden has become repugnant to me: it is often unavoidable, but even then it must not be introduced without the listener having been so decisively prepared for a sudden transition that he himself wants it to take place. My greatest masterpiece in the art of transition is certainly the great scene in the second act of Tristan und Isolde.)

¹ See also pp. 279-80
Although the Periode structure of the Ring may have been perfectly clear in Wagner's mind, the construction is frequently obscured by the way the music flows from one Periode into the next, these transitions often stretching some distance into the Periode on either side.

The central sections of the Periode however, those sections not complicated by the modulations out of one Periode into another, illustrate perfectly the Oper und Drama theory in practice. To what extent this was a conscious process on Wagner's part it is impossible to say; the conclusion that at many moments (especially later in the cycle) the music took over from any theory (assuming that the theory was ever foremost in his mind at all when he came to compose) cannot be avoided. Some Periode however are so perfect in terms of the theory that whether Wagner denied or not the influence of his theories on his composition, the influence of the dichterisch-musikalische Periode is clearly to be found in the Ring.

Lorenz was concerned more with analysis of the Ring according to formal structure in terms of melody and phrase length than with the relationship between such structure and the manner in which the poem was built; indeed, this factor did not concern him at all. Wagner's practice of carrying melodic ideas across the boundaries of the Periode to produce continuity in fact resulted in the possibility of more than one analysis of the structure. However, in naming his
formal units Periode, Lorenz appropriated a term which did not strictly apply to his analysis. It is not possible to regard the whole of the centre of the Siegfried/Mime scene discussed above as a single dichterisch-musikalische Periode; the dramatic and musical content is too diverse. The scene certainly does have a tonal symmetry, but not to the degree suggested by Lorenz, several of whose tonality labels seem to have been selected in order to engineer the symmetrical form. That does not however preclude the possibility that Wagner did originally see the scene in Lorenz's symmetrical terms, the structure undergoing change during the process of composition, or being submerged in series of modulations. The actual pattern of the scene, according to the principles of Oper und Drama, may be represented:

B flat minor

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>B flat minor</th>
<th>Prelude</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>G major</td>
<td>Mime.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G minor – D minor</td>
<td>Siegfried's arrival</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F minor</td>
<td>Mime's &quot;complaint&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D minor – major</td>
<td>Siegfried's search for identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G minor</td>
<td>Siegfried's demand</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F minor</td>
<td>Mime's reply</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B flat major</td>
<td>Siegfried's joy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B flat minor</td>
<td>Mime alone</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Lorenz similarly reduced the whole of the second scene of Siegfried to two giant Periode in C major and F minor. This is equally dramatically and musically too all-embracing, and again does violence to Wagner's conception of the Periode, and to the symmetry
which the scene does possess:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Periode</th>
<th>Lorenz:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>C major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>E minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>F minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>D flat major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>F minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>A minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>F minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>B flat minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>C major</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Wanderer's arrival
First question and answer
Second
Third
Mime's turn
First question
Second
Third
Wanderer's exit

These two scenes are in fact the two major instances in which Lorenz's division into Periode is open to argument; the remaining instances are:

| 1. | C major |
| 2. | F minor |

(P indicates Periode)

Rheingold

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>P. 13</th>
<th>B flat minor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(In fact three Periode: B flat minor - G minor - B flat minor)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>P. 17</th>
<th>E flat major</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(Five Periode: C minor - C sharp minor - C minor - B minor - C minor)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Walküre I

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>P. 12</th>
<th>G major</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(Four Periode: E minor - B flat major - C major - G major 2)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>P. 7</th>
<th>A minor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(Six Periode: A minor - A flat minor - A minor - A major - A minor - C minor)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Siegfried I

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>P. 3</th>
<th>G minor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(Six Periode: G minor - D minor - F minor - D minor major - F minor - B flat major)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2 Lorenz acknowledges this division, but labels the sub-units Abschnitte.
3 Lorenz divides this into six Abschnitte.
4 See pp. 289-98
There are, in addition, ten of Lorenz's Periode which could be regarded as being in keys other than those in which he places them.

Despite these difficulties, it is clear that the dichterisch-musikalische Periode theory does determine the frequency of modulation in the Ring, the distance of that modulation from a home-key, and the movement of the home-keys themselves; which movement then forms the large scale construction of scenes and acts. It was these larger units which concerned Lorenz, though his analysis was made from the basis of splitting the larger unit into the smaller, rather than on a basis of delineating the smaller units and then forming larger ones from them.

The tonalities of the Periode are in many cases determined by the association with a particular key held by one of the characters (or other elements) with which the poetic matter of that Periode is concerned, and further modulation induced by dichterisch-musikalische

---
1 See p. 305
2 Other Periode in which it is possible to disagree with Lorenz's label, or of which it is very difficult to decide the tonality at all are (Lorenz's numbering): Die Walküre II P.2, 4, 13; III P.7; Siegfried I P.10; III P.2; Götterdämmerung II P.7, 8, 10.
principles within the **Periode** is frequently carried out to keys whose appearance is occasioned either by connections with further elements mentioned in the text, or by dramatic considerations of Ahnung und Erinnerung.

It is only natural that the use of the system was flexible and not invariable; it would otherwise have been mechanical, and that was certainly not in Wagner's nature: the analysis of the Immolation Scene, for example, according to these principles is (with the exception of the forecasting of tonality at certain moments by reference to the text) almost impossible. The **Periode** structure (if any) is obscure in the extreme, and the almost total lack of key-signatures in the **Kompositionsskizze** adds to the impression that Wagner followed where the music led, subject to the acknowledgment of certain anchoring points\(^1\). Even here however the close relationship between **Stabreim** group and frequency of modulation remains, to a degree which is too consistent to be coincidental.

---

1 D flat for Walhall, the C major reminiscences from Siegfried, the B minor key-signature for mention of Grane (even though that key is not used), the A flat for the Rhinemaidens' melody.
APPENDICES
APPENDIX ONE

Table of Motive to which reference is made in this volume.

Wotan's Abschied (Farewell):

The Magic Apples (= youth):

Atonement:

Blutbrüderschaft (blood-brotherhood) melody:

Brooding:
Brünnhilde as woman:

Curse:

Donner's Call to the mists:

Enticement:

Erda:

Fate:

Forging song melody:

i)

ii)
Freia ( = female beauty):

Fricka's anger:

Friendship between Siegfried and Gunther:

Frustration:

The Giants:

The Giant Fafner as dragon:

Gibichungen:
Gibichungen Horn-Call:

The Gold:

Götterdämmerung:

Götternot (Motiv of the gods' despair):

Gutrune:

Hagen:
"Helle Wehr" Oath:

The Hoard:

Hunding:

Motive from the "Triebchen Idyll" (originating in the Starnberg Quartet of 1864):

a) 

b) 

Lebensfreude (Motiv of the joy of life):

i) 

ii)
Loge / Fire:

a) 

b) 

"Love's Enchantment": 

Magic Sleep Motiv:

Magic Sleep Chords:

Mime's Complaint:

Mime's elation:

Murder:
Norns:

Oath:

Obligation:

The Potion:

Redemption:

Renunciation (named by Wagner: Liebesfluch):

Revenge:
"Rheingold!" song:

Rhinemaidens' song:

The Ring (named by Wagner: Welterbes):

Ritt-Motiv (Riding Motiv):

Sehnsucht (yearning):

Servitude:
Siegfried:

Siegfried & Brünnhilde love themes:

a)

b)

c)

Siegfried's Horn-Call:

i)

ii)

Siegfried's love theme:
Sieglinde:

Siegmund:

Smithing Motiv (also associated with the Nibelungen in general):

Spear / Treaty:

i)

ii)

iii)

The Sword:

The Tarnhelm:
Todesverkündigung (melody of the intimation of death):

Urmotiv:

Walhall Motive:

a) 

b) 

c) 

d) 

Walkürenritt (Ride of the Valkyries):
Walküren War-cry:

The Wälsungen:

Wälsungenliebe (Wälsungen love theme):

Wälsungenweh (theme of the misery of the Wälsungen):

The Wanderer:
Weltbegrüßungsthema: (melody of Brünnhilde's greeting to the world):

Winterstürme melody:

The Woodbird:

a)

b)

Wurm (Serpent/Dragon):

i)

ii)

Vernichtungsarbeit (Motiv of Alberich's revenge):

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{Vernichtungsarbeit (Motiv of Alberich's revenge):} \\
\quad &
\end{align*}
\]
APPENDIX TWO

Classification of Motive according to consistency of tonality relationship.

i) Motive and Themen with a definite association with a particular key, but which do not appear exclusively in that key:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Motive</th>
<th>Key</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Blutbrüderschaft</td>
<td>D flat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curse</td>
<td>First note F sharp (also approximates)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fafner as dragon</td>
<td>C - F sharp</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Giants</td>
<td>C (single note)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gibichungen</td>
<td>B minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gutrune</td>
<td>G major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gibichungen Horn-Call</td>
<td>C major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Siegfried's Horn-Call</td>
<td>F major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Augmented Horn-Call</td>
<td>E flat major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mime's &quot;complaint&quot;</td>
<td>F minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mime's elation</td>
<td>First note A flat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rhinemaidens' song</td>
<td>A flat major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Servitude</td>
<td>B flat minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sword</td>
<td>C major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urmotiv</td>
<td>E flat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Walhall</td>
<td>D flat / E major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weltbegrüßung</td>
<td>C major</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Longer passages of music:

W/414

G/329-30 (Spear/oath combination)
ii) Motive and Themen which to all intents and purposes appear only in one key throughout the Ring:

- Erda: C sharp minor
- Forging song: D minor
- Hagen's "Hoi-Hoi!": D flat – C over F sharp bass
- Potion: First chord G-D sharp-C-G
- Renunciation: C minor
- Tarnhelm: First chord G sharp minor
- Walkürenritt: B minor
- Walküren War-cry: Augmented triad B-D sharp-G
- Winterstürme song: B flat major
- Woodbird texture: E major

Sections:
- R/566-70
- W/430
- W/437 f.
- G/370-71

iii) Motive and Themen which approximate to a particular pitch level:

- Atonement
- Götterdämmerung
- Murder
- Obligation
- Vernichtungsarbeit
- Wanderer chord sequence
- Wurm

Sections:
- W/348ff.
iv) Motive and Themen with no consistent key-association at all:

Abschied
Apples
Brooding
Brünnhilde as woman
Enticement
Fate
Freia/Woman
Fricka's anger
Frustration
Gold
Götternot
Hoard
Lebensfreude
Fire
"Love's enchantment"
Magic Sleep Motiv
Magic Sleep chord sequence
Norns
Redemption
Revenge
"Rheingold" song
Ring
Ritt
Sehnsucht
Siegfried
Siegfried/Brünnhilde love themes
Siegfried's love theme
Sieglinde
Siegmund
Smithing
Spear/Treaty
Todesverkündigung
Wälsungen
Wälsungenliebe
Wälsungenweh
APPENDIX THREE

The relationship between characters and tonality

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Character</th>
<th>Rheingold</th>
<th>Walküre</th>
<th>Siegfried</th>
<th>Götterdämmerung</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rhinemaidens</td>
<td>E flat</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>F major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alberich/</td>
<td>B flat</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>B flat</td>
<td>B flat minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nibelungen minor</td>
<td>minor</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fricka</td>
<td>(D minor)</td>
<td>C minor</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wotan</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Freia</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Froh</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Donner</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fasolt</td>
<td>F minor</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fafner</td>
<td>F minor</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>F minor</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loge</td>
<td>F sharp min./A major</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mime</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>B flat min.</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erda</td>
<td>C sharp minor</td>
<td>[C sharp minor</td>
<td>C sharp minor]</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Siegmund</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>(D minor)x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sieglinde</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hunding</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>(C minor)x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brünnhilde</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Walküren</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>B minor</td>
<td>[B minor]</td>
<td>[B minor]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Siegfried</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Woodbird</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>E major</td>
<td>[E major]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norns</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>E flat min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gibichungen</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>B minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gunther</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>B flat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gutrune</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>G major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hagen</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>(E flat min.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vassals</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>C minor</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

x indicates that the character is not concerned in that drama.
- indicates that no tonality relationship is established.
() indicate that the existence of a tonality relationship is debatable.
[ ] indicate that the influence of that character's tonality (established in a previous drama) is here strongly felt.
# APPENDIX FOUR

## The Periode structure of the Ring

### RHEINGOLD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sc.</th>
<th>Key</th>
<th>Scene</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>E flat major</td>
<td>Bottom of the Rhine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C major - minor</td>
<td>The Gold</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>D flat major</td>
<td>Walhall</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D minor</td>
<td>Fricka</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E minor</td>
<td>Freia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>F minor/major</td>
<td>Giants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D major/minor</td>
<td>Giants and Wotan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>F sharp minor</td>
<td>Loge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D major</td>
<td>Loge's narration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>F major</td>
<td>Giant's departure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E minor</td>
<td>Gods</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Sc. 3

- B flat minor | Nibelheim
- G minor | Wotan and Loge
- B flat minor | Alberich
- A minor | Alberich and Wotan
- F sharp minor/A major | Loge captures Alberich

### Sc. 4

- C major | Arrival at Walhall
- B flat minor | Arrival of the gold
- C major | The ring
- B minor | The curse
- C major | The gods
- C minor | Piling of the gold
- C sharp minor | Erda
- F minor | 2 Ring given to giants
- B minor | Fasolt's death
- C minor | Wotan and Fricka
- B flat major | Donner
- D flat major | Walhall

---

1 Lorenz does not mention a G minor Periode but includes this section in the B flat minor Periode.

2 Lorenz calls the whole of this passage a single E flat Periode.
### DIE WALKÜRE

**I**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sc. 1</th>
<th>D minor</th>
<th>Prelude</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D minor</td>
<td>Siegmund and Sieglinde</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sc. 2</th>
<th>C minor</th>
<th>Hunding</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>G minor</td>
<td>Siegmund's narration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A minor</td>
<td>The Neidings</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sc. 3</th>
<th>C major</th>
<th>Siegmund alone</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E minor</td>
<td>The sword in the tree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B flat major</td>
<td>Winterstürme song</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C major</td>
<td>The Wilsungen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>G major</td>
<td>Ecstatic climax</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**II**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sc. 1</th>
<th>A minor</th>
<th>Prelude</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B minor/D minor</td>
<td>Wotan and Brünnhilde</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C minor</td>
<td>Fricka - incest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>G sharp minor</td>
<td>Fricka - infidelity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A minor</td>
<td>Siegmund as the hero</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C minor</td>
<td>Fricka's exit</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sc. 2</th>
<th>B minor</th>
<th>Brünnhilde and Wotan</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A minor</td>
<td>Wotan's monologue 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A flat minor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A minor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A major</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A minor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C minor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A minor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sc. 3</th>
<th>B flat minor/C minor</th>
<th>Siegmund and Sieglinde</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sc. 4</th>
<th>F sharp minor</th>
<th>Todesverkündigung</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

---

1 Lorenz inserts a B flat major Periode prior to this one.
2 Lorenz called the whole of this passage a G major Periode.
3 Lorenz denoted this a D minor Periode.
4 Lorenz called this C major.
5 Lorenz called the whole of the monologue a single A minor Periode.
6 See p. 244
Sc. 5  
| G minor 1 | Siegmund and Sieglinde |
| D minor    | Siegmund's death |

III

Sc. 1  
| B minor | Walkürenritt |
| D minor | Brünnhilde |
| G major | Sieglinde |

Sc. 2  
| D minor | Arrival of Wotan |
| G minor | Wotan chastises Brünnhilde |
| F minor | Brünnhilde |
| G minor 2 | Statement of punishment |
| B minor | Walküren exit |

Sc. 3  
| E minor | Brünnhilde's pleading |
| A flat minor | Wotan unmoved |
| B minor/D major | Wotan moved |
| E major | Abschied |

SIEGFRIED

I

Sc. 1  
| B flat minor | Prelude |
| B flat minor | Mime |
| G major | Siegfried's arrival |
| G minor | Sword smashed (Transitional 3} |
| D minor | Mime's "complaint" |
| F minor | Siegfried's hatred |
| D minor-major | Mime's narration |
| G minor | Siegfried demands to know of parents |
| F minor | Mime's narration |
| B flat major | Siegfried's exit |
| B flat minor | Mime alone |

Sc. 2  
| C major | Wanderer's arrival |
| E minor | First question and answer |
| F minor | second |
| D flat major | third |
| F minor | Mime's turn |
| A minor | First question and answer |
| F minor | second |
| B flat minor | third |
| C major | Wanderer's exit |

1 Lorenz denoted this as D minor
2 Lorenz called this F minor
3 See pp.290-1
4 Lorenz structured this differently. See pp.291-8
5 Lorenz called the whole of this passage a C major Periode. See p.304
6 Lorenz called the whole of this passage an F minor Periode. See p.304
Sc. 3
C minor
G minor
G major/E minor
E minor
D minor
D major
F major
D major

Mime alone
Siegfried's arrival
Fear
Filing of sword
First sword song
Mime brews poison
Second sword song
Siegfried and Mime together

II

Sc. 1
F minor
B minor
F minor
F major
F minor

Prelude
Alberich
Wotan and Alberich
Wotan renounces the ring
Fafner
Wotan's exit

Sc. 2
D minor
E minor
F major
F minor
E major

Mime and Siegfried
Woodbird
Siegfried and Fafner
Fafner's death
Woodbird

Sc. 3
B flat minor
E minor
E major
D major
B minor
E minor
E major

Mime and Alberich
Woodbird
Mime and Siegfried
Mime and Fafner put in the cave
Siegfried alone
Woodbird tells of Brünnhilde

III

Sc. 1
G minor
G minor
G minor/C sharp minor
E flat major
G minor-major

Prelude
Erda summoned
Erda replies
Brünnhilde
Erda dismissed

Sc. 2
E flat major
F minor

Siegfried and Wotan
Wotan's anger

1 Lorenz combined these to a single E minor Periode.
2 Lorenz combined these three to a single F major Periode.
3 This Periode contains continuous key-movement, far more so than in any previous Periode in the Ring. Lorenz placed it in A flat major/minor.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sc. 3</th>
<th>F major – E major</th>
<th>Journey through the fire</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E minor</td>
<td>Siegfried undresses Brünnhilde</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C major</td>
<td>Brünnhilde awakes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E flat major/C minor</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Brünnhilde afraid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E minor/major</td>
<td>&quot;Idyll&quot; music</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A flat major</td>
<td>Siegfried overcomes Brünnhilde's fears</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C major 2</td>
<td>Final duet</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**GÖTTERDÄMMERUNG**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vorspiel</th>
<th>E flat minor 3</th>
<th>Prelude</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E flat minor 4</td>
<td>Norns' scene</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E flat major</td>
<td>Brünnhilde and Siegfried</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E flat – F – A –</td>
<td>Rhine journey</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**I**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sc. 1</th>
<th>B minor-major</th>
<th>Gibichungen</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B major-minor</td>
<td>Gunther's wife</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>G minor – B minor</td>
<td>The Potion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B minor 5</td>
<td>Siegfried's arrival</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sc. 2</td>
<td>B flat major</td>
<td>Siegfried and Gunther</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>G major</td>
<td>Gutrune</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B minor</td>
<td>Brünnhilde</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B flat major</td>
<td>Blutbrüderschaft</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E flat minor</td>
<td>Hagen's Wachtgesang</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sc. 3</th>
<th>B minor</th>
<th>Waltraute's arrival</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C minor/E flat major</td>
<td>Brünnhilde</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Transition to</td>
<td>Waltraute's conversation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>F sharp minor</td>
<td>Waltraute's narration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>F sharp minor</td>
<td>Brünnhilde's reply</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>F sharp minor</td>
<td>Waltraute's exit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B minor</td>
<td>Arrival of Siegfried=Gunther</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**II**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sc. 1</th>
<th>B flat minor</th>
<th>Alberich and Hagen</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sc. 2</td>
<td>B flat major</td>
<td>Interlude and Siegfried's arrival</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>G major</td>
<td>Gutrune</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

1. Again a tonally complex *Periode*. It is centred on E flat although that key only appears occasionally and incidentally.

2. A long *Periode* with a central sub-section in B.

3. A long, tonally complex, *Periode*.

4. A long *Periode*.

5. Lorenz denoted this B flat major.
Sc. 3  
| C minor | Vassals |

Sc. 4  
| B flat major | Gunther's arrival |
| C minor 1 | The ring on Siegfried's hand |
| C minor-major 2 | Siegfried and Brünnhilde argue |
| E flat major/C major | Oath swearing |
| C major | Wedding music |

Sc. 5  
| C minor 3 | Vengeance Scene |

III  

Sc. 1  
| F major | Rhinemaidens |
| F major | Siegfried's arrival and taunting |
| Transition to | |
| F minor | Siegfried offers ring |
| F minor | Siegfried to die |
| F major | Rhinemaidens |

Sc. 2  
| A major 4 | Arrival of the hunt |
| G minor | Siegfried's narration I |
| A major | Narration II and death |

Sc. 3  
| C minor | Trauermusik |
| C minor-major | Gutrune |

Sc. 4  
| ? 5 (ending D flat) | Immolation Scene |

---

1 Lorenz split this into two Periode, in B flat minor and D minor respectively.
2 Lorenz placed an additional Periode here in E flat minor.
3 Within this C minor there is considerable complexity.
4 Lorenz precedes this with a D major Periode.
5 In the whole of Götterdämmerung it is extraordinarily difficult to discern the Periode structure (in dichterisch-musikalische rather than Lorenz's terms). This is illustrated in the problems of nomenclature indicated in these footnotes.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

G. Abraham          A hundred years of music (London 1938)
H.G. Atkins          A history of German versification (London 1923)
C.C. Barber          Old High German Reader (Oxford 1951)
Herbert Barth (Ed.)  Internationale Wagner Bibliographie 1945–55 (Bayreuth 1956)
                     Internationale Wagner Bibliographie 1956–60 (Bayreuth 1961)
Henrik Barth (Ed.)   Internationale Wagner Bibliographie 1961–66 (Bayreuth 1968)
D. Cooke             The language of music (London 1959)
C. Dahlhaus (Ed.)    Das Drama Richard Wagners als musikalisches Kunstwerk. (Regensburg 1970)
                     Richard Wagner - Werk und Wirkung (Regensburg 1971)
Wagner's Konzeption des musikalischen Dramas (Regensburg 1971)
H. Denecke           'Versuch einer Geschichte des deutschen Verses und seiner Umbildung durch Richard Wagner'; Bayreuther Blätter 1896
A.E.F. Dickinson     'The structural methods of the Ring'; Monthly Musical Record, May/June 1954
                     The musical design of the 'Ring' (London 1926)
R. Donington        Wagner's 'Ring' and its symbols (London 1963)
C. V. Ehrenfels      'Die musikalische Architektonik'; Bayreuther Blätter 1896
Richard Wagner — Versuch einer Würdigung  
(Frankfurt 1963)


Tonality and musical structure (London 1970)

Die sagengeschichtlichen Grundlagen der Ring- 
dichtung Richard Wagners  (Berlin 1902)

Richard Wagner — the man, his mind and his 
music  (London 1968)

Musical criticisms 1846–99. Translated and 
edited by Henry Pleasants  (London 1953)

Richard Wagner und der Stabreim  (Leipzig 1883)

Deutsche Vers-Geschichte 3 Bände (Berlin 1956)

Wagner  (London 1953)

Rhythmus und Sprache im deutschen Gedicht  
(Stuttgart 1966)

Opera as Drama  (New York 1952)

Deutsche Literaturgeschichte 2 Bände  (Fünfund- 
dreissigste Auflage, Leipzig 1922)

Romantische Harmonik und ihre Krise in Wagners  
Tristan'  (Bern, Leipzig 1920)

Das Geheimnis der Form bei Richard Wagner  
4 Bände  (Berlin 1924-33; reprint Tübingen 1966)

Wagner und unsere Zeit: Aufsätze, Betrachtungen 
und Briefe herausgegeben von Erika Mann.  
(Frankfurt 1963)

Wagner in Selbstzeugnissen und Bilddokumenten  
(Hamburg 1959)

Erinnerungen an Richard Wagner  (Leipzig 1907)

The Life of Richard Wagner 4 Vols.  (New 
York 1933-46; reprint 1966)

A study of Wagner  (London 1899)

Wagner as man and artist  (London 1914)

Wagner Nights  (London 1949)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Work</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>K. Overhoff</td>
<td>Die Musikdramen Richard Wagners – eine thematisch-musikalische Interpretation (Salzburg 1967)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P. Piper</td>
<td>Die älteste deutsche Litteratur bis zum 1050 (Berlin n.d.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H. Porges</td>
<td>Die Bühnenproben zu den Bayreuther Festspielen des Jahres 1876 (Chemnitz 1881)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H. Scharschuch</td>
<td>Gesamtaanalyse der Harmonik von Richard Wagners Musikdrama 'Tristan und Isolde' (Regensburg 1963)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Schopenhauer</td>
<td>Die Welt als Wille und Vorstellung (Sämtliche Werke Bände I, II) (München 1924)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Seidl</td>
<td>Wagneriana 3 Bände (Berlin 1901–2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G.B. Shaw</td>
<td>The perfect Wagnerite (London 1908)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Simrock</td>
<td>Das Heldenbuch 6 Bände (Stuttgart, various dates)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H. von Stein</td>
<td>Dichtung und Musik im Werke Richard Wagners (Berlin 1962)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O. Strobel</td>
<td>'Die Kompositionsskizzen zum Ring des Nibelungen'; Bayreuther Festspielführer 1930</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W. Tappert (Ed.)</td>
<td>Wörterbuch der Unhöflichkeit: Richard Wagner im Spiegel der zeitgenössischen Kritik (München 1967)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D.F. Tovey</td>
<td>Musical Textures (London 1941)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Beethoven (London 1944)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Musical articles in the Encyclopaedia Britannica (London 1944)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Essays and lectures on music (London 1949)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M. Vogel</td>
<td>Der 'Tristan-Akkord' und die Krise der modernen Harmonielehre (Düsseldorf 1962)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Voss</td>
<td>Studien zur Instrumentation Richard Wagners (Regensburg 1970)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cosima Wagner</td>
<td>'Aussprüche des Meisters aus den Tagebüchern der Meisterin'; Bayreuther Blätter 1936, 1937, 1938</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mein Leben 2 Bände (München 1911)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Gesammelte Schriften und Dichtungen 14 Bände herausgegeben von Julius Kapp (Leipzig n.d.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Richard Wagner an Minna Wagner</td>
<td>2 Bände (Berlin 1908)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Richard Wagner an Mathilde Wesendonk 1853–71</td>
<td>(Berlin 1908)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Briefe Richard Wagners an Otto Wesendonk</td>
<td>1852–70 (Berlin 1905)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>König Ludwig und Richard Wagner: Briefwechsel</td>
<td>5 Bände (Karlsruhe 1936)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Briefwechsel zwischen Wagner und Liszt</td>
<td>2 Bände (Leipzig 1887)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Familienbriefe von Richard Wagner</td>
<td>(Berlin 1907)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Richard Wagner an seine Künstler</td>
<td>(Berlin 1908)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Richard Wagner an Freunde und Zeitgenossen</td>
<td>(Berlin 1909)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Briefe an Hans Richter</td>
<td>(Berlin 1924)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Briefe an Hans von Bülow</td>
<td>(Jena 1916)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Richard Wagners Briefe an T. Uhlig, W. Fischer und F. Heine</td>
<td>(Leipzig 1888)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Richard Wagner an August Röckel</td>
<td>(Leipzig 1912)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Richard Wagners Briefwechsel mit seinen Verlegern</td>
<td>2 Bände (Wiesbaden 1971)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wagner und Nietzsche zur Zeit ihrer Freundschaft herausgegeben von E. Förster-Nietzsche (München 1931)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The letters of Wagner to Anton Pusinelli 
translated and edited by E. Lenrow (New 
York 1932)

The Burrell Collection of letters (London 
1951)

Richard Wagners Briefe ausgewählt und 
erlautert von W. Altmann 2 Bände (Leipzig n.d.)

C. von Westernhagen

'Die Kompositionskizze zu Siegfrieds Tod 
aus dem Jahre 1850'; Neue Zeitschrift für 
Musik, May 1963

'Die vier Fassungen des symphonischen Schluss-
satzes der Götterdämmerung'; Neue Zeitschrift 
für Musik, July 1972

Vom Holländer zum Parsifal: Neue Wagner-
Studien (Zürich 1962)

H. Weissner

Der Stabreimvers in Richard Wagners 'Ring des Nibelungen' (Berlin 1924)

G. Whitehouse

A short history of German literature 
(London 1942)

H. von Wolzogen

Poetische Lautsymbolik, psychische Wirkungen 
der Sprachleute im Stabreime aus Richard 
Wagners 'Der Ring des Nibelungen' (Leipzig 
1876)

'Über Lautsymbolik und Stabreim'; Bayreuther 
Blätter 1890

Thematischer Leitfaden durch die Musik zu 
Richard Wagners Festspiel 'Der Ring des 
Nibelungen' (Leipzig 1876)
I would particularly like to thank the following for their assistance in the preparation of this dissertation:

Frau Gertrud Strobel, Richard-Wagner-Archiv, Bayreuth
Dr. Joachim Bergfeld, Richard Wagner Gedenkstätte, Bayreuth
Dr. Peter Williams, University of Edinburgh
Professor William Mathias, University College of North Wales, Bangor
Deutscher Akademischer Austauschdienst, Bonn
Dr. Curt von Westernhagen, Hamburg
Michael Anderson, Reid Music Library, University of Edinburgh
Universitätsbibliothek, Freie Universität, Berlin
Universitätsbibliothek, Göttingen
Universitätsbibliothek, Würzburg
Dr. Hugh Ridley, German Department, University of Kent
Ken Trueman
Kay Laing
Daphne Philo
## Calendar Showing the Dates of the Poems, Kompositionsskizzen, Orchesterskizzen and Partiturschriften of the Ring Dramas

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Poem</th>
<th>K.S.</th>
<th>O.S.</th>
<th>P.S.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Siegfrieds Tod</td>
<td>1848</td>
<td>1850</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Junger Siegfried</td>
<td>1851</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rheingold</td>
<td>1852</td>
<td>1853-4</td>
<td>1854</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Die Walküre</td>
<td>1852</td>
<td>1854</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Siegfried</td>
<td>1852</td>
<td>Acts I &amp; II</td>
<td>Act I</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1856-7</td>
<td>1856-7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*(Tristan und Isolde written between 1857 & 1859)*

*(Die Meistersinger written between 1862 & 1867)*

<p>| | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Act II</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1864-5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Act III</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1869</td>
<td>1869</td>
<td>1869-71</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Götterdämmerung     | 1852   | 1869-72 | 1870-72 | 1873-74 |

*(Parsifal written between 1877 & 1882)*