THE CONTRIBUTION OF SCOTTISH MISSIONS TO THE RISE OF RESPONSIBLE CHURCHES IN INDIA

by

James McMichael Orr, B.D.

Thesis presented for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy of the University of Edinburgh in the Faculty of Divinity 1967

Volume II Pages 420 - 759
CHAPTER X.

THE CHURCH IN THE PUNJAB.

Of the racial groups which in turn invaded and made themselves masters of India, the British alone were maritime traders who established themselves at the great ports and then proceeded to extend their dominion inland. Earlier invasions had all approached by land over the passes of the North and it was the fertile plains of the Punjab, the land of the five rivers, which had proved to be the key to the sub-continent. In the tracks of the original Aryan invaders had come Alexander with his Greek veterans, then the Tartars, the Moguls and the Afghans. And when, towards the middle of the 19th Century, Britain's military strength and skill had ousted her European rivals and gone on to extend her empire beyond the three maritime provinces, it was in the Punjab again, a vast stretch of country occupying a tenth of the country's area and containing a tenth of its population, that the crucial struggle for supremacy was fought and won. The gateway to India had shifted to Bombay, but these central plains were still the key to control over the country.

Well before European traders or missionaries appeared on the scene, the military and political importance of the Punjab led to the building up of British army cantonments and it was a legacy from a Captain Murray, a Scottish Officer who had been stationed in Sialkot, a military frontier post, which provided the Church of Scotland with the capital to open there a Mission whose first intention was to work among the Sikhs.

The Mission's founder, the Rev. Thomas Hunter, made the tedious three-month's journey up from Bombay, where he had been teaching for nine months in the Assembly's Institution, taking with him his wife, their small child and one of his own converts, a former Muslim called Mohamet Ismael.

A few months later while he was still in the early stages of learning the language, the Mutiny broke out and he and his family were killed, the Mission's sole Indian worker being rescued and taken to shelter in a nearby village, later to make his way back to Bombay.
To the Church of Scotland this was a challenge too great to be ignored and four years later Hunter's place was being filled by two more ordained missionaries, accompanied again by Mohammet Ismael. Educationally a backword province, the Punjab was then as now the home of some of the most virile of all the Indian peoples, while its history of conquests and immigrations made it a melting pot of races, languages and religions. From its soil had sprung both the ancient Vedic rituals and the Buddhism of Asoka; it had seen centuries of Muslim rule and was the birthplace of the Sikh religion. While Hindi or Persian were spoken by the more cultured townsmen, the lingua franca was Hindustani or Urdu, a mixture of Hindi and Arabic, and many villagers understood nothing but their own Punjabi dialect. After the Mutiny, an area consisting of roughly half the province came to be administered directly under the British Crown while the remainder, consisting of 36 Native States of varying size, continued to be ruled with a fair degree of independence by hereditary rajahs, some of whom were Hindus, some Muslims and some Sikhs. To add to the happy confusion, the Northern section of the population included large numbers of aboriginals who after 3,000 years of oppression still stubbornly maintained a simple animistic faith and held to customs and beliefs quite distinct from the practices of their neighbours. Universally regarded as outcasts, these Chuhras, Mehs and Chamars were to become the backbone of the Christian Church, the foundations of which were now to be laid by American Presbyterians, the Church Missionary Society and the Church of Scotland. With all their differences of race and religion, the people of the Punjab possess certain characteristics in common. Aggressive and conservative in their outlook, but open-handed and full of energy, humour and resource, they showed a readiness to meet Europeans on an equal footing, even the outcast communities showing innate vigour and resource. (1)

NOTES.

1) See General Sources.
The Mission's Centenary Booklet divides the history of the Punjab Church into three periods, of which the second, covering the expansion and development of women's work, overlaps the first and the third. Adopting this historical division, we can look on the years 1857 to 1884 as those in which centres were founded and established; on the period 1885 to 1930 as concerned with the development of institutions and the emergence of national leadership; and on the years from 1930 onwards as the story of the integrated Church. (2).

1860 – 1884.

One expected obstacle standing in the way of the two missionaries who travelled out to resume work at Sialkot was a memorial sent by the American U.P. Mission already established in the city, to the effect that the Church of Scotland should not return to that area. The Church of Scotland did not accede to the request, but as a result in the early years there was a certain amount of overlapping and even rivalry between the two Missions, until adjustments were made and the field redivided. (3). From the Indian people themselves, there seems to have been little of the opposition one might expect from minorities long accustomed to having to maintain their position. The diversities of religion and race represented in the Punjab certainly presented a problem in the wide knowledge of language and custom required of the missionary. But the constant rubbing of shoulders with people of other faiths had produced an unusual spirit of tolerance and it was seldom that Christian preaching failed to get a fair hearing, though conversion to Christianity was often followed by persecution. Yet even this form of opposition was due to ignorance rather than deliberate malice. (4).

It was among the sturdy farmers and their labourers that John Taylor and Robert Paterson, Hunter's successors, hoped to sow the seed of the Gospel. Taylor "dreamed of a wide-spread system of village evangelisation, in which numerous centres were to be established, each with a resident catechist who, mingling with the people/
people in the affairs and interests of their everyday life and work, was
by his teaching and example to wean them from blind ignorance and prejudice and make
known to them the Gospel of the Eternal Son of God." (5).

With this object in view, work was developed for a quarter of a century
along the normal patterns for a rural Mission. Schools were opened in Sialkot and
evangelistic tours penetrated into the surrounding villages, of which there were over
2,000 to choose from. A tract of land was purchased on which were settled nine Meng
families. Not Christians as yet, they were "favourable to Christianity" and by this
attempt to shield them from the rapacity of the Zemindars and at the same time "foster
a spirit of independence and habits of industry" it was hoped to lay, on land bought
near the Hunter Memorial Church, the foundation of a Christian village.

The Hunter Memorial Church, a striking little building, which held 200
worshippers, was dedicated in 1865 and four years later Mohammet Ismael was ordained
as its first native pastor. With 55 Communicant Members after only 9 years work, a
fine building and a pastor of their own, the Sialkot Church could claim to have got
off to a promising start. And while the initiative and the funds had come from the
Mission, already there was a firm move towards self-support, congregational offerings
coming to about £1 a month. "Small as this is", runs a contemporary report, "the
principle of self-support is regarded as just and members are led to feel that they
are not merely component parts of an Institution supported by European influence, but
rather a real brotherhood whose interests are identical with all sections of the Holy
Catholic Church". (6) Ten years later however, their progress was not so promising.
Their pastor had almost immediately been moved to another district, leaving a missionary
as Moderator, Communicant membership had only risen by four and the building was found to
be inconveniently situated for worship. Elders and deacons had been set apart, but it
being evident that they were still too weak to support a minister on their own, efforts
were now being made to raise an endowment fund. (7).

NOTES.

(5) H.F.L. Taylor op. cit., p.27.
(7) Ibid., 1879, p.5.
Apparently there was some difference of opinion on this project. There were those among both missionaries and Indian leaders who held firmly that no church could grow strong so long as it took money from Western sources. But the Church Missionary Society had overcome the problem of self-support among city congregations by a wide use of the endowment method and in Sialkot it was decided to follow suit. (8)

The failure of the tenants at the model village to develop their land and a spirit of independance was part of the trouble, and for a time plots were handed over to non-Christians. "It is sad to think that there is no prospect of (the Hunter Memorial Church) ever becoming useful to our native congregation", was the verdict in 1873. But once more Christian tenants were given portions, "Hunterpur" village sprang up, and by 1885 Dr. Youngson was writing hopefully, "We ought not to rest content until we have a Christian village round the Church and a church-going bell calling the villagers every sabbath to prayer". The pattern which emerged was to prove rather different from what he had envisaged, and it was Christian townsmen rather than village farmers who eventually filled the Church on Sundays. But in essence his wish was fulfilled and the Memorial Church became the centre of a flourishing congregation. (9).

At the same time, the Mission was reaching out into the country districts. A Punjabi-speaking catechist was established and gaining the esteem of villagers 23 miles away; two others were working in still more distant villages, and arrangements were being made to occupy three key townships each 16 miles from Sialkot — Pasur, Gondal and Somrayal. (10). Converts were not numerous but there was a growing hope that when the harvest came, it would come in the form of communities rather than individuals. Only a few years later a farmer was converted in a village near Somrayal in the American Mission's area, who brought into the Church fifty of his own family and neighbours, seeking no help from the Mission. This was regarded as the ideal to be worked and prayed for.

NOTES.
(9) Church of Scotland Report, 1869, p.15.
We want independence among our native Christians and such an example proves that such is now possible in this part of India — at least among the peasant classes in some districts." (11)

During the early 1860’s, visits were also paid to Wazirabad, about 30 miles to the West of Sialkot, and to Gujrat, which lies North of Wazirabad and on the Northern side of the Chenab River. The latter town was formally opened as a Mission Station in 1865 and work was extended to Jalalpur, Dingah, Davlatnagar and Chilianwala. Mohammed Ismael was placed in charge of these two districts until his death in 1875. By 1880, the Christian Community in Gujrat numbered about 40 adherents, half of these being children, but there had been one notable baptism in the person of a Sikh, Kedar Singh, a landowner of noble descent who held office of Tahsildar, or district officer, and was a man of considerable influence and prestige. (12)

A separate but parallel venture was the Mission in Chamba, an inaccessible and predominantly Hindu State in the hills adjacent to Kashmir. The Mission had been opened in 1863 by the Rev. William Ferguson, an army chaplain, and began as an independent effort, the Church of Scotland regretting that for lack of funds it could not support him. But ten years later it was taken over by the Church of Scotland, and is of particular interest as a valiant attempt to work on apostolic lines.

Ferguson himself was a man of strong character who held distinctive views about missionary methods and aims. A rolling stone, he had taught in the Assembly’s Institution at Bombay, served as a chaplain in the Crimea, led a 'Mission' in the Edinburgh Grassmarket and marched with the 79th Highlanders to the relief of Lucknow. After attending a Missionary Conference at Lahore, he had resolved, against the protests of his friends, to commit the 'consummate folly' of throwing in his lot with the missionaries. (13).

NOTES.

(11) Ibid 1875, p.3.
(12) Ibid 1879, p.15.
His approach was nothing if not original. Clad in his pulpit robes, he preached the Gospel message through a speaking trumpet in the bazaars of the capital, proclaiming a text and waiting for it to be translated by two catechists into Hindi and then Hindustani. The Rajah of Chamba, while remaining a Hindu, was deeply impressed by him as a holy man, or Christian fakir. He renounced idolatry and gave the Mission every assistance, presenting it with a site and allowing his citizens freedom to embrace Christianity without loss of their rights.

As individualist, but a far-sighted one, Ferguson was able to give a clear outline of the principles on which he believed a rural Mission should be run. They can be summarised as follows:

The simple story of the Gospel can be understood by people, and the missionary's chief office is preaching the Word.

The ability to read is desirable but it is not necessary to give intellectual enlightenment first.

European interference with social customs greatly increases the weight of the cross which all native converts to Christ have to bear: "It should be left to the solvent powers of Christianity to bring about changes which, however desirable, would be ill-timed and burdensome if introduced at present."

The national Church should be as far as possible self-supporting from the beginning. Too much use of Mission money demoralises.(14)

The Church of which Ferguson was the founder was thus encouraged from the start to express itself in indigenous ways. Services of worship were highly informal, the catechist giving instruction and members of the congregation breaking in to ask questions and offer comments. Simple Christian truths were repeated and re-repeated in everyday language. There was a conscious attempt to take Pauline rather than Scottish churches as a model. "In all things bearing on the Christian life and society, strict care is taken not to engrat on Orientals notions /

\[\] \begin{notes}
\(\text{(14) Occasional Paper, 1872, p.4.}\)
/notions and customs that have originated among Western Churches — but to follow as closely as possible the models of the New Testament." (15)

Emphasis was laid on the need to organise an actual Christian society at the earliest date, in contra-distinction to a mere visiting and preaching agency. Christianity was seen as a social religion, a fellowship. "We need not merely the Gospel but the Church — we must not only make converts but found churches" (16)

While few other missionaries of the period would have wished to criticise such a statement, nevertheless the emphasis was unusual, and is far more typical of a Twentieth Century outlook than that of the Nineteenth.

While Ferguson relied, like other missionaries, on trained catechists paid by the Mission to carry out evangelistic work in the hill villages, he was firmly of the opinion that the most effective means of propagating the Gospel was by neighbour to neighbour. "The best and most effective agency," he wrote, "was the influence of every member on his immediate surroundings. In point of fact, this is how our converts increased in Chamba. I am not aware of having been directly the means of bringing in a single soul." (17)

He quickly set up a separate native church organisation. A group of 4 "pirs" or presbyters, were elected and conducted services of worship in rotation (18), and nine years after the start of the Mission the entire management of the congregation's affairs was handed over to them. "The Mission and the Church are now separate", declared Ferguson, and for the next eight months he purposely absented himself from church business. (19)

NOTES.

(15) Church of Scotland Report, 1868, pp.5-6.
(18) Church of Scotland Report 1875, p.74. "Pir" is a Moslem religious term which Ferguson adopted for Christian use, and denotes a holy man or spiritual guide. While the Hindu words "saddhu" and "Guru" have found a somewhat uneasy place in Indian Christian thought, "pir" has dropped out entirely. This is possibly because so many of the original pirs were immoral charlatans who made a living by playing on the superstitions of simple people.

It was a brave and practical testing out of his personal belief that "an organised native church, well taught in the Gospel, spiritual, zealous and wisely led — greatly surpasses the efforts of a number of foreigners, however powerful they may be." (20)

In ten years of work, Ferguson baptised a total of 170 persons, but the subsequent history of Qhamba Church was for many years an unhappy one. One of the four ordained "pirs", a Sohan Lal, a Brahmin convert of the priestly class, continued as a faithful church leader and was later ordained to the ministry, completing before his death fifty years of service. But among other leaders and elders there was much back-sliding. One elder was put under discipline for introducing Hindu customs at his daughter's wedding, another removed from the roll for leaving his wife and taking a heathen girl. (21) Some Christians managed to stand out against heathen customs, and Sohan Lal's wife showed initiative by opening a small house-school for women and girls. (22) But although it was never suggested that there be any modification of the infant church's independent status, the spiritual state of the community, especially among isolated families in the hill villages, and their lack of missionary spirit, gave Ferguson's successor, the medical missionary Dr. Hutchison, cause for deep concern. "Everything depends on the spiritual life of the Church in its separate and independent existence and organisation" he wrote. "The preaching of the foreign missionary, or even of the paid agent, will be productive of but meagre results so long as the Church does not stand forth as a living witness to the truth. — Our great endeavour, therefore, is to encourage in every way the internal growth of the Church in her connected corporate capacity, in order that she may become both selfexisting, self-propagating, and in no way dependent on the presence of the Mission." (23)

By 1880, after a falling back due to lapses from Christian practice, the number of communicants had risen from 35 to 62, quite a few of these being apostasised Christians who had now been restored to the roll. And a year later there were nine heathen baptisms. Some of those were inmates of the little Leper Asylum set up by the Rev. Wellesley Bailey, who later became Founder and Superintendent of the Mission to Lepers. (24.)

**NOTES.**

(20) Occasional Paper 1870, p.10
(21) Church of Scotland report 1876, p.24.
(22) Ibid. 1877, p.27.
(23) Ibid. 1878, p.75.
(24) C.F. L. Nov. 1879, p.94.
But not for another half-century, till the late 1920's, were there any noticeable signs of outward growth.

The immediate causes of the retrogression appear more or less as Dr. Hewat suggests — namely that the rate of advance had been too speedy: too much had depended on the fiery energy of one unconventional pioneer: the few caste converts had found it too difficult to withstand the pressure put on them by their relatives: while the body of the Christian community, who were low caste Chamars or leather-workers, lacked the moral fibre to go it alone. (25)

We can take the Chamba Mission as an example of an attempt to break with contemporary mission policy and follow a New Testament pattern under Indian conditions and leave further consideration of its lessons to a concluding chapter.

By 1884, with 24 years of work behind them the Mission as a whole had gathered a Christian community which was variously estimated as between 170 and 185 souls. At least a quarter of these would be paid workers and their families. There was one native pastor — Sohan Lal of Chamba, 10 or 12 Catechists and colporteurs, and 10 schools with a total of about 1600 pupils. (26) The pattern was a familiar one and in terms of statistics not particularly encouraging.

1885 – 1930.

This period is described in the Mission's Centenary booklet as one during which institutions were developed and national leadership emerged. It was also the period of the Church's most rapid growth. The milestone marking its beginning was the contagion of the movement towards Christianity among aboriginal peoples which was already on foot in the American United Presbyterian Mission's area.

Notes.

(25) Hewat, p.118.
(26) Church of Scotland Report, 1885, statistics.
The seed had been sown by one of those colourful and all too rare figures in Indian Church history, a sadhu Jawahir Masih (Jewel of Christ), who was the first native preacher to be supported by the Church and accompanied Ferguson to Chamba. Described as having a character of Nathaniel-like purity and simplicity, he finally set off on a voluntary missionary pilgrimage into the mountains of Kashmir and was not heard of again. Earlier on, while preaching in the villages round Sialkot, Jawahir Masih had been the first to lead to Christian conviction a large group of Megs from a single village and, while persecution thinned their numbers, it proved to be a sign of the times. (27)

In the Scottish Mission area, the catechist at Daska reported that the Chuhras of several village were clamouring for instruction and the first trickle of the flood appeared when in 1885 five casteless men from Amoutrah village were baptised in Sialkot. While they might be despised by their neighbours, they were by no means destitute or unintelligent. One of them, a weaver, could read, and of the others one was a "banker" and another a tanner. Before the year had ended, another twentyfour from their village were baptised at an open-air Service in Amoutrah itself before the eyes of their Mohammedan neighbours. In the course of the next three years, Sialkot district recorded respective totals of 460, 666 and 568 baptisms, until by the time a decade had passed the Christian community had reached the 5,000 mark. (28)

The character of this rapidly expanding Church showed an encouraging spirit of independence which the missionaries did all in their power to foster. "It must be kept in mind", wrote Youngson, "that these people who have now turned to the Saviour were not an abject and weak race, small of stature and weak of intellect, despised and despicable, but in reality a tall and stalwart tribe, intellectually capable of as much as others more favoured, albeit ignorant and subject." (29)

NOTES

(27) Youngson, op.cit., pp. 254-257
(29) Ibid., p. 260
While from the movement there was some local persecution and at Amoutrah the well was seized, the new Christian community proved themselves quite capable of regaining possession and set about building their own church hard by. (30)

Obviously the primary need, in such a situation, was not that of providing support but of giving adequate instruction to the new converts and supplying them with teachers and pastors. In their attempts to meet this need, missionary leaders showed originality and an ability to adapt to circumstances.

"The organisation of the churches will now fully occupy our attention", wrote Youngson in 1886 (31) and it was a task to which he applied himself with typical foresight and energy. Sanction was obtained from the Presbytery to ordain elders in five villages. Ten families were settled in Hunterpur with the Rev. Tahal Singh as their pastor. The Daska catechist, Nathan Lal, in whose district the mass movement had started, was also ordained to combine care of the churches with evangelistic work. A mud house was built at Daska and became "The School of the Prophets", with 16 young men enrolled for training as catechists and possibly future pastors. A year later the number of students had risen to thirty. And schools began to multiply in the outlying villages. (32) Yet throughout this period of intense activity, a firm hold was kept of the ends in view and of the immediate need to cater for large numbers of new converts and sometimes even larger numbers of catechumens without permitting essential Christian standards to be lowered.

In the circumstances, education was seen less as an evangelistic arm and more as an agency for raising the spirit of the Church. The School of the Prophets, which a few years later took English into its curriculum, was then opened also to non-Christian pupils and eventually became a High School. But with the addition of a hostel for Christian boys, the original intention of keeping it as a Christian training centre was maintained. The Girls' /

NOTES

(30) Ibid., p.283
(31) C. of S. Report, 1886, p.4
(32) Ibid., 1886, p.p. 4.
Boarding School started in Sialkot in 1892 did parallel work for the training of Christian girls. And within a few years other schools offering higher education to both boys and girls were running successfully in Gujrat, Wazirabad and Chamba. Many of the small village schools were closed after a few years of life due to lack of qualified staff. But an attempt was always made to supply elementary education where there were Christian families in any number, and by the end of the century somewhere between 70 and 80 schools throughout the area were catering for nearly 3,000 pupils, perhaps one third of whom would be Christian children.

Simultaneously, efforts were made to supply leaders for village communities and establish John Taylor's dream of established resident catechists. Nathu Mal was ordained to build up the church round Daska. Tahal Singh was taken from school work, and as pastor of the Hunter Memorial was also placed in charge of evangelistic work for the Northern section of Sialkot district. Hakim Singh, whose direct, pithy speech was a constant source of surprise and delight to his companions — "arguing with Hindus and Muslims is like weighing live frogs" was one of his often quoted phrases — was ordained and put in charge of Wazirabad. Thakur Das, a layman, was stationed at Sambrial and appointed superintend Sialkot district schools. The male missionaries, all of whom were engaged in district work, spent the winter months on tour teaching catechumens and strengthening the raw but steadily growing communities, while the task of evangelism was left to Indian workers and the new converts themselves. With them worked other full-time employees such as Didar Singh, John Daniel and Benjamin of Daska, pastors S.S. Mark and K.D. Lazarus, all of whose names are still affectionately remembered in local circles.

As was inevitable when the spate of enquirers and converts continued /

NOTES

(33) "One hundred Years of Growth", pp. 11 and 6
(34) C. of S. Report, 1903, p.141
(35) "One Hundred Years of Growth", p.8
over the century, instruction in the essentials of Christian truth and living became the most pressing problem. "Scores of villagers would become Christians if we could teach them", wrote the Sialkot missionary in 1903. (36) Christians in the Sialkot area, who in 1885 numbered 70, had within sixteen years risen to nearly 2,500. And while the number of baptisms that year was only 72, there were 400 catechumens still under instruction. (37) Jamrau, the same year, had 205 baptised Christians and 100 receiving preparation. (38) As one might expect, the proportion of communicants was very low — only 82 in Daska out of nearly 1,200. (39) Only in Chamba and at the newly opened medical outpost of Jalalpur were numbers not proving an embarrassment.

Yet on two points Mission policy remained firm. Illiterate though most converts still were, the standard of entry into the Christian fold must not be set too low; and principles of independence and stewardship must be taught from the beginning.

From reports of a Conference held at Sialkot in 1897, it is evident that the Mission's standards were higher than those of other Missions, including American Presbyterian neighbours. For one other Mission, ability to say the Decalogue and the Apostle's Creed was reckoned sufficient and the Rev. Tahal Singh appears to have concurred with this simplified qualification. Pastor Hakim Singh of Daska thought that the Decalogue and the Lord's Prayer, with a general knowledge of the life of Christ and the origin of sin, was a fair test. But the final decision was for a minimum of three months' instruction, after which the catechumens must be able to recite the Decalogue, the Lord's Prayer and the Apostle's Creed, and have some knowledge of the work and office of Christ and of the Holy Spirit. (40) It seems fairly clear that the missionaries stood out for a more exacting standard than most of their/

Notes

(36) C. of S. Report, 1903, p.141
(37) Statistics 1885: C. of S. Report, 1902, p.28
(38) C. of S. Report, 1902, p.100
(39) Ibid., p.104
(40) Ibid., 1898, p.24, ff.
Indian colleagues, that their authority carried the day and that the required level of instruction was high for the conditions prevailing.

The insistence on self-help was by contemporary standards, just as striking, though among Indian leaders there was clearly some difference of opinion. "What we need" said Mr. R.C. Dass, "is to go back to the practice of the apostolic Church"—and he advocated a tent-making ministry. But the Rev. Thakur Das was of the opinion that a growing church should not be overburdened and one should wait till it was strong before asking it to support its own pastors. (41)

The principle on which work went forward so far as the country districts were concerned, was that while the Mission employed the pastors and other workers, each Christian community should be responsible for the erection and maintenance of its own church building. This was not strictly adhered to, congregations in Scotland being asked to subscribe to the building of village churches, but the movement towards spontaneous giving was everywhere encouraged. It was, for instance, reported from Daska in 1896 that voluntary contributions had gone up in spite of it being a bad famine year: the church had appointed its first full-time evangelist: and in order to stir up a missionary spirit among members, a branch of the Christian Endeavour had been started. (42)

This Society, comparatively little known in Scotland, was to have increasing influence over young Christians not only in the Punjab but all over India. Its missionary emphasis was strong but it did for young Christians in country districts what the Y.M.C.A. and the Y.W.C.A. were to do for students in the cities, though with a more direct concern for training in Church leadership.

Three years later, in the Daska area, money was being collected for a central church, and while famine relief was being distributed to the poorest,

NOTES

(41) Report of Punjab Presbyterian Conference, Lahore, 1879. While this discussion took place before the beginning of the mass movement and was centred on the situation in city congregations, it underlines the differences of approach which continued to operate.

(42) C. of S. Report, 1897, p.14
no appeal was going to be sent to Scotland until the people themselves had first made a reasonable contribution. (43)

A more ambitious scheme for self-support, made possible by the Government's policy of land reclamation, was that of planting a Christian colony on ground newly irrigated by the Chenab River Canal. In 1900, some 1,700 acres were handed over to the Church of Scotland and a group of over 600 Christians settled in the new village of Youngsonabad. A panchayat appointed by the families elected Thakur Das, the evangelist, as their headman and acting pastor and it was possible for Dr. Youngson to report after a year that the families had already built their homes and cultivated all their land; the community were raising money for a church building and were determined to support a pastor without help from outside. The Rev. S.S. Mark was ordained and inducted in 1905 and though the Colony was to have a somewhat checkered history, it had by that time reached a strength of over 2,000 and was able to maintain its pastor at a salary of Rs 25 a month. (44)

In any assessment of the quality of this rapidly growing Church, there are a number of features to be taken into account. Up until 1885, work was carried on among better-class people. Dr. Hewat notes that in the first 40 years of the Mission's history, among those who became Christians were a Panjabi fakir, a Brahmin, a medical student, a goldsmith's son, a brilliant Mohammedan scholar and a Sikh merchant. (45) With the advent of the mass movement, the overwhelming majority of those coming into the Church were Chuhra or Mehs, yet a few converts were made from time to time from the higher classes also. The Mission report for 1907 tells of a Mohammedan convert who was trained and licensed to preach, only to return to his ancestral faith. (46) But this was exceptional and against the flow of the stream. Daska had four high caste/

---

**NOTES**

(43) Ibid., 1900, p.8.
(44) "One Hundred Years of Growth", p.67; C. of S. Reports, 1907, p.124 and passim.
(45) Hewat, p.119
(46) C. of S. Reports, 1907, p.131.
converts in 1898; the Reports for 1902 and 1914 speak of enquirers among students and other caste people in Sialkot, five high caste Hindus were baptised in the Hunter Memorial Church in 1916 and in 1925 there were twelve young educated Muslims under instruction and two outstanding converts from Islam had just been baptised. (47) Since men of this type came as individuals, often under threat from their familiares, their faith was much more sorely tested than was the case with converts from the lower castes. Yet it was rare for them not to stand firm. The point may here be made that the mass movement, while it stamped its own character on the Church, was not a deterrent to the ingathering of converts from the higher castes, but rather the reverse.

Another feature of the Church's development at this stage can be seen in the competition which began to take place early in the new century with Roman Catholic Missions, which tried to drive a wedge into the Daska and Sialkot areas. (48) Food, clothing and other inducements were offered by their missionaries and it was explained that there would be no great insistence on the giving up of old customs. About 400 converts and catechumens were lost to them in the Sialkot district in 1911 but the majority stood firm. (49) A high proportion of those who had left later returned and by 1914 it was being reported that the Roman Catholics had failed in their efforts. (50) One may naturally suspect here that among many of the new converts there was a balancing of advantages. But the early withdrawal of the forces of the other Mission suggests that native opposition must have been fairly staunch and motives sincere.

As the first two decades of the twentieth century moved on, the principles on which an independent Church must rest were kept well in the van. Self-propagation was not a problem and once the tide had started to turn it seems to have been accepted by the rank and file of the Christian community that/

NOTES

(47) Ibid., 1896, p.18; E.G.K. Hewat, op.cit., p.120 and other Reports passim.
(48) C. of S. Report, 1905, p.172
(49) Ibid., 1912, p.113
(50) Ibid., 1914, p.p. 104-105
it was a believer's task and privilege to bring in his brother. The Annual Conventions and other gatherings which became a distinctive and valuable feature of the Punjab Church's life were a help and inspiration in this direction, deepening spiritual life and rousing fresh enthusiasm. The example may be cited of one of the earlier Conventions which led to a widespread revival and a "Pentecost" at the Boys' Boarding Home at Daska. (51) The second instance is that of the two lads who returned to Wazirabad after a C.E. Conference and so shamed their fellow villagers with accusations of sin and half-heartedness that apparently the whole village experienced a revival. (52)

"The work begun by personal evangelism goes on", ran the report from Sialkot in 1909, "Nine out of ten converts are won by self extension." (53) And again, "Our Christians have in truth been missionaries to their own people." (54) The 325 baptisms and the improved church attendance recorded at Daska in 1916 are said to have derived from the efforts of Indian workers. (55) Even at the end of the war, when influenza and famine were stalking the countryside and families were migrating by the hundred, small congregations were springing up "all over the cantonments of Sialkot city", and it was mainly the people who were doing the evangelising. (56)

This missionary spirit was fostered by efforts to understand the work and purpose of the Church at a wider level. The union movement which had by 1900 been going on through a series of meetings and conferences for almost 30 years, may have meant little to village Christians. But the redivision of Mission areas with the American U.P. Mission in 1889 and again in 1904, and the building up of colonies along the Chenab Canal, made even these aware in a practical way that the Christian Church was bigger than the Mission. (57)

NOTES

(51) Ibid., 1906, p.153
(52) Ibid., 1909, p.112
(53) Ibid., 1909, p.105
(54) Quoted Hewit, p.120
(55) C. of S. Report, 1917, p.148
(56) Ibid., 1919, p.28
And as early as 1900 there was a prayer group in Gujrat studying the progress of Mission work in China. (58) It continued to be a mark of the Punjab Church that in spite of the high rate of illiteracy, many of its humblest members were often quite well informed about the progress of Church at wider levels. For this the Christian Endeavour groups were, without question largely responsible.

The move towards self-support, on which self-government was going to depend, did not unfortunately keep up the same pace. As already noted, the Youngsonabad congregation was supporting its own pastor by 1905. Within a five-year period up to the end of 1908, Christian liberality in the Sialkot Villages rose from Rs 15 to Rs 172 and teachers who were acting as lay pastors agreed that their salaries should be reduced by Rs 1 a month with each year, the balance to be made up by the people. A year later all but two villages were being congratulated on having met their quota and the year after that a few villages had actually exceeded it. (59) "The Christians are beginning to understand that the Church should maintain her own ordinances and allow our paid agents to do as much pioneer work as possible", ran another report about this time, it being also noted with pleasure that in Hunterpur rents were now being paid regularly. (60) Village elders and other leaders were also being trained to run their own business affairs and local panchayats to take more responsibility. (61)

It is evident, however, that the self-help programme failed to keep up with rising costs after the war and even a generation later the goal of a network of independent congregations maintaining their own pastors was far from being realised. (62)

NOTES

(59) Ibid., 1909, p.105; 1910, p.120 - 1911, p.112
(60) Ibid., 1908, p.139
(61) Ibid., 1909, p.105
In the city centres, where a more permanent form of building was required, their erections owed more to donations from friends of the Mission in Scotland than to local contributions. The Church building at Chamba was dedicated in 1889, that at Jalalpur in 1913, St. Andrew's Gujrat in 1914 and the Daska church the following year. Only of the church built by the Youngsonabad congregation, to which they contributed both material and labour and which was completed in 1910, could it be said "of the cost, all but one tenth has been met by the people themselves."(63)

So far as self-government was concerned, the chief problem was the training of the pastors themselves. The first ordained ministers were the catechists of special intelligence or ability who had already proved their worth on the field. This was the system followed by the majority of Protestant Missions, in particular those in an isolated situation, it being left to the missionary in charge to give likely candidates what theological instruction he could. It was not until 1910 that a more systematic form of training was established and 15 theological students were assembled at Wazirabad to begin a four-year course. The plan was that they should study for six months of the year under the missionary at Wazirabad and for the other six months with his colleague at Daska. The course appears to have been a fairly stiff one. After a year the candidates were reported to be making progress in Greek, but by the third year only six students remained and only three survived the final year to be licensed.(64) The most promising student of all unhappily died in the middle of the course, but one cannot help wondering whether in the circumstances a less exacting and more practical curriculum might not have produced better results.

The most significant trait of the period, however, was without doubt the manner in which the Christian community was year by year raised, and

NOTES

(63) "One Hundred Years of Growth", p.p. 15-16
(64) C. of S. Reports, 1910, p.121; 1911, p.112, p.111. 1913, p.87.
raising itself, to new levels of character and social responsibility. The increase of literacy, through the work of schools and hostels, certainly constituted the major factor in this metamorphosis. Without village schools, the Bible remained a closed book but the greater the number of Christians who could read, the greater the number of those who could guide their companions along the road of holiness. Nor was this process of sanctification to be understood in any narrow sense. For the new convert, cleanliness is closely related to godliness, and beside the signs of a new reverence at worship, we may note the new respect accorded to Christians round Daska when plague broke out again and it became plain how much higher was the death rate in the non-Christian villages. The state of the field round Hunterpur was admired by neighbouring farmers. And when the war started, it was a real cause of triumph for the Punjab Church that the first casteless Christians ever to be accepted for the Indian army should come from their number. Quite a few of these soldiers, due to their superior education, were quickly promoted to non-commissioned rank and it was soon noted that, "the constant demand for more Christians itself speaks for the success of the experiment." It is an engaging sidelight on the growing influence of Indian Christianity that when the 86th Carnatic Regiment was moved to Poona, Dr. Youngson, who was stationed there at the time, was able to greet some of his converts and baptize one Hindu and one Muslim soldier who they introduced to him.

The reliability of Christian farmers and standards set by Christian sepoys were together responsible for another notable step when in 1917 the/

NOTES

(65) Ibid., 1908, p.139
(66) Ibid., 1909, p.107
(67) Ibid., 1902, p.11
(68) Ibid., 1913, p.119
(69) Ibid., 1916, p.85
(70) Ibid., 1917, p.147
provincial Government for the first time began to grant to the heads of casteless families the status of land-owner and the right to buy and sell land. (72) This was a welcome reinforcement to the Church in its campaign for self-support. But it had an even greater effect in offering a real measure of security to those who had never known it and in granting them open recognition of the standing which had for centuries been denied them.

This was all the more important because in one area at least Christianity and the casteless community were becoming almost synonymous terms. It could be said in the Sialkot district "One can now calculate the number of Chuhras in the district who choose to remain in the old condition — only 244". (73) There were still occasional cases of persecution and one case at least of Christian converts having to leave their village. Yet the fact that a group made up so predominantly of people without rights or privileges was being accorded a new social status gave the Church self-respect and a goal to work towards. Independence was a reality within their grasp.

The period we are investigating has already been described as one in which the development of institutions and the emergence of national leadership were accompanied by a wide expansion in the realm of women's work. The first and last of these activities must again be simply recognised without going into detail. While village schools multiplied and city schools graduated upwards to Middle School or High School level, sometimes with hostels for Christian children attached, medical work also spread until there were women's hospitals at Sialkot (The Hay Memorial) and at Gujrat (the Dow Memorial), a small general hospital at Chamba and a large one at Jalalpur. (74) Setting out to heal in Christ's name, and for healing's sake, on numerous occasions they won/

NOTES

(72) C. of S. Report, 1917, p.147
(73) Ibid., 1915, p.118
(74) Ibid., passim. There was also a little hospital at Daska which closed for lack of funds — Ibid., 1905, p.147.
the confidence of suspicious Sikhs or Muslims and paved the way for a ready hearing of the Christian message. Again it is just a case of accepting, before passing on, that the traditional pattern of a Western Mission was taking shape.

The rise of Murray College at Sialkot was somewhat different, however. Each of the other seven Colleges founded by Scottish Missions had been the original cornerstone on which it was intended that later work should develop. It was a case of working from the centre outwards and providing, as a corollary, training for Christian converts when they should be gathered in. Murray College differed in this respect, that it emerged as the central institution of a community already in being and could thus all the more easily be integrated into the life of that community.

Officially registered in 1889 as a College of Lahore University, it was in fact for another twenty years little more than an extension of Sialkot High School, with senior masters giving the necessary instruction. But in 1909 new buildings were erected and the College was opened under its present name. Two years later it became a degree College and while planned to cater for about 400 pupils it was eventually taking in more than twice that number. Up to the 1920's, only an occasional Christian student was attending classes, but the proportion of Christian students rose with each decade and by the 1930's women students also were included. (75) While educational standards were not so high as those of the older Scottish Colleges, yet the mere fact that it could not, like them, rely on a strong body of missionary professors meant that it put more into the hands of Indian leaders who were themselves products of the local Church. And this in turn was an advantage towards indigenous development.

The Punjab Church, which by 1900 numbered just over 5,000 souls, had /

---

NOTES

(75) "One Hundred Years of Growth", pp. 11-12.
within ten or eleven years doubled its numbers to pass the 10,000 mark and by 1930 totalled over 17,000 people. (76) Nearly twice as large as any Scottish Mission in the country, its proportion of communicant members was at the same time the smallest — just over 9%, as against 31% in the Eastern Himalayas and Rajputana's 42%. (77) It had, however, by now reached the limit of a long and vigorous span of natural expansion. And the spell which followed was essentially one of consolidation.

1930-1965.

"Quiet progress" is the phrase used in one Mission report of the early thirties, and if we allow for the periodic visitations of flood, drought, famine and plague it describes fairly well the Church's activity up to the time of Partition. (78) Immediately before and for some time after that event, the prevailing atmosphere was very different.

Consolidation, not expansion, was the key note of these years and while the Church continued to grow it did so much less rapidly. The 74 adult baptisms of 1930 had dwindled by 1940 to 36 and within another few years to single figures. (79) For the Mission, financial curtailment came at a very awkward time, with cuts in grants from the U.K. and the Government hampering institutional work and so the training and supply of leaders for illiterate or semi-literate communities. "Our very success is our embarrassment — we have to retrench just when the work is ready to advance" was the complaint. (80)

Murray College was expanding in size and at the same time taking a larger share in Christian witness. Having already anticipated some of the Lindsay Commission's recommendations about linking higher education with village and district work, it could fairly claim that "no College makes a bigger contribution to the life of the Church". (81) As the number of /

NOTES

(76) C. of S. Statistics, 1902, 1913, 1931
(77) Ibid., 1931
(78) C. of S. Report, 1933, p. 547
(79) Ibid., 1931, 1941, 1951, statistics.
(80) Ibid., 1932, p. 594
students increased, until the building was overcrowded to twice its intended
capacity — by 1947 the 500 of 1930 had almost doubled — the proportion
of women students and Christian students had also increased. (82) A chapel
was added to the buildings without any help being asked from Mission funds,
Christian boys who had up until then been segregated in their own hostel were
now being distributed among non-Christians and a strong branch of the S.C.M.
grew up. (83)

For a number of years "Roman Catholic aggression" posed a problem.
A Roman Catholic worker placed in Youngsonabad won over some waverers with
offers of free board and education. And an attempt was made to set up an
Intermediate College in Daska. (84) Like earlier efforts, however, these also
met with little success. Through the influence of Daska's pastor, a record
number of Roman Catholic converts joined the Punjab Church and the College
was closed. In Youngsonabad too, most of the wanderers seem to have
returned, having felt the lack of proper pastoral care. "We didn't know what
it was to sit quietly and listen to a Service", one of them is reported to
have said. "None were held in the village by Roman Catholic workers. Once
a year each adult had to go to chapel many miles away and pay a rupee to the
priest." (85) If motives in either direction were liable to be suspect, the
Punjab Church had at least the satisfaction of knowing that its standards
were set at something rather higher than nominal membership.

While the majority of new converts, like those who were already Christians,
came from humble backgrounds, evangelistic and welfare efforts were directed
as opportunity arose to special groups, and there were also individual
conversions. We read of a Sikh convert in Gujrat in 1932 and a Hindu and /

NOTES
(82) Ibid., 1932, p. 594; 1934, p. 598; 1942, p. 323; 1946, p. 366
      1947, p. 350; and passim.
(83) Ibid., 1934, p. 598; 1936, p. 552; "Conference", Mar., 1936, p. 17
      C. of S. Report, 1945, p. 300
(84) C. of S. Report, 1934, p. 601
(85) Ibid., 1932, p. 597; 1934, p. 601
an educated Moslem in Wazirabad a few years later. Through a Christian girl married to a soldier in Sialkot the way was opened for work among soldiers' wives. And meanwhile a determined effort had already been made to raise the living conditions in three poor Christian streets in Gujrat city and to get the boys into school. This was followed up by a wider attempt to reach the poor of the town generally, as a result of which more of the sweeper class were brought into the Church, sometimes without adequate preparation. "After baptism their interest ceases", came the complaint of those working among them. "They have no wish to learn anything more about the Bible." Yet in the Hindu state of Chamba, where for so long the Christian community had remained stationary and stagnant, it was the sweeper families who were all at once being drawn in to swell its numbers and effect a transformation in their own way of life. The dual problem of providing them with proper instruction and of getting them accepted by those who were Christians already was overcome, and in 1934, with a record figure of 67 baptisms, a full Kirk Session was constituted. The congregation showed initiative enough to form its own Evangelistic Society and as the church grew in unity and strength new centres were opened up. Partition and the shortage of missionary staff meant that Chamba eventually lost its connection with Scotland and the Punjab Council and became part of the Indian Church's Home Mission responsibility. But by now well-established under its own pastor, it continued to flourish.

NOTES

(87) Ibid., 1946, p.366
(88) Ibid., 1932, p.548: 1933, p.600
(90) Ibid., 1946, p.366: Information obtained through correspondence. Dr. E.G.K. Hewat refers in her official history to a booklet "The Chamba Mission, 1864". Unfortunately the copy to which she had access has since been lost and destroyed and the writer has been unable to trace other copies.
Interestingly enough it was at another isolated station, the Temple city of Jammu, that some of the most marked progress was made. With immigration to the newly-opened canal lands there were soon fourteen villages containing Christians and in an area covering more than 3,000 square miles of territory district work actually began to spread too rapidly, until it became impossible to accept the requests of all enquirers. (91) Before the war started a community of well over a thousand had been formed, half of those living in the city and the other half in villages. (92)

The Church's greatest need in the areas where the earlier mass movements had taken place was now for the formation of pastorates of a workable size and the finding of men to staff them. The "Divinity School" in Daska was by this time housed in a building of its own and in 1933 twelve catechists had passed through a two-year course which qualified them to be sent out as preachers and pastors. (93) But Sialkot, with its five groups of congregations under one pastor and Daska district with a Christian community now numbering over 7,000 and over 400 children being baptised each year were clearly in need of more organised supervision. (94) To build up the Church, more emphasis came to be placed on training for communicant membership. It was not unusual for a pastorate to have 70 or 80 new communicants in a year and Wazirabad had at one point as many as 260 under instruction. (95)

Poverty and the inability of congregations to support a pastor of their own was the chief stumbling block now, and it was not helped by the Mission's policy of a few years back. The situation is described in the Centenary booklet as follows:

"When the great inrush began and so many Christians hardly knew what their responsibility was, the matter of self-support was not considered so important as the matter of supplying teachers and shepherds. *(Later) grants/
were increased in order to meet increased costs. It is true that in certain places there was a desire on the part of congregations to pay for their own catechists and erect their own churches, but invariably help had to be given. This is the system the church has inherited and we must acknowledge that it does not encourage the fullest generosity in attaining self-support." (96)

In the still-growing village of Youngsonabad, although owing to its size it had almost from the beginning been a self-supporting unit, poverty was as yet the chief problem. Four successive years of drought in the early 1930's were enough to send the community back to the Mission crying for further help. (97) There were of course exceptions to the attitude of dependence. A particularly promising piece of work in the Sambrial district, run by a catechist who exercised great influence, was supported by the Church itself, while the prayer house was a gift from a Muslim friend. (98)

Within the Church itself, there were other forms of activity. Among young people Sunday Schools and the ever-popular Christian Endeavour had a large following. The Daska branch of the C.E. proudly displayed the Flag of Honour for the best branch in the Punjab Union and Sialkot, a few years later, had its own group of "Scottish Mission Volunteers" — a group of young men who elected their own officers and promised to attend church regularly and abstain from liquor. (99)

Regular habits of worship, also, were training congregations in the forms of worship most suitable to a semi-literate people. Much emphasis was placed on participation and the constant repetition of basic Christian truths. Village Christians would repeat in Punjabi the General Confession and the General Thanksgiving — "as used in St. Giles, Edinburgh" adds the missionary in a justifying aside. They would also read and repeat together passages from/
the Bible and stand to join in responsive prayers. (100) The church buildings now going up in many villages, though of humble construction compared with churches already in use in the cities or in a large village such as Youngsonabad, owed more to the initiative and resource of the people who were actually going to use them. (101) Among the most important developments was the establishment of a Central Fund for pastors, an essential step towards self-support in any church where pastors were to expect a regular stipend and the stronger units were to recognise their duty to help the weaker. (102)

The coming of independence, which affected to some degree every branch of the Indian Churches, subjected the Church in the Punjab to highly disruptive and challenging experiences. Independence here meant Partition, and the Punjab Church alone of Scottish Mission Churches found itself part of Pakistan and separated by a national boundary from its sister Church Councils of the U.C.N.I.

As individuals and in their communities Christians also had to face the terror of possible massacre and then the suffering of unemployment and hunger before the economic life of the new nation was restored to something like normal.

By 1946 the storm clouds were already gathering, and in the Punjab, suspicion and intolerance had crept in to poison the atmosphere among mixed communities which had been existing in amity together for hundreds of years. Hidden feuds were brought out into the open, through which Christian groups were also sometimes affected.

On the declaration of independence there followed riots, lootings and killings, while refugees in their thousands and then their tens of thousands started streaming toward the Indian border. The College at Sialkot was bereft of every Sikh and Hindu member of staff, while there were few Christian/

NOTES
(100) C. of S. Report, 1933, p.547 and passim.
(101) Ibid., 1938, p.688 and passim. Some interesting information about Church buildings is given in "One Hundred Years of Growth", pp.15-16 and "Sketches of the Field: Punjab", pp.36-37.
(102) "One Hundred Years of Growth", p.21: "Sketches of the Field: Punjab", pp.35-36
teachers left to replace them. Christians on the whole remained unmolested, but as the massacres extended and blood ran hot they also began to be in danger. The Christians in one Sikh village were only saved by their evangelist when the Muslims attacked. At Bhimber village, in the Gujrat district, the two dozen Christians were all slaughtered along with their Hindu neighbours. In Jammu it was the sign of the Cross on doors and walls which saved the lives not only of Christian householders but of the Muslims who took refuge with them. Schools and other public buildings remained closed sometimes for months on end, villages were deserted, fields left uncultivated and livestock free to wander. (103)

After the excitement and the terror of those two years, the more prosaic business of trying to scrape a living among the difficulties of unemployment, food shortages and epidemic disease was for the greater part of the Christian community even harder to bear. Standing aloof from politics and not included in the animosity between Muslims on the one hand and Hindus and Sikhs on the other, it had been the victim of fear rather than murder and pillage. It was its poverty and its dependence on agricultural labour from now vanished Hindu landlords which during the next year or so inflicted on it the greater amount of suffering. (104)

Of the immediate effects of independence and Partition on the Punjab Church the most important was perhaps a negative one — there were no defections back to the Mohammedan faith. (105) Christians stood firm, sometimes with courage, but at least they stood firm.

Of the positive effects, we should note first that Chamba and Jammu remained as part of India and while both continued in a sense a Church of Scotland Mission responsibility, neither could any longer be administered/

NOTES

(105) Ibid.
by the Sialkot Church Council and accordingly they were transferred to the Church Council of Gurdaspur. (106)

Within Pakistan, the chaotic conditions caused by the disruption of commerce and agriculture and consequent unemployment threw much of the rural Christian communities back on to the Mission's shoulders. Economic distress was spread throughout the Province, which with its mixed population had suffered more than any other in the country, all classes feeling the pinch. "Army cooks, drivers and N.C.O's are working as sweepers" came a report from Gujrat. The mission started famine relief kitchens for women and children and subsidised a variety of welfare and milk marketing schemes. Bricklaying was begun at Shadiwal, a co-operative marketing scheme at Younagondbad and the need was recognised, though unfortunately not met, for a new type of missionary who would have experience of trade and agriculture. Institutions were the first part of the Church's work to return to normal and within a year of Partition Murray College had 600 of its students back, but evangelistic work was much slower to recover. (107)

The overall result was that for a period the Church was driven in on itself. By 1950 it was again engaging in normal activities — the C.B. and the College S.C.M. revived, classes and camps were being held for church members and workers, for women and for pastors and new churches and manses were going up. (108) Yet there was much less outward-directed activity. Although the U.C.N.I. continued as if no border existed, the West Pakistan Christian Council had had to withdraw from the National Christian Council of India and Pakistan and the Church generally was recuperating from shock, as yet uncertain what the future might bring. (109)

NOTES

(106) Ibid., 1949, p.346; 1959, p.443; and passim.
(109) Ibid.
In Jammu alone was a different note being struck. The church here is flourishing not in spite of, but because of the situation, wrote its fine pastor, Aziz Williams. "Displaced village Christians are returning. Services are being conducted in Hindustani and English and army officers taking part. Christian liberality has reached Rs 2,000, an increase of Rs 400." (110) In fact the Jammu congregation was to go on from strength to strength, a changing and progressive community." Within ten years, a church which had been made up almost wholly of sweepers had its young men earning their living as mechanics, drivers and painters and at similar trades. (111) And by the 1960's, with few of the city's sweepers left to be gathered into the Christian fold, it was beginning to produce its first graduate teachers, while the High School had attained a high reputation. Women had been rising with the men and were the leaders of a revival movement that had a strong missionary emphasis. As a significant feature of everyday Christian life in "war-scarred Jammu" we should take note that the congregation had held its own prayer-meeting in the church every evening without a break for eleven years. (112)

For the Church situated within the bounds of West Pakistan itself, we may in the period between Partition and the present time distinguish two peculiar dangers threatening its progress or stability. Extreme pressure against a minority religion in a Muslim State was fortunately not one of these. There was little or no interference with Christian instruction in church schools, though very reasonably it was necessary to be able to offer the alternative of Moral instruction. The problem here was rather the small proportion of Christian students and pupils and the shortage of Christian teachers. (113)

NOTES

(110) Ibid., p.303
(111) Ibid., 1955, p.347
The first positive danger, then, was not that of deliberate pressure from the State but of Christians becoming satisfied to think of themselves as a self-contained community. While evangelistic activity continued, there appears to have been little expectancy of it making any impact, while a poor welcome was extended to newly baptised members. "The Church that disappoints the convert", was the description given it in 1955. Third generation Christians no longer had the same freshness of experience as their grandparents and Muslim converts — of whom in fact there were only six that year — found that having made the sacrifice of leaving home and family there was a disappointing lack of enthusiasm in the society to which they now belonged. (114)

A second danger was that described by a member of the College staff as "Islam by osmosis". The history being taught in Government schools was history written from the national and Muslim viewpoint. And the fear was that ignorance coupled with lack of enthusiasm on the part of Christians could easily lead to acceptance of the assumptions lying behind such teaching. (115)

It is indeed questionable whether the danger of reversion to Islam through assimilation has any real existence. According to one serving missionary, the number of Christians in the Church's area who have become Muslims since Partition is practically nil. Village Christians who came in by mass movements have too big a community-pull to want to change and would not be welcomed if they did. The greatest fall-away is among new converts from Islam to Christianity. Perhaps twenty to thirty per cent of these revert within the first five years after their baptism, due to family and economic/

(114) Ibid., 1956, p.399
The Constitution of the Republic of Pakistan makes it clear first that "no law should prevent the members of a religious community or denomination from professing, practising or propagating their religion, or from conducting institutions for the purpose of or in connection with their religion". At the same time it enjoins that while the reading of the Holy Quran shall be compulsory to the Muslims of Pakistan, the legitimate rights of minorities shall be safeguarded. (Constitution of the Republic of Pakistan, Part II - Principles of Law-Making". Quoted Vivienne Stacey, "The Islamic Republic", pp. 27-28.

pressure or inability to fit into a Christianity community. The only other form of apostasy at all common is among educated young Christian girls in the cities. If unable to find Christian grooms with a suitable standard of education they may marry educated Muslims and the family, if not they themselves, will be lost to the Church. (116)

Of the two perils, the one which encourages a community settled in its convictions to withdraw from contacts and conflicts and accept its protected minority status is obviously by far the greater.

Against that background we must place the picture of a Church commendably active within the framework of its own organisations and institutions, developing fresh vigour by the time the 1960's had come round and beginning at last to look outside itself again.

In December, 1953, a major step towards integration took place when after 25 years of preparation the Sialkot Church Council took over from the Mission Council. Eighteen new members were added to represent evangelistic, medical and educational work, Murray College alone retaining its separate Board of Directors. The new Moderator was a Pakistani, and in line with Scottish Mission policy, though contrary to the policy of the American Presbyterian Mission also at work in the Punjab, control of all finance and not just the money devoted to strictly ecclesiastical purposes was placed in the Church Council's hands. (117) In the course of the next few years leadership passed over progressively into Pakistani hands. The College installed its first national Principal and the Council's Evangelistic Board worked out plans to ensure that every district should have a national as superintendent. (118) And from about 1962 onwards, by giving a fresh impulse to evangelism, by raising interest in the needs of Pakistani Christians/

NOTES

(116) Information obtained through correspondence.
in more distant places and by organising Bible study groups, stewardship campaigns and training conferences, the Council has shown itself capable not only of governing but of taking its own initiative. (119)

Evangelism continued to be a feature of church life, especially at the annual Campaign observed in every pastorate. Normally this became a time of intensive preaching with bands of Christians, often led by a choir with drums and tongs marching in procession through the streets and stopping at a busy corner while one of their number delivered his message. By the end of the 1950's, the term "Commando Campaign" was coming into use and students from the College would on occasion organise a campaign or "raid" on their own. When the area chosen was a distant one, as when the Church in Gujrat decided to evangelise in Azad Kashmir, camps were set up in which both men and women took part. (120)

A more intelligent interest was also taken in the needs of fellow-Christians in the Church's own geographical area and beyond. Donations for the relief of flood victims in the Punjab were followed a couple of years later by offerings for other flood victims in Japan. (121) By 1960, with 37 Muslims baptised in the last three years, it could again be said that "the Church was wide awake to its evangelistic opportunity." The Council by now had its full-time Youth Organiser and women were emerging among the newest set of leaders. At Wazirabad a Pakistani woman was appointed as district superintendent of women's work and a Christian woman teacher at a Government school in Jalalpur took the lead in organising branches of the Women's Fellowship as well as opening the way for contacts with educated Muslim women. (122)

At the village of Kharian, where there lived a very/

**NOTES**

(121) C. of S. Reports, 1958, p. 495; 1960, p. 451
(122) Ibid., 1960, p. 450; 1957, p. 365; 1958, p. 482
unresponsive small group of Christians, a woman convert who had learned to read by the Laubach method started tutoring her neighbours, with the result that the village was adopted as an extension project of the Gujrat Church. (123)

Many other examples of this type of extension could be given. Equally important was the revitalising of the more isolated and often disheartened villages such as Bhimber, the scene of the 1947 massacre, where a little band of unkempt Christians now numbered almost 100 again and were recovering their confidence. The knowledge that others were taking an interest in them was a tonic in itself and now some of them were walking nine miles every Sunday to worship, where they sat clean, alert and attentive. (124)

Two more unusual forms of church extension, one of which comes into a category of its own, were the establishment of a church in Karachi and the dispatch of a Pakistani minister to Scotland. In a matter of fifteen years, the population of the capital of West Pakistan has mushroomed through immigration from 300,000 to 2,000,000 and among the increase were several hundred Christians from the Sialkot Council's area. A pastor was appointed to work there in 1962 and to conduct Urdu Services at the Scots Church. (125) About a year later the Rev. Emmanuel Johnston, with his wife and family, had sailed for Scotland. Here he had been commissioned to act under the Church of Scotland's Home Board as a sort of unofficial pastor-cum-evangelist-cum-welfare officer to the ten thousand or more Pakistanis and Indians living in Glasgow. (126)

The pastorates which come under the Sialkot Church Council, at present about 25 or 26 in number, are divided into six districts, five of these having a city as its centre and the sixth being the "village" of /

NOTES

(123) Ibid., 1961, p.17
(124) Ibid., 1961, p.16
(125) Ibid., 1963, p.434. The growth of the cities, particularly Karachi, was due to the pressure of population-growth which is, up to date, Pakistan's greatest social problem. See Ian Stephen, "Pakistan" pp. 65-66 and passim.
(126) "Conference", Aug., 1962, p.9
Youngsonabad which now has a population of about 2,000. Sialkot, with three "city" or single unit congregations, also embraces two country pastorates. Daska, Jalalpur, Gujrat and Wazirabad have each a city congregation and a number of district pastorates — in the case of Jalapur one, in the case of Daska as many as six. Most city charges will also have a number of villages attached to them. Country parishes vary considerably, there being anything from one to thirty Christian families in a village, while the number of Christian centres in a pastorate is anything between ten and thirty. In the larger pastorates the pastor is assisted by one or more catechists, in the proportion of roughly one to every ten villages.(127)

The size of the Christian community is a little difficult to determine, due to political changes and the immense amount of movement going on. About 22,000 strong at the time of Partition, the Church lost perhaps a tenth of its strength when Jamnu and Chamba remained under Indian occupation. By 1955 numbers were under 20,000 and this was certainly due to continuous movement from the villages to the larger cities. It was reckoned in 1954 that at least 700 of the Christian community had already gone to Karachi, many others had left for Lahore, Rawalpindi and other centres, and at present there are over a thousand Pakistani Christians connected with St. Andrew's Church, Karachi. "It is estimated that 20% of Pakistanis are now in towns", says the latest official account, "And that by 1980 this will increase to 50%. Christians are moving to the cities much faster than Moslems and since 1947 the Christian population in Sialkot Church Council area has fallen from 20,000 to 16,000 in spite of natural increase."(128)

Pakistani pastors are in charge of all congregations though a missionary may on occasion be inducted as pastor and it is not unusual for one to act as Interim Moderator.(129)

NOTES

(127) Information obtained through correspondence, etc.
(128) C. of S. Reports, Statistics, 1941, 1948, 1951, 1956: "The Church is There in Two Moslem Lands", p.28
(129) A missionary is reported as pastor of Gujrat congregation in 1964: "Conference", March, 1964, p.8
All offerings, except for specially destined sums, go to the Central Fund and to this all of the eight "central" pastorates but Lalamusa contribute at least as much as they receive, while the country pastorates all draw towards their support. The total Christian liberality for the year is perhaps £3,000 and this would be just about sufficient to pay all the Church's pastors. But with the upkeep of buildings and other commitments to be met, the Central Fund has to subsidised by another £1,200 or so from Mission funds. At the same time, the Church contributes a fair percentage of its offerings to charitable and evangelistic work, a sum of up to £200 a year being allocated to the U.C.N.I's overseas Mission in Kenya.

While there is every reason to hope that the present position will continue to improve so far as the central churches are concerned, the situation is by no means so happy in country pastorates. The steady drift of wage-earners from village to city keeps those churches static and none are yet within sight of self-support.

The language used for worship in the town congregations, where people are better educated, is Urdu and in the villages Punjabi. Only the New Testament is available in a Punjabi translation, however, so pastors of country churches will read the Scriptures in Urdu but conduct the rest of the service in Punjabi. The psalms are also sung in most congregations in a very popular Punjabi version. Kirk Session meetings are held in both languages and Council meetings in Urdu, though Minutes are in this case also kept in English. From 1947, women have been eligible for election as elders but in practice only the town congregations have chosen any. The proportion of women elders is always low and of the few elected, a number are women missionaries.

Church union up to date has not affected the composition of the Council, there being no other Missions connected with the U.C.N.I. working in the area. The Sialkot Church Council and the Lahore Church Council — /
the latter consisting of about forty congregations connected with the American Presbyterian Mission — together make up the West Pakistan Synod of the United Church in Pakistan, which is still officially part of the U.C.N.I.

The situation, so far as Church union is concerned, is bedevilled with ecclesiastical as well as political divisions and cross-currents. The American Presbyterian Mission, which supports the U.C.N.I. and the Scheme of Union the latter has taken part in working out, is now technically united with the United Presbyterian Mission and the U.P. Church of Pakistan is now autonomous, technically independent of America and not at present negotiating towards union. If the present Scheme of Union were to be accepted by the churches negotiating, the two Presbyterian bodies might both come into the new Union, might both stay out to form a Presbyterian Church of their own, or might divide while both retaining their connection with the same home church.

Due to its size and relative isolation, the Siakcot Church Council engages in little co-operative work with other Churches and Missions at the institutional level. Through the Synod and the West Pakistan Christian Council, however, much help is gained through joint planning and the discussion of common problems. Further Church union, while it would not bring about any major readjustments in the Council area, would bring the Church into organic relation with Methodist and Anglicans; and as already explained it might or might not result in closer relations with other Presbyterians.

One vital union institution which the Church helps to support is the Gujranwala Theological Seminary. Here the medium of instruction for a three-year course is English for graduate students or those with at least two years of college training and Urdu for the rest. The wives of students also receive instruction from a Christian Teacher Training Centre nearby. The Seminary takes in Anglican, Methodist and a few Lutheran students, but/
Presbyterians make up about two-thirds of the total. (130)

The staffing of pastorates in the Sialkot Council area is adequate in numbers but the average educational standard is low. "Matriculation with a wife" was the requirement set by the Evangelistic Board in 1948, (131) and this is adhered to with the further proviso that a candidate’s wife must also be educated up to Primary Pass level. A good proportion of candidates for the ministry will already have been working as "manads" or catechist lay preachers, but if not they are required to go through a period of two to four years of probationary training in village work or as assistant in a town congregation. A good deal of weeding out is done at this stage. Some candidates will be found unsuitable but as the Council can generally afford to send only one candidate to the Seminary each year, others will grow disheartened with waiting. As yet there are only two graduate pastors, a B.D. who is at present in Scotland and a B.A. The danger apparent in other fields is met with here also, that while the educational standard among Christians is rising, that of the ministry is not keeping pace with it. (132)

The changing pattern is particularly noticeable in a centre such as Youngsonabad, where a community still primarily dependent on agriculture has now produced perhaps 100 graduates, most of whom leave it for work elsewhere. In spite of growing prosperity and a tradition of hardy independence, the resident missionary recently appointed to Youngsonabad after a long gap describes the missionary sahib era as not yet dead. "The squire mentality lingers on". And meanwhile the gap is widening between the Christian families who are growing more prosperous and the many who are still very poor. (133)

A real measure of independence has thus been achieved, the chief /

NOTES

(130) Information obtained through correspondence, etc.
(131) C. of S. Report, 1949, p.345
(132) Information obtained through correspondence, etc.
(133) "Conference", May, 1962, p.10
hindrance to strong indigenous growth being the rather ingrown pride of a self-contained community like Youngsonabad, described as "touchy and difficult"; the difficulty of raising standards in rural pastorates which are likely to multiply as the number of available pastors increases, without at the same time being able to reach self-support; the drift to the cities, which tends to enlarge the gulf between city and village communities within the Christian society; the educational level of the ministry; and possibly in coming years, though at present the problem is hardly apparent, pressure to conform to the ideas and customs of an Islamic State.

Isolation is not seen as a major problem by the Church itself, for while separation from India is likely to increase, union with Anglicans and Methodists should take place within the next few years. Were this by any chance to fail, a likely alternative would be an all-Presbyterian union. Members of the Sialkot Church Council at present play a disproportionately large part in the West Pakistan Christian Council and church leaders at least do not lack the stimulus of contacts with other churches.(134)

---

(134) Information obtained through correspondence, etc.
GENERAL SOURCES

J.A. Alexander, "Sixty Years in Jamma" (Pamphlet, no date or publisher, probably about 1950, F.M.C. Secretary's Library.)
R.W. Weir, "Foreign Missions of the Church of Scotland"
"The Church is There in Two Moslem Lands", printed for F.M.C., 1964,
Church of Scotland F.M. Reports.
"Conference"
Occasional Papers, F.M.C. Secretary's Library.
Manuscript Correspondence, S.N.L.
"The Rajputana Mission was born out of the shock of the "Indian Mutiny".\(^{(1)}\) That simple statement is fundamentally sound, but there were contributing factors which led to the establishment of the United Presbyterian Church's first Indian Mission Field at such a place and time. By the 1850's, the U.P. Church of Scotland already had missionary commitments in three separate areas among people of African descent; in Jamaica, in old Calabar and in the Kaffrarian field which it had taken over from the Glasgow Missionary Society.\(^{(2)}\) But it supported no work of importance among Eastern peoples and with the fresh surge of interest in India which followed the Mutiny, there came the desire to enter this field.

Even although the Mission Board was carrying the proverbial deficit, a scheme was laid before the U.P. Synod of 1858 and shortly afterwards a sum of £10,000 was guaranteed. With the advice of Free Church missionaries, this huge, unoccupied area of Rajputana was chosen as offering the most promising opening.

While in summer Rajputana can reach temperatures in the region of 120° in the shade, it has a dry and relatively healthy climate and winters are bracing. The district of Ajmer-Merwara had recently been taken over as British-controlled territory and while it was not easily accessible, there was every hope that an improved communication system through the extension of railways would link it with the rest of the country and increase the/

---

**NOTES**

1) U.P.C. Report for 1929, p. 166.

2) A summary of the U.P. Church's missionary commitments in these and other areas is to be found in the introduction to "Missions of the U.P. Church", Edinburgh, 1896, pp. iii to vii.
importance of its situation. Above all, it was, from the missionary point of view, virgin soil, with a population of 17 millions for which no evangelistic provision had as yet been made.(3) These were the reasons for the Mission's location.

Rajputana differed from any other field yet occupied by a Scottish Mission in that it was neither a city nor a rural area, but an agglomeration of 24 native States, each governed by a petty king or Raja who was, in the majority of cases, descended from the ancient Hindu warrior caste. In size, the States varied considerably, the smallest being mere local chieftainships. And all were now subject to British supervision, either directly or through the agency of a "resident" who acted as adviser to the Raja and his council of ministers.

As in mediaeval Europe, a native State normally consisted of a walled city surrounded by fields and small farming communities. Large tracts of the North-Western region were desert, but towards the South-East the black cotton soil produced good crops of maize, other grains and vegetables. In comparison with other parts of India, the population was thinly spread and scattered and made up of a mixture of races. The ruling class of Rajputs themselves numbered less than 8% of the population. Of the rest, some were Brahmins, some Hindus belonging to 20 or 30 other castes or sub-castes. There were also Mohammedans, some Jains, and two groups of aboriginal hill tribes, the Oils and the Minas. In spite of this broth of religions and races, and the fact that the majority of people lived a primitive village/

---

3) Figure given in article by Dr. John Wilson in U.P. "Monthly Record", November 1860, p.211. The 1884 P.M. Board Report says twelve million.
life, with few social contacts outside their immediate neighbourhood, Rajputana had stamped on its inhabitants a character of its own. "The Rajputs are the best people to labour among, being the most manly, brave and liberal of all the nations of India" runs an optimistic letter printed in the U.P. Record.(4) Proud, belligerent, quarrelsome, loyal, courageous and conservative, their make-up must have suggested to early missionaries a spiritual kinship with Scotland's Highland clans.

The amount of ground to be covered, the distances involved, the variety of background to be considered and the complication of so many independent political divisions, meant that the work of the Mission was bound to be complex, causing it to become one of the most difficult of the Indian fields and leading willy-nilly to a number of obvious weaknesses and frustrations.

"The environment of our Rajputana Mission is, from its very complexity, very difficult to understand" wrote John Robson in his introduction to the first official history. "The old civilisation of the land, with its hoary religions, its pantheistic basis, its inexorable caste rules -- the presence of the English Government, with its religious neutrality, its educational system and its disintegrating effect on old beliefs --- the internal independence of the native states among which we are working, their history and their relation to the supreme Government, are some of the factors that must be taken into account if we would understand the work our missionaries have to do."(5)

As the original, and for many years the only Mission working in the area,

NOTES

4) U.P. "Monthly Record", December 1858, article by the secretary of the London Christian Education Society for India.

it was hard to avoid a sense of frustration at the magnitude of the task, inability to meet successive challenges and lack of success at the main points of thrust. The choice of where to work often depended less on Mission policy than on obtaining permission to enter a particular Raja's territory. And the political structure of the community led almost inevitably to a Mission organised on a pill-box system where widely-separated stations, each supervised by one missionary or more, carried on its work in comparative isolation. The Mission-Station formula became more fully accepted in Rajputana than in any other Scottish Mission. And although it was at times the most fully-served of all the Indian fields — in the middle of the 1900's there were over 20 male missionaries and about 15 women — yet this did not prevent a demand for more. As late as the 1930's, it was still regarded as an ideal, if not a necessity, to have an ordained missionary in every centre, accompanied where possible by a medical and a woman missionary. (6)

It was a further peculiarity of the Rajputana Church that it came to be built largely, although not wholly, on the foundation of "Famine orphan" communities. Two great famine periods, one in the 1860's and the second towards the end of the 1890's, brought under the care of the Mission several thousand orphan boys and girls. Many of these became Christians and the backbone of the future Church. This in turn affected the life and character of the Church in three ways. The Christian community remained poor, those who were not able to benefit from higher education becoming farmers whose earnings seldom exceeded the level of bare subsistence. "If everything goes right, they can just manage" is a woman missionary's comment on the Christian/

---

farm settlement at Piploda. "If even a little goes wrong, the trouble is acute at once."(7)

A second result was that local Christian groups, Mission-reared and Mission-trained, could hardly be regarded as an integrated part of the wider community. There was a tendency to be both dependent and inward-looking.

A third and more positive result, however, was that these groups of famine orphans, who in childhood and youth were moved from one station to another, depending on where they could best be catered for, did help to bridge the gap between isolated stations and form something like a united family. Christian boys from the orphanage at Kotah were married to Christian girls from the orphanage in Nasirabad and settled together to farm at Piploda.

There was constant movement, as people left one State to look for work in another. Yet while individual congregations might suffer on occasion from an unusually large exodus, "the fellowship of the churches", which geographical conditions did not favour, was strengthened by the Mission tie and a common upbringing.(8)

The first two missionaries sent out by the U.P. Mission Board in 1860 were William Shoolbred and Thomas Steele. Sailing to Bombay, they were taken under the wing of Dr. and Mrs. John Wilson, who accompanied them by sea to Surat and organised the 6-weeks journey on horseback and by bullock cart which ended at Beawar. On the latter part of the trip young Steele took seriously ill and finally died 120 miles short of their destination.

Shoolbred was left to start alone, his only companion being a new Brahmin convert baptised by Dr. Wilson in the course of their journey. Yet this early set-back acted on the home Church as a challenge.

---

7) Ibid., 1931, p.664.
8) See General Sources.
next three years, five more missionaries with their wives arrived in Rajputana and while unfamiliarity with the climate led to further deaths, by 1869 the first phase of the Mission's development was over.

With the grand design of planting a Mission in the capital of each native State, from which the surrounding district could be evangelised, the missionaries began by consolidating their position in British-held territory. After Beawar, Nasirabad, Ajmer and Todgarh were occupied in that order. Then Dr. Valentine, a medical, won the first foothold in Jaipur, the richest and most powerful of the independent States. Schools were opened, which by 1868 had a roll of 2,300 pupils; small dispensaries were beginning to gain the people's trust and evangelism was being carried on along traditional lines, with preaching in the streets and on country tours and by the distribution of Gospels and tracts. By the end of that first decade there was a Christian community of 50, of which half were communicant members.(9)

The second phase began with a hideous famine, at its worst in the bare North-Western section of the province. Partial failure of the monsoon for two or three summers was followed by a complete failure in 1868. "Lakes and wells were lower than they had been at the close of the hot season. The fields and jungles were a stretch of sand instead of being covered with grass, and water was being sold in some parts at an anna per jar. Children were sold by their parents for sums varying from one to five rupees. Cholera followed the famine and the next crop, after a good rainfall in 1869, was eaten up by a plague of locusts. This last blow seems to have broken the heart of the suffering farmers and their families and before another year had/
passed and things began to return to normal, something between 1½ to 4 million people had perished."(10)

Refugees from the North and West came pouring into Ajmer-Merwara and the British Government, prepared to help its own charges, found itself helpless before the influx. Starving families began to turn up at the Mission bungalow in Nasirabad also and soon the Mission was telegraphing home urgently for money. The response was fast and generous, over £5,000 being sent out specifically for famine relief work and another sum almost as large to care for the "orphans" the Mission had by now taken into care. The mortality among those children was tragically high. Two out of five died in spite of all the missionaries could do. But there remained a total of 500 children to be distributed among boys' and girls' orphanages in the four main stations. And for the best part of 20 years, until the last of them became self-supporting, their upbringing, education and future livelihood became one of the Mission's main concerns.

The effort and love expended was thoroughly repaid, however. Only about 7% of the children turned out unsatisfactory. Roughly one quarter of the boys -- about 70 youths in all -- eventually qualified to become ministers, doctors or teachers. The remainder grew up to earn their living in other ways, while all the girls got married. "They are, with few exceptions, Church members", wrote Dr. Robson, "and among them are to be found the backbone of our churches and the most reliable of our Mission agents."(11)

The 1880's were notable for further extensions of the Mission's territory/

---

NOTES

10) Ibid., p.40.
11) Ibid., pp.41-43.
and the gaining of people's confidence rather than for any great successes through evangelism or for growth in the Church. In the lovely lakeland State of Udaipur, Dr. Shepherd waited patiently in his tent until, with an outbreak of cholera, he so proved his value to the city that he was given a site on which to build. Dr. Sommerville's first attempt to settle in Jodhpur was unsuccessful, but shortly afterwards the Maharajah's prejudice were down sufficiently not only to grant him land but to build for him a Mission house and a hospital. Work was also opened up in Kotah State, where Mr. Bonner favourably impressed its ruler.

Four hospitals were by now established, at Ajmer, Nasirabad, Jaipur and Jodhpur. A Normal School for training Christian teachers was situated at Beawar. Women missionaries had also been building up zenana work and schools for both Hindu and Muslim girls, the two largest of their institutions being a Boarding School at Nasirabad and a Home for distressed Christian women at Beawar. The next century was to see the beginning of great developments in women's medical work, with two well-run hospitals at Ajmer and Jaipur and dispensary work at Nasirabad. (12)

Meanwhile the Church, though small in relation to the outreach of such a powerful Mission, was growing at its own pace. In the mid-80's, when there were 90 schools with a combined roll of over 4,500 pupils, 32 Sunday Schools with nearly 1,400 on their Roll, and the evangelistic workers in Jaipur alone reported having held 500 meetings in 150 villages, the whole Christian community distributed in and around 9 stations numbered only 454, a figure which included 100 baptisms in the course of the year. This appears surprisingly little when we consider the number of famine orphans reared under Mission care. We must/

NOTES

12) Ibid., passim.
remember, however, that it was not the custom with most Protestant Missions to baptise such children. They were baptised as adults when old enough to make a personal confession of faith. By no means all of them came forward to take Christian vows, and even for those who did there were tests of sincerity before they were admitted. The fact that, of the 101 persons baptised that year, 84 were children, suggests that the Church, at this point, after 24 years of work, was virtually static. These children represented natural growth, the families for the most part of famine orphans who were now married.(13) A year later, with deaths and removals, the size of the community was actually reduced.(14)

Yet this Church was beginning to show at least the first signs of maturity. Five Mission agents had been licensed by the Presbytery and were shortly to be ordained,(15) A new church building was dedicated at Alwar and then the Martin Memorial Church at Nasirabad.(16) The former, built on an open plan, allowed people to go in and out as they pleased and while not conducive to quiet and decorum, allowed interested by-standers to observe Christian worship and hear Christian teaching.(17)

The general picture of this Church is one of docility and obedience and there is little evidence of fire or fervour, although the average age of the community was low. The young native farmers at Ashapura showed themselves/

NOTES

15) Ibid., 1884, p.521.
17) Ibid., 1886, p.352.
to be thrifty and enterprising. While the missionary at Alwar met with trials and adults newly baptised returned to Hinduism, the conduct of the congregation was reported as "outwardly circumspect". The congregation at Beawar was within a few years of paying the pastor's salary, that at Nasirabad met half of theirs, and the community as a whole gave Rs 300 towards medical work.

Missionaries were also buoyed up by new signs of outside interest. In Udaipur, some of the enquirers were held back in the hope of bringing in complete households and not cutting off converts from being free to influence other members of their community. In Jaipur and elsewhere there were said to be "secret disciples" but they were timid and the cost of open declaration was too severe.

At the same time, missionaries would lament over the Church's lack of evangelistic spirit. "The outward conduct of the native brethren has been on the whole satisfactory, but an aggressive Christian life is still but little known", complained the missionary at Beawar. There was little sense of responsibility for self-propagation, evangelism being left to the Mission agents.

Right on through the 1890's, while the Church slowly grew — 30 were added in 1894, 31 the next year, 36 the next — that word "aggressive" was regarded as the key to the problem. Further north, mass movements were under way and it was a constant hope that in Rajputana too the smoking flax would catch fire. In Beawar in 1895 there were nine adult baptisms, the/

NOTES

18) Ibid., 1888, p.998
19) Ibid., 1887, p.760
20) Ibid., 1888, p.969
21) Ibid., 1885, p.853
22) Ibid., 1888, p.999: 1889, p.257
23) Ibid., 1890, p.198
result of "aggressive efforts by native Christians"(24). A Rajput yogi converted at Jaipur was commended for exhibiting "an aggressive enthusiasm rarely met with in our native Church".(25) But the longed-for breakthrough on a broad front never came. Christian influence was certainly strengthening its hold. "Christianity has gradually taken shape in their midst. Christian buildings, Christian institutions, Christian books, Christian vernacular preaching exhibit in an unmistakable way the energy and the resourcefulness of the new faith."(26) Christian knowledge was spreading. "The young of towns and villages could compete with the average district in Britain on the facts of the life of Christ and Scripture generally." (27) All that was lacking was the coming of the Spirit. "We are waiting for the troubling of the waters".(28)

As might be expected, then, the move towards self-support and self-government was hardly enthusiastic and did not illustrate the traits of an outward-looking community. "The people are steady in their attendance at Church, they listen attentively to the preaching of the Gospel, they show an intelligent interest in everything connected with the welfare of the congregation and give what they can of their means for the schemes of the Church".(29) In spite of the fact that that was a famine year, Christian/

NOTES

24) Ibid., 1896, p.110
25) Ibid., 1889, p.96
26) Ibid., 1892, p.47
27) Ibid., 1897, p.110
28) Ibid., 1890, p.180
29) Ibid., 1898, p.115
liberality went up.

Yet if these were the virtues of a loyal and conscientious community, they also reflect a thoroughly dependent community. Every advance being made was still, by the end of the century, made not only on Mission money but on Mission initiative. Active opposition to preaching had disappeared (30) but it was paid agents who did the teaching. A three weeks "Preaching Class" to step up standards of evangelism was attended by 50 men, but all these were full-time servants of the Mission (31). Every High School now had a Christian headmaster (32), eleven congregations were being ministered to by 3 pastors, 4 licentiates and 30 elders, and Sunday School children numbered over 4,000. (33) Yet missionary leaders were still everywhere in the saddle. With the first few third-generation Christians now being Baptised (34) difficulty was still being experienced in getting Christian workers who would not "deteriorate" when left isolated in heathen surroundings. (35)

There were notable exceptions, men for instance such as Paul Bishan, evangelist at Kikri, who as head of the only Christian family in the village was elected to the Municipal Council and put in charge of the district poor fund. (36) But he had been a Brahmin convert. Missionary supervision/

---

NOTES

30) Ibid., 1893, circa p.28
31) Ibid., 1894, p.28
32) Ibid., 1896, pp.86-87
33) Ibid., 1895, p.79
34) Ibid., 1899, circa p.96
35) Ibid., 1898, p.116
36) Ibid.
was still regarded as imperative, not only for the Church's expansion but for detailed and internal matters of character, growth and Church discipline. By the end of the century, it could be said of a Church whose communicant membership had risen to about 680 that native congregations were satisfactory, worship was well attended and the lives of Christians were sincere. (37) But what growth had taken place was almost wholly internal. A force of 19 male and 16 women missionaries, occupying 11 central stations, could claim, with the help of a staff of about 300 workers, to have brought in, during the course of a year’s labour, 6 outside converts. From eight of the main centres occupied, there were no converts at all. (38) The Church was at a stage of almost complete stagnation.

1900-1930

It was rescued from vegetation by the onslaught of a second famine even more devastating than that experienced a generation earlier. In the “Great Famine” of 1900, some Native States lost nearly half of their population; there were at one point four million people labouring on Government famine relief works for just enough grain to keep them alive; countless thousands left their homes in search of food only to return, destitute and almost naked, to die; and every Mission house was besieged from morning to night by starving crowds.

For months the Mission’s every effort was concentrated on saving lives. Of 6,000 children picked up, half died of famine dysentery or cholera, neither food nor medical care being able to save them, but the Mission found itself responsible for the remainder. Many boys quickly solved the problem by running away home, while another 1,200 were temporarily accommodated at Ashapura, where a varied programme of trade and craft training was organised. The stronger boys were sent on to farm at Chajawa and then to open up new/

NOTES

37) Ibid., 1899, p.67: 1900, circa p.57
38) Ibid., 1899 and 1900
ground at Piploda, in Kotah State, on a site granted on easy terms by the Maharao.

The girls had meanwhile been gathered into an orphanage at Nasirabad and a home for destitute Christian women had been opened at Beawar. The health of the girls compared unfavourably with that of the boys at Ashapura and every year a number were dying of phthisis. For their sakes a girls' sanatorium was opened at Todgarh, a hill village some 44 miles up a rough track from Beawar. (39)

By 1910, the Mission had extended its bounds to what was to be for the next fifty years at least, the shape and limits of the Church. To the ten stations opened up between 1862 and 1889 there had been added the farm settlement at Piploda, in Kotah State. Of the others, Ashapura centred round its orphanage and settlement, while Todgarh had gained importance because of its sanatorium. The latter two stations, along with Beawar, Nasirabad and Ajmer itself, lay in British India, in the government-administered territory of Ajmer-Merwara. The remaining five stations, Jaipur, Jodhpur, Udaipur, Alwar and Kotah, were all the capitals of Indian States. And a Christian society which at the end of the century had numbered no more than 780 communicant members was for the second time being rejuvenated by an influx of growing boys and girls and the children of their marriages.

The largest Christian group, of over 500 people, was that at Ajmer, where there were three male and five female missionaries, a pastor and three evangelists, besides teachers and hospital staff. The smallest community, at Alwar, had one supervising missionary, two evangelists and a Christian community of 70 souls. This was the accepted pattern of administration -- one hesitates to say advance --: a Mission-station-stronghold system which was less of the missionaries' choosing than thrust on them by the peculiar nature/
of their territory. Missionaries resided at ten of the eleven stations, one from Beawar also travelling to Todgarh. The total Christian society was by now about 3,000 and was partly but not wholly supporting its five ordained pastors. Meanwhile the Mission maintained 20 male and 18 women missionaries and over 30 evangelists in addition to its medical and educational commitments.

Twenty years later, when the Christian population had increased mainly by natural growth to 4,000, work was still gathered round the same eleven centres, the total number of missionaries was much the same and the number of pastors had risen to seven. (40) When we take into account the fact that the population of Ajmer State was half a million and those of Jaipur and Jodpur two-and-a-half million respectively, and that the Scottish Mission had neither allies nor rivals in the field, we are given an idea of how much the Church had to rely on its own and the Mission's resources and how little response there had been to the varied agencies of evangelism. (41)

The variety in the type of work entailed in extending and building up this Church is described in a report made during the 1920's as follows:

"The death of a great Raja: the conversion of sweepers: the light and shade of Indian Christian character: the problems of closer co-operation with the Indian church: dangers and opportunities arising from political unrest: the breaking up of mediaeval tradition in a conservative native State: the fight with the caste system within and without the church: farm settlement: co-operative banking: efforts to raise the economic position of the poorer Christians: the war with physical disease: High School work: village school/

---

NOTES

40) U.F.C. Reports, 1902, Statistics: 1911, pp.43-49:

work: preaching in town and village; Boy Scouts: temperance campaigns; antimalarial campaigns: public lectures to the educated; study circles; a great annual Christian convention; quiet retreats for workers; services for Europeans and Anglo-Indians —- all these and much else finds a place in the personal reports of your missionaries" (42) This heterogeneous programme, taken with the figures given above, indicates that problems of internal growth loomed as large as those of outward extension. The field was still a difficult one and its character had not altered much.

The external problems were those we have met with already. "Rajputana is a hard field" ran one contemporary report. "There has been a drop of 40 communicants during the year, many people having moved to other parts of India for work. There is no movement towards Christianity and national feeling is against the missionary. Converts are persecuted and taunted that they have betrayed their country." (43)

Among the features which merit special attention, pride of place must go to the farm settlement at Piploda. It was not the only establishment of its kind — Balakpura, "The Children's Village", was also a famine relief settlement founded near Ajmer about the same time with money sent by Sunday School children of the U.P. Church. Yet due to its larger size and more isolated position the future of Piploda was one of vital importance.

In the early 1900's the Ashapura orphanage was a place "throbbing with life" where elementary education for as many as 650 boys was balanced with vocational training. Given support by the Scottish Mission Industries Company, it was recognised by the Government and received a grant as an industrial training school. Here older boys were taught carpentry, smith-work, pottery, tailoring, masonry, weaving or gardening efficiently enough for the/

NOTES

42) Ibid., 1923, p.50
43) Ibid., 1913, p.16
whole concern to run at a slight profit. Brighter boys went on to higher education. And increasing numbers were sent to the new settlement opened at Piploa. (44)

Eleven senior boys from the orphanage were settled there with new wives from the Girls’ Orphanage in 1905 and while the harvest that year was a failure they showed independence enough to go out and try to earn sufficient by day labour to buy themselves bullocks for ploughing. (45) Within three years, as more ground came under cultivation, 84 young farmers had settled in and the Christian community was "growing through brides and babies". (46) A Kirk Session had already been formed, with three elders ordained for a three-year period. (47)

Much hardship was suffered, however, in the struggle against natural conditions and it was the exception for a good harvest to be safely gathered in. In 1916 only the Co-operative Bank carried the villagers through a famine, four years later the crops were frosted, the following year brought another drought and two years after that floods destroyed everything. (48)

The church began to flourish in its own small way, with the help of two day schools, a boarding school for girls and a little dispensary. Before the end of the period a pastor was installed, a new church built and the Sunday School was being congratulated on coming out top in the all-India examinations. The pastor also ministered to the branch settlement established at Ahmedi eight miles away. (49) Yet existence continued to be a hand-to-mouth/

---

**NOTES**

44) Ibid., 1903, p.38; 1904, p.49; 1906, pp.64-66 and passim
45) Ibid., 1906, p.66
46) Ibid., 1907, p.52; 1909, p.55
47) Ibid., 1908, p.58
48) Ibid., 1917, p.27; 1921, p.31; 1922, p.33; 1924, p.58 and passim
affair and a community which now numbered over 500 souls was more of a Christian enclave than an outward-looking body.\(^{(50)}\)

Progress in the older congregations reflected much of the same see-saw struggle. Institutions were multiplied and built up until besides the Normal Training School and the Women's Industrial Home at Beawar there were a Women's Normal School, four High Schools, four hospitals, numerous village schools and a number of hostels and dispensaries.\(^{(51)}\) Christian influences continued to spread until, as one missionary averred, "Christianity is the standard by which everything is measured. People say, 'It's as good as Christianity'".\(^{(52)}\)

A report from the early part of this period, which may be taken as representative, described the congregation at Jaipur — "It is heartening to see the good behaviour of Christians in a critical and even hostile community. The silent influence of older members helps to shape Christian character. The yearly congregational meeting helps interest in church affairs. The idea is being fostered that they are a corporate unity".\(^{(53)}\)

Two equally typical reports a quarter of a century later illustrate the virtues and faults emerging with greater maturity. Of Ajmer it was said, "The church here has managed its own affairs without help from the missionary — it has dropped the name Presbyterian and in doing so is realising that it has set out on a new career. Its membership is large - over 1,000 - but the/

\[\text{NOTES}\]

50) U.F.C. Report, 1923, p.54; C. of S. Report,1931, p.664 and passim
51) U.F.C. Report, 1925, pp.51-53
52) Ibid., 1925, p.53; 1917, p.25f
53) Ibid., 1903, p.37
missionary spirit is in its infancy. The community is apt to be self-centred and new converts tell one that they do not feel they are welcomed. There are, however, among the membership some notable instances of those willing to make sacrifices to welcome the converts but so far the church has still to learn what it is to be missionary."(54)

"The smallness of the congregations knits them together" went a similar assessment, speaking of the Church as a whole. And of one of the smaller congregations it was said, "They are splendid church-goers and every Sunday all the parents and children wend their way up the hill to church. The members are mostly young and form an inspiring audience to preach to --- They are not yet free from petty bickering but there is an advance. One notes the triviality of complaints to the Kirk Sessions, but is thankful that there are so few genuine cases of discipline."(55)

The picture may be painted in with a few individual features. Nasirabad, with its schools and orphanage, continued to rejoice in a young congregation. In 1904, out of a community of 860, which had jumped almost overnight through the baptism of 78 orphan girls, only 118 were communicants. And a generation later the church was still being crowded out on Sundays by 300 Christian school children.(56) In contrast, Jaipur had a large proportion of elderly people, the younger ones tending to scatter for work and better wages elsewhere.(57)

Christians at Ajmer were fortunate, a good number of their men-folk being employed at the railway workshops and at Jodhpur also government servants received a regular wage. But economic stability often went hand-in-hand with/

---

NOTES

54) Ibid., 1927, p.49
55) Ibid., 1929, p.178
57) U.P.C. Report, 1908, p.51
quarrelsomeness and failure to show an evangelistic outlook. (58)

Udaipur, with one of the larger Christian communities, showed a healthy congregational life, with women’s classes and young men’s classes and little shortage of volunteers for evangelism. But there was quite a conflict among members in the 1920’s when some sweeper families were converted and continued to follow their old profession. A community determinedly trying to climb the social scale was offended at what appeared to be an undermining of their position. Yet the sweeper people were accepted in time and the result of the conflict was a resurgence of missionary interest. (59) By contrast, small congregations such as that at Alwar, without a pastor and cut off from social life, were apt to lose heart. (60) And it was a general observation that the ignorance of the women-folk was a drag on all communities. (61)

While all congregations, in varying degrees, took part in evangelistic efforts, self-propagation could certainly not be called a distinctive mark of this Church. In the 1900’s, which were the years of most rapid growth, the addition in numbers came chiefly through the baptism of orphans who had reached adult years. Nasirabad in 1906 saw 104 adult and only 5 infant baptisms, all the former being girls from the orphanage. (62) Within a few years it was the "orphan babies" which were being brought forward -- 51 of them in 1911. (63)

---

NOTES

58) Ibid., 1908, pp.49 and 56; 1923, p.52
59) Ibid., 1906, p.56; 1923, p.53
60) Ibid., 1908, p.55
61) Ibid., 1923, p.54
62) Ibid., 1907, p.41
63) Ibid., 1912, p.15
Four years later the Mission was rejoicing that it had made more converts than for many years, some of them from high castes. (64) Individuals of different castes and races were indeed being brought into the Church - a Bengali Brahmin was baptised at Alwar; the pata of a local village near Kotah; a Rajput, a Brahmin, an Arya Samajist, a fakir, a samyad, a Parsi and a Mohammedan at Ajmer; and two Punjabi soldiers at Nasirabad. (65)

But the majority of accessions were from among outcastes and while congregations kept being encouraged to take part in evangelistic campaigns as well as to exert individual influence it was a recurrent complaint on the part of missionaries that "preaching needs to be done by the Church, not by us." (66)

Among the younger people, branches of the C.E. did excellent work both in bringing their members to Christian conviction and planting in them a desire for active forms of service. "How can we help our pastor?" the young Christians at Ajmer started asking. (67) And for older members of the community, the annual Mela or Convention, where as many as 2,000 would sometimes be gathered, served to deepen spiritual life and give a sense of unity of purpose while also underlining the fact that every Christian must be an ambassador for Christ. (68) The district round Brinpur was divided with the Mission as the Church's Home Mission field and medical and evangelistic camps organised. (69)
Yet for all this, propagation was still generally regarded as the province of the Mission's full-time workers. And it was not uncommon for disputes in the community so to occupy a congregation's attention that in the course of a year there would be no accessions from outside at all.\(70\) Sometimes there would even be considerable losses, as when a hundred nominal Christians from a village near Jaipur had to be removed from the roll for persisting in Hindu practices.\(71\)

Self-support in financial affairs was encouraged by the general rule that before getting a pastor a congregation should be able to pay his salary and while there were exceptions the aim was largely met by the bigger congregations. Ajmer, Nasirabad, Beawar, and Udaipur were all in this position before 1910 and also contributed to outside causes.\(72\) But even Ajmer, the most prosperous of all, could not have balanced its budget without the personal contributions of the missionaries.\(73\) Other Indian ministers such as the Rev. Manawar Khan at Todgarh were paid from Mission funds.\(74\) By the end of the period, Jaipur could claim to be self-supporting, though in fact a missionary still acted as pastor, and Jodhpur, where the Somerville Memorial Church had recently been dedicated, was in roughly the same position.\(75\) But there was as yet little question of any congregation/

---

**NOTES**

70) U.F.C. Reports, 1908, p.56: 1927, p.56: 1929, p.178
71) Ibid., 1912, p.15
72) Ibid., 1906, p.48: 1908, pp.49-53: 1911, pp.43-49
73) Ibid., 1908, p.49
74) Ibid., 1908, p.50
attempting much more.

Self-government, which operated at both the Kirk Session and the Presbytery levels, was strengthened as self-support and the sense of responsibility grew. But the number of ordained missionaries on the Presbytery, the fact that every church did not have a pastor and the control exercised over institutional work by the Mission Council were still severe limitations.

There was one exception to the very similar picture presented by all congregations of a beleaguered and somewhat ingrown life. Of the orphan children taken into custody by the Mission at Udaipur at the end of the century, a number belonged to the aboriginal Bhil tribes from the hills nearby, with whom contacts had already been made. A shy, backward and independent-minded people, they were not easy to deal with, though of 45 adults added to the church in 1903, 34 came from this tribe. The orphanage which was set up in the city and cared for 20 to 30 Bhil boys was clearly looked on by their parents as a great convenience. Sickly children would be dispatched there for care, but if the harvest promised to be a good one they would be called back to watch the fields. (76) But while a few more converts were made over the next few years, the situation was never a happy one. It was evident that the Bhils were ready to form an alliance with whatever body or movement would afford them the greatest natural advantages. And they were doubtful whether Christianity would do so. "The Bhils are keeping to themselves", wrote the Udaipur missionary in 1923 and the same year the Home was closed. (77)

Strangely enough, there appeared only three years later the first symptom of a genuine indigenous movement. Its leader was one Poona, an unbaptised/

NOTES

76) U.F.C. Report, 1903, pp.42-43
77) Ibid., 1924, p.56
youth from the Bhil Home who, while he had forgotten Jesus' name, had been explaining to his people the message of "The True Teacher". Their knowledge of the Teacher's words, if not always accurate, was remarkable. Of the first twelve men who came to Udaipur for baptism their questioners were moved to say --"They know more about Christianity than we do". The situation was by no means a simple one, as the people were cattle-thieves by profession, there was some question of Poona himself being involved in crime and there had also been some persecution of those baptised. Yet a Christian community of over 100 souls had been established and soon there were others under instruction for baptism. Once a minister had been found to shepherd them, there was every hope of further progress.(78) Up to date, this was the only aboriginal group in Rajputana yet to have been drawn into the Church, attempts to evangelise the Mers near Todgarh having been unsuccessful.(79)

There was little sign in the Church at this time of any political consciousness or much awareness of the outer world. The Swaraj movement had found a following among some of the city populations and in the 1920's Christian preaching in the Ajmer bazaars was stopped by cries of "Mahatma Gandhi ki jai!" But politically inspired opposition soon died down again and there are no reports of it having affected church life or activities.(80)

Religious opposition of the conservative variety was a constant factor to be reckoned with and as this period drew to its close there began to be seen a stronger defence of old religious practices, while money was being donated for the erection of new temples. "It is better than indifference", said one missionary, reviewing the signs of this revival.(81) But while it may have/

NOTES

78) Ibid., 1927, pp.54-55; C. of S. Reports 1930, p.659; 1931, p.662
79) U.P.C. Report, 1905, p.52
80) Ibid., 1922, p.29: 1923, p.50
81) Ibid., 1929, p.174.
affected the efforts of Mission workers and the atmosphere in some schools and institutions, it was of little concern to a Church still too small and weak to make an impact on communal life. Of the 24 States in the Province, only seven were occupied by congregations and the proportion of Christians throughout the region was still only about 1 to 2,500. Where the proportion was highest, as in Ajmer, it was only 1 in 500. In the circumstances, it could hardly be expected that the Christian community could exercise much influence. Cut off by their faith from social contacts with their neighbours and with little social life of their own outside the bounds of their congregational activities, their chief problem, both materially and spiritually, was still really that of survival. (82)

1930 - 1965

The far-reaching changes taking place in the world over the last 35 years, while they affected every Mission and Church, put more than average pressure on the Church in Rajputana -- or "Rajasthan", to give it the name adopted after independence. With a "strong" Mission growing weaker and a weak church unable to make up the necessary leeway, this was humanly speaking unavoidable. With the coming of the 1930's the Mission was faced by the universal staffing and financial difficulties. "Unless the staff is increased," ran a report in 1932 when overseas workers still consisted of 13 male and 24 women missionaries, "something will have to go -- something that is big -- and worthwhile." And again, "The schools are growing beyond the means of the Mission. Municipal schools don't charge fees and give scholarships. Congress turns people against Bible teaching". (83)

Almost twenty years later, with a missionary staff much reduced, it was/

NOTES

82) Ibid., 1922, p.29

83) C. of S. Report, 1932, pp.583 and 602
even clearer that "we need a New Deal between Church and Mission". (84)
The former still lacked strength through numbers and was chronically short of pastoral leadership and this had the effect of driving it further in on itself. The more it was thrown on its own resources, the more it displayed the characteristic of a Church Litigant rather than a Church Militant.

In the sphere of self-government, it became an unusual and distressing feature of the local situation that in the passage through stages of integration and the accepting of more responsibility on the part of the Church, it was the Mission Council which was placed in the position of appearing to object that the pace was too fast for Rajasthan. At the Integration Conference held for C.S.M. Councils in 1947, the Rajasthan delegates objected -- and were alone in openly tabling their objections -- to the generally accepted proposals. Their desire to take a rather different line towards the agreed end of complete integration was interpreted by the Foreign Mission Committee as being due to the following factors:

1. The difference in atmosphere in the Indian States, which were more feudal and less politically active.
2. The isolation of stations.
3. The sharp separation between Church and Mission and the backwardness of the Church, which was both the cause and the effect of separation.

The sincerity of the Church Council, which welcomed the proposals of the Conference and was restive at what it described as the conservative attitude of the Mission, should not in charity be questioned. (85) On the other hand, it was not a sign of a forward-looking spirit nor a desire to accept responsibility rather than power and authority. For when the/

NOTES

84) Ibid., 1950, p.377
85) Ibid., 1948, pp.350-353
practical issue arose of closing some Mission station or institution, the objections came from the other side. (86) It would be a reasonable, if over-simplified judgment of the situation to say that while the Church was eager for independence, without realising all the implications of such a step, missionary leaders were anxious not to overload it with institutional work, to the detriment of its own life and witness. (87) At the same time this was an unhappy instance of a break-down in the awkward triangular relationship existing among Church, Mission and Home Committee. It sowed seeds of misunderstanding and suspicion where there was a pressing need for harmony, and the consequences were serious.

The educational level of the Christian community was definitely rising and as a result of many years of teaching and example women and girls, both Christian and non-Christian, were beginning to emerge from their traditional seclusion. "The better educated girls are choosing nursing for their profession", a woman missionary had written from Jaipur in 1926. "Two further girls have just come from Piploka." (88) The establishment, at Nasirabad, of the first Girls' High School in the Province was an important step in raising the status of women (89) and by the 1940's, with more emphasis being placed on the indigenous church, Indian leadership was plainly improving. (90)

NOTES


87) Information obtained through correspondence: see also Minutes of the Rajputana Mission Council, 27th Feb. - 2nd Mar., 1948, Minute 23 and Appendix IV.

88) MS letter from Miss Ailie Smith, Jaipur, to Miss Lee, dated 13.5.26, S.N.L.


90) Ibid., 1942, p. 323
The Kirk Session of even a modest-sized congregation like that at Udaipur now included in its number two doctors, a professor, the department head of an educational institution and two Mission teachers, which was a notable contrast with earlier days. Individual congregations were also being strengthened by the presence of Christians from outside who were being appointed to civil posts -- Jaipur mentions a woman doctor in the State Hospital and the Headmistress of a Government Girls' School who acted as superintendent of the Sunday School.

While it was an unending fight to keep an agricultural community like Piploda, which continued to suffer from droughts and storms and was badly in need of an industry, from degenerating into a mere backwater agricultural exhibitions such as those held at Ashapura, with competitions for the best cattle and for handwork, cooking and the cleanest homes were raising the standard of living among the poorer congregations. The retort of a Mohammedan cook to the British officer who employed him and complained about the smallness of the eggs -- "I can't help it, the Christian hens are not laying just now" -- gives a small practical illustration of slow and varied processes of social improvement.

In spite of differences of opinion, integration had also been moving forward steadily. In 1942 the Church Council took responsibility for the payment of pastors and a few years later a Maintenance of the Ministry Fund.

NOTES

91) Ibid., 1951, p.313
92) "Rajputana" Report, 1956, p.29
95) Ibid.
was formed, to which a third of the 16 congregations then established were to contribute more than they received. (96) In the years which followed evangelistic work, schools and hostels, and medical work were successively handed over to the Council's supervision. (97) In 1960 Mission and Church Councils were finally united and in the course of the next few years that newly constituted body put into practice a much needed scheme for the transfer and location of pastors. (98) The fact that one Indian minister had not moved for 27 years and that there had been strong objections on the part of others to postings in the past are evidence of the need for such a measure. (99) In general the Council showed its ability to face up to a number of vexed or complex questions, such as the review of a syllabus for Religious Instruction in schools. (100)

But while to this extent the aims of self-support and self-government may fairly be said to have been reached and the Church had emerged ready to adopt new methods in dealing with fresh problems or opportunities, quarrelsomeness was a much clearer mark of its character than a desire to propagate its faith.

Evangelism, which was the first responsibility officially taken over, continued and developed on lines similar to those seen in other areas and any fault here lay in the lack of a driving spirit rather than in failure to make imaginative use of modern facilities and ideas. "The old kind of evangelism is not being done because of reduced staff and lack of evangelists", came a report from Ajmer in 1932 (101), and consequently greater emphasis began to be placed on voluntary work. In obedience to the challenge of the National/

---

**NOTES**

96) "Conference", May 1960, p.4: P.M.C. Report 1946, p.366

97) "Conference", May, 1960, p.4: P.M.C. Reports, 1951, p.312; 1957, p.359; 1960, p.454 and passim


100) C. of S. Report, 1961, p.26

101) Ibid., 1932, p.605
Christian Council, every pastorate started mounting its "Week of Witness" or annual evangelistic campaign. (102) And during the year most congregations, and groups within them, maintained their own particular forms of evangelism. In the 1930's, church members at Kotah visited the villages twice a week and Jaipur and Alwar had their cycle corps of young volunteers. (103) In addition to the bajan or singing groups, an individual of talent like the new evangelist who had a gift for conducting kathas -- dramatic recitals -- would on occasion introduce an original approach. (104) It was understood that nurses in the Church hospitals should conduct ward Services. (105) And with the 1960's modern audio-visual aids came into general use, while dispensary and bazaar preaching, bajan and Gospel teams and visitation of villages by Christian volunteers all continued. (106) Special campaigns were launched during Hindu festivals and not only were new converts made (107) but new churches established. The pastorate of Bikaner was taken over from the American Methodist Mission and a pastor installed and we read of three church buildings going up among the Bhil Christians in the 1950's. (108) School/

---

**Notes**

103) C. of S. Reports, 1932, p.606: 1937, p.693
104) "Conference", Feb, 1936, p.15
105) "Rajputana" Report, 1956, p.22
107) Ibid., 1934, p.605
108) Information obtained through correspondence.
C. of S. Reports 1949, p.348: 1950, p.377:
"Rajputana" Report, 1956, p.31
and evangelistic work was started among the professional beggars of Jaipur and near Ajmer a group of Harijans came asking for instruction. (109) Before the end of this period, the Church was setting aside 5% of its income for evangelistic work (110)

At the same time, by means of its annual Melas and by a greater concentration on youth work and lay training, it sought to stir enthusiasm among Christians and deepen inward life. The Conventions were organised by the Council's Evangelistic Committee, one held in Beawar to celebrate the church's 75th anniversary and the 15th of its Home Mission attracting 2,000 people. Another at Ajmer in the fifties lasted five days and attracted many non-Christians. (111) There is no doubt those Conventions were a source of real fellowship and provided a sense of strength and joyful unity of aim. Speaking of one such gathering and of the non-Christians who attended Services or looked on, one missionary could say "Christ has brought to their lives not only a new joy and happiness but a new enterprise and capacity, a new zest in living and a warm friendliness towards one another which it was a delight to behold. It was a striking contrast to see the wistful crowd of onlookers who gathered to watch the fun. One felt there was something lacking in their lives." (112)

For the younger Christians, in addition to the C.E. meetings and conventions where there would be talks and discussions on such subjects as:

"The young Christian in his home,

NOTES

112) "Conference", April, 1938, p.16
"The young Christian in his church", a Youth Fellowship movement was begun. (113) This was felt to be all the more urgent because "the problem of the rising generation, with their love of pleasure, lack of discipline and hooliganism" was being found among Christians as well as among the Hindu and Muslim youths attending Mission schools. (114) And even where outward behaviour was as circumspect as could be wished, there remained questions of sincerity and depth of Christian commitment. "Their behaviour is so exemplary and their fluency in prayer so remarkable", wrote a senior missionary of a particularly docile group at the High School hostel in Nasirabad, "as to arouse misgivings." (115)

In 1956 an ordained missionary was set aside for youth work and Youth Fellowships were organised in the larger congregations (116), while joint youth conferences held at Mount Abu or at the new Christian Retreat and Study Centre established at Ashapura included in their programme both Bible study and manual labour. (117) This Centre also became the meeting place for the Pastors' Refresher Courses and Lay Training Courses had already, under Mission auspices, become a regular feature of the Church's life. To the courses for lay workers, women also were now coming as delegates. (118)

While such new forms of work and witness were evolving among the more sophisticated communities, whose character and outlook was now that of the middle classes, the simpler approach was still being used towards the/

---

NOTES

113) C. of S. Report, 1949, p.346
114) Ibid., 1937, p.690
115) Ibid., 1949, p.347
primitive Bhils in a venture which had its full share of frustrations and reviving hopes. At considerable sacrifice to himself, the Rev. Hanif Ullah, a Muslim convert and an excellent pastor, had left Udaipur to accept a call to the Bhil community. But many of the new converts had been baptised without sufficient preparation and had also lacked pastoral care, with the result that by the time of his arrival over half the little group of 250 Christians had decided to revert to Hinduism. (119) For the best part of another twenty years the situation showed little change, until in the 1950's there came a revival of interest in Christianity. The tiny Church at Fai suddenly doubled in numbers, the Church Council lent a sum of Rs 1500 to help erect church buildings and local Christians themselves subscribed money and labour, often at considerable loss to themselves. Two churches were erected and later a third which was completely a local effort made under the leadership of the Christian compounder. (120)

If either Church or Mission had been stronger at the time, more might have been made of the opportunity. But as the only homogeneous community within its bounds, this group of Bhil Christians presents the Church with a continuing challenge.

As it faced the new internal problems being brought about by changing conditions, the Church in Rajasthan was now beginning to have its doors opened also to the world of national and social movements and of the Church beyond. Its internal problems were for the most part those common throughout the Indian fields — the difficulty of finding Christian husbands or wives for orphan converts or their children (121), the fact that converts in certain areas must now make a declaration before a magistrate (122)

NOTES
119) C. of S. Reports, 1932, p. 414; 1933, p. 554; 1934, p. 610
121) Ibid., 1932, p. 606
122) Ibid., 1934, p. 611; 1936, p. 559
and the reduction of grants-in-aid. (123)

Social and political movements were also those affecting the country as a whole, and while not at the centre neither was Rajasthan on the far periphery of such influences. To the materialism growing more evident in the 1930's (124) was added the resistance of a Hinduism which was national in sentiment as much as religious and had been refined by Christian values. New shrines were going up and the old festivals were proving no less popular, while the Arya Samaj protested that Christian preachers were "influencing these ignorant people". (125) Yet the idol-makers of Jaipur complained that business had never been so bad. The massacres which followed Partition in 1947 were at their worst further north, but there were riots and killings round Alwar, refugees came flocking into most States and to the Christian hospitals and a mixed population was left with a sense of insecurity. (126)

Political and social changes came nearer when the national Government took over the States from their hereditary rulers. Rajas and Nizams were required to accept from the Government a privy purse for the maintenance of their estates and private property and provincial governments were elected by the people. (127) In some respects the Church was here already ahead of the community. It had pioneered in backing up the claims of the outcastes and, more to the point, sweeper families were now being confirmed as full communicant members. (128) Christian women were freer and showed more/

---

NOTES

123) Ibid., 1948, p.346 and passim
124) Ibid., 1932, p.606
initiative than their sisters of other religions and at the time of independence were supplying almost the whole staff for nursing services in Rajasthan. (129)

Direct contacts with the world Church, while spasmodic, were also increasing in frequency. Jaipur's first Indian pastor had come from the Scottish Mission at Sialkot and he was followed by others from various parts of the country. (130) Ajmer took its turn at extending hospitality to the 8th General Assembly of the U.C.N.I. (131) At one annual Convention Rs. 1,100 was raised for aiding homeless Christians in the Punjab: the Ajmer pastor, the Rev. J.S. Ram, spent ten months in Kenya relieving the U.C.N.I.'s overseas missionary there: young people attended a Youth Conference at Madras: a group of pastors formed a fraternal with Anglican and Methodist ministers: and nurses at a Government hospital organised weekly meetings with other nurses who were Roman Catholic or "Syrian" Christians. (132)

Yet progress in such directions was being vitiated all along by a spirit of contention which kept splitting congregations into parties and turning energies inward. From the 1930's onwards these quarrels became more frequent and some of the worst kept re-erupting like sores that refused to heal. Inter-marriage, naturally aggressive tendencies, the limited size of Christian communities and the fact that their church was the centre round which all social life revolved may together explain the/

NOTES

130) "Conference" April 1938, p.16: Information obtained through correspondence.
131) G. of S. Report, 1946, p.366
causes, without condoning the sin. Divisions which were splitting the churches at Jodhpur and at Kotah in 1949 had not been mended seven years later. (133) A report in 1951 instances "many quarrels". (134)

Sometimes the New Testament spirit of repentance and forgiveness proved triumphant. On one occasion the Jaipur pastor, after deciding with reluctance to leave because of the animosity against him, received the apologies of the chief trouble-maker and agreed to stay. And the Piploda "Week of Witness", shelved for many years because of factions in the congregation, was eventually restored. (135) But the overall atmosphere has not yet cleared. The number of court cases involving two Christian parties, with an overseas missionary sometimes cited, is on the increase. And in 1966 the state of the Church was so serious that the annual Council meeting had to be postponed. (136)

The shortage of pastors has undoubtedly contributed to the unhappy situation, while low salaries were not able to attract in from outside men of the highest calibre. (137) Church attendances were generally recorded as excellent, there was seldom any difficulty in finding elders ready to conduct Sunday worship and Christian liberality, at 15/- a head in 1949,

NOTES

134) C. of S. Report, 1951, p.313
136) "Conference" March 1966, p.10
137) Information obtained through correspondence:
"rajputana" Report 1947, p.19
was as good as that to be found in many Scottish Presbyteries. (138) But the cry for more ministers going out in the 1930's was still being repeated twenty years later. In 1950, with eight Indian ministers on the strength, the Council was still left with seven unfilled vacancies. And when two young pastors were ordained in 1962, they were the first for sixteen years. (139)

The position in the last few years has fortunately improved, and rather than speak of a shortage of pastors it would be more accurate to stress the need of good pastoral oversight. One Indian minister may now be doing work that was formerly shared with a couple of missionaries and perhaps two or three full-time evangelists. Of the sixteen congregations which make up the Rajasthan Church Council (140), twelve have Indian ministers and four are vacant. An ordained minister is also serving as Headmaster of a Church High School, one probationer will shortly be due for ordination and there is a theological student in the middle of his course. Theological training is normally taken at the United Theological College at Bareilly, which prepares students for the L.Th. diploma with Hindi as the medium, but also some English. Students also used to go to Indore Theological Seminary, which in 1965 merged with Bareilly.

Of the Indian pastors at present in service, two at least have qualified as B.D.'s, four others at the L.Th. level and the remainder are Hindi-trained (141).

---

**NOTES**


140) The five newest pastorates, in addition to the eleven referred to as Mission stations at the beginning of the century, are Balakpura, Phal Nagra, Abu Road, Kripura and Bikaner.

141) Information obtained through correspondence etc.
The majority of congregations may be described as city or town charges, though all include the pastoral oversight of small groups of Christians living in villages near at hand. (142) Three of them — Ashapura, Piploda and Balakpura, outside Ajmer, are Christian villages, while Erinpura and Todgarh are villages of older vintage. The Bhil congregation East of Udaipur alone consists of rural communities. The community at Christiangunj, near a large irrigation tank outside Ajmer, is a suburban settlement of middle-class Christians and it is the Church Council's plan to establish it as a second congregation. The usual difficulties attending the planting of a church extension charge and the unwillingness of members to break with the parent church have so far prevented this move.

The pastoral care of isolated Christians — nurses, teachers, forest officers and so on — working in outlying villages and usually in government posts, presents a real difficulty. Yet besides being their due as church members, pastoral visitation reinforces their witness and gives opportunities for preaching which arise naturally and without any need for contriving.

The total Christian community numbers between five and six thousand, about half of these being communicant members. The total Christian givings for 1955 were a little over Rs2,000 and after West Bengal proportionately the highest for any former Church of Scotland Mission area. (143) Worship is conducted mainly in Hindustani and occasionally in Hindi, Council meetings using Hindi and the Synod English.

Congregational Boards include men and women both as elders and as managers, while Indian and European women workers have the opportunity, given/

---

NOTES

142) Ajmer, Udaipur, Kotah, Jaipur, Jodhpur and Bikaner are cities. Nasirabad, Beawar, Abu Road and Alwar correspond to small country towns.

the necessary qualifications, to be appointed as Church sisters. The proportion of men to women elders in 1955 was nine to one. (144) The Council follows the constitution recommended by the U.C.N.I. and while "representative" on the Presbyterian model also provides room for workers in charge of institutions. Pastors receive their salaries through a Central Fund to which all congregations contribute and which also draws interest from an Endowment Fund raised mainly through the sale of Mission property. As an interim arrangement, the Foreign Mission Committee continues to subsidise the Central Fund up to one third of its total. At present Ajmer, more than twice the size of the next on the list, is the only congregation to be in the full sense self-supporting, contributing more than it receives.

Among the men of unusual ability whom the Church has already produced are the Rev. Kenneth Masih, the son of a Mission colporteur, who became a pastor at Indore and later a Moderator of the General Assembly; and his brother-in-law, Boanerges Malvea, who as Principal of the Wing Christian College at Allahabad was also active in Assembly affairs. At a rather humbler level, there have been several men like B.S. Paul, the veteran Headmaster of the Jaipur High School, who gave a life-time of distinguished service in one place. In 1960, Paul received the President's award for outstanding educational service to the Province. (145)

As already suggested, Church Union within the Council area, while it has produced some opportunities for wider contacts for church leaders, has not done so for humbler workers and members of congregations. The American/

---

**NOTES**

144) "Rajasthan" Report, 1956, Statistics

Methodist Mission which at one time worked in Rajasthan withdrew a quarter of a century ago and retains only its Madar Sanatorium at Ajmer and a number of small congregations at Ajmer and Jodhpur. Those two congregations, being planted in centers already occupied, have tended to hinder the cause of Christian unity rather than further it. While there is a small Anglican church in Jaipur, no other Protestant Mission works in Rajasthan and further union, although it might strengthen cooperation in medical work, would do little to alter the Church's present situation. The Church would remain, from any Protestant viewpoint, the Church in Rajasthan. (146)

The faults and limitations of its character, therefore, depend completely for reformation on the action of God's Spirit on its present membership and present structure. From the intractable wastes of Rajasthan has risen an intractable Church. Its community, non-homogeneous in origin, now displays a very definite family likeness. If some of those features are less than attractive, they nevertheless stem from its people's natural qualities. In this sense, it is an indigenous Church. It remains to be seen whether this underlying unity, not achieved without struggle and cost, can under God become a strength used to a better purpose. /

---

NOTES

146) Information obtained through correspondence.
GENERAL SOURCES

W.F. Martin, "Martin Memorials", Andrew Elliot, Edinburgh, 1886


"Our Church's Work in India: The Story of our Rajputana Mission" by Frank Ashcroft.


"Sketches of the Fields: Rajputana", printed for F.M.C.

"Rajputana" reports, being a number of annual field reports printed for private circulation at the Wesley Press, Mysore City.

U.P. Church "Monthly Record".

"Conference".

F.M.C. Reports.

MS Papers, S.N.L.
In founding its fifty Indian Mission, the Free Church of Scotland departed from the method pursued up to date, that of planting a centre of education in a key city. Instead it moved into isolated hill country to work among aboriginal tribes.

The Santal country lies to the North of Calcutta in the angle formed by the Ganges and the Hoogly, and though at that time included in Bengal was soon to become part of the Province of Bihar. The Santal people, who trace their Indian ancestry back to before the Aryan invasions (1), have occupied South-West Bengal for at least three centuries and are the largest aboriginal group in the sub-continent to have retained their social cohesion. A "Deko", or Hindu, was to a Santal almost as much a foreigner as a European and he treated Brahmins with as much contempt as they treated him. (2)

Though the Santal tribe is a large one, its members are scattered widely in villages interspersed with towns or larger villages of Hindus or Moslems. Nowhere do they form the majority of the population and in the area which the Church of Scotland was to occupy they made up a minority of 20 to 25 per cent. The Church which developed was over 90 per cent Santal, however, a fact which explains many of its special characteristics.

Gaining a scanty livelihood through rather spasmodic agriculture, the Santals found their stimulus and amusement in hunting, dancing, singing and the drinking of rice beer. Community life centred round the village and was/

NOTES

1) Dr. B.S. Gupta, who distinguishes six main racial types in India, classes the Santals among the Proto-Australoids, the second racial group to reach India, after the Negritos. See B.S. Gupta, "Racial Elements in the Population", Oxford Pamphlets on Indian Affairs, 1944.

2) The attitude of the plains Indian towards the Santals is illustrated by the first description of Chakai given to Dr. Macphail by the Bengali postmaster: "This, sir, is a country of barbarous people, precipitous mountains and ferocious animals". Quoted "Conference", May 1934, p.14.
so organised as to make common action inevitable in social, economic and religious affairs. While there was also a loose system of linkage among groups of villages, the basic tribal divisions were through clans and sub-clans, ties of kinship governing a man's relationships with his fellows and imposing rigid standards of right conduct. The village system, like the family system, was patriarchal, the hereditary headman of "manjhi" being a man of considerable consequence. While intermarriage outside the tribe was forbidden, clans within the tribe were exogamous and women enjoyed a fair amount of freedom and the honour of being valued as marketable commodities, though not so highly priced as a horse. This custom should be noted as running counter to Hindu practice and in addition child marriage was practically unknown among the Santals, while widows were free to re-marry.

Daily life and domestic affairs followed the pattern of a strong tribal society whose cohesive elements were language and race rather than religion. Religion was animistic, a major part being played by totemistic and sacrificial rites, exorcism, food taboos, veneration and worship of ancestral spirits and magical beliefs. The two great yearly festivals, the "Baha" or Flower Festival in early spring and the "Sohrae" festival which followed the autumn harvest were indigenous and owed nothing to Hinduism. Religion as such, however, especially in times of prosperity, was not regarded as important, a characteristic which early missionaries took as a sign of the Santal people's seemingly ineradicable "materialism".

Santal morals, if low by Christian standards, were high compared with those of Indian plainsmen. Although given to shiftlessness, superstition and drunkenness, they were courageous, truthful and faithful to their tribal mores, and with sturdy independence had managed to preserve their language and customs against outside pressure. A virile people, they were still growing in numbers and continued to do so after the forces of Christianity and of Westernised civilisation had made their dual entry.
Besides the Santals, there were also other and smaller tribes inhabiting the district, among those least affected by Hinduism being the Kols and the Mahles.

Two years before the Mutiny, the Santals, exasperated by the exactions of Hindu money-lenders, rose in rebellion and determined to march to Calcutta to lay their grievances before the Governor-General. They were badly led and left indiscriminate slaughter in their path. When British troops were sent against them, the Santals' savage reputation and the fact that British Officers were completely ignorant of their language led to a campaign which almost developed into a massacre. When the Government had come to a better understanding of their wrongs, they were placed under official protection and Missionary Societies were encouraged to enter their area to tame and educate them.

The C.M.S. and a joint Lutheran Mission were the first to seize the opportunity. Then Alexander Duff, after a cold weather tour round Paresnath hill in the winter of 1862-63, suggested that the Free Church should also open a Mission there and an Anglo-Indian, Mr. Vernieux, was sent from Calcutta in 1869. Two years later Dr. Templeton reached Pachamaba as the first Scottish missionary, to be joined in 1875 by Dr. Dyer. This was the beginning of the long tradition of medical work and supervision by medical missionaries which has been a characteristic of the Mission. (3)

During the first generation of the Mission's life and beyond, missionaries found three circumstances in particular which worked to their advantage. While there was resistance to their teaching the primitive beliefs of the people presented a much less obdurate target than the hard front of Hinduism or Islam. The absence of a caste system meant that a Santal who became a Christian was still regarded as a Santal. In the earlier days of the/

NOTES

3) See General Sources.
Mission, conversion certainly led to social ostracism, Santals refusing to eat, hunt or inter-marry with those who had become Christians. But there was little direct persecution and a strong community spirit, while it might initially hold back potential converts from making a Christian profession, could also lead to the gathering in of groups rather than individuals. "It is a characteristic feature of the Santals that they are exceedingly loath to take any step, unless all the people of their village or indeed their community of villages take it together." (4)

At the same time, there were also peculiar difficulties. The lack of the traditional Indian reverence for all things religious and a thoroughly "materialistic" outlook led one missionary to compare local efforts at evangelism to trying to drive nails into airy nothing. "A man will listen intently to the most earnest preaching, and when you wait for his response, it is to beg a little tobacco or to ask how much you paid for your boots." (5)

Scattered communities tucked away in inaccessible corners of the jungle also made Christian shepherding an exhausting task. And there was none of that desire for learning and enlightenment evident on the plains. As late as 1900, only 7 out of every thousand male non-Christian Santals could read and women were reported as still wholly illiterate. (5)

In 1875, two more district centres were opened up. That at Pokhuria, a deserted site reputed to be haunted by a demon and situated in the Tondee district about 30 miles South-East of Pachamba, was manned by Andrew Campbell, an artisan missionary who was later ordained: while the village of Bamdah, 30 miles North-East of Pachamba in the Chakae district was occupied by Dr. Dyer. Besides finding it hard to maintain an existence by cultivation of their own land, the Santals possessed something of a wanderlust, and before coal /

NOTES
4) F.C. Report, 1878, p.25
5) "Our Church's Work", in India: Santalia", by J.M. Macphail, p.40
6) Ibid., p.25.
fields were opened in their native area many of them would travel to work as
day labourers at harvest time in the Bengal plains or to the tea gardens of
Assam. About 1890, the South Sylhet Tea Company agreed to pay the salary of
a missionary who would also act as chaplain to the planters and of two
Christian Santal teachers. The first missionary, the Rev. R.E. White, made
his headquarters at Jaycherra. In 1908 a fifth and last centre of operations
was established at Tisri, about 30 miles West of Bamdah, by another medical
missionary. Here in a large area with a population of 200,000 co-operative
work was done with Anglicans and Lutherans, though there was also to be
competition with Roman Catholics. With this last advance, the present
boundaries of the Scottish Mission area had been set. (3)

Reports of the early years of the Mission's work, while containing
little that can be called exceptional, provide an excellent running commentary
on the stages of labour which give birth to a Church. More than itinerant
preaching, it was by the teaching and influence exerted through elementary
education that the missionaries saw their best opportunity. At that time,
among the thirty to forty thousand people living in the Pachamba area, not
one child was receiving schooling and the only means of gathering a nucleus was
to offer free lodging, food and clothing. Short of supporting him entirely,
there was no other way of teaching a boy to read and write and the Boarding
School at Pachamba started on this system. Then village schools were opened
up, conducted on the simplest of lines, without a building or furniture and
led by an itinerant teacher. Little boys took two hours off at mid-day from
their task of herding cattle, to sit under a tree or in the shade of the
village temple, scrawling their letters on the sunbaked earth with chalk dug
from the hills. (7) Within a couple of years, when the Boarding School had 32
boys and about 50 village children were being taught the three R's, two young/

3) See General Sources.
7) Our Church's Work, p.53.
men, pupils at Pachamba, were baptised as the Mission's first converts. (3)

A year later they were joined by 5 more Santals and a Kol, all again Boarding School pupils. Happily none of them was cut off from social intercourse, all retaining their rights and being free to visit among their relations. With a task force now collected of 16 agents, 7 of them being Christian Santals and borrowed presumably from neighbouring Missions, it was possible to embark on more direct forms of evangelism. (6)

By the time another year had passed, work in Santalia was already being remarked on as showing visible results larger than that among Hindus (10), and the following year a band of Santal preachers of character and energy were moving round the villages. There were 25 baptisms, 19 of the new converts being adults and their conduct was encouraging. "When we remember the temptations that beset some of them and the steadfastness with which they adhere to the Scriptures as their rule of life, we feel that this community of native Christians must ere long exercise a most beneficial influence on their heathen relations and neighbours." Four teachers, all of whom could read Hindi and Santali and one at least a little English, were keeping up a circuit of 11 schools, and it could be said that there were village groups which were Christian in all but name. (11)

Of the 45 adults baptised in 1878, the majority had been reached through contacts in schools or the hospitals, (12) and a year later the Presbytery of Bengal had agreed to form a congregation. With no ordained missionary in the field, the three lay missionaries were inducted as elders of a Kirk Session whose Moderator worked in Calcutta. While there was as yet/

NOTES
8) W.C. Report, 1874, p.17
9) Ibid., 1875
10) Ibid., 1876, p.11
11) Ibid., 1877, p.11: 1878, p.24
12) Ibid., 1879, p.24
no indigenous organisation, it could be said with pride that "the medical, evangelistic and educational work — are extending along lines which converge in the one point of a living Church." (13)

A determined effort was now made to inculcate Christian habits and strengthen the community at its weakest point by the formation of a Total Abstinence Society. (14) "We could forget everything connected with our religion except the drink", as one old Santal said to Andrew Campbell, "that we could never give up." (15) The following year, while some village headmen were trying to influence their people against Christianity, it was being welcomed by villagers who tried to blend its teaching with their own religious practices. (16)

By 1882 the community included 113 communicants and 140 adherents, morale and conduct were noted as high, and it was a matter for rejoicing that the majority of the converts were young. (17) The next year with Christians passing the 300 mark, the Government handed over all education to the Mission, which now had 23 schools to work through. An effort was made through the founding of a Pastor's Fund to encourage more systematic giving — "We are keeping prominently before the people the principle of giving to the cause of Christ" — and within a year Rs.135 had been collected. One group of villagers teamed up to cultivate two plots of land and the money earned by the produce, about two shillings, was given to the Church. (18)

In 1884 there were more applications for baptism than ever before and signs of a deeper spirit among Christians themselves. But tribal customs were not easily abandoned and a strict probationary period was required.

Sunday Schools flourished and the Pastor's Fund continued to grow. (19)

NOTES

13) Ibid., 1880, p.15
14) Ibid., 1881, p.21
15) Our Church's Work, p.60
16) F.C. Report, 1882, p.27
17) Ibid., 1883, p.27
18) MS letter from A. Campbell, Pokhuria, to Dr. Smith, dated 24.4.1882, S.N.L.: F.C. Report, 1884, p.21
19) F.C. Report, 1885, p.18.
Home Committee were now urging the need for Santal congregations to call and support a pastor of their own, but the missionaries replied that the scattered nature of the churches, the poverty of members and the youth and inexperience of the only men available as pastors precluded such an aim from being realised for many years to come. Nevertheless they emphasised the importance of shepherding. "We have arrived at the stage now when the teaching and looking after of the Christian community must be provided for" wrote Andrew Campbell in 1886. "Formerly, when it was smaller, this could be effected without appreciably lessening the time which could be devoted to evangelistic work — but this is no longer possible" Christians were scattered, a few families here and there over a wide area and all travelling had to be done on foot. It was impossible to gather them into centres for public worship and instruction. They had to be visited in their homes. One new Christian village was established at Baritand, in the shadow of Mount Paresnath and seven families settled under a headman who was an experienced evangelist and also acted as pastor and headmaster. For some time rents were not paid regularly, but the village eventually became self-supporting, the scheme working out more successfully than in other fields. Yet the experiment was not repeated. Rather than settle Christians on Mission land and advance them money to buy beasts, seed and implements, the missionaries concluded that cultivators got on better on their own, provided they were given timely advice and encouragement.

At the same time the need had arisen to build adequate churches at the central station — schoolrooms and dispensary rooms no longer sufficed. The Free Church Mission was co-operating with the C.M.S. to translate the Scriptures into Santali. The magic lantern was proving its worth as an aid /

---

NOTES
20) MS copy of Santal Mission Minutes, dated 11.10.1883, S.N.L.
21) F.C. Report, 1886, p.20
22) Ibid., p.21
23) Our Church's Work, p.56
24) Ibid., p.69.
to evangelism. And to supplement the day schools, Sunday Schools were teaching by means of Christian songs set to local tunes. (25)

It was a distinct sign of growth that of the 25 adults baptised in Toondee district in 1886, the majority had been brought in by their own relatives. Discipline was still being exercised by a missionary Kirk Session — who added 16 names to the communicants' roll that year, but withdrew 7 others. But attendance at worship was regular and the demeanour of worshippers was quiet and attentive. Family worship is said to have been conducted in most homes. (26) The following year the number of baptisms reached 230, the highest figure yet. Most of the new converts came from the hill village of Kolkarin in the Toondee District and within three years 200 Christians were worshipping there in a mud church. (27)

Stripped of its natural ingredients — the jungle background, the life-pulse of a simple, lusty and lovable people, and the patient Christian devotion which taught and healed, exhorted, scolded and pleaded, this tale of little-by-little makes rather insipid reading. But the reality was anything but insipid, as the graphic letters and reports of the period make plain. During the spring and summer, which was the hunting season, evangelism was apt to be quite an energetic business, one missionary explaining that he and his two Santal evangelists would join with the villagers in their hunts and then preach to the assembled crowds in the evening at their resting-places. (28)

In the course of the 1890's, while this was seen as mainly a decade of consolidation, the number of Christians nearly doubled, from about 700 to over 1,300. Growth tended to be by jumps rather than by arithmetical progression, as is understandable when it was groups and not individuals coming forward. The Chakai district in 1893 reported no baptisms at all, but /

NOTES

25) F.C. Report, 1886, p.21
26) Ibid., 1887, pp. 21-23
27) Ibid., 1888, p.18: 1892, p.20
28) MS letter from Dr. J.A. Dyer, Pachamba, to Dr. Smith, dated 11.4.1882, S.N.L.
the total for the Mission five years later was an influx of nearly 120 adults and children. (29)

In the famine years which arrived at the end of the century, when many villages were trying to eke out an existence on roots and berries, and the Government and the Mission alike were engaged in famine relief work, 500 people in the Toondee area who had become economically dependent on the Mission asked for baptism. Faced already with the practical problem of supervising his community, the missionary wisely told them to wait until the famine was over. (30)

With 50 elementary schools, most of them situated in villages round Pachamba, and a staff of 27 native evangelists, the level of education and of Christian knowledge was gradually rising. But the ratio of communicant members to adherents was less than 25 per cent, and it was recognised that many children of Christian parents were growing up without proper instruction. (37) The difficulty, as reports reiterate, was not that of vast numbers, for conversions had not kept up with the growth of the Mission agency. It was rather that of a Church dispersed in scores of tiny units, aggravated as often as not by the nomadic nature of its members.

Central Churches were erected at Toondee in 1887, Pachamba two years later and Bamdah in 1893, (32) and these were substantial buildings planned to hold large congregations — in the case of Toondee up to 500 people. Yet by the end of the century they were needing to be enlarged. And for a good half of the Christian community, worship was still conducted in some mud-and-thatch building under the supervision of a catechist or teacher. Services were normally held in Santali, yet it was also necessary to be able to preach.

---

NOTES

29) F.C. Report, 1894, p.21: 1899, p.28
30) Ibid., 1898, p.6
31) Ibid., 1899, p.28
32) Our Church's Work, pp. 56. 62. 78 and 81.
and converse in the two other dialects. Christians of the Kol tribe by now had the Catechism, the Lord's Prayer and the Ten Commandments printed in their own language, but as yet nothing had been printed in Mahle. (33)

Discipline was now beginning to be exercised by local Christian panchayats and revealed its peculiar problems, as is evidenced by the new rule established at this period, that no one might become a communicant member until they had married. One communicant suspended for taking a concubine is said to have answered plausibly that he was but "walking in the footsteps of David and Solomon." (34) The buying and selling of wives was a subject which was agitating the whole Christian community, one Missionary Society being in favour of continuing the custom while the others opposed it. (35)

The Church had as yet neither ordained pastors nor licensed probationers and while leaders were elected to local panchayats, there was no Kirk Session or Deacons' Court. Rightly or wrongly, the missionaries still considered the Church as in the nursery stage of development. (36)

"For many years to come they must be guided and encouraged in their work, if it is to be effective, by the personal co-operation and example of the missionary." (37) In practice, this actually meant pastoral supervision, which missionaries felt necessary on the ground that Santal Christian leaders were easily discouraged. "We found from our experience that --- evangelists when left to themselves become despondent and lose heart in their work and are moreover apt to become negligent and lazy. Frequent visitation is absolutely necessary," wrote the Pachamba missionary in 1880. (38) Periodic betrayals of trust had the effect of confirming them in this opinion. "Of Saolapur I can only report/
the most painful news. Our chief fellow-worker there has again turned out to be an immoral, ungrateful, family-deserting, praying hypocrite," came another comment almost twenty years later. (39)

Because they saw little hope of Santal ministers being ordained in the near future, the missionaries of this period favoured the system followed by Congregationalists and put forward a strong plea to the Bengal Presbytery that unordained workers should be permitted to administer the Sacraments. "If liberty to administer the Sacraments were given to others than ministers of the Word", wrote W.H. Stevenson in the 1880's, "The missionary effectiveness of the Church in India would be greatly increased." Explaining that converts held back because there was no one to baptise them, he declared his belief that every ordained elder, and certainly every Mission evangelist, should be allowed to baptise and conduct Communion Services. "We believe that Presbyterianism would thus be most easily adapted to meet the needs of the village communities of India." (40)

Meanwhile a small army of workers, "some 75 Christian Santals, catechists, evangelists, leaders, school inspectors, compounders, nearly all of whom are converts of the Mission, trained from first to last in the Mission schools" (41), were now available to lead and represent the Church of the future. At a village called Jalakdiha, half a day's journey from Pachamba, a Home Mission field had been established and the salaries of one of the two catechists was being met from Church collections. (42)

It would be wrong to underestimate, also, the impact made by Christianity, in these thirty years, on the Santal people as a whole. With every school in the area under its control, an annual attendance of 12,000 patients at its hospitals and dispensaries, and its central church buildings/
the most imposing symbols of community life these simple people had yet seen, the Mission had virtually taken over the civil administration of the district and become the Santal’s means of contact with the outside world and the only form of authority he knew. Nor is it surprising that the gap between missionaries and their native successors seemed so large as to be for the present impassable. A man like Andrew Campbell, who settled in a remote corner of jungle, ten miles from the nearest road, was not called “Father and Mother” for nothing, and did a great deal more than open schools, preach the Gospel, baptise converts — 97 of them one day in a village stream — and dispense simple medicines. He also introduced the cultivation of castor oil plants and mulberry trees and taught brickmaking, bricklaying, carpentry, iron-work, silk culture in all its stages, printing, book-binding, lace-making, and cotton weaving. In the printing press which employed 20 youths, books and Bible portions were produced in 4 languages, Campbell himself doing much writing and translating and being responsible for the editing of the first Santali dictionary. Among other duties he also accepted that of district magistrate. (43)

The situation, common enough in tribal Africa, was more extreme than any yet encountered by Free Church missionaries in India. It is not surprising that few of the innovations introduced by a man of Campbell’s abilities to stimulate cottage industries should survive his death. And it would have been exceptional if he and his colleagues had not thought it necessary to continue exercising a firm paternalism. Yet it remains true that the independent nature of the Santal people, lacking any natural urge for education, was left with little incentive to establish an independent Church. /

NOTES

43) Pamphlet: “Dr. Campbell of Santalia”. Printed by F.M.C. for U.F.C., no date. (New College Library. Not listed in E.G.K. Hewat’s bibliography.)
"A great difference between the first period of mission activity and the following stages is the existence of a Christian community" writes W.J. Culshaw, with Santalia in mind. (44) And while the community gathered by the Free Church Mission was very much smaller than that of the continental Lutheran Mission to which he was at this point referring and still consisted mainly of small village groups connected by jungle paths, we may say that something approaching a Christian social life was beginning to appear. (45)

Figures in this instance are apt to be misleading. In the first sixteen years of the century a community of 1,300 had risen to about 2,000, but by 1930 had shrunk to under 1,900, just 30% in that latter year being communicant members. (46) This can be accounted for in part by purging of the rolls, which was done periodically. (47) But while in the first decade of the century there might be as many as thirty baptisms in a year, most of the new converts coming in through the influence of relatives and friends, by the 1920s it was not unusual for a busy district such as Bandah to record none at all and it became quite an event for as many as seven adults to be received into one congregation. (48)

It was unusual, too, for a village headman to become a Christian, though one is reported as having been baptised with his family at Tisri, and without this lead there was less likelihood of a whole village following suit. (49) "The growth of the Christian Church in Santalia is slow", wrote one missionary that year, and went on to explain that the burden of medical work allowed him to give to evangelism and education only the fag-end of his time. About the best that could be said of the Church was that it was "marking time". (50)

NOTES

44) J.W. Culshaw, op.cit., p.173
45) In 1941, the Lutheran Mission community numbered about 25,000.
    The Scottish Mission Church had less than a tenth of this,
47) U.F.C. Report, 1915, p.21
48) Ibid., 1906, p.25: 1913, p.15: 1928, p.22 and passim
49) Ibid., 1925, p.25
50) Ibid., 1923, p.30: 1927, p.70
Gathering together for worship on Sunday provided the young Church with its chief social activity and conduct on such occasions was orderly and obedient — "one may remark on the subdued and earnest appearance of Santal congregations compared with England." (51)

But the Christianising of daily life was a more complicated matter. The conduct of Christians was "good and bad" and missionaries confessed how difficult they found it to write with confidence about the spiritual condition of the Church. "The Christian liberality of the people approximates to the average among Indian Christians generally — a rupee per member or As. 4 per Christian — and the moral conduct of the great majority has been good. What causes most anxiety is a growing spirit of worldliness and indifference which are probably the direct result of the manifest improvement in the material condition of the people. It is pitiful to find how cheaply the soul of a Santal can be corrupted. A man grows purse-proud and worldly-minded on 2d. a day and neglects the worship of God for a few pigs and goats. The heathen plead their poverty as an excuse for not becoming Christians, but we are always telling Christians that their greatest danger lies not in poverty but their prosperity." (52)

If such a judgment sounds over-harsh to our ears, it is certainly not due to intolerance on the part of the writer or lack of familiarity with the background of the sheep being shepherded. "One often wonders" he confessed on another occasion, "How far our very ignorant Christians are able to appreciate and profit by the ordinary church services, and how far the preaching especially goes over their heads. One day last year we took as our text the parable of the Unjust Steward and sought to inculcate the lesson that Christians ought to be as zealous in doing God's work as the worldly were in seeking their own interests, or the heathen in serving their own/

NOTES

51) Ibid., 1906, p.25
52) Ibid., 1907, p.21: 1908, p.24
idols. 'When you Santals go hunting', we said, 'you think very little of the heat or the cold, of sun, or rain, or dew: you live for days on a little dry food, and sleep at night under the trees; but we have never seen you yet preaching the Gospel with the same disregard for personal comfort'. It so happened that three of the evangelists were to go off on a preaching tour on the Monday. They quietly slipped away without taking a tent, with only one coolie to carry all their things, instead of the three always allowed. They tramped 160 miles and visited 36 villages, some of which had never been reached before, in eight days, and on their return presented a bill of four annas for their expenses. The incident serves also to illustrate how intimately, at this stage of missionary work, the pastoral and evangelistic functions are intertwined." (53)

In spite of the difficulties of pastoral oversight which were reiterated year by year, a distinct improvement in moral standards could be observed, along with the development of activities which centred round the church. "Already the Christians begin to differ from the heathen in appearance, being clean and tidy as to dress," said the Pachambha missionary. The festivals of Christmas and Easter, the former especially taking on the nature of an act of communal enjoyment, took the place for Christians of the traditional Santal feasts and by 1930 the institution of a Santal Christian Convention had added something new and on a grander and wider scale. (54) Christian stewardship was encouraged with the introduction of a Freewill Offering system, and the printing of a Santali hymnal was another advance. (55)

The severest bar to progress, however, was the lack of native pastors. Congregations had been contributing year by year but by 1930 Kirk Sessions were still being moderated by a missionary while the day-to-day work of a /

NOTES:

53) Ibid., 1904, p.26
pastor was performed by an unordained catechist. (56) This major handicap was due primarily to the dearth of educated workers but also to the fact that there was no European minister to train them. The work of the stations revolved round their hospitals and ordained men were either doctors or the Chaplain at Sylhet.

By 1905, over 23,000 patients were being attended to in the hospitals every year and work at Bamdah in particular was growing "at an alarming rate." (57) As the Bamdah hospital's reputation for eye surgery spread, patients began to arrive from as far away as Calcutta or Rajputana; until by the 1920's more than 3,000 operations were being performed in a year. It is not surprising that the doctor in charge, with the additional task of supervising over 60 village schools, should have little time to spare. (58) Another significant factor to be taken into account is that Santals themselves did not form the bulk of hospital patients. They were distrustful of this new form of magic and the majority of patients were Bengalis or from further afield. On leaving hospital they moved, of course, out of the Mission's orbit.

"Actual conversions as a result of the work of our Mission hospitals are comparatively rare", ran one candid comment in 1926. (59) Hence the plea kept being renewed, "We need three ordained missionaries" -- "the care of the Christian community is a matter for anxiety" -- "we must have an ordained missionary to train men for the pastorate." (60) The inability of the Foreign/}

NOTES

56) Ibid., 1927, p.67
57) Ibid., 1905, p.24: 1906, p.25
Mission Committee to find such a man at an earlier stage undoubtedly had an adverse effect on the Church’s development.

For better or worse, the missionary himself was still a patriarch and the Church almost wholly dependent on him both for making ends meet economically and for its evangelistic drive. Elders were always capable of keeping up the normal practices of weekly worship but the urge to bring in their kinsfolk slackened off as a second generation of Christians settled down into a way of life now growing familiar. It is significant that the first sign of a revival for many years took place in Bandah when a Santal divinity student returned on holiday and began to chide his fellow members for their slackness. The immediate results were the formation of a “Band of Friends”, a new interest in reading the Bible, fresh vows to stop drinking beer and the conversion of two families. (61) The very unusualness of the event indicates how much such a spirit had been lacking and the inability of the Church’s own leaders to infuse it.

At the economic level, too, it took a long time to teach this tribal community how money must be provided for anything beyond their own personal and immediate needs. Mission institutions were erected with Mission money, but the central church buildings at Pokhuria and Bandah were also gifts from Scotland. (62) And while we do hear near the beginning of this period of a little iron church being built by the Christians at Sylhet, this was paid labour and not a voluntary contribution. It seems that almost another twenty years had passed before the custom became accepted that while the Mission would supply the heavy material for local church buildings, the community was expected to supply the rest. (63)

It was in Toondee that the most sustained practical efforts were made both to train young men to a trade and to raise the standards among /

NOTES

61) U.F.C. Reports, 1904, p.16 and passim; C. of S. Report, 1931, p.643
62) U.F.C. Report 1904, p.25
63) Ibid., 1902: 1924, p.30
farmers by releasing them from debt. To the printing Press was added a Co-operative Bank scheme and a weaving school, (64) while over near Pachamba the Mission’s only “Christian village” venture at Baritand was stated to be quite capable of standing on its own feet — “Having helped them in the past, Mission funds are no longer to be drawn upon to aid the people who are quite able to work for themselves and their families.” Twenty years later the 200 Christians of Baritand had advanced far enough to be electing their own Kirk Session. (65)

Yet by 1930 the year’s offering for the whole Church came to less than £40. (66) Even if full-time pastors had been available the Church was in no state to support them, nor did it show any great desire to do so.

Where economic standards were rising, indeed, it was not through those laudable but mainly abortive attempts to introduce new trades and methods but as a result of steady employment under the Mission, through opportunities for clerical work open to men and women with education and through the increasing number of Santals who were travelling to work in the mines. For the Church these changes created as many problems as they solved. “The Santals are becoming civilised”, wrote one missionary in 1912, “the Government is recognising the need for special education for them. But as they reach the level of the Hindu community, they are more influenced by its religious standards and ritual. Commercial development is against the development of spiritual life.” (67)

Yet there could be no refusing to face the fact that civilisation was on its way in. The coal and mica mines where more and more men from the Toondee district were going for work were near enough to prevent the /

NOTES

64) Ibid., 1905, p.24; 1907, p.20.
65) Ibid., 1903, p.17; 1923, p.30.
66) C. of S. Report, 1931, Statistics
danger of detribalisation so common in Africa. But the money now available
for spending was naturally as likely to demoralise as to uplift. (68)

Simultaneously, as the Government took an increasing interest in the
tribe's peculiar needs and as soldiers returned from the war, there grew a
greater awareness of the world outside which was in the next generation to
present new tensions. (69)

As the writer of the little Mission "Sketch" put it: There are those
who say that it is a pity to try and change (the Santal way of life), that
it would be better to leave the Santal alone and unspoiled. The fact is,
however, that in the world as it is he cannot, try how he may, be left
alone." (70)

So far as the Church was concerned, these first thirty years of the
century were a time of little outward advance, and it was still a native
body very much "under tutorship" in all departments which had to accept
much of the leadership for the Santal people as they felt the force of the
greater changes now to come.

1930-1965

If the 1920's were a winter season of little growth, with the next
decade and the third generation of the Church's history a surge of life
moved through it once again. And as the isolation of Santalas was
progressively broken down, seeds of new growth which had not been apparent
to the eye showed their heads above the surface.

It became possible to speak once again about "a vigorous and
growing church and community". The need for missionary leadership had not
lessened but there was a deepening of spiritual life and education was
tempering and refining the character of the community. "We are observing /

NOTES

p.625 and passim.
69) U.F.C. Reports, 1918, p.20 and passim.
a social and religious awakening among the Santals", it was recorded. "Socially and politically they are no longer willing to accept their age-long status and condition of life. Christians are taking a leading part towards self-help. In the church they are taking responsibility too." (71)

Bandah, from which that report issued, was witnessing more adult baptisms than ever before and new converts were standing fast under persecution. (72)

The problems which had taken shape in the previous generation had not disappeared. No native Santal had as yet been ordained a minister: the struggle to maintain the numbers and standards of village schools became no easier: the draw of the coal fields kept increasing year by year: and a Roman Catholic Mission with offers of free education, board and clothing was offering fresh competition. (73) Yet a revival of evangelistic enthusiasm within the Church, a desire on the part of the Santal tribe to gain the benefits of education and the stirrings of political consciousness were positive advances which proved more than sufficient to tip the balance.

In native leadership and natural expressions of Christian solidarity there was a distinct improvement. "There is a growth of leadership qualities for the indigenous church", wrote the missionary from Tisri, "One finds joy in church services, personal aggressiveness in evangelistic endeavour and a commendable liberality." (74) Elders showed keenness to lead or take part in Sunday services and gained even greater confidence in later years when the supervision of the missionary was withdrawn. (75)

The most effective step towards these ends was the installation of the first Santal pastors. Bandah's first convert, the beloved "Chandrae /
Pastor", had served the church devotedly for fifty years and on his retiral, his son, a Mission compounder, was elected by the congregation in his place. But both father and son, like the "pastors" in the other congregations, were locally trained men who had never been ordained. In 1935 the first Santali minister, having completed his training at the Santal Mission's Divinity School, began assisting the missionary at Pokhuria. He was ordained the following year at Pachamba and was soon joined by a colleague.

(76)

Simultaneously there appeared among the Santal clans a new interest in education, missionaries noting with satisfaction that non-Christian boys were now coming to school in greater numbers. After the Mission Council's success in getting the Santali matriculation accepted for entrance to Patna University, an appetite began to develop for higher education also. (77)

The revival experienced among the younger Christians in Bambah pastorate was maintained and spread to other congregations, and in the 1930's groups of young men calling themselves "Bands of Friends" would tour the district, choosing a village in which to spend the evening. Bambah, Poluria, Tisri and Pachamba all reported on the activities of these societies, the last-named at least apparently supporting also a "Women's Band of Friends". (78) Cause and effect became inter-mingled and at one point it looked as if there were all the elements of a mass movement. Although this hope was never realised, yet the increasing attractions of Christianity, particularly through the influences absorbed by children in the schools, kept adding to the Church. As the war drew to its close a depleted missionary staff was still describing with enthusiasm the "immense promise for evangelism." (79) /

NOTES

76) "Conference", Nov., 1934, p.35; C. of S. Reports 1936, p.544:
Nov. 1936, p.70
78) C. of S. Reports, 1932, p.588: 1933, p.541: 1934, p.593:
The awakening of political awareness was another factor almost as important to the Santal Church as to the tribe itself. Congress agents had penetrated even to this jungle fastness and as attempts were made to organise Santals for political purposes educated Christians were often in demand as leaders. From all accounts, issues quite clear to the minds of nationalist leaders beyond grew rather confused against this tribal background. Here there was little hatred of the British and a good deal of suspicion concerning the possible effects of Hindu rule. Culshaw cites the example of a spontaneous movement in the Anglican Mission area which coincided with the Civil Disobedience programme but, led by three non-Christian Santals who had been educated at Mission schools, was in essence an effort towards moral reform. It is probably fair to conclude that while the Swadeshi movement as such took little hold over Santal minds, and the paritan element in local reform movements did not appeal, yet the influx of such new ideas, both civilising and disturbing, left a permanent impression.

The war years were naturally disruptive of routine activities, for while there were no acute alarms in this secluded area there was an increased demand for workers in the coal and mica industries and the possession of this unaccustomed wealth brought many problems. Discipline grew lax and Indian pastors and the one remaining medical missionary were hard pressed simply to keep the wheels turning. Then rising prices made it necessary to close down some of the village schools and although the Church was strengthened by ex-servicemen returning home, the number of converts being brought forward was much reduced.

Understandably, in view of their history, the Santals showed no great enthusiasm over the departure of the British and even attempted to form their /

NOTES
80) C. of S. Reports 1933, p.541; 1944, p.345 and passim
81) C.of S. Report 1942, p.300
82) Ibid., 1947, p.349
own Swaraj party, the Adabasi movement. (83) There followed a period of policy changes in education much stress being laid on basic and adult education, both obviously very relevant to local needs. The substitution of Sanskrit for English caused difficulties in a non-Hindi-speaking area and for Christian schools the rule against teaching Scripture during school hours made the influence of the hostels of even greater importance. Much of what in the past had been taught by precept must now be taught by example. (84) Christian families who were among those keenest to get schooling for their children also suffered some hardship since they were not eligible for Harijan grants. And the Christian community came under a certain amount of suspicion from the Government because on tribal, not religious, grounds they tended to support the Jharkhand Party, Congress' strongest opponent in Bihar. While making up less than two per cent of the population, the value of their educated leaders gave Christians an influence quite out of proportion to their numbers and national sentiment in the Indian administration reasonably but quite incorrectly questioned their loyalty. This misunderstanding was not helped by the Santais' normal reluctance to enter public life because of the accusations of corruption and inefficiency which would be levelled against them. Less vocal than their non-aboriginal neighbours, Christian Santals were often only persuaded to take on responsibilities because of the obvious need and it took time for them to gain confidence when having to express or defend their views among educated Hindus. (85)

Fortunately, the Church itself was by this time standing much more firmly on its own feet and showing ability to deal with its own problems. For one thing, the training of church workers and lay members had vastly improved. Illiteracy among women and girls had been a constant drag which /

NOTES

83) Ibid., 1948, p.345
84) Ibid., 1949, p.342; 1950, p.375
85) Ibid., 1956, p.401; 1953, p.491
the absence of women missionaries had done nothing to alleviate. The majority of Christian girls received no more than two or three years' schooling, parents having the idea that more would spoil them for village life.

Now women became eligible for election to the eldership, but the whole idea of women as leaders was a new and startling one. It was not a part of the Santal tradition, where women were expected simply to follow their men-folk. While according to Santal custom women were supreme in the home, they took little part in religious life, and up until now in the Church too it was unusual for the mother of a family to take the initiative in accepting the Christian faith. Women were either born into Christianity or conformed with their husbands, and it had been one of the Church's minor problems in earlier days even to persuade male members to drink out of a Communion vessel after women had used it. (86) This situation now began to change rapidly.

A woman missionary was appointed in 1953 and soon there was a series of Bible courses for women, usually lasting four or five days. A missionary nurse soon followed, the first step towards the training of female nurses who might work alongside the male compounders. Branches of the Women's Fellowship were formed and special conferences were held for women leaders. Bible study among village groups concentrated on the building up of Christian homes, and as women who could read were encouraged to start teaching their illiterate sisters, standards rose a little every year. Women were now represented on all Kirk Sessions and the Church Council, and the wife of one pastor, after returning from a training session in Scotland, proved well fitted to give fresh impetus to a very lively movement. (87)

Lay training among the men was also proceeding through conferences.

NOTES

courses and the experience gained through taking on more responsibility. In 1954 Pachamba housed the first Santal Youth Leaders' Conference and soon Youth Fellowships began to multiply. (88) Elders, full-time teachers and evangelists who had in earlier years been kept up to the mark by annual refresher courses were now required to sit a three-year Bible study course with a compulsory examination at the end of each year. (89) And while pastors were still in short supply the first Santal B.D. was now at work. At the same time Pastors' Conferences covering the whole Santal area gave ministers a chance to pool their ideas and experience. (90)

Integration was taking place at the same time, although slowly, difficulties met with in other Mission areas in the 1950's not coming to the surface in Santalia for another decade and more. Here church leaders were almost without exception in Mission employment, with the result that the missionaries on the Church Council exercised even more than the average amount of influence. A Church Board set up about 1950 consisted of five men from the Presbytery or Council, two Scottish missionaries and three others — an Irish Anglican, a Hindu woman convert and a coalfield worker. A Central Fund was established for the maintenance of the ministry, with the result that givings immediately began to soar. And six years after its inception the Board, which had only been a temporary body, handed over full responsibility to the Church Council. (91)

Unity and co-operation in Santalia had taken an interesting turn, following a slightly different path from other Mission areas. To a very great extent the body which has proved most important to Christian leaders and been the voice of the Church in the land has been the Santal Christian/
Council, formed in 1934 as the first of the Regional Councils proposed by the National Christian Council of India. The first organised body of any kind to bring Santals of different provinces together, it greatly heightened the Church's community consciousness and within a few years was proving its worth. From the Church of Scotland Mission's point of view, it gave an opportunity for direct and detailed co-operation with the Lutheran, Anglican and other churches with which its work was so closely associated but which still belonged to other denominations. By 1937 the Regional Council was planning a survey of the whole Santal area, pressing the Government strongly to recognise the peculiar needs of Santal education and agreeing to subsidise a new translation of the New Testament, the presence of two versions in use being confusing. (92)

In the years which followed, the Regional Council enabled the Church Council to develop and share in activities which with its limited resources it could never have attempted on its own. Among the most valuable co-operative efforts may be mentioned the joint Bible School for evangelists; the Santali Christian paper, which in the 1950's had a circulation of over 4,000; a determined but unsuccessful effort to find for one Christian community a pastor who would be acceptable to all denominations; the publication in 1963 of the fresh translation of the New Testament; and continued support for a companion version of the Old Testament. (93) The survey of Santalia was eventually produced after some delay. And in facilitating other forms of co-operative work and strengthening reforms for church life and discipline throughout the Santal area the Regional Council provided the necessary voice of unified knowledge and authority. (94) It is a very real drawback at present that while union negotiations would bring the/

NOTES
Santal Church Council together with churches of Anglican, Baptist and Methodist origin, they would leave out the powerful Lutheran Church which is both its most valuable partner and its nearest neighbour. (95)

Turning from church policy to the life of the ordinary villager, we find in the past the care of Indian ministers a distinct upward trend. The days have long been past when a man like Andrew Campbell would build a special house for fellow missionaries gathering for a Biennial Conference and provide a troop of elephants to convey them from the nearest station, or when such visitors would be carried along the jungle paths by paliki-bearers trotting to the rhythm of a Christian hymn. (96)

Of the hospitals which had gained such fame for the Mission, Pachamba had closed while Bamdah and Polhuria were extending and being thoroughly modernised. "The day of the jungle hospital is over", wrote the doctor at Bamdah with the arrival of the first European nursing sister. (97)

And Santals on the Church Council were at last saying openly, "Now we can speak freely". (98)

Christianity was still very much the faith of the minority. Churches were established in only one out of every three administrative districts of the Province and even in a district like Pokhuria the Christian population was barely one per cent of the whole. (99) The diseases being treated at outpatients' clinics -- malaria, dysentry, bilharzia, under-nourishment, T.B., leprosy and cataract -- appeared as prevalent and as virulent as they had fifty years ago. (100)

Santal social life followed its age-old patterns. A thousand villagers would meet at midnight under a full moon in a dried up river-bed to be led by the Manhi in a detailed discussion of their problems and to arbitrate over infringements of their tribal law. (101)

NOTES

98) C. of S. Report, 1960, p.452
100) C. of S. Report, 1947, p.349
101) "Conference", Aug. 1935, p.54
to Christian congregations still had to be done in the simplest of conversational terms .... a lesson/the first commandment would lead to discussions on crops and the iniquities of the moneylender. (102) Yet with it all, the Church could be seen growing in strength and maturity.

The pattern of life in Christian homes had to contend with much that ran contrary to tribal customs. And where the father of the family was at work in the mines, parental discipline grew slack. But the Church, while adopting the custom whereby marriages were arranged by the groom's parents and recognising the essential value of the dowry system, did its best to enforce Christian rules for marriage, to prevent "mixed" marriages and to encourage the habit of family worship. By the 1960's, a Christian home magazine was being edited by a Santal woman. (103)

At the same time a movement was taking place to make worship more meaningful and beautiful, choirs were formed in the larger congregations and on special occasions the procession of clergy in the white gowns and red stoles of the U.C.N.I. brought a touch of solemnity. (104)

Larger meetings were offering an attraction of their own to non-Christians and whereas evangelism had once been synonymous with Christians going out to others, it now included inviting others in to watch a school giving a Christmas Tableau or join activities at a Convention. (105)

The idea of a Church beyond the bounds of Santalina was also beginning to possess some reality. A group was formed at Pachamba to support the work of the National Missionary Society, the Church Council discussed the lessons /

NOTES

to be learnt from the experience of the Church in China and there were notable occasions such as the visit of the U.C.N.I. Moderator. (106) The danger was further recognised of trained mission workers forming an elite which might direct church policy but make little direct contribution to the life and spirit of the Church. Through the institution of a day like Hospital Sunday, full-time Mission workers were encouraged to dedicate themselves as representatives of the Christian community. (107)

The problem of sanctification was a constant one, drunkenness being the fault most difficult to deal with. "and than wadna hau"; "they have no sense of sin"; "The Santals are so utterly worldly as to be unaware of their worldliness" — these are typical descriptions made by Europeans. (108) But while Kirk Sessions often had difficulty in enforcing discipline, they were gradually growing both stronger and wiser. (109) The worst trouble area was Toondoo, which had the highest proportion of wages too often squandered in drink. Conditions were serious enough for the Government to be approached and the home was safe-guarded when the law was amended to forbid the employment of women in the mines. (110) Yet as the drift to the mines continued, this threat to the stability of the whole community began seriously to affect the Church also. The congregation at Pokhuria became more and more an assembly of women, while the leaderless manfolk away from their homes were a source of great anxiety. (111) The little St. Andrew's church at Jharia had been under the care of the missionary in Pokhuria, but more than the Scottish Mission churches are by now involved in the problem and this is clearly a situation where joint action needs to be taken. (112)

NOTES

106) C. of S. Reports, 1949, p.345; 1951, p.308; 1954, p.321
107) Ibid., 1958, p.484
109) "Conference", Aug., 1954, p.32
       C. of S. Report 1949, p.342
Under the Santali Church Council there are at present five pastorates - Pokhuria, Toondee, Pachamba, Bamdah and Tisri. All of these are the scattered multi-congregation type of pastorate. Indian pastors are in charge of them all, but with at present only four ministers and one of these involved deeply in Bible translation, a missionary often acts as Interim Moderator. There are at present three divinity students in training, which should improve the situation.

One pastor, the Rev. Kuel Soren, is a B.D. of Serampore, the others having taken their training at the Theological College at Benagaria, in the Santal Parganas. This is a Lutheran establishment which serves the whole Santal area.

Pastorates are almost but not wholly self-supporting, the Central Fund receiving a 25% grant from Mission funds. The Santalia Church Council unites at Synod level with two other Councils of the U.C.N.I., Calcutta and the Eastern Himalayas. But as already explained, the strong ties formed through the Santal Christian Council are for all practical purposes of greater significance. Services of worship and church meetings are conducted in Santali, with the very occasional addition of a Service in English. Women, though in small numbers, are represented on all church courts. And co-operative work on the lines described earlier on has played a large part in the Church’s development. (113) Of the Christians in Santalia, who number not more than 50,000 out of a population of about two-and-a-half million, the majority are of Lutheran Mission origin and those who come under the U.C.N.I. Council only about 2,500. The largest pastorate, Pachamba, might have about 300 of a community and the smallest at Tisri less than 200. Roughly a third of these are communicant members. Annual givings to the church come to /

NOTES

113) Information obtained through correspondence, etc.
A little more may be said here about the problem peculiar to the Christian community. The influence of Christian theology and beliefs on ancient patterns of tribal culture is clearly one of these. Faith in a single Creator who is at the same time vitally concerned with the intimacies of human conduct is plainly a belief which it takes time to translate into terms of practical thought and living. A good number of local customs, those concerning marriage for instance, have been retained by Christians. With other customs, some form of compromise has been reached. Christian Santals still pay reverence to their ancestors and offerings are made, but no sacrifices, while pre-Christian taboos still tend to be observed on matters of pregnancy and marriage. The Satan of the Bible has been identified in Christian minds with Maran Buru, the god of beer, with the result that total abstinence has become a primary Christian virtue and drunkenness a major vice. (115)

The fear of any exterior force which might destroy the Santals' highly-prized social cohesion provides a second element of tension and coupled with this goes a dislike of Christianity's puritan ethics. As one old Santal put it, "Yes, your religion is good and some day we shall all be Christians, but we shall wait until we can all do it together." While another man who clearly saw Christianity as a foreign tradition replied to the challenge of an evangelist, "I shall never become a Christian. What should I do with a pair of shoes" (116) Rejection there was based on a dislike of the fringe influences of Western and Christian culture. But in a far greater number of cases it also stems from a genuine dislike of an ethic in which the ten commandments loom large and moral reformation is demanded. Here non-Christian reformers have found themselves up against the same barrier. (117)

NOTES
115) Quoted W.J. Culshaw, op.cit., pp.176-177
116) Ibid., p.189
117) Ibid., pp.167-168
A third cause of tension is one to which we have already referred, namely the disintegrating effect of high wages on the village way of life. At its worst in Pokhuria, the mining district, it is a problem likely to spread to other districts.

A fourth cause which affects all Santals but the Christian community in particular lies in the detribalising effects of education. As the benefits of education become more widely appreciated and as more educated Santals return from training outside to their native heath, there is a danger that they will come to form a cultured middle class removed from the ways of village life. There is already a tendency for Santal customs to be despised, children are discouraged from speaking Santali rather than the commercially more profitable Hindi or Bengali in their homes, and the white-collar jobs offered by Government and Mission authorities are seen as the surest road to social advancement. The change of attitude towards girls' education has extended the danger among women also. While both the Government and the churches have tried to keep a reasonable balance through various forms of rural uplift or industrial training, the idea that there is honour to be found in manual labour is not one more easily made commendable to Indian minds here than in any other part of the country. (118)

Lastly, there remains the solid weight of the Mission-compound outlook, aggravated in this case by the fact that the great majority of Church leaders are also Church employees. This attitude, in earlier days, was reflected in open dependence on Mission institutions. With integration and the retiral of senior missionaries whose authority was never asserted but implicitly recognised, it has somewhat changed in form. It has changed to an outlook which looks on those institutions as the private perquisite of the Christian community and particularly of a few families within it. Thus while there has really /

NOTES
been remarkably little serious quarreling among congregations — a dispute in Pokhuria pastorate in the 1950's appears a rare enough exception to prove the rule — Bamdah hospital experienced several years of staff trouble, with members of the Kirk Session and the Church Council too deeply involved to form an impartial judgment and enforce the necessary discipline. No doubt an unavoidable stage of growth, it is also a sign that local Christians have to learn to accept their wider obligations and understand what is meant by Christian stewardship. (119)

But there is evidence to show that the lesson will be learnt.

"Formerly people went to the missionary because he is a European. Now they go to him because he is a Christian", states one report early in the 1960's. If this is an over-simplification, yet it carries its kernel of truth. (120) Relations between Church and Mission are already more harmonious. Pokhuria needs a High School and the proposal put forward by Hindus, Moslems and non-Christian Santals that they should raise the money but Christians should be responsible for running the school shows the respect in which the Church is held (121) Church union should help to strengthen the community consciousness which has fortunately never separated Christian Santals from non-Christians. And the rising number of educated leaders, although it creates its own difficulties, can also be the key to the making of a vital Church whose faith the tribe comes to see as its own health and salvation.

NOTES

   "Conference", May, 1960, p.8
120) C. of S. Report, 1960, p.452
121) Ibid., 1965, p.9
GENERAL SOURCES


"Dr. Campbell of Santalia", printed for U.F.C., no date. (New College Library)


F.M.C. Reports.

"Conference"

MS Papers, S.N.L.
"The Wedge", as Dr. Graham called it (1), is the mountainous triangle of country which juts on the North towards Tibet and is bordered on the East by Bhutan and on the West by Nepal. The Northern part of the Mission's territory penetrated the independent State of Sikkim. South and West lay the hill station of Darjeeling, sloping down towards the Indian plains through the Terai district. And South and East, on its own range, stood Kalimpong, to the South of which stretched the Duars tea estates.

The last of the eight Scottish fields to be established, the Eastern Himalayas Mission was geographically the most difficult to cover and ethnologically by far the most complex. Due to its altitude, the climate was also for Europeans the healthiest and most attractive. And the immense variety of its scenery, situations and peoples gave it, and continues to give it, a romantic appeal. As Europeans were constantly comparing its quietness with the heat and teeming life of the plains. "I suffered from a continual desire to bend down lest I should knock my head on the sky", wrote one young Scotswoman: while another wrote back from Bihar, "How different this plains India is from our own rugged mountain home -- Somehow this seems a far more real India, with its little clustering villages, wide expanse, palms and bamboos." (2)

From the historian's point of view, it is an added complication that while operating as a single and harmonious Mission, it was supported by

NOTES.

(2) MS letter from Miss Georgie Stewart, Cossipore, Calcutta, to Mrs. Gardiner, on returning from Kalimpong, dated 31.7.29: MS letter from Miss Grace Paterson, while on holiday in Bihar, dated 6.1.29. S.N.E.
three separate organisations, the Church of Scotland, the Young Men's and Young Women's Guilds of that Church and the Scottish Universities' Mission. Any summarised narrative is, therefore, bound to do even less than normal justice to the work of the Mission and the rich and varied character of the Church it founded.

The Church's humble beginnings, from the time when in 1870 two missionaries arrived at Darjeeling and were welcomed by Scottish planters, reads not unlike a modern chapter added to the Acts of the Apostles. The Church of Scotland's little Mission at Gaya, a town in Bihar about 300 miles West of Calcutta which was a famous Hindu centre, was started in 1859. Preaching in both the town and its surrounding villages had little effect, however, and the Mission's leader, the Rev. William McFarlane, was an evangelist by conviction with little love for the roundabout methods of education. The only piece of work which showed any promise was the little orphanage composed not of local Hindu boys but hill children from the Darjeeling area. When it was agreed to move the Mission's location to Darjeeling, the orphanage moved with it and its children formed the nucleus of the first congregation.

Two years after the baptism of the first indigenous converts, three Nepalese teachers, in 1874, the district suffered a severe epidemic of cholera. One of the converts, Sukhman, a man of remarkably staunch and cheerful nature, came to Mr. McFarlane in Darjeeling in great distress. Of the three lone Christians living on the Eastern side of the Teesta River, the crofter, Raghabir was now dead. And Jungabir the teacher who had buried him, was critically ill at Kaliapong. Sukhman had come as a messenger to ask that help and medicine be brought at once. But a few hours later, while crossing the slippery cane suspension bridge in the footsteps of the missionary, Sukhman dropped the precious bag of medicine into the swollen river below and it was lost. The disconsolate catechist, sure that God had deserted them,
had to be reminded of Paul's sufferings before the two men hurried on to do what little might still be possible. (3)

Kalimpong itself, situated on a saddle of high ground where several mountain tracks converge, had been opened as a second station in 1773. And the Mission's commitments were further extended in the last year of the decade, Kurseong, a small town fifteen miles South of Darjeeling, and the area round Sityang and Sitong being added to make up four centres. Fifteen schools had been opened with about 500 pupils, the great majority of them being boys.

In the 1880's, the Scottish Universities' Mission founded its Training Institution for Christian workers at Kalimpong and fresh ground was broken in Sikkim. The Rev. J.A. Graham was also appointed to Kalimpong as the first missionary of the Young Men's Guild, while the Young Women's Guild undertook to support a cottage hospital. The Guild Mission went on to open up work among the employees of the tea estates in the Eastern and Western Duars, together with chaplaincy work among the European planters. A large part of the population in this area were not indigenous, many being coolies who had emigrated with their families from Chota Nagpur and other parts of India. A few of them were Christians already. Nearer to the Assam border, however, in the Eastern Duars, a strong church began to be built up among the Mechs or Bords, who were aboriginal tribes living mainly by agriculture.

In Kalimpong itself, J.A. Graham founded the famous St. Andrew's Colonial Homes, a philanthropic effort for Anglo-Indians, run on an inter-denominational basis. The majority of local conversions, however, were coming here from Nepalis or Lepchas.

On the Western side of the Teesta, work from Darjeeling spread southwards/

---

(3) J.A. Graham, op.cit. p.22.
- through the Terai district, with its centre at Kurseong, the missionary in charge acting again as chaplain to the planters. School work had by this time spread to such an extent that the Mission was the biggest educational authority in the area, with over one hundred elementary schools which catered for more than 2,000 pupils.

During this period of expansion, the Church had also been growing at a rate unequalled in any other Scottish Mission area except the Punjab. A Christian community which in 1880 numbered 120 souls was, within another twenty years 3,000 strong. (4) Nor was there any comparison with any Protestant Mission on the whole sub-continent, for the variety of races and language groups of which it was composed. Vigour and variety were the new Church's outstanding characteristics. (5)

Having obtained this brief general picture, we may now turn to study the process of growth in more detail.

Within seven or eight years of the seed being sown, the embryo Church was almost fully formed, growth and education going hand in hand. While the community still numbered under a hundred, a central Panchayat was formed and met to approve candidates coming forward for baptism after instruction. A small Training Institution at Darjeeling, forerunner of the Scottish Universities' Mission Institute, was already acting as a feeder to the Church, the most competent adult converts being passed through it to be appointed as catechists or teachers. (6)

The Mission's late start carried with it certain advantages, in that it was able to gain by the experience and the mistakes of others. Already one/

NOTES.

(5) See General Sources.
(6) Church of Scotland Report, 1878, pp. 28 f.
aim was clear, that of training native pastors whose education, though academically far below European standards, would be adequate for the congregations under their care, while their other qualifications would be those lacked by overseas missionaries. "I feel more strongly year by year", wrote William McFarlane, "that the permanent success of the Mission depends on our having as catechists, Godly and able and devoted men who can gradually be trained for and entrusted with the full powers of the minister. Such men must be more efficient both as ministers of congregations and as missionaries, than any Europeans can be. — We differ from them in all our ways and habits and as far as I can see there can be no compromise between the European and the native way of living. The catechists are people of themselves: they live as the people live." (7)

It was a distinct advantage, of course, that intelligent men of this type, usually with no more than an elementary education behind them, should stand at a level well above the people in their charge. Caste was still an obstacle among the Nepalese (8), but not among other language and tribal groups, and therefore there was not the need for Christian teachers and leaders to be solidly grounded in the intricacies of Hindu philosophy or Buddhist doctrine.

It is evident that these catechists, paid though they were from Mission funds, were regarded as both the backbone of the Church and the spearhead of its advance. Partly owing to the distances involved and partly to the fact that growth in numbers made it necessary to select representatives instead of following the earlier custom of admitting all heads of families, the monthly Panchayat meetings at Darjeeling soon came to consist only of missionaries and catechists who decided everything. "Those connected with the Church do not, as yet, show much/  

---

NOTES.

(7) Ibid. 1879, p.70.
(8) Ibid. 1880, p.13.
spontaneous, independent, vigorous life" ran one assessment in 1680. "As a rule, after they are baptised, they settle down and seem almost wholly occupied with their own worldly affairs, showing little anxiety for Scripture knowledge and little zeal for advancing God's Kingdom," (9) The Church was judged to be steadfast rather than enterprising.

Yet it went on growing at an encouraging rate. In 1681 the community rose from 184 to 248, while an additional 176 catechumens were under instruction. Christian giving for the year, at Rs 440 or about £30, also appear unusually high, though no doubt some of this came from missionaries and other Europeans. Lepcha families were now coming in as well as Nepalis, so that at Kalimpong it became necessary to conduct two services, one in either language. A definite movement was gathering way, as is instanced by the fact that some who were not becoming Christians were becoming Hindus or Buddhists. (10) Clearly the field lay open for persuasion from any quarter. Conversions, moreover, were spread evenly over the Mission area and were the result not of any concentrated effort but of "diligent use of the ordinary means of grace." (11) By its thirteenth year, the Church consisted of nine established congregations, none with an ordained pastor but all except one developing under the leadership of a trainee catechist. (12)

The community was still largely illiterate, lacking local leaders and "needing education to build it up in faith and holiness." (13) Yet the spirit of independence was strong.

When church buildings were erected, it was at the expense and through the voluntary labours of the congregations themselves. Only the church at Kalimpong was Mission property and there too, Christians were beginning to acquire their own land. (14) /

NOTES.

(9) Ibid., p.64.
(10) Ibid. 1882, pp 52-54.
(11) Ibid. 1883, p.16.
(12) Ibid.
(13) Ibid. 1884, p.18
Here several factors may be taken into account which were an aid to such initiative. Living standards were low but here alone, in contrast to the other fields, while we hear of cholera epidemics and land-slides, the recurrent cry about drought and famine is absent. Primitive though conditions might be and simple the mud and thatch huts which were so proudly dedicated as churches, Christian converts lived socially and economically on an equality with their neighbours. Conversion did not lead to out-casting nor were they forced to draw humiliating comparisons with the power, wealth or learning of other communities. British-controlled government policy, working in close harmony with the interests of a British Mission, was also to be instrumental in providing many Christian families with land of their own to cultivate. Regular employment in the tea-garden districts, even more than the support and encouragement of European planters, provided the Church with a basis for self-support. The continual influx of fresh blood, both from the closed lands of the North and by immigration from the plains, kept it from becoming ingrown. And the unspoiled vigour of hill people guarded against stagnation.

This helps to explain why the churches grew and also perhaps why, within the next decade, there appeared the danger of "churchiness". Each congregation had its catechist and its panchayat, but whereas the catechists' primary task was to work among non-Christians, congregations were coming to regard them as pastors rather than leaders for local evangelism. (15) The danger should not, however be exaggerated.

Mission history was repeating itself and a Church now 20 years old was still being led and governed entirely by European missionaries and their paid agents, the grounds in this case not being native poverty but sheer lack of education. Yet dependence on this plane did not stultify healthy development in other directions. A genuine missionary spirit was the key to steady expansion on all fronts, while providing some notable examples of personal sacrifice. At/

(15) Ibid., 1891, p.35.
At the same time there appeared the first signs of social self-consciousness—or what the New Testament calls more simply "Christian fellowship".

While still very young, the Church began to take a share in the organised evangelistic work of the Mission—the Darjeeling area, with a community of 220, raised Rs 122 for this in 1883. (16) Two years later the Church dedicated and dispatched three catechists of its own, one to Bhotia tribesmen, one to Dhangars and a third to Sikkim. (17) And in 1892, amid scenes of great rejoicing, the Kalimpong congregation launched its own "Ghoorka Mission" into Nepal, a country no European was allowed to enter. The native missionary, a teacher, had agreed to work without salary while the Church guaranteed to meet his needs and care for his aged parents. Sadly enough, this venture was dogged by misfortune, starting with the early death of its first worker. Yet it proved a measure of real initiative. (18) Other examples, such as that of the elderly Christian in Sikkim who took it on himself to assist with the visiting of the sick and conducting worship, show a refreshing contrast to the general tendency to rely on Mission workers. The number of converts brought in that year, when in Kalimpong district alone there were over 300 baptisms, and the number of parishes had spread to ten, are further signs of healthy growth. (19)

Christian character and social life were also being strengthened. By the 1880's, annual fairs of "Melas" were furnishing Christians, who still only represented one in three hundred of the population, with a chance to gain confidence in numbers and unity of aim. (20) And there were local activities such as the Darjeeling congregation's decision to form a Total Abstinence Society. (21)

---

NOTES

(16) Ibid., 1884, p.19
(17) Ibid., 1886, p.16.
(18) Ibid., 1893, p.93.
(19) Ibid.
(20) Ibid., 1887, p.18. 1888, p.20, 1895, p.23.
(21) Ibid., 1890, p.29.
No doubt such efforts were Mission-inspired, but once adopted, they developed as natural expressions of the Church's life. And they were accompanied by moral reformation and a deepening sense of responsibility. "Christians reveal a keener conscience" wrote Dr. Graham in 1894, "Regarding drink, debt and the self-supporting ordinances. They are having an influence on their heathen neighbours." (22)

The subjects discussed at a typical Panchayat meeting in Darjeeling included consideration of the Church Expenses Fund; Schools; Sunday Schools; Bazaar preaching and evangelism; Communicants; Probationers for baptism; Re-Admission of the lapsed; the Provident Fund; the Total Abstinence Society; Children's Services and Social Meetings; the Marriagable Unmarried; the Nepal Mission; Cemeteries; the supply and distribution of tracts; and a list of subjects for united prayer. (23)

If the balance was still weighted on the side of internal affairs, it was less so than with most church meetings and the range of accepted responsibility is a broad one.

The time had also come when the Church should have pastors of its own. The McFarlane Memorial Church with its proclamation, set between the windows, of the Gospel message in ten languages, was dedicated in 1891. (24) The congregation in Darjeeling, whose church was built by European planters two years later, came from backgrounds equally diverse, the 48 converts baptised in one year representing twenty different castes and races. (25) And almost every year saw smaller buildings going up in villages as the fruit of voluntary work. (26) In the last year of the century three pastors were ordained, one being a Lepcha and the other two Nepalis. All three were middle-aged men, experienced catechists who had been undergoing a special course of training.

The installation of these Indian ministers was a success as well as a forward/
step. "It makes no difference to their salary and they still travel their parishes barefoot" wrote the missionary. "But their standing is increased. Their leadership was required and their authority with and through Kirk Sessions." (27)

The Panchayat system was simultaneously tightened and overhauled. Up to date the head of every family had had a seat on the local Panchayat. With the increase in numbers this was becoming unworkable and members were from now on elected. Fourteen elders had been ordained with the three pastors and the "Bari" or central Panchayat, equivalent to a Presbytery, was made up of ordained men along with those elders. (28)

In practice as well as in theory, the Church was already well on the road to self-government. While the majority of congregations were still without ordained pastors and only partially supported the catechists who did the work of licentiates, this dependence was due to lack of trained men rather than shortage of funds. And there was not the same lack of the "aggressiveness" so badly missed in other areas. While evangelistic efforts were led by Mission Agents and channelled through the hundred elementary schools, they were on the whole supported with enthusiasm by the Christian communities where men and women were bringing in their neighbours. And this was the youngest of the churches to have its native Mission.

What danger there was lay not in apathy but with the possibility that the next Christian generation, better educated and more sophisticated, might fail to reveal the same vigour. "A generation has passed" ran one comment at this time, "the children and grandchildren of the original Christian community are now, many of them, men and women. We fear sometimes for the younger generation, lest their faith should not be so strong nor their life as earnest as their fathers. There is the danger that with everything made easy for them -- better opportunities of education and upbringing, fewer difficulties, lesser trials -- they may lack the robust strength of character which opposition and persecution often bring." (29)

NOTES.

(27) Ibid., 1900, p.40; 1901, p.35f.
(28) Ibid., 1900, p.40.
(29) Ibid., 1900, p.31.
Fortunately the Church was to go on expanding too fast and the needs and opportunities for advancement were to be too great, for a second generation recession to set in.

Before progressing to the next stage of its history, one observation should be made about the development of the Church in the Eastern Himalayas. One of the most widely accepted premises of present day missionary theory, that where a Mission is and remains strong, the Church becomes weak, does not in this instance seem to apply without modification. It was certainly not an axiom with which the missionaries of this period would themselves have concurred. The Mission was certainly never powerful in terms of man-power. The eight male and five women missionaries on the strength in 1900, most of them engaged in some form of institutional work, were a comparatively feeble company. Yet in terms of workers and agencies it was strong, and since running costs were unusually low, every effort was made to multiply them. (30) Not only were bodies such as the Young Men's Guild and the Scottish Universities Mission invited to share in the work, but individual congregations in Scotland and European planters were encouraged to take on the support of a catechist or some other worker. (31) No suggestion was made that at some future date these agencies would become the sole responsibility of the Church, nor was the fear expressed that it might find difficulty in doing so.

There was a total absence, in other words, of any sense of dichotomy between Church and Mission. "The twelve churches were little missions in themselves" ran one description of the 1890's, and the fact that Mission-paid catechists and teachers were their leaders was not seen as an anomaly. (32) The church thrived on its dual system; initiative was not smothered, and there is nothing to indicate that Christianity would have spread more rapidly or taken root more firmly by other means.

NOTES

(31) Ibid., 1890, p.36. The system of individual support by congregations in Scotland was greatly extended after 1900.
(32) Ibid., 1893, p.33.
The truth is that comparison with other Scottish Mission areas would, in this case and at this point of growth, be misleading, closer parallels being provided by the missions working further East in Assam. There a Welsh Presbyterian Mission, working among tribal peoples in the Kasai and later the Lushai hills, and using similar methods, though with perhaps greater emphasis on preaching and the development of Indian leadership, gathered a church ten times as large. (33) The common factor is clearly that of aboriginal hearers and the lack of caste barriers. The field was a fertile one, so that faithful sowing, by almost any method, was bound to produce a harvest.

1900-1930

This Christian community, which in 1900 was just over 3,000, multiplied over three-fold in the next thirty years until it was only a little short of the 10,000 mark. (34) In normal circumstances it should not be difficult to give a general account of a Church's growth over this limited period. But in fact the diversity of the Mission's operations, which led to different rates of development in separate areas, would make such a summary misleading. It will therefore be necessary to treat districts separately. Yet two broad trends are distinguishable and should be noted. The greatest advances, numerically, were made among aboriginal peoples who were illiterate and had little desire for education. While the most definite steps towards independence were taken among the more sophisticated people and were centred in the towns.

The greatest increase in numbers was made in the gardens of the Duars, where a community of about 360 Christians multiplied almost twenty times over in these thirty years. Up to date, the small and widely scattered groups of Christians spread over this huge district had been made up of mixed races, only a

---

NOTES.

(34) C. of S. Statistics 1901 and 1931.
minority being of local origin. The spurt which began in the 1900's was due to a mass movement among the indigenous Mechi or Boro tribe. "Some Mechis have been baptised" wrote the District missionary in 1901. (35) After another ten years, with 300 baptisms recorded, it was possible to say that "the tide was flowing" (36) And before another decade had passed, with its record figure of over 500 baptisms in one year, the hope could be expressed, "Soon all the Mechis will be Christians" (37)

The peak had by this time been reached and while growth continued at a gentler pace it became possible to make some assessment of the new community. "As with all mass movements" ran one report, "there is the danger of emotional enthusiasm, particularly among an illiterate people and the Mechis are not keen on education." (38) Out of those 3,000 Christians, less than a tenth could at this time read or write or had any wish to learn. There were only six teachers in the whole area and motives were naturally suspect where there was such a fragmentary grasp of Christian principles. "The difficulty is not to make converts but to make a convert a real one", confessed the missionary. (39)

During the next ten years, therefore, a strenuous effort was made to supply a solid if simple foundation of education. The pastor who had been ordained to work with the missionary in 1905, and whose task had become an impossible one, was at last joined by a colleague and the district divided, while the number of catechists and teachers, still in desperately short supply, was slowly increasing. (40) The life of the Church also began to progress. There was a "tender purging" of those who had fallen by the wayside; the new communities awoke to take some interest in educating their children or at least their sons; elders were ordained, congregations set-to and built their own churches and a local Training School was established for teachers. (41) By the mid-twenties, out of eight "congregations"
in the Eastern section, one was said to be self-supporting, two very near it and five contributed over half of their expenses. Full self-support was taken to be responsibility for church and school buildings, the teacher's salary and a set contribution towards the salary of the pastor. (42) In the Western Duars, three out of six "congregations" were by now self-supporting, with the other three half way to their goal. Nor had the urge died out which had brought about the movement. As a result of a revival at Mahagalguri, we are told that three church members "left all to preach the Gospel", becoming voluntary missionaries to their own people. (43).

Heartening as these years of growth had been, the Christian community still only made up a small proportion of all those employed in the gardens. It was still composed of small groups living in the estates where they were employed. A parish of 1500 square miles which it took four days to cross from end to end, made shepherding unusually hard alike for the Indian pastor and the supervising missionary. Yet numbers and character were together beginning to tell. "It may be a small church" ran a report at the end of this period, "but every manager will tell you that that little group of Christians enriches the life of a tea garden community by its sterner moral code and its faithful daily work." (44)

Evangelism, as is the case with all mass movements, functioned naturally through the body of the Church and by personal and group contagion, the people being commended for their missionary spirit (45), and the small team of hard-working pastors and their helpers concentrating mainly on the education of the church members and adherents. The leaders among the Meelis themselves were now beginning to see their need for rural education, of the kind which included practical projects such as the home gardening scheme run in co-operation with a Government Demonstration Farm. (46) While there continued to be a shortage of experienced/

NOTES.

(43) Ibid., 1924, p.132.
(44) Ibid., 1930, p.525.
(45) Ibid., 1930, p.526.
(46) Ibid.
leaders and money was not plentiful, labour and materials were willingly offered for building schools and churches (47) and this branch of the Church, still in the first generation of its life, showed genuine promise and already made up nearly two-thirds of the total Christian community. (48)

By comparison the second-generation churches in the towns of Darjeeling and Kalimpong remained, in terms of numbers, more or less static. Yet work from both centres radiated out to build up strong rural communities and both continued to maintain missions to the lands across the border, inaccessible to Europeans. They also led in the movement towards self-sufficiency and acted as training centres for the Church's manpower.

At the start of the century, Darjeeling district, with a community a little over 1,100 strong, had four ordained pastors, three of these being Nepalis and one a Lepcha, and a staff of about eighty catechists and teachers. All but one of the pastors were Mission-maintained, however, as were the majority of the other workers, the church's givings coming to less than £50 a year. (49) Nevertheless, the objects of self-support and missionary outreach were kept firmly before people's minds. Congregations took the responsibility for putting up their own churches, sometimes solid buildings of stone, and by the time another thirty years had passed, the central congregation at Kurseong, which had earlier become a separate pastorate, had raised the creditable sum of £220 for a building of their own and were supporting their own evangelist. (50) The "fine missionary spirit" for which they were commended and which accounted on one occasion for nearly 300 baptisms in a year, was directed to both direct evangelism among relatives and neighbours and to supporting the Church's own Mission to Nepal. An /

NOTES:

(47) Ibid., 1929, p.267.  
(48) Ibid., 1931, p.651.  
(49) Ibid., 1902, p.86; 1904, p.114  
1911, p.123 and passim.  
(50) Ibid., 1903, p.129; 1911, p.123; 1927 and passim.
Indian catechist was trained as a compounder and his wife as a nurse before crossing the border as missionaries of the native church and in fact to the £50 raised by that church in 1903, we must add another £33 donated to the work of this mission. (51)

At the same time, congregational life was being strengthened by new activities. The formation of C.E. branches gave scope to the younger members and Kirk Sessions were now taking more direct responsibility for Christian morals and practices. (52) By the 1920's, the town congregation had installed the first native pastor to be trained at a theological seminary, (53), and a sustained effort was being made to raise the standard of instruction before baptism and to hold up higher ideals of life and conduct. (54) A movement towards Christianity among sweeper families in Darjeeling added to the Church's numbers and also to its enthusiasm. (55) And the problem of caste, which at an earlier date had threatened to divide the community, appears no longer to have mattered. (56)

By 1930, of the three pastorates into which the district had now been separated, Darjeeling with a community of about 700, had stopped growing in numbers but was advancing in the direction of independence. At a church conference arranged by the members themselves, ideas were discussed to foster self-support and more systematic giving and the desire was openly expressed "to overcome the difficulties standing in the way of making the church indigenous." (57) The Kurseong area had been divided into two, the Kurseong congregation being made up mainly of hill Nepalis, while Terai, with its headquarters at Siliguri, consisted of Bengali speakers from the/
While neither congregation was yet fully self-supporting, they were reported as recognising "the real need to do for themselves what had been done up to now by the Mission." (58) A purging of the roll, taken on the Kirk Session's own initiative, had reduced the number of church members and leaders felt the need of a deeper spirit of commitment. "We are at the stage when we need a real revival," commented a woman missionary, "Our people for the most part are but nominal Christians. They think that baptism makes them Christians and if they outwardly obey the Presbytery they are safe." (59) Nevertheless the church grew in size, the Christian community numbering by 1930 almost 2,000. (60)

One illuminating sidelight on methods of attaining independence was thrown on the local situation by the arrival in the Terai of several groups of Lutheran Christians from Chota Nagpur. The missionary noted that, although hillmen themselves, they had a finer spirit of independence than most hill congregations and met for worship regularly under their own leaders. "Is it possible", he asked, "that the Christian congregations of the Mission fields would progress more rapidly if left a little more to themselves?" (61) If the answer was "Yes", then Mission methods here were certainly at fault, the task of careful shepherding being one to which all Mission workers were fully committed.

Development in the church in and around Kalimpong had meanwhile been taking a similar course. Although there was no mass movement, the community nearly doubled itself again in thirty years, until Christians numbered nearly 3,000. (62) The fact that the Scottish Universities' Mission Institute, the Charteris and the Leper Hospitals and St. Andrew's Homes were all situated at Kalimpong, made it the key point for the training

NOTES.
(58) Ibid., 1929, p.263; 1930, p.522
(59) MS letter from Miss M.B. Gardner, Kurseong, to Miss Reid, dated 4.6.29, S.N.L.
(60) Ibid., 1930, p.521 and passim
(61) Ibid., 1928, p.334
of Christian workers, many of whom were employed in the town itself. In 1905, two ordained pastors were at work at Kalimpong and Sitong respectively, and about 20 years later, a third pastorate was separated off. They were responsible among them for the supervision of fifteen established congregations and a number of smaller groups. (63)

Once again, interest in national missionary work and in self-support progressed side by side, Kalimpong's special venture being the Tibetan Mission which had several unhappy false starts but managed to struggle on without making much headway. The Tibetan Treaty of 1903 had lowered the country's barriers against non-nationals but for many years after the work was being described as "very hard and unfruitful", with only occasional converts coming in against strong opposition. (64) Not till the 1920's did the situation look more hopeful. By then a Tibetan congregation of 50 in Kalimpong doubled its numbers in five years and contacts were being kept up with other Christians in Tibet, while Church and Mission co-operated in starting up a Tibetan press and newspaper. (65)

Congregational life was also making progress and we are told that in 1910 the Kalimpong congregation, by now fully self-supporting, had its Sunday Schools, Young Men's and Young Women's Guilds and Scripture Union and the growth of home industries was also being encouraged. (66) If those organisations suggest a Western flavour, as undoubtedly they do, yet mere repetition of a name should not mislead us, for the atmosphere was Eastern. The new Church at Sitong, for instance, had been built after the/

NOTES

(63) C. of S. Reports, 1906, p.130; 1924, p.178 and passim.
(64) Ibid., 1904, p.114; 1909, p.130; 1910, p.137.
(65) Ibid., 1923, p.154; 1928, p.334; 1929, p.264 and passim.
(66) Ibid., 1910, p.135.
style of a Buddhist monastery, the pillar carving having been executed by a head Lama, and in the same way activities with names familiar to Scottish ears were quickly adapted to local ways. (67)

The background against which evangelism was being carried on did not appear to be a very promising one — "there is no evidence of spiritual interest among non-Christians" runs a contemporary report. Yet Evangelistic Camp Weeks became a regular feature of church life, between two and three hundred volunteer workers taking part. (68) The general standard of education was gradually rising and with 40 to 50 Christian students at the S.U.M.I. there were hopes that the demand for trained workers would soon be met. (69)

The Mission's more isolated outpost in Sikkim was at a much earlier stage of development, the church in that independent state being unable to keep pace with the stronger or more centralised branches. When Tibet was opened up, it had been hoped that evangelists would be allowed to move into Sikkim and start nursing the seeds already planted by Christian merchants. (70) But the Raja was jealous of his independence and the Mission, on being refused permission to set up its headquarters in Gangtok, the capital, established it at Timi. (71) A certain amount of opposition was offered by moneylenders, who gave warning that those who listened to Christians would have their debts called up, but immigrant Christians helped to swell the number and small congregations were formed at both Gangtok and Timi. (72)

NOTES.

(67) Ibid., 1903, p.133.
(68) Ibid., 1909, p.130: 1919, p.74.
(69) Ibid., 1914, p.149: 1927.
(70) Ibid., 1905, p.153.
(71) Ibid., 1910, p.130.
(72) Ibid., 1912, p.128: 1921, p.73 and passim.
By the 1920's, an Indian pastor had been placed in charge, and by the end of that decade there was a Christian community of 400. (73) Their position was weak however, with Buddhism a strong and even reviving force and it was a distinct advance and a major concession when at the end of this period Christians became, for the first time, eligible for Government posts — the community, in other words, was officially recognised. (74)

Even where the Church had made its most notable advances the fulfilment of its two great needs, for self-support and for a trained body of pastors, seemed always to be just round the corner. By the 1920's, an unofficial scheme for devolution was already on its way. More work was being handed over to the Church and four Indian workers served on the Mission Council. (75) Yet the Church itself, whose Christian liberality worked out at something like 1/- per person per year, was in no position to take over work which even the Mission was finding it difficult to maintain. (76) "Our main trouble is finance" ran the official report for 1930. "We can embark on no new work until there is increased self-support. And the poverty of the people seems to preclude this." (77)

Theological education posed a parallel problem. The pastor inducted at Darjeeling, after studying at Saharanpur was followed a few years later by the first graduate minister, a B.A. of Calcutta. (78) But these were exceptional cases. From the first full theological course started at the S.U.M.I. in 1921, only one student finally went forward for licensing. (79). And a one-year vernacular course for the training of district/
catechists, launched a few years later, fell through because the districts declared that they could not spare their workers. (80) While the chronic shortage of Christian teachers and other workers was being made good in places, it would clearly be many years yet before, under the present system, adequate Indian leadership could be provided.

1930 - 1965.

It is possible to treat the modern period of the life of the Church in the Eastern Himalayas as a whole. As the Church's responsibilities increased and patterns of parish life became clearer, the whole region began to emerge from seclusion and become more aware of the world on its doorstep. The first stirring of political awareness came with the late twenties and the early thirties and was accompanied by a more determined desire for education. (81) People were learning to vote and as one young Christian said, "What the vote is I don't know. What I do know is that something will have to be done for my parish." (82) Such ignorance, if it was common, was certainly not universal, however, and higher standards of education among Christians often singled them out for positions of leadership. (83)

Economic depression in the thirties and inflation after the Second World War had a marked effect on the Mission's ability to maintain institutional work and emphasised the Church's need to adapt to new methods. (84) National independence and the setting up of Pakistan as a separate State divided the region from East Bengal and caused further economic hardship, but it helped /

NOTES.

(80) Ibid., 1920, p. 269; 1930, p. 528.
(81) Ibid., 1932, p. 589; 1948, p. 345 and passim.
(84) Ibid., 1937, p. 682; 1946, p. 365; 1949, p. 343.
tribal peoples to understand that they were part of a greater whole. (85) Through the 1950's and after, influxes of Hindu workers from the plains and of Tibetan refugees brought fresh problems and opportunities. (86) And firmer contacts with the Church outside, while few in number, helped to carry the Local Church into the broader stream of Indian Christianity. (87)

The Church's isolation, its youth and the comparatively low standards of education meant that integration moved more slowly than among more advanced communities on the plains. We have seen that the process of devolution had already begun, but up to the 1950's administration remained in the hands of the Mission Council or the Presbytery, both of which tended to be dominated by Europeans. Of a meeting of the Presbytery in the 1930's, at which missionary members were unable to be present, it was said, "The meeting seemed for the most part lifeless and uninteresting." (88) Only a year later, however, Indian members were beginning to speak with more confidence and overcoming their shyness. (89)

In time, a system was devised of Regional Councils under a Central Board on which both Church and Mission were represented. (90) And in October, 1954, the Mission Council handed the bulk of its work over to this Board. (91) Great strides in the direction of Indian leadership were taken in the next few years and by the 1960's the Council was confidently dealing with such matters as grants to Mission work in Nepal and laymen's training courses as well as simpler items of internal training and discipline. (92)

NOTES.

(85) Ibid., 1948, p.345.
(86) Ibid., 1949, p.344; 1951, p.312 and passim.
(88) "Conference", May, 1936, p.34.
The Eastern Himalayas Church Council is now part of the North-East India Christian Council, once known as the Assam Christian Council. (93)

The Christian community itself continued to grow, though at a reduced rate, the 10,000 Christians of 1930 increasing to between seventeen and eighteen thousand. (94) Christian liberality multiplied four times over, but as the cost of living had in the same time gone up at least as much, this could hardly be called an improvement in financial stability. (95)

On the whole the Church also managed to keep its outward-looking spirit. Speaking of the Darjeeling congregation, where membership remained more or less static, one missionary professed to see signs of "Gospel hardening". (96) But in the Kalimpong area a new impetus was gained strangely enough through competition from Roman Catholics. A few families, including those to which three pastors belonged, went over, but so far from disrupting or disheartening the church, the bulk of its members were so stirred that the R.C. Mission made no further progress. A number of families were won back and the new group of catechumens under instruction was reported as the largest for many years. The incident also resulted in a stronger concentration on house visiting and congregational work and a more genuine interest in self-government and support. (97)

Elsewhere, among the more scattered rural congregations, there could be seen a general growth of willingness to shoulder responsibility and volunteer for evangelistic campaigns, while improvements also took place on the educational side. Later lay training grew in importance, together with new methods of youth work. But where growth in numbers was greatest, the standards of Christian life and knowledge were often very low. And as a typical danger of any mass movement community, an outlook grew up which tended to equate the Church with the tribal group of the district. These/
These overall trends may be illustrated by a few examples.

The Mech or Boro communities showed great willingness to supply money and labour to build their own churches, so that almost every year some account is given of a new building going up or an older one being enlarged. The church erected at Mahagalguri, in 1932, cost less than £100; another dedicated eighteen years later cost £750, local money and labour being responsible for both. Church offerings in this district multiplied twenty times over in the course of thirty years. (98) This was partly due to the fact that converts came in year by year with apparently no sign that the stream was drying up. The 2,500 Boro Christians of the Eastern Duars region in 1920 had become 7,000 by 1950 and were 8,000 a few years later; this despite the fact that possibly another 2,000 had emigrated to the gardens of Assam. (99) The Western region was expanding at an almost equal rate, each region now being divided into two sections with a pastor for each section. (100) "We have established a progressive Christian community, the younger generation of which gives promise of still greater capacity for shouldering responsibility" wrote the missionary in charge and his words may be taken as a fair summing up. (101)

Further West, in the Terai and Kurseong pastorates, numbers and givings were also going up while church attendance was improving and the evangelistic spirit was strong, young men and boys being among the most enthusiastic workers. (102) The supervising missionary declared himself "struck by the way in which work was carried on and the spirit of self-reliance and independence that is increasingly manifest." (103)

NOTES.

(98) Ibid., 1933, p. 545; 1951, p. 310.
(101) Ibid., 1934, p. 597.
(102) Ibid., 1953, p. 543; 1949, p. 344 and passim.
(103) Ibid., 1934, p. 584.
Yet the situation in these areas also had its dark side. In the realm of self-support, while Indian Christians were contributing sometimes a little more and sometimes less than half of all expenses, as costs went up the proportion did not rise and year by year the Mission was finding it harder to meet the balance. (104) And the level of education, although on the upgrade, was still desperately low. The Boros were beginning to produce a few leaders — "The Mechs are doing better now", reported the Principal of the Training Institution in the 1930's. (105) The High School at Mahagalguri was proving of immense value and by 1948 had 280 pupils attending, 200 of them being Christian boys. (106) But there was a very long leeway to be made up. "Out of 5,500 Christians, we have only two matriculates" ran another report about the same time, "and 25 are needed as teachers." (107) The cry for Christian teachers, or indeed teachers of any kind, was a constant one, with little immediate hope of supply matching demand for a generation to come.

Education in Christian principles was in both Duars areas equally patchy and unsatisfactory. The Western Duars region, which in 1956 had thirty congregations, was only running two Sunday Schools and one Youth Fellowship, (108), while Christian fellowship still stretched no further than tribal loyalty. Bengali Christians, on asking for the nearest Church, would be directed to some Bengali-speaking congregation a dozen or more miles off, rather than welcomed into the Boro Church next door. (109)

One result of this need was that a new district missionary, instead of following the old pattern and acting as a general supervisor and extra/
pastor, decided it would be more profitable to concentrate on one small area. A work camp was established, twenty congregations were invited to send representatives, and while talks were given on church life, and evenings were spent in organised evangelism, a road was also built, fences repaired and wells cleaned. (110) This effort supported the scheme for lay training organised by the Church Council. In its desire to raise the standards of Christian knowledge, it arranged a 30-day layman's Bible Course to run over three years, together with a monthly Bible Course for elders and an annual conference. At a higher level, hopes were being pinned on the five graduates planning to complete B.D. degrees within the next seven years. (111) While the Mission had long lost its monopoly in education, its contribution was still an immensely important one. The S.U.M.I., which was recognised in the 1930's as an Intermediate College, was soon being so swamped with applications that it could only accept one in seven and was as much as ever one of the main forces helping to build up the life of the Church. (112) In the 1960's, faced with the alternative of raising its curriculum to B.A. standard or reverting to a High School, for lack of staff and money it chose the latter course. But the establishment in its place of a Government College at Darjeeling, affiliated to the new University of North Bengal at Siliguri, meant that Christians able to profit from higher education now had the chance to do so without having to travel to Darjeeling. (113)

Even elementary education and Christian teaching were becoming all the more necessary because the environment was still primitive enough for common/

NOTES.

(111) Ibid.
(113) Information obtained through correspondence.
religious ideas, whether Hindu or Buddhist, to operate at the lowest levels of superstition. The demon worship and associated practices so often described by early missionaries retained their hold and nothing but patient instruction often repeated could keep them out of the Church. (114)

There was also a great deal still to be learnt about the practice of Christian brotherhood. One example of indigenous adaptation intended to encourage fellowship on a local scale was the Kalimpong congregation's institution of a "love feast" after the Christmas Service. The service itself was a combination of baptisms, harvest thanksgiving and Christmas, and was followed by a communal meal paid for by the young men of the church, after which games were organised for the children and other activities for adults. The idea soon proved popular enough to be adopted by the other congregations in the district. (115)

The need for clearer teaching about the universal character of the Church is demonstrated by the example of "closed-shop" mentality shown among the Boros. (116) And the fact that after several years of national independence they still referred to themselves as belonging to the "Iscottis Mission", while it would surprise no experienced missionary, indicates the difficulty of inculcating a wider outlook. (117)

Yet in common with other Indian churches, the Church of the Eastern Himalayas was now belatedly beginning to feel the pressure of a Hinduism strengthened by the force of national pride. It was a problem which had to be faced by the congregations at Darjeeling and at Kurseong, where the Rama/

NOTES.

(117) "Conference", May, 1958, p.5.
Krishna Mission was now at work. Quite a few Christians were affected by this unaccustomed influence, which in the past had been exerted in the opposite direction through Christian teaching allied to Western education. The churches had to deal with an unusually large crop of mixed marriages and found that it was the teaching and prestige of the Christian schools which provided the core of resistance. (118) Of the Council's four spheres of interest in Tibet, Nepal, Bhutan and Sikkim, limits of space prevent us from saying more than a few words. Kalimpong had its Tibetan congregation, which grew through conversions among refugees, but after the Chinese invasion missionary work had to be confined to evangelism through literature and broadcasting. (119) The work in Nepal, to which the Church Council contributed, was now in the hands of an inter-denominational body, the United Mission to Nepal. Among the missionaries on its staff was a Scottish doctor and it had in all about 40 Indian workers, while Ghurka converts coming over the border for baptism brought new vitality to the Darjeeling congregation. An Indian pastor who had been imprisoned was exercising great personal influence while in jail, and Christians on the Indian side of the border were again able to take a share through literature and the radio. Yet the project was still a Mission rather than a Church responsibility. (120)

The Bhutan Mission was at an even earlier stage of development. The first convert had crossed into India to be baptised almost thirty years before, but it was not till the 1960's that a Scottish missionary was

NOTES.

allowed to open a small dispensary and a pastor permitted to travel round visiting the few Christian families. (121)

In Sikkim alone was an organised church beginning to make some headway, helped by the presence of a redoubtable woman missionary and some schools. Permission had eventually been obtained to buy land for a church site at Gangtok, which was soon in regular use. After a Treaty made with India, an Indian pastor was allowed to take up residence in the country. Given the task of shepherding a community of about 1,000 Christians over an area of 2,000 square miles, he worked in close co-operation with elders in key positions. And the bar to evangelism having been lifted, an enthusiastic band of young men in the capital show promise for the church of the future. (122)

If the Church of the Eastern Himalayas were organised on traditional lines, it would extend to about twenty pastorates. But in fact its organisation is such that some explanation is necessary. In the towns, and in an isolated state like Sikkim, congregations work on the familiar model. But among the other rural areas, a system has been developed from the old missionary "districts" whereby a group of two or three pastors, one of whom usually acts as superintendent, care jointly for an extensive "region" which has only the one Kirk Session. The real unit below the region is, therefore, not the pastorate but the "mundli" or worshipping congregation. These are grouped geographically under a catechist, with an elder who may be a tea-garden worker acting as lay pastor and taking Services on Sunday. (123)

There may be over twenty of these "congregations" organised under one Kirk/

NOTES
(123) "Conference", May, 1958, p.5.
Session and while a pastor will supervise a certain number of them, the whole region is not necessarily sub-divided into a separate group for each minister. Whether this collegiate-pastorate system will continue with the Church's further development, is a matter that at present there is no means of determining. (124)

Sikkim Pastorate has, as already mentioned, a community of about 1,000, its own Kirk Session and an excellent pastor who conducts worship in Nepali or Lepcha. Gangtok church, erected in 1936 to seat 200, now has over 300 members and has recently been extended. Describing his "parish", the Rev. C.T. Pazo has written, "Although the name 'Sikkim Church' sounds as one, many members neither meet nor know each other. They know the pastor who visits them and he knows them. In four places Christians worship every Sunday in houses in rotation. Able members conduct services turn by turn. We encourage such voluntary workers and spontaneous worshippers." (125)

Darjeeling congregation, with 500 people, is self-supporting with its own Kirk Session and worships in St. Columba's, the former Scots Kirk, Nepali and Lepcha being again the languages used. Members of the congregation take part in an evangelistic campaign in a different district each month. (126)

The Darjeeling District, under a separate Kirk Session, covers a small community of about 500, contains nine congregations and has three pastors working from Mirik, Kizom and Rimbick. One of the pastors is responsible only for Sunday work, being a full-time teacher at the Bible School.

The self-supporting congregation of Kalimpong has a community of well over 1,000 and a Nepali pastor, while the Tibetan congregation has its own/

NOTES:
(124) Information obtained from correspondence, etc.
The Tibetan Christian community itself is hardly 100 strong and is suffering because so many Tibetan refugees have now moved on into India, to Nepal or elsewhere. Yet the recent baptism of a well-educated Buddhist, a former high lama of Odzer Monastery, shows that it has a part to play. (127) Institutions like the two Kalimpong hospitals, which relied on subscriptions from friendly townspeople, are also suffering from the exodus of so many rich Tibetan merchants and it appears that Kalimpong's great days as a trading entrepot are over. (128)

In Kalimpong region there are three pastors, one of whom is also superintendent. Here a community of roughly 4,000 is divided among 22 congregations, with Nepali or Lepcha as their languages, and is gradually moving towards self-support. (129)

The pastor of Kurseong, with two congregations to supervise, is also at present superintendent of the Terai region, but has his own Kirk Session, whose language is Nepali. The Christians of the Terai district are mainly plainsmen, and have one pastor at Siliguri who cares for the congregation there and at an out-station. Services are conducted in Hindi, though Nepali is also spoken. His colleague at Maxalbari in the Terai, with three congregations in his charge, conducts Services in Hindi but also uses Oraon and there are some Christians who are Mundas. The total community in this region is perhaps 1,500. The pastors grow rather despondent because of the number of young people who leave for work or training. The installation of an All-India Radio station nearby, on which the congregation is sometimes allowed to broadcast, and the drawing in of "churchless Christians" from other denominations, has helped to broaden the church's outlook. But /

NOTES:

information obtained through correspondence, etc.
(129) "Eastern Himalayan Church News", June, 1966, p. 26; information obtained through correspondence, etc.
it is now quite a rare occasion for rejoicing when new families are actually brought forward for baptism. (130)

The Western Duars region has three pastors caring for a community of 2,000 who speak either Hindi or Bengali.

The largest region of all, the Eastern Duars, with a community of about 8,000 scattered among 20 congregations, has four pastors. The senior men among them is stationed at Mahakalguri and another in Assam, to care for the eight small congregations over the border. Boro is the language generally spoken, but there are also Christians who are plains Bengalis. Pastors' Conferences, youth work camps and Women's Fellowship Conferences appear as regular features of church life in this area. (131).

The only other congregation not yet mentioned is the English-speaking Union Chapel in Darjeeling which is served by a missionary or by an Indian minister when no missionary is available.

The Rev. Martin Rai has recently gone to act as pastor of the Nepali-speaking Hill Christian Church in Calcutta. (132)

Kirk Sessions deal directly with the Council, while institutional work is supervised by the Council through its six Regional Boards — Sikkim, Darjeeling, Kalimpong, Kurseong-Terai, Western Duars and Eastern Duars. The five larger single-unit congregations are self-supporting, paying their pastor's salaries and the upkeep of their buildings. The others still receive some subsidy from Mission funds.

Kirk Session meetings are, according to the district, conducted in Hindi.

NOTES:

Nepali, Boro or Tibetan. Services of worship are, as indicated earlier, conducted in these and five other languages. Up-to-date, no provision has been made for electing women elders, and women members of the Church Council do not vote on matters of faith and order.

While there is at present no actual shortage of pastors, the distribution is plainly uneven, with a strong concentration round the two main centres and a need for further manpower elsewhere, particularly in the Boro region. Tribal divisions as well as language make re-distribution a problem and it is not easy to move a hillman for service among tribesmen nor for the man to be quickly accepted there. (133) In recent years, the shortage of pastors in the larger areas has to some extent been countered by the efforts made towards lay training. Elders have shown an increasing willingness and ability to conduct Services and Kirk Sessions to do pastoral visitation. (134)

The standard of theological education has recently been stepped up, the Church Council having decided that candidates for the ministry should, whenever possible attend Bible School or Theological College before ordination. Until seven or eight years ago, the great majority of ministers qualified by completing the Mission or Church Council's own reading course which was in Hindi, three examinations being set over a course of three years. A revised Reading Course has been retained for special cases.

An attempt is also being made to train five pastors, one for each of the town congregations, up to B.D. standard. Of the pastors in service, one is a Serampore B.D., one has qualified at the Bengali Theological School at Behala; one at Allahabad Bible Seminary (Hindi); one at the Darjeeling Hills Bible School (Nepali), and two have taken a year's refresher course, in Hindi, at the Indore Theological Seminary. The remainder are locally trained. It is hoped that the four candidates at present in training will all eventually graduate at B.D. /
Church union has brought little outward change to the Church’s situation. With the partial exception of the Union Chapel, all the work coming under the Council’s jurisdiction is of Church of Scotland Mission origin, there being no other Mission connected with the U.C.N.I. working in the area. Besides ministers and elders, the Council, whose meetings are held in Hindi, includes representatives from the institutions, both men and women.

While there are Anglicans and Lutherans in the area who co-operate with the Council in various projects, such as the production of Christian literature and the Mission to Nepal, they are few in number, and, while further union would strengthen these bonds, one of the Church’s main problems, that of its isolation, is likely to remain.

"In its young people the church is rich", declared a recent editorial of the local news-sheet, and it is true that the Christian community as a whole is young and vigorous and keeps an active missionary spirit. But for finance, education and the running of its medical institutions it is still very dependent on Mission support, a fact brought home to leaders during the emergency of the invasion of Tibet. "One wonders about the big institutions", said the pastor at Kurseong, "The Church Council is not strong enough to support them and maintain them at present. — We are willing to hand over (our) two schools to the Municipality if they are willing to take them before things become abnormal." (137)

It is a great advantage, however, that relations between national leaders/

NOTES.

(135) Information obtained through correspondence, etc.
(136) "Eastern Himalayan Church News," June 1965, p.17
(137) Ibid., 1965, p.25.
and missionaries should be most harmonious, there being few of the tensions apparent in other churches. This is in spite of the fact that the Mission has always had a strong European atmosphere which has lasted well into modern times. Missionaries also acted as chaplains to the European community, the renowned Dr. Duncan could be met in the bazaars of Darjeeling clad in dark suit, clerical stock and collar, and the political outlook was uncritically pro-British. Writing about the new regime at the time of the Simon Commission a woman missionary remarked, "It is understood that 75% of all Government appointments will be given to Indians. Poor India! — Swarajists are going ahead at a great rate even here —- I tremble to think what will happen to India if they get into power." (138)

But in this case missionary paternalism seems to have done no harm. If to some extent it prevented the development of indigenous forms and leadership, because there was wisdom and affection behind it, it did a great deal towards forwarding the Church's unbroken expansion. Because of the primitive nature of the Church, the cheerful independence of hillmen or tribesmen and their isolation from current events, there never arose any signs of national feeling against Western influences. Integration has thus been smooth and leaders are now being groomed for more responsible duties. The change-over is being dealt with at the Charteris Hospital, for instance, by the appointment of two joint superintendents, one Scottish and one Indian. We may say that indigenous Christianity, strong at the local level,

NOTES.

(138) MS letters from Miss M.B. Gardner, Kurseong, to Miss Reid, dated 4.3.29 and 1.7.29, S.N.I.
has not yet been fully expressed by the Church as a whole. Yet the uncertainty of the political situation, particularly the threat over the Tibetan border, has stirred the Church Council to face up in a more matter-of-fact manner to the responsibilities which a sudden withdrawal of overseas support would thrust upon it.

The refusal of the Indian Government to grant entry permits to new missionaries in frontier areas and doubts about the renewal of other permits has brought this problem to the fore-front. (139)

(139) Information obtained through correspondence, etc.
R.W. Weir, "Foreign Missions of the Church of Scotland."


"Papers of the Scottish Universities' Mission", 1885-1902. F.M.C. Secretary's Library.

F.M. Reports.

"Conference."


MS. Papers, S.N.I.
CHAPTER XIV.

THE CHURCH UNION MOVEMENT.

The Nineteenth Century.

Although Scotland is a small country, perhaps even because of it, in relation to their size the Presbyterian churches in Scotland have done as much as any of their contemporaries for the cause of unity among Protestant denominations. Since the ecclesiastical history of Scotland is notorious for its schismatic character, this is more than a little surprising. But there are a number of reasons which quite logically account for it.

First there is the fact that whereas in the Eighteenth Century and earlier the history of Scottish Presbyterianism was one of schisms and secessions, subdivisions and cross-divisions, the impulse of those movements carrying well on into the Nineteenth Century, from 1850 onwards the story was one of rapprochement and reunion. (1) The change of direction represented popular moods and reflected accurately the convictions and enthusiasms of the new period. As the Church had for long enough been the sole organ of Scottish collective life (2), so its courts had offered the chief means through which Scotsmen might publicly express their opinions, and these on matters political and social as well as religious. Consequently religion, which in England was apt to be a thing apart, and evocative of social and economic distinctions, in Scotland permeated the whole fabric of national life (3). The tangled profusion of Presbyterian splinter groups which had begun to proliferate early in the 1700's — Cameronians and Secessionists, Burghers and Anti-Burghers, Auld Lichts and New — these may appear to our eyes almost indistinguishable one from the other. But they represented to their adherents distinctions as real and important as anything on earth or even in heaven. The evils of patronage and of State control and the

NOTES.

(2) G.W. Trevelyan, "British History in the Nineteenth Century and After", p.284.
(3) Charles Petrie, "The Victorians", p.133.
presentation of pure evangelical doctrine were for hundreds of thousands of lay men and women as well as clergy issues more vital than the regular supply of food or raiment. With this religious background, we must not be surprised that, as one historian remarks, "the most important event in Scottish history in the Victorian age should have been of an ecclesiastical nature, namely the Disruption of 1843." (4)

Momentous as it was in its consequences, however, and the largest of all the Presbyterian secessions, the Disruption provided both the climax and the end to the long-drawn-out series of lesser disruptions. Four years later, as the Synods of the Relief and the United Secession churches joined in the United Presbyterian Church, the centri-petal influences which were truly typical of this century began to gain ground. Very soon the question was not whether the various Presbyterian denominations would unite but with whom they would unite and how soon. The unions of 1900 and 1929 were logical steps in that process and unity among fellow Presbyterians led naturally to and was influenced by the thought of union with other Christians who were not Presbyterians. This could hardly take place in Scotland, where the overwhelming weight of the Presbyterians very naturally frightened off the other, smaller bodies, who were in mortal fear of being swamped. But it could take place elsewhere. And where such possibilities presented themselves, the Scottish churches showed a lively interest.

Furthermore and rather unexpectedly, Presbyterian unions in Scotland did not lead to a strengthening of Presbyterianism as a whole, or to a narrowing insistence on its peculiar tenets. The process in this instance worked in the reverse order to what may be observed South of the border, where the High Church revival launched from Oxford under Keble and Newman was directed, after Newman's accession to Rome, into the channels of a strong and world-wide Pan-Anglican movement. (5) In England it was Anglo-Catholicism which gathered strength, leading to the genuine revival of /

NOTES.

(4) Ibid., p.136.
a moribund Establishment and the awakening of a new sense of responsibility but also to a narrowing and hardening in the realm of doctrine. But meanwhile Scottish Presbyterianism, which had at its worst been utterly bigoted and fanatical, grew less rigid and much more openminded. Thus while Pan-Anglicanism spread outwards across the globe from Oxford and Canterbury, Pan-Presbyterianism found its drive and centre in the U.S.A. far more than in Scotland.

In addition to the centripetal movement which was now taking place in Scottish church circles, and to a growing spirit of tolerance towards differences of ecclesiastical form and government, a third reason for the attitude of the Scottish churches may be found in the demands of the Missions they had founded. Here factors which affected in varying degree all the Western sending churches bore on the Scottish situation with more than average weight.

The modern Church Union movement, one of the finest fruits of Nineteenth Century missionary endeavour, had behind it at least as much of divine necessity as of human aspiration. Churches on the Mission field began to consider uniting not because they wanted to but because it had become obvious they had to. Resources were quickly seen to be spread far too thinly over the ground. Common treasures of the Christian heritage were highlighted, while deep-rooted historical differences refused to put forth new shoots in alien soil. Customs and practices still cherished in the home churches were dropped and others adopted from neighbouring denominations to suit the needs of the time, the place and the people. Personal friendships, mutual respect, mutual dependence and a common goal drew the missionaries of the various Societies together. In the fight against a common enemy, it was quite evident that unity meant strength and a divided Church could not hope to proclaim one Lord, one faith, one baptism, one God and Father of all. And in the desire to form indigenous churches which would be more than mere /
reproductions of Western models, church leaders moved slowly but determinedly towards the elimination of their divisions not through compromise but by seeking to form a new creation.

In this movement, and many years before the meeting at Edinburgh in 1910 (6), the Scottish churches through their Missions in India played a part which was sometimes small but always wholehearted. When the prospect was one of union with other Presbyterians they either took the initiative or gave full co-operation. When the possibility of a wider union presented itself they chose the greater rather than the less. When delays occurred due to difficulties or suspicions on the part of one negotiating group, they were seldom directly responsible and more than once they acted as mediator between extremes. In the preliminary stages, of practical comity and the organising of joint institutions, they had an excellent record. And in the course of time they were able to furnish the union movement with several able workers and leaders. These facts are stressed only because the opposite might well have been the case. There would have been sound historical precedents for a few exhibitions of Presbyterian stickiness and intransigence, but in fact there was not even the occasional spanner in the works. And if Scottish Mission churches did not always lead the way towards union they were normally among the front row of followers.

This was possible because by and large they had an easier road to travel than some of their neighbours. The Calvinist doctrine of the Church is a high doctrine but its institutional basis, the hierarchy of courts, is adaptable. Besides, Scottish Calvinism in India proved in the event a good deal less aggressive than that of other churches of the Reformed tradition. Leaving theological considerations aside, moreover, Scottish Missions with their limited size and high educational demands had to keep two very practical objects in view. Their university colleges, most of which served the Church and the Province at large, needed the support of other Missions if they were /

NOTES

(6) See Chapter 5.
to flourish. And their own small pastoral units, which were too scattered to allow of uniting and strengthening each other, had of necessity to rely on neighbours of other denominations to supply teacher training, theological training, professional education for women, and similar expensive facilities.

This situation was of course a rule which knew of few exceptions among Indian Missions. Yet there were a few, such as the Anglican Missions, which were together powerful enough, along with the official Church of the Indian Establishment, to organise a reasonably exact reproduction of the traditional system. There were also other Missions which, though perhaps small and weak, because of the strength of their convictions, the narrowness of their outlook or a peculiar twist in their tenets, would have little to do with anyone but themselves. But the Scottish Missions, neither strong enough to stand on their own feet nor bigoted enough to hold aloof, took with most others the middle of the road. As a consequence, if they contributed less than they might of their original Calvinist heritage, in spite of their schismatic past and partly because of it they could hardly have contributed more in terms of honest donkey work, patience and sheer goodwill.

The Scottish Disruption was, as we have seen, the climax of a process already on the way to being reversed. Presbyterian secessions began to make up their differences, so paving the way for more extensive unions. In the meantime, as in Scotland cousins of the Presbyterian family drew closer together, the Scottish Mission churches in India were moving towards each other and their neighbours along three parallel but inter-connected lines.

First came the principle of comity, with the origins of which the Bombay Mission was closely connected. In 1825, the Anglican, Congregational and Presbyterian missionaries working in the capital of that neglected Province met with each other and their colleagues of the Brethren to found a Missionary Union whose aims would be fourfold; to discuss common problems, to discover areas of agreement, to find ways of avoiding friction and to fix a common standard of requirements for baptism.
Out of discussion on the third of those aims the practice of delineating Mission areas and recognising mutual boundaries which later came to be defined as the principle of comity was given its first tentative work-out. As Dr. Warren points out, comity would never be more than a temporary answer for the relations between Missions. However sound the concept, in practice it was limited because it excluded bodies like the Roman Catholics, the "Syrian" churches of South India and a host of small "one-man" sects and Missions. As has happened with the parish system elsewhere, comity in the cities proved unworkable. And the emigration of populations kept cutting across previously agreed boundaries. It was also found to provide a fertile breeding ground for confessionalism and the building up of denominational empires. (7)

Nevertheless, when we remember that for the greater part of the Nineteenth Century English Dissenters were prevented by law from taking magisterial office, that until 1880 the Church of England retained the right to read the Prayer Book burial service at the grave-side of non-Conformists and that in the 1930's and possibly later Anglican chaplains in India were re-baptising infants whose baptism had not been at the hands of an episcopally ordained minister, comity among Missions may be seen as a distinct and even a remarkable advance. (8) On the whole it worked well among the Missions which accepted it, as did all the larger Protestant Societies. There were many minor infringements and causes of friction, yet these were mostly of the kind which can occur within any denomination. (9) Such petty/

**NOTES**

(8) G.M. Trevelyan, op. cit., p.280. The last practice is a matter of personal knowledge.
(9) Examples occur here and there in Chapters 6-13. In Nagpur, there was rivalry for a time between the Free Church Mission and the C.M.S. (Ch.6) In Poona shortly before the first world war, the Church of Scotland Mission actually caused a local Presbyterian schism. (Ch.6) And as late as the 1940's, the Church in Rajasthan was troubled by Methodist Episcopal groups. (Ch.11)
irritations were very different from the type of rivalry only too often produced through competition with Roman Catholic Missions and some of the small Protestant sects. These not only entered areas already occupied, which after all they had a perfect right to do, but with a choice of hundreds of untouched villages to approach attempted to form a church by seeking out and "converting" somebody else's converts. (10)

It was the principle of Comity which prevented the same thing happening either deliberately or inadvertently among the larger Protestant Missions. (11) Thus during a period when relations among churches in the West were often strained, the observance of Comity on the Mission fields helped towards both friendship and efficiency and the principle can well be called the god-mother of the ecumenical movement.

Its god-father, to continue the metaphor, was the steady advance made in building up co-operative institutions. In this advance, as in the observance of Comity, the Scottish Missions, owing to their constitution and character, had a very real interest. Had their resources been larger, then they might like the Anglican Missions have been able to build up a structure which was in its totality nearly self-sufficient. Or if those resources had all been concentrated within a single geographical area, as

NOTES

(10) To be fair, up to the end of the Nineteenth century, the attitude of the larger Protestant Missions towards the conversion of Roman Catholics was very similar. Tests of sincerity were severe, however, there was very little outright bribery and most Roman Catholic converts or "re-converts" were lapsed individuals. Eventually the Anglo-Saxon sense of fair play, and closer co-operation with R.C. Missions on educational boards, etc., led to a diminution even of this form of sheep-stealing.

(11) By the time of the Mutiny, we find the principle of Comity being accepted by the larger British and American Societies. At a Missionary Conference held at Ootacamund, South India, in 1858, where ten Societies took part, a paper was read on "The Laws which Should Govern Missionary Societies --- in their Relation to One Another". The Conference not only approved of the principles laid down but sent a letter to the Leipsic Lutheran Mission in protest against its failure to co-operate. "Proceedings of the South India Missionary Conference held at Ootacamund, 1858", S.P.C.K., Madras, 1858, pp.334-339.
was the case with a number of American and Continental Missions, they might then have achieved within a narrower field a similar measure of self-sufficiency. Or again if they had been too small and weak to maintain any large institutions of their own, they would have had to rely for the training of their leaders on the institutions of others.

But the Church of Scotland Missions were in the position of being too small in the aggregate to form, like the Anglicans did, a nation-wide organisation of their own. They were too scattered to do so within a more limited area and yet powerful enough to have developed several institutions, in particular the four Provincial colleges, which were of unusual prestige and value. These colleges were expensive and could only reach their full potential stature with the additional support and influence of other Missions. At the same time the Scottish Missions found that, as educational standards rose, they were often unable to meet government or internal requirements for the training of their future teachers, catechists and pastors, doctors, nurses and compounders.

Institutions such as hospitals or high schools lay within the scope of all but the very smallest Missions and they could moreover be opened or closed again, extended or cut down, without greatly affecting the future of the local church. But the training of leaders was another matter. This was something quite vital to the Church's development and it was in the support of these large and costly institutions, requiring a highly qualified staff, extensive buildings and equipment and the continuity of a stable tradition that most Missions pooled their resources.

The Scottish Mission colleges all became in varying degree union institutions and in the other branches of academic and practical training the Scottish Missions became partners in other co-operative institutions.

Every one of the eight Mission fields had at least one institution which administered to the needs of its Christian neighbours and the majority/
of fields had several. (12) But if ability to train one's own leaders
be taken as an essential mark of an independent church, none of the eight fields
even approached self-sufficiency in this direction or showed a particular
desire to reach it. Co-operation was both the Christian and the practical
answer.

The resulting complex of inter-dependent links, in which the Church
of Scotland Missions and their churches were in a position similar to those
of the other bodies with which they were co-operating, was thus a second and
very fruitful influence towards a more organic type of unity. The co-operative
movement was embodied in the National Christian Council of India, which was
formed in 1922 and developed to operate under fourteen Provincial Councils. We have seen how in a district like Santalia the Christian Council became,
for lack of any more representative body, the voice of the Santal Church
itself. And at the All-India level the National Christian Council, besides
acting as a sort of unofficial spokesman and Parliament for the non-Roman
churches of the nation, provides a meeting-place for agencies with common
interests, such as the University Colleges, and organises common projects
in evangelism, literature, social service and so on.

Comity kept Missions apart where friction would have aggravated
differences, co-operative work brought them together where isolation would
have stunted growth. Together, they eased the path of negotiation among
Presbyterian churches which was to be for them the prelude to wider union.

In 1875, five years after the last of the Scottish Mission fields
had been opened at Darjeeling and in the year that the World Presbyterian
Alliance was founded, the "Presbyterian Alliance of India" was formed.

NOTES

(12) At the time of the re-union in 1929, by which year the number of
major institutions had been stabilised, the number of co-operative
institutions for which the Scottish Missions had originally been
responsible was ten. This does not take account of the many others,
such as high schools and hospitals, which were made use of by other
Missions. And the position was of course reciprocal. See C. of S.
Its origin can be traced back to a certain "Plea for a Presbyterian Church in India" sent out by the American Presbyterian Synod of the Punjab. And one of its chief architects was the Scottish missionary, J.H. Morrison.

The Alliance brought together ten churches, three from Scotland, one each from Ireland and Wales and five others from the U.S.A., Canada, New Zealand and the Continent. The 1870's were a seminal decade for co-operation, because a year earlier the five of those churches which had their headquarters in Britain had already met, and important missionary conferences had also been held at Calcutta and Madras. There was much talk among Presbyterians of brotherly co-operation and the partitioning of fields and it was put forward as a definite proposal that the Free Church and the Church of Scotland unite their Madras Institutions to form a Madras Christian College. It was a matter for regret that a similar move would not at present be possible in Calcutta.(13)

The Presbyterian Alliance which, though founded in 1875, only held its first plenary session in Allahabad two years later, agreed to meet thereafter at three-year intervals. It was concerned with evangelism and matters relating to comity and co-operative enterprise. But its reason for existence and the immediate purpose to which it quickly gave priority was the establishment of an Indian Church. At its opening meeting, delegates pointed out the difficulties attendant on government by the home churches, particularly in the supervision of Indian pastors, and a desire was expressed that Indian courts should be allowed to take their own disciplinary action.(14) By the time another dozen years had passed, the Alliance was in a position to declare that "there is nothing in doctrine, polity or worship to keep the Presbyterian Churches in India apart, and the interests of Christianity, especially from /

NOTES

(14) F.C. Report, 1878, p.13. Where numbers permitted, a Mission field was invariably constituted as a Presbytery of the Synod or Assembly of the home Church.
a missionary point of view, would be advanced by their union. (15)

Partly because of the number of Missions involved, however — and by 1888 there were thirteen — progress was slow. In that same year the Council of the Alliance began issuing its own magazine, "The Indian Standard", a periodical which continues to be published monthly as "The United Church Review". The difficulties experienced by the Alliance derived from the fact that its constituent bodies were not agreed on the respective merits of organic union or a looser type of federation." A mere alliance proved less than what was needed" written Dr. William Stewart, "And, late in the century, its activities languished, while those who cared debated in the pages of the "Standard" the desirability of going forward to an integrated Church." (16)

Further meetings of the Alliance were held between 1880 and 1889, however, on Allahabad, Poona, Bombay and Calcutta. And finally, in 1904, partly through the interest aroused by the Scottish union of 1900, the Presbyterian Church of India was brought into being by a union of all but four of the Churches represented in the Alliance. (17) The Church's first Moderator was the Rev. K.C. Chatterjee, a pastor of the American Presbyterian Mission and one of Alexander Duff's converts. "We believe that only the presence and guidance of the Spirit of God could have produced the unity of sentiment which now prevails among us in India," ran part of the Negotiating Committee's final pronouncement. "The native Church of India calls for an indigenous Presbyterian Church — This union will when completed represent the widest union hitherto consummated by Presbyterians." (18)

The formation of the new Church was hailed in Scotland, with some hyperbole, as "an epoch in /

NOTES

(15) F.C. Report, 1890, p.29
(16) W. Stewart, "The Church is There in North India", p.14.
(17) B. Sundkler, op.cit., p.28; James Kellock, op.cit., p.2
(18) "Proceedings of the Representative Committee of the Presbyterian Alliance of India", Allahabad, 14-16 Jan., 1903, Edinburgh Press, Calcutta, 1903. (S.N.I. Folio 7840. This publication includes a short history of the Alliance.)
modern church history — India's greatest lesson to the historic and divided
Mother Churches of the West." Divided into sixteen Presbyteries, the
Presbyterian Church of India cared for a baptised community of a little under
50,000, of whom one third were communicants.[19]

To think of this achievement as basically a strengthening of
Presbyterian forces in the country would be very wide of the mark. The truth
is that even before the Presbyterian Alliance had been formed, some of its
members were already thinking in broader terms. This fact is important and
may best be illustrated by two typical examples.

The following quotation is extracted from a narrative of the visit of
the Church of Scotland Deputation to India in the winter of 1867-68 [20]:

"During our stay in Madras we were met by fifteen native pastors belonging
to various Christian societies. Most of them understood English; some of them had
resided in Europe, and could speak English with great ease and fluency. We
found that in their ordination to the ministry every item of the formulas of
the various churches to which they are attached had been prescribed. Matters
of history which have moulded the churches at home have been imported, in all
their literal inductions and detail, into the Christian teaching of these
pastors: so that of necessity Christianity in the Hindoo teacher has taken
a shape which does not appear so natural to minds which have no historical
association with it: and in the propagation of Christianity there is awaiting
that natural force which would exist if stricter regard were had to its simpler
and original truths before they took their expression from Western history.
How can the body of Christian truth appear other than tinged with foreign
elements when, apart from appropriateness to their special wants, it is
presented to the Hindoos as it is to ourselves in our various Confessions? /

NOTES

We were conscious of some incongruity when we saw before us fifteen men — all converts to the faith, all preachers of the Gospel — going forth to their heathen countrymen with all the symbols and badges of our divided Churches at home. — It is clothing David in Saul’s armour: it is an excellent coat of mail and a valiant sword, but there are other and simpler weapons better fitted for the shepherd, and with which he is more likely to accomplish his work....

"Perhaps in connection with this subject we may be allowed to repeat a conviction made by one of the Deputation at a great missionary meeting in Calcutta, as to keeping steadily before the mind of the Churches at home the vast importance of a native Church being organised in India.

"By a native Church we do not certainly mean — what in present circumstances we thankfully accept — native Churches in ecclesiastical connection with the different European and American Missions. It surely cannot be desired by an intelligent Christian — that our several Churches should reproduce, in order to perpetuate in the new world of a Christianised India, those forms or symbols which in the old world have become marks, not of our union as Christians, but of our disunion as sects. We may not, indeed, be responsible for these divisions in the Church which have come down to us from the past. We did not make them nor can we now perhaps unmake them — But must we establish these different organisations in India? — Is the grand army to remain broken up into separate divisions, each to recruit to its own standard, and to invite the Hindoos to wear our respective uniforms, adopt our respective shibboleths, learn and repeat our respective war cries, and even make caste marks of our wounds and scars, which to us are but the sad mementoes of old battles? — Shall Christian converts in India be necessarily grouped and stereotyped into Episcopal Churches, Presbyterian Churches, Lutheran Churches, Methodist Churches, Baptist Churches or Independent Churches and adopt their respective creeds, the Confession of Faith, the Thirty-nine Articles, or some other formula approved of by our forefathers —?
"Whether any Church seriously entertains this design we know not, though we suspect it of some; and we feel sure it will be realised in part unless it is carefully guarded against by every opportunity being watched and taken advantage of to propagate a different idea, and to rear up an all-inclusive and independent native Indian Church. By such a Church we mean one which shall be organised and governed by the natives themselves, as far as possible, independently of us. —

"A Church like this would, from its very nationality, attract many a man who does not wish to be ranked among the adherents of Mission Churches. It would dispose also of many difficulties inseparable from our position, whether regarding baptism or the selection and support of a native ministry. And finally it would give ample scope, for many a year to come, for all the aid and effort which our home Churches and missionaries could afford by schools and colleges, personal labour, and also by money contributions, to establish, strengthen and extend it ...

"Our hopes of an Indian nation are bound up with our hopes of an Indian church; and it is a high privilege for us to be able to help on this consummation. The West thus gives back to the East the riches which it has from the East received, to be returned again, we doubt not with interest to ourselves." (21)

The quotation is given at some length because it expresses sentiments and ideas with which even informed historians would hesitate to credit Christians of that date. Yet if it is not entirely representative of the period, it certainly represents one of its major currents. The ecumenical

NOTES

idea is clearly not so modern as many people think.

Our second quotation is taken from the report of a Punjab Presbyterian Conference held at Lahore in 1878, about a year after the first meeting of the Presbyterian Alliance. According to an introductory circular, the Conference was held because "the existence in India of different denominations had led converts to compare one church system with another." Anglican missionaries now moving into the area in greater numbers were said to be teaching episcopal forms and rites and the Presbyterian missionaries wished Christians "to study the Scriptural basis" (i.e. of the Church's foundation).

In the course of a discussion which followed the reading of papers on "Church union", an Indian pastor, the Rev. Mr. Bhose, expressed himself in these words:

"You, the fathers of Presbyterianism, have done your work well. You have made us so much Presbyterian that we cannot be more so: yet as the Fathers passed away from you, so you will pass away from us. I was never taught Presbyterianism. I was taught the Bible and I believe that the great and broad principles found in it will characterise the Church of India and not any special tenets of Presbyterianism. Don't be afraid of those going to Episcopacy. Let them alone. Now you must unite Presbyterians by taking an interest in them and gather them together and you will thus prepare them for being the Church of India." (22)

Those quotation may be taken as reasonable illustrations of the outlook becoming common in Protestant circles throughout India. As an extension of the idea of Comity, a number of Provincial Conferences for missionaries of various denominations were held in the 1850's and 1860's, and in 1870 Allahabad /

NOTES

(22) Report of the Punjab Presbyterian Conference, Lahore, December 1878, p.8. Before it closed, this Conference considered a motion by Mr. Youngson of Sialkot that a Committee should approach the Episcopal Church and other Evangelical Protestant Churches of the Punjab "with a view to preparing for corporate union in one Church of the Punjab". The motion was only accepted finally in a very modified form.
became the scene of the first General Missionary Conference. (23) There a C.M.S. missionary, the Rev. J. Barton, read an important paper on "The Indian Church of the Future", which gave instances of the common ground shared by the policies of the leading Missionary Societies. This makes it clear that the hopes expressed by the Church of Scotland's deputation, based as they were on information gleaned from their tour, were shared by leaders of other churches. (24)

Of equal significance are the pleas of the Indian pastor at the Punjab Conference for a "Church of India", his eagerness to allay the fears of the missionary "fathers" that their converts were likely to desert the true Christian doctrine and his assumption that the founding of a national Church must lie in missionary hands. Here are represented what are perhaps the three most important factors of the situation: the desire of Indian Christians to unite and form a national Church; the sharing of this desire by the missionaries, but coupled in their case with convictions about first principles and a fear these might be abandoned; and the recognition by all parties concerned that until an Indian Church was formed progress must lie with the missionaries.

The better educated Indian Christians were indeed by the 1870's beginning to grow impatient of Western divisions and, without having as yet much idea of their depth or complexity, were hopefully urging Missions to unite. In 1870, the Bengal Free Church Mission's Lal Behari Day had published a scheme for church union which was to include both Episcopalians and non-Episcopalians. It was not a very satisfactory document from any /

NOTES

(23) These Conferences were not, as the title would suggest to present-day ears, for overseas missionaries alone. The appointment given to the ablest Indian converts was that of "missionary", and so the Free Church contingent at the Allahabad Conference consisted of six Scotsmen plus four Indians - Nauroji from Bombay, Rajagopaul from Madras, Battacharya from Calcutta, and Sheshadri from Jalna; Free Church Report, 1873, p. 11.

point of view, and it was quickly pointed out that Behari Day's "bishop" was no more than a Moderator in disguise. (25) Not by the greatest stretch of imagination could the plan have been made palatable to Anglicans and Behari Day's own Mission dismissed it with kindly patronage as "laudable but premature." (26)

Yet the important thing is not the intrinsic worth of the attempt but the fact it should have been made at all. During those thirty years of negotiation for Presbyterian union which ended in 1904, forces and interests were at work which we have illustrated in Presbyterian circles but which had their counterparts elsewhere. And no sooner had the Presbyterian union been consummated than men began to look towards the next stage of the journey. "God grant", wrote the Church of Scotland's missionary at Wazirabad even as the final arrangements for union were going through — "God grant that the Church of Christ in India, whether Presbyterian or Episcopal or Methodist or Congregational or Baptist, will be welded and united into one glorious whole, and will go forward united to the conquest of India for Jesus Christ its Head." (27)

The Twentieth Century.

In entering the Twentieth Century we reach the period when the Church Union movement attained adult status. It was no longer a matter for discussion at some occasional Conference or for a scheme propounded by some well-meaning individual which would magically iron out all difficulties. Church union graduated into the big business class. The Western churches themselves, through responsible leaders and officially appointed representatives, commenced to move cumbrously together. The process slowed down simply because it was so heavily weighted. Behind the naive eagerness of Indian Christians lay /

NOTES
(26) P.C. Report, 1873, p. 11.
(27) Wazirabad Mission Notes, February 1902.
the deeper knowledge and also the ingrained predilections and prejudices of
the missionaries. And behind them again there stood the Home Churches,
conscientious but suspicious, sympathetic but conservative, superior, refusing
to be rushed, and never in any circumstance whatever prepared to take the
slightest risk.

Yet new forces kept the movement from stagnating completely. During
the first decade of the century, the ideals and programme of the National
Congress stirred up Indian Christians to regard with fresh clarity and
enthusiasm the practical goal of a national Church. (28) The Y.M.C.A.,
though a Western institution, proved in India as in China a splendid training
ground for Christian leadership. Indeed K. T. Paul, one of the first Indian
Christians to take an active part in politics, chose it because it offered
a freedom and scope denied by the Church. And the foundation of a National
Missionary Society helped to turn the minds of Indian church members to the
needs of their own land, while also giving them some idea of their powers
and responsibility. (29) Meanwhile, at the international level, the
ecumenical movement and the International Missionary Council entered the field
as the most powerful of all the organs which were directing the minds and
consciences of Christians towards the goal of unity.

Of the eight Scottish Mission fields, representing the work of three
parent bodies whose daughter churches entered the Presbyterian Church of India,
that of Madras joined with a reservation. In October of 1901 the Madras Free
Church and Church of Scotland Missions had united with the American Aroot Mission,
a Reformed body with its headquarters at Vellore, to form the "South India
United Church". Though the American Aroot Mission was Presbyterian in policy,
it traced its ancestry back to the Dutch Reformed Church, consequently the /

NOTES

(28) "Awake Indian Christians! Swadeshi is in the air. Is it without lessons
for us?", asked an Indian minister in Bombay. Quoted B. Sundkler, op. cit
p. 33.
(29) B. Sundkler, op. cit., gives in Chapter I, pp. 26-35, a short but comprehensive
account of the main unifying forces which were prominent at the beginning
of the century.
word "Presbyterian" was omitted from the new Church's name. It did not accurately describe the American Mission's background and furthermore the architects of the union looked forward to the possibility of later unions outside the Presbyterian family. Of the South India United Church's community of about 12,000 people, only a sixth came from the two Scottish Mission areas.

(30)

In 1908, this body left the Presbyterian Church of India, in which it had formed the South India Synod, to join with a group of Congregational churches which had come into being through the work of the London Missionary Society in Travancore and the American Madura Mission. The step was acceded to "with much regret" on the part of the Presbyterian Church of India, but the South Indian section was convinced that the natural division between North and South, rather than denominational boundaries, was the best line of cleavage to be adopted in the interests of the Indian Church itself. As the Conjeevaram district missionary, J.H. MacLean, expressed it, "A union for all India would lead to the formation of a Church with its centre of gravity in the South while its geographical centre would be pretty far North." (31) Maclean himself was one of the prime movers in the formation of the original S.I.U.C. and continued until his death in 1944 to be a doughty champion of Church union. In following this decision, the wisdom of which has never since then been seriously questioned, the churches of the Madras Mission ceased to have any organic connection with those of the other Scottish Mission fields, and their history must therefore be taken separately.

The new Church adhered to the name "South India United Church" but it was now not only a very much larger body but preponderantly Congregationalist in origin and outlook. Out of a Christian community of 142,000 less /

NOTES

(30) Ibid., pp. 37-38
than a tenth came from the Presbyterian or Reformed tradition. The proportional
make-up of the S.I.U.C. was to be a matter of some importance, as in the
negotiations which were going to take place in the years to follow the extremes
on either side were usually represented by ex-Congregationalists of the S.I.U.C.
on the one hand and the High Church elements of the (Anglican) Church of India,
Burma and Ceylon on the other.

The Presbyterian section of the S.I.U.C., though small, thus represented
what one might, using political terms, designate as the moderate section of the
left wing. Consequently in the course of discussions it was often cast in
the role of mediator or interpreter. As time went on J.H. Maclean, whose
strong principles and grasp of Presbyterian doctrine did not prevent him from
learning or being able to change his mind, became the chief spokesman on the
Reformed side. While opposing the High Anglican conception of the Church and
its ministry, he was on the other hand equally pronounced against the radicals
of the S.I.U.C. who were apt to be suspicious of order or the imposition of
superior authority. Maclean was also the interpreter of union negotiations to
his own colleagues and the home Church in Scotland through a constant stream
of articles in church and mission periodicals. And while it is a feature of
all Congregationalist Mission work that their churches have gradually moved
towards the acceptance of some more centralised authority (32) there can be
little doubt that Maclean's steady influence helped to carry the S.I.U.C. in
that direction. "Though the Presbyterian Churches entering the union
constituted a very small element numerically", he wrote in 1931, "And though
we have never tried to propagate Presbyterian views, the history of the Church
during the 23 years of its existence has been a history of the gradual adoption
of Presbyterian practices throughout the Church." (33)

NOTES
Unfortunately, the churches of the Presbyterian or Reformed tradition did not produce, between 1919 and 1947, any outstanding Indian leaders who were able to contribute something positive to the course of the next set of negotiations, which took place from 1919 onwards. On the Anglican side, that Church's first Indian bishop, Azariah of Dornakal, proved from the first a man of magnetic personality and unusual gifts. (34) And representing the S.I.U.C. there were men such as Neshach Peter, V. Santiago, H. Sunitra and the layman K.T. Paul. Apart from Peter, who was a product of the Arcot Mission, these men all came from a Congregationalist background, however, and as a result the most authoritative and persuasive Presbyterian voice remained a Scottish one.

This was the more to be regretted because for the first time in history the movement which culminated, in 1947, with the founding of the Church of South India, was actually Indian Christian in origin. Of the seven Anglicans and twenty-six representatives of the S.I.U.C. who started the movement through the historic meeting at Tranquebar in 1919 and produced the document which popularly came to be known as the "Tranquebar manifesto", all of the former and all but four of the latter were Indian. Bishop Azariah's was the driving force and in the earlier negotiations Indians played the greater part, not only numerically but in the expression of their hopes, opinions and beliefs. The path taken by negotiations over the next twenty-eight years, including the entrance of the South India Methodists in 1925, has been thoroughly documented and it would not be relevant to select from Professor Sundkler's book items here or there which might be dubbed "the Presbyterian contribution".

Undoubtedly the main picture which emerges is that of the theological heavy-weights of the West moving in, and apart from Azariah and Sunitra there were few Indians capable of keeping their feet in the ring with them for very /

NOTES
long. With increasing frequency the names which appear in debates are Western names and their subject matter carries us deep into the dusty corners of ancient ecclesiastical disputes. It may well be argued that as part of the Holy Catholic Church the new Church must be built on the foundation of the saints and the apostles. Azariah himself gave it as his view that, "The faith handed on to the saints, the Bible, the common confession of the Universal Church, the historical ministry, the service and ritual of our parent Church are to be the heritage which we can continue to use and preserve for the Indian people". (35) History cannot be ignored and Sundkler, in recording the South India union movement, suggests that the deepest problem of Church union is that of finding redemption for the wrongs of history without renouncing it. (36) Nevertheless, as he goes on to say, "The struggle over South India was not really fought over South India at all. — The main contestants in the debate were not to be found in the Assemblies of South India. They were sitting in their studies in Oxford and Cheltenham." (37)

It is understandable why, as discussions on issues of doctrine and church polity grew more complicated, the missionaries should take over. These were the scholars and the professors, some of whom were at the same time able church leaders with great practical experience. This is what happens with all such discussions. The tragedy in this instance consisted in the fact that the theological experts also happened to be the foreigners.

"Those who took part in the South India negotiations have been represented alternately as old men in a hurry and young men in a hurry", writes Stephen Neill in one of his latest assessments, "As nice but rather ignorant people; as earnest pastors who were determined to force union through, regardless of any theological issues might come up. In point of fact they were a patient, rather learned, very human group of Christians, who believed /

NOTES

(35) Quoted Neverhaus, p.139
(37) Ibid., p.178.
themselves to have heard a call from God and were prepared to sit down year after year to listen to the voice of God — Every point, of theology as of practice, was patiently discussed. Every suggestion, from whatever quarter received, was weighed with discrimination and unhurried judgment. The delegates remained in close touch with the authorities of their own Churches in India and elsewhere and with the best theological authorities in the whole of Christendom." (38)

We need not doubt that this was true, nor question the sincerity of those who carried the heaviest burdens and for longest. But we may put forward the point of view, that it would have been better to let more Indians accept a greater proportion of those burdens, which they would certainly have got rid of sooner. Even so, negotiations would not have been protracted to such an inordinate length if the Scheme of Union had depended on the agreement of missionary leaders alone. The home Churches, with which in theory the negotiating Churches were in a fraternal but independent relationship, had also to be consulted and here the law's delays had little to teach the theologians and the churchmen. "If the task had only been to reconcile and combine the South India churches, the solution would probably have come much earlier than it eventually did" writes Professor Sundkler again. (39) It is not to be wondered at that many responsible Indians were saying, like Canon Manuel, "The Indian Church is sick of the whole thing". (40)

Bishop Azariah himself is reported as having at one point called the Indian members of the Committee together to tell them: "Our European friends are not going to help us. These subtle points of doctrine and practice which they raise have little or no meaning for us here in India. We must force the pace". (41)

NOTES

(39) B. Sundkler, op.cit., p.207
(40) Quoted Ibid., p.207
It was not until the 27th September, 1947, less than two months after India had become an independent nation, that the Church of South India came into being. Responsible for a little under one million souls and ministered to by eight hundred ordained pastors, it was divided ecclesiastically into fourteen Dioceses, from Medak in the North to South Travancore. In its doctrinal basis it conformed to the Lambeth Quadrilateral and with regard to the most controversial of its items, the episcopate, it declared that "the uniting churches accept the historic episcopate in a constitutional form as part of their basis of union." (42) The uniting churches also stated their belief that "episcopal, presbyterial and congregational elements all have their place in the order of life of the united Church" in their several spheres. (43)

Government has to be exercised through a hierarchy of courts from the Synod, through the Dioceses, to the Pastorate Committee, the latter being the responsible body in individual congregations. (44) Some Diocesan Councils laid it down that a certain proportion of women as well as laymen be represented on the Council and lesser Courts.

At the Inauguration Service, no act of re-ordination or re-commissioning was performed, it being agreed that for a thirty-year period all ministries previously recognised by the uniting bodies be accepted by the new Church. But it was the intention and expectation that eventually every minister exercising a permanent ministry in the Church be episcopally ordained. Meanwhile a "Pledge" was given to safeguard against the forcing of a non-episcopally-ordained minister on any congregation which objected to this on grounds of conscience. (45)

The Rev. J.E. Lesslie Newbigin, J.H. MacLean's successor at /

NOTES

(42) "Proposed Scheme of Church Union in South India", Seventh Edition, (Revised), Part I (Basis of Union), Article 9, p.9.
(43) Ibid., Article 6, p.7.
(44) Ibid., Part II (Constitution), Chapters 7-9, pp.59-66.
(45) Ibid., Article 16, pp.17-19: See also "First 'Quarry' Article: Inauguration of Church Union in South India", pp.38-43.
Coonjeeveram, who in 1943 had taken over the Convenorship of the S.I.U.C's Church Union Committee, was consecrated as one of the fourteen Diocesan bishops and went to the Diocese of Madura and Rammad. (46)

The Presbyterian tradition is represented in strength in only one Diocese of the Church, namely Madras. Former Anglicans in this Diocese numbered about 60,000, former Methodists 22,000 and members of the S.I.U.C. 40,000. Out of this total of over 120,000 about 10,000, or one twelfth, came from the Scottish Mission churches. (47) The Diocese provides an interesting and healthy mixture, for with the addition of a few Congregationalists in the city, all four of the traditions contributing to the union have a place, English, Scottish, American and Australian Missions are also represented and while the main language is Tamil, in a few districts, Telegu is spoken. As a seat of Government and a centre of commerce and education, Madras is further advanced than the majority of other Dioceses and is in a position to supply them with leaders. Since the union, two Indian pastors who were brought up in the Church of Scotland Mission area have been consecrated to the episcopate. The Rt. Rev. J.S. Subramaniam, the son of a caste convert from near Conjeeveram, served as a pastor in that area, as Chairman of the Conjeeveram Circle Committee, as Bishop's Commissary and as a pastor in Madras before being elected Bishop of Coimbatore. (48) And the Rt. Rev. Solomon Doraisami has recently been consecrated as bishop of Trichinopoly. A highly talented young man, S. Doraisami became a graduate teacher before taking his B.D. course at Bangalore. After serving for five years as the first Presbyter of a new village pastorate he was appointed as All-India Secretary of the /

---

NOTES

(48) The Diocese of Coimbatore, originally the North Tamil Church Council of the C.I.B.C., was a "High Church" district, the majority of whose members followed the lead of their S.P.C. missionaries and stayed out of the C.S.I., only to join it three years later.
Christian Endeavour. He later returned to his home district as Headmaster of Arkonam High School and was then elected to Trichinopoly.

The two Scots "kirks" at Madras and Bangalore retained their connection with the Church of Scotland until 1958, when the former became part of Madras Diocese and the latter of Mysore. (49)

Considering their modest dimensions, the Church of Scotland Mission churches in South India have made a respectable contribution to the Church there as a whole, and great pains have been taken that the tradition they represent should be honoured and given its place.

In the case of North India, however, not only has the Presbyterian element loomed much larger, but the part played by the Scottish Missions has been proportionately greater. This is partly a mere accident of geography. But it is also accounted for by the fact that, compared with the English Missionary Societies, Scottish Societies were late on the field: and compared with British Societies the American Societies were late. Accordingly when in the late 1850's and the decade following the Church of Scotland and the United Presbyterian Church of Scotland wished a little belatedly to expand their missionary enterprise, it was to the wide and unoccupied spaces of the North that their attention was directed and it was there that some of the strongest churches, numerically speaking, were built up. The same applies in a large measure to the American Presbyterians and the American (Episcopal) Methodists.

So when we turn to look at the progress made towards Christian unity in the North, there are a number of important differences to be kept in mind. Allowing for such exceptions as the districts round Bombay and Calcutta, the churches here were younger than those of the South. Some of them, as in Rajputana, were spread very thinly indeed over huge areas covering many thousands of square miles. In consequence they were less well organised, had not travelled so far towards the development of national leadership and were more/
dependent on missionary guidance and control. The number of ecclesiastical units was also larger and their background more varied. The participation of Baptist churches presented a new feature. And while the Anglican element was still prominent, the presence of the Methodist Episcopal Church — or Methodist Church in Southern Area, to give it its proper name — made discussions on the episcopacy and the ministry somewhat more complicated. A greater part was also played by American Societies and a smaller part by British than was the case in South India.

These considerations go a long way to explaining why the churches of Northern India, with the example of South India before them as an inspiration, guide or warning, were not only ten years later in opening up negotiations but these negotiations will have taken at least twenty years longer to bring them to a successful conclusion. (50) They also go some way towards explaining why once more the contribution made by Indian leaders has been disappointingly small.

The Presbyterian Church of India followed the lead of the S.I.U.C., after a longish interval, by uniting in 1924 with the General Aikya of the Congregationalist Churches in Western India to form the United Church of Northern India. (U.C.N.I.) A few years earlier the strength of the Presbyterian Church had already been increased by the addition of about 30,000 Christians from the Church as Assam, the fruit of the Welsh Calvinistic Methodist Mission. (51) And from time to time in the next few years certain other small churches of evangelical background joined forces with the U.C.N.I., the largest accession coming in 1944 with the entrance of the churches associated with the L.M.S. in Bengal. (52)

As in South India, there was here again a balance of Reformed and

NOTES

(50) This is assuming that in 1957 the Plan of Union will be accepted by the churches which are negotiating.
(51) James Kellock, op.cit., p.2. See also “Conference”, May 1930, p.24, Article on General Assembly of U.C.N.I.
(52) James Kellock, op.cit., p.2. See also Chapter 7.
Congregationalist elements, with the difference that the balance was much more even. (53) The area covered by the U.C.N.I. is immense, extending roughly 1,700 miles from East to West and 1,200 from North to South and from 1947 it has existed on either side of the India-Pakistan border. At the time of its formation the U.C.N.I., which was in its original form almost 90% of Presbyterian origin, comprised a Christian community of perhaps 180,000 and was divided into twenty-seven Church Councils with its Supreme Court, the General Assembly, meeting once in three years or if possible once in two. The Church of Scotland and United Free Church Mission churches were represented, as we should expect, on seven of those Church Councils, in several cases making up the body's whole complement. (54)

At the time of its inaugural Assembly the U.C.N.I. declared its wish to strive for further union and in 1929, the year in which the Scheme of Union for South India was first published, conversations were opened up between its representatives and those of the Anglican, Baptist, British and Australian Methodist and American Methodist churches. The majority of these had already been involved or concerned with union negotiations at other times and places — the U.C.N.I. prior to its own union, the Anglicans and the English Methodists with South India and the American Methodists in the United States itself. (55) Through the "Round Table Conference", as the group called its meetings, and its Continuation Committee, discussions went ahead fairly steadily. A Basis of Negotiation was prepared by the third Round /

NOTES
(53) The Missions associated with the U.C.N.I. are:
American Evangelical Mission of the Evangelical and Reformed Church,
American Marathi Mission (Congregational)
American Presbyterian Mission
Church of Scotland Mission
Irish Presbyterian Mission
London Missionary Society
New Zealand Presbyterian Mission
Presbyterian Church of England Mission
United Church of Canada Mission
Welsh Presbyterian Mission


(55) For the last, see Stephen Neill, "Towards Church Union, 1937-1852", pp. 66-69
Table Conference in 1937 and published two years later. About this point certain bodies, notably the Society of Friends, which had been taking part from 1930 onwards, dropped out of the group. (56)

Because of the number of parties involved and their distance from each other, negotiations in Northern India were complicated. In addition to the Round Table Conference scheme, the U.C.W.I. had from 1930 onwards been engaged also in separate negotiations with the Methodist Church in Southern Asia and with the churches associated with the Baptist Missionary Society in India and the London Missionary Society in Bengal. Since the Anglican churches were not involved here, the historic episcopate was not a basic issue and a Joint Council, with which the Baptist Missionary Society was also associated, produced in 1940 a Plan of Union which was revised two years afterwards. Although the Plan did not meet with whole-hearted approval, the situation appeared fairly hopeful until 1945, when the Methodist Church in Southern Asia withdrew its support in favour of considering more carefully what was happening with the Round Table and South India schemes. (57)

The work of the Round Table now came to the forefront and in August 1947, just before the inauguration of the C.S.I., a solution for one of the main problems, that of the unification of the ministry, was accepted in the form of a Service initiated by the mutual laying on of hands with prayer. A Plan of Union was issued in 1951 and a third revised edition of this, published in 1957, was submitted to the negotiating Churches for acceptance or rejection. The negotiating Churches had meanwhile been joined by the Church of the Brethren in Gujerat and the Disciples of Christ in Madya Pradesh. (C.P.) (58)

In the course of the next few years the U.C.W.I. and the British and Australian Methodists approved of the Scheme as submitted, but the Anglicans /

NOTES

(56) James Kellock, op.cit., pp.3-4; Stephen Neill, "Towards Church Union" p.53
(57) James Kellock, op.cit., pp. 4-18
(58) Ibid., pp. 19-25.
American Methodists and Brethren failed to get the necessary majorities and voting in the Baptist churches was divided. By 1963 it became clear that a further revision would be necessary, and a fourth revised edition was published in 1965.

The present position is that the bodies corresponding to those which took part in the South India union — that is the Anglicans, the U.C.N.I. and the British Methodists — are prepared to unite but the other bodies still profess difficulties and it is possible that quite a few years may yet elapse before these are overcome. (59)

In its main features the "Plan of Church Union in North India and Pakistan" follows the South India Scheme, though it has been influenced by the course of events in Ceylon and West Africa. The first significant difference is that since Baptist Churches are taking part, two alternate modes of Baptism, infant and believer's, are recognised. (60) The second difference lies in the formula for the unification of the ministry by means of a Service of re-commissioning through the mutual laying on of hands. (61) In both respects the Northern India scheme deviates from that of South India and is similar to the Ceylon scheme. The re-unification of the ministry is the crucial issue, and it is claimed that the rite proposed in the Plan is not ordination and not mere commissioning, but a unique act that seeks God's authorisation and grace for bringing together differently authorised ministries into one universal ministry, acceptable throughout the united Church, and so far as may be throughout all Christendom. (62) /

NOTES

(59) "Plan of Church Union in North India and Pakistan", Fourth Revised Edition, 1965, pp. VI-VII. A summary of negotiations up to date is included in the Preface: information obtained by interviews.
(60) Ibid., Part I, "Constitution", Article VI, pp. 7-9. See also Appendix, "Declaration of Principle of the Baptist Churches", pp. 41-42
(61) Ibid., Part II, "Inauguration of Union", Article VII, pp. 50-55
(62) James Kellock, op.cit., p.93
In other respects the North India Plan of Union outlines the framework of a Church which would, with the exceptions noted, be very similar in polity to the C.S.I. Criticisms of the C.S.I.'s method of reuniting the ministry centre on doubts about what will happen once the thirty-year "probation" period is over. The planners in North India and Ceylon are not happy about the idea of a Church "growing together" before such a vital and final decision is made. Objections to the North India scheme point out that the act of re-commissioning would have to be repeated with every future union. (63)

It is difficult to get accurate figures for the bodies negotiating towards union in North India. Year Book statistics are not always reliable and the organisations to which they refer sometimes cover a larger area than that with which the Northern India union is concerned. This is true here in the case of the Methodist Episcopal and the Baptist churches. However, a rough estimate of the size of the communities involved is given, as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organisation</th>
<th>Membership</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>U.C.N.I.</td>
<td>500,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methodist Church in Southern Asia</td>
<td>550,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Church of India, Pakistan, Burma and Ceylon</td>
<td>230,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Council of Baptist Churches in North-East India</td>
<td>80,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methodist Conference in Northern India</td>
<td>8,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Church of the Brethren</td>
<td>13,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disciples of Christ</td>
<td>8,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>1,444,000</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These figures, even if they are not exact, may be taken as proportionately a fair estimate. (64) It may be noted that the U.C.N.I., with its ex-Presbyterian majority, is among the largest of the negotiating bodies./

**NOTES**

(63) For one of a great number of discussions and apologies on the respective merits of the two schemes, see James Kellock, op. cit. pp.

(64) Information obtained through correspondence: World Christian Handbook, 1962.
while the Anglican Church, which in South India played such an important part, is relatively a good deal smaller. It is the whole aim of such unions to forget denominational differences and sit loose to the ecclesiastical traditions of the West. Accordingly it would be introducing a false note to suggest that a united Church in North India, with an almost identical Constitution, is likely to differ much in character from the Church of South India. It will be instructive to learn in due course, however, how far any special characteristics which emerge are not indigenous, but can be traced to the influence of the founding Missions.

Again most unfortunately, while many missionaries, including Scottish missionaries serving with the U.C.N.I., have given tirelessly and unsparingly of their time over many years to attend committees and sub-committees and prepare papers, yet it is also the missionaries who have been responsible for complicating and extending negotiations to such wearisome length. Or else it has been the home Churches which have stepped in with their queries, doubts and warnings.

In his review of the North India schema, Dr. Kellock speaks of the difficulty of turning the apathy of the average church member over church union into intelligent enthusiasm. "Why should we care? some would say. It was the missionaries who brought the divisions to India. It is for them to clear the matter up". (65) This apathy is of course met with even more frequently among members of our Churches in the West, where the drawbacks of division are not yet so obvious. But while it is culpable, it is also understandable in a situation where the points at issue are often so subtle as to be incomprehensible to the average church member and appear almost wholly irrelevant to the Church's own national pastors and leaders. Left to themselves, the Indian leaders of the Churches involved would in a tenth of /

NOTES

(65) James Kellock, op.cit., pp. 7-8
the time have produced a scheme of union which would without doubt have been doctrinally suspect by every one of the older Churches. Yet it might reflect the Spirit of Christ as accurately as any of the systems those younger Churches had inherited and would in essential be perfectly workable. Some missionaries would question the underlying stability and cohesion of the kind of united Church that Indian leaders would have built on a pan-confessional basis and without much regard for the problems of full organic unity. And this is of course a question no one can answer. It remains a sad fact, as comments from Indian Christians have made clear, that the West has used the East as an experimental guinea-pig for the patching up of its own quarrels. The experiment was made largely with a view to the welfare of the guinea-pig -- it will be a mighty advance if the seven traditions taking part in negotiations are truly united and reconciled in North India and Pakistan. In addition the experience gained in the Indian unions has already proved relevant and helpful to discussions on unity in the West. Yet while service has thus been rendered to the Church universal, much of it has been at the expense of the Church in India. (66)

The Church of Scotland's most valuable contribution to the negotiations in both the South and the North has not therefore been the amount of service given through its missionaries on working committees, although here a very large part has been played by various members of the staff of the colleges. /

**NOTES**

(66) Professor Sundkler quotes impressively the opinions of Indian Christians who at the time when India was fighting for political independence saw the South India Scheme of Union also as merely "A Western Contrivance". Much more to the point were the criticisms levelled at the repeated delays. "Left to themselves, Indians would have united long ago", said the future Bishop Sumitra, perhaps the only Indian besides Bishop Asariah to understand how involved were some of the issues under discussion. Professor Sundkler's own final judgment on this matter runs, "If Inauguration (of the C.S.I.) had come fifteen years earlier no harm would have been done." (B. Sundkler, op.cit., pp.204-206 and 349). While concrete evidence of a similar nature is not yet available from North India, we need have no doubt that the same pressures have predominated again.
Its greatest contribution has simply been its approval, often tacit, its encouragement and interest, and above all its refusal to interfere or present obstacles. In no better way could it have respected the independence of its daughter churches.
General Sources


John Burleigh, “A Church History of Scotland”.


“Statements of Faith of the Uniting Churches in North India and Pakistan”, C.L.S., 1965. (Being a supplement to the above)

F.M. Reports

“Conference”

MS Papers, S.N.L.

Proceedings of Missionary Conferences (Various).
CHAPTER XV

THE CHURCHES AND THE COLLEGES

The Nineteenth Century

The part played in Scottish Mission work by educational institutions has always been a large one and the whole question of educational missions has from the beginning been a thorny one. On the one hand there have been those who held that the Christian mission is to "preach the Gospel" pure and simple. To such, the devious routes of education, medical care and social uplift are not only a waste of time but a blinding of the eyes to our Lord's plain directive. There are still Missions holding such a view which will send a trained nurse or a qualified teacher out as an "evangelist" on the grounds that the service they are best qualified to give would be a deviation from the preaching of the Gospel and not a form of it.

At the other extreme, there have been Missions and individuals who have held that, at least in the India of the last century and a half, except through this method of sowing there could be no hope of the soil accepting the seed.

While the two extreme poles of opinion have seldom been heard among Scottish missionaries and have never found a place in official policy, most of the gradations lying between them have had their day and their supporters. Thus while Alexander Duff virtually staked the whole future of his infant Mission on the success of its Institution, William Macfarlane, the founder of the Eastern Himalayan Mission, turned away in disgust from the barren field/
of an early educational Mission to preach the Gospel at Darjeeling. (1) Further enquiry reveals the fact that at different periods and in individual fields the balance has tended first to one side and then the other.

Yet speaking in the broadest terms, it is true to say that the policy of Scottish Missions has here accorded closely with that of the great majority of other Western Missions, both Protestant and Roman Catholic. Education has been seen either as a necessary praeparatio evangelica or at least as a true and valued handmaid of the Gospel. Educational work has been built up as a means of evangelism and of establishing the Church in Christian faith and life. At this level there has been agreement, and differences of /

NOTES.

(1) Macfarlane was not more of an evangelist than the men who founded and built up the colleges, but he was a keener churchman. His point of view, which is typical of the anti-educational mission outlook, is represented in the following letter which concerns the opening of the Scottish Universities' Mission at Kalimpong:

"Large societies, like the Church Missionary Society, establish Missions among the aboriginal tribes wherever a suitable opportunity presents itself. --- Success in one field amply compensates for the want of it in another. So it is also with their Hindoo Missions. If in many parts of Northern India their Missions produce few converts, they have in Timevelly and Travancore some of the most successful Missions in the world. It is quite different with our Missions. In Calcutta, Madras, Vellore, Arcotum, Bombay, Sealcote, Gujrat, Wazirabad and Chumba, there is little to be seen but discouragement as regards the important matter of making progress with the conversion of the people and of forming living, progressive churches among them."

The plea is clearly for balance rather than the abandonment of educational missions, with the writer's personal preference on the side of direct evangelism and the building up of the local Church.

(Letter from the Rev. W. Macfarlane to the Secretary of the Church of Scotland F.M.C., dated 25th Sept., 1885. Papers of the Scottish Universities' Mission, 1885-1902, pp.104-105.)
opinion have revolved round matters of method and degree rather than principle.

Among the most controversial issues of method and degree, however, has been that of the anglicised education provided by the Indian university colleges. The argument which was going on between the Anglicists and the Orientalists when Duff landed at Calcutta, and which Macaulay's Minute of 1835 decided in the favour of the former, has in point of fact been going on ever since. That Minute and the policy it put in train could still be described a hundred years later by Indians and Europeans alike as the Magna Carta of Indian education; and by both alike again as its "evil genius". Even Mahatma Gandhi and some of his most devoted followers were divided on the matter. (2)

In a chapter as short as this and with a limited acquaintance with a vast and complicated subject, we must avoid getting too deeply embroiled in its more controversial aspects. Nor is there any question of trying to follow the history of the Scottish Colleges in even the most summary fashion, though here is a subject which would well repay study. (3)

NOTES.


(3) There is extensive material for such a study, which has never been attempted. All five Indian colleges of Scottish origin have at one time or another, usually on the occasion of a Jubilee or a Centenary, produced some short history of their own. F.M. Minutes and Reports normally give good coverage of events. Copies of the Madras Christian College magazine, filed in the Church of Scotland's Overseas Department, come to over twenty printed volumes. And there are numerous additional sources of material. The only general history up to date, however, is a sixpenny booklet by the late T.W. Gardiner, once Principal of Hislop College and published in the F.M.C.'s "Sketches of the Field" series. An admirable guide at its own level, it was of course never intended to be more than an appetiser.
But it will be necessary to recognise the special contribution to higher education made by the Scottish Colleges in India and to understand that the shape of four Mission fields at least was greatly affected by that emphasis. When Stephen Hislop started his school at Nagpur in 1846, it was the seventh Scottish missionary institution to be offering higher education through the medium of English. And while the two Church of Scotland Institutions in Bombay and Madras respectively were never large nor healthy and closure or amalgamation eventually reduced the total to five, including the addition of the Murray College at Sialkot, yet those five Colleges were all large establishments with a wide reputation.

No other Protestant Mission in India put so many eggs into this particular basket or indeed into any other basket. There is for instance no question of any other Mission ever being in the position of the two Scottish Missions in Calcutta in 1908, when twelve missionary professors were balanced by one district missionary. (4)

Yet even in more normal circumstances, the Scottish stake in higher education was formidable, as a few comparative figures will show.

Thus about 1908, the twenty-five British missionary Societies working in India were among them responsible for 25 Colleges and a total of 3,850 students. The C.M.S., which was far and away the largest of those Societies, with a strength of 160 ordained missionaries on the field, was responsible for six of these Colleges and about 460 students. At the same time it maintained twenty teacher-training or theological colleges and had over 20,000 pupils in high schools or middle schools.

NOTES.

(4) See Ch. 7.
The two Scottish Missions were between them just about half as strong, with a combined strength of just under 80 missionaries. In their seven colleges they were responsible for nearly 2,500 students, however, or nearly sixty per cent of the total for all British societies. Yet, to balance the C.M.S.'s twenty normal and theological colleges, the Church of Scotland had none and the U.F. Church two; while their 4,000 higher grade school pupils came to less than a fifth of the Anglican Mission's total. (5)

It is clear that with such a commitment a high proportion of Scottish missionaries must normally be engaged in college work and this was indeed the case. Out of twenty-six male missionaries serving in India in 1929, the Church of Scotland had six, or over twenty per cent, engaged on college teaching. (6) The U.F. Church, with 24 out of 65 male missionaries similarly engaged, had a far higher proportion, and if we were to isolate the four fields in which their colleges had been established we should find that over half the men missionaries on service were members of a college staff. (7)

It is hardly debatable, then, that however great the influence which a college might extend, however acceptable its role as a trainer of Christian leaders and a feeder to the Church, and whatever it might bring in the way of prestige to the particular community with which it was connected, yet so strong a concentration was bound to mean less energy expended in other directions. In short, the Scottish Missions and those of the United Free Church in particular were specialists in the field of higher education. Their contribution was made in the broadest of terms, to benefit the Church as a whole and at the widest level. But simply because they had such a natural bent for running colleges, they were able to devote fewer resources to the multiplying and building up of churches. We may accept this as a fact and then go on to consider why it should be so.

NOTES.
The primary reason for the unusual emphasis was undoubtedly the influence of Duff himself. Indeed the latter's chief monument is the mesh of Christian high schools and colleges now spread over the country and the many outstanding missionaries who were his lineal descendants in the expansion of educational work. Duff was both the pioneer and the spiritual father of Christian higher education in India and it should not be a matter for astonishment that his Scottish colleagues and their successors were ardent supporters of his method.

His own vision and aims have been described in an earlier chapter. He was looking for nothing less, but also very little more, than the conversion of the Indian nation to Christianity. Writing to Dr. Inglis on the occasion of the baptism of Gopinath Mundi, he said, "Our plans exclude everything that has not distinct bearing, directly or indirectly, on the grand ultimate end contemplated by all, the conversion of souls to the Saviour." (8)

Truth being in his view indivisible, Western education was being offered not as a bait to draw students in but as both introduction to and confirmation of the central truths taught by Scripture. A modern commentator has put it, "He felt that a left hook from western knowledge would throw the Hindu off guard and a right hook from the Bible would administer the coup de grace. Consciousness would only be regained within the Kingdom." (9)

But this is inaccurate as well as unjust. The aim was not to blind and stun but to open men's eyes to the truth. The other Scottish Institutions in Bombay, Madras and Nagpur were opened with the same end in view. And it was a firm conviction shared by others of a less evangelical turn of mind, that if Western education did not lead to Christian conversion, it would at least prepare the way by separating Indians from their old religions.

"No Hindu who has received an English education ever remains sincerely attached to his religion", Lord Macaulay gave it as his opinion. "It is my firm/

NOTES.

(8) Letter from Alexander Duff to Dr. Inglis dated 10/6/1883, Scottish National Library.

belief that if our plans of education are followed up there will not be a single idolator amongst any of the respectable classes of Bengal thirty years from now, and this will be effected without the smallest interference in their religious liberty, merely by the natural operation of knowledge and reflection." (10)

This conviction, however illusory it may have proved in the cold light of subsequent history, could hardly have been shared so widely if there had not soon been definite evidence in its support. Unlike Macaulay, the missionaries could not be accused of basing their hopes on the liberating power of sweet reason alone. Nor on the other hand was it simple faith in the power of the Holy Spirit. Other Scottish missionaries after Duff took up the idea with enthusiasm because faith and reason seemed here to be pointing in the same direction. Results suggested this to be the right road and their native tradition was behind it from the start. The long-standing national alliance between kirk and school had given most Scotsmen a solid regard for the power of truth and with his high educational standards the average Scots minister was unusually well fitted to fill with credit the role of a professor. (11) So where the Scottish Missionary Societies had been complaining not so many years earlier about the lack of suitably trained candidates, a body like the Free Church Institution at Calcutta now grew accustomed to having on its staff no less than four doctors of divinity.

Later missionaries in turn came to accept the marriage of Western education and Scripture teaching not because Duff urged them to do so but because his premises seemed to be sound. The converts made by the Calcutta Institution and the others which took it as a model, the high quality of those converts and their value to the Church, appeared ample proof of the method's effectiveness. And even when the promise of the early years remained unfulfilled, education was still widely regarded as the key to the missionary situation.

NOTES.

(10) Quoted Ibid., but also in many other places.

(11) Sir Charles Petrie in "The Victorians" (Eyre and Spottiswoode, 1960) writes: "The average Presbyterian minister was — and still is — infinitely better educated than his Anglican brother." (p. 135)
A clear distinction was not always drawn between higher institutions and those teaching in the vernacular. But even among men who were, in practice, concerned with village schools, it was usually accepted as axiomatic that where possible a Mission should supply education at all levels. Speaking of Christian education in general, the Free Church missionary in charge of district schools round Bombay wrote in 1886:

"The teacher appears to be the agency appointed by Divine wisdom to bring about (India's) evangelisation. The proud Brahmin and the high-caste Hindu will not condescend to approach the Christian preacher or listen to his story or read his books. It is only when he is offered something in the nature of a school or a lecture that his mind is disarmed of prejudice — Our schools enable us to impart religious instruction to the children of classes who would never otherwise come under its influence." (12)

While the reference there is to education at all levels, many Scottish missionaries saw it as their Church's particular contribution to supply for a whole district or province the higher education without which the work of village schools and rural Missions would come to nothing. So concerning the foundation of Hislop College, Mr. Whitton wrote to Dr. Smith in 1884, "The higher education that we propose is not for Nagpur alone or even for Nagpur, Chhindwara and Bhandara, but for the whole of the Central Provinces, with its population of eleven million souls ... There is no likelihood that any Church or Society working in this province will be able, for years to come, to supply that which is needed to counteract the baleful influence of these secular colleges — There may be a superabundance of missionaries in higher education in other parts of India, but not here." (13)

From these and similar expressions of opinion it is evident that Scottish/

---

(12) Free Church Report, 1886, p.34.
(13) Letter from Mr. Whitton to Dr. Smith, F.M. Convener, dated 29/11/1884.
Scottish National Library.
missionaries engaged in educational work were thoroughly convinced of the value of their higher institutions and thought of them as instruments their Mission had been particularly well fitted to use. There were at the same time other missionaries and a strong body of supporters in the Home Church who looked with dismay on the amount of effort being expended on educational work alone.

The Free Church and its Committee, with four Institutions all developing in size and influence, was the more firmly committed to the method and the more convinced of its worth.

But in the Church of Scotland, of whose three Institutions only the original at Calcutta was doing any more than struggle for existence, doubts were expressed more trenchantly and often. The debate started in the General Assembly of 1885 and continued for six or seven years. It was triggered off by the need to decide whether advantage should be taken of the grants-in-aid offered by the East India Company after 1854 and available for colleges but not for religious instruction.

The Assembly of that year decided against accepting grants, but its successor next year reversed the decision. Meanwhile the Committee, which had taken up the whole question of educational Missions, came out with the proposal that the three Institutions be closed, their buildings sold, and work be concentrated on preaching and training for the ministry. The Assembly took a wider view than its Committee, however, and was influenced by the arguments of one of its ablest missionaries, Mr. Ogilvie at Calcutta, who was later to become a most distinguished Principal of the Institution. It was agreed that educational Missions should continue but other work on different lines should also be initiated. The Deputation which was sent out to India by the Church of Scotland to tour India over the winter of 1867-68 helped to settle the Church's mind on the matter for the time being. (14)

NOTES.

(14) C. of S. Reports, 1862, p.18; 1863, pp.7-12; Chapter 5; R.W. Weir, op.cit., pp.62-64.
With the opening up of two highly successful rural Missions in the Punjab and the Eastern Himalayas, the Church of Scotland felt that its work had achieved a better balance and the antipathy towards educational work was greatly modified. Yet while enthusiasm for village schools seldom faltered, missionaries remained much less certain about the value of higher education.

"To convert to faith in Christ — this is or ought to be the great aim of all our efforts. It is with deep regret therefore that I have to inform you that I have nothing to report on this point which is at all of a more encouraging nature than I have repeated now for the last three years", Mr. Ogilvie had written from Calcutta in 1860 (15)

Fourteen years later his colleague in Madras sounded even more depressed and bewildered, when he wrote, "It is difficult to form any idea how far the cause of Christianity is being advanced by such institutions. For my part, I can only say that during my five years' experience there has been no case of conversion, nor, so far as I am aware, any instance of a sincere enquiry after Christ." That young missionary, who was in the difficult position of having to run his Institution single-handed, was definitely of the opinion that the rise of so many Government schools had yoked Christianity with education in people's minds and Christian Institutions were no longer producing the same impression as when they had begun. (16)

Such doubts concerned higher education through the medium of English, and did not extend to the work of local schools which was so closely inter-woven with a Mission's other activities. On this score the Church of Scotland was as fully convinced as any other Protestant Mission. "Surely then it matters not whether the message of salvation is declared to our scholars in the class-rooms or to the people in the crowded streets and under the village tree", said Mr. Paterson of the Punjab Mission on this subject. "It is the Gospel in both cases." (17)

NOTES.

(16) Ibid., 1874, p.20.
(17) Quoted Youngson, "Forty Years of the Punjab Mission", p. 168.
During the last twenty or thirty years of the century, the attitude began to change as missionary institutions multiplied through the country and their influence increased. Their work came to be generally regarded in a much more favourable light by both missionaries themselves and their home supporters. The fact that direct conversions were few was no longer seen as a sign of failure and the aim of christianising the nation rather than capturing individuals was accepted as valid. In this period no man did more to define the objectives of Christian education and demonstrate its effectiveness than William Miller of Madras, who became statesman and spokesman for the missionary educators of his day.

More and more it was now being emphasised that the success of a college was to be judged not by enumerating its converts but by the much subtler permeation of a whole community with a Christian outlook and standards. "The higher aims of the Missionary institution are never lost sight of," wrote Miller in 1885. "But in virtue of the very constitution of the world such progress as there may be towards attaining them cannot be plainly visible from year to year. 'The Kingdom cometh not by observation'. And the prosperity and influence of a College is a thing for which we can be thankful." (18)

Fundamentally, Miller was of one mind with men like Duff and Wilson concerning the value of education as a missionary instrument in opening Indian minds to the truth. "There is a great power of thinking in them (the Hindus)," he wrote to a friend in 1863. "In our particular line of work this is the great thing that is needed, just to get them to think. The barest even intellectual realisation, if a real one, of the truth that is lying dormant in their minds would be the most likely of all human means to lead them to Christ." (19)

Miller's later views of the function of a Christian College, as published in 1893, (20), distinguished two purposes in educational missions. These were to exercise "a strengthening, training and developing agency" for the building/
up of the Christian community and to provide leaders for the Church; and to offer
a "preparatory agency" in introducing non-Christians to the truth of the Gospel.
Miller saw the second of these aims as by far the more important and also a danger
that the Indian Church, as it grew, might push it into the background. The
College would serve the Church, which would be "turned into a guild for the
worldly welfare of its sons".

The primary function of a Christian College, then, was as an evangelistic
agency, to bring men to a knowledge and then a saving knowledge, of Christ.
The special tool placed in the hands of missionaries for this purpose was the
Bible. "The Scriptures were to be the spear-head, all other knowledge the well-
fitted handle." The training of the Christian community must remain subordinate to
this purpose and even be seen as a by-product of the College's work. And the
conversion of individuals was of even less importance. (21)

Such an informed and authoritative statement was all the more necessary
because Christian Missions were having to decide how far they should fall in with
the Government's plans for education. An important Government Commission had
been appointed in the 1880's, one result of which had been that elementary schools
also became eligible for grants-in-aid. (22) And it was becoming clearer with
every year that Western education would be "the one avenue in India to respect
and power." (23) Missions were having to make up their minds how far they should/
take advantage of the opportunities before them through the medium of education, whether they should concentrate equally on lower or higher, regional or English medium institutions, and what danger there might be in committing too great a proportion of their resources to one type of agency.

The Free Church of Scotland itself, and its Foreign Mission Committee, were not fully in agreement with its leaders on the field. Late in the 1880's it sent out a weighty deputation which spent no less than thirteen months touring the Indian fields and its report, submitted to the Assembly in 1889 and 1890, showed a few significant differences of opinion. (24) They approved the amount of effort being spent on higher education, and recognised as valid the aims outlined by William Miller, but were not prepared to put them in the same order of importance. They questioned the effectiveness of Scripture teaching among non-Christians in the new environment which Christian education had itself helped to bring about. They pointed out that instead of being made receptive to Christianity, Hindus were everywhere "arming in defence of Hinduism". They were not prepared to accept the lack of conversions as a matter of little significance. And they were concerned with the relation between the Colleges and the Christian community. (25)

In the introduction to their report it was clearly stated: "The Church was wisely guided when in reliance on divine help it resolved through the agency of Christian Educational Mission work to deal with that great central core of the people of India on which Christianity had, up to that time, made small impression. This educational work always deserved and still deserves the support of the Church."(26)

NOTES.

(24) This Report was the second of the three statements of policy taken by the Lindsay Commission as a working base. See pp.23-26.
(26) Free Church Reports, 1890, p.5; 1891, p.7.
At the same time the relative importance of the various aims of Christian education was re-stated, attention was drawn to the change of climate and conditions in India since Duff's day and stress laid on the danger of isolation from the rest of the work being done by the Mission. "Educational work needs to be supplemented by the simple proclamation of saving truth — the two sides of the work should always have visible connection." (27)

The Church of Scotland had meanwhile been examining its position also. A special report made by a Committee on "Educational Missions in India," which was published in 1890, quoted from letters which had been received both for and against the work of Christian education. In reply to critics of the Calcutta Institution, it pointed out that the Calcutta Oxford Mission, which had no College and relied almost exclusively on direct means of evangelism, had enjoyed no greater success.

Three-quarters of the letters received by the Committee - over 300 in number - had been in favour of continuing the Institution's work and the Assembly agreed to do so. It laid much emphasis, however, on the fact that such work should be done thoroughly or not at all and that its missionary character must be upheld. If it ever became undermanned, it would be preferable for it to unite or close. (28)

Summing up the position at the end of the century, we may say that it had by now been generally accepted that the Colleges could no longer be looked to for increasing the number of a Mission's converts; in consequence, it was essential that the work of a College be balanced by more direct forms of evangelism.

Nevertheless the influence of the Colleges in spreading Christian ideas among the educated classes was very great, as was their value for creating an atmosphere /

NOTES.

(27) Ibid., 1891, p.7.
(28) Special Report of the Committee for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts on "Educational Missions in India": attached as appendix to C. of S. Report, 1890.
favourable to Christianity. They were also gaining increasing importance as a training ground for Christians, though this was seen by the Colleges themselves as a secondary aim.

The Colleges themselves, while increasing in size, prestige and efficiency, had usually to fight a battle on two fronts. As educational bodies, they had to strive to keep their position of leadership while maintaining religious education at the centre of their system. At the same time they had also to keep justifying their existence before the home churches.

As yet the contrast between their position of power and prestige and that of the Indian Church was so great that no kind of adult relationship between the two could exist. The Church was very much the poor and dependent relative. Without the College it would in certain fields hardly have existed and it leaned on the College heavily for leadership and solvency. Nor was it really expected that the relationship, even if its balance altered, should ever grow much closer. The personal contacts were always there, of course, at congregational and Presbytery level as well as through countless common meeting points and joint efforts. This is something the history of the churches in the field should have made very plain.

But officially it was the first duty of Principal and staff to make of their College an efficient Christian weapon, while letting the Church get on with its own work. Indeed Principal Baitie of the Church of Scotland's Calcutta Institution was on one occasion firmly rapped over the knuckles for taking too little interest in the College and too much in the Indian Church. (30)

The Twentieth Century.

With the opening of the new century, the aims of missionary higher education remained virtually unchanged. But times were changing and no aspect of missionary work was affected earlier or more directly than the Colleges.

NOTES.

(29) These general remarks, which apply to the churches attached to the provincial capital colleges, do not apply to the Murray College at Sialkot.
(30) C. of S. Report, 1900, p.82: 1902, p.81. sc/im.
"Education is the key to the religious position in India" ran the Church of Scotland's report from Calcutta at the turn of the century. It went on to quote with approval an Anglican statement to the effect that it was a matter of life and death for the Church to have the controlling influence not only over young Christians but other students also.

Yet the statement came with a recognition that the day was over when Missions had most of higher education in their hands. The time was past now when Western learning was new and challenging. Less emphasis must be placed on the mere teaching of Christian truth and more on personal influence, particularly through Christian hostels. (31).

From three directions, the political, the educational and the religious, conditions were growing less favourable for the Christian Colleges and storm clouds were gathering.

The rise of Indian nationalism directed men's attention from religion to politics and the earlier admiration for all things Western was turning to suspicion. (32) A new generation of students, no longer sharing the traditional reverence of the pupil for his guru was becoming passionately involved in the fight for freedom and in protesting against the ruling power. And the Universities and their Colleges, as bodies representing that power, naturally presented themselves as targets for revolutionaries to strike at. The surprising thing is not that Mission Colleges suffered along with others from the results of strikes and hartals, but that with their foreign connections they were not singled out for more special attention. The movement was more anti-government than anti-Western./

NOTES.


and more anti-Western than anti-religious, and as Dr. Gardiner remarks, "It says much that in 25 years of almost unbroken political agitation the Christian colleges maintained their hold on the affection of their students and suffered so little loss of public esteem." (33) It does indeed say much, both for the patience and understanding shown by members of the College staffs and the essential pacifism and friendliness of the Indian character.

Changes and advances in the educational world brought a second crop of difficulties. As colleges multiplied the competitive spirit grew fiercer and the pre-eminence of the Christian institutions began to be challenged. As a result of the recommendations of the Sedler Commission, an educational commission appointed in Bengal in 1917, colleges affiliated to the great provincial universities now came more directly under the authority of provincial legislatures, and this affected all five of the Scottish Mission Colleges. (34) Independence grew more restricted as the universities tightened their control and under the levelling effect of a nation-wide educational policy it required more control and concentration on the part of Christian colleges to maintain a distinctive corporate life.

The attitude of students was now a long way removed from that real desire for truth and enlightenment which had warmed Duff's heart. The Government's educational policy was coming under fire on the grounds that the system's chief function was to examine and confer degrees, not to develop character, community life or a social conscience. Consequently students were encouraged to come with the single aim of passing examinations which would open the way for better paid posts. Under the weight of this pressure and the

NOTES

(33) T.W. Gardiner: "Sketches of the Fields: Our Indian Colleges", p.18. Bishop Whitehead (op.cit., pp.147-148) illustrates the switch of interest from religion to politics by describing a passionate debate which took place in the Calcutta Mission Hall of the Oxford Mission one evening in 1890, when it was debated whether orthodox Hindus should be allowed to "cross the black water." A generation later the subject was one which could hardly raise even a passing interest in the student mind.

(34) "Christian Higher Education in India", pp.21 and 66-69.
increasing number of students applying for admission, it was a growing temptation even for Christian Colleges to see examination results as the real criterion of success. The dangers of this pressure were recognised and in efforts to combat it there arose in Christian Colleges a fresh understanding of the College's place and value as a community, a living organism as well as a teaching instrument. (35)

A third problem was posed by the vexed and contradictory attitude of students towards religion, both Christianity and their native Hinduism. On the one hand, the youth of a country which had for centuries prided itself on the nobility of its spiritual heritage and professed openly to despise the secularism of the West was becoming more materialistic as each year passed. This was the secularism of which educational missionaries had been afraid since Duff's time and which they hoped to counter through the teaching of Scripture.

On the other hand, sweeping in with the nationalist movement there came a revival of Hinduism. The high principles of the Brahma Samaj were now less attractive than the politically-orientated teachings of the Arya Samaj and it is true at this point to say that the very success of the missionary institutions at inculcating Indian minds with Christian tenets was becoming their undoing. The ethical principles of Christianity had been so thoroughly absorbed by educated Indians that they were being reproduced in all sincerity as native to Hindu religion and philosophy. In Kramer's phrase, men had been sufficiently inoculated with small doses of Christianity to be immune to the disease itself. A reviving Hinduism no longer stood on the defensive against the claims of a higher ethic but was quite ready to adopt and adapt the teaching of Christ into/

---

(35) H. Whitehead, op. cit., pp. 146-151 and passim.
what it saw as a deeper and more comprehensive system of truth. (36)

For the Christian Colleges, these changes meant that while students might on occasion show a greater readiness to listen to Christian teaching or share in an act of Christian worship (37), the task of a College, whether considered in the light of an educational institution, an instrument of evangelism, a preceptor of moral standards (38), or a pillar of a growing Church, grew yearly more difficult. Class-work was constantly interrupted because of politics, competition from other colleges was on the increase, more rigid controls were limiting freedom of movement and Christian instruction was no longer accepted, much less welcomed, as a valued and essential part of the curriculum. (39).

NOTES.


(37) As with all broad, slow movements, this included cross-currents and counter-currents and there frequently appear local revivals of interest in Christianity on the part of Hindus or Moslem students when the general trend is in the opposite direction.

(38) Dr. Miller's views on the purpose of education were as perspicacious as they were typically Victorian. Like the public school system of Dr. Arnold, Christian College education, where it did not directly convert, was still seen as a mighty moulder of character. "It is not by the results of examinations that the work of the Institution must be judged", he wrote once, "the aim by which it strives to regulate its methods is not that of pushing its students through examinations as quickly and extensively as possible, but of forming their characters aright, of training them for usefulness in the world and above all of impressing them with those views and principles and feelings which are the basis of noble life on earth and the only preparation for the life that lies beyond." Free Church Report, 1886, p.23.

(39) See Article by James Kellock, "Religious and Ethical Education in College", from "Thoughts on Indian Education", pp.103-111. The article describes the problems which began to arise with regard to scripture teaching for non-Christian students from the 1920's onwards.
Equally important, with the passing of time and the changes and developments in administration, the work of the colleges was becoming divorced from the life of the Church. Local Kirk Sessions and Church Councils, even if they were not in full or even partial control of the work being done in hospitals, high schools and similar institutions, were at least closely enough linked with those bodies and their activities to be in constant touch. But the daily life of a college had only too often little connection with the life of the church on its doorstep. And a college had its own controlling Board, which in the case of a body such as the Madras Christian College contained representatives from three quite separate denominations.

As this problem became more evident, there came with it awareness and a search for its solution. A new note is struck in the third of the policy statements studied by the Lindsay Commission and produced by the C.M.S. in 1921-22. Here for the first time, while the three purposes of educational mission work outlined by William Miller are recognised, pride of place is given to the promotion of Christian leadership and emphasis laid on the task of Mission boards to work side by side with the Church of the land. Christianity is defined as a life and fellowship, rather than a truth to be taught and learnt, and Christian education must be undertaken from within the fellowship. The stress laid on the factor of "fellowship" or "community", and the acceptance of its importance by other colleges besides those of the C.M.S., was to have a signal effect on their further history.
This, then was the increasingly critical situation which gave rise to a request on the part of the Indian colleges themselves that a Commission be sent out to examine and advise them on their position. The Lindsay Commission, which took its name from its chairman, A.D. Lindsay, then Master of Balliol, came to Indian in 1929 and published its report two years later.

Of the 43 colleges which came under review by the Commission 18 had their headquarters in Great Britain, and of these the Scottish colleges, as we know, numbered five. Yet by reason of their size, seniority, reputation and key positions their contribution was still of great importance. With a roll of 3,835 students they accounted for very nearly half the students attending all the British-run colleges. And the recommendations of the Commission were obviously likely to affect them and the work of their Missions to a marked degree. (40)

In the Report, which followed a very thorough enquiry, the Commission declared its belief in the undiminished opportunity lying before any Christian College which was adequately staffed and supported. Its two main criticisms were that university education as a whole had become separated from the problems of Indian everyday life, Mission colleges having paid the price of so close a connection with the Government system: and that at the same time the colleges had become divorced from the life of the Indian Church. The "redirection of effort" which the Commission recommended to cure these weaknesses involved the adoption of two new functions, research and extension.

These functions were envisaged not as academic exercises but as a means by which a College might explore and define some local or specific need and then deploy its knowledge and other resources in order to meet that need. Knowledge was to be linked through service to the work and witness of the Church.

__________________________________________

NOTES

40) "Christian Higher Education in India", pp. 12-13 and 373.
In the words of the Commission's own report, "The harmonising of knowledge in the service of love, or putting the scientific mind behind the merciful heart, is an essential part of the Christian message and a message which is both urgently needed and warmly welcomed in present-day India."

Recognising the difficulties which now faced the Christian colleges, and that it was no longer possible for them to function adequately under the present system, the Commission suggested that they might still keep their place in the University system and yet:

1. Recover control of the content of their education, working out a new version of that *praeparatio evangelica* which in earlier days had been their source of unity,

2. Give their teachers a sphere in which to exercise their powers of experiment and research

and

3. Come into close and direct contact with the Indian Church (41)

In addition to its general recommendations, the Lindsay Commission made specific suggestions concerning individual colleges. These were followed up when possible with commendable enthusiasm and had in some instances a vital effect on the life both of the college and the church on its doorstep.

It was partly if not entirely as the outcome of the Commission's recommendation that the Madras Christian College, which had for many years dominated the whole situation of Christian education in South India and played the role of mother-college to so many other institutions, moved to its new site at Tambaram, to the West of Madras. There a community life based on student hostels could start again on a new footing and there would continue to be room for further expansion. The M.C.C. was strengthened by the/

NOTES

addition of the former Bishop Heber College from Trichinopoly, with its strong hostel tradition, and was in a much better position for starting up co-operative work with the Church. (42)

The Scottish Church College in Calcutta (so re-named after the Union of 1929) for a time took a somewhat firmer line in limiting the size of its classes, but largely because of the expense involved the proposal to remove to a new site was not followed up. (43)

Murray College, Sialkot, was encouraged to add to the number of Christians on its staff, to make its chief concern the Christian community and to take steps towards self-government. (44) It was suggested that Hislop College too should build on a fresh site, a proposal which could again not be adopted for lack of funds. But in the transfer of responsibility to an Indian Board and Principal it was soon to lead the way. (45)

Wilson College, which the Commission considered to be carrying a disproportionate burden of responsibility for higher education in Bombay, was strengthened by further support from other Missions and encouraged to develop work among women students and in the sphere of social service among the industrial poor of the city. (46) The addition of chapels at Wilson, Murray and Hislop Colleges were also indirect results of the Commission's reports.

It is interesting but hardly surprising to note that reactions to the Lindsay Commission's report on the part of the Principals and staff members of the Scottish colleges themselves were varied and by no means always in agreement with each other. There was general approval of the recognition/
that no other agency could give to Christianity in India the particular contribution which the colleges still supplied and hope was expressed that perhaps from now onwards Missions and churches alike would stop trying to run their colleges on the cheap. It was felt that on the whole the Commission had painted too black a picture of the college's loss of influence both in the Universities and among the community at large. And it was pointed out that most of the Commission's recommendations, admirable though they might be, were evolutionary rather than revolutionary, making explicit movements and ideas already at work in the lives of the colleges.

Yet the colleges themselves were clearly in agreement with the core of the Commission's thesis. Emphasis on quality rather than quantity; emphasis on the college as a living community; concentration on the drive towards Indianisation; and the recovery of freedom of movement through a closer connection with the Indian Church; as basic aims these were all accepted and differences of opinion were only concerned with matters of method. (47)/

NOTES

47) The issue of "Conference" for December, 1931, gives a valuable if rather belated series of comments on the Lindsay Commission's report by three members of two of the Scottish colleges, in the course of which reference is made to previous articles appearing in the "National Christian Council Review". See this issue pp. 66-72.

In three articles, entitled "The Missionary Colleges in the Light of the Lindsay Report", published in the "Scots Observer", 28th April, 5th May and 19th May, 1932, James Kellock gives the Report an enthusiastic welcome but criticises it on one important point, i.e. its "rather too optimistic estimate of the power of the study of history and science to transform the Hindu mentality into a seed-bed for the Christian Gospel. -- Western learning in the East has come to have much the same relationship to Christianity as it has in the West. On the battlefields of science, philosophy and history, Christianity must expect to meet challenges and conflicts in the East as in the West. Moreover the fluid and uncertain state of Christian theology in the present day makes it difficult to know which, if any, of the special branches of human knowledge are to be regarded as direct allies of the Christian faith." (Ibid., 2nd article, "How to Unify the Missionary and Educational Aims"). Dr. Kellock suggested that a better formula for harmonising the two aims of the Christian Colleges, and one to which a great part of the Report's argument really pointed, would be:--

The service of the educational needs of India in the name and spirit of Christ.
The most significant comment of all is perhaps one of silence, however. One cannot help being struck by the fact that among the wealth of recommendations, reactions and contrasting opinions the voice of the Indian Church itself is neither raised, quoted nor apparently missed.

The Church of Scotland, now a united body again, noted the contents of the Lindsey Commissions' Report and its Committee underlined to the Assembly the fact that the Scottish Church had here a place of its own among Protestant Missions and one which merited special attention.

It accepted the role of the Colleges as defined by the Commission, as not aimed directly at the service of the existing Church. It also acknowledged that except for the salaries of missionary staff, the Colleges were for all practical purposes self-supporting units, and had not for years been a charge on the home Church. And it enumerated their contributions to the Christian cause in India: that without them, the alternative would be education without religion; that they were the last link in the chain of education for Christian leaders; that the majority of those contacted were people whom Missions could not easily reach in any other way; and that they had interpenetrated Indian culture with the best of Western ideas.

The peculiar difficulties facing the Scottish Colleges were also sympathetically noted: the problems of maintaining educational standards, of making personal contacts in the face of large numbers and a non-residential system, and of a closer relationship with the local Church.(48)

The Committee made no revolutionary or indeed very positive suggestions/

NOTES

It was agreed that the work of all five Colleges was too vital to be dispensed with. But lack of money as well as a growing shortage of missionaries became the chief obstacle to implementing the Lindsay Commission's recommendations. The translation of the Madras Christian College to Tambaram was the most important step taken. The efforts of Wilson College to rouse the social conscience of both students and the Indian Church struck a fresh note very much in line with contemporary ideas. And Indianisation was pressed forward. Otherwise there were no significant changes in policy or function.

It is when we come to the modern period — the developments of the last thirty years and the contemporary situation — that any commentator who lacks direct and recent experience of teaching in an Indian college must feel most incompetent to chart an accurate course. Yet there are a few guiding lights which can hardly be missed.

The first change which has taken place in the intervening period is this: that whatever their relation and value to the Indian Church, the Christian Colleges, while they still welcome and use missionary members of staff and receive certain foreign subsidies, are no longer dependent for their existence on Mission support. The question is no longer: Are they more of the Mission or of the Church? It is rather: Are they more of the Christian Church or the secular University? To this extent the Colleges are now independent and indigenous bodies.

At the time of the Lindsay Commission's enquiries and in the 1930's, most Christian colleges were highly conscious of their relationship to the various Mission Boards and sometimes of the extent to which those bodies could control their policy. That relationship is now more a matter of friendly intercourse than of vital concern, for while the Mission retains a right of interest, it has no right of veto or control. The new Constitution formulated for Wilson College in 1952, for instance, states that, "the Foreign Mission Committees of/
supporting Churches shall have the right to have their opinions put before the Board of Governors on any question regarding the College, not being a matter of detailed administration, and to offer advice and suggestions as occasion may arise — They shall seek to promote the efficiency and well-being of the College, and further the objects for which it exists as a Christian educational institution. In particular, they will help by fostering the interest of their respective Churches in the work of the College, by financial assistance, and, when requested to do so by the Board of Governors, by endeavouring to secure suitable persons for appointment to the staff of the College." (49)

In the twenty years between 1941 and 1961 all five of the Scottish colleges have had an Indian or Pakistani Principal appointed at their head. Support from overseas, in terms both of men and money, has of necessity and because demand has always exceeded supply become yearly of less importance. "Now the stream of (missionary) recruits is an uneven trickle; and the grants, at least for my College, have remained the same throughout my time, which means in effect that they are cut by a half or three-quarters", wrote a missionary member of the staff at the Madras Christian College in 1961. (50) So far had the pendulum swung by this time in Calcutta, indeed, that in 1965 it was reported that for the first time in the history of the College there were no missionaries on its staff whatever. (51)

---

NOTES

49) See article by Chandran D.S. Devanesan, "Historical Traditions and Opportunities", pp.15-16, in "Rethinking our Role as a College";


51) "Conference", March 1965, p.3.
These are all indications that the centre of gravity had gradually but definitely shifted from Scotland to India. The Centenary booklet produced by Wilson College after one hundred years of affiliation to the University of Bombay is a production whose Indian contributors outnumber Europeans and there is a fair representation of non-Christians: while the forewords written by the Vice-Chancellor of the University, not the Chairman of the Mission Council nor even the Moderator of the Presbytery. (52) Similarly the symposium published by the Madras Christian College a few years later, although also written in English, is as it should be predominantly an Indian production. (53)

Yet if the Christian Colleges may reasonably claim to have acquired indigenous status, so far as the Indian University system can itself claim to be truly of the land (54), almost inevitably they have not been exercising/

NOTES

52) "Thoughts on Indian Education". See Note 39.

53) "Re-Thinking our Role as a College". See Note 49.

54) It is of course the chief criticism which has been made all through the years of the Indian system of higher education that it has from the beginning been essentially foreign to the country. See e.g. H. Whitehead, op.cit., pp.137-145; Arthur Mayhew, "The Education of India", pp.27-28 and passim. It is Mayhew's interpretation of a complicated issue that the British Government came tacitly to recognise the extreme nature and therefore the one-sidedness of the views put forward by men such as Macaulay: in its educational policy it quietly proceeded to change horses in midstream and was by 1913 attaching "great importance to the cultivation and improvement of Oriental studies". Nevertheless the English medium, the secular system of education and the increasing emphasis on the technological sciences continued to stress the "foreignness" of the Universities.
the same broad influence either on their own students or on the wider community. A bald statement such as this is unfortunately difficult either to prove or to disprove. And as Principal Urquhart remarked when the Lindsay Commission made a similar statement a generation earlier, it is unfair to make comparisons with the spacious days when Christian Colleges had the field to themselves. Certain colleges, so Dr. Urquhart claimed, continued to exercise as much influence as ever they did, though in a more diffused and therefore less noticeable way. (55)

Nevertheless figures tend to speak for themselves. It is not so many years since Christian colleges were responsible for practically a tenth of all students at the university level. But other communities have been closing the gap and the Government itself has embarked on a programme of expansion. In the space of about ten years, up to 1961, universities had doubled, students had multiplied by five and colleges by ten, while the Christian colleges stayed where they were. (56) With such changes in circumstance, it hardly seems possible any longer to speak of Christian influence as more widely diffused.

NOTES

55) W.S. Urquhart, article in “Conference”, Nov. 1931, pp.69-70.


While University education has not quite kept pace with the spread of secondary education, in 1964 India had 54 universities. Of these, 17 were trying to get away from English as the medium of instruction in favour of Hindi or a regional language. The total of 200,000 students at the time of independence in 1947 had within fifteen years passed the million mark. Standards are lower at present, with 50% of those being admitted failing at the intermediate level and 40% of the remainder failing their finals. (Taya Zinkin, "India", Thames and Hudson Ltd., London, 1965, p.119)
but rather, if any claim is to be made at all, that a deeper influence
is being exerted on a smaller number.

But this again is questionable and we are not aware of any such claim
having actually been put forward in recent years. For one thing, direct
Christian teaching has been unable to keep its former place on the curriculum.
The Bible, whose exposition was once the hub of the wheel, is now well out on
its periphery and the problem is no longer, "How do we keep the Bible in the
centre?" but "How do we give it a place at all?" (57)

The report of a Central Government Department commission, the Sri
Prakasa Committee on Religious and Moral Instruction in Schools and Colleges,
issued in December, 1959, had in places almost gone out of its way to
compliment the Christian Colleges on the atmosphere that distinguished them
and its fine character-building effects. The question can be asked, and had
indeed arisen in the minds of many missionaries -- Is this Christian
atmosphere dependent on compulsory Bible Classes? A proposal to make them
optional was made by Wilson College in 1924. As it was turned down by the
Foreign Mission Committee, the status quo was maintained for the next twenty
years -- except for the institution of a conscience clause in the 1930's, of
which very few took advantage. But in 1944 the experiment of making the
Bible Classes entirely optional, except for Christian students, was initiated,
and this was succeeded in 1946 by a system that offered a Bible Class or an
alternative class, students being required to attend one or the other. (58)/

NOTES

58) James Kellock, article cit. See Note 39
This system aimed to give full scope for imparting religious instruction based on the Bible to all non-Christians willing to receive it. In the minds of those not so willing, it sought to awaken and deepen an appreciation of the spiritual and ethical values by means of an alternative class whose syllabus would deal with the cardinal virtues, the common personal and social problems, life's ultimate questions and what the different religions have to say about the dynamism of the good life. The object here was to dispose the minds of students towards taking an interest in the moral and spiritual aspects of human life. (59)

It is clear from the report of the University Education Commission, 1949 (the Radhakrishnan Report), and that of the Sri Prakasa Committee in 1959, that Indian educationists in both Government and University circles believe the welfare of the country calls for explicit moral and religious instruction of some kind in schools and colleges. The Sri Prakasa Committee sketches the situation which has given rise to this trend by stating that, "the many ills that our world of education and our society as a whole is suffering today, resulting in widespread disturbance and dislocation of life, are mainly due to the gradual disappearance of the hold of the basic principles of religion on the hearts of the people". It further declares that, "the only cure is the deliberate inculcation of moral and spiritual values from the earliest years of our life." (60)

The concurrence of the Christian Colleges with this trend towards the planned teaching of moral and spiritual values is a foregone conclusion, for indeed they have been seeking to do it all along. But their problem will continue to be how best and most effectively the inculcating may be done. /

NOTES

59) James Kellock, "Ethical Studies, Personal, Social and Religious". The contents are largely lectures given to alternative classes in Wilson College between 1946 and 1956.

60) Quotation from Sri Prakasa Committee Report supplied by Dr. Kellock.
To try for a genuine and sympathetic understanding of other religious faiths and to rid oneself of prejudice and bigotry are aims to be encouraged and commended. But a humbler attitude towards the presentation of Christian truths, together with a need to come to terms with the just and sincere but highly syncretistic views of Hindu educationists (61), could mean that what had once been "Christian instruction" had given place to "conversations between the religions". (62) Certainly the situation is now such that Christianity must more than ever be caught rather than taught.

Yet here the shortage of Christian staff presents a very serious problem. The Scottish Church College reported that with less than twenty per cent of its staff Christians and education growing ever more secular in tone, little impression could be made on the majority of students. (63) In most colleges, and particularly in the largest at Calcutta, it had been found either impossible or inadvisable to cut down, as had been recommended, on the intake of students. With the demand for places, the number of students at the/  

NOTES

61) The Radhakrishnan University Commission Report recommended that "in the first year of the Degree Course, the lives of great religious leaders like Gautama the Buddha, Confucius, Zoroaster, Socrates, Jesus, Sankara, Ramanuja, Madhva, Mohammed, Kabir, Nanak, Gandhi, be taught". Quoted C.T.K. Chari, article "Impact of Renascent Religions and Cultures", "Re-Thinking our Role as a College", p.35.

62) Ibid., pp.34-42.

Scottish Church College had risen by 1960 to 1,500 (64) This was accompanied by a deterioration in the staff-student ratio and a decline, as we have seen, in the number of staff members coming from overseas. And except in Maharashtra, there was no rise in the number of Christian students. (65)

To summarise, as time goes on it appears that the contribution of the Christian College is going to depend more on the quality of its teaching and of its community spirit and less on size and weight. But the maintaining of quality is by itself a major problem.

Another weakness which is due to changing conditions rather than slackness on the part of Christian leaders arises from the fact that the Christian colleges, with their fine tradition for academic education, have up to date provided nothing like the same facilities for the technical education which has become one of India's most urgent needs. To this extent they share with other older colleges a danger of growing remote from the country's life. "Medical and engineering colleges are concerned with something real: up go the dams, down comes the birth-rate -- in these colleges there are no strikes. But the B.A. student and even the B.Sc. student doesn't know what he is supposed to be doing and easily runs amok. The Arts and Science Colleges have always been exotic and meaningless", writes a young Scots missionary.

NOTES

64) C. of S. Report, 1960, p.451

65) J.W. Airan, op. cit., pp.5-6. It is difficult to find a satisfactory explanation of the fact that in so many parts of India, as the educational level of Christians went up, there appears to have been little or no increase in the proportion of Christians at Church High Schools or Colleges. It is of course a possible explanation that more Christian youths and girls were receiving their education at non-Christian institutions. But positive evidence is lacking.
teacher. (66)

For financial reasons, if for nothing else, it may be taken as read that neither the Church of Scotland nor any other Western Church or Mission is likely to start founding a technological college today, or even to make the major changes necessary for the setting up of technological departments (67). The opportunity is over for advances of this nature and the contribution of the Christian Colleges must be through the excellence of the education they supply rather than by a move to new ground. (68)

NOTES

66) J.N. Walker, article cit. It is true that the Scottish Church College, where the writer was a member of staff, had been troubled with strikes. But one wonders whether the sentiments expressed are not more typical of the Western than the Indian outlook. At the same time, the Scottish colleges were perhaps more at fault than admitted in not developing technological departments. "Technical education is now the cry in India. It is the education of the future, not excepting the Colleges", wrote the Free Church's missionary from Poona. The date of that utterance was 1887. (F.C. Report 1887, p.91) See also U.P.C. Report, 1905, p.9. Some of the Christian colleges must be given credit, however, for the contribution they have made towards meeting the growing demands for technologists through the very considerable expansion of their science departments. By training young men and women up to Inter-Science, B.Sc, and M.Sc, levels, they have been important feeders of the more strictly vocational technological institutions.

67) "If there were no Christian colleges in India today, should we start any? -- Nobody in Scotland would think of it at all," wrote J.R. Macphail, article cit., p.3. But Dr. B.P. Kivale, who started the now flourishing Ahmednagar Christian College in 1948, would certainly not have accepted such an outlook.

A great deal could be said about the role of the Christian college in India today, for this is the central theme which has in recent years been exercising some of the best minds in the Christian community. We should be glad to welcome the wealth and variety of the ideas expressed and not too disappointed if, in an atmosphere of experiment and exploration, there is little consensus of opinion. Our chief concern, however, is with the relationship between the colleges and the Church and the contribution which either makes to the life of the other. On this theme relatively little thinking seems to have been done, prior attention quite naturally being given to the wider questions of the place of the Christian College in the nation and in the University. (69)

But we can take as fairly relevant to our purpose three definitions of a Christian college which are cited by Dr. Airan. The first was produced at a conference of the heads of some of the Christian Colleges and speaks about the proclamation of the Gospel of God’s righteousness and love in Jesus Christ, the imparting of sound Christian education and the development of the life of students in such a way that they may play a part in the service of God and their fellow-men.

The second, circularised by a Mission Board, defines a Christian college as one where “Christian faith and doctrine and Christian personalities constitute an effective force, shaping every phase of life.”

And the third, emanating from a group of Christian educators in the U.S.A., speaks of a college as becoming progressively Christian through/

NOTES

69) This is the outlook of the two symposia produced at Wilson College and the M.C.C. from which quotations have already been taken.
confidence in the transforming love of Jesus Christ; and of its insistence on spiritual above material values, personal integrity and human brotherhood. (70)

In all these definitions, the primary emphasis is rightly placed on evangelism and the influencing of the non-Christian community through living witness and service. Yet this, as Dr. Airan remarks, is the central task of the Church itself and the question must now be asked - Whether a Christian college can look upon itself as a Church and proceed to do what a Church can do better? (71)

It is surely misleading, however, to make any such distinction between the college as a witnessing body and the Church in its performance of the same function. Surely the Christian college, in the truest and broadest sense, is the Church in one aspect of its witness and service. Since the form of witness and service given is that of education, the college's first duty is to maintain at the highest possible level the education it offers. The Christian teacher "teaches Chemistry for its own sake" as Dr. Taylor puts it and not as a mask for anything else, even for the Christian Gospel. But teaching is always teaching with the highest aim of education in view, namely the production of men and women of integrity and intellectual maturity, and then of good physicists, economists and historians. The strength of the Christian colleges has indeed in the past lain in their ability to offer an education behind which such an ideal was always present. (72)

NOTES

70) J.W. Airan, op.cit., pp.11-12

71) Ibid., p.12

And this primary aim is not very far from that propounded by William Miller.

A second possible effect of such Christian witness, namely the conversion of individuals or communities to Christianity through the "effective force of Christian faith, doctrine and personality", is surely still another function of the Christian college in its capacity as an arm of the Church in India. It was with this purpose in mind, namely the conversion of India, that the first colleges were founded. It must be faced that the result had been almost total failure. India has not become a Christian nation, the colleges have not destroyed Brahminism nor proved the most effective weapon of Christian evangelism, Christian education has not been accepted as the key to all truth and the number of conversions for which Christian colleges have been demonstrably responsible is very small. If Duff, Wilson, Anderson and even possibly William Miller were to return to their institutions today their first reaction would certainly be disappointment. The failure has been due to a misunderstanding of Hinduism and a fatal under-rating of its powers of resistance. As Mayhew points out, with the wisdom of hindsight, it was ridiculous to think that any educational system could touch the core of Brahminism while ignoring the strength, first of caste, and then of the joint family system. The "plastic conservatism" of Hinduism has blunted the weapons of Western knowledge and of the Christian truth so closely and deliberately associated with it.\(^{(73)}\)

On the other hand, while nations, like individuals, have on occasion come to a knowledge of truth with astonishing celerity, the conversion of a people is normally a slow process. It took nearly three centuries for the/

---

**NOTES**

Roman Empire to adopt the sign of the Cross and it would have been a great mistake for Christians of that period to have reckoned the size of their Church as the sole criterion of progress in evangelism. There are other potent factors to be taken into account in the India of today and Dr. Urquhart's "peaceful penetration" is one of them. (74) It may be unrecognised, unacknowledged or resented, but it is there. And while impossible to measure, it provides not only a basic attitude of good-will towards Christianity but a readiness to listen to Christian truth when that truth is presented without arrogance.

For example, the writer recalls a speech delivered by a Minister of the Madras Government, himself a Brahmin and the product of a Hindu school but a Christian College, when the Minister was guest of honour at the laying of the foundation stone of a new Hindu College. In the course of his address, the Minister quoted once deliberately from the New Testament, once deliberately from the Gita and three times unintentionally from the New Testament. The speech, incidentally, was accepted as orthodox and highly suitable to the occasion. There is no end to the number of similar examples which could be adduced.

For this state of affairs the Christian colleges and their teachers are responsible. They have been one of the main forces in the shaping of present-day India and indeed without their influence the Constitution of India, in its present form and with its high regard for personal freedom, could not have been framed. The effect is admittedly very different from that which was intended. It has been immense, nonetheless, and without the/

NOTES

74) Chapter 7.
contribution of the colleges the outlook and ethos of the Indian nation would be very different, as would the situation of the Indian Church. There is among educated Indians a knowledge of the teaching of Jesus and a genuine admiration for Him as a person. The fact that, in South India particularly, thousands of Indians in positions high and low look back with affection to a Christian college as their alma mater and treasure friendships with Christian members of staff has had quite immeasurable results in terms of help given towards other Christian institutions and sympathy afforded to other Christian individuals. This is the "peaceful penetration" of which Dr. Urquhart spoke, its effects should not be underestimated and it must be recognised as an important contribution on the part of the colleges to the atmosphere in which the Church lives and moves.

The first field, therefore, in which the Christian colleges have won success has been that of education as such. And if this appears to have little direct relation with the Church it has at least provided Christians with an honourable means of service.

The second field has been through the permeation of Indian life with Christian teaching and Christian values. Even in terms of the counting of heads and direct accessions to the Church, the untraceable effects of this must have been considerable. But in terms of a leaven still at work it offers a potential the end-results of which are quite incalculable. The Christianity of the West has not been accepted but it has been largely understood and assimilated. It is for the colleges to lead the Church in trying to present the Christianity of the East.(75)/

NOTES

75) It is of interest to note that C.R.K. Chari, in his article "Impact of Renascent Religions and Cultures" sees the question "Are Christian values in some way bound up with Western culture?" as of almost equal concern to Christians and non-Christians. See "Re-Thinking our Role", p.35 and passim.
The third field in which the relationship between colleges and Church must be considered concerns the training of Christian leaders and co-operation with the Church in various community activities. In the case of an institution such as Murray College, this element has loomed large from the beginning. While the complement of Christian students was small, the College came about because it was necessary for the Christian community. And it will be remembered that the Lindsay Commission recommended Murray College to make that community its chief responsibility (76). With the other four Scottish Colleges the reverse was the case. And while the intention of providing a training school for converts and their descendants was there from the beginning, it was only gradually, as the number of Christian students increased, that a real need was being met.

It may be noted as a fact today that the number of Christian leaders with higher educational qualifications who did not pass through a Christian college, but took their degree at some other institution, must be extremely small. Christian leaders are with very few exceptions Christian-college-trained, with all that one would hope that implies. And among the most hard-working and distinguished servants of the Indian Church on its Courts, committees and commissions have been members of the college staffs.

Yet this is not quite the same as saying that college and Church have invariably worked in cordial co-operation in the training and education of Christian youth. Since 1950 there has been a definite integration of the Church of Scotland colleges with the Church. College Constitutions now require that Minutes, reports, financial statements and budgets of the College's supreme body be sent annually to the General Assembly of the U.C.N.I. or the/
Synod of the C.S.I. And like the Mission, the Church has the right of consultation or suggestion, and is charged with seeking the welfare and efficiency of the Christian colleges. But constitutional links are a very different thing from informed and conscientious team-work. Too often it has been a case of the Church dispatching the student to the college and the college eventually returning him to a Church for which it now tragically appeared he had little use. Where the hostel system was strong and organisations such as the S.C.M. in a flourishing condition this happened less, yet still in the interval Christian students tended to get lost. This was one aspect of the absence of close links between college and Church on which the Lindsay Commission put its finger. But while in the years immediately following the Commission's report there were marked improvements in this direction, particularly in the sphere of social service work, in which Christians and non-Christians worked together, we hear less about this form of college-Church link in more recent times. (77)

The main reason for this is simply academic pressure on both staff and students. Extra-curricular activities, including social service projects, are apt to drop out of sight before the need to complete a syllabus and pass degree examinations. One frequently comes across a complaint that Christian students look on the S.C.M. as exclusive and something apart from life, and when this occurs participation in welfare activities is less. There are similar complaints that the traditional aloofness of Indian intellectuals from the real problem of life continues and it is difficult to get non-Christian students interested. Where, as in Calcutta, the number of Bengali Christian students is small and the Christian community must rely on students/

NOTES

77) See Chs. 6 and 8.
from Assam or South India, any form of co-operation between college and Church must be more of a problem. (78) Here college hostels, which can become both a centre of the Christian life of prayer and service and of community living in which Christians and non-Christians share together, have obviously a great part to play. Dr. Airan draws attention to the fact that in some colleges the whole prayer life of the Christian group centred round such hostels and sometimes even the local Church has benefitted by it. (79)

Again Indianisation, good and necessary in itself, has in one respect tended to weaken the bonds between college and Church. In times past, the overseas missionaries serving on a college staff were in most cases ordained ministers who automatically took their place on the courts of the Church. Other links through social contacts and the work of Mission boards and committees prevented these two aspects of Christian work from losing touch with each other. One group was at least always aware of what the other was doing.

These particular forms of contact no longer continue to the same extent, which is inevitable with the growth of larger and more complicated units and their bureaucratic demands. The Christian staff of a college, from the Principal downwards, now consists mainly and sometimes entirely of laymen. And while the higher courts of the Indian Churches are so constituted that colleges are represented, the college as an organisation is not under the Church's control, with the consequence that such links could become merely nominal. It is quite possible, in other words, that the gap observed by the/

---

**NOTES**


79) For a fuller treatment of the matter treated in this paragraph see J.W. Airan, op. cit., pp.20-23. An article on the role of hostels in University Education, by D. Fraser and V.D. Dehulkar, is included in "Thoughts on Indian Education", pp.87-90.
Lindsay Commission, and which it sought to close, may again become wider.

At a wider level, the Christian colleges have much to offer the Indian Church along the road of unity, whether one thinks in terms of organic union or of co-operation between denominations. Most of the major Christian colleges in India, Roman Catholic colleges excluded, are inter-denominational, co-operation between churches and Mission boards having here kept ahead of and not simply parallel to Church Union movements. Through the Central Board of Christian Higher Education, a board of India's National Christian Council, Christian colleges have a means of exchanging news and views and formulating joint policies. Other voluntary bodies such as the Asia Christian Colleges Association provide a channel for maintaining still wider contacts. (80)

To the minds of Scotsmen in whose country the relations between Church and State, and Church and University, have from Reformation times onwards been unusually close and in some respects unique, the whole concept of a Christian College within a secular University is utterly foreign. And even to those who, like American Christians, are familiar with denominational colleges, the situation of a Christian college as part of a secular university in a non-Christian State presents something of a problem.

As educational institutions, the colleges are responsible to the Universities with which they are affiliated and also by a separate organisation to the Education Department which assesses financial grants. As Christian institutions, they are represented on various Church Courts and have links with each other through the National Christian Council. Their position is anything but simple.

NOTES

80) The Association is in contact with all but five Christian Colleges, all but five of which, however, are in either India or Pakistan. See bulletin of the Association, May, 1965, pp. 12-13.
The Scottish Colleges are long past the stage of having outgrown the control of the Missions by which they were founded. And they have never been under the authority of any Court of an Indian Church. The lack of balance which we observed in the work of Scottish Missions has thus with time been redressed. The Scottish colleges are a contribution which Scottish Missions have made to Christian progress in India from which the whole Church stands to gain. These huge organisations, while they have been expensive in terms of missionary manpower, have, thanks to their efficiency and the sums brought in through fees and grants-in-aid, cost the Churches amazingly little in terms of hard cash. And anything the churches founded by Scottish Missions may have lacked through over-concentration on higher education is in the process of being made good by the healthier balance which Church Union and co-operative work supply. Closer unity among their co-operating and supporting bodies should be a great advantage to the colleges.

A paper on evangelism read to the Fellowship of Christian Workers (formerly the Calcutta Missionaries' Conference), raised the familiar accusation that in Western Bengal not enough emphasis was placed in direct evangelism.

The speaker suggested on this occasion that one of the six Protestant Arts/Science Colleges might be closed and money from the buildings and other resources be used to start a carefully planned programme of evangelism among a chosen group of Gospel-starved villages. (81)

We are not concerned here with the wisdom of the scheme as such, only with the fact that it could in 1964 be put forward as a feasible line of action. This shows that the Colleges may be capable of planning in concert for the service and effectiveness of the whole Christian enterprise in India.

The stage has now been reached when in many parts of the country they can operate both as a function of the Church and as a Christian element in the Indian system of higher education.

NOTES

GENERAL SOURCES.


Wm. Miller, "Educational Agencies in India", Madras, 1893.


"Hislop College, 1885-1935": a Jubilee booklet printed at the Central India Printing Works, Sitabuldi, Nagpur, 1935.


"The Centenary of the Scottish Church College: a Book of Remembrance, 1830-1930."


F.M.C. Reports.

"Conference."

MS. Papers, S.N.L.
PART IV - OBSERVATIONS AND CONCLUSIONS

Chapter XVI - Recapitulation and Comparisons

What useful lessons may be drawn from this account of the efforts of a Western Church to preach the Gospel and plant churches in a distant land?

Any conclusions we are able to draw will certainly suffer from a number of limitations. They will in the first place be of historical interest rather than pragmatic value, for the initiative has now passed almost entirely to the young Churches themselves. It is they who will reap the harvest, plentiful or scanty, and will have to struggle with the weeds and tares. Thus even if we were in a position to judge objectively where missionary motives may have grown confused and aims distorted, if we could put our finger accurately on a faulty method or point out where some healthy approach had continued too long, such knowledge will not necessarily be of much help to the Christian leaders of the present day. The situation has so changed that Christians of another generation have different problems to face.

It is a further limitation, however, and a point frequently underlined in recent years, that objective judgment on a subject of this kind is very difficult to attain. Western Missions and their work, though undertaken as service unto God, have themselves, through the turbulent forces of history, fallen under divine judgment and the supporters of such Missions are not therefore the most unbiased critics of what has been done or left undone. If we are to look to the future with a prophetic and realistic eye, we need an unusually honest attitude of repentance and humility towards the past. (1)

It remains true that repentance can lead to new life and assessments of the past can be used for constructive building in the years ahead. Yet the only type of analysis which can be attempted here is one which leaves open the question -- Where do we go from this point? And it must to a large extent reflect the defensive attitude of the prisoner at the bar.

A third and very real limitation is set by the scope of this survey /

NOTES

and the fact that it is not a "study in depth" of some specific locality (2)
The only pieces of research of this nature that have been made up to date are three studies of North Indian churches, one in Delhi, one in the Punjab and one in the Kond hills, which were published late in 1966. There we are given carefully collated information gathered at first hand and in sufficient detail to gain an intimate, unsentimental but sympathetic view of a Christian community. (3) Such field studies are most illuminating and since they describe not only the history, background and customs of the people, but their thoughts, feelings and unconscious assumptions, there is material for a much more penetrating examination than is possible with a wider survey such as this.

The value of this study should lie rather in the differences which emerge among Missions all following the same aims and using similar methods. These eight fields have clearly much ground in common, yet there is also great variety in development. By comparing them with each other it should therefore be possible to distinguish some of the factors which led to success or failure, to strength in one church where there was weakness in another.

One common element is very obvious, namely the fact that, judged by the standard of size, the churches raised by Scottish Missions were all middle-of-the-road churches. No Scottish Mission achieved a success comparable to that of the Welsh Presbyterians in the hills of Assam, where a group of missionaries roughly equal in number to those of the Punjab or Eastern Himalayas Missions gathered in a Christian community ten times the size of either. (4) On the other hand, no Mission suffered the complete frustration experienced by missionaries in Aden who laboured for seventy years without a convert. (5) In each of our eight fields there developed a church which could make some claim to be autonomous and indigenous; yet in every field /

---

NOTES

(2) See Foreword to "Christians of the Copperbelt", John V. Taylor and Dorotha Lehmann, p.x.
(3) Victor E.W. Hayward, "The Church as Christian Community".
there were many signs that that church was failing to act with full independence and responsibility. Thus while there is variation in size, strength and character, it is always with enough ground in common for comparisons to be meaningful. Provided we recognise that this family likeness was not due primarily to their Scottish origin, but was shared by Protestant Mission churches throughout India, we can try to assess the importance of both the resemblances and the distinctive features.

1. The City-Centred Churches.

There is a manifest basis for comparison among the first four churches to be founded by Scottish Missions, all of which took as their original centre an educational institution in a cosmopolitan city. The fact that the likeness was not fortuitous but in the first three instances a matter of choice and in the last of opportunity fitting in with established policy, makes variations in development all the more significant. The central institutions were established for tactical reasons and not, as we have seen, on any principle of essential strategy, yet both positively and negatively their presence had a great effect on the development of the churches. The fruits of this opportunist policy also varied considerably from field to field.

The Church in West Bengal.

The Bengal Church appears at first sight an almost classic example of "Western captivity". Due to the early success of Duff's policy, the original congregation was no mere collection of illiterate outcasts but for a long period the star among Protestant congregations in India. Indian leaders were emerging by the 1850's and in the next decade the Duff church was being described as the best-educated, most prosperous and most influential in the land. To the end of the century it could offer a record of exceptional converts unmatched anywhere in the country. (6) Yet being cradled in the College, it grew up under its shadow and for the best part of a hundred years continued to find there its /

NOTES

shelter. Because of the high standard of education among its members it had difficulty in finding a suitable pastor whom it was at the same time able to support. Its community life was also weak, there being complaints that the church has "no parish" and members were largely "birds of passage." (7)

Yet it would be incorrect to deduce that the College was largely responsible for stifling national initiative in such a promising group, for an English Mission which concentrated much more on direct evangelism and the training of converts was in even worse case. (8) The two chief reasons for the church's failure to grow were rather that the supply of exceptionally able converts dried up and the Rural Mission proved an almost complete failure. The latter was not badly planned, for energies were concentrated on an area of reasonable size and, partly because of climatic conditions but also as a matter of policy, the work was put into Indian hands. Here the Free Church Mission was recognised as having splendid leadership and it supplied pioneer workers to many younger Missions. Yet after a promising start district work languished and re-organisation under an energetic and experienced missionary had no lasting effect. Hindu resistance was too strong, in particular the sheer force of apathy. And even if the College had not demanded the bulk of the Mission's manpower and rural efforts had been multiplied ten times over, resulting in ten times the number of converts, Christian communities would have been small and scattered and dependent on outside leadership (9)

The decision to place evangelism in Indian hands was sound in principle and once made it was inevitable that rather than wait until the Indian Church could support those workers the Mission should do so. It was equally realistic to style well-qualified leaders as "missionaries" and set them on a footing comparable with Europeans. This was a notable example of the intention to draw /

NOTES

(7) Pp. 315, 323
(8) P. 623
(9) Pp. 316, 330-331, 338
no hard and fast lines between Europeans and national leaders. Yet a good purpose was defeated, the reason being the gap between Indian leaders and the remainder of the community. Those natural leaders, for lack of a society of Indian Christians able to support them, either became servants of the Mission or graduated to other forms of employment. The step down towards becoming a full-time servant of the Church was too great, even the Duff congregation being for long periods without a pastor. When in the 1900's the two Colleges united, both Missions were strong in European personnel and Indian leadership, yet the Church was crippled for want of an adequate ministry. (10) And with Jalna as the outstanding exception, sister Missions whose district work had been extended under the direct supervision of Europeans proved to have fared better.

The improvement in the Church's situation, when it came, was due not to any change of policy or emphasis but to an access of material prosperity which helped poorer congregations to start doing things for themselves. Industrialisation and regular wage packets did what no amount of exhortation could achieve and small groups of Christians began to build their own places of worship. (11)

Union and integration showed the character of the Scottish Mission churches to be very similar to that of their ex-Congregationalist partners, the special part played by the College being in the production of better leaders. (12) The shortage of pastors and the poverty of many Christians still constitute problems, but largely because Christians are so scattered. Pastoral care would be adequate if they were grouped more closely together. (13)

This Christian society is now almost wholly urbanised, with a strong elite of well-educated members. The spiritual goals of sanctification and growth in grace are therefore accompanied, in the eyes of most of the community, by ideals /

NOTES

(10) Pp. 335-6.
(11) P. 344
(12) Pp. 346-7
(13) Pp. 348, 351.
of economic prosperity and middle-class respectability. In this respect they may be compared with the Protestant Christians in Delhi, whose standards of success are described as economic, with particular ambitions to own one's home and live in a Christian neighbourhood. Yet in contrast to Delhi, families in the Calcutta community are too widely dispersed to form anything like a "Christian ghetto". This has concomitant disadvantages in making it more difficult to keep contact with those on the fringes of the fellowship. Yet compared with other urban societies, there is an excellent community spirit.

The key to this appears to be the communal loyalty of the Bengali, who is a Bengali first and an Indian second. Although the Church is urbanised and the education of many members Westernised, Christians wear Bengali costume and, while members of the Church Council are usually fluent in English, Bengali is often used by preference. Little progress can be made by any member of the Council who does not speak the language.

This regional atmosphere also prevents Christian communalism, there being an unusual number of social contacts between Christian families and their non-Christian neighbours. The tolerant attitude fostered by societies like the Brahmo Samaj has helped in this direction, coupled with the fact that there are distinguished Christians who play a part in public life. Consequently Christians remain on friendly visiting terms with their Hindu relatives.

The Church is no longer dependent on the College and could survive without it. And there are Christian leaders who resent or at least deplore the amount of effort still spent on institutional work and would prefer to see some of the capital sunk in education employed on such things as rural evangelism.

Yet the College itself keeps in touch with the community through a monthly College Service held in the Duff Church and the Christian society as a whole reveals no great evangelistic fervour. It is hardly increasing faster than /

NOTES

(14) V.E.M. Hayword, op.cit., pp. 74-78
(15) Information obtained through correspondence and interviews.
(16) See Ch. 15, Note 81.
the rate of natural growth and may be described as self-maintaining rather than self-propagating. The Church has not proved particularly hospitable to fellow-Christians from the Santal area coming into the city, nor to the Nepali-speaking Hill Christian Church. (17) Yet it is more than a Christian caste and reflects its catholic nature by including in its fellowship a congregation of Tamil-Telegu speakers which lately inducted a double graduate as its minister. (18) Nevertheless the bonds of language and race tend to count for more than those of religion.

One peculiar feature of the Church, which again reflects its Bengali character, is its intense reverence for age and experience. The Church Council has for many years been controlled by old men, to such an extent that there is little chance of a pastor being elected Moderator before he reaches retiring age. (19)

To sum up, this Church is a vigorous and harmonious body which has yet not cut itself off from the society in which it lives. And in spite of Western origins and influences it has developed an indigenous life. Due to excessive urbanisation and the lack of any community of rural Christians, it is weak in its sense of responsibility towards the needs of the Indian Church as a whole and the strangers within its own gates.

The Church in Western India.

In contrast to Calcutta, work in Western India had begun as a rural effect, but failure to make progress in the South Konkan and the influence of Duff's success in Calcutta led to concentration in two large cities. The Church was finally established as not one but three distinct communities in Bombay, Poona and Jalna. /

NOTES

(17) Pp. 248, 569.
(18) "United Church Review", June, 1964, p.138
(19) Information obtained through correspondence and interviews.
The Church in Bombay grew up in a manner similar to its sister in Calcutta, with the Institution taking a central place. But while there were some outstanding converts in the first generation, the church at Ambroli never achieved the distinction of the Duff congregation. And the failure of the Church of Scotland to maintain its work in the city left the Free Church Mission with a heavier load to carry alone and a weaker Church.

Again the top-heavy Mission organisation was much in evidence, but this was regarded by missionaries as a temporary phenomenon and the training of the ministry made a matter of prime importance. (20) At the same time much emphasis was laid on "voluntary" work and the temptation to subsidise converts was at least partially resisted. (21) The Bombay missionaries were among the first to see the need for some kind of social life to grow up within the Christian community, hence their introduction of love-feasts and meetings with other congregations. Their ideas may appear to us excessively dull, churchified and Westernised. But the alternative was nothing at all, the real model was the world of the New Testament rather than Victorian Scotland, and we have no reason to believe that church members did not find it stimulating. Plans for the raising of a national ministry went ahead and here again by the 1880's Indians were being installed as "pastors" rather than "missionaries." (22)

Yet the Church in Bombay emerged much weaker than that in Calcutta, language divisions, the disappearance of the Church of Scotland Mission and a disappointing lack of fruit from district work all having something to do with this. Thus while co-operative work among Missions played a correspondingly greater part in the Church's life, the Central Fund for the maintenance of the ministry did not work well and efforts to keep contact with poor immigrant Christians widely scattered throughout the city suffered from lack of local support. (23) The chief reasons for this lie not in any difference of aim or /

NOTES

(20) Pp. 260, 258
(21) Pp. 263-4
(22)PP. 267, 270
(23) Information obtained through correspondence: pp. 309-310.
lack of forethought, but in the smallness of the Mission staff, their absorption in the College and the absence of the type of regional loyalty visible among Bengalis. Congregations are thus self-centred and quarrelsome, the Church Council has little authority or cohesion, and rather than add its strength to such weakness the Scottish congregation of St. Andrew's decided to continue on its own.

The Mission's second centre at Poona presents an almost perfect example of a church surrounded by every major factor likely to inhibit natural growth. Here were Hinduism at its strongest, the atmosphere of a cantonment to give Christianity a foreign flavour, an institutional Mission whose institutions were yet not quite good enough to outshine their non-Christian rivals and a compound-centred community too small to make any impact on the city. (24) To such drawbacks there was added at one point by the Church of Scotland the final flourish of competition among fellow-Presbyterians. (25)

Missionaries were well aware of most of these weaknesses and while trying to foster a community spirit resisted the plan of settling too many Christian families within the Mission compound itself. (26) While converts came again almost wholly from among the outcastes, the Poona Mission was unique in this respect, that lacking the centre of a strong College it nevertheless kept developing its evangelistic approach to the educated and caste communities. Discussion rooms were established because preaching in the streets seldom went uninterrupted and lectures given on history and other secular subjects. This is the only instance we have among Scottish Missions of indirect evangelism through teaching which was not channelled through institutions. "There is no indication of any religious interest in this", wrote one Poona missionary, "But I am convinced that second only to direct religious teaching are the lessons of history to young India in these days." The patent fruit of this work among /

NOTES

(24) Pp. 274-5
(25) P. 294
(26) P. 273
English-speaking caste people was insignificant, confirming the fact that much more influence could be brought to bear through an institution. (27)

Missionaries would have been prepared to concentrate more on direct methods of evangelism, but a three-year campaign mounted by the Salvation Army proved the futility of such efforts in the city when unsupplemented by other agencies and the missionary staff was too weak for sustained evangelistic work beyond. (28) The Church of Scotland's example in deliberately setting up a rival congregation was a unique contradiction of normal practice and only a temporarily reversal of the trend towards closer co-operation.

The most surprising thing is not that the Church which developed should have faults but that it should exist in such numbers at all. It graduated from dependence to become a centralised, urbanised, fairly well educated and contentious little society. Community loyalty and the draw of regular employment accentuated the pull towards the city. Country cousins were drawn in and city members did not go out to strengthen the Church on its weak fringes. With the exception of Ajmer, Christchurch has become numerically the strongest of any Scottish Mission congregation. But its life has been rent with quarrels and those who have attended its monthly evening Service in English comment on the fact that it attracts few Christians outside its own membership. (29)

The Mission's third community in the Jalna area presents a distinct contrast. For the first time an Indian leader was given a free hand to develop his own methods, the institutional background was missing and the local environment favourable towards the start of a mass movement. Thanks to his original methods of evangelism and a purposeful drive towards the building up of an indigenous church, Dr. Sheshadri's experiment came like a breath of fresh air.

His dream of a countryside studded with Bethels was not translated into fact /

NOTES

(27) P. 293: Notes from Poona by J. Small, 1898. (S.N.L., Folio 7828)
(28) P. 276
(29) P. 305: information obtained through correspondence etc.
and even the prototype Bethel produced its crop of problems. Yet this was the type of evangelism and also of church growth which accorded with centuries of Christian tradition. There were hopes of a church which would quickly become independent while continuing to expand. For a year or two after Sheshadri's death, it looked as if the Mission had taken a retrograde step by replacing him with two young missionaries, for with their stricter ideas concerning discipline and self-help the flow of converts ceased abruptly. Yet the change had a salutary effect, the spirit of independence improved and within a few years the spontaneous movement was once more gathering strength. (30)

The explanation is that the church at Jalna was not, as might at first sight appear, an example of spontaneous extension which was then made to conform to traditional Western methods. The truth is rather that while Sheshadri was a true missionary and had a flair for using Indian techniques, fundamentally his approach was the same as the Mission's. He was a servant of the Mission, not of the Church, and if his outlook was in the highest sense fatherly and responsible it was also as paternalistic as that of any European.

The mass movement was not allowed to continue without check or guidance, there being an insistence that converts receive adequate instruction and training. But since this depended on the Mission's paid agency, the growth of the Church was literally controlled by the number of full-time workers available. In no other Scottish Mission were such sustained efforts made towards social and economic uplift, yet the problem of poverty, aggravated by a mental outlook induced by centuries of subservience, left the basic query — How can the Church change until there is an economic change? (31)

Particular problems such as a shortage of pastors, their lack of suitable training and the gap between leaders and the rank and file have nothing unusual about them (32) What is new to us here is the twofold dilemma which confronted leaders in every mass movement area where converts were of outcaste origin rather /

NOTES

(30) Pp. 280-3, 286-7, 296-7
(31) Pp. 298-9, 306-7
(32) Pp. 310-311
than from animist tribes. How teach independence to those who, having poverty and dependence bred in the bone, still possess little hope of reaching any reasonable level of economic security? And when should witness give way to consolidation, and when is consolidation far enough advanced for renewed concentration on witness? These were not such pressing problems for the city Missions, whose people had more opportunity for advancement, but we shall meet with them again in other country areas.

It should be noted that Western India provides the sole example of a Church whose extension appears definitely to have suffered as a result of the Scottish Disruption: and by a corollary it has most to gain from church union and the prospect of further union. Divided as they are into three distinct units widely separated from each other, the natural links of these churches all stretch across denominational boundaries. (33)

The Church in South India.

The Bengali Church became an urban society, but units were multiplied within the city and its community spirit grew strong but not too exclusive. The Church in Western India extended further and grew greater in size but spread too widely to become a cohesive whole, and smaller or more isolated units became ingrown. The Church in Madras Province shows a third variation on the same basic pattern. It managed to extend, thus achieving an even balance than in Bengal, but not, as in Western India, at the cost of cohesion.

Once again the original Indian leaders were converts from the Free Church's Institution. Of these Rajahgopal gave distinguished service, it being observed of the others that "the flower did not thrive" which had been sheltered in Mission compound conditions. As in Calcutta, members of the Free Church's central congregation proved "too individualistic" to merge easily into one fellowship, while the Church of Scotland's Tamil congregation was dependent on the goodwill of the Scottish community. (34) /

NOTES

(33) Pp. 309-310
(34) Pp. 357, 359, 367-8
The main difference lay in the fact that when rural work was opened up it came to be directed by missionaries and met with some success, yet city and country congregations were near enough to each other for contacts to be maintained. Converts once more came mainly from outcaste villages and with mixed motives, and faced with the difficulties of giving instruction and teaching self-support missionaries announced at one point that they did not want large numbers until they could train them spiritually. The Church never grew rapidly and Madras had no Sheshadri ready to strike out on his own, for Rajahgopal was always content to work wholly within the framework of Western ideas. Too much stress was probably laid on the personal convictions of individuals and there was insufficient understanding of the value of group conversion. Numbers certainly did not justify the fear of a Church likely to be swamped by nominal Christians and there need not have been such concern about immediate consolidation. (35)

But this Church possessed strong advantages. Work was contained within a manageable area and outlying commitments were passed on to other hands. The two Scottish Mission areas were contiguous, not overlapping, and they worked well in harness together, forestalling by many years the Scottish union of 1929. It was also a factor of great importance that there should be continuity of development in district work under missionaries quite as able as the professors of the Madras Christian College. Close relations with other Missions which were thicker on the ground but well organised on a basis of comity gave an impetus to co-operative work and union movements. Consequently church union came earlier, as did the emergence of Indian leadership. (36)

While the build-up of organisational work, in relation to the size of the Church, was very heavy -- Madras describing itself as a "well-equipped Mission" -- the College did not to the same extent occupy the centre of the stage. This was partly due to the growth of the Church in the country districts, partly because the College led the way in becoming a co-operative effort. The danger /

NOTES

(35) PP. 359-360, 363, 376, 368-9
(36) PP. 368, 370
was rather that because its base was broader than that of the local Mission, it would lose contact with the Church. Here church union proved a saving factor and the College was integrated with the Church, not the Mission. (37)

The overall picture is that of a highly institutionalised body which has nevertheless been saved from stagnation and frustration. The country districts showed healthy growth but were not isolated as round Jalna. City institutions could offer education and advancement, with opportunities for co-operative work and cross-fertilisation helping the process. Growth has never been remarkable but expansion continues both outwards and through the internal organisation of pastorates. (38)

The Church in Central India.

In the opening years of our fourth city-centred Mission, that at Nagpur, there were certain obvious contradictions which were bound to inhibit growth. Stephen Hislop's personal inclinations clearly lay with a peripatetic form of evangelism. The seed must be broadcast but failing an immediate response the sower shook the dust of that place off his feet. He thus managed to cover an astonishing amount of ground but with little result. (39) At the same time the powerful Duff tradition ensured that the Mission should be city-based and orientated from the Institution. (40)

Perhaps because Hislop's heart was not wholly in it, certainly through a shortage of missionary staff, but mainly because the ferment of interest in Western learning had scarcely reached the youth of Nagpur, the Institution failed to win that vital nucleus of caste converts who would have provided leaders for the Church. Yet the Mission was established for forty years before a serious attempt was made at district work. And it is apparent that in their approach to people like the primitive Gonds at Chindwara Scottish...
missionaries were working with a very superficial understanding of their customs and mentality. (41)

For all the hard and devoted work put in, then, and the genuine difficulties encountered, much labour was misdirected and the Church grew up on a narrower foundation than might possibly have been the case. As late as 1930 the city congregation made up two-thirds of the whole community. The result, as happened in Poona also, was that Christian village groups, too weak to develop a society of their own, kept being drawn into the city. And while one cannot but commend the loyal support given by some of Nagpur European residents, undoubtedly it stressed Christianity's foreign accent. (42)

Ironically enough, the Mission's well-intentioned efforts to make the Church more indigenous only complicated matters. The new church built by Europeans for Indians to witness among their own people was never popular and the area round the Mission compound became in the end the location of the Christian community. (43) The lesson is driven home that indigenous development can only be achieved by nationals themselves.

It was not until the 1930's, which were for many others years of stagnation or retrenchment, that the Church began to flourish. The rate of growth quickened and this had its psychological effect. Through an enlightened policy in a small and manageable College the Mission was soon leading the way towards indigenisation and integration. And after the second world war a new generation of Indian and missionary leaders formed a team ready to make experiments in communal living, social work and lay training. (44)

---

NOTES

(41) Pp. 395, 392
(42) Pp. 398-400
(43) P. Pp. 403-4
(44) Pp. 406-8, 408-410, 416-7
Nagpur presents the rather unusual picture of a Mission which almost thrust self-government on a small community which was not yet prepared for self-support. Present-day leadership, though far ahead of the rank and file, has shown much initiative. It is possible that in a larger church, with many routine administrative demands, such original ideas would not have had a chance to develop. Many missionaries have hankered in their day to try something along the lines of the Allipur experiment but have lacked the time or freedom. It is a reversal of the common and uncreative trend among churches with large institutions to serve, where instead of being able to work at the growing edges of the Church European missionaries are located in administrative posts. Nevertheless it is a pity that the Allipur centre does not serve a larger Christian community. This is a case of good gear going into too small bulk. (45)

This small and city-centred community is more outward-looking than its more powerful sister in Poona, however, lack of numbers and good leadership having eventually led to an excellent atmosphere of co-operation. Relations with Anglicans could still be improved, but an English evening service is supported now by members of the Methodist Episcopal congregation, with Anglicans also joining in once a month. Church union is therefore likely to bring immediate and practical advantages. (46)

NOTES

(45) Pp. 405, 407, 417-8
(46) Information obtained through correspondence etc.
The Pour Churches.

In dealing with the four city-based Missions, we note that in South India alone was a cohesive structure erected which included natural as well as gathered communities. Differences in development were determined by many factors, the most important of which were environmental. But some of the blame for a failure to advance outwards must certainly be laid at the door of the large institutions. In addition to this, district missionaries came to devote more time to the needs of the growing community than to evangelism. A similar situation in Delhi, a city of comparable size, is described in some detail in one of the studies in depth already referred to. In Delhi also a number of Mission schools and a College, the Anglican St. Stephen's, had grown up, and while they made practically no contribution to the numerical growth of the church they raised the educational level of Christians and in doing so demanded the attention of the ablest leaders. At the same time missionaries and their Indian colleagues are reported from the beginning of the century to have been devoting more time and resources to the needs of the church, so that evangelism in its traditional forms came to a standstill. Accordingly while the church in Delhi has advanced in size and independence, as well as educationally and economically, it is inward-looking and hesitant about its mission. There is no urge to propagate the faith among non-Christian neighbours and no contact or concern with the lives of fellow-Christians outside the city limits. (47)

Among the Scottish Missions, the heavy commitment to College work has not only brought about a similar development, but even less attention was paid to the churches. It is logical and significant that tension between College workers and those seeking to build up rural churches should be most apparent where the country churches were strongest, that is in South India and Western India. Letters from Madras in the 1890's describe a request on the part of the College Senatus for a missionary to take charge of district schools. This proposal was objected to by the district/

NOTES.

(47) V.E.W. Hayward, op.cit., pp.38-42, 131-134.
missionary, who held that schools should be developed under local supervision. (48)

And a letter from Dr. Mowat, stationed in Jalna, complains that College professors outvote him in the Council, although ignorant of the needs of an expanding district. "While no college business is ever discussed in our presence — you will see in a case like this it is easy for a good cause to be negatived." (49)

The importance of such differences should not be exaggerated, for relations on the whole were amicable. But it is noticeable that tensions should be least evident in Calcutta and Nagpur, where district work was relegated without question to second place.

The tendency to band together and become an exclusive society has been visible in churches of the four Scottish city Missions. This is indeed the typical dilemma of gathered Christian communities, as the choice between witness and consolidation is the dilemma of the mass movement area. In place of the lost background from which converts came, which included superstitious beliefs, idolatrous practices and caste distinctions, but also provided social moorings for a man and his family, it was necessary to offer in practical form fullness of life in the household of faith. To some degree this involved exclusiveness. Had barriers not been erected, Christians would either have drifted back to Hinduism or become totally rootless. Yet the exclusive community, the peculiar people, must not be permitted to become another caste, and the sense of mutual responsibility must somehow be widened to embrace the non-Christian world. (50)

In South India, the solution to this complex problem was worked out chiefly through church union and the balance provided by a community which included both gathered churches and congregations set in their natural environment. In Bengal, regional loyalty supplied both a bond among congregations and links with the non-Christian community. In Nagpur, a spirit of mutual friendliness with Christians

NOTES,

(48) MS letter from George Pittendrigh, Madras, to Mr. Peattie, dated 11.4.1894.
(49) MS letter from A.C. Mowat, Chingleput, dated Nov., 1894.
(50) See V.E.W. Hayward, op. cit., pp. 79-81 on "community consciousness".
of other denominations has helped to keep the doors open. It is in Bombay that small, self-centred congregations have most signally failed to reach the goal of a Christian community life; and in Poona that that life has become most exclusive.

2. The Rural Churches.

A second series of comparisons may be made of the four Missions which opened work, if not strictly in rural districts, at least not in major cities, and did not start with the founding of another Institution. Indirect methods of evangelism, mainly through schools and medical agencies, were still employed, but there was never an early nucleus of well-bred and educated Indian leaders. Growth was in most cases more rapid, converts were of a simple breed, the educational level took longer to rise, standards of living were low and village communities were the standard unit.

The Church in the Punjab.

The village, not the city, and the social group of converts, not the educational institution, provided the starting-point of the Punjab Mission’s expansion. There was nothing unusual about the methods adopted and they did not bring about a mass movement. But they were adaptable enough for all resources to be placed behind the mass movement when it started. Not because of any difference in principle, but because of the numbers involved, education was used for the training of Christians more than as a praeparatio evangelica. (51)

The Church would have grown in numbers faster than it did but for the insistence of missionaries on certain minimum standards both of Christian knowledge and practical stewardship. The elements of self-support were inculcated from the beginning. But during the years when converts were coming in by the hundreds the system was modified and could not later be reinstated. (52).

Converts, although they were almost entirely of outcaste origin, were less

NOTES.

(51) Pp. 430, 432.
spineless than in other parts of the country and could stand up for their rights when necessary. The founding of colonies on the new canals and the enrolment of Christians in the army helped to raise material standards, give Christians an independent status and widen the Church’s outlook (53).

The mass movement did not prove a deterrent to converts coming in from other castes but it later accentuated the boundaries of a self-contained society. The average educational level of the people and their pastors remains low, but Partition and industrialisation have not had the effect of turning the Church in on itself. Such changes have indeed had more effect on the Christian than the Muslim community, scattering the Church but opening up fresh opportunities. The mass movement in the villages has come to a complete halt, and migration to the cities is making it difficult to maintain even present standards of self-support and pastoral care. The growth is in the cities where standards of literacy are higher and a different approach is needed. (54)

We may note three points of particular interest. In the first place, the Punjab offers the only instance among the Scottish Missions of a university college which developed naturally out of the needs of the Church. This has not made it easier for a poor Church to support a large institution, but it has made integration between Church and College simpler and more complete. (55)

Secondly, the canal colonies and especially Youngsonabad offer the only instances in this study of "Christian villages" which can be said to have prospered. The inference is that the weakness lay not where Missions made an effort to found a new community and raise its economic standards but where, as was usually the case, 

NOTES.

The depth study on "The Church in the Punjab" (V.E.W. Hayward, op.cit.) describes the church raised up by the American U.P. Mission whose origins, history and present situation offer a close parallel to the Scottish Mission church. It is part of the Punjab Synod of the U.C.M.I.
(55) P. 442.
the Mission itself continued as the underwriter or natural facilities were too poor for higher standards of living to be attained. In the case of the canal colonies the Government and not the Mission provided fertile soil, the Mission retaining no more than a moral responsibility. Real progress was made, to such an extent that a new problem arose, that of an increasing gap between families who had made good and others who had failed to do so.

Thirdly, a situation has now arisen in which a Church which grew up in the natural environment of its members must face the difficulties of a shifting population and increasing emphasis on urban congregations. This is a reversal of the type of development we have seen up to now, where the Church spread or failed to spread from the cities outwards, and it calls for considerable changes of method and outlook.

The Church in Rajasthan.

In Rajasthan, as in the Punjab, the Mission was placed in a mixed community of Hindus, Moslems, Sikhs and Jains, though in this case with Hindus in the majority. The mixture was an aid to that tolerant atmosphere more likely to give Christian preaching a ready hearing. There were also numerous groups of people, low on the social scale, whom experience suggested would be most responsive to the message of the Gospel. On the face of it, there is no reason why a spontaneous movement like that which took place in the Punjab, for which the Rajasthan missionaries looked and longed, should not have occurred here also. (56)

It is not easy to fathom why it should fail to take place. It can be suggested that among the individualistic Native States, not unlike the warring Scottish clans, it was particularly difficult for any movement to gather impetus on a broad front and across State boundaries. One might point to the puny nature of the efforts which a single Mission could make in such a huge area and to the conservative character of the Rajput. But similar handicaps were experienced in other parts of the country and the Punjab Mission also had State boundaries, long distances and a conservative atmosphere to contend with. The same methods were

NOTES.

(56) Pn.422.
used in very similar conditions in both areas, but with different results, and one cannot pinpoint the cause. It is of the essence of a spontaneous movement that it is spontaneous and not engineered by human instruments. The Spirit bloweth where it listeth and in Rajasthan it did not blow.

One result was that the Mission-station approach, though unavoidable in the early stages, was unduly prolonged. Had the Church grown larger and stronger, the key centres occupied for so long by missionary leaders and the institutions they founded would have become progressively of less importance. In other areas of more rapid growth, centres like Sialkot, Gujrat, Darjeeling or Kalimpong became hubs round which were grouped anything up to six village pastorates. In Rajasthan, to the eleven centres occupied by 1905, there had been added sixty years later only five more pastorates. The Church had grown in size but hardly spread at all. The Mission station centre thus continued to play a part in its life which was unusual and unhealthy. (57)

The backbone of the Church for two successive generations was provided by the famine orphans who came under Mission care in the 1860's and 1890's. Without them there would hardly have been an organised Church at all. They supplied its leaders and workers as well as the rank and file of the new Christian community at Piploda. They also formed those vital links between isolated stations which gave the Church social cohesion. Yet if in the beginning they were docile and obedient, they were also responsible for much of the Church's lack of initiative and its dependent attitude. The outcaste who is a homeless orphan has that extra step to climb up the long ladder which leads to self-respect and confidence. It is not astonishing that with the third generation of Christians being brought forward for baptism missionaries were still complaining that it was hard to find workers who would not "deteriorate" without supervision. (58)

The bellicosity which marred the later years of the Church's history was /
not peculiar to Rajasthan but was visible here to an excessive degree. As elsewhere, it was a sign of small communities whose existence was of great importance to their members turning their eyes inwards. The climate possibly had something to do with it as well. Those familiar with the electric atmosphere of Rajasthan during the hot weather season recognise April as a danger month for irritable tempers, and recommend an armed truce until parties are able to meet in greater ease and comfort after the rains. And men whose sense of inferiority shows itself at first in unusual docility can at a later stage become aggressive, touchy and jealous over petty symbols of prestige. One question we shall be raising later is whether the Presbyterian form of church government was the best suited to dealing with such problems. (59)

A matter which is of minor importance but still some interest is the inclusion, in the membership of a Church roughly homogeneous in origin and steadily acquiring a bourgeois outlook, of the aboriginal Bhils near Udaipur. Their assimilation and further evangelisation present the Rajasthan Church with a real challenge. (60)

It is to be hoped that the Church will rise to this and the other challenges before it, for it is not in a happy or healthy condition. Conversions are rare and the lives of some so-called leaders give the Christian community a bad reputation. The hesitation on the Mission's part over going through with integration was due fundamentally to a fear that power was being sought, not a means of service, and that fear has unfortunately been justified. The rise of a new generation and a modification of the Presbyterian system, which may help to control factions and individuals, appear to promise, with God's grace, the best hopes of reformation. (61)

The Church In Santalia.

As the outstanding features of the situation of the Church in Santalia, we note this to be the only place in which converts came from a single social unit, in/
this case an aboriginal tribe, and that for two generations the Mission was a male,
lay and medical Mission.

The Santals never made up a majority of the population, being well outnumbered
by non-aboriginal peoples. Yet it was out of concern for them that the Mission
began and the Christian community which grew up was almost wholly of Santal origin.
More than in any other Scottish Mission area, there were reasonable hopes of a
community movement towards Christianity and of the adapting and transforming of a
local culture into indigenous Christian forms. (62)
Contacts were made through elementary schools but there was no attempt to
build up elaborate institutions. An experiment at founding a Christian village was
not repeated, it being thought better for Christian Santals not to be isolated from
their fellow. The most effective evangelism was natural evangelism, Christians
passing on the Good News to their relatives.

These were promising beginnings, and again there appears on the surface no
reason why a tribal movement should not have taken place as happened among animistic
groups in so many other parts of the world. (63)

If the Church was slow to develop on an independent basis (64), this is
something for which we are prepared when we remember how many of its converts were
illiterate and that the Christian community had to hold its own among better-educated
neighbours. What is much more puzzling is the fact that it grew so slowly, little
faster in fact than in many non-aboriginal areas.

Some peculiarities in the constitution of this Mission go a little way
towards accounting for this. Most important was the complete absence of ordained
missionaries. The Church was actually formed with no resident missionary licensed to
act as pastor, the training of the ministry was inevitably neglected and it was
not until 1936, after more than sixty years of work, that the first Santal pastor was/

NOTES.

(62) Pp. 513, 525 etc.
(63) Pp. 508-510 etc., see also V. E. W. Hayward, op. cit., the third depth study, "The
Church in the Kond Hills". The Konds are an Indian tribe of Dravidian origin living
in Orissa. (64) Pp. 513-515.
ordained. This does not mean that converts had gone shepherdless, for the medical and other lay missionaries had indeed acted as fathers-in-God and experienced evangelists, lacking only the seal of ordination, had been doing the work of pastors for years. In the eyes of the Mission authority those men fell far below the minimum standard of formal education required of a fully accredited pastor. Yet the dispersed nature of the community, scattered in small family groups along winding jungle trails, made shepherding a matter of great urgency. (65)

It is significant that signs of a genuine local revival came about with the direct challenge of a Santal divinity student, and that after the induction of Indian pastors the Church, which had up until then been content with its dependent status, showed a desire to stand on its own feet. (66)

Secondly, the development of medical work affected the shape of the Church. It provided a much needed and admirable piece of Christian service, and indeed in terms of suffering relieved, human hopes revived and Christian hands stretched out in love the work of the jungle hospitals is beyond praise. But as an evangelistic arm their success was small. This was not for lack of interest or effort in the propagation of the Gospel, but primarily because, as the medical missionaries kept explaining, they had far too much to do. "If the Indian medical missionary is in a rural Mission", reported Dr. Dyer in the 1890's, "he has most probably the whole work of the Mission on his shoulders—medical, school, pastoral, evangelistic, etc.—and cannot undertake without injuring the other and most important part of his work as an evangelist the heavy and anxious duties of hospital work. — The need therefore is for small hospitals. — If these are properly conducted, that is, if the European missionary takes the preaching— are a splendid means of preaching the Gospel." (67) Yet inevitably the number of patients coming to the hospitals kept steadily increasing.

Of greater import still, perhaps, was the fact that Santal patients were in

---

NOTES.

(66) Pp. 520, 524, 527.
(67) MS letter from Dr. Dyer, Pachamba, to Dr. Smith, dated 29.12.1891, S.M.L.
a small minority. "Missionary work among the sick is, if we except the Christian
and other Santals in the Mission, almost entirely confined to Hindoos and Mohammedans", wrote Dr. Dyer again, and expressed his wish that the scope of the Mission should be
broadened to include a planned approach to non-Santals. The Foreign Mission Committee
insisted that this must continue as a tribal Mission, however. Hospitals were
never directly responsible for many conversions and even as church-builders or
church-stabilisers their worth was questionable, local Christians coming to look on them as a perquisite rather than a challenge and responsibility. (68)

It was a third unusual characteristic of the Santal Mission that not
until after the second world war was a woman missionary appointed. Work among women
and girls was certainly done by missionaries' wives, but it was spasmodic and lacked
continuity. Any evidence here is of course negative evidence, and it is impossible
to say how the picture would have been altered had women missionaries appeared
earlier on the scene. Santal society was patriarchal and there was not the initial
barrier which might have been presented to an all-male Mission by a matriarchal
community. It was also an issue how the presence of women would be regarded
by people with a tribal background. Two sisters sent out by the Free Church's Women's
Missionary Society actually settled at Pachamba in the 1890's but strong protests
came immediately from the Santal Mission Council at the impropriety of such a move.
The Council pointed out that the juxtaposition of male missionaries and unmarried
ladies at the same station or even within a few miles of each other would do their
cause much more harm than good. (69) The ladies withdrew and in the circumstances
that was the only reasonable course. Yet this alone does not explain why two full
generations should pass before they had any successors, other tribal Missions having
faced and solved the same problem years earlier. Where female illiteracy was /

--

(68) MS letter from Dr. Dyer, Pachamba, to Mr. Young, dated 18.4.1882, S.N.L. pp.519 etc.
Folio 7843.
one hundred per cent, more concentration on the winning of women and the training of girls would certainly have paid dividends, the rapid emergence of women leaders from the mid-forties onwards revealing the presence of resources long untapped. (70)

It can be deduced that these factors, taken together, limited the spread of the Gospel where the Scottish Mission was at work and also delayed the Church's coming of age. The neighbouring Lutheran Mission, though with a larger staff, had gathered what was proportionately a larger community. (71) Yet these factors cannot be accepted as supplying the main explanation. There are many instances of smaller and much more limited Missions working among tribal groups having gathered churches ten times as large. The stumbling-block lay not in the Mission's methods but in the character of Santal society.

The key to the situation lies in the fact that the Santals were a minority and had survived because they were a resistant minority. True to the wider pattern, an animistic people had proved more responsive to the Christian message than their neighbours of a more advanced civilisation. Yet Santal society was not, like most other tribal societies, facing for the first time the pressures exerted by a different religion and an alien culture. It had already had to maintain its identity, and done so with success, against centuries of Hinduism, and had developed a certain immunity to foreign ideas. When confronted by the Christian message, it displayed once again its acquired powers of resistance. Hence occurred the unforeseen difficulty of getting headmen to take Christian vows and the unwillingness of villagers to follow them if they did. (72) It may still be asked why this particular tribe should have proved more able than others to withstand the influences of advanced religions. The fact that it is the largest aboriginal tribe in India,

---

NOTES.

(70) Pp.527,531.
(71) P.534.
(72) Pp.506,516.
numbering well over two millions, may provide part of the answer. But according to one experienced missionary the traditional emphasis on ancestor worship, which is very strong, may well be the key factor. (73)

The Church in the Eastern Himalayas.

In the Eastern Himalayas, as in Santalas, the Mission won most of its converts from among animistic tribesmen. From the point of view of the Hindu caste system these were peoples without standing, yet they did not regard themselves as inferior. While ignorant and superstitious, they possessed the sturdy natural pride of the hillmen, and, since their wants were simple, Christian communities were ready from the beginning to support themselves. (74)

But in contrast to Santalas the Mission was dealing here with not one but several aboriginal tribes divided from one another by barriers of language and terrain. The story of the Church has therefore largely been the story of its separate parts. Among the Boro people, who are plainsmen, an even more rapid advance was made. Unlike the Santalas, they had no acquired resistance to new ideas and because of regular employment in the tea gardens the economic struggle was less severe and self-support an easier goal to reach. The whole Church grew steadily in size; the 3,000 Christians of one generation’s work multiplying more than three times over within the next generation. Although in town centres, like Darjeeling and Kalimpong, Christian societies of the second generation became static, because of the growth which continued elsewhere there was no widespread second-generation recession. The urge towards self-propagation was strong, and the proximity of lands which were closed to Europeans helped to keep alive the sense of mission. (75)

Lack of education rather than poverty or lethargy slowed the Church’s advance towards autonomy, standards of literacy in some areas being even lower than those in Santalas. But much attention was given to the training of indigenous leadership.

NOTES.

(73) Information obtained through correspondence, etc.
(75) Pp. 541,550-1, 547,551-2, 564 etc.
the Mission's central institution being geared to this purpose and
looked on chiefly as a church-builder. It was consequently possible to ordain
the first group of Indian pastors less than thirty years after the founding of the
Mission, and although ministers were for many years to be supported by the Mission
rather than by the Church, national initiative was not squelched. (76)

Here as elsewhere the Church was overshadowed by the Mission, so that a
comparison could be drawn with a group of Lutheran Christians who came into the
area and set about supplying their own ordinances. Yet because the chief enemy was
ignorance and not another advanced religion, the long-term effects of European
paternalism were not too severe. The Mission was able to place the emphasis
on men rather than institutions. As a result of this, while the Church was unable
to take over the Mission's institutional work, its life was less dependent on it (77).
In addition, the gap between East and West, missionary and convert, was here so
wide that Western influences could be minimised. The first national pastors were
not "Indian missionaries" who spoke good English after having passed through a
college course. They did not wear European clothes and had not spent the last
few years living in the Mission house or compound. They were peasants still,
who walked the hills bare-foot, but ordained peasants who carried with them the aura
and status of leadership. Thus while there was no compromise with Indian ways of
living on the part of the missionaries and British residents were actively encouraged
to support and subsidise the infant Church, there did not develop among Indian
Christians the same attitudes of dependence, envy or resentment towards Western ways.
Due to the Church's long isolation and educational apprenticeship, integration has been
slow but the absence of tensions between missionary and national has helped to make/
its passage smoother. (78)

Among the Boro people of the Duars, the Church has almost reached the position where, as with the Chhuras round Sialkot, its fellowship is equivalent to that of the tribal community. But one direct result has been a "closed-shop" outlook, introducing the dangers of a caste church. (79)

Features of the Church's situation to which further attention must be given are first of all the fact that progress in Sikkim, a native State, has been much harder than in British-controlled territory. In the second place, we shall later take note of the "collegiate pastorate" system which has been adapted to suit the needs of the Duars congregations. (80)

The Church is in many respects the healthiest of those whose histories we have been studying, but is at the same time the most untried. As in its early adult years it emerges from isolation, it faces at once and the same time the challenge of Hinduism and Indian nationalism, the threat of invasion from across the Tibetan border and the implications of a Christianity which is world-wide(81).

The Four Churches.

The most significant fact which emerges from a comparison of these four rural churches is the danger of making too sweeping generalisations concerning missionary methods, mass movements or the most fruitful approach towards tribal communities.

The methods used in these four areas differed only in detail. The Punjab and Rajasthan were fields where missionaries faced very similar opportunities and problems, yet the development of the two churches took different lines. We may deduce that the start of a spontaneous movement depends much less than some theorists would have us believe on spiritual preparedness or an informed approach and much more on environmental factors, the dividing line between success and failure being /

NOTES.

sometimes a very narrow one. Nor can the element of mystery in the working of God's Spirit be ignored.

There was also much common ground in the conditions met with by the Santal and the Eastern Himalayan Missions. Theories which stress the importance of regarding men as members of an organic social unit point to the strength of churches which can be equated with a homogeneous tribal society. (82) This holds good so far as the Boro church is concerned, but not for the Santals, where tribal bonds were to prove more of a hindrance than a help. Developments in the Eastern Himalayas as a whole also show that when a primitive church is not homogeneous this does not necessarily hinder growth. This Church is possibly the best example in India of a multi-racial Christian society in which racial tensions have up to date been kept to a minimum.

The Santal and Eastern Himalayan fields also demonstrate the comparative effects on a Christian community of regular employment and economic advancement which are not dependent on Mission sources. In both cases regular wages led to a spirit of independence. But in Santalism, where men travelled to work in the mines, it had a disintegrating effect on the home and tribal life which disturbed Christians also. A small Church had difficulty in coping with the growing "materialism" of many of its members. In the Eastern Himalayas, on the other hand, where the Church was larger and men lived with their families, the regular incomes of tea-garden workers proved an aid to stability and autonomy. It has been seen that in urban Christian societies the urge to reach middle-class status led to communalism, the same trend being visible in a prospering community like that at Youngeonabad. Here is an illustration of how economic security in an expanding rural community can be a great advantage if the Church is in a position to control its effects. But when the Church is weak it can become a liability. (83)

A final comparison suggests some of the strengths and weaknesses of the /
Presbyterian system, which is at its best in an expanding or outward-looking church and at its worst when growth has come to a halt. In the former case its flexibility and the emphasis placed on voluntary leadership through lay elders is an aid to expansion and the acceptance of responsibility within local communities. In the latter case it leads not to apathy but to contentiousness and battles for power. Further consideration will be given to this in the following chapter.
CHAPTER XVII

SOME QUESTIONS OF POLICY

In the course of this study a number of questions have come up concerning missionary aims or major matters of policy in which many Missionary Societies were involved. On such questions Scottish Missions also had to make a choice or decide on the best plan of action. On other occasions the background or constitution of Scottish Missions played a part in determining the form taken by their activities. It will therefore be relevant to consider whether the policy of Scottish Missions, by any special emphasis, influenced the development and character of a church for better or for worse.

Among what appeared to be insurmountable obstacles, were there in fact some which a change of direction might have avoided? Were any golden opportunities lost? Or could the structure of a church have been strengthened by some simple act of obedience which was never offered?

These are hypothetical questions, of course, which cannot be answered with any exactitude. And to step into this arena is to confront issues some of which are still highly controversial. Yet they cannot be ignored entirely, for had the attitude of Scottish Missions towards them been different the history of the churches might well have taken another course. There are four points in particular where the wisdom of Mission policy may legitimately be called in question—namely its attitude towards "spontaneous expansion"; its emphasis on education; its doctrine of Church order; and its attitude towards mass conversions. We shall attempt to deal with each of these in turn.

1. Spontaneous Expansion

By "spontaneous expansion" is meant that theory of indigenous growth most clearly expounded by Roland Allen, in which it would be the aim of/
Western Missions to preach the Gospel and plant churches but exercise no authority over them. It was a fundamental axiom of this method that "spontaneous expansion must be free: it cannot be under our control." (1)

Under this heading we may place any serious attempt to plant a church which at a very early stage of growth would be able to stand independent of Mission support or control.

Among the churches we have been studying, there is really only one example which can be included in this category, that being Ferguson's effort to found an indigenous church at Chamba. It will be remembered that not only did his methods of evangelism strike an individual note but he also had distinctive theories concerning spontaneous growth which he did his best to put into practice. Ferguson was ahead of his time in insisting that Western structures and ideas should not be forced on an Eastern church and because he saw Christianity in terms of a society rather than as a system of beliefs and ethics. Within nine years, the management of its own affairs had been entirely taken over by the congregation under a type of organisation which adapted local usages and nomenclature. As we noted at the time, this was a definite departure from the policy accepted by most Missions, Ferguson's professed aim being obedience to New Testament models. It was the sole radical experiment of its kind to take place in one hundred and thirty years of missionary activity. (2)/

NOTES

2) pp.425-428
The experiment did certainly not commend itself to other Scottish Missions. This might be put down to prejudice, but was primarily because the Chamba Mission's lack of success failed to shake the confidence of other missionaries in their own more conservative approach. The Chamba congregation remained for two generations a more or less static community. No evidence was produced, as Ferguson had hoped, that Christians would of their own accord learn to baptise into Christ their ancestral customs and mode of life. And on the other hand there was serious backsliding among leaders as well as people. (3)

It must be admitted that a theory can not be judged on the strength of a single example. Again, supporters of the Roland Allen school of thought would undoubtedly point out that the Chamba experiment was never more than a half-way house. Ferguson founded a church which, though it achieved self-government at an early stage, was not self-supporting, still less self-propagating. It relied on paid Mission agents as its evangelists and self-control was therefore not followed by spiritual development or natural expansion.

Yet the Chamba church illustrates the fact that freedom from control is not enough and that by itself it can achieve very little. There must at the same time be freedom from influence and even from the temptation to lean. As Ferguson himself perceived, Mission support demoralises, but under the system adopted at Chamba the Mission, while disclaiming responsibility, continued to hover in the background. Thus the kind of "spiritual self-support" of which Roland Allen speaks as a mark of the Moslem religion never had an opportunity to develop. (4) This half-and-half arrangement did not prove satisfactory, for the church was neither wholly free nor adequately controlled. Its situation/

---

NOTES

3) Ibid.
4) Roland Allen, op. cit., p.49
also underlines the difficulties likely to be encountered by an isolated unit which is surrounded by a system working on a different principle. Had the Chamba church been able to make contacts with other churches working on similar lines, this might possibly have resulted in cross-fertilisation and a new lease of life. But once taken under the Mission's wing it quickly merged with the overall pattern to become just another small, out-of-the-way and not very enterprising group of Christians.

There were no other deliberate and informed attempts to found a church on indigenous lines. The principles of spontaneous expansion and freedom from control were never unfamiliar to missionaries, based as they were on the Acts of the Apostles. We found the Church of Scotland deputation of 1867-68 listening to arguments that it would be wiser and healthier for Indian converts to be allowed to form themselves into small communities and provide for keeping alive their common faith. (5) Ten years later the Punjab Conference was debating the advantages of a tent-making ministry. (6) And in 1928 the missionary at Kurseong remarked on the independent spirit of Lutheran groups from Chota Nagpur. (7)

Signs of spontaneous spiritual activity or individual initiative were welcomed in every field and of these there were many instances. At an early stage of its existence, the congregation in Kalimpong dedicated its own missionary to Nepal, a man who had agreed to work without salary. (8) /

NOTES

5) P.217
6) P.434
7) P.554
8) P.545
In Central India, the Rev. Sidoba Misal gave up a comfortable post as pastor under the Mission to open his own mission venture at Bhuswal. (9) An unbaptised boy from the Bhil home at Udaipur started a spontaneous movement among other members of his tribe. (10) And other examples of a similar nature could be cited.

Yet situations of this kind were not left to develop entirely on their own. Missionaries saw it as incumbent on them to follow up any new advantage or offer help when an individual venture came across difficulties. The Mission organisation was extended accordingly and it was the general opinion that such aid was essential. Experience had taught that when converts went unshepherded by the Mission they lapsed and reverted to paganism, as happened with the group near Dhapawada who were baptised by Hislop and rediscovered by John Douglas thirty years later. (11) Even trained workers were seen as apt to "deteriorate" when too far from Mission supervision. (12)

Once the Indian Church was established it continued to take much the same attitude. There was thus nothing unusual about the complaint of the Godavari Valley Council in the 1950's that congregations from which paid catechists were withdrawn tended to revert to Hinduism. (13)

The British Government, when called on by Gandhi to quit India and leave the country in the hands of God, refused to do so partly at least because of/
fear that anarchy would result. In very much the same way Scottish missionaries, like the majority of their European colleagues, were loath to leave any Christian effort to sink or swim on its own. When matters were unavoidably wrested from Mission hands, then the frail vessel of some isolated local venture might be commended to God's mercy alone. But such situations could not be artificially manufactured. Fundamentally, it was necessary to choose between two systems, one based on freedom and the other on control. These could not be matched under a double yoke and the second was invariably the method preferred and followed. The twentieth century was well advanced before some of the truths brought to light by Roland Allen began to sink in and Scottish Missions, with their neighbours, began to understand the distinction between "abandoning" a church and leaving Christians to learn by making their own mistakes.

The Emphasis on Education

A good deal has already been said about the importance which Scottish Missions placed on education as an agency, especially higher education. This was particularly the case with the Free Church Missions. Alexander Duff launched a tradition which was carried on partly because of its initial successes but also because it appealed to Scottish churchmen, with their strong intellectual bent and inherited respect for the power of learning.

On one point we need have no doubts, namely that the emphasis -- or over-emphasis -- was not accidental but a matter of deliberate choice. Scottish Missions did not drift into education but earmarked it as their/

NOTES

14) E.W.R. Lumby, "The Transfer of Power in India", p.32
15) See Roland Allen, op.cit., p.206
16) P.616
special arena. The option was clearly outlined by William Miller when he wrote in 1873,

"When the Scottish Church first planted Christ's banner upon Indian shores the practical question was whether effort should be put forth on the leading section of the population, though experience had shown that scarcely any influence over them, or indeed any access to their minds and feelings could be obtained, or whether attention should not rather be turned to those among whom work was easier and its results more rapidly apparent. The example of others was almost universally in favour of the latter of these two alternatives — it was what may be termed an intricate problem in spiritual strategies. For the great ultimate result of the conversion of that land to Christ, the course that had come to be adopted certainly might be and probably for the time it was the best. At all events, it was a course eminently capable of defence and it has already produced results of which the Church of Christ might well be proud, if pride were not swallowed up in adoring thankfulness to God."(17)

While the majority of Missions thus found their attention being directed to the conversion of the outcasts, however, at the time when Scottish Missions were being planted missionaries believed God to be opening a way into the Hindu section of the community. "It appeared to our Church that there was thus a divine call to use this desire (for education) as a means of bringing the Hindu mind face to face with the truth that God has revealed to men."(18)

Miller pointed out that there was no question of Scottish policy being guided by the shallow notion that education was necessary for spiritual life. He argued that where only one Protestant missionary was available to preach/

NOTES

17) William Miller, "Indian Missions and How to View Them", p.13
18) Ibid., p.16
to every half-million of the population a fundamental law of Christ's
Kingdom -- that it was like the seed growing secretly -- was one to which
missionaries were bound to give attention. Already the change in Hindu
thought and feeling gave evidence that God's Spirit was at work and the
Scottish Church right in its individual choice. (19)

Yet behind this preference there always lay, as we have had occasion to
note, certain assumptions and provisos. In the first place, the educational
method was regarded as a variation of the New Testament approach, not a
substitute for it. Miller described as totally false "the supposition that
the apostolic methods had been fundamentally improved upon and there was a
sort of attempt to make the church grow out of the school." (20)

Secondly, it was tacitly assumed that whatever approach was used, the
triumph of Christ's cause would be a slow business. "For years, for a
generation or two, the work is chiefly or altogether of a preparatory kind." (21)
Missionaries had therefore to reassure themselves about the silent working of
the leaven and the invisible growth of the seed.

Thirdly, a reasonable case could be made out by the Free Church at least
that the inspiration and success of educational work was in great measure
responsible for the rise of missionary enthusiasm at home. "In 1863",
 wrote William Miller again, "The Free Church of Scotland had only two
Scottish missionaries in Southern India; where it had formerly had, and meant
to have always, at least five or six, and where it had work enough for more.
This was not because the means of support had failed -- it was mainly because
man's hearts had grown cold to a work which was but little understood. /

NOTES

19) Ibid., pp.14-19
20) William Miller, "Educational Agencies in Missions", 1893, p.12
21) F.C. Report, 1867, p.105
"In recent years, since the Church had begun somewhat adequately to understand the work taken up in India, there have been fourteen European missionaries occupying what is practically the same ground which two were struggling to maintain thirty years ago. Ten of these have been carrying on the work of Christian education on the lines traced out in the beginning and there is no longer any difficulty in keeping up their number. There has begun to be a competition among eligible men — not of the Free Church of Scotland alone — as to who shall be appointed when a vacancy occurs..... The remaining four of the fourteen who have been at work in recent years have no connection with educational agencies. They are meant to do the work to which such agencies are auxiliary and to take their share in forming a Church in India 'through the foolishness of preaching'. They are meant to build on the foundations which Christian education has been laying ..... "It is not maintained that the remarkable change is wholly due to the better understanding of the function of Christian education, Other causes have been at work which it would be irrelevant to touch on here. But it is certain that the chief cause is the one I have mentioned. The experience of all the Scottish Missions which follow the path marked out by Dr. Inglis has been substantially the same. The better apprehension of their principles and function which began to gain ground some twenty years ago has been accompanied by a steady increase in the number of fit men who are glad to join them, and by increasing interest in their work."(22)

Lastly, it was demonstrated two chapters earlier that if there was a tendency on the part of enthusiastic professors to regard a College as indispensable, that was a different thing from calling it self-sufficient. Educationists took it as axiomatic that their efforts must be supplemented/

NOTES

by those of evangelists and cultivators of the harvest. To quote Miller yet once more,

"Here is the present great need of Scottish Missions in India — an agency for the direct, systematic simple Gospel effort among those who have already, through our own instrumentality, been brought somewhat under Gospel influences and fashioned in their thoughts and character somewhat on a Christian model. Until this want is supplied, I at least shall never look on Scottish Missions as complete."(23)

This might be sound theory, but we observed that it hardly worked out so well in practice. By any standards, it was a one-sided arrangement to have fourteen out of seventeen missionaries engaged on educational work, and it has already been suggested that by concentrating on the larger section of the Indian population, the caste Hindus, Scottish Missions enriched the Church as a whole while impoverishing their own immediate outreach.(24)

It was a parallel and contributing result that while the Colleges undoubtedly attracted to the Mission fields men of exceptional calibre, they also absorbed much of the best brains and energy. Where an Anglican missionary of ability might end up as the bishop of a diocese, in the Scottish Mission organisation he became the Principal of a university college. Although there were exceptions to this, one cannot fail to see the centralising of the best minds in the colleges. As a result, creative thinking followed the line of the Christian approach to the Hindu, usually the educated Hindu. This was highly commendable in itself, but the balance of effort was poor.

There were indeed one or two notable scholars, such as J.M. MacFie of Ajmer, who remained "district missionaries" throughout their period of/

---

NOTES

23) William Miller, "Indian Missions and How to View Them", p.32
24) pp.652-3
service. J.H. Maclean of the Madras Mission was another with a penetrating mind whose influence in the field of church union extended far beyond the bounds of his own denomination. Yet the publications of such men were not intended to be popular or original. (25) The pioneers and leaders of missionary thought were all men concerned with the communication of the Gospel rather than the building of the Church. Principal Urquhart of the Scottish Church College wrote with clarity and learning on Hindu philosophy. (26) Principal John MacKenzie of Wilson College discoursed on Hindu ethics and their relation to Christianity. (27) And Principal A.G. Hogg of the Madras Christian College delivered his Duff lectures on "The Christian Message to the Hindu". (28) Niccol Macnicol, who spent the greater part of his service in Poona, was only an apparent exception to this rule. A first-rate scholar and an irrepressible enthusiast with a versatile mind, his forte also was the interpretation of the East and the West to each other and his chief interest the evangelism of the educated Hindu. (29)

Without in any way seeking to minimise the value of the contributions made by such men, we may recognise that their predominating interest was always apologetic. It was not until the 1940's that in Lesslie Newbigin --/

**NOTES**

25) J.M. MacFie was quite a noted oriental scholar about the 1920's. Among his better-known works are "Myths and Legends of India", "A Summary of the Maharashtra", "The Ramayana of Valmiki", etc.

26) W.S. Urquhart's best-known works were "Pantheism and the Value of Life", "Theosophy and Christian Thought", "The Vedanta and Modern Thought", and Humanism and Christianity".

27) After his "Hindu Ethics", John MacKenzie's major work is "Two Religions".

28) Among other books written by A.G. Hogg are "Christ's Message of the Kingdom" and "Redemption from this World".

29) Niccol Macnicol was a prolific writer. "India in the Dark Wood", "Indian Theism", "The Making of Modern India" and "Psalms of the Maratha Saints", are his best-known books.
himself an Englishman — Scottish Missions produced a dogmatic theologian who was also a pastor of souls. By this time the ecumenical age was well advanced and Newbigin's ideas were not concerned with the policy or future of Scottish Mission work in particular. So while these Missions produced a Duff, a Miller, a J.A. Graham and a Nicol Macnicol — each a creative and influential man in his sphere and generation — they never threw up a Nevius. One senses the lack of such a single directing mind intent on the building of Christian churches. It is a matter of moment that two such distinguished College Principals as A.G. Hogg and John MacKenzie should both confess towards the end of their period of service that if they had their time again they would give more attention to the place and work of the Church. (30)

The Presbyterian Order

Scottish Missions took the normal course of reproducing their own form of church government. It is obviously a relevant question whether Presbyterianism had any particular effect, beneficial or otherwise, on the young churches raised.

Scottish missionaries were never fanatical about this, but often had strong convictions about the Scriptural basis and working value of the Presbyterian order. We remember J.H. Maclean, an ardent champion of church union, remarking with gratification on how the S.I.U.C., with its small ex-Presbyterian minority, was yet gradually adopting Presbyterian practices. (31)

It has been seen, however, that loyalty to the Presbyterian tradition was subsidiary to the propagation of the Gospel, the growth of the Church and the promotion of Christian unity. By the 1860's, missionaries and nationals alike were speaking in terms of an Indian Church which would be/

---

**NOTES**

30) Information obtained through interview with Dr. William Stewart.

31) P.594.
supra-denominational. And while the earlier moves towards unity were within the Presbyterian family, Scottish Mission churches in both South and North India had united with Congregationalists before the mending of the Presbyterian schism in Scotland. (32)

We may therefore make the point that, while the Presbyterian form of government was indeed introduced, it was never insisted on as a permanent feature. Its essential elements were retained but as part of a wider structure.

In the second place, even where, within the Indian Church, forms of worship and administration were subject to a minimum of outside influence -- as was the case where a Scottish Mission had the field to itself -- those forms were always modified according to the needs of the people and their environment. Missionaries working in Santal in the 1880's wished the Bengal Presbytery to license elders to administer the Sacraments, explaining that thus Presbyterianism would be most easily adapted to the wants of village congregations. A much later example comes from the Eastern Himalayas, where the Church of Scotland Mission found itself working without partners, and where in the 1950's the Church Council was declining to elect women elders because of the home Church's refusal to make such an innovation. (33) Yet in spite of its conservative attitude on that issue, the Council put into operation in the Duars an original joint-pastorate system admirably suited to local conditions. This experiment did not contradict Presbyterian principles, but neither was it a deliberately planned interpretation of them. It was rather a development which arose out of the demands of the situation. (34)/

---

NOTES

32) Pp. 588, 593, 601
33) Pp. 514, 570, with information supplied by the Rev. J. H. Brodie.
34) p. 566.
Where Missions were thicker on the ground denominational customs grew thoroughly confused. In South India, where the mixture is very evident, the writer heard an educated Christian speak with feeling about the simplicity of the old Presbyterian tradition in comparison with Anglican ritual: in particular he liked the way in which Presbyterian congregations repeated together the words of the General Confession and the General Thanksgiving!(35)

The truth is that, within the limits of Protestantism, it made little difference to Indian churches what tradition they had been reared in, it being a commonplace of missionary history that the non-Roman Missions, in spite of their differences of order and traditions, all developed along the same general lines.(36) For the young Indian church, the Mission-Church relationship was a factor of much greater importance than the original form of government with which it might have been endowed. High schools, orphanages and village dispensaries counted for more than the historic episcopate, the parity of the ministry, believers' baptism or the principle of independency, and the former were things possessed by all churches in common. The Jerusalem and Tanjore Conferences made it abundantly clear that denominational ties were of little matter compared with the bonds which secured a Church and a Mission to each other.(37) The missionary, whether he was a bishop, a moderator of Presbytery, a Methodist Superintendent or the supervisor of a group of Congregational churches, tended in fact to be the head of the church in that area. Denominational labels were thus largely irrelevant. And as Azariah confided to his fellow Indians on a South India negotiating committee/

NOTES

35) Repetition is understandably a common feature of worship among literate or semi-literate communities. Translations of the General Confession and General Thanksgiving from the Book of Common Prayer were included in the suggested Order of Service produced by the E.I.U.C. in the 1930's, and came into general use, especially in villages where worship was conducted by a layman.

36) See B. Sundkler, op.cit., pp.23 ff.: Latourette, Vol.VI, p.189

37) See pp.25 ff.
matters of church order were not to them of first importance. (38)

Thus while Church of Scotland Missions, when it came to the point of a wider union, played their part in passing on the essentials of Presbyterian policy, so far as the character of their churches are concerned, most would have turned out little different had they stemmed from some other tradition. Presbyterianism as such was not a major moulding element.

But to this central observation a rider must be added, to the effect that Presbyterianism did not fit easily into Indian conditions. It is true that the Scottish tradition of the ruling elder as a member of the Kirk Session and the Indian system of the Panchayat, or court of five elders, had strong affinities. But at any but the local levels Presbyterianism, like democracy, is a highly advanced form of government and it is questionable how far, again like democracy, it can put its roots into Indian soil. The type of movement towards Presbyterian practices which was remarked on by J.H. Maclean is in fact interpreted by Sundkler as a gradual shift towards the acceptance of a centralised authority. (39) It could also be described as a natural preference for the authority of a society over the will of the individual.

But the authority of a society has in Indian as in other cultures traditionally been invested in an individual -- the king or priest who represents society in the performance of particular functions. About him there have been woven systems of ceremony and ritual which are full of colour and meaning. Again, in India at least, even where the outward trappings of power were missing, as was the case with the religious teacher or guru, his moral authority, like that of the Old Testament prophet, was held in high regard. Thus while Presbyterianism expressed the cohesion and interdependence of Indian society better than the individualism of the Congregational/ 

---

NOTES

38) P.597

39) B. Sundkler, op. cit., p.40
system, the personal hierarchy of an episcopal church was as easily accepted and there was more to be said for a bishop than a supreme committee. The respect and affection given to a bishop had little dogmatic content, but it expressed the ordinary Christian's satisfaction at having represented in such a figure the authority, guidance and blessing of the Church. Like most people, the Indians also love a show and a bishop, like royalty, provides a touch of excitement to break the monotony. Indian Congregations of the Church of South India reared in the Presbyterian tradition, when asked whether they would prefer new communicant members to be admitted by the pastor or confirmed by the bishop, would invariably plump for the bishop. Yet while enjoying the impressiveness and bustle of the bishop's visit, they would freely admit the meaning of either service to be identical.

This is to do no more than point out that, like the majority of peoples, Indians have always been symbol-loving rather than Puritan in their emphasis. Hence Presbyterian austerity is by itself rather lacking in appeal. On the other hand, symbols are seldom invested with such solemn significance as is done in the West, neither are they shored up by such complicated intellectual arguments. The intricacies of Hindu philosophy might suggest the opposite, yet here again it is never the intellect which reigns supreme. "The Indian has always stressed bhakti (i.e. faith) and feels that through faith in God his highest feelings can be expressed rather than through dogma." (40)

This is relevant when it comes to any question of church order. Systems of order in the West have been founded on dogmatic grounds, but have then gone on to harden into specific forms of ecclesiastical administration. Professor Eddy Asirvatham speaks for his fellow-countrymen when he says that the Indian church must refuse to magnify the institution of the Church as the West has done. He points out that efficient administration, if not balanced by spiritual qualities, may spell the Church's undoing and warns Christians/

NOTES

40) Quoted B. Sundklar, op. cit., pp. 205-206
against the Western sins of excessive ceremonialism, sacerdotalism and ecclesiasticism. (41) This confirms that the processes of union which have already taken place reflect for Indian Christians what is a natural trend, that the Indian churches will continue to dislike exclusive ideas and that they are likely to gravitate towards a highly flexible system of church order.

At the local and practical level, we must note before leaving this subject that there appear to have been places and occasions where the Presbyterian system proved inadequate. The Scottish tradition of the "free call", which was adopted with modifications by Indian Church Councils (42), could lead in the context of a small number of inter-connected communities to increasing stagnation.

Note was taken of the Rajasthan Church Council's difficulties in getting their pastors to move and other Councils met with the same problem. (43) Indeed Rajasthan, while it had no monopoly of congregational disputes, demonstrates better than any other field a vulnerable point in the Presbyterian armour. A bishop would not necessarily have been successful in reconciling contending parties and keeping trouble-makers in check, but he would have had a better chance of doing so than a series of church committees.

This is not an argument for the superiority of the episcopal system, for any study of the Anglican Church overseas will reveal other weaknesses just as glaring. Christians of the Tinnevelly Diocese of the Church of South India, who were mainly people of the Nadar caste gathered in by the S.P.G. Mission, were far less quarrelsome than their brethren in Rajasthan. Yet in the 1960's it was reported of them that, though an able people, they had become/

---

NOTES

41) Eddy Asirvatham, "Christianity in the Indian Crucible", pp.159-162
42) See William Stewart, "The Church and its Ministry", pp.72-73
43) P.49C; "Stationing Committees" are among the most unpopular of most Council committees.
ingrown and lazy: their bishop ruled supreme, even to the extent of signing every order for the posting of a teacher: and their impact on the surrounding communities was negligible. (44)

Weaknesses cannot therefore be blamed on a particular denominational system. Yet particular systems encourage certain weaknesses and it is likely that Rajasthan, the most militantly Presbyterian of all Scottish Mission areas, might have borrowed with most benefit the grace of another tradition.

Mass Movements

A mass movement towards Christianity was what every missionary in India hoped for, prayed for and worked towards. It was the purpose behind Duff's founding of an institution whose teaching might help to blow Hinduism sky-high. In face of the shortage of missionaries, it provided the driving force behind William Miller's argument for his Mission's concentration on the educational method. And among those engaged in more direct methods of evangelism it was the accepted criterion of success. All alike were waiting for the troubling of the waters.

Mass movements varying in size had been known in the past and continued to take place from time to time, and missions which had to fight for each individual convert tended to become restless when they saw their neighbours gathering in sheaves by the armful. In the 1860's, some Church of Scotland missionaries started complaining about their own lack of progress when compared with the success of Anglicans in Timnevelly and demanded a change of approach. (45)

NOTES

44) "Conference", Aug. 1962, p.3.
45) P.215
A wave of new enthusiasm began to sweep over missionary supporters in Scotland when with the 1880's Missions began to report at last that whole groups of people and not just individuals were coming into Christ's fold. The building up of a new church among the Manges round Jalna and the spreading of the Gospel among the Chuhras in the Punjab provided for the Free Church and the Church of Scotland respectively a new ray of hope. The possibility of similar movements in South India, round Chingleput and Arkanam, in Santal and later further North among the Boros, kept missionaries in other fields hoping that in God's good time, if they continued to watch and pray and labour, their turn would come. Experience showed that while spontaneous movements could not be foreseen, they took as their starting-point the patient work of earlier years and once under way could exceed all expectations. "When I wrote the other day I suggested that we might have nearly 200 new Christians in the next few days", reported the Duare chaplain near the end of the first world war. "To my amazement, we actually had 248 names given in and were told of another 50 or 20 or yet another 18 which were likely to be ready for giving in at an early date. I simply don't understand it. I suppose we are gathering in some fruits of the labour of past years, but there is more to it than that --- So far as my experience goes we are being carried forward on a tide which must be taken at the flood."(46) District missionaries never ceased to hope that such an experience might at any time be repeated in their own area.

It appears strange, then, that when late in the 1920's and into the 1930's a much more widespread movement away from Hinduism on the part of the depressed classes began to gather force in many parts of the country, and when whole villages and groups of villages were expressing a wish to become Christians,

NOTES

46) MS letter from F. Milne, Duars Manse, Jalpaiguri, to Mr. Maclachlan, dated 25.10.13, S.N.L.
many missionaries showed themselves suspicious. Before 1930 it was estimated that one half of all Roman Catholic Christians in India and as many as four out of every five Protestants were the product of mass conversions. (47) And as the trend continued, the proportion increased. Yet the acceptance of hundreds of thousands who came to Christianity as part of a social group became a highly controversial issue and Scottish missionaries were among those most critical of the whole movement.

The champion and interpreter of mass movements, the Methodist Episcopal Bishop J.W. Pickett, refers in his classic study of the phenomenon to critics who complained about the mixed motives of those coming into Christianity as part of a social group. He then goes on to argue that the motives of a group are not necessarily more confused than those of an individual. (48) The objections actually quoted by Pickett at this point were put forward by two Anglicans, Bishops V.S. Azariah and Henry Whitehead. But among Church of Scotland missionaries we find similar ideas being expressed. "The Church of Christ can never be enriched or strengthened by adding to itself great multitudes of the unevangelised. History has taught us this lesson very plainly" warns the editor of "Conference" in 1936. (49)

But other Scottish voices were raised in encouragement and there were many who agreed with Bishop Pickett's basic contention that "individual conversion is at its best when there is a movement of the group. There is more chance of spiritual renewal and spiritual growth when the spiritual/

---

NOTES

48) Ibid.
49) "Conference", Nov. 1936, p.61
tissues have not suffered from a drastic surgical operation." District missionaries watched eagerly for any hint of group enquiries and some, like the Arkonan missionary, lamented that for lack of volunteer evangelists among those already converted the movement away from Hinduism was not leading more villages to Christ. (50)

The fear of admitting by baptism great masses of men and women who had received little previous instruction and had little hope for many years to come of getting proper spiritual care and teaching was a very natural one. This had been the method adopted in an extreme form by Loyola's great lieutenant, Francis Xavier, in the sixteenth century among the Paravas of the Coromandel Coast. Thousands were baptised but as Xavier and his fellow missionaries were ignorant of their language the difficulties of giving instruction were very great. So while through the work of Xavier's successors the Parava Church survived and grew, this type of indiscriminate baptism was not repeated by later Roman Catholic missionaries (51) and appeared especially repugnant to evangelical Protestants.

There was also a certain amount of truth in the common accusation that a mass movement among one caste led to a caste church. "Is there not a danger for the future of the Church of such emphasis on the group as a passage-way into the Church? Will not group sentiment, exploited in the best sense in the catechumens, persist in the members?" enquires a Scottish Missionary. (52) Such a danger certainly existed and we have seen symptoms of the caste or tribal attitude among Boros, Santais and others. (53)

---

NOTES

52) "Conference", April 1938, p.3.
53) P.243
Yet it is better to take risks than to miss opportunities. The mass movements among Chuhras in the Punjab did not stop caste conversions (54), and a stratified Christian community is superior to no community at all.

It is apparent that among Scottish Missions, city-based missionaries in particular took up a rather defensive attitude towards the mass movements of the 1930's. Hints were dropped in various places that rather than waste time working with large institutions, Missions would be better to concentrate on more fruitful work among the "approachable" communities. (55) Educational missionaries reacted to the one-sidedness of this outlook, which among other things ignored the role of Christian education in helping to stir up the ferment among the depressed classes. In consequence they themselves failed to perceive the significance of what was happening.

It is further true that while common-sense was enough to convince any missionary of the value of converts coming into the Church within communities that remained intact, few leaders recognised how much more this meant to Indians than to themselves. Protestant "gathered church" convictions made it difficult for them to see how deeply the existence of others was sunk in their social organism. (56) Sociology, social psychology and anthropology with their new insights were still in the juvenile stage of development, the group conversions and "people movements" which were taking place did not fit easily into New Testament categories and there was always a sneaking sense of guilt at what one missionary described as "an almost idolatrous regard for numbers." (57)

---

NOTES

54) P.436
55) "Conference", April, 1933, p.3
56) Consult e.g. Donald McGavran, "How Churches Grow", pp.20-24
57) J.W. Pickett, op.cit., p.156
Accordingly a question asked concerning Dr. Pickett's complaints about cold water — "Do we have in the experience of the Church of Scotland Missions in India examples of the discouragement of movements among the depressed classes such as Dr. Pickett has met with in his researches?" plainly expects the answer, "No." (58) Yet even if there was no positive discouragement, the attitude was often lukewarm rather than enthusiastic.

Having made this point, we must then go on to add that Dr. Pickett, in his enthusiasm, often over-stated his case and exaggerated contrasts. By his own definition, eighty per cent of most Scottish Mission churches were the result of group movements, and Scottish missionaries disliked the "either-or" outlook which starkly opposed individual to group conversions. (59)

The district missionaries working within or on the fringes of areas where mass movements took place, even if they were not trained sociologists or anthropologists, usually acquired a fair working knowledge of their people's mentality and were conversant with their history and environment. An example is the Rev. A. Andrew, who took up district work in Chingleput in the 1880's. (60) While demonstrating that he was well aware of the mixed motives with which outcastes were coming forward as enquirers, he did not for that reason turn them away. (61) And a 26-page pamphlet produced by him on the economic and social conditions of the depressed classes of the Madras Presidency provides evidence that he both understood their background and sympathised with their aspirations. (62) Such men — and Andrew had his opposite number in every field — were eager to foster any genuine mass movement, knowledgeable enough/

---

**NOTES**

58) "Conference", April 1938, p.3

59) Ibid.

60) P.362


to have some appreciation of its origins and normally sensible enough not to be stampeded.

With Scottish Missions, in fact, the main caveat was not against the admission of large numbers but against admitting converts without adequate instruction beforehand and provision for aftercare. The movement round Jalna was thus deliberately checked with the aim of building up Christian knowledge and spiritual life. (63) This was sound in principle, but vitiated by the need to rely on paid workers to do the shepherding. It was a typical complaint — "We could go ahead almost without limit to the number of baptisms — but who is to edify?" (64)

We learnt that Scottish missionaries in the Punjab were demanding a minimum standard on Christian fundamentals at least as high as those of their fellow-Presbyterians and there again the rate of advance was regulated by the Mission's ability to teach and shepherd. "Scores of villagers would become Christians if we could teach them", explained the Sialkot missionary. (65)

Group movements, where they occurred, were therefore treated with considerable caution. On the other hand, where they did not occur on any large scale, missionaries were sometimes apt to give in to wishful thinking. This happened in the Nagpur area, which was the headquarters of Dr. Ambedkar's Harijan movement, over enquirers from the small town of Hinghanghat. (66)

Still commoner were the occasions on which whole villages had to be suspended or removed from the roll for reverting to pagan practices. This happened to Sambhar village, near Jaipur, in 1911, and was undoubtedly due to the fact that the Mission was prepared to accept a group rather than insist/

NOTES

63) P. 296
64) P. 293
65) P. 430
66) P. All and information obtained through correspondence.
on individual conversions.(67)

We may conclude by saying that because of their strong stake in education Scottish Missions were much slower than they might have been in coming to accept the full implications of mass movements. We find strong negative evidence for this in the fact that the Survey Commission of 1932, whose report was presented to the General Assembly in 1935, dealt in detail with district work, the training of leaders, elementary and higher education, medical work, women's work and co-operative enterprises. Yet while group movements towards Christianity on the part of Indian outcasts were then at their height, no specific reference is made to them. This suggests an insufficient grasp of their significance.(68)

NOTES

67) P. 483

CHAPTER XVIII

THE INDIAN CHURCHES TODAY.

The Scottish Mission churches as they are now constituted cannot be treated either as one single unit or as individual units. While all retain their Scottish connection, they are integral parts of the United Church of Northern India or the Church of South India and have grown, changed and contributed to changes as those bodies have developed. Yet this study would be incomplete without some attempt to portray them within the larger setting. And since it has become apparent that the character of those churches does not greatly differ from that of churches reared in other Protestant traditions with which they are now united, we may conclude by looking at their situation. Using the categories introduced in the first chapter, which are the product of successive insights into the needs and nature of the Church, we shall ask how those Churches stand with regard to their autonomy, their indigenous character and their sense of responsibility.

1. The Autonomy of the Churches.

The United Church of Northern India and the Church of South India are in principle as autonomous as any other organised branch of the Church Universal, always remembering our definition of autonomy as not absolute independence but freedom under Christ's rule. (1)

Yet in practice independence is always limited by a variety of human factors. The first of these would appear in this instance to be the size of these Churches, or more precisely their lack of it. "Humanly speaking, the Church in revolutionary Asia is indeed in a desperate situation", writes Hans Ruedi-Weber, "The whole Christian community forms in Asia today not much more than 3% of the total population. Moreover, in most areas /

NOTES.

(1) Beyerhaus, p.112. See p.54.
the birth rate far outstrips the conversion rate and exactly in those areas where the Church meets the now Asia — in Communist China, in industrial Japan and North India — the Christian minority forms less than 1% and it lives in an extreme form of diaspora." (2) There is not one of the former Scottish Mission areas where the Church's position as a very small minority has not had a great effect on its development.

Yet while we can recognise that the smallness and scattered nature of the churches appears from the human point of view a severe handicap, and while we can at the same time acknowledge that such lack of strength might be a judgment on lack of zeal or unwillingness to follow the guidance of God's Spirit, Christians can hardly put forward want of numbers as an excuse for other kinds of inadequacy. The Lord saw no reason for Elijah to withdraw because the prophets of Baal who opposed him were four hundred and fifty in number, Christ sent eleven men out to turn the world upside down and Christians must always accept that God may choose to save by the few rather than the many. In other words the Church's numerical weakness must be seen, as William Stewart rightly points out, in the nature of a challenge rather than a handicap. (3) If the overall average of Christians in the areas occupied by the United Church of Northern India and the Church of South India is something like two per cent, then these are the conditions in which Christians there are being required to witness. Fellow believers in a more fortunate position may have sympathy with them and do everything in their power to support them. Yet the situation, however desperate in human terms, is one that has been common in Christian history and out of such challenges there have come in the past great triumphs.

NOTES.
(3) W. Stewart, "India's Religious Frontiers", p. 108.
Much more serious are the limitations which have definitely been imposed on the Churches by the nature of their inheritance from parent Missions. These have not only helped to shape the Churches but continue to guide their policy and influence their character.

Those limitations have been described many times and in much detail. Here for the sake of brevity we may adopt the simple analysis presented to the first Asian Christian Conference in Malaya. (4)

The first limitation on autonomy springs from the fact that Western Missions relied so heavily on a professional agency which they themselves paid and controlled. In this respect Scottish Missions worked on traditional lines. As a result the basic pattern of the Church became not congregational but organisational. "The original units of missionary thinking were not congregations and dioceses and presbyteries" says Newbigin, "They were mission stations and out-stations. The effect of this has been that the reality of the congregation as the basic unit of Christian existence has not really been grasped -- the result will be that distressing attitude of dependence -- which we so often deplore in our churches.... This also produces a further effect of tremendous importance. A Church so based does not become self-propagating." (5)

We may go further than Newbigin does here and emphasise once again that not even the diocese or presbytery but the local congregation is the basic Christian unit. In his comparison of three churches in Nigeria, among the Bataks of Sumatra and in Korea, Beyerhaus points out how the /

---

NOTES:


(5) Ibid., pp.26-27.
Anglican and German Lutheran missionaries working among the first two bodies regarded the central organisation rather than the local congregation as "the church". The American Presbyterians in Korea, on the other hand, not only called the local congregations "churches" but entrusted them with the bulk of the Church's activities. Thus while the forty ordained missionaries of the Presbyterian Church of North America, working among a population of six to seven millions, were concentrated in eight stations, Korean elders and office-bearers were given real responsibility from the beginning. Congregations were thus always living cells and growing points. (6)

The situation was much simpler in Korea than in India, where Hinduism offered much sterner opposition. The depressed classes which came to form the bulk of the Christian communities had been deprived of their independence for so long that it took several generations for them to learn confidence and self-respect. Yet the criticism still stands. We saw that in the city Missions caste converts with a good standard of education might be trained and ordained to the ministry within ten or twelve years of the Mission's establishment, but they went on to become "missionaries", not servants of the Church. In the country areas it was a long time before congregations were given responsibility. In the Eastern Himalayas a generation passed before pastors were ordained, in Santalia two generations. Control was centralised on the missionary and exercised by catechists and teachers and autonomy therefore took the form of exhortations towards financial self-support rather than an actual transfer of authority and responsibility.

It is only in recent years that the Indian Churches have learnt to /

NOTES.

(6) Beyerhaus, pp.120, 152-3.
rely less on an administrative system taken over from the Missions and to nurture the essentials of Christian life in local communities by simpler methods.

J.E.L. Newbigin, at that time Bishop of Ramnad in the Church of South India, describes a visit to a "congregation" consisting of six families of a leather-workers' community which had never had the advantage of a mission school or a paid mission teacher. Their leader was a volunteer who had lately finished a month's course at a theological seminary and possessed just enough education to be able to read the Bible and conduct a Sunday Service. In his spare time he cared for the members of his flock. "This is the kind of thing which convinces me beyond all doubt that the Church has taken root", Newbigin concludes. "I suppose that much of our more impressive work could easily be swept away. But I do not think that what I saw this morning could be blown away: it is so close to the ground." (7)

This picture of a Church as a Body in which each cell, however small, should contain the essential elements of life and self-propagation, raises important issues concerning the ministry. And arising from the needs of Christian groups such as that described above there has been much discussion about the nature of the ministry, whether it should be full-time or part-time, paid or unpaid, educated or if necessary only semi-literate. (8)

The situation is at present fairly fluid. It is one of the positive/

NOTES.

results of church union and -- in the case of North India -- the negotiations leading up to it, that the varieties of approach and dogma which until now have differentiated forms of the ministry in Protestant denominations have for all practical purposes been resolved. The vital question is no longer whether God's Spirit is channelled through the medium of a bishop, a Presbytery or on occasion an unordained village teacher, but how the Word and Sacraments are to be made regularly available to those tiny groups of Christians who make up in their thousands the individual cells of the Body. It is largely towards this end that such stress has lately been laid on lay training, for those being trained are not "church workers" of the kind familiar to the West, with its close-knit and comprehensive ecclesiastical framework. They are men like the leader from the leather-workers' village.

Under the old Mission regime that place was usually occupied by the paid catechist or teacher, whose salary would as often as not be government-aided. But we saw that even where congregations took upon themselves from the beginning the responsibility for erecting and maintaining their own buildings -- as happened with the Nepalis and Lepchas round Kalimpong -- they tended to look on the Mission workers as their private property. And when the Mission proved unable to keep up its former quota of workers, the pastoral system started straining at the seams. Moreover it was quite impossible for either Mission or Church to extend such a system indefinitely as the Church expanded.

Leaders in the Church of South India and the United Church of Northern India have been keenly aware of the weaknesses of the old system and also of

NOTES.

(9) Pp. 543-455.
the gaps left in places to which it does not extend. It is recognised that many village congregations, though by definition centres of Christian witness and service, are in fact dependent for pastoral care on occasional visits from outside. They are spiritually undernourished and only receive spasmodic ministration of the Word and Sacraments.

The Church of South India has gone furthest towards meeting the challenge by suggesting that the key to the pastoral care of village congregations is to be found in the ordination of a Presbyter (i.e. pastor) who is a voluntary servant of the Church but follows his normal secular employment.

"The first aim in establishing the New Pattern", runs a paper read by Bishop Whittaker to the C.S.I.'s fourth Synod, "is to choose godly men and women who can be trained, equipped and appointed to serve in the local church as voluntary ministers: some to conduct meetings for prayer and services of worship: some to give instruction in the faith: some to act as pastors of the flock..."(10)

The new pattern has been much more fully implemented in some dioceses than in others, but several hundreds have after training received a Bishop's Licence and begun to function, according to their gifts, as assistant pastors. (11) But while the plan mentions women and includes the training of women, no women have in fact been ordained.

This revival of the idea and practice of a tent-making ministry is not purely an attempt to solve the financial problem of how a poor church is to /

**NOTES.**


pay its pastors. It arises from a conviction that in thinking of the Church's witness it is necessary to begin not with the organisation at some headquarters but with the local, worshipping congregation. This ought to be equipped with the full ministry of Word and Sacraments, yet at present the normal life and worship of a congregation is independent of its ordained minister. The ministry is therefore not fully integral to the life of the Church. A voluntary ministry of the type proposed and being experimented with will not make unnecessary a well-educated and full-time ministry. But it should foster and demand a more vigorous spiritual life in local congregations. (12)

Up to date the United Church of Northern India has not initiated any radically new practices. The subject of the pattern of the ministry was brought up at the General Assembly of 1962 and instructions were given that it should be treated as a matter of urgent and comprehensive study. A Commission was appointed under the chairmanship of the Rev. Aziz Williams, pastor at Jammu, two meetings were held, and an attempt made to get reactions from Church Councils, but with disappointing results. A booklet for study published in 1963 under the title "The Mission and Ministry of the Church" was unsubstantial and roused little comment or response. In October of that year a larger conference was held under the auspices of the National Christian Council at which the majority of delegates were from North India and its report, "The Vicious Circle", was much more widely read. (13)

NOTES.

(12) See article by Michael Hollis, "The C.S.I. and a Voluntary Ministry" S.I.C., Aug. 1955. Information has also been obtained through correspondence with Bishop Hollis.

(13) Information received chiefly through correspondence with the Rev. William Stewart.
In his Moderatorial address to the 1965 Assembly at Bombay, Dr. Stewart told delegates, "Unfortunately there has been scanty evidence of real concern about this quite vital matter. The very fact that even in this day we hear of graduate ministers who are paid less than Rs.100 a month is a startling symptom of lack of understanding of the whole ministry itself which is deeply disturbing. It is earnestly hoped that the matter will not be allowed to rest there, for without nourishment on the Word of God and the Sacraments of the Gospel, for which God has always called His ministers, the Church must be impoverished and weak." (14)

Unfortunately that General Assembly was given little further information or guidance on the pattern of the ministry, and meanwhile major developments in integration, involving a large American Mission, came to occupy the centre of the stage. It is certainly to be hoped that when the North India union has been consummated, the new Church will take up the pattern of the ministry as one of its earliest priorities.

In the C.S.I., as in the U.C.N.I., the traditional training of a full-time ministry continues along with a greater concentration on "lay training". Although there is no surplus of full-time ministers, it is lack of quality rather than of numbers which presents the biggest problem. Men are not coming forward from among the better-educated groups of Christians, those with good intellectual abilities either preferring or being pressed by their families to enter more highly paid professions. This is all the more unfortunate in view of the growing need for pastors who are capable of holding "conversations" with non-Christians. An article in the South India Churchman in 1963 points out that whereas Chingleput District in 1958 /

NOTES.
had five high schools, the number had escalated within five years to fifty-seven. In such a situation, the lack of gifted men in the ministry was a great handicap and a loss of opportunity. (15)

As constituted at present, theological education in India could not be carried on without the supply of both funds and staff from overseas. Until this position is remedied, and until a workable system is introduced under which the very smallest and newest congregation is supplied with a "minister" of its own, these two Churches cannot be described as fully self-governing or self-supporting.

Meanwhile, there is a growing body of opinion which considers that changes within the traditional pattern of the ministry common to all Protestant Churches of the West are necessary. Firstly, there is a place for the development of a truly local ordained ministry drawn from the congregation itself. Secondly, there remains the need for a thoroughly-trained full-time ministry. And thirdly, there is room for the ordination of men in secular occupations to care for some group of Christians in a particular place and for a limited time. (16) Women are represented on all church courts, but the question of the ordination of women to the ministry has still to be seriously discussed.

If the first limitation hindering independence derives from the tradition of paid agents, the second stems from the familiar problem of the Church's institutions. These are now solidly integrated into the life and fabric of the churches, but it is sometimes difficult to tell whether the church supports the institution or the institution the church. Seen from the point of view of an expensive plant which it is the Church's duty to /

NOTES.
maintain, the institutions are an increasing drain on its slender resources.

The "institutional dilemma" is all the more agonising because these agencies for education, healing and service were founded originally with an evangelistic purpose in mind, to confront men with Jesus Christ. To this end they have been for the most part ineffective and many of them can also be criticised individually on the grounds of their expensiveness, their cost in terms of missionary personnel, their immobility, the fact that they cater mainly for the privileged classes and their continued dependence on the sympathy and support of a non-Christian government. (17)

A number of Indian Christian leaders would wish drastically to reduce the number of the Church's institutions. In the case of such large and expensive bodies as the colleges they would even advocate their abolition. "For the last fifty years I have been watching the work of the colleges run by Christian Missions", runs a paper read by a senior pastor to the Fellowship of Christian Workers in Calcutta in 1964. "Confining my remarks to West Bengal Christian Colleges I have been pained to come to the irresistible conclusion that it has been a huge failure.....The hackneyed old excuse 'we are leavening the lump' has been exploded. We do not get one convert from among non-Christian college students in perhaps a whole decade...... The running of our colleges does not touch the fringe of Hinduism..... If the fig tree does not yield fruit, cut it down and use it for fuel." (18)

There is no unanimity of opinion and others point out that the Christian institutions at their best, even if they do not lead to conversions among pupils or patients, are part of the Church's witness to God's concern/

NOTES.
with the whole man. Provided that their function is held in subjection

to the primary task of witness and they are genuine examples of Christian
brotherhood, they still have a part to play in the Church's life and provide

service to the wider community. (19) "Man is not separable. To flit

about the world hitting the high spots with the essence of the Gospel

ignores the wholeness of the person", runs one such commentary, which
criticises the failure of the Roland Allen - Donald McGavran school of

thought to appreciate the importance of the institutions. (20)

Yet quite a few of the institutions which were once flourishing have

now become an embarrassment to the Indian Church. When only a small

proportion of the staff are Christians, as is the case for instance in the

Scottish Church College, it becomes a question what is really meant by

"Christian witness". (21) This suggests that when a shortage of Christ¬

ian staff no longer makes it possible to speak of "witness" in this sense,

the institution has outlived its usefulness. Yet Gandhi's indictment of

India's educational system as "totally godless" and the findings of the

Sri Prakasa Commission make it clear that from the nation's point of view

Christian education still has something to teach and something to give. (22)

In the case of medical work, Church hospitals and dispensaries grow

yearly less capable of competing with the facilities available to govern¬

ment institutions, but since health is a matter of the spirit as well

as the body and Christian girls still supply the bulk of India's nursing

profession, there remains a place for Christian medical work even on quite /

NOTES.

(20) Ibid., p.8.

Missionary Institutions", recommends that in a Christian institution

it is necessary for two-thirds of the staff to be Christians. Alvin J.

Poppen, article cit., p.9.
(22) See W. Stewart, "India's Religious Frontiers", p.144.
a humble scale. In addition, there are many opportunities for specialised work in such fields as leprosy or tuberculosis. (23)

It is usually with reference to the burden of its institutions that Indian Christians speak of their Church as a David attempting to fight in Saul's armour. But as Dr. Stewart affirms, "there is also a deep-rooted conviction that before the Church would be justified in turning its back on institutional work, it must be very clear-minded that this is right and particularly that there is something of positive value to take its place." (24)

Apart from the strain on the manpower of the Churches, the institutions have had a twofold effect on the spirit of local communities. In the first place, the presence of a school or hospital often results in the creation of an "elite" of "professional Christians" who regard themselves and are regarded by their fellows as superior. This superiority may be seen as a matter of education, but at the small town or village level it may simply refer to economic security. Workers in the Christian institution are reasonably sure of continued employment while most of their fellow church members keep struggling for a precarious existence. It is the obverse of this coin that those same professional Christians are held responsible for any propagation of the faith which is to be done and for leadership and initiative in church affairs. And there come complaints from pastors that ordained ministers and others in positions of power, perhaps as headmaster of a Mission school, can because of their position carry too much weight on local church courts, thus undermining the pastor's /

NOTES.

(23) Alvin J. Poppen, article cit. p.9.
(24) W. Stewart, op.cit., p.120.
own work and authority. (25)

The effect on the institution's own employees can be equally unhealthy. There is the danger of which William Miller gave warning when he insisted that the Church must not become a guild for the worldly welfare of its sons. The Christian community at Bamdah, in Santalia, provides a straightforward illustration. Here two medical missionaries, father and son, served in all for a period of over seventy-five years, so that the Christian society had never known a time without their guidance and control. Through specialisation in eye-surgery the Bamdah hospital became a famous institution, though it numbered relatively few Santals among its patients. (26) But generations of Christians were trained as nurses and compounders until a tradition was established. When Dr. Ronald Macphail retired, his place was taken by a young missionary who was welcomed by the community. Soon afterwards certain senior members of the hospital staff were found to be extorting money from patients and had to be either disciplined or dismissed.

The result was a storm which, with the moral authority of a senior missionary removed, the local Pastorate Committee was quite unable to deal with and the Church Council itself had great difficulty in controlling. It became clear that, in the eyes of many local Christians, the hospital was their legitimate perquisite. They had been willing to submit to the ruling of Mission or missionary authority but, when the Church itself took over, the hospital, with its offer of power and personal profit, became a strong source/
of temptation and a cause of dissension. (27)

It is examples of this kind which lead those concerned with the institutional dilemma to insist that if the outgoing qualities of love and brotherhood are lacking, no amount of skill and efficiency or co-operative effort can prevent its institutions from being a burden to the Church. Furthermore, too much concentration on institutional work can cause the Church to forget that agencies are never more than a means to an end. Bishop Newbigin refers to "the deep-seated and persistent failure of the churches to recognise that the primary witness to the sovereignty of Christ must be given and can only be given in the ordinary secular work of lay men and women in business, in politics, in professional work, as farmers, factory workers and so on." (28) In the West, this truth gets obscured by the amount of organisational work connected with the life of individual congregations. In the East, it is the Mission institutions which dominate the scene, so that church members employed in them tend to think of themselves as ipso facto leaders in the Christian enterprise and those not so employed as camp followers rather than front-line troops.

A third stumbling block on the road to full autonomy is the extent to which the Indian Churches still rely on the West for financial support and to a lesser degree for leadership. We have already taken note of the great degree of dependence in the field of theological education, and it applies with only slightly lesser force to the maintenance of other institutional agencies.

NOTES.

(27) Information obtained mainly through correspondence with Dr. Alastair King, Bandah.

In a survey of Christian institutional work in India and Pakistan, R.P. Beaver reported that 24,000 congregations were supporting 2,428 institutions, a load of one institution to every ten congregations, which is more than enough to strangle extension work. It was further calculated that fifty per cent of overseas missionaries, and from some Missions as many as eighty per cent, were occupied in institutional work. (29) This not only sapped the initiative of these men and women, who were presumably intelligent, resourceful and keen to propagate their faith, but also helped to keep those institutions under foreign direction, and thus the churches themselves dependent on overseas support.

A report on the 1965 Assembly of the United Church of Northern India expresses concern over that body's attitude towards integration and the fear displayed whether Church Councils would get their fair share of subsidies from abroad. This seemed to the commentator, an Indian pastor, an unhappy indication that the Church looked on overseas support as a security, not a means towards growing in responsibility. (30) The need for financial help is understandable. But the fact that local Pastors' Funds are also dependent on Mission grants is much more disquieting: even in Rajasthan, where the Christian liberality is proportionately higher than for any other Church Council except West Bengal, the subsidy comes to thirty per cent of the total. (31)

The days are fortunately over when the Indian Churches and their courts had to rely on the recommendation of Mission Councils, for agreements are now made directly between the Indian Church and its Western partner, while a system of block grants usually gives a fair amount of freedom in allocation. /

NOTES.
(29) Alvin J. Poppen, article cit., p.7.
(31) P.499.
Nevertheless material dependence, however it may be disguised, always involves moral dependence. Bishop Hollis is of the opinion that even among responsible church leaders in the West, very few are aware of how far Eastern Christians feel the continuance of financial support from Mission boards to depend on the readiness of the recipients to remain within Western denominational patterns. There is also a feeling that missionary societies will only send money if at the same time they are allowed to send missionaries. (32) Due to this conviction of "strings attached" to overseas aid, the Indian Churches do not therefore feel entirely free to express themselves in natural ways. It is, however, the other horn of the dilemma that support from overseas is necessary if the Church is to witness within the nation through leadership and service. It was one reaction of the African Church to the C.S.I.'s statement "Renewal and Advance" that while it agreed excessive help to be a hindrance to genuine growth, it considered that the adoption of the C.S.I.'s policy in Africa would be disastrous. This was not because the Church would not survive without it, but because she would condemn herself to being irrelevant and ineffective in the present African situation. (33) Though conditions differ greatly between the two continents, it is true for the Indian Church also that any sudden or extensive withdrawal of overseas support would greatly limit its contacts with the community at large. Yet the fact the Church is not in this sphere completely its own master breeds an atmosphere of moral dependence which also has its effect on indigenisation.

NOTES.

(32) M. Hollis, op.cit., pp.78-79.
(33) S.I.C., Mar., 1965, p.7.
2. The Indigenous Character of the Churches

Even if they were vague about details, Scottish missionaries had recognised at an early stage that much of what they built must be temporary scaffolding. Indian Christianity would in due course put up its own structures. "The best missionary is still a foreigner", wrote John Wilson's biographer, George Smith, in explanation of the former's attitude towards sectarianism. "He and his translations must in time give way to an indigenous and self-developing church or churches." (34) Yet missionaries were seldom aware how closely inter-connected were the Gospel they preached and the mores of the civilisation from which they came. Nor could they foresee the partial disintegration of that culture, the rejection of many of its basic assumptions by the younger nations of the world and the difficulty which the younger churches would experience in winning free from the West.

The foreign nature of the Indian Church is therefore much more pronounced than leaders of an earlier generation would have expected, and Dr. William Stewart names it first among the elements of the challenge facing that Church today. "There is a critical evaluation of the Christian religion which rejects it as something inherently Western", he writes, "As something which fails to correspond to the felt needs of Asia ---. Christianity is, in such judgment, altogether too Western in its character and in the form which it assumes in its local manifestations. This rejection is the more serious in that Asian -- peoples are themselves, like us in the West, confronted by the bewildering demands of the modern world. All the old landmarks are disappearing. Everywhere there is a desperate search for some inner basis of security. In the sequel, particularly in Asia, the

NOTES.

peoples are not seeking to find this psychic security by digging deep into their own past." (35)

It is not in dispute that Christianity has yet to acclimatise itself to Indian conditions, and because of this its impact on the bulk of the Indian population is blunted. Eddy Asirvatham asserts that in matters of food, dress, speech and social customs Indian Christians are hybrids. And in its art, architecture, music, worship and thought-forms the Church is thoroughly Westernised. (36) It is a sign of growth, however, that the blame for this is no longer laid squarely on the shoulders of the Missions, where much of it rightly lies, but also on the Indian Church itself and the complacency with which it has been content to reproduce alien forms.

By way of example we quote some trenchant comments on the Church of South India's first ten years of growth delivered by the late Bishop David Chellappa of Madras:

"We are so afraid of the danger of syncretism that we hesitate to assist at the coming into being of a theology that is at once Indian and Christian --

"As regards worship, it is notorious that our Church of South India liturgy has been so generally acceptable precisely because it goes back behind the Reformation controversies, and the Mediaeval churches' aberrations, to the New Testament and the primitive Church: but the same is not true of a great deal of our worship --

"As for the externals of worship, such as Architecture and Music, church buildings continue to be built in bastard Gothic and in a deliberately foreign style of architecture.

NOTES.

(36) Eddy Asirvatham, op.cit., p.131.
"Our people are naturally sacramental, but our present system gives them a fair amount of the Word but little of the Sacraments." (37)

The creation of indigenous forms of expression hinges on people being free from outside direction, and we have seen that Christian communities in India were particularly slow in being granted such liberty. This can be explained in part by the powerful threat which Hinduism and Mohammedanism continued to present, particularly Hinduism with its strong syncretistic bias. In addition, most converts already had the psychology of a conquered people, being downtrodden and ignorant and aware of it. Most of them were only too happy to grow up as obedient children under the benevolent care of the Mission. Yet with colonial expansion and the establishment of colonial rule there was a hardening of the attitude of the white to the coloured races. Most historians today would agree with Stephen Neill when he affirms that the early missionaries were more prepared to treat their converts as equals than their successors in the middle of the Nineteenth Century. (38) The intrinsic superiority of the white man gradually came to be assumed as a fact of nature and "natives" were judged to be incapable of managing their own affairs.

This was demonstrated very clearly in India, where political gradualism led to ecclesiastical gradualism. The culture of India and the ability of its people to govern themselves were certainly not behind those of China. Yet because China retained its political independence and European business men mingled with Chinese much more freely at social levels, Christian missions were also less paternalistic. It is significant that the only large Mission to plant its headquarters in the receiving and not the sending country was Hudson Taylor's China Inland Mission. (39) And at the other extreme it is equally pertinent that the largest group of Protestant Missions in India, those connected

NOTES.

(37) Address to the 6th Synod of the C.S.I. at Nagercoil. Quoted S.I.C., Feb., 1958, pp.4-5.
with the Church of England, had to wait until 1930 before, with the constitution of the Church of India, Burma and Ceylon, they obtained freedom to elect their own bishops. (40) This un readiness on the part of Missions to hand over authority was noted and resented by Indian Christians, while the National Christian Council campaigned for independence and complained that Western missionaries, like the British Government, were treating Indians as a subject race. (41) As the ruling power was slow to accept that only by practice can the art of government be learned, so Missions were slow to acknowledge that only by being given responsibility could men learn to use it; and freedom to introduce idolatries, produce heresies and lower standards of honesty or efficiency was the cost of Christianity adopting national dress. The policy of integration followed by the majority of Missions was thus in the words of the Indian Church itself, "the healing of the wounds inflicted by the colonial era, the reintegration of that which should not be separate but had become so." (42)

Yet the Indian Church is aware of the peril of making indigenous characteristics an end in themselves. Christianity in particular, being a religion of incarnation, can take shape only in social, economic and political forms, evangelism when it moves across national frontiers has always walked hand in hand with civilisation and it was inevitable that the "pure Gospel" should come to India within the impure vessel of Western culture. (43) If inevitable, it was also necessary, for there were evil customs and false doctrines to be rooted out. Even the reformed Hinduism of the present day retains a great deal in it that is puerile, degrading or cruel and the Hinduism of earlier centuries was a system from which men definitely needed to be rescued. Caste had become/

NOTES.

a curse, various forms of vice were not only practised but encouraged in the name of religion and the doctrine of a divinely established society in which it was rigidly forbidden any man to alter his station was one which denied the underprivileged any hope of betterment.

Since religious sanctions were involved in every aspect of personal and social life, the only means of winning free from them was to turn one's back on them entirely. A man's name, his trade, his dwelling-place, his costume and even his hair-style denoted his caste. Rites of birth, marriage and death were inextricably bound up with a web of superstitious and idolatrous practices. Popular songs, lyrics, dances and dramas could not be separated from lewd associations, immoral practices or mythological lore. Customs of immemorial antiquity encouraged dirt and disease. It was impossible to winnow the wheat from the chaff and little attempt was made to do so, Indian Christian society becoming a rather shoddy imitation of Western Society. Indian pastors wore clerical collars with rusty black jackets, congregations sang translations of Western hymns to Western tunes and Indian converts took the name of the missionary by whom they were baptised. Usually it was Indian Christians themselves who, in their determination not to revert to a past they had no wish to resurrect, resisted "indigenous" innovations for fear of contamination. "The one person more difficult to move than a conservative missionary is a conservative Indian Christian." (44)

Yet while the process was agonisingly slow, gradually forms of social life emerged which, even if they were hybrid in character, could be described as both Indian and Christian. A common and early example was the use of the tali, or necklace, the Indian marriage symbol, instead of or along with a ring at a Christian marriage service. With the return of national pride, this movement was greatly

NOTES.
accelerated. Family names were reinstated and national dress was no longer despised. School children were taught the folk dances of their people, Christian words were set to new or traditional Indian tunes, there appeared the first flowering of work by Christian artists, poets and dramatists, Christian "ashrams" were founded and in a variety of ways the culture of the people was baptised into Christ. (45)

There are large areas of life in both the Church of South India and the United Church of Northern India where the development of indigenous expression still has a long way to go. This is particularly the case in the related realms of worship and thought, or liturgy and theology. "We cannot but admit that the liturgical forms in use in South India, whether pre-union or post-union, are for the most part imported from the West", writes T.S. Garrett. "And even those elements in them which have had their birth in India show marked signs of Western influence." (46) In the parallel field it has often been pointed out that Indian Christian theology has not up to date produced a single major heresy and certainly no system of Indian Christian thought has yet been produced. Yet interesting developments have been taking place within the last few years. Stephen Neill and Rajappan D. Paul, writing independently in the 1950's, both remark on the imitative nature of Indian theology, whose most daring thinkers have attempted little more than to lift wholesale into a Christian context various Hindu terms and ideas. (47) By the middle of the present decade, however, it became possible to say at last that "a body of Indian theological writing exists which demands serious attention!" (48)

NOTES.

(45) For a concise description of such indigenous forms and experiments see Eddy Asirvatham, op.cit., pp.131-154.
In matters where religious faith affects social and domestic practices much thinking also remains to be done. The rules regarding Christian marriage and divorce which hold force in the Church of South India at present, for instance, are simply those which have been recognised for centuries by the Church of England. They provide a questionable interpretation of even Western Christianity today and have nothing to say about the complicated laws of consanguinity which are part of the Indian social heritage.

Another type of problem is posed by the different attitudes adopted towards certain moral standards and priorities which are visible among Indians and Europeans. In money matters, Anglo-Saxons have rigid standards of honesty and are especially strict where responsibility for public funds is involved. This is recognised by Indians. "I would hesitate to plead for more general Indian leadership, especially where finances are concerned, until it can be proved — that the average Indian leader is as honest and conscientious in the application of public funds as the non-national," said David Chellappa. (49)

Missionaries in the past have often deplored the lack of integrity shown by Indian treasurers and others in responsible positions and pointed to this as a mark of the Church's immaturity. On the other hand, Indian Christians carry over from their social background a very strong sense of family responsibility. A poor man will half-starve himself and his own children in order to maintain a host of indigent relatives, and Indians regard with horror the European readiness to dispose of elderly relatives by consigning them to a hospital or a home. Moral issues such as this help us to see that indigenisation can never be final but must continue as the environment goes on changing. The Indian Church must teach and interpret standards of honesty against the background of a social ethic which places family loyalty higher than public integrity. It would be a

NOTES.

(49) S.I.C., Feb., 1953, p. 5.
corollary if Western churches made a renewed attempt to interpret Christian personal values within a rootless, affluent and automated society.

While much dissatisfaction is rightly expressed over the extent to which the Indian Church is prepared to jog along in borrowed clothing, the national flair for assimilation and transformation should not be ignored. "There is no doubt that to an outside observer the Church in India seems to be dominated by Western attitudes and modes of thought", writes R.H.S. Boyd (50), but many would disagree with or at least wish to qualify such a statement. What often strikes the visitor most forcibly is the complete Indian-ness of Western forms when adapted to Indian ways. We may note that T.S. Garrett, whom we have quoted on the Western character of Indian liturgical forms, goes on to say, "It would not, however, be fair to the churches in India to say that, because their forms of worship are for the most part foreign in origin, they have therefore remained equally foreign in character after a period of use in India. Like many other Oriental countries, India has a faculty of assimilating foreign elements into her culture while still remaining essentially Indian; and no one from the West who has lived and worshipped with the Church in India for any length of time would say that such externals as church architecture in which Gothic predominates, or an Anglican Order of Service, make the worship any less the Indian Church's own. Somehow an Indian atmosphere always succeeds in asserting itself." (51)

A new drive towards the production of more Christian literature in regional languages has greatly assisted the process of acclimatisation. A Christmas edition of "Manai Malar", a monthly Christian Home magazine issued for Tamil readers, has an article on "Christmas gifts" and illustrations of Santa Claus, the three Kings following the star and an angel blowing a trumpet, all of

NOTES:

(50) R.H.S. Boyd, op.cit., p.2.
(51) T.S. Garrett, op.cit., p.9.
which might be lifted out of any European periodical. Yet in its outward form the production is similar to many secular magazines and the average Indian reader would find nothing alien or exceptional about the rest of its contents. (52)

This suggests that it is possible to be over-sensitive about the need to preserve ancient traditions unchanged. To assimilate is to progress; to refuse to do so is to stagnate, a young community is robust if philistine in its approach and Indian Christianity has shown that it can digest Western customs while it adapts its own.

In the earlier days of the Church's life, when the ideas of the West were everywhere in the ascendency and its customs were too slavishly copied, little attention was paid to the fostering of indigenous growth. Disenchantment with Western civilisation and the rise of nationalism caused a swing of the pendulum in the opposite direction. It is to be hoped this will continue but it also seems certain that there will be incorporation of features borrowed from the West into what will eventually be a new structure. At present the reaction against all things Western places the Church in a poor light among many non-Christians. But as that reaction runs its course the bipartisan nature of Christianity may be revealed as no bad thing. Great cultures are all the product of the fusing of older and often disparate elements under the pressure of events and new ideas. It was so with the Christian culture of the West and though, as with the making of a pearl, the process is a painful one, the results justify the cost.

It is noteworthy that no nation has been so willing to learn from the West as Japan, which made a laughing-stock of itself for its imitateness. Yet according to informed observers, the Japanese have retained their traditional values more successfully than other nations which sought to preserve their/
identity by resisting the tides of modernism. What is even more interesting, Japan is now developing innovations of its own and frequently surpassing its teachers in constructive thought and original execution. A lesson may be drawn from this, that if Indian Christianity is still far from being sufficiently Indian in nature, its grounding in Western models was not necessarily a tragedy and in time, under God, the child may be all the stronger because of its mixed parentage.

Finally we must remember that for the Indian Church as for others, indigenisation can never mean more than the nationalising of the non-essentials. "Indigenisation is commonly misunderstood", writes C.S. Rao, "(to mean that) one should be more Indian than Western." He goes on to underline the danger by quoting Dr. P.D. Devanandam: "There is always the possibility that in our anxiety to identify ourselves with the people of our country who are kinmen in our culture we may compromise on the fundamentals of our faith." (53) The chief function in indigenisation is identification, but in its relations with other religions Christianity can only identify itself in matters which are non-essential. It is therefore not Christianity itself which needs to be re-thought — and here the prophets and critics of the previous generation went too far — but the presentation of Christianity in terms comprehensible and acceptable to Indian minds. (54)

Eddy Asirvatham is saying the same thing when he describes what the attitude of Indian Christianity ought to be towards various types of custom. Some, such as the practice of monogamy, must be regarded as obligatory on all Christians everywhere. Others, like the worship of idols and the placation of evil spirits, child marriage and colour or caste distinctions, must be forbidden to all Christians.

NOTES
(54) Ibid., p.106.
Third comes the type of local custom which ought to be positively encouraged — in India, the habit of daily bathing which is enjoined by Hindu teaching would be an example.

Fourthly come habits which are socially destructive, such as the superstitious treatment of disease.

Fifthly come neutral customs like vegetarianism or cremation, which should be left to the individual choice.

And last of all come indigenous practices which have no great religious significance but preserve common bonds between Christians and their Hindu or Moslem brethren. Such are the giving and accepting of food or money with the right hand, putting off one's sandals before entering a building, abstinence from alcohol and general simplicity of life. (55)

In every one of the categories listed above, the Indian churches are attempting to bring about the kind of fusion which will present the true Christ and the Community of His Spirit but in Indian dress. Yet while it is possible in theory to draw distinctions between essentials and non-essentials, this is anything but easy in practice, especially for the humble Christian convert still living cheek-by-jowl with non-Christian neighbours.

Even among an aboriginal tribe like the Santals there was the recurring problem of caste and every church had to make decisions on marriage customs and the attitude to be adopted towards women. "I hardly know how far these scruples are to be respected. It is a difficult matter to decide, but we will tolerate nothing that savours of caste", the missionary at Poburua had written in the/

NOTES.

(55) E. Asirvatham, op.cit., pp.155-158.
A quarter of a century later the two district missionaries in Jalna, though old college friends and colleagues of many years standing, parted company and one resigned on the issue of whether converts should continue to make their livelihood through the practice of Danhade. (57)

Situations calling for decisions of this kind were part of the everyday history of every Christian community and continue to the present time. A district missionary working near Arkonam obtained money to help erect a church in a village with a growing Christian community. After consultation with the pastor, he erected, in place of the traditional type of building, a brick chancel which was whitewashed and had painted on it the emblems of the dove and the true vine and the figure of the Good Shepherd. The congregation itself was accommodated in a mandal, or roof-shelter made of palm leaves, attached to the chancel. The Christian community, which was made up largely of new converts, was not happy with its unorthodox church and in particular with images reminiscent of the Hinduism they had renounced. Hindu neighbours asked, "Why does the god appear only on the outside of the temple and not inside?" Local Christian leaders would have much preferred the norm, a simple rectangular building which might look neutral and ugly but lacked disturbing religious associations.

Within twenty miles of that village a Christian woman was appointed Headmistress of a government school. There she was required according to the syllabus laid down to conduct a school assembly where passages were read alternately from the classics of several great religions and the tone was highly syncretistic. She had no hesitation in doing so and was indignant when the Headmistress of a Church School suggested that her Christian principles were being compromised.

NOTES.

(56) MS letter from A. Campbell, Pokhurua, to Dr. Smith, dated 15.12.1861, S.N.L.
(57) MS letter from Mr. Douglas, Jalna, to Dr. Smith, dated 6.8.06, S.N.L.
Such examples could be multiplied almost indefinitely, it very seldom being a simple matter to decide where right ends and wrong begins. "It is hard to say", wrote J. Russell Chandran, "Whether Christians in India have established an indigenous Christian culture." He went on to give it as his opinion that while the only group who could definitely claim to have done so were the Syrian Christians of South Travancore, among the younger Indian churches there was a vigorous movement towards it. (58) The formation of a new culture is a slow and complicated process and meanwhile the parent cultures of both East and West are changing themselves. The result may possibly be as surprising to us as it would have been to the missionaries of our great-grandparents' day.

NOTES

3. The Responsible Nature of the Churches.

By "responsible nature" we understand that complex of qualities whereby a church's autonomy is exercised in humility, brotherly love and outgoing concern and its nature related to the soil after being rooted in Christ. (59) Like other churches, the Indian Churches press towards the mark of this high calling but fail to reach it.

Lack of size and extreme dispersal, while they cannot strictly speaking be claimed as limitations, nevertheless exaggerate certain human weaknesses and bring in their train specific temptations. The most pressing of these is the temptation to withdraw from a hostile world into the safety of one's own shell. Pietism, self-absorption and a narrow complacency are faults likely to develop in any religious minority society. Group ties grow stronger but social and then mental boundaries become fixed and real contact is lost with the larger community within which the group is contained. The Christian Church then shows all the characteristics of a communal society. This happened with the Syrian Church in Travancore, which simply grew into a Christian caste (60), and like tendencies have been noted in every one of the churches under review.

The hazard is one to which the situation of the Indian Church makes it prone and the Church must therefore be on constant guard against it. "The Church is in danger of settling down as an inoffensive and benevolent society among other communities in the land", runs the report of a Church of South India Commission on Integration and Joint Action. "That their Lord expects them to be lights in the world and the salt of the earth, that their countrymen are seeking for better and fuller life which only our Lord can supply, do not seem to control their thinking or direct their actions." (61) This Report which "attempts to present the Church as it is, with warts and wrinkles," declares that the Church of South India has /

NOTES.

(59) P.57
(60) W. Stewart, op.cit., p.110.
failed to live up to the hope of earlier days concerning a church with "a fuller life, a renewed eagerness and an increase of power for the furtherance of the Gospel."

In place of this the picture is one of "A Church turned in on itself, labouring and quarrelling about the machinery of organisation, slow in growth in real union, ignorant and lacking in leadership, clumsily active with an excess of ineffective institutions, clutchingly dependent on foreign support, and failing to make use of her own resources." (62)

These harsh criticisms are the judgments passed on a Church by its own leaders and they echo the words of an earlier censure administered by Bishop Sumitra. "A hundred years ago, when the Church was young and small, it was zealous for the Lord. Now it is concerned with its own position, its freedom and its progress — the Church in India has yet to learn that without Christ it has nothing." (63).

This is to concentrate on one corner of the whole picture. Yet Bishop Sumitra was anxious to make clear how far the processes of history had diverted the Church's attention away from its primary task — which was "mission" — to secondary things. First there came the drive for better organisation and union of the churches; then devolution and the passing of authority into Indian hands; and finally the bifurcation of the duties of a Christian led church members to leave evangelism to the pastors and other paid workers. (64) These three emphases all had the effect of turning the eyes of Christians inwards.

In a more recent appraisal, K.M. Thomas describes how studies of the churches in Asia have shown them to be living spiritually and socially in "Christian ghettos", the modern version of the old mission compound. So concerned can they be about safeguarding their communal interests that they may even consider/

NOTES:

(62) Ibid., p.7.
(64) Ibid.
evangelism, with its possibility of new converts, as a threat to their security. (65)

It is not always the smallest or most isolated communities which are most at fault here, some of the worst examples being set by city congregations of third and fourth generation converts (66), or villages which are wholly or almost wholly Christian. Poona and Youngsonabad spring to mind as concrete examples. In such cases, while the Christian groups form a real social entity, there is a readiness to "sit at ease in Zion" and it is minority groups of fairly recent converts in other villages which show the true missionary spirit. (67)

The frequency and virulence of church disputes and congregational squabbles are further indications of narcissism. "Far more tragic (i.e. than the denominational divisions inherited from the West) is the unenviable reputation which the Christian community has gained in many areas for quarrelsomeness, a quarrelsomeness which leads again and again to the law-courts", writes William Stewart. "Nor can this be laid at the door of Western influence, for the ancient churches of Malabar have wasted their substance through years of litigation even to the Supreme Court of India. Their example has been widely followed. Further North we find competitors for a presidency in a Lutheran church appealing to the courts; dissidents in a Presbyterian church who carry their complaints against their own councils and synods to the same arbitration; indignant laymen of an Anglican church prepared to prosecute their own bishop for alleged violation of their religious susceptibilities. It is hardly surprising in such a context to learn of converts who, having come with a deep conviction to their baptism, have afterwards found themselves desolate in a Church which has shown so little evidence of fellowship; nor is it surprising to hear of those who profess devotion to Christ but hold back from identification with such a people." (68)

NOTES.

(66) V.E.W. Hayward, op.cit., p.80.
(67) T.S. Garrett, op.cit., p.10.
(68) W. Stewart, op.cit., pp.110-111.
In mitigation of such glaring faults, there is some truth in Bishop Newbigin's observation that this disputatiousness is often the result of a deep, keen interest in communal affairs. While strongly emphasising that it is imperative for church members to let their disputes be settled by church courts, not civil courts, he goes on, "I believe that the reason why quarrels, and the settling of quarrels, play such a large part in the life of the Church here is that the whole structure of society is such that people are much more fully involved in each of their social relationships than is the case in the Western type of multiple society." (69) There springs to mind here the very similar characteristics of Scottish Presbyterianism, where a tale of discord and division betokened not disinterest in religion but a very close concern with it. The fact remains that in both cases energy and conviction were being diverted inwards and not outwards, matters of no spiritual value being treated as all-important. In Scotland, peripheral canons of doctrine were made the test of saving truth. In India, Christians fought for the prestige of being elected to a church court, intrigued on behalf of their relations and declared themselves ready to go to the stake for the sake of some liturgical nicety. Such activities were all symptoms of an unwillingness to recognise where their real responsibilities lay.

In consequence there has been a breakdown of contacts between the Christian community and the people of the country as a whole. "Generally speaking, the churches have not yet realised their responsibility in the national awakening", says T. Sihombing, giving an Asian view of the situation, "Their time is more taken up with their own institutions (i.e. church organisation) than by the way of life of their own people. — If some members have turned their attention to politics they have rapidly lost contact with the Church. There are so many fields in which the Christian community can serve to help the victims of social and economic

NOTES

unrighteousness, to crusade against social disorder and to lead the way to the
total change of society without violence in social and economic affairs." (70)

Because the Christian society has been small, poor and backward, it has
been more concerned with raising its own status than with the life of the nation.
Christians took a very small part in the agitations stirred up by the nationalist
movement and seven years after Indian independence we come across a letter to
the editor of the "South India Churchman" complaining how little attention is
paid during church services to the affairs of the nation or the welfare of its
elected leaders. "In Britain today I am sure passing and relevant references
to Queen Elizabeth and the Prime Minister Churchill from the pulpit are fairly
common —— But in our churches —— has anyone heard any passing reference to
our Union President, Dr. Prasad, or to our Prime Minister, Mr. Nehru?"

"I was in two Indian churches on Independence Day which fell on a Sunday"
the writer continues, "the two Indian Presbyters never made any reference to
India at all, or to her Rulers, or to her having attained independence, when the
whole nation was celebrating the Day of Independence that Sunday —— It is a notorious
fact that most of our clergy do not read books either on up-to-date theology
or current affairs —— not even newspapers! —— Certainly nobody wants any
church committee or Presbyter as such to participate in politics —— But is it
not clear that patriotism and a spirit of nationalism are something quite
fundamentally different from party politics, political activities and the
governance of the country?" (71)

Omissions of this kind are all the more noticeable because before 1947
it had been the accepted custom, particularly within the Anglican communion
with its set liturgy, to pray for the British Sovereign and Government. A /

T. Sibbing, "The Church in the World: An Asian View", in "The
Missionary Church in East and West", edited S.J. West and D.K. Paton,
S.I.C. Nov. 1954, p. 16.
A letter from Chingleput at the beginning of the century even describes how on receipt of the news of Queen Victoria's illness a special meeting for prayer was held in the church. (72)

Prayers for the leaders of the nation are now included in the advisory liturgies produced by the Indian Churches. And it is a mark of development that the deaths of Nehru and Shashtri were mourned much more whole-heartedly and openly by Indian Christians than the death of Gandhi. (73) But an extract like that given above from the "South India Churchman" makes it plain that not even church leaders are accustomed to think of Christian society as in any way responsible before God for the life of their nation.

In two particular spheres where contacts and influence have been strongest in the past, there is a need for new bridges to be built. First comes evangelism, which as a result of the earlier system has come to be regarded as the special provenance of the Church's paid workers. This is the danger of clericalism, where the people consider the Church as the work and concern of its officers, their own duty being fulfilled by attending a service of worship once a week. (74) This can only be overcome by unceasing stress on the fact that all evangelistic witness to non-Christians should be closely related to and come out of local congregations.

Secondly there is the field of service towards one's fellowmen, in which Christian Missions won a fine reputation as pioneers. This diminished as the government caught up with and surpassed anything that voluntary bodies might be able to do. Yet the Indian Church, in one sense saddled with its educational, medical and welfare institutions, is at the same time unable to see beyond them to other possible forms of service to the community. To this extent it is even falling behind other voluntary organisations in initiative.

"The change in the concept of service in recent years had been too radical for the Church in Asia and has swept it off balance, so that it has yet

(72) MS letter from A. Andrew, Chingleput, to Dr. Smith, dated 24.1.01.S.N.L.
(73) Information obtained through interview. (74) See T. Sihombing, op.cit.,p.38.
to find its feet properly on the ground again," writes M.M. Thomas (75)
He describes the shift as one from "charitable" to "social" forms of service,
and from social service to organised social action aimed at changing structures,
institutions and laws of society. This in turn can only be achieved through
"discriminating participation in power politics as a means of service", a
form of activity for which Indian Christians have never been trained by their
churches. (76)

At present there are two lines along which Indian Christians might
claim to be witnessing in service outside the framework of former Mission
institutions. Christian ashrames, the best-known of which is the Christu-Kula
Ashram founded by Doctors Jesudasan and Forrester-Paton at Tirupattur,
combine the Hindu tradition of a religious community which studies and
meditates under the leadership of a teacher or guru with the Christian idea
of love found in fellowship and expressed in service. (77) And in some
parts of India Christian girls still provide all but a fraction of the
trained nursing staff for both government and voluntary hospitals.

In the eyes of a historian like S. Pannikar, representative of the
balanced, middle-of-the-road point of view, the West has contributed a
great deal to his country, but Christianity very little. "It is not/

NOTES.

(75) M.M. Thomas, op.cit.,110.
(76) Ibid., pp.110-111.
(77) For accounts of the Christian ashram movement see "Ashrams Past
and Present", a Symposium edited by P. Chenchiah, Indian Christian
Book Club, Madras, 1941: E. Asirvatham, op.cit.,pp.149-155:
E. Forrester-Paton, "The Christian Ashram Movement in India", 1962
(Published privately? F.M. Secretary's Library)
"It is not correct to say that the like-mindedness which exists between India and England today is a superficial one," he writes; "It is based on an experience of 150 years of history. The inheritance from Britain is even more important than the Hindu tradition from the past. Modern India does not live under the laws of Manu. Its mental background and equipment have been moulded into their present shape by over 100 years of Western education. —— Its social ideas are derived predominantly from the liberalism of the Nineteenth Century. Therefore this like-mindedness is a social fact. ——" (78) In acknowledging the strength and importance of that inheritance from the West, however, he stresses that Christianity, the religion of the West, has been almost completely rejected. "It will hardly be denied that, in spite of the immense and sustained effort made by the churches with the support of the lay public of European countries and America, the attempt to conquer Asia for Christ has definitely failed." (79)

That assessment is correct insofar as it makes the impact of Christianity co-extensive with the bounds of the organised Church. But we know such an identification to be unreal. The true Christian impact on India has been first to shame it, then to rouse and arm it and finally to reform it. (80) Hinduism today, especially through the influence of Gandhi, has radically altered its outlook under the pressure of Christian beliefs and teaching. An almost equally striking change has been brought about in the outlook of Mohammedanism, it being noted by one scholar that in modern biographies of Mohammed there is invariably a tendency to redraw the portrait in order to make it more acceptable to modern and more particularly to Christian standards. (81)
Here the Church has obviously an opportunity and an opening. Some see the most pressing need to be that of spiritual renewal within the Church itself. "The major evangelistic thrust must be made inside the Church" (82) So the Church of South India Synod, when considering the first ten years since union, chose to discuss first how far the Church had grown in unity and secondly how far it had progressed towards being a truly Indian body. (83) Christian responsibility was also seen to involve helping one's own immediate community to advance, and descriptions of the life of the Church included reports on efforts made in rural districts — cottage industries, fruit farming, the cultivation of vacant spaces on church and mission compounds and other means of encouraging country communities to stand on their own feet. (84)

There is nothing trivial or self-centred about such efforts when we keep in mind the degrading and poverty-stricken conditions under which the majority of Indian Christians still live and St. Paul's constant encouragement to the converts of his own day to rise to higher things. "And such were some of you", he told the Corinthians, reminding them of the gutters from which they had crawled. (85) Many Indian church members are equally conscious of their precarious grip on a life of modest decency and self-respect.

Where material standards were raised without the influence of Christian teaching to create a balance the results could be disastrous, and we saw examples of this among non-Christian Santals. (86) But where opportunities to earn a decent livelihood and a consequent improvement in living standards were accompanied by Christian teaching, there came also an increase of proper pride and a greater sense of responsibility. It made a great difference to the Christians of the/
Punjab to be allowed to enlist in the army and to possess their own land: while the contrast between the flourishing condition of Youngsonabad and that of most "Christian villages" was due wholly to the fact that Christianity developed in conditions of genuine opportunity for economic advancement. (87)

In the same way it brought a new lease of life to Christians in the suburbs of Budge-Budge and Mattiabruz when industrialisation and regular employment meant there was money to spare for the building of a church. (88) Grinding poverty and a sneer on the face of one's neighbour are not necessary conditions of the Christian life and the Church is right to face its responsibility for the welfare of its poorer members. The Indian Church recognises that this must be balanced, however, by accepting the challenge of the second and third of the three themes put forward at New Delhi — namely the call to witness and the call to service. (89)

It has already been remarked concerning service that India is sensible of the debt it owes to Christianity in this field. "The contribution of Christian Missions to the shaping of Indian life in modern times has indeed been impressive" runs the Niyogi Report, as it records how Missions cared for the maimed and handicapped, elevated the neglected classes and gave them dignity as men and raised the status of women. (90) It is a matter of some consequence however, that while the article from which the last quotation has been taken speaks of the new socialistic pattern of society and village uplift as being the most significant movement in modern India, and refers to the Christian record of social regeneration, no attempt is made to look beyond. "This in essence is the contribution of the Christians of India to their country's village uplift, community development and socialistic /

NOTES.

(87) P.435.
(88) P.344.
(89) S.I.C., May, 1962, article, "The Thinking at New Delhi", p.3.
(90) Quoted from S.P. Raju, "Christians in Independent India, S.I.C., Jan, 1959, p.9.
pattern of society" is the verdict — "this" being no more nor less than the Mission institutions. M.M. Thomas is evidently correct in his assessment that the Asian Church has not yet caught up with the new concept of service. Christians think in terms of individuals — a Christian nurse serves suffering humanity in the name of Christ. Or else they think of service in terms of community work through institutions or other organised bodies. The idea of wide-scale co-operation with non-Christians in various types of "joint-action groups exerting social pressure" is up to date too radical for the Churches to have absorbed, but at least the issue is now being seriously discussed. (91) A paper read at the C.S.I. Synod's Committee on Social Concerns pointed out that over five million villages were being brought under the government system of community development blocks and equally momentous changes were going on in the cities. Yet in urban areas there was very little participation by Christians in decision-making councils, while Christians were not even on the fringe of the "Panchayati Raj", the movement for developing leadership and self-help among village people. "There is need to organise for participation", the paper concluded, "Our concept of the Church should undergo a radical change." (92)

Nevertheless evangelism continues to be the Church's prime responsibility. As Dr. Mackay put it to the Free Church congregation in Calcutta more than a century ago, "If any Church — let her discipline be the purest and her faith the most orthodox on earth — is occupied only with herself, if she have not largeness of spirit and heroism of faith to grasp as her main object the glory of the Redeemer in the conversion of the world, the Lord will visit her with barrenness and leanness and she shall fall from her pride of place. A non-missionary Church is an inconsistent Church and can never prosper aright." (93)

NOTES.

(91) M.M. Thomas, op. cit., p.111.
(93) W.S. Mackay, "The Church's Duty", sermon preached in the Free Church, Calcutta, March 16, 1850.
The principle has not changed and for all their weaknesses the idea of self-propagation is very much stronger among the younger churches than among the older churches of the West (94), where support of the church's ordinances and "living a Christian life" are too often regarded as the sum of a man's essential duties. The Indian Christian is at least seldom left in doubt about his obligation to try and convert his non-Christian neighbour.

That is not the same as saying that he does it, for the tradition of the paid evangelist dies hard. And even where, as in former mass movement areas, the idea of each man telling his neighbour is deeply ingrained, with later generations it becomes petrified. A recent study of the church in the Punjab reveals among communities there a strong belief in "mission" — Christians still thought of themselves as the first-fruits of a great movement — together with a weak expression of it. (95) Leaders are therefore often heard complaining that the growth of the Church is barely keeping pace with the population. (96) Despite the drives of the last thirty years towards national leadership, co-operation and church union, the churches most closely concerned with those movements have not grown in any way commensurate to the amount of effort put in. It has, on the contrary, been among the sects which stood aloof from such enterprises that evangelism has been carried out with most conviction and enthusiasm and they have reaped the fruits of their efforts. The churches connected with the ecumenical movement have been only too ready to persuade themselves, like their disheartened sisters in the West, that the era of opportunity is now over, the old religions are re-asserting themselves and it will be as much as they can do to maintain the status quo.

In complete contrast to such pessimism comes the kind of clarion call sent

NOTES.

(95) V.E.W. Hayward, op. cit., p.193.
out by the Rev. Din Dayal, the United Church of Northern India's own missionary to Kenya. Passionately denying the conclusion that India as an evangelistic opportunity is finished, he describes it as the biggest mission field outside the Communist world, and pointing to the fact that the Roman Catholics and many small sects are reaping where his own Church has sown he begs the Church to rise up and be equal to her task. (97)

Certainly this is the Indian Church's greatest responsibility and a challenge on her own doorstep. It is the whole Church, not her professional workers who must provide the response and while there is a variety of schemes on foot for training laymen as ambassadors for Christ, it is not through schemes but through ordinary men and women fired by God's spirit that the Gospel will become Good News for India. In the words of the New Delhi statement on witness, "Only laymen can speak to their fellows in terms of their common involvement in the work on which they are engaged and can demonstrate that the Gospel of Christ is relevant to this actual situation and not merely to some remote 'church' sphere of life." (98) Ultimately, as always, the future of the Church and its Gospel depends simply on its people.

"Our wise men have not seen the star

and the manger of Bethlehem

is not yet the cradle of our Lord.

But Christian hope never dies

and the ends of the strands of destiny

are held safe in the hands of God." (99)

NOTES.

(97) Din Dayal, "Defeatist Protestantism and Open Doors in India", I.R.M., Oct., 1960, pp.446-449


P. Beyerhaus and H. Lefevre, "The Responsible Church".


"South India Churchman", magazine of the Church of South India.

"United Church Review" magazine of the United Church of Northern India.

"Church Union News and Views", magazine of the Negotiating Committee for Church Union in North India and Pakistan.

MS papers, S.N.L.
Sources of Material on the Indian Churches

There are two primary sources of information on the Indian Churches available in this country.

These are:

1. Surviving foreign mission records of the churches which reunited to form the Church of Scotland in 1929, most of which are now stored in the Manuscript Department of the Scottish National Library. The bulk of these files consists of letter-books kept by the Convenors and Secretaries of the various Foreign Mission Committees and, although there are occasional gaps, records are more or less continuous from 1822 until 1929. They supply valuable material for any history of Foreign Mission enterprise from the Scottish end but have little to tell us about the Indian churches. The next largest group of material consists of incoming correspondence, mainly from missionaries, in the form of minutes, letters and miscellaneous papers. These often contain information about the developments of the churches, but only cover two brief periods, from about 1880 to 1905 and 1918 to 1925. Letters and papers from Free Church Missions are most numerous, particularly from Western India, there are relatively few from the Church of Scotland fields and no incoming letters from the man's Mission of the pre-1900 U.P. Church have survived. They cannot therefore be used as a basis for the history of the churches but only as supplementary sources.

2. Information supplied by missionaries and Indian or Pakistani Christians. Much of the material for the modern period has of necessity had to be gathered from them through correspondence or interviews.

The main secondary sources of material are printed and consist of:

1. Minutes of the various Foreign Mission Committees.

2. Annual Reports submitted by those Committees to their General Assemblies or Synod.
3. Articles in the periodicals published by the Scottish Churches.

4. "Conference", a magazine for Scottish Missions in India first published by the Free Church of Scotland.

5. Periodicals published by the Indian Churches.

From these secondary sources it would be possible to compile a voluminous history of Scottish Mission work in India, as elsewhere, and a fairly comprehensive, though not exhaustive, history of the churches they founded. For a full history of the Indian churches it would be necessary to study the records which they kept themselves from the 1900's onwards and these are not available in Britain.

Since it would have been a very great labour to go through every one of these volumes of printed records, perhaps 500 in number, to which access is at present possible in the Church of Scotland F.M. Department, and would also have meant covering the same ground several times over, a selection was made.

F.M.C. Minutes, while they may deal with important policy decisions, are concerned mainly with matters of administration and naturally say little about the life of the churches. Articles appearing in church periodicals, while often vividly descriptive, are aimed at capturing the interest of the reader rather than giving a record of facts. Annual reports, on the other hand, must try to present a balanced picture of progress, so that accurate reporting and summarising are combined with description and value-judgments. These reports have therefore been taken as a basis for the history of the individual fields, with occasional references from parallel sources.

The periodical "Conference" has also been used extensively for the modern period. Unfortunately, while at least one complete file exists in India, earlier issues kept in Edinburgh were destroyed during one of the salvage drives of the last war and only issues dated from the 1940's onwards survive. Issues between the years 1902-1911 are also preserved and others have been borrowed from private sources. This source is a valuable one since contributors write for fellow-/
missionaries much more frankly than they would for home consumption.

Issues of the "United Church Review", the monthly organ of the U.C.N.I., and the "South India Churchman", the magazine of the C.S.I., for the last eight years or so are filed by the Church of Scotland Foreign Mission Committee. They do not describe the work of the Scottish Mission churches in particular, but have been used in the concluding chapter to bring the story up to date. Issues of "Church Union News and Views", the organ of the Committee negotiating for union in North India, have also been examined.

Finally, selective use has been made of the great amount of other printed matter available, in particular Mission histories, annual or periodic reports from the fields, missionary biographies and books or pamphlets produced by missionaries or Indian nationals. A catalogue of the contents of the bookcases and cupboards belonging to the Foreign Mission Committee has recently (1967) been completed and future students are likely to find research into Scottish Mission history a somewhat easier task.

APPENDIX II

Theological Education

Theological education is a vital field but a specialist one. And since in India it has become a form of co-operative effort which goes well beyond the boundaries of church union, it is out with the scope of this study.

Although in the forty years between 1870 and 1910 the Christian population of India had more than trebled, the problems of raising and using a well-trained Indian ministry remained largely unsolved. A notable advance was made in 1910 when the Serampore College's Charter was revived and a theological department opened on an interdenominational basis. In the same year the United Theological College at Bangalore was founded as a joint venture.

By 1915 Serampore College was beginning to confer degrees on its own graduate/
students and those of the theological colleges affiliated with it. The
graduate-standard colleges are now five in number — the U.T.C., Bangalore;
Leonard Theological College, Jabalpore; Gurukul Lutheran Theological College,
Madras; Union Biblical Seminary, Yeotmal; and Bishop's College, Calcutta.
Serampore also co-ordinates the work of the regional "schools" which
educate theological students below graduate standard through the medium of an
Indian language. The total list of affiliated colleges stood in 1960 at
twenty.

The following are useful sources of information on the history and
present situation of theological education:

C.W. Ranson, "The Christian Minister in India", U.C.L.S., India,
1945; London, 1946.

M.H. Harrison, "After Ten Years", a Report on Theological Education
in India for the N.C.C., 1957.

H.H. Harrison, "Notes on the History of Protestant Theological Education
in India, 1910-1960". (Jubilee Volume of the U.T.C., Bangalore.)

"The Story of Serampore and its College", Baptist Mission Press,

Article by S.J. Samartha, (present Principal of Serampore College),
on "Rethinking Theological Education in India", N.C.C. Review,