THE CONTRIBUTION OF SCOTTISH MISSIONS
TO THE RISE OF
RESPONSIBLE CHURCHES IN INDIA.

J.M. Ott
THE CONTRIBUTION OF SCOTTISH MISSIONS TO THE RISE OF RESPONSIBLE CHURCHES IN INDIA

by

James McMichael Orr, B.D.

Thesis presented for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy of the University of Edinburgh in the Faculty of Divinity 1967

Volume I
Pages 1 - 419
# CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acknowledgments</th>
<th>ii</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviations</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Note on Bibliography</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Note on Terminology</td>
<td>iv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prologue</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Part I.  
**CHURCH AND MISSIONS.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter I</th>
<th>The Responsible Church</th>
<th>1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chapter II</td>
<td>The Scottish Church's Mission</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter III</td>
<td>The Pioneer Missionary: Alexander Duff and his Method</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter IV</td>
<td>Missionary Motives, Aims and Conditions</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter V.</td>
<td>Scottish Missions and Indian Churches</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Part II.  
**THE FIELDS.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter VI</th>
<th>The Church in Western India</th>
<th>256</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chapter VII</td>
<td>The Church in Bengal</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter VIII</td>
<td>The Church in South India</td>
<td>353</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter IX</td>
<td>The Church in Central India</td>
<td>386</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter X</td>
<td>The Church in the Punjab</td>
<td>420</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter XI</td>
<td>The Church in Rajasthan</td>
<td>462</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter XII</td>
<td>The Church in Santalia</td>
<td>503</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter XIII</td>
<td>The Church in the Eastern Himalayas</td>
<td>538</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Part III.  
**SPECIAL FEATURES.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter XIV</th>
<th>The Church Union Movement</th>
<th>575</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chapter XV</td>
<td>The Church and the Colleges</td>
<td>610</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Part IV.  
**OBSERVATIONS AND CONCLUSIONS.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter XVI</th>
<th>Recapitulation and Comparisons</th>
<th>655</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chapter XVII</td>
<td>Some Questions of Policy</td>
<td>687</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter XVIII</td>
<td>The Indian Churches Today</td>
<td>712</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix I</td>
<td>Sources of Material on the Indian Churches</td>
<td>756</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix II</td>
<td>Theological Education</td>
<td>758</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Grateful acknowledgements are made to the following, who were good enough to supply information either through lending documents not available elsewhere or from their personal knowledge and experience. A number of those mentioned also took great pains to correct manuscripts and make helpful suggestions.

**General Information**
- Dr. E.G.K. Hewat.

**Western India**
- Dr. James Kellock, Dr. Duncan Fraser.

**Bengal**
- Miss Alexa Scott, Dr. William Stewart.

**Madras**
- Rev. E.O. Shaw, Miss E.W. Young.

**Central India**
- Rev. George More, Dr. William Stewart.

**Punjab**

**Rajasthan**
- Rev. R.M. Macphail, Dr. Alastair King.

**Santalia**
- Rev. J.M. Brodie, Miss E.S. Scrimgeour, Rev. W.E. Scott.

**Eastern Himalayas**
- Dr. James Kellock, Dr. William Stewart, Bishop Michael Hollis.

**Church Union**
- Dr. James Kellock, Dr. A.J. Boyd.

**Conclusions**
- Dr. William Stewart.

A particular debt of gratitude is owing to Dr. James Kellock for much time spent on checking manuscripts and many valuable suggestions. Thanks are also due to the Rev. J.M. Hamilton, F.M.C. Secretary, and members of the office staff for their courtesy in helping me to gain access to documents; and to Mrs. Mary Gottes, Mrs. Beatrice Calder and the Copyright Secretarial Service, Glasgow, for patient work with drafts and typescripts.
Full titles are normally given and abbreviations confined to Notes or in order to avoid too much repetition. It should be noted, however, that while in Britain bodies such as the Church of England or the Church of Scotland usually receive their full titles, in India abbreviations like the C.S.I., the U.C.N.I. or the C.I.P.B.C. are in common use.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B.E.</td>
<td>Christian Endeavour.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.I.B.C.</td>
<td>Church of India, Burma and Ceylon.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.I.P.B.C.</td>
<td>Church of India, Burma, Pakistan and Ceylon.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.M.S.</td>
<td>Church Missionary Society.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. of S.</td>
<td>Church of Scotland.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.S.I.</td>
<td>Church of South India.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.S.M.</td>
<td>Church of Scotland Mission.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F.C.</td>
<td>Free Church of Scotland.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F.M.C.</td>
<td>Foreign Mission Committee.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I.M.C.</td>
<td>International Missionary Council.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I.R.M.</td>
<td>&quot;International Review of Missions&quot;.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L.M.S.</td>
<td>London Missionary Society.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M.C.C.</td>
<td>Madras Christian College.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our Church's Work</td>
<td>&quot;Our Church's Work in India,&quot; published by Oliphant, Anderson and Ferrier for the United Free Church of Scotland, about 1902.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N.C.C.</td>
<td>National Christian Council of India.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N.C.C.R.</td>
<td>&quot;National Christian Council Review&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P.C.I.</td>
<td>Presbyterian Church of India.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.C.M.</td>
<td>Student Christian Movement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.I.C.</td>
<td>&quot;South India Churchman&quot;.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.I.U.C.</td>
<td>South India United Church.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.N.L.</td>
<td>Scottish National Library.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U.C.N.I.</td>
<td>United Church of Northern India.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U.F.C.</td>
<td>United Free Church of Scotland.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U.P.</td>
<td>United Presbyterian.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W.C.C.</td>
<td>World Council of Churches.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y.M.C.A.</td>
<td>Young Men's Christian Association.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
NOTE ON BIBLIOGRAPHY

A list of sources is given at the end of each chapter. For Part IV, the list of sources for Chapters XVI to XVIII is given at the end of Chapter XVIII.

NOTE ON TERMINOLOGY

Certain terms, such as "native" or "vernacular" are now to be avoided because of past associations, "national" or "regional language" being more acceptable equivalents for the present day. In quoting from other works, however, the earlier forms of nomenclature have had to be retained.
PROLOGUE

"How can the body of Christian truth appear other than tinged with foreign elements when, apart from all appropriateness to their special wants, it is presented to the Hindoos as it is to ourselves in our various Confessions? We were conscious of some incongruity when we saw before us fifteen men - all converts to the faith, all preachers of the Gospel of Christ - going forth to their heathen countrymen with all the symbols and badges of our divided churches at home ——

It is clothing David in Saul's armour; it is an excellent coat of mail and a valiant sword, but there are other and simpler weapons better fitted for the shepherd, and with which he is more likely to accomplish his work."

Report of the Church of Scotland Deputation to India, 1868.

"Apart from a foreign denominationalism that Western Christianity has brought into India, it has also brought with it — an administrative, ecclesiastical and evangelistic machinery that is beyond the natural capacity and unsuited to the instinctive genius of the Indian —— The excessive centralisation of authority and the much more complicated and heavy machinery that a united Church implies will be the culmination and triumph of a foreign system that will not only clothe young David in the armour of King Saul, but still worse, in that of the Philistine Goliath."

Memorandum of the Christo Samaj to J.H. Oldham, 1921.

"The Church in Asia today might well be compared with the youthful David struggling with the well-intended gift of Saul's armour. It must fight its battles in its own way and it is saying of its Western inheritance, "I cannot do battle with these, for I am not used to them"."

Report of the Theological Study Institute, Singapore, 1959.
Chapter I.

The Nature of the Church.

"The doctrine of the Church has come in recent years to occupy a central place in theological discussion", wrote J.E.L. Newbigin in the introductory sentence to his Kerr lectures in 1952. He went on to enumerate three reasons for this development — the breakdown of Christendom, the missionary experience of the Churches in lands outside historic Christendom and the rise of the modern ecumenical movement. (1)

That statement is indeed an understatement and it would have been no exaggeration to say that never in the Protestant era have the Protestant Churches been so concerned with the question of their own nature. The main causes of this are as Bishop Newbigin stated.

In Europe, the established position enjoyed by Christianity, though it still on the surface appeared secure, had already been corroded by processes of secularisation in the political, cultural and social spheres and was visibly crumbling. Christianity could no longer claim that its beliefs and ethical standards represented those of the community at large. In Eastern Europe, and then beyond, a new faith, international Communism, presented the quite unique challenge of an atheistic religion. And in multiple contacts with Asia and Africa, where ancient religions, themselves reacting strongly to Western influences, were reviving with the growing nationalism of emergent races, Christianity was facing a situation where its assumption of absolute truth and even of superiority over other religions could nowhere be taken for granted.

NOTES

The predicament, which is that of Western civilisation described from the Christian point of view, has been analysed frequently enough but probably never more penetratingly than in these words of Hendrik Kraemer's:

"When this process (of secularisation) started, the Church was what is called the Corpus Christianum, that indissoluble unity of Church, Community and State which is the outstanding characteristic of the medieval period of European history —

"What, put positively, can be formulated as the present dominion of secularism and relativism, is, put negatively, the fact that the shattering of the Corpus Christianum has nowadays become a patent situation, and that religion and the Church seem so largely irrelevant to the bulk of man.

"The Church has therefore lost its 'recognised' or 'established' position in the conscience of man, although the remnants of this 'established' position are still alive in the structure of modern society —

"A fundamental re-orientation regarding its relation to the world and all its spheres of life has therefore become the urgent need of the hour —

"The Church and all Christians — are confronted with the question, 'What is its essential nature and what is its obligation to the world?'"(2)

Christian confidence was rudely shaken and, with the rise of Nazi totalitarianism in Germany, the prevailing gospel of liberal humanism and universal brotherhood was seen to be inadequate. Germany was the second of the great Christian States to deny its birth-right, condemn Christian teaching, persecute Christian leaders and set out on a deliberate policy of preaching and practising hatred of one's brother. The difference was not that unChristian things were done, but that they were said and done openly and even with pride.

NOTES.

The individualism which, in the words of one philosopher (3) defined religion as "what a man does with his solitariness", was clearly no match for such forces and already the young Swiss theologian, Karl Barth, was marching in the van of a movement which sought to re-affirm the fundamentals of the Gospel. Thus when an ecumenical gathering met at Oxford in the spiritual home of the Anglican Tractarian movement, the theme of its discussions was later summarised by the phrase, "Let the Church be the Church." (4)

When Christian leaders began to see themselves once more as a beleaguered minority within a hostile and pagan world, they came to speak increasingly of "the Church" and "the churches" rather than of "Christianity" or "The Kingdom of God." The doctrine of the Church came to be recognised as an integral part of the Gospel and a far greater measure of attention was directed to its nature. Where a nation, and the "parishes", or natural communities into which a nation was divided, could no longer be spoken of as basically Christian units, and where, due to the "atomising" processes of Western civilisation, millions of individuals had lost all sense of community, Christian thinkers had to consider afresh the character of the God-given community, the Church of Jesus Christ.

According to the traditions of evangelical Protestantism, it had always been the Gospel which came first, with the Church its servant and auxiliary. To think otherwise was to compound with the Roman heresy. And even for the Reformation's new prophet, Karl Barth, the Church only stood supremely among human things as under the crisis and judgment of God. Nevertheless the failure of the Gospel to make or keep a world Christian was compelling Christians to think in terms of the community to which the Gospel had been committed. What was the/

NOTES.

3. A.N. Whitehead.
It was founded on Jesus Christ, but what of the structure men had been erecting on that foundation? What was the Church's true shape and what the nature of its task, its weapons, its limits? What was its mission and its ministry and what were its distinguishing marks? Kraemer's own epoch-making volume, describing the situation of a world in transition, and finishing with the nature and task of the Church, set the pace for the doctrine of the Church to become a central theme of Protestant Christian concern, thought and discussion.

Yet long before the rise, in Twentieth Century Europe, of secularism, relativism and political totalitarianism, the experience of missionaries in lands beyond Europe and the emergence of young churches in those lands had raised practical questions about the nature of the Church. A situation had arisen here which was without historical precedent or parallel.

Christian "Missions" from the West which had been going out in increasing strength from the end of the Eighteenth Century, with the object of converting the heathen and raising up churches on the model of the New Testament, were finding that history refused to repeat itself. Converts were made and churches grew up, but this did not mean that the evangelists were now free to move on to other spheres of work. On the contrary, whether or not their efforts might be termed successful in the number of converts won, they found themselves getting year by year more deeply committed and involved. Christian communities which grew up as a result of their work did not immediately show those marks of independence and Spirit-filled life which are in Christian minds associated with the churches of the New Testament. They did not stand radiant and assured in the freedom with which Christ makes men free. They did not, after expressing gratitude to their Western fathers-in-God, indicate that they were now ready to take over from them the privilege of acting as missionaries to their own countrymen. They did not even appear able to undertake what churches everywhere for eighteen hundred years had accepted
without argument as a basic requirement — namely the maintenance of their own life and ministry. On the contrary, they remained communities which appeared to need not only spiritual guidance but practical and material assistance, and this over a period so lengthy that the "Missions" themselves became permanent fixtures and the framework for a new type of ecclesiastical structure.

This Mission-Church form of structure, which was a local phenomenon repeated almost universally wherever a Mission had been established, was something quite unique, and began to raise questions which were puzzling and disturbing.

How were these new communities, which might or might not have the technical status of "churches", to attain the autonomous life and character reflected in the churches of the New Testament? What was their relation to the Mission and Missionary Society from which they had sprung? What was their relation to the Churches which supported those Societies? To the missionaries who were their fathers-in-God? And to the State, the culture and the society to which by birth or race they belonged? To what extent were their models the churches of Jerusalem, Antioch, Ephesus or Phillipi? How far should they follow the example of the Western churches to which they stood in a filial relationship? Or how far was it God's will that, ignoring earlier models, they should under the guidance of the Spirit develop a form and character of their own?

As the new churches grew in size and number, questions of this kind began to be asked with increasing frequency and greater urgency. And as Missions and churches found that their neighbours were facing problems similar to their own, there was a general move towards trying to solve them in concert. These younger communities then, simply because they were small dependent, and isolated and lived as tiny Christian minorities in the middle of/
a non-Christian culture which it was part of their task to destroy or transform, found themselves sharing many things in common which were not shared with the older Western churches. Through bonds of fellowship in which the overcoming of common difficulties played a large part, they worked out their own systems of "comity", co-operation and even organic union. Of these we shall have more to say in later chapters. At present we shall simply note that their situation, and the need to resolve particular problems inherent in it, had the result of concentrating many minds on the doctrine and nature of the Church.

In such efforts much assistance was given by the rise of the ecumenical movement, the last of the three influences mentioned by Bishop Newbigin. As it will be necessary to describe that movement later in its proper historical context, little need be said about it here. It will again be sufficient to observe that it was the missionary enterprises of Western Churches in Eastern lands which manufactured the movement and the meeting of the first International Missionary Conference which launched it. From this time onwards the plans and progress of the majority of the younger churches were thoroughly intertwined with those of the ecumenical movement.

Eventually the three streams which we have been describing flowed into one, until consideration of the nature of the world-wide Church became a matter of concern to the world-wide Church itself. Historically, it was the stream of missionary activity and theology which started the process and then went on to run parallel to the wider but shallower river of ecumenical thought and influence. The most powerful current of all, that represented by reaction to the shaking of the foundations of Western civilisation, was the last to appear from underground. But because its sources lay further back and it had been gathering strength over the longest course, once it reached the surface it proved most powerful, and the other two streams were drawn into it. Concern about the nature of the Mission-churches and of the ecumenical task were merged
in more comprehensive questions about the nature of the Church itself, its place in the world and its message to that world.

The thinking of theologians from the West or the East, from the older churches or the younger, from a background of traditional Christendom or of monistic pantheism, could no longer easily be separated, as would once have been possible, into distinct compartments. As in Kraemer's case it was a Western theologian without missionary experience who prepared the younger churches for the next stage of their task, so after the second world war it came to be missionary leaders and representatives of younger churches who wrote or lectured for the West, not on "foreign missions" but on such subjects as the nature of the Church, its revival and religion for secular men. (5)

It is clear that the three currents, although they have not completely merged, are now thoroughly intermingled. And this is nowhere more evident than in lines of thought which seek to isolate and define the basic character of the Church — and the "churches" (6)

NOTES.

(5) No attempt is made here to do more than touch on such a major theme and the examples given are only straws in the wind. Yet even straws show in which direction a gale is blowing. It is not fortuitous that a missionary like Newbigin should be lecturing on the nature of the Church and writing on "Honest Religion for Secular Man" (S.C.M. Press, 1966), or that when W.A. Visser 't Hooft, Secretary of the World Council of Churches, was asked to give the thirteenth in the series of Dale Lectures, the word "Church" should, for the first time, appear in the title of those lectures. (W.A. Visser 't Hooft, "The Renewal of the Church", S.C.M. Press, London, 1956).

(6) So far as possible the traditional forms will be followed in usage of the word ecclesia. Following the N.T. which speaks of ecclesia in two senses, "the Church", with a capital, will be used to denote the Universal Church; and "church" or "churches", without the capital, for the local congregation with Christ in their midst. There remains the problem of how to describe those ecclesiastical organisations which have no counterpart in the New Testament. Generally "church", with a capital, will be used to describe a recognised organisation, such as "The Church of Scotland". In this sense we may speak of "The Western Churches", meaning the denominational organisations and not the aggregate of all Western congregations. But a phrase such as "the Western churches", without a capital, may have to be used when distinguishing individual denominations from the Church universal.
What makes a group of Christian believers into a church? What distinguishes such a body from any group of men, women and children sharing certain religious beliefs, traditions, hopes and aims? What turns them into something more, from a like-minded coterie of pious people into a living cell of the organism which the New Testament calls the Body of Christ? And what are the spiritual marks by which its membership of the Body can be recognised?

The base from which questions of this kind arise is wide enough at present to include not only the whole circle of the world-wide Church but the local church at any point on its circumference. So whereas even a few years ago someone speaking of a "free church" would normally be assumed to be referring not to Christian freedom in general but to certain Western churches in a historical relationship with the State; and someone else mentioning the "indigenous church" could reasonably be taken as describing a non-Western church in relation to a non-Christian culture; now terminology, Biblical and non-Biblical, increasingly finds common ground. Adult status, maturity, self-hood, responsibility — these are all familiar terms today, and they are used to describe the Church and the churches generally with no unspoken conditions attached. The streams have converged and with every year grow more fully merged. Indeed it was the writer's experience, on purchasing a volume on "The Responsible Church", to discover that instead of a work on the theory and theology of missions he had been given one dealing with the Church of England's obligations to society. (7) This is more than mere verbal coincidence. The wording coincides because more and more does the thinking overlap.

NOTES.

The point about the general convergence of theological thought must be made because it will be now necessary for us to go back to the source of the second of the three streams we have been describing, in order to follow its course in greater detail. It was Western missionaries and national leaders in the young churches who first in the modern era started asking such questions as, "What is the nature of the Church? How far does the Christian community to which I belong conform to the New Testament model? How far does the denominational structure to which I belong conform? What must be done, that the Body of Christ may be able to do the work of Christ in this land where it has now been set?"

In time, as we have seen, their conclusions contributed to and provided some of the ground-work for a more comprehensive enquiry. But even before this took place, dependent on the answers which were given to such queries and the way in which practical efforts were then directed, the churches with which missionaries were working took shape. It is this process that we must now examine more carefully.

When the missionaries of whom we have been speaking went out in what they themselves sometimes described as "the footsteps of the apostles", to preach the Gospel and to plant churches, they did so with strong hopes but few preconceived notions about the results of their efforts or the shape of the problems they were likely to encounter. For all they knew to the contrary, the history of First-Century Christianity was about to be repeated and the Holy Spirit, blowing where it listed, would by His own mysterious and divine means of operation bring all nations to the feet of Christ as once He had brought the Roman Empire under the sign of the Cross. They had no power to see into the future except in eschatological terms and they spent little time speculating about it. Only as their work advanced -- or failed to advance -- /
/did they gain a clearer insight into what, under God, they were trying to do and the means for achieving their ends.

Invariably, along with any advances they experienced failures and frustrations in two particular spheres. First, men failed to respond to the message of the Gospel and the call of Christ, and to accept Him as Saviour and Lord. In the second place, those who did respond and were baptised failed to react in the hoped-for manner, as Christians in the past appeared to have reacted by growing in grace and spiritual maturity.

Neither the failure to respond nor the failure to develop constituted by itself a surprise, because both ran true to the norms of Scripture and early missionary experience. The truth of the Gospel presents a stumbling-block to sinful men, and even the redeemed are pilgrims still and not possessors of the Kingdom. It was also a fundamental truth of Scripture that not many noble, wise or mighty would be chosen, so faults which were due to ignorance and poverty as well as sin had to be treated with a love that suffers long and is kind. The old Adam continues to inhabit the same earthly tabernacle as the man in Christ, and those missionaries were prepared to fight both the head-on battle for conversion and the winning of souls and the long-drawn-out campaign for sanctification.

What most of them were not prepared for was the fact that the process of sanctification soon presented itself as not just lengthy but unending. The "pressure for perfection" became overwhelming. (8) While in theory the point should at some time be reached when it was clear that groups of converts were in a position to stand on their own feet and shoulder full responsibility for themselves, in practice the point kept receding into the future. This in turn affected the immediate purpose of the Mission, for if a Mission was to be almost completely involved with "the care of the churches", and if those/

---

NOTES

(8) For the exposition of this tendency, see D. McGavran, "How Churches Grow", World Dominion Press, London, 1959. Chapter XIII.
churches were not themselves ready to undertake freely the work of evangelising their heathen neighbours, the result would be sterility and stagnation.

Missionary policy therefore had to start grappling with these two inter-connected problems, the sowing of the seed and the ripening of the harvest. Certain governing principles were put forward and certain theories of missionary work emerged.

"Missions must have as their primary goal the establishment of churches". (9) The Protestant missionaries of a hundred years ago would not have agreed with such a statement. They would have said the purpose of missions was to preach the Gospel. Nevertheless they were concerned also with establishing churches and when the kind of churches they wished to see did not develop of their own accord, they began to think about and define the nature of an autonomous church. Once the principles had been established, they believed it should be possible for Missions to achieve their aim with greater speed, ease and thoroughness.

The pioneers in the field of creative missionary policy were Henry Venn, an Englishman and an Anglican, and Rufus Anderson, an American Congregationalist. Venn's father and grandfather had been members of the group of evangelical English churchmen known as "the Clapham Sect" and his father was one of the founder members of the Church Missionary Society, for which Venn himself acted as secretary for about thirty years from 1831. His contemporary, Rufus Anderson, had a similar position in Boston with the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions, a body whose formation/

NOTES.

owed much to the influence of Claudius Buchanan, another Anglican evangelical. (10) The two secretaries corresponded regularly, and between them worked out and gained wide acceptance for the principle, about which there was no real argument, that it was the aim of Missions to found independent churches. They also provided a definition of an autonomous church, namely that it must be self-supporting, self-governing and self-propagating. Venn's Memorandum which included a note about "the settlement of a Native Church under Native Pastors upon a self-supporting system" was dated 1851: Anderson, with his more individualistic background, stressed the self-propagating qualities required of congregations: and by 1861 the famous "three selves" formula had taken shape. A slight difference of emphasis was discernible, the Anglican Venn thinking of "the church" rather in terms of the organised body and Anderson in terms of the localised community with its missionary obligation. Another difference which was to become important later was Venn's idea concerning the "euthanasia of the Mission."

"Regarding the ultimate object of a mission", he wrote in the same momentous Point Ten of his Memorandum, "—it should be borne in mind that the progress of a mission mainly depends upon the training up and the location of native pastors: and that, as it has been happily expressed, the 'euthanasia of a mission' takes place when a missionary, served by well-trained native congregations under native pastors, is able to resign all pastoral work into their hands, and gradually relax his superintendence over the pastors themselves, till it insensibly ceases: and so the mission passes into a settled Christian community. Then the missionary and all/

NOTES.

missionary agency should be transferred to the 'regions beyond'." (11)
This concept of the relation between Church and Mission which regards the Mission as a sort of scaffolding which will ultimately be dismantled and used again was later to prove most significant. (12)

The ideas which Venn and Anderson put into currency in the 1850's and 1860's had within another twenty years become such common property that they were almost being taken for granted. Thus late in the 1860's a report submitted to the Church of Scotland's General Assembly concerning its "East India Mission", after explaining that the Native Church was still in its infancy went on to say:

"The whole work of Missions in our Church has hitherto been so much preparatory --- we have native pastors in our own Church, and there are numerous native pastors connected with other churches, but as yet the more prominent aspects of all Christian Missions are of a European rather than a native kind." Yet the object of raising up an Indian church is clear in the minds of those who support the Mission -- "The leading idea of the Church, in the establishment of the India Mission, was to raise up a native ministry --- it is the thought which runs through the whole history of the Mission." And it is recognised that until a church possessing some measure of autonomy is established, the Christian cause cannot flourish --- "until a stronger feeling of self-reliance is developed among native churches, the cause of Christ cannot be regarded as placed on a satisfactory basis in India. So long as our native churches exist on their present footing, there/

NOTES
(12) Beyerhaus, pp. 25-33, gives a selective account of the ideas of Venn and Anderson.
is no room for that wider and freer expansion which all hope to see."(13)

Patently there is a link existing between the ideas expressed in this Report and those which Venn and Anderson had been the first to formulate. Nor is this just the inevitable similarity to be found among men doing the same kind of work with identical aims. A Report from the same Mission a few years later reveals that policies were being built on a common basis. "We hope it may yet grow", wrote the Church of Scotland's missionary in Calcutta, "into what must be, if India is to be converted, a Church taught by natives, governed by natives, supported by natives and extended by natives--"(14)

To follow the same theme a little further, among the Resolutions put out by a meeting of the Alliance of Reformed Churches in 1887, the first was to the effect that Mission Churches should be independent of Home Churches, but that self-government was dependent on (financial) self-support(15). Local Missionary Conferences on the fields, and the first Ecumenical Conference on Foreign Missions which was held in London in 1888, provided further opportunities for the exchange of such ideas, and by the 1890's the Free Church of Scotland was saying: /

NOTES.


(14) C. of S. Report, 1870, p.18. "The "it" referred to here is The Brahma Samaj, the Society founded by the Indian reformer Ram Mohun Roy, which missionaries admired for its rejection of idolatry and some hoped would form a bridge between Hinduism and Christianity and the seed of a truly Indian Church. (The whiff of Gettysburg is unexpected but unmistakable!)

"For several years no question has been so frequently the subject of careful action as that of the development of the Native Church on a self-supporting basis." (16) In the light of these samples we may take it as reasonable to assume that ideas so commonly expressed in Scottish and Presbyterian circles were equally familiar among most English and American missionaries.

Nevertheless it is equally true that while the autonomy of the native Church was taken as a desirable end, the goal came increasingly to be seen as a distant one and very little effort was made to put it into practice. Venn himself made a courageous if rather unsuccessful attempt to put his principles of self-sufficiency to the test by establishing a "Native Pastorate" in Sierra Leone in 1860, and having Samuel Crowther, an able African convert, consecrated as a bishop. (17) The experiment was not a very happy one, however, and the vast majority of Western missionaries continued to be of the opinion that autonomy could only be reached after a long period of carefully guided development. Particularly in Indian missionary circles --- and India because of its size, the number of missionaries at work there and its early development, tended to be thought of as the "senior" field --- missionaries were talking and thinking in terms of generations rather than years. "It is not the levelling of a single wall or the opening of a single door", wrote William Miller of Madras in 1893. (18)
The reasons for such procrastination were two-fold. In the first place, missionaries were quite honestly of the opinion that converts were not yet mature enough to take full responsibility. And secondly, Western Missions were themselves expanding at such a rate that the whole idea of 'euthanasia' appeared unrealistic. In 1867, according to one calculation, the total number of Protestant missionaries in India and Ceylon amounted to a little over 1,100, the number of native Protestant communicants was about 35,000 and their Christian communities might be estimated as between 80,000 and 100,000. (19) By the end of the Century, there were between ninety and a hundred Missionary Societies at work in India alone, the number of missionaries had more than trebled and the number of Christians had multiplied more than ten times over. (20)

Even more to the point in influencing missionary thinking were the eight thousand day schools, 360 High schools and Colleges and 300 Hospitals and Dispensaries which those Societies had established and now considered it necessary to keep running. (21)

The young native churches were in no position to maintain such structures, which the Missions themselves often only managed with difficulty to staff and keep on a sound financial footing, usually with the aid of substantial government subsidies. The total "native liberality" of the Church of Scotland Mission's churches in India in 1900 came to less than /

**NOTES.**


(21) Ibid.
£200, while the total amount raised locally from other sources was over £10,000. (22) Thus it came about that while the principle of founding independent churches with their qualifying characteristics of self-support, self-government and self-propagation was universally approved and applauded, and after the year 1900 churches which were technically independent of Mission supervision actually began to be formed, in point of fact this independence was a myth, and was recognised as such by Indian Christians and missionaries alike.

It was in protest against the perpetuation of this static position that Roland Allen, an Anglo-Catholic clergyman who had been a missionary in China, put forward a point of view which he described as the Biblical pattern of "spontaneous expansion". (23) Allen was in many ways a thinker far ahead of his time and the larger Missionary Societies had by now become so deeply involved with institutional work that, even had they wished to do so, it would have meant a very great upheaval to turn from the methods they had chosen to adopt in favour of those advocated by Allen. The result was that his ideas had little influence during the early years of the Twentieth Century when they were first made public and it is only in the last few decades that they have achieved popularity as well as prominence.

Yet by insisting on the fact that self-support, self-government and self-propagation were not ultimate achievements for a church to work towards, but gifts of God's Spirit which were, from the very start, the possession of the smallest, weakest and most illiterate group of new converts, Allen was acting as spokesman for a growing body of opinion. He further brought into/

NOTES.

(22) Church of Scotland Report, 1901, Statistics.
(23) See under "General Sources" for this chapter.
the open the uneasiness present in many minds about the multiplication of institutions and the top-heavy type of organisation which had become the accepted norm of mission work. Referring once more to the Report of the Church of Scotland Deputation which visited India late in the 1860's, we find its two members, Dr. Norman MacLeod and Dr. Archibald Watson recording:

"We found a few European ministers of experience in India who believed --- that a far wiser and healthier way would be to leave native converts to form themselves into small communities and provide for keeping alive their common faith and hopes; but in most cases we found that distrust of the native capacity prevailed". (24)

It was exactly this "distrust of native capacity" which Allen pin-pointed as really doubt about the capacity of the Holy Spirit to guide and inspire Christ's Church and build it up in grace. Western missionaries, he complained, kept the young churches in leading strings because they "feared for the doctrine", whereas what Christ asks of His disciples is "not so much exposition of His doctrine as witness to His power." (25)

Roland Allen's books make excellent reading today, indeed there is in them some of the undying fire of a P.T. Forsyth. And in his reactions against expensive buildings and elaborate institutions, a highly trained and subsidised ministry, a westernised theology, an arbitrary separation of Church and Mission and paternalism in general, he has pioneered lines of thought which have now been recognised to contain much truth. Through the World Dominion Movement and its /

NOTES.
Press, which Allen helped to found, the ideas he stood for are still being developed, Dr. McGavran’s "How Churches Grow" being a good example of the Roland Allen approach brought up to date (26). As Beyerhaus has put it, "Under pressure of world politics, partly at least, a modern version of their demands for reform has been universally adopted." (27)

Yet Allen’s most valuable contribution to missionary activity was probably just the extent to which he managed to fix in missionary minds and consciences a vision which had been growing dim — that of the autonomous church. As part of that vision there was also growing up another idea, that of a church which must be not only independent in fact and spirit but indigenous by nature.

The Indigenous Church.

It had been necessary to work out the characteristics of an autonomous church simply because the young Christian communities on the Mission fields seemed retarded in this respect. Indeed the problem is one which has not yet been fully solved.

After the first world war, however, the aspect of the problem which captured most minds was not so much that of the Church’s autonomous nature as its indigenous quality. The two concepts were of course complementary. The word "indigenous" had been in use since the start of the modern missionary enterprise, and pamphlets issued by the Roland Allen school of thought through the World Dominion Press appeared under/

NOTES.

(26) See Note 8.

(27) Beyerhaus, p. 39.


The general title of "The Indigenous Church Series" (28). Yet it was not until the 1920's that the fuller implications of the term "indigenous" began to receive real attention. Political events, especially in China, India and Japan, had their effect here and much emphasis was now being placed on the unnatural foreignness of the native churches. Their alien character was in turn put forward as the main reason why they did not attract converts and were failing to achieve self-support and independent status. There were also a number of contributing reasons for the new emphasis.

To begin with, it was not until the World Missionary Conference held at Edinburgh in 1910 that the Western Churches started looking at the younger churches in the light of Christian communities which might have insights, feelings and a viewpoint of their own. Although there were only seventeen non-Western delegates at the Conference, and all represented Missions rather than native Churches, yet they made an impact quite out of proportion to their numbers. In particular some words spoken by young V.S. Azariah of Dornakal on "The Problem of Co-operation between Foreign and Native Workers" made a deep impression:

"Through all the ages to come the Indian Church will rise up in gratitude to attest the heroism and self-denying labour of the missionary body. You have given your goods to feed the poor. You have given your bodies to be burned. We also ask for love. Give us friends." (29)

NOTES.

(28) Besides Roland Allen's works, the World Dominion Press was responsible for such publications as W.F. Rowland's "Indigenous Ideals in Practice", R. Allen and A. McLeish's "The Real Significance of Devolution", and S.W.J. Clark's "The Indigenous Church".

No subject was more earnestly discussed than that of the future of "the native Churches" and when the Conference elected a Continuation Committee an African, an Asian and a Chinese were among those appointed as members. The preface to the report of one of the Commissions of the Conference summed up the contemporary attitude by saying, "We have now to think of the Church in the mission field as not a by-product of missionary work, but as by itself by far the most efficient element in the Christian propaganda". (30)

The younger churches were at last on the way to being regarded as entities to be consulted and not just problems needing to be tackled. And it was a matter of significance that the non-Westerners most prominent in missionary circles, men like Azariah, the first Indian Protestant bishop, and K.C. Chatterji, the first Moderator of the Presbyterian Church of India, should also be prominent church leaders. (31)

At the same time as a genuine international exchange of missionary ideas and experience was being formed (32), and the younger churches were actually starting to express themselves, though still under Western leadership, Western ideas towards the non-Christian world were also experiencing a change. This was the hey-day of Protestant liberal theology and, with comparative religion graduating to the position of a major science, much less stress was being laid on the exclusive qualities of the Christian Gospel. In India, a book such as J.N. Farquhar's "Crown of Hinduism" drew a picture of Christianity as the divine fulfilment of all that was best in Hinduism rather than a revelation of that religion's essential falsity. (33)

NOTES.

An approach of this kind stood in striking contrast to the contemporary but traditional "Arsenal for Christian Soldiers in India", which massed Christian arguments against the evils of idolatry. (34) And it was followed up in the 1920's by such popular works as Stanley Jones' "The Christ of the Indian Road" or Nicol Macnicol's "India in the Dark Wood". (35) This was theological liberalism at its best, warmed by genuine brotherly love and inspired by a deep personal devotion to Christ.

Ideas of this kind gave impetus, especially in British missionary circles, to a sense of shame and dislike for imperialism and colonialism. Ideas were in the air which were later to lead to pacifism and appeasement and Britons, no longer taking quiet pride in the fact that they were citizens of the world's greatest imperial power, showed a new eagerness to look for and give credit to what was good in other traditions and cultures. (36) It was no longer false religion which was seen to be the real enemy of Christianity, but secularism in all its forms, particularly the secularising of Christian aims. (37) And on the administrative side of missionary work, the process of handing over responsibility to national leaders, to which was given the name of "devolution", had become widespread.

NOTES.

(34) J.Fr.Stacker, "The Arsenal for Christian Soldiers in India", C.L.S., Madras, 1910. Stacker was a missionary of the Evangelical Lutheran Church.


(36) Stanley Jones was an American, and liberalism and anti-imperialism were more marked in American missionary circles. Yet in British colonies and dominions, American missionaries appreciated government protection and were careful to avoid inflammatory statements. See here S.C. Neill, "Colonialism and Christian Missions", Lutterworth Press, London, 1966, Chapter III.

(37) Nicol Macnicol remarks that when Professor Rudolph Otto visited India, he considered that Missions themselves had become "very strongly secularised". op.cit., p.199.
The new outlook can best be illustrated, perhaps, by a contemporary "vision" of what the Indian Church of the future could look like.

"I seem to see the Indian Church modelled, as regards its organisation, on the lines of the ancient village community", wrote one missionary in 1920. "In every village the natural leader of the community, without relinquishing his own profession, acts as elder or minister to the congregation, commissioned to dispense to them the Sacraments. In all matters that concern the welfare and up-building of the local Church, he acts in consultation with his panchayat, which has the confidence of the people --

"I see the men and women in these Christian communities not aping the ways of Western civilisation, but true Indians, Indians in dress, Indians in manner of life, Indians in heart, glorying in their country's heritage, eager to forward her freedom; bound together in a brotherhood of helpfulness more strong than caste, yet not isolated from their non-Christian fellow-countrymen--

"And the children at school -- not in stuffy, nor even the most hygienic classrooms -- but in the wide spaces of nature and under the shade of trees; and again, not cramming for examinations, but learning rather to think for themselves and growing daily in moral stature; their training religious through and through; --- loving the heroes of the Bible, loving too the heroes of the great epics, the Mahabharata and the Ramayana: and as they grow older, entering into the treasure house of the deep things of the spirit, their minds steeped in the teaching of the New Testament, yet not scorning the help of the Upanishads, the Bhagavadgita and the great bhakti saints. ----

"I see men, women and children alike eagerly awaiting and rejoicing in the great festivals --- Christmas, above all the children's festival; Makarasankranta, with its New Year greetings; Easter, the festival of the New Life, incorporating in itself whatever is worth preserving of Holi; Dipavali, the festival of light with its blaze of lamps; and many others. /
"And then the worship. I see churches, at least in Hindu India, shaped like temples only with a larger shrine. The outer court is used for Kirtans, for public preachings and for all large gatherings. The inner sanctuary serves for the regular assemblies of the faithful. On the walls are sculptures or frescoes by Indian artists -- Isaiah in the temple, and Gautama the Buddha beneath the bo-tree, the great illumined seers; Sita, the type of wifely faithfulness, and Ruth the Moabiteess -- Within the Sanctuary no lingam or Ganesh or Hanuman, but the figure of Christ crucified -- in place of the smoke of the home the incense rising; drums beating and cymbals clashing; the people barefooted, now bending prostrate in adoration, now joining in the bhaajana that they love, now greeting one another with the 'salutation of peace', now partaking without distinction of caste or rank in the Holy Food.

"I see also the Christian sadhus, clad in their orange robes, travelling from place to place -- And I see ashrams -- homes of meditation, prayer and study, set among surroundings of natural beauty ...

"And over all, in ashram and town and village, I see not Krishna but Christ enthroned -- yet a Christ who comes not to destroy but to fulfil. Can we doubt that at the feet of a Christ so witnessed India would fall down and worship?" (38)

Those familiar with Indian churches today may be encouraged when they realise that some parts of the vision at least have become reality. And the dream itself, based as it was on the planned and directed efforts of thousands of Christian workers on five continents, helps to explain the marked difference in atmosphere which obtained between the Conference of /

---

NOTES.

/ 1910 and the meeting of the International Missionary Conference at Jerusalem in 1928. It was not only the first such gathering of international stature to be meeting on non-European soil, but on this occasion one quarter of the delegates came from non-Western churches. Among the subjects to which particular attention was given were the threat of secularism, the right missionary attitude towards other religious faiths and relations between the younger and the older churches. At Jerusalem the delegates from the younger churches made a much more positive contribution to discussions, and it was a reflection of the rising tide of resentment against political domination by the West that there should appear the first stirrings of a critical opposition to westernised Christianity. (39)

The Commission on relations between the younger and older churches was in fact a discussion on various forms of autonomy and indigenisation. In the course of the preparatory studies made and published for delegates to use, Henry Venn's words concerning a self-supporting native church and the euthanasia of the mission were quoted in full (40), and a statement made by J.H. Oldham quoted at length a Memorandum which he had received seven years earlier. In this the Indian Christo Samaj, pleading for an indigenous church structure, had emphasised very strongly the foreign nature of so much Eastern Christianity.

"Apart from a foreign denominationalism that Western Christianity has introduced into India" ran the Memorandum, "— it has also brought with it an administrative, ecclesiastical and evangelistic machinery that is beyond

NOTES.


(40) Report of the Jerusalem Meeting, Vol.III, p. 31
the natural capacity and unsuited to the instinctive genius of the Indian. Indian religion has laid far less emphasis on close organisation and on costly institutions and has depended far more on the personal and voluntary service of unorganised religious workers of the type of the Sadhu. The excessive centralisation of authority and the much more complicated and heavy machinery that a united church implies will be the culmination and triumph of a foreign system that will not only clothe the young David in the armour of King Saul but still worse, in that of the Philistine Goliath. We plead that the development of the Indian type of Christianity embodying Indian ideals should precede any efforts to organise an Indian Church.

It should perhaps be made clear that the Christo Samaj was by no means fully representative even of advanced Indian Christian opinion and its ideas concerning church union and a fellowship with a minimum of organised life were not shared by many national leaders. Yet the Memorandum was one expression of a point of view which was brought out forcibly by Chinese delegates in particular and also by Africans. Christian truth and national pride combined to make them feel that the churches to which they belonged were not fully indigenous to their land and that this was a basic fault.

Time and again the point was made that independence by itself was not enough. "As the Church on the Mission field has grown and taken form, leaders both native and foreign have asked, 'What kind of Church are we working for, what kind of Churches do we want?' Is the term 'a self-supporting, self-governing, self-propagating Church' sufficient? Must not a Church also be indigenous to the soil, filled with the native spirit, to become a permanent part of the nation's life? The very number of definitions found in missionary literature in the last fifteen years shows the effort being made to think out /

\[\text{NOTES.}\]

(41) Ibid., p.51
the ideal towards which the Christian movement is tending —" (42)

At Jerusalem, the shift from a Gospel-centred to a Church-centred theology which we noted at the beginning of this chapter had not yet taken place. The impact of the Gospel had indeed been so far watered down by an over-apologetic attitude which was commending Christianity as one of the great religions of mankind, that the Conference has been spoken of as "the Nadir of the modern missionary movement". (43) But the seed of change was present. In dealing with the relation of Missions to the younger churches it was pointed out that "a church-centric conception of foreign missions meant virtually a new theology of missions itself." (44) In the course of the next ten years this insight was going to be developed until it provided one of the main themes of the next Conference. And when the time came round for this to meet near Madras in 1938 the shift of focus was well under way.

The veteran John R. Mott set the theme for Tambaram in his opening speech when he said, "Notice, it is the Church which is to be at the centre of our thinking and resolving these creative days." (45)

A very thorough preparatory study organised by Merle Davis had made wide researches into the economic basis of the Church and this meeting of the Council has been aptly described as "a manifestation of the Church Universal and its missionary nature," (46)

NOTES.

(42) Ibid., p.41.
Of particular interest for our theme was the Commission on "The Growing Church", which started with the presentation of field reports on types of indigenous development by a wide variety of churches, both young and old. The emphasis on an indigenous church truly rooted in native soil was as strong as ever. There were in addition direct criticisms of the weakness of churches which bore the stamp of a foreign importation, especially in countries where nationalism was a growing force. But there were also some significant new developments.

The findings of this Commission revealed that the Scylla and Charybdis of the two thorniest problems confronting the search for autonomy were now clear enough to be recognisable. "--- the young church is confronted with two grave perils. On the one hand there is the danger that it be so tied to the forms of an older church that it is prevented from becoming indigenous. On the other hand it may be driven by undue deference to the spirit of the times to admit into its life and teaching elements which are incompatible with the doctrine and practice of the early Church." (47)

We should note that a new note was being struck here which proved of considerable importance. Just as the simple demand for autonomy had been modified by an understanding of the fact that self-determination is not enough -- a Church which is independent but alien in appearance to those to whom it preaches the Gospel is not Christ's Church in the land -- so now another truth which had been implicitly accepted, but only in its negative aspect, was being presented in positive form. Although churches ought to be indigenous by nature, it was not enough to say that by the act of putting their roots into native soil they were thereby representing Christ. "The Christian Church/

NOTES.

/does not exist for the sake of being indigenous", Dr. Cheng Ching-yi had said at Jerusalem, "Make it indigenous and we have still to solve the main problem -- the Church exists for the worship of God, Christian fellowship, the training of its members in spiritual daily life, for service for the good of our fellow men and for the propagation of the true message of love!" (48)

What in 1928 had been an individual statement was now repeated, after the passage of another ten years, as among the principal findings of this Commission. "An indigenous Church" ran the reports, "Cannot be content merely to assimilate itself, it will seek to purify the natural life in the new life in Jesus Christ. An indigenous church cannot be satisfied with being merely a church within the boundaries of a nation, but will maintain the connection with the universal Church. It is not a church which makes it easier for its members by releasing them from a brave and dangerous confession. It is not a church without a rock of offence. Woe unto us if we try to remove or cancel the rock of offence which consists in the absolute claim of Christ to be Lord of all --- Yet we must say with equal emphasis: woe unto us if the stumbling-block lies in the pride or foreignness of our church.

"An indigenous church, young or old, in the East or the West, is a church which rooted in obedience to Christ, spontaneously uses forms of thought and modes of expression natural and familiar to its own environment. Such a church arises in response to Christ's own call." (49)

In these developments of thought and the policy-changes for which they were responsible, the Scottish Missions operating in India and the churches/

NOTES.

(49) "International Missionary Conference at Tambaram", Vol. II, pp.296-297.
connected with them took their part. A Presbyterian Church of India had been formed early in the 1900's and within the next twenty years the Scottish Missions, like many others, had openly resolved to follow a policy of devolution and had initiated plans to hand over supervision of their agencies to boards of the Indian Church. (50) Such boards had Indians as the majority of their members and frequently an Indian chairman. (51)

Much effort was expended in getting congregations which had been in the habit of expecting help from the Mission to undertake the maintenance of their own buildings and pay the full salary of their pastor. A typical story of this time which was quoted with approval concerns a visitor to a Christian village who found the congregation worshipping in a dilapidated building badly in need of repair and said to the pastor, "This seems to mean failure."

"Oh no", replied the pastor, "It means success", and he explained that when the Mission had refused to pay any further towards the repair of the building, cracks had appeared in the walls and the roof began to sag. But these signs of neglect had at last stirred the congregation to take matters into their own hands and already half the money had been collected for the erection of a new church. Due to the enthusiasm roused there was now only one non-Christian family left in the village. (52)

NOTES.


(51) A typical example was the Evangelistic Board of the Presbyterian Church in Poona, which in 1921 had eleven members, eight of whom, including the Chairman, were Indian and the remaining three missionaries. Yet the fact this should be picked out for mention shows the novelty of the idea. U.F.C. Report, 1922, p. 25.

(52) C. of S. Report, 1929, p.258.
Among the reports on indigenous development presented at the Jerusalem meeting was one from the United Church of Northern India, with which the majority of Scottish Mission Churches were by that time connected. (53) And in the directing of both church and Mission policy Indians were now on more of an equal footing with missionaries. The example may be taken of an article appearing in "Conference", a magazine for Scottish missionaries in India, in the year 1936. Here a distinguished Indian Christian, G.V. Job, advised the Scottish Foreign Mission Committee that its first task was to build up Christian communities. More effort should be put into rural uplift and there should be less subsidising of city congregations which would be all the healthier if asked to make a few sacrifices. But help should be given in training Christians for the professions and in getting land for those in rural communities. "Other assistance" concluded the writer, "would only postpone the day of the emergence of a strong, independent, indigenous Church of Christ in our land." (54)

These and many other examples which could be adduced made it evident that the Scottish Missions and their related churches were travelling with the stream. That stream had in fact now reached a point in its journey where investigations concerning the nature of the Church were about to undergo a major development.

The need for independent national Churches was almost universally recognised and methods by which autonomy might be reached were slowly being worked out between literally hundreds of Mission and church groups, through a great variety of schemes involving devolution and also through negotiations /

---

NOTES.

(54) "Conference", Aug. 1936, pp. 43-44.
for church union. Yet most Christian leaders, whether missionaries or nationals, were aware that the transfer of administrative power from Mission to Church was only one aspect of indigenous development. The "three selves" were still an idea for which the younger churches strove, but they were seldom now regarded as an end in themselves. As part of the Church Universal, no local manifestation of the Church could ever be entirely independent of its sister churches. And while the need to reveal and develop indigenous qualities was seen by the younger churches to be as urgent as ever, the irreducible scandal of the Cross had been set back in its proper place. The liberal reign was over and men were talking again about "the uncompromising elements in Christianity". (55)

Churches must be rooted in Christ and only then, and through Christ, in the soil of a particular country or culture. Recognition of the danger of sitting contented under paternalistic Western control emphasised the weakness inherent in failure to be indigenous. But new insight into the temptations of syncretism underlined the peril of thinking that indigenous development could in turn be regarded as an end in itself.

Those prophetic words spoken at Tambaram about "a brave and dangerous confession" were clearly said with an eye on the gathering clouds of war. Before another year had passed the storm had broken, and when the immediate effects of the cataclysm were over the world-Church realised it was looking out on a different kind of world.

The Universal Church.

The new world on which Christians looked out was one on which the "Constantinian situation" of Christianity as the accepted religion of the West no longer applied except on the surface. In certain Communist /
countries the Church was actively repressed, in others it was more subtly mocked at, ignored and rendered impotent. Although in States still Christian by law anti-clericalism was on the wane, as the State and its culture grew more secularised the Church in turn would wish for independence, thereby bringing to a formal close the symphony between Church and State. And among the people Christianity had, more by neglect and absorption in other interests than by direct opposition, lost its hold on the hearts of millions of potential followers.

In consequence, the concept of "Christendom" was by this date almost wholly irrelevant. The older Churches and their missionaries could no longer speak as from a secure base in a Christian world to the pagans of a non-Christian world. Certainly the situation of Western Christians was still very different from that obtaining in Africa and even more in Eastern lands, where Christianity was the religion of a tiny minority. Nevertheless a new field of common experience had emerged. Christians everywhere — and this was by no means entirely a healthy sign — began to look once more on the world, whether it was that of post-Christian Europe, animistic Africa, Hindu India or Communist Russia, as "the enemy".

Along with the final dissolution of the Corpus Christianum, with its consequence that Christians and their Churches, though differing widely in age and background, found themselves all in the same boat, a third factor must be taken into account. What the Indian historian, J.M. Pannikar, has dubbed the "Vasco de Gama era of Western expansion" had come to an end or was at least in its last stages. (56) The races, first of Asia and then of Africa, were demanding self-determination and once India, the world's/

NOTES.

largest colony, had obtained its independence it was only a matter of time before other colonial possessions would follow suit. The Empires built up by the powerful nations of the West over the course of the last four centuries would fade from the maps and a colourful crop of new countries would add their flags to the display before the United Nations Building. While the influences of Western civilisation, particularly its technological skills, were too deeply embedded in the life of those new nations ever to be eradicated, yet while they sought to become modernised many would object to being christianised. (57)

Among the many reactions of Protestant Christianity to this situation, the most typical and substantial was without doubt the Churches' realisation of their own underlying unity and universal character. The formation and first meeting of the World Council of Churches at Amsterdam in 1948 was a symbol of this. Divided Churches began increasingly to seek out and value what they held in common. Their feeling grew stronger that they were one Church, responsible together for the evangelising of one world and aligned shoulder to shoulder in opposition to the same evil and disruptive forces. Most of the sublime confidence which had called forty years earlier for the evangelisation of the world in this generation had evaporated. There was little left either of a far too childish trust in the power of progress. And men spoke no longer without fear of contradiction about the blessings of Christian civilisation or the hope of establishing the Kingdom of God in the course of a few lightning campaigns. There was less optimism and much uncertainty, but perhaps also a deeper sense of reliance on the God with whom all issues belong.

NOTES.

Nevertheless it remained true that the greater part of the globe had in the past half century been evangelised. Christianity was not just in potential but in sober fact a world-wide faith, and daughter-churches stood ranged side by side with mother-churches. The concept of the Universal Church might be nineteen hundred years old and rooted in fundamental Christian doctrine, yet for Protestant Christians it was only in this post-war world that they were able to see it as a visible reality. Viewed from this angle, appreciation of the Church's universal character was a source of strength, of comfort and of hope.

Viewed from a slightly different angle it was a source of challenge. For among the largest of the new nations Christianity was still very much a minority religion -- 2% in India, less than 1% in China, 1% in Japan. Whereas on the continent of Africa it was unquestionably the dominant religion of the present and likely to prove the majority religion of the future, with Christians taking the lead in most nationalist movements and new nationalist governments, yet its strong Western taint had become a disadvantage and its impact had widely failed to penetrate far beneath the surface of African minds or social customs. Of the churches isolated behind the curtain of most Communist frontiers, little information was obtainable and not much of it was reassuring. And in Western Europe, as the church-going habit continued to decline and secular standards of ethics to present a more powerful challenge than had ever been the case before, it was clearly no longer possible to speak with accuracy of the Christian West. Thus Christians of all colours and races were able to think in parallel though not identical terms of their faith as set in a non-Christian world.

One far-reaching result of the change of outlook and reactions to it was the much mature, more confident and happier relationship now obtaining/
between younger and older churches. There were periods of strain in most colonial countries when agitation for political freedom appeared for a time to be setting native Christians and missionaries on opposite sides of the fence. The desire of young Christian communities, and especially of their educated leaders, for their own autonomy often added to the tension. But the distrust seldom ran deep and once the object of independence had been obtained any breaches were quickly repaired. The sense of sharing a family bond was strengthened and, while the relationship remained that between mother and daughter churches, the daughters now had adult status in their own right. In both thought and action, the lines of demarcation which separated one from the other grew of progressively less importance.

When dealing with ethnic tensions, there were obvious similarities between the situations to be met with in South Africa, Indonesia or South Carolina. The detribalised African had his counterpart among the beat generation of post-war Europe. Refugees knew no frontiers. And in general, what the Amsterdam Conference defined in parallel terms as "the Disorder of Society" and "International Disorder" were issues of equal moment to Christians from every corner of the earth. (58)

As a consequence, while the classic problems of dependence and paternalism, westernising and indigenisation, still had to be tackled and discussed because in practice they were far from being solved, Christian leaders were able to think with greater facility and a wider-ranging knowledge in terms of the Church as a whole.

This was expressed in theological terms by a fresh insistence on the fact that the Christian Mission and the Christian Church were one. It was worked out in ecumenical terms through the ultimate integration of the International Missionary Council with the World Council of Churches. And

NOTES.
/pragmatically it meant that in the areas occupied by younger churches a policy of integration and partnership was substituted for the old idea of devolution.

We have already seen that before the outbreak of Hitler's war there was a move towards a Church-centred theology which was to some extent a reaction against the Gospel-centred emphasis of an earlier day and still more against the Kingdom-centred theology of liberal Protestantism. The Church gathered its forces together to face a hostile world. Yet at the heart of this new line of thought lay a vital element best expressed in Emil Brunner's magnificent phrase, "The Church exists by mission as a fire exists by burning." As developed, this idea insisted that by separating the concepts of "Church" and "mission", the Church became an introverted body concerned with its own welfare and not the Kingdom of God: that Church and mission belong indissolubly together: and that the Church is integrally a part of the Gospel.

For the established Churches of Europe this was a call to the renewal of their missionary obligation. For the young minority Churches, it meant that Henry Venn's theory of euthenasia, with its attendant aim of turning over all agencies to the indigenous Church before departing to the regions beyond, no longer applied. Church and Mission must not now be regarded as separable entities, nor the Church as a chrysalis emerging from the Mission cocoon. The Church was the Christian mission. It was wrong therefore for a Mission to concentrate on evangelism, thereby condemning the indigenous Church to be a mere receptacle for converts — this was to deny it the right to exercise its missionary calling. But the Mission was also the Church. Thus it was equally wrong for a Church to "unchurch" a Mission by asking it to withdraw or relegating its personnel to the administrative side-lines.
At the International Missionary Council's Willingen Conference in 1952, representatives of the younger Churches stated: "We should cease to speak of Missions and Churches and avoid the dichotomy not only in our thinking but also in our actions. We should now speak of the Mission of the Church." Mission here, as it has been pointed out, was raised to a permanent "mark" of the Church. And the ultimate aim of mission was seen not as the organisational independence of the young Church but its establishment as a body which voluntarily accepted responsibility for missionary outreach of its own. What were once spoken of as "the Mission" and "the Church" were partners in this enterprise.

This truth was stated again at Willingen by Dr. D.G. Moses in a slightly different form when he said, "The accepted definition of an independent Church is a 'self-supporting, self-governing, self-propagating community'. The circumstances of the present intensify what is inherent in the nature and growth of the Church, namely the necessity of the acceptance of responsibility which found expression in the historic formula. But if self-sufficiency and autonomy are isolated as ends in themselves, they lead to a dangerous narrowness of view. They have meaning only as expressions of the Church's worshipping and witnessing character. We need to apply tests deeper in content and wider in scope." (59)

As already mentioned, these new insights resulted, in ecumenical circles, in the integration, at New Delhi in 1961, of the International Missionary /

---

**NOTES.**

(59) Both Willingen quotations are taken from Beyerhaus, p.167, as is also some of the matter of these paragraphs. For a fuller but still popular treatment of this theme, see J.E.L. Newbigin's pamphlet, "One Body, One Gospel, One World", Carling and Co., Ltd., London, 1958.
Locally it meant that patterns of integration were worked out, on the completion of which a Mission as a separate entity ceased to exist but its personnel and resources were all merged within the organisation of the Church. When we come to study in detail the progress of Scottish missionary work in India, we shall find that the principle of integration and its implications were fully endorsed by the Scottish Missions and their Churches. Indeed it was afforded a much more thorough approval than the earlier policy of devolution, of which complaints were made that "it didn't work".

The policy of integration, while it presented for Scottish Missions certain administrative difficulties, was welcomed as a much more satisfactory method of maintaining but developing the Church-Mission relationship. And by the middle of the 1950’s churches linked with Scottish Missions had taken over almost complete supervision of the responsibilities which were still in Mission hands. In the development of indigenous character and the adoption and assimilation of local forms and customs they were a great deal further behind. But before going into this further it will be necessary/

NOTES.

(60) "To have two world bodies giving separate expression to these inseparable functions (i.e. its unity and its mission) of the one Church is to place a stumbling-block in the path of the younger churches": Ernest A. Payne and D.G. Moses, "Why Integration?", Edinburgh House Press, London, 1957, p.25.

(61) This was the verdict of the U.F.C. Mission's Biennial Conference held at Calcutta at the close of 1927. See "Conference", Feb., 1928, pp. 2-4. One of the chief obstacles to the devolution policy was resentment on the part of the Indian Church, which thought that the Mission was opting out of its responsibilities.
for us to back-track for a while and take up consideration of another line of thought concerning the nature of the Church which has up to this point been ignored.

The Church as Community.

If we reflect for a moment on the theories propagated by Venn and Anderson, we shall realise that they took as their starting-point the relationship between Mission and Church, or as we should put it in terms of present-day development, between mother and daughter churches. The aim of the Mission was to build up and leave an autonomous Church, and beyond defining the three qualifications for self-sufficiency, little was said about its form. The theories of the Roland Allen school of thought, built though they were on the foundation of the "three selfs", directed more attention to the actual character of the emerging Church. Roland Allen himself took great pains to underline the foreignness of Mission churches and stressed the need for allowing local resources to be used and indigenous qualities to be fostered from the very beginning. But missionary methods of evangelism were his chief interest, so he was concerned more with the principle of indigenisation than its application in particular fields. In his individualistic outlook towards conversion, too, Allen was a child of his age. The important thing was that modern Missions should be faithful to New Testament models and be ready to rely on the spontaneous power and guidance of the Holy Spirit. While Allen warned his fellow-missionaries against the dangers of confusing the proclamation of the Gospel with the introduction of Western civilisation (62), and insisted that the native/

**NOTES.**

(62) See e.g. "The Spontaneous Expansion of the Church", Chapter 6, on "Civilisation and Enlightenment". Although at the present day we may find ourselves taking most of Allen's ideas as natural and right, we can yet appreciate their revolutionary nature at the time of writing, and recognise the truth of his own observation that fifty years would pass before his views would win wide assent.
church must originate in and not just be transplanted to, native soil, he was not in fact much concerned with the texture of the soil itself. Possessing an almost Pentecostalist conviction about the transforming power of the Holy Spirit, he did not in fact give due weight to the importance for the new church of its natural heritage, its cultural environment and the social and religious background from which its members sprang.

But another school of thought had meanwhile been rising up which took this background as its point of departure, and the time has come when we must take stock of some of its ideas. Mainly of Continental origin, this theory of missionary development is associated with the names of Gustav Warneck and Bruno Gutman, and its purpose was to stress the importance to the Church of its existence and character as a community. British and American Societies, because of their evangelical convictions and a lack of any official connection with the State, tended to think of Christian communities in terms of the "gathered church", a fellowship of individuals called to be saints. The same emphasis was apparent in Continental Missions with a Pietist tradition. The Missionary Societies themselves were, with few exceptions, gathered groups within gathered Churches, and since the congregations they founded were usually made up in turn of individual converts or families rescued from a surrounding sea of heathenism, it would have been surprising had their attitude been any different. Certain groups of Lutheran missionaries, on the other hand, thought more in terms of a Volkskirche, or national Church, in which the social and cultural heritage of a people was preserved and further developed. As early as 1892, indeed, Gustav Warneck was saying that the mission must be seen as an activity of the whole Church and must have as its primary goal the establishing of churches -- "Unter christlicher Mission verstehen wir die gesamte auf die/
In teaching that autonomy, while important for the mature church, was not essential from the beginning, Warneck differed somewhat from Venn and Anderson, with whose theories he was familiar, and much more strongly from the ideas which Roland Allen was to put forward. But he laid great emphasis on the need for a church to be truly indigenous, outlining five particulars to be kept in mind when laying the foundation of a new church. These were:

first, that the mother language should be used;

second, social ties, especially those of the family, should be strengthened, not broken;

third, Christians should not be isolated from their natural environment in a mission-compound system;

fourth, every effort should be made to bring in the middle classes which constituted the sound core of any society;

fifth, any folk customs not spiritually incompatible with Christianity should be welcomed and preserved. (64)

At the back of Warneck's ideas there lay, of course, historical examples of the wholesale acceptance of Christianity by primitive Germanic or Celtic tribes which followed the lead of their chieftains. This was a fact of which other missionaries were well aware. But there was also the recognition of a truth which had been ignored for too long, namely that the ties of race, tribe and family obtaining among many of the peoples/

---

NOTES.

(64) G. Warneck, op.cit. A summary of this part of Warneck's teaching is given in Beyerhaus, pp.45-49.
Western Missions were at work had much in common with pre-medieval Europe. Even where missionary work was being conducted, as was the case with most Eastern countries, among people of highly civilised cultures and religions, there family ties and special groupings exerted a much deeper influence than was the case in modernised, secularised, industrialised and liberalised Europe. The community, in other words, the natural community of family and tribe, religious or social group, nation or race, was a factor of immense importance to the individuals who formed the nucleus of the young growing churches. The Church also was a fellowship, and while not co-terminous with the natural community into which converts had been born, it must not destroy but rather use and transform those fundamental human ties.

These principles, it goes without saying, are accepted today as so self-evident that no argument should be necessary. But they were new to the men of that time and their application in any pure form was not easy, for the simple reason that most young churches were in fact, and usually to the distress and frustration of the missionaries who had founded them, very much gathered churches, small and isolated enclaves which had lost social contact with their unconverted neighbours and had as yet no distinct culture of their own. At the same time, even when Christian groups were large and cohesive enough to form something like a natural community, Christian suspicion of idolatry and superstition, coupled with Western ignorance of and prejudice against the barbarous customs of alien races, hardly provided fertile ground for the transplanting of local customs or the adapting of a national ethos.

Yet the atmosphere was gradually growing more propitious. To a/
/certain extent through the interest and researches of missionaries themselves, anthropology had been established as a reputable science, its discoveries were studied and some of its lessons digested. (65) Churches in many parts of tribal Africa were expanding rapidly enough for large new communities to be growing up, and there the relation of Christian living to ethnic customs had become an issue of prime importance. In India and other parts of the East, mass movements among the depressed classes and among tribal groups constituted what amounted to a new situation, demanding a fresh missionary approach. (66) It was one of the real virtues of the liberal approach that it viewed the socio-religious background from which converts came and in which evangelism was conducted with a much more open mind, and so with more sympathy and a better understanding.

As a comparison of the papers delivered at the Jerusalem and the Tambaram Conferences will reveal, as indigenous development progressed and national Christians began to speak more freely about their problems, more emphasis came to be placed on environmental factors. The rise of national movements for liberation from colonial rule made members of the new /

NOTES.

(65) Comments on the contributions to anthropology and social anthropology made by missionaries, the present relationship between anthropology and the Christian religion, and the comparative failure of Western Missions to make use of the findings of this science are made by E.E. Evans Pritchard in his "Social Anthropology", Cohen and West, Ltd., London, 1951, Chapter VI; also in his essay, "Religion and The Anthropologists", included in "Essays in Social Anthropology", Faber and Faber, London, 1962; see also pamphlet by John M. Graham and Ralph Piddington, cited under General Sources.

(66) Bishop J.W. Pickett's volume "Christian Mass Movements in India", Abingdon Press, New York, 1953, is not only the standard work on this phenomenon but has had a great influence on the development of missionary policy.
churches much more aware of natural ties and more sensitive to accusations of foreignness. And generally speaking, as the significance of the fact that man was a social animal was borne in on Christian minds, there was a clearer grasp of the need to baptise into Christ not just individual converts but so far as possible the organic social structures with which they were familiar.

Warneck’s theories were put into practice and modified and developed by Bruno Gutman, a missionary of the German Leipzig Mission in East Africa. Gutman tried to use indigenous social structures for the building up of a church in Tanganyika, to the extent of almost abandoning the concept of individual conversion and refusing to appoint Mission-trained pastors to take charge of congregations. (67) The same principles were given an even more thorough trial over a longer period by the German Batak Mission in Sumatra and the lessons to be learned through the development of that Church were widely publicised after an investigation conducted by Hendrik Kraemer. (68) The most successful example of an attempt made by any Protestant Mission to Christianise a whole nation, the story of the Batak Church shows also the dangers which arise when the desire for autonomy in the church gets tangled up with national aspirations. "It ought to be understood that the nation is not to be regarded as the structural basis of the Church, nor should the Church form an integral part of the nation". (69) The Batak Church’s history also underlined the truth/

NOTES.

(67) Beyerhaus, pp. 50-53.

(68) H. Kraemer, "From Mission Field to Independent Church". (A Report on a decisive decade in the growth of the indigenous churches in Indonesia", S.G.M. Press, 1958, pp. 50-70.) See also P. Beyerhaus and H. Lefevre, op. cit., Chapter V, and works by Johannes Warneck cited in their bibliography.

(69) Beyerhaus, p. 158.
that Christian independence cannot be exercised at the expense of other Christian communities or in denial of the fellowship of the Church Universal.

Growing insights of this kind into the nature of the relationship between the Church and society have had an immense influence on recent Christian thinking in every part of the world, it being fundamental to this approach that it should be flexible, according to the continent, country and localised background of the church on the spot.

Thus in Asia it has brought about the kind of developments outlined in M.M. Thomas's "The Christian Response to the Asian Revolution". (70) In India it has led to many attempts to bridge the gap between the traditional thought-forms and terminology of Christian and Hindu theology (71), to social experiments such as the founding of Christian ashrams and to some remodelling of the patterns of Christian worship. (72)

The effect on Scottish Missions in India has been indirect rather than immediate and direct, and rather complex. In general the call for the indigenisation both of church structures and of Indian life and worship was taken seriously. "What is an indigenous Church?" asked a recent/

NOTES.


"Perhaps we should ask, "When is a Church indigenous?"

Judged by questions of independence and leadership, the younger Churches are far advanced. Judged, however, by the character of their worship and their assimilation of local custom and symbol they have a long way to go. A visitor in India will seldom find a church building which belongs essentially to the country and background. Buildings such as the chapel of the Women's Christian College, Madras, or the little church at Gangtok, Sikkim, are remarkable because they are unusual. It is true that some churches have adopted the Hindu Festival of Lights as a Christian Home Festival and that Indian hymns are sung to Indian music and indigenous lyric forms are used in telling the Gospel story. These, however, draw attention to the fact that the Indian Church, at least in those parts where it owes its existence to modern Missions has adopted Western patterns rather than created its own." (73)

The unspoken suggestion contained in that statement is that missionaries had long been pressing for indigenous development while the Indian Christian community had unaccountably dragged its feet. The real facts of the case were rather different, however, and for a number of reasons Scottish Missions were slow to accept the implications of mass movements into Christianity and a resulting situation which required not the edifying of individual converts but the christianising of whole social groups.

The reasons for this should become clearer in the course of this study. At present we may simply note the evangelical convictions of Scottish missionaries and their emphasis on individual conversion; their/

NOTES.

/choice of educational methods and their success in winning a number of
caste converts of unusual gifts; the exceptionally high standards of
knowledge and conduct demanded of converts; a dogged determination never
to compromise with heathen superstition; and sometimes sheer unwillingness
to adjust their minds to the unfamiliar phenomenon of mass movements.
These all helped to build up a negative attitude towards the idea that a
heathen social group might in time be transformed into a Christian social
group. They prayed and laboured incessantly for conversions, longed for
their churches to grow and rejoiced when they did. But it remained a
matter of principle that quality should always be preferred to quantity.

In an article in the "Spectator", written in 1936, the Rev. William
Paton, then secretary of the International Missionary Council, drew
attention to the political implications of the Indian mass movements of the
day and went on to remark, "The duty of the Christian forces is plain. In
no case will they be or can they be a party to a sort of gigantic auction
of souls." (74)

Even when political issues were not involved, those words expressed
exactly the attitude of most Scottish missionaries towards the acceptance
of large numbers of "baptised heathens" into the Christian fold. That
would be an auction of souls and a denial of the fundamental condition that
before a man entered the Kingdom he must be born again. In company with
the majority of those who supported the older forms of missionary work,
Scottish missionaries were, with a few exceptions, very cautious and some-
times highly critical of mass conversions. So while in theory they
favoured indigenisation, in practice their approach was very unlike that
which deliberately set out over a period of years to capture a whole
community. This was to have a marked effect on the size and character of/

NOTES.
(74) Quoted "Conference", Nov., 1936, p.61.
The Unity of the Church.

There is no branch of the Christian Church which does not preach the doctrine of unity or claim that it seeks to practice it. All branches of the Church would say that they accepted unity as one of the four pillars on which the fellowship of the Christian body -- one, holy, catholic and apostolic -- was declared by Augustine to rest. The Protestant branches in particular, however, would claim that this pillar cannot be judged in isolation, but must be measured only in juxtaposition to the other three. Should the Church fail to be at the same time a witness to consecrated living, a universal Gospel and apostolic truth, then any outward appearance of unity is false. This is no true communion of saints. Nevertheless, unity is an essential element of the original foundation, and if as a result of human sinfulness it has once been damaged or broken, then the structure cannot stand secure until it has been restored.

At the time of the Reformation, the monolithic organisational unity of the Roman Catholic Church was broken on the grounds that falsification of Christian truth rendered it a meaningless facade. It was emphasised that Christian unity was first and foremost a spiritual quality -- the unity of the Spirit in the bond of peace. John Calvin, who abhorred schism and denounced separation as one of the greatest evils of his day (75) always spoke of unity in spiritual terms -- "we attest our unity in true doctrine and love." (76) Yet in the course of the next three centuries it became obvious that if the Protestant churches were not to divide and sub-divide/

NOTES.


themselves out of existence, their schismatic tendencies and fanatical devotion to every jot and tittle of doctrinal truth would have to be balanced by a deeper regard for the Church's other qualities, in particular that unity of spirit which begins with humility, walks in toleration and is warmed by love. It is one of the great facts of history that in our own time such a change of heart should take place, and while the Nineteenth Century was the great century of Christian expansion the present century has been, up to date, the great century of Christian union.

That change has been described in the following words:

"Over a great part of Christendom (would it were the whole) we do not excommunicate those who differ from us in some matters of doctrine, or relegate them to what used to be described -- as the 'uncovenanted mercies of God'. We are more ready to sit down together and look at the possibilities and the problems of union, and hear open and frank statements from all sides. That is a gain whose importance cannot be exaggerated. It is true that progress, especially at home, has been slow, and some would say almost imperceptible. But one who can look back over the last forty or fifty years can realise that we are living in an entirely different spiritual climate from that of the chilly unapproachableness or the over-emphatic assertiveness which was amongst the characteristics of the Churches of the last century. --- Men no longer beat their heads against bars that seemed as if they would never yield. It has to be admitted that what may be called the theological approach to Church Union has made but limited progress towards the goal. --- But circumstances, coupled with growing conviction, have made a change. --- This is by now (i.e.1947) readily observable in our own country: it is much more obvious in the Church/
overseas, where — the sundering forces of Western Christianity are less powerful." (77)

In the trend towards unity so described, there has been no more consistent driving force than that of the Missions and the young Churches together. Co-operation among churches of different denominations began on the Mission fields of the Nineteenth Century. The ecumenical movement was a fruit of the missionary movement. The younger Churches have far outstriped the older in the achievement of successful inter-denominational unions. And while the theological approach has been slow to gather strength, in the last twenty years, since the quotation given above was written, a tremendous amount of attention has been given to the doctrinal implications of re-union. It has been stressed very strongly how closely the missionary nature of the Church and its essential unity are bound up with one another. One Lord, one faith, one Church, speaking to one world — those are the Biblical categories in which the Gospel is presented to men. Therefore in order that the world may believe, Christians must be one and their unity, although its roots are spiritual, must also be visible.

Unity, according to this outlook, does not mean uniformity, neither does it mean compromise — a marriage at any cost of incompatible partners. But inevitably it involves repentance, sacrifice and a death of the old for the sake of being born into the new.

The Christian unity movement came to play such an important part in the history of the younger churches, including those attached to the Scottish Missions, that it becomes difficult to isolate causes and effects. In the following chapters we shall find this to be a constantly recurring theme and Church Union will eventually require a chapter to itself.

NOTES.

At the moment it will be sufficient simply to note the fact and its importance and to realise that in any contemporary theological understanding of the Church's nature, the element of "one-ness" or unity is indispensable.

The Responsible Church.

It is now going to be necessary to try and fit into some kind of pattern the principles concerning the nature of the Church whose discovery, recovery or development we have been describing in this chapter. It should be evident that this will not be an easy task and if any neatly-finished package emerges it is likely to be the product of over-simplification. There is going to be no short and satisfying description of the Church which covers all the points we have seen regarded at different stages as basic or near-basic principles.

Henry Venn and Rufus Anderson advanced it, not as a comprehensive definition of the Church of God but as a sufficient definition of the Churches which Western Missions were trying to found, that they should be self-supporting, self-governing and self-propagating.

To this concept there was added, by Roland Allen and others, the vision, through a reminder of Biblical examples, of churches which possessed those characteristics as of right from the beginning and not only after a long period of tutelege. Because the missionary methods used to raise them were those of the New Testament, they would be indigenous churches which sprang from the soil of the land and spread spontaneously through the inspiration of the Holy Spirit. The majority of Western Missions, even when they had to admit the faults and aberrations of the very different type of system they had evolved, did not accept this interpretation. They believed that autonomy was only possible after a lengthy period of preparation and training. Nevertheless they modified many of their old ideas.
More attention was given to questions of indigenous development, and the process of handing over authority and responsibility to national Christians and their organisation was speeded up. There was a better understanding of the fact that a church must speak in the language of the people.

There then followed, under the pressure of events, a deeper and more penetrating concern about the nature of the Church itself, and a rediscovery of the fact that mission was not one of its ornaments but the very blood running through its veins. The Church became part of the Gospel, Mission a function of the Church and the separation of Church and Mission which was being expressed through a policy of devolution was brought to a halt. At the same time the quality of self-propagation as an essential mark of the Church received fresh recognition. The power to act as a missionary church was seen as not necessarily dependent on self-support and self-government, and churches which still had to rely on Mission leadership and financial subsidies were encouraged to exercise this privilege and obligation. There was rejoicing that "never has the Indian Church been more evangelistic in spirit than it is today." (78)

Further understanding of indigenous development was gained through efforts to harmonise the fellowship of the Church with the social order of tribes and other communities. There was seen to be a real sense in which the social order of non-Christian (and also of secular) societies was itself ordained of God, that the Church should be representative of the community and that its life should be expressed through indigenous traditions.

Yet neither independence nor indigenous expression could now be regarded as ends in themselves. Nations could be independent, but not churches. For the Universal Church itself, there could be no absolute autonomy, for its independence was rooted in the Lordship of Christ. And /

the local ecdesia, the congregation of the faithful, itself directly dependent on Christ, could not remain unrelated to, and therefore independent of, the Universal Church. This meant that, so far as relations between churches were concerned, dependence and independence must not be thought of in terms of exercising authority or winning free from authority, but with the aim of achieving a mature, adult relationship, namely partnership. (79)

Again, the character of the Church can never be wholly indigenous, for the Church and the churches are not of this earth. By the end of the 1950's, and to counter-balance the too accommodating temper and over-apologetic tone of earlier liberal theology, Hendrik Kraemer recaptured the Biblical emphasis that the Church must be Holy - that is, inevitably in one sense different, foreign, absolutist, unbending, exclusive. It is true that the type of foreignness which is seen by the outside world is too often a quite un-Christian foreignness. "Even a Christian missionary enterprise can never completely overcome certain imperialistic corruptions which arise from the historic relations of the missionary enterprise to particular powerful nations and cultures." (80)

NOTES.

(79) For an exposition of this argument based on the historical development, see Beyerhaus, pp.112-116, and Chapter 9 on "The Unity of the Church and the Autonomy of its Members". Beyerhaus' argument does get a little confused however. While rightly pointing out that when the New Testament speaks of the Church it refers either to the whole Church (universal) or the local congregation, he goes on to state that the administrative organisation has no theological relevance. This is sound so far as it goes, but Beyerhaus does not then explain how episcopate is to be exercised except by the local ecdesia (and Congregationalism is rejected as inadequate) or by a Romanist form of totalitarianism.

Yet if there is a rejection of Western culture, there is also a rejection of the scandal of the Cross. As Kraemer pointed out in relation to Hinduism, the identification of Christianity with the civilisation of the West was "not only due to the unimaginative, rigid, and dogmatically-bound mind of Western missions, but at least as much to the Hindu system itself." (81) Christianity, to put it another way, must aim at coming to terms with the ethos of India but not through some form of syncretistic alliance. It must work for Christianity's Indian incarnation, seeking to find the Christ of the Indian road. Thus while the indigenous tradition was the natural agent through which the Gospel should be preached, Christ seen and the Church's life expressed, the scandal of the Cross could never cease to be felt. "Excessive respect for the people is in the last instance apostasy from God" (82) and to speak of a church as indigenous must always be a relative term.

What word, then, will define a Church that is based on the principles outlined above and recognised by such marks? This is the kind of Church Christians themselves say they have laboured and are labouring for, but there is plainly no single word which will adequately describe it. Yet the lack of one has itself caused confused and misleading thinking. Whitby (1947) spoke of "the obedient Church" and more recently a thoroughly unbiblical phrase, "the self-hood of the Church" has gained popularity. D.T. Niles addressed the East Asia Christian Conference on "The Church and its Self-hood." (83) G.C. Oosthuizen introduced his study on confessional developments with a chapter on "the self-hood of the Church." (84) From New Delhi we are told of churches "seeking -- their selfhood /
as self-governing churches.\(^{(85)}\) And Beyerhaus too uses the word.\(^{(86)}\)

Intended as a synonym for "independence", and so derivatively for "indigenisation" \(^{(87)}\), it is a most unsuitable choice. In the first place, to quote the editor of the World Christian Handbook, "When we speak of 'self' with regard to the Church, we cannot in the last analysis mean a church or the Church in India or any part of Africa, but the Church Universal." \(^{(88)}\) To speak then of any part of the whole as "gaining its selfhood through self-government" is a contradiction in terms. Even more to the point, Christ said that he who would seek his soul, or self, would lose it, and this applies to churches equally with individuals. The word "self", unless brought constantly into obedience under Christ, leads away from Him. \(^{(89)}\)

At present the most suitable alternative would appear to be that of speaking about "the responsible Church". This is Lefevre's translation of the German Selbständigkeit, literally "independence". \(^{(90)}\) It is by no means a perfect choice because it immediately suggests, in any non-theological context, its opposite, "irresponsible". And in the narrower world of technical theology since the first Assembly of the World Council of Churches at Amsterdam coined the term "the Responsible Society", it /

\(-56-\)

\begin{table}[h]
\centering
\begin{tabular}{|l|}
\hline
\textbf{NOTES.} \\
\hline
\textit{(85)} Kenneth Slack, "Dispatch from New Delhi", S.C.M. Press Ltd., London, 1962, p.84. \\
\textit{(86)} Op.cit., p.151. \\
\textit{(87)} "The problem of the selfhood of the church, i.e. the problem of indigenisation", G.C. Oosthuizen, op.cit., p.11. \\
\textit{(90)} Ibid., Note 1. \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
\end{table}
has generally been taken to denote social responsibility. (91) Following Lefevre again, "responsible self-hood" would be more accurate, when defined as the Church's power, readiness and freedom to follow its divine call within its sphere of life. (92) Yet the simpler term "the responsible Church" conveys much more strongly the note of adult maturity which nevertheless "responds" -- is answerable, like Adam in Eden, Cain after the murder of Abel, or the Prodigal Son eating husks, to a moral authority other than self.

At any rate it is with this understanding that, for want of a better word, we shall use the phrase "the responsible Church". We may recall that Dr. Moses at Willingen spoke of the need for an autonomous and indigenous Church to accept the responsibility inherent in such a status and go on to apply tests deeper in content and wider in scope. (93) We shall take "responsibility" to include the application of those other tests so far as Christians and churches have been enabled to comprehend them. A responsible church is one whose independence is exercised in obedience, humility, brotherly love and outgoing concern and whose nature is related to the soil because it is rooted in Christ.

This is the abstract formula, the ideal, against which we must prepare to measure far from ideal but living churches. Where they have fallen badly short we must try to assess how far this is because all churches, like all men, are earthen vessels, and how far it is because they have been required to bear the armour of responsibilities God never intended them to carry.

NOTES.

(92) Beyerhaus, pp.17 and 151.
(93) See Note 59.
Chapter I

General Sources


Reports of the Church of Scotland, Free Church of Scotland and United Free Church of Scotland Foreign Mission Committees.

CHAPTER II

THE SCOTTISH CHURCH'S MISSION

A visitor to Scotland in the early 1800's would have found a nation with surprisingly high standards of literacy which was yet vastly ignorant of the world beyond its borders. He would have found a country not rich, but one which had in the last fifty years emerged from its grinding poverty. He would have seen a nation rapidly losing its isolation, and he would have met a church-going people who took their religion very seriously but were not yet in the least missionary-minded.

In a sederunt of the Church of Scotland's General Assembly in 1824 he might have witnessed an event which was in its own small way unique—namely the decision of a National Church to send a Christian Mission to a non-Christian land. This venture was unusual in two respects. First, it was interesting that the Church of Scotland should so far anticipate the trend of a later day as to set behind its Mission the backing of the Church itself and not some form of affiliated Society. In the second place, it was strange that the majority of its members should have taken so long to accept any missionary obligation whatever. Yet to find the reasons for this we do not have to look very far.

The contrast between the conditions of that day and those of a hundred years earlier must be described as nothing less than startling. The nation had awakened from social stagnation to life and energy and moved from abject poverty, if not exactly to wealth at least to widespread comfort. In the course of the Eighteenth Century, while the population had increased by one half, from 1,100,000 to 1,625,000, the national revenue had been multiplied fifty times over and the growth of trade and industry, matched by improvements in agriculture, had opened men's minds as well as lining their pockets. (1)

NOTES.

(1) H.G. Graham, op.cit., pp.348, 536 and passim
The peace which followed the abortive 'Forty-Five' rising brought amazing prosperity to the country, especially to the Lowlands. Families were leaving the farms and the crofts for the cities, yet with the introduction of new methods of farming, agricultural yields increased steadily. The linen and wool industries received a new lease of life, with cotton overhauling them both and jute mills being opened somewhat later round Dundee. Coal and iron mines began employing their hundreds and then their thousands. With the building of new roads, canals and railroads, the system of transport was revolutionised. The happy contiguity of iron, coal and accessible waterways, with the spurs to manufacture provided by mechanical inventions and the ever-increasing demands of overseas trade, turned the Clyde valley into Britain's largest heavy engineering and shipbuilding centre. The population of Glasgow, which came in the year 1700 to about twelve thousand, multiplied seven times in the ensuing century and twelve times again in the century after that until it passed the million mark. Industry attracts more industry, success breeds success and money begets bigger money. These things all acted and inter-acted on each other and while the industrial revolution brought misery to thousands in Scotland as elsewhere, it wrought more good than it did evil. And even before it was properly on its way, wealth was pouring into the country, transforming the face of the land and the living habits and outlook of the people.

One of its most striking effects was to turn Scottish eyes abroad. The "old Empire" on the other side of the Atlantic had provided Scotsmen with opportunities both for commerce and emigration. But while emigration continued, the tobacco trade was killed by the American War of Independence, just as later the Civil War stifled the booming cotton trade. The sugar plantations of the West Indies supplied their rich tributes, but Wilberforce with the power of public opinion behind him was bringing the shameful profits of the slave trade to an end. Up to the last quarter of the Nineteenth Century, most of Africa was to remain a dark continent only slowly being /
mapped out through the arduous journeyings of explorers and missionaries.
It was largely to the East and especially to India that Britain was turning
now for commerce, for plunder, for cargoes to fill the holds of her growing
mercantile fleets and latterly for the export markets on which her prosperity
would be built. In the course of about twenty-five years, from 1757 onwards,
the victory at Plassey, the disengagement from Europe which followed the
Peace of Paris and the loss of the American colonies more than trebled the
importance of Britain's Eastern trade and influence. And meanwhile the
publication of Cook's "Voyages" and Adam Smith's "Wealth of Nations" had
stirred the imagination of the romantics and the canny profit-makers. In
the realm of geographical discovery alone, "the last four decades of the
century (had) yielded greater results than the whole time which had previously
elapsed since the first track across the (Pacific) ocean had been drawn by
Magellan." (2)

The Scottish traveller of earlier days had been known widely on the
Continent as the Soctus Viator, usually in the guise of a penniless student
or soldier of fortune. But from the Act of Union in 1707, when English
colonies were opened to Scottish trade, and as Britain's second Empire took
shape in almost accidental succession to the one she had already lost, the
ragged Scottish wanderer was replaced by the merchant mariner, the represent-
itive of the wealthy trading house, the professional soldier or officer, the
administrator, the missionary and the skilled engineer.

NOTES.

(2) E.A. Haywood, "A History of Geographical Discovery in the Seventeenth
and Eighteenth Centuries", 1912, p.321: quoted by G.R. Mellor, op.cit.,
p.21. While it is the Pacific ocean Haywood refers to here, Mellor
goes on to remark that it is no accident the first Missionary Societies
were founded during this period.
Under Henry Dundas, the "uncrowned king of Scotland", a stream of young men had been sent out to make their fortunes or die of dysentery in the factories of the East India Company, or in the extension of that Company's interests by diplomacy and force of arms. And while Scotland's exports rose steadily, expanding to seven times their original value in the first eighty years of the Nineteenth Century, her most valuable exports were always her native sons. (3) Of those who made the passage to India, the most conspicuous were soldiers or administrators or both, from men such as John Morison, who commanded the armies of the Great Moghul, and the Lawrence brothers, to Governors and Viceroy's like Minto, Dalhousie or Mountstuart Elphinstone.

With this brilliant sunburst of prosperity through trade and imperial conquest, and the commencement of Britain's reign as manufacturer, middle-man and banker for the rest of the world, contact with other nations was firmly established. And Scottish Christians at last woke up to understand that as well as goods to sell they had a Gospel to preach.

They should indeed have discovered this much earlier. But to the advent of material prosperity and the opening of men's minds to new ideas there must be added, in Scotland of all nations, the powerful influence of more purely religious and theological factors.

Education, administered and fostered by the National Church, was high by contemporary standards even if low by our own, and in much closer touch than was the case in England with all ranks of society. Although there were never enough schools, in those which existed the teaching was generally sound and many a humble family was prepared to make great sacrifices for the education of its sons. Yet for long enough it had been the Bible alone which provided food for men's minds and their chief mental exercise had been the weaving of

NOTES.

(3) A.M. MacKenzie, op.cit., p.155
tortuous arguments and subtle distinctions round the doctrines of Election and Predestination. The confusion of political and religious interests and the arid scholastic by-ways into which Calvinism had wandered offered no climate for the growth of concern about the salvation of unknown multitudes in far-off lands. It was not man's duty to interfere with the fate of those whom God in His infinite mercy had consigned to the eternal flames.

Nor did the mellower but even more disinterested rationalism which in the latter half of the Eighteenth Century replaced the determinism of the evangelical "high-flyers" materially alter the situation. The religion of the "Moderates" who were now setting the country's spiritual tone was doctrinally orthodox but largely a matter of "sanctified common sense" and the deadly enemy of all enthusiasm. And in spite of their breadth of interests and literary gifts, the mental world which the church leaders of this generation inhabited was a static world whose basic law, for churches and nations as for men, was harmony through the maintaining of the present order of things. For all their excellent teaching about the supreme virtues of benevolence and brotherly love, no ears were ever less attuned to hear the cry of the perishing, whether near or far off.

It was the Evangelical Revival which in more ways than one turned this little ecclesiastical kingdom upside down. Even in the early days when the Wesleys had been tramping round England, the parish of Cambuslang had had its "Wark" or local revival. George Whitefield and somewhat later John Wesley made frequent journeys to Scotland, travelling as far North as Aberdeen. And while Methodism never took root in Scotland, the influence of Methodist leaders and other English evangelicals added to Scottish Presbyterianism, which had never lacked fire, the warmth which transformed it into Evangelical Calvinism.

By the 1790's, according to Principal Burleigh, the evangelical movement in Scotland was still far behind England, which already had several /
Missionary Societies. (4) The "Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge", founded in 1698, saw its chief aim, as the title suggests, in promoting Christian education at home and abroad and supported the work of Danish and German Lutheran missionaries in South India. (5) Another Anglican body formed two years later, the "Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts", was concerned with ministering to the spiritual needs of English settlers in the New World and propagating the Gospel among the heathen tribes they encountered. (6)

Scotland also, through its contacts with colonists, knew something of the evangelistic work being carried on among the North American Indians. The "Scottish Society for the Propagation of Christian Knowledge", founded in Edinburgh in 1701, gave occasional assistance to missionary work and helped to support David Brainerd, who laboured among Indians in Pennsylvania and New Jersey. (7) Brainerd's "Journal", published in 1746, and the Biography written later by his friend and father-in-law, President Jonathan Edwards, were influential in arousing missionary interest in Britain as well as in America.

As far back as 1723, Robert Millar of Paisley had published his "History of the Propagation of Christianity and the Overthrow of Paganism", one of the earliest works in the English language to be written with a concern for the evangelisation of the world. (8) Within another twenty years, the first of the many little Praying Societies which were to fan the flames of enthusiasm for the missionary cause was springing up in the Glasgow area. In the 1760's/

NOTES.

(4) J.H.S. Burleigh, op.cit., p.310
(6) Ibid., p.58
(7) Ibid., p.370 f.
the Church of Scotland's General Assembly authorised a special collection to be taken for evangelistic work among Red Indians and raised a sum of over £500. (9) Two widely-travelled and evangelically-minded laymen, the brothers Robert and James Haldane, sought to stir up Christian zeal by going about preaching, distributing tracts and opening Sunday Schools. And the former went so far as to sell his estates with the firm intention of starting an Indian Mission in Bengal.

Such incidents were isolated rather than typical, and Eighteenth Century Scotland experienced no Great Awakening. Yet they were the first wavelets of an advancing tide of interest which was spreading throughout Britain although still only lapping occasionally North of the border.

The 1790's witnesses a concentrated spurt of enthusiasm in the founding of a new generation of British Missionary Societies. Of these the Baptist Missionary Society, formed in 1792, was the first in the field. It was followed rapidly in England by the London Missionary Society, the Church Missionary Society and the British and Foreign Bible Society, the first and last of these three being inter-denominational. Scotland also had its counterparts in the Glasgow Missionary Society and its Edinburgh equivalent, the Scottish Missionary Society, both founded in 1796. Following and accompanying them, numbers of local groups were started, the most typical form being that of a praying society with a declared missionary interest.

The Missionary Societies were representative not so much of a new spirit as a new determination to put dreams and prayers into practice. They not only prayed together and collected money and information, but sent out missionaries of their own. The first /

NOTES.

British missionary was William Carey, the Baptist shoemaker, who reached Calcutta in 1793 but on being refused permission to land received sanctuary and set up work in the Danish settlement at Serampore. The pioneer among Scottish bodies, the Glasgow Missionary Society, undertook the support of two German laymen in Sierra Leone in 1797 and later began work in Kaffraria. The Scottish Missionary Society co-operated in the support of the two West African missionaries and opened up work of its own at Karass, between the Caspian and the Black Sea, and later in Jamaica and Bombay.

In a sense, however, the Scottish Societies were the result of failure to win support rather than success in doing so. Scotland is a small country and the Church of Scotland possessed advantages greater even than the Church of England in being able to speak for the Christians of the nation as a whole. The compactness of the country, added to the fact that it lacked any outlet for political expression, meant that the General Assembly was a body truly representative of all its parts and a democratic agency enabling all voices to be heard. It was for such reasons that, when church members in England were forming independent Societies, the Synods of Moray and of Fife presented Overtures to the Assembly in 1796 asking the Church to support a Christian Mission overseas. This was the very year in which the redoubtable Charles Simeon of Cambridge, with a group of evangelical preachers that included James Haldane, visited Scotland and was the instrument of a spiritual awakening in Perthshire. Although Britain was moving through the darkest days of the Napoleonic wars, and enemies of "enthusiasm" were still pointing to the dreadful lessons of the French Revolution, there seemed every hope of the Overtures going through. The plea was strongly endorsed by Dr. John Erskine of Greyfriars, the leader of the Evangelical party. But Moderatism was still in command and the venture was considered as being undesirable at the best and dangerous at the worst. Thus the question of an organised Church committing itself to an/
overseas Mission was shelved for a generation. (10)

During the period of nearly thirty years which followed, the work into which the two Scottish Societies had launched met with varying degrees of success. The missionaries under their control did not possess high educational qualifications and some lacked common-sense and even moral fibre. Inexperience and the appearance of unexpected obstacles took their toll and the Sierra Leone Mission and the venture at Karass both had to be abandoned. But the other three fields of work, in Bombay, Jamaica and South Africa, all survived and were eventually taken under the broader wing of a Scottish Church.

These efforts had their effect on the minds of Scottish churchmen, and indeed too much stress can be laid on the fact that the Overtures to the 1796 Assembly were rejected. As Dr. Mackichan aptly remarks, that debate "ended in a defeat which was really the beginning of a victory." (11) The majority had only been one of 58 against 46, those present obviously representing not much more than a bare quorum, and even then some of those who voted against the petitions shrank from an unqualified dismissal. (12) When a series of similar overtures was presented to that Assembly's successor twenty-eight years later, the attitude with which they were received had changed markedly. The work of the two Scottish Societies, though not widely publicised, was placing before young divinity students a fresh alternative to a home pulpit and the care of a parish. The London Missionary Society, among whose founders and fathers had been Alexander Waugh and David Bogle, both of Berwickshire, and John Love of Paisley, was attracting young Scotsmen to its ranks and had already sent /

NOTES.

(10) D. Mackichan, op. cit., p.78 ff.
(11) Ibid., p.96
(12) Ibid., p.91
Although the East India Company's policy, which had kept Carey out of Calcutta, was firmly opposed to evangelistic work among natives, for fear of stirring up resentment and interfering with trade, interest in India as a potential field was growing all the time. And in 1813, when the Company's Charter came up for its twenty-year renewal, literally hundreds of petitions had been received by Parliament praying that some provision be made for the opening up of missionary work. The Church of Scotland's petition had been the first to be lodged and was accompanied by a request for the appointment of Presbyterian chaplains. (14)

In 1793 the "pious clauses" which Wilberforce and the Scottish Charles Grant, a servant of the East India Company, had tried to get through Parliament had been rejected. In reply to Wilberforce's plea for "missionaries and schoolmasters", the Company had replied that "the Hindus had as good a system of faith and morals as most people, and that it would be madness to attempt their conversion or to give them any more learning or any other description of learning than that which they already possessed." (15) The weighty representations of Henry Dundas and others had been sufficient to keep the embargo against missionaries in force. By 1813 the tide had turned, however, and public pressure as well as a general shift of opinion was enough for Parliament to agree to a sounder type of amendment.

NOTES.


(14) The first chaplains, who were Anglicans, were appointed by the East India Company, records of such appointments going back at Fort St. George, Madras, to the 1630's.

Christianity would have been greatly compromised had teachers and missionaries gone out under the official employment of the East India Company. This danger was now recognised and with the rise of the Missionary Societies an alternative road lay open. The obligation which the new Charter laid on the Company was that of permitting access and facilities to persons going to India "for benevolent designs." At the same time the petition for Scottish chaplains to be included on the Company establishment was accepted. (16)

The first Presbyterian chaplain to reach India, Dr. Bryce, wrote back from Calcutta urging his Church to initiate a Mission of its own. His appeal was presented to the General Assembly of 1824 together with a number of Synodical overtures on similar lines. On this occasion the motion for their adoption came from Dr. Inglis, leader of the Moderate Group, was seconded by another prominent member of the same party and was carried unanimously. (17)

The decision and the whole-hearted manner in which it was reached had important results. (18) It meant for a start that the projected Mission would be the first in modern history to have behind it the full if still unoccupied, support of an organised Church. It meant further that the Mission's policy would reflect and be determined by an unusually broad range of viewpoints.

NOTES.


(18) Strangely enough, while Principal Burleigh's history refers to the 1826 debate, no mention is made of the 1824 Assembly's decision. Both debates are described in some detail by Dr. Mackichan. (op.cit., pp. 78-114) There are also independent eye-witness accounts by a Mr. Robert Heron and a Rev. Hugh Miller. Dr. Robert Buchanan's more judicial version in "The Ten Years' Conflict" is based on those earlier records.
The simple desire to preach the Gospel would be undergirded by a reasonable conviction that evangelism must be conducted within a framework of sound education, and Dr. Inglis himself was appointed Convenor of the new committee. (19)

It meant also that because the Scottish Church was committed to a Mission which it would come to regard as a first call on its members, it could in future years be accused of trying to perpetuate denominationalism. (20) This was of course not the intention at all, as events were to demonstrate. The emphasis was never on extending the bounds of a particular Church or its forms, but on emphasising that overseas Missions should be the responsibility not of a few interested members but of the whole Church.

The most far-reaching result of all, however, was that less than twenty years later, when the Disruption came, and its missionaries to a man went over to the Free Church, the Church of Scotland refused to abandon its work. It was, broadly speaking, the Moderate element which remained within the establishment and the Evangelical section which "went out into the wilderness". But so far as manpower on its Mission fields was concerned, it was the Church of Scotland which was left with some property but bereft of workers. The fact that it had sufficient enthusiasm and sense of obligation to try and maintain its work provides the strongest evidence of how much the attitude towards Foreign Missions had changed.

NOTES

(19) R.W. Weir, "Foreign Missions of the Church of Scotland", p. 34: Dr. Mackichan draws attention to the fact that the educational policy of the Church of Scotland's Mission was not Duff's along, but that of a Committee of which Dr. Inglis, the Moderate leader, was Convener.

(20) The present United Free Church of Scotland (continuing) which maintains no separate Missions of its own but contributes to the work of various inter-denominational Societies such as the China Inland Mission, occasionally accuses the Church of Scotland of "Missionary denominationalism".
Indeed it was to be a rather unusual characteristic of Scottish missionary endeavour from 1824 onwards that the sending bodies, when Presbyterian, were always Churches and not Societies. Mission fields were opened up by the Church of Scotland, the Free Church of Scotland, the United Presbyterian Church and the Original Secession Church and in each case it was the Church itself, through its highest Court, which pledged its whole membership to the support of the venture. To this approach, and the reasons which lay behind it, we may trace the sustained enthusiasm shown by Scottish church members for overseas missionary work, which came to be regarded as an integral part of Christian witness and service.
GENERAL SOURCES


G.D. Henderson, "The Church of Scotland", Church of Scotland Youth Committee, Edinburgh, 1939.


W.L. Mathieson, "Scotland and the Union", James Maclehose and Sons, Glasgow, 1905.


CHAPTER III.

THE PIONEER MISSIONARY: ALEXANDER DUFF AND HIS METHOD.

The Committee appointed by the Church of Scotland's Assembly of 1824 was not immediately successful in finding a suitable candidate but when five years later it sent out Alexander Duff as its first missionary it was fortunate in getting the services of a man of excellent calibre.

His personal gifts and training enabled him to see and take advantage of the opportunities before him and he reached his field at exactly the right time to seize the chance presented. It was a case of the man, the place and the hour being providentially matched.

So much was this the case indeed, that if Duff's first five years of service had been all he was able to give, he would still be recognised as the pioneer who effected a crucial change in missionary policy. As it was, his influence on the lines along which missionary work should develop was as great as that of any man of his generation. And while it is possible to exaggerate the overall effect of his ideas and personality on both missionary and educational policy, it would be hard to over-estimate the contribution he made towards converting his home Church into one of the most missionary-minded in the world.

Alexander Duff was a native of Moulin, in Perthshire, and brought up in a home of genuine evangelical piety in which can be traced, through his father and the local parish minister, the influence of Charles Simeon and the evangelistic Mission he had conducted in this area back in 1796. As a student at St. Andrew's University, Duff fell under the spell of the great Dr. Chalmers and became one of the leading spirits in the founding of the St. Andrew's University Missionary Society. The determining factor in his decision to give his life for the work of Christ as a foreign missionary was the death of his close friend and fellow-student, John Urquhart. But as
at this time he still had two years of studies to complete, he neither committed himself to any definite undertaking nor offered his services to any Society.

In the meantime, while the Church of Scotland was still looking for its candidate, it was agreed to give effect to its Committee's recommendation that a Mission be started in India. In response to Dr. James Bryce's plea, the location of the Mission was declared to be Bengal, somewhere in the region of Calcutta, while its form was to be that of a rural educational Mission. But for lack of a man nothing was done until Duff was appealed to and agreed, after prayer and consultation, to accept the appointment.

He sailed for India with his bride in September, 1829, a young man of twenty-four, the best student of his year at St. Andrew's, possessed of great physical stamina, bursting with vitality and already, at this early stage, a powerful and persuasive speaker. An intensely serious-minded young man and lacking in humour, he was by no means without personal charm and attractiveness. He embarked on his venture full of faith, hope and a truly Scottish determination. He was also extremely fortunate to be reaching India just in the middle of a period of tranquility and political consolidation which followed a quarter century of turmoil, struggle and conquest.

The British victory under Clive at Plassey is usually reckoned as the date on which an era of competitive trade was succeeded by one of imperialistic advance. After 1784, the Company's administration had come under Parliamentary control. British public opinion had become aware of some of the blacker episodes of the years of looting, misrule and exploitation which /
followed Plassey. (1) And Edmund Burke's thesis that power cannot be divorced from responsibility was sinking into English minds. Gradually the idea that Britain was in India because of the excellent opportunities afforded for commercial profit was giving way to the conviction that Britain was in India for India's own good. This process had now been in train for over seventy years.

The Napoleonic wars, even while they threatened Britain's shores, had ceded to her navy undisputed supremacy over Eastern waters, and on the Indian peninsula her armies no longer had to contend with European rivals. The campaigns of Hastings and Wellesley had finally crushed Tippoo Sahib, the master of Mysore, and demolished the power of the Maratha dynasty, with the result that the map of India as a British possession was now taking recognisable shape. Among the changes which it introduced to the East India Company's Charter at its renewal in 1813, the British Parliament had brought an end to its trading monopoly in India and had begun, in the Company's place, to accept the responsibilities of paramountcy. With the new security afforded by such a series of events, the arrival of Lord William Bentinck as Governor-General in 1829 heralded British India's first short era of peace, humanitarian reform and the orderly organisation of administrative controls. There/

NOTES.

(1) For evidence about the plundering and misrule which followed Plassey, indignation and disgust at which led to Warren Hastings' impeachment, we do not unfortunately have to look very far. The English historians, Edmund Thomson and G.T. Garrett describe it by saying that "a gold-lust unequalled since the hysteria that took hold of the Spaniards of Cortes' and Pizarro's day filled the English mind. Bengal in particular was not to know peace again until she had been bled white." One remembers the early history of British India which is perhaps the world's high water mark of graft." (Quoted from Ramess Butt, "An Economic History of India under British Rule, 1901). The American, Brooke Adams, very questionably cites the loot brought back from Bengal as the primary cause for the start of the industrial revolution. ("The Law of Civilisation and Decay", p.259). But a contemporary account of Calcutta in the 1760's is not flattering to British moral standards, painting the city as "one of the most wicked Places in the Universe, Corruption, Licentiousness and a want of Principle seem to have possessed the minds of all the civil servants. By frequent bad examples they have grown Callous, Rapacious and Luxurious beyond Conception". (Quoted Taya Zinkin, "India", Thames and Hudson Ltd., London, 1965, p.41).
was as yet no real consensus of opinion on how long or how widely such controls would have to be exercised. Great Britain, through the Company, was in all but name the ruler of the three maritime Provinces of Bengal, Bombay and Madras but had only extended its influence, not as yet its authority, to the regions beyond. By the same token, although the British, like other European races, tended to class all non-Europeans and non-Christians as savages and barbarians, there existed in many quarters a genuine admiration for Indian civilisation and culture. The classical criterions of Eighteenth Century Europe still held. Literary excellence and the possession of ancient arts, laws and philosophies counted for more than technological skills. And it was accepted that if the West had much to teach the East, the opposite also applied.

There were men of the stamp of Sir Thomas Munro, Lieutenant-Governor of Madras, whose regard for Indian manners was high enough for him to remark that "If civilisation is to be an article of trade between England and India, I am convinced that England will gain by the import cargo." (2) A few years later the Marquis of Hastings, one of Bentinck's predecessors as Governor-General, had declared during a period when British power and influence were being steadily extended that he looked forward to a time "not very remote when England will, on sound principles of policy, wish to relinquish the domination which she has gradually and unintentionally assumed over this country and from which she cannot at present recede." (3) On the whole, Britain was at this time being seen by its own sons as the rather unwilling guardian of India's peace and prosperity. Her rule was necessary but temporary, and would cease as/
soon as India was in a position to govern herself in a proper and orderly manner. "We must look on India not as a temporary possession" wrote Sir Thomas Munro again in 1824, "but as one which is to be maintained firmly until the natives shall in some future age have abandoned most of their superstitions and prejudices and become sufficiently enlightened to frame a regular government for themselves and to conduct and preserve it. Whenever such a time shall arrive, it will probably be best for both countries that the British control over India shall be gradually withdrawn." (4)

It was this outlook which saw it as at least one of the objects of British policy to promote the welfare of the Indians while control lay in British hands, that the liberal and humanitarian Lord Bentinck sought in his seven years of office to embody by legislative reforms. Abolishing the Hindu practice of Sati, or self-immolation of a widow on her husband’s funeral pyre, he also set out to suppress the activities of the thugs, a caste of professional dacoits. A system of training was organised for Indian officials, whose status was also raised. And the Company Charter of 1833 which was renewed under his Governorship declared that, "No native of India shall be disabled from holding any place, office or employment by reason of his religion, place of birth, descent or colour." (5)

This broad and liberal guarantee, as we shall have reason to observe later on, was by no means fulfilled. Yet as a statement of intention it was fundamentally sincere. Neither the Parliament in London nor the Company’s civil servants in India had the least idea at present of associating Indians with the actual government of the country, as distinct from its administration. Yet government by Britain was seen as being both for the welfare of the subject race and a preparation for self-government. (6)

NOTES,
(6) See here e.g. L.S.S. O’Malley, "Modern India and the West: a study in the Interaction of their Civilisations", published O.U.P., for the Royal Institute of International Affairs, 1941.
A growing number of Englishmen were becoming convinced, however, that for India the way to progress and freedom could lead along one path only, that of Westernisation and Christianisation. Distressed and horror-struck, or sometimes scathing and contemptuous, of everything which they saw in Hinduism, they were further confirmed in their views because one or two enlightened Indians shared their opinions on the evils of idolatry and the liberating power of Western education. During this period of transition, it was men of this persuasion who were going to carry great weight and their decisions on matters of education were to have a momentous effect on the country's future. Most prominent among them were Thomas Babington Macaulay, who in 1833 was appointed as the first law member to the Governor-General's Council; his brother-in-law Charles Trevelyan, a Company official in Calcutta; and Ram Mohun Roy, a well-educated Brahmin of advanced reforming views who has on various occasions been described as the Erasmus of India.

When the 24 year old Alexander Duff disembarked at Calcutta on 27th May, 1830, after an eight-month voyage round the Cape which included two ship-wrecks en route, he seems to have possessed no set ideas about his best course of action. The Home Committee had given him a free hand, subject to a gentleman's agreement that he would start an educational mission, but not in the city itself. About such a project there was nothing in the least original. The two forms of work already being undertaken by other missionaries were evangelistic work — preaching in streets, bazaars and by the road-side — and the teaching of children in vernacular village schools.

This was the system which had already been adopted by the missionaries of the Glasgow Missionary Society near Bombay, and in Bengal too it was the accepted pattern. It was true that William Carey and his two colleagues had set up a printing press and started a college at Serampore. And while the college's medium of instruction was Bengali, Sanskrit and English literature were also
offered as part of the curriculum. But Serampore was too far from Calcutta to have a great educational influence, and as yet the only institution in the Province where a real taste for English knowledge and learning had been developed was the Hindu College. (7) This institution had been started by a group of Indians anxious to gain for their sons a type of education very different from that offered by the old Sanskrit or Arabic systems. In their project they had received whole-hearted support and advice from an English watchmaker, David Hare, a self-declared rationalist and freethinker and a disciple of Tom Paine's. The atmosphere prevalent in the Hindu College was one of scepticism and scorn for traditional beliefs and was disturbing to orthodox Hindus. But it was equally abhorrent to Christian missionaries who saw it as a breeding ground of doubt and agnosticism. The majority of them, therefore, in reaction against the disintegrating effects of this rationalistic type of education, had a strong initial prejudice against the use of English as a medium of instruction. So far as missionary work was concerned, education meant the teaching of illiterates and semi-literates in the regional language. Here contacts would be made with groups who would form ready-made audiences for Christian preaching; and after the first few conversions there would also be the nucleus of a Christian community. Higher education, on the other hand, should be a matter of following the methods and preserving the traditions of Indian culture already hallowed by centuries of use.

In adopting this outlook missionaries found themselves ranged on the same side as a Committee of Public Instruction appointed to administer the expenditure of a sum of £10,000 which Parliament had decided should be set aside annually "for the revival and promotion of literature and the encouragement of the learned/

NOTES.

(7) According to Bishop Whitehead, Bishop's College also had an English Class. It may be assumed that the standard was low, however, and that little attempt was being made to teach "Western knowledge". op.cit., p. 178.
natives of India and for the introduction and promotion of a knowledge of the sciences amongst the inhabitants of the British territories." (8)

The Committee was given a fairly free hand to strike what might appear to it the wisest balance between fostering the traditional forms of Indian scholarship and introducing the sciences and philosophies of the West. In the event, all but a very small part of the money was used to found three more Oriental Colleges and for the highly expensive business of editing certain Eastern Classics and translating European mathematical or scientific works into Arabic or Sanskrit. (9)

These "Orientalists", to give them the name by which they were popularly known, were as certain that the old style of education was right for the country as they were that the teaching of English — both the language and the subjects it opened out — would be resented by the Indian population. Among them were excellent linguists who had acquired a deep love and respect for the learning of the East and were concerned to defend it as an inheritance of which the Indian peoples should not be deprived. They considered that Persian, the language introduced to the courts of the Mogul Emperors, should continue as the official language of the administration. And it seemed even more fitting that Sanskrit, with its magnificent vocabulary and wealth of poetic and philosophical thought, should be the basis of all higher learning.

In the opinion of the "Anglicists", who took the opposite view, it seemed on the other hand quite essential to open up India to the stream of Western ideas, for which the English language was the only practicable medium. Subtle and sophisticated though Indian culture undoubtedly was, it was riddled with falsehood and superstition. Indians as a race were by all Western standards thoroughly backward in terms of modern commerce, education and political /

---

NOTES.

(8) Quoted W. Paton, op.cit., p.89.
(9) Ibid., pp.89-90.
institutions. And it would be an equal handicap to both Britain and India to deprive the latter of the means of emancipation. The desire was not to subject and dominate but to civilise. But civilisation, seen through the eyes of the English civil servants and politicians of that day, inevitably meant westernising and modernising. As Macaulay was to explain to the British Parliament a few years later, when he described the political implications lying behind a new educational policy for India, the aim was to create a class of "Indians in blood and colour, but English in taste, opinions, morals and intellect, (because) no nation can be perfectly well governed till it is competent to govern itself. It may be that the public mind of India will expand under our system until it has outgrown that system — that by a good government we educate our subjects into a capacity for better government, so that they demand English institutions."

Macaulay then went on to say, "It would be, on the most selfish view of the case, far better for us that the people of India were well-governed and independent of us than ill-governed and subject to us — to trade with civilised men is infinitely more profitable than to govern savages. That would indeed be a doting wisdom which, in order that India might remain a dependency, would make it a useless and costly independence: which would keep a hundred million men from being our customers in order that they might continue to be our slaves." (10).

The situation in India when Duff reached it in 1830 was that Indians and Europeans alike were divided on the issue of whether a westernised education would be to the country's advantage or not. But the Orientalists, consisting of /

NOTES.

(10) Speech by T.B. Macaulay to House of Commons, 10th July, 1835, quoted T. Zinkin, op.cit., p.44.
Government servants, missionaries and the largely inarticulate mass of orthodox caste Hindu families, were against it. While the Anglicists, who were in the minority, were represented by a new generation of Englishmen who sat loose to the cautious traditions of the Company and an equally new generation of educated Indians who resented the restriction of ancient fetters.

It took Duff six weeks to make himself familiar with the position. During this time he talked with as many other missionaries as possible and travelled up to Serampore to meet the venerable Carey himself. Then he dropped his bombshell.

With the intrepidity of youth, he announced his intention of opening an institution in which instruction on the Western arts and sciences would be accompanied by the teaching of the Christian Scriptures. The new scheme was launched against a formidable barrage of hostility or disapproval. "All authority and influence" says William Paton, "were arrayed on the other side." (11) Of Duff's missionary colleagues, Carey alone had given him some encouragement, orthodox Hindus and the radical supporters of the Hindu College both opposed the teaching of Scripture, though for different reasons, and in administrative circles the ideas of westernising and of christianising were frowned on with equal dislike. Without the help of Ram Mohun Roy, Duff would have experienced much difficulty in renting a building and the five young men who presented themselves for enrolment on the opening day were all sons of the Indian's family friends responding to Mohun Roy's persuasive tongue and out of a sense of obligation.

---

NOTES

(11) W. Paton, op.cit., p.63.
But the venture proved so overwhelmingly popular that by the end of the week the opening trickle had swelled to a flood of over three hundred applicants. And at the end of the year, when Duff submitted his pupils to a public examination, the enthusiasm of those who came to listen and criticise left no doubt concerning the success of the experiment. For days Calcutta talked of nothing else and from now on the Assembly's Institution had more applications than it could accept.

This rapid and surprising story of success was due primarily to the fact that Duff was meeting a real demand. In a letter to Dr. Inglis he described how all through the time when preparations for opening the Institution were in train, excitement among the natives was intense. "Every day numbers collected about my house: they followed me along the streets: they threw open the doors of my palkee (palanquin?) and poured forth their entreaties with an impassionate earnestness that would have moved (?) the most obdurate heart: they deplored their ignorance: they craved for 'English reading': they constantly appealed to the compassion of Englishmen: some said, 'Me good boy, oh take me'. Some said, 'Me poor boy, oh take me'. Some said, 'Me want read your books, oh take me'." (13)

But the test of the experiment was the excellence of the education provided. When given simple subjects to expound and not carried away on one of his oratorical flights Duff was a born teacher and with eager and intelligent pupils to instruct he made astonishing progress.

Yet he was a missionary first and a teacher second. His purpose/

NOTES.
(12) G. Smith. op.cit., pp.66-68.
(13) MS Letter from Alexander Duff to Dr. Inglis, 23rd Aug., 1830; Scottish National Library.
was to educate, but with a further end in view. In the words of his biographer, his object was, "In the strength of God and with the intensity of a faith that burned ever more brightly to his dying hour, nothing less than the destruction of a system of beliefs, life and ancient civilisation of the highest type, based on a great literature expressed in the most elaborate language in the world." (14)

The basis of the school curriculum was the teaching of Scripture, which was for Duff the key to all Western learning, the goal towards which all truth led. He was absolutely correct in his perception that it was a false dichotomy, and for Indians in particular a meaningless and destructive act, to departmentalise religious teaching or remove it from the general corpus of instruction. This had been done at the Hindu College, with disastrous results. Speaking of some of the young atheists who were students at that College and whom he found himself able to influence, Duff wrote again to Dr. Inglis, "It is scarcely possible to overestimate the importance of the endeavour to bestow just impressions of the truth and give their minds an impulse in the proper direction. --- It is clear that at the breaking up of the old system and the introduction of another to succeed it, trains of good or evil may be set in motion which may diffuse a blessing or propagate a curse throughout all time. Now, unless their present anti-religious, anti-social views be either greatly modified or entirely changed, evil interminable must be produced." (15)

The secular subjects offered by the Institution, then, were not a/

---

NOTES.

(14) G. Smith, op.cit., p.56.

(15) MS Letter from Alexander Duff to Dr. Inglis, 31st Dec., 1831. Scottish National Library.
bait for enticing in pupils who would then be subtly exposed to Christian propaganda. Education crowned by diligent instruction in the revelation of God’s truth in Jesus Christ would set in motion the "train of blessings" and avert the evils for which Hindu superstition and secularised education were alike responsible.

More positively and directly, the work of Duff's Institution would be "to apply a lever to the formidable mass of Pagan Idolatry". Missionary methods up to date had only succeeded in converting individuals here and there and all but a very few of these came from the lower castes. It was Duff's hope, on the other hand, to start the whole fabric of Hinduism crumbling through the conversion of its leaders. As he saw it, Western missionaries had so far been no more than a collection of individuals, each one of whom was hacking away at one corner of the massive citadel of Hinduism with little hope of success. Though with infinite labour a stone might be removed here and another there, the strength of the structure itself was unaffected. "Formerly each denomination or rather each missionary followed the bent of his own inclinations: his labours were isolated." But now the operation was about to take place through which the citadel itself would begin to dissolve from within. The plan which he had in mind Duff explained himself some thirty years later in the following words:

"The grand question was -- How can we in the most speedy and effective manner succeed in reaching and impressing the body of a great nation?"

NOTES.

(16) Letter from Alexander Duff to Dr. Inglis, 4th Jan., 1832, Scottish National Library.

(17) Ibid.
Or how can we most efficiently and permanently succeed in regenerating the great mass of a sunken, demoralised people? Whether, for example, in the first instance, it is better exclusively to pursue the direct method of attempting at once to impart a general element of knowledge to the many or the indirect method of attempting to reach the many through the instrumentality of the superiorly instructed few.

"For strong reasons — I was led conclusively to decide in favour of the latter. My resolution was, therefore, taken from the outset to establish a separate institution for the express purpose of communicating that higher knowledge — In this way, as remarked in substance at the time, what we sow, we shall reap 100-fold." (18)

The theory was excellent, but the test of a theory is whether it fits the facts. Within a couple of years, substantial evidence was produced that Duff's method seemed to be achieving its aim. Four young converts were made, all from high-caste Brahmin homes. The first of these, Mohesh Chunder Ghose, was a student at the Hindu College who had attended meetings of students held at Duff's house. Of the other three, Krishna Mohan Banerjee, Gopinath Nundy and Anando Chand Mozumdar, only the last was Duff's own pupil. But all four took the momentous and socially very complicated and difficult step of becoming Christians by baptism as the direct result of Duff's teaching and personal influence. These conversions led to a series of uproars and for a time the school was deserted. Then the students returned, the Institution continued to flourish and its founder's fundamental contention was triumphantly vindicated. These were converts of a type with

---

NOTES.

which other Missions had hardly made even surface contact. It began to seem feasible after all that it might be through Western teaching, offered along with the Bible instruction which was an integral part of it, that the more intelligent sections of the population would be brought to a saving knowledge of Christian truth. Under their leadership, Indian Christianity would become a self-propagating faith, so that the masses in turn might be brought in. (19)

It is only natural to wonder why such a young and inexperienced missionary should appear to have broken through where older hands and presumably wiser heads had failed. The answer undoubtedly is that Duff arrived at the psychological moment for the making of such an approach. His fresh mind, uncluttered by too many conflicting arguments over a mass of detailed evidence, reduced a complicated problem to simple terms. And to his task he dedicated all his burning energy and infectious enthusiasm. This was balanced by force of character and a cool head, a good brain, an excellent education and practical teaching ability. The launching of the Institution, though rapidly carried out, was no brilliant but sketchily conceived idea. Based on accurate observation and assessment of the facts, the plan of the Institution and its curriculum was carefully thought out and it was put into operation with thoroughness and imagination.

The key to the whole conception was the fact that knowledge without religion -- facts without faith, as we might put it today -- was negative, meaningless, and so eventually a completely destructive idea. While this /

---

NOTES.

(19) For accounts of the conversion and baptism of Duff’s first four converts, see G. Smith, op.cit., Ch.VI, pp.71-90: W. Paton, op.cit., pp. 82-86. Some of Duff's MS letters, preserved in the Scottish National Library, give detailed narratives.
may be one of the fundamental theses of Christianity, it is not even a matter of argument among Hindus, the most religious race in the world. Duff perceived this very clearly, and that any form of education which professed to stand aloof from religious beliefs must in fact be preaching atheism. "A course of instruction that professes to convey truth of any kind thus becomes a species of religious education in India — all education there being regarded as religious or theological. It is this that gives to the dissemination of mere human knowledge, in the present state of India, such awful importance." (20)

For Duff himself, it was part of his faith that all truth came from one source. "If in that land you give the people knowledge without religion" he told the General Assembly in 1855, "Rest assured that it is the greatest blunder that was ever committed. Once driven out of their own systems, they will inevitably become infidels in religion." (21)

While Duff certainly underestimated the power of Hinduism to resist such attacks on its system, in his central contention he was absolutely correct. To speak of "knowledge" without beliefs was to describe a ship with no compass and it was his own life-long conviction that in Christianity alone did God provide man with his true compass. Thus Western learning led naturally to an understanding of the need for the Christian truth on which it was built and an appreciation of the saving rightness of that truth. But fail to add the crowning glory of Christian teaching and it would be impossible to save the empty house of the Indian soul from being occupied /

NOTES:

(20) Quoted W. Paton, op.cit., p.107
(21) Quoted G. Smith, op.cit., p.134
by the seven woe devils which came raging in once the absurdities of Hinduism had stood self-revealed. (22)

In arriving at such conclusions, Duff found himself in the course of the next few years very close to some of his contemporaries of the British administration, though here we must also allow for the effect of his own powers of persuasion. It was also the opinion of Macaulay, an orthodox churchman but no evangelical, that "No Hindu who had received an English education ever remains sincerely attached to his own religion. It is my sincere belief that if our plans of education are followed up there will not be a single idolater among any of the respectable classes of Bengal thirty years from now and this will be effected without any effort to proselytise, without the smallest interference of their religious liberty, merely by the natural operation of knowledge and reflection." (23) We may here recall Macaulay's words to Parliament about the raising up of an emancipated middle class, "Indian in blood and colour but English in taste, opinions, morals and intellect." (24) And we may understand why his ideas and those of Alexander Duff, while /

NOTES

(22) See e.g. in Duff's "Missions the Chief End of The Christian Church", p.79: "It is a fact therefore that members are well qualified to read the Christian Scriptures in our admirable English version -- This surely is no ordinary blessing, this is not to impart knowledge, whether common or sacred, by measure. -- No, this is at once to present members with the key of knowledge -- of all knowledge, literary, scientific and religious, knowledge which ages of time and hosts of translators could never furnish."


(24) See Note 10
they circled round a different centre of interest, nevertheless shared a large common segment.

Macaulay's was the authoritative voice which got the important Education Act of 1835 into the statute books. How far he was wise in his judgments and aims is a matter we have still to discuss, but his motives were generous for he declared "a wish to share with the youth of India the rich inheritance of English literature, to admit them to the storehouse of English political philosophy and to prepare them to play their part as citizens of a Commonwealoh organised on the English model."(25) The result of this Act was that the Indian administration was now committed to promoting higher education through the medium of English and to a general policy which laid much more stress on Westernising. And in due time Macaulay's prediction about the rise of a liberalised middle-class who would demand English institutions was actually fulfilled. Idolatry was not abolished, but it was this class which formed the backbone of the National Congress; and that in turn demanded for India democratic self-determination. To this extent Macaulay's insight was accurate and "India broke her fetters with Western hammers."(26)

It was equally realistic of the Governor and his Council to realise that the Government had a moral obligation to offer Indians the chance of a Western education in some form or another. It would have been impossible to prevent such knowledge from spreading. And Indian leaders of a later generation could rightly have accused Britain of denying their country the means of advancement in order to keep them under control as a race of ignorant slaves. "It is our duty to extend knowledge, whatever the result" remarked Sir Charles Metcalfe about this time. "And spread it would, even if we prevented it."(27)

NOTES.
(26) P.E. Roberts, op. cit., p.649
(27) Quoted by G.M. Trevelyan, op. cit., p.316
about the teaching of Christian doctrine to Hindu youths and the possibilities of unrest as a result of proselytising activities, there was among administrators more uncertainty. According to one present-day Indian interpretation, Lord Bentinck was himself against it, being of the opinion that, "In all schools and colleges — interference and injudicious mingling, direct or indirect, — of the teaching of Christianity with the system of instruction, ought to be forbidden." (28) But this was certainly not the Governor's view by the time the Education Dispatch was in the process of being framed. And although the Government officially stood neutral to all religions and no grants were given for religious teaching, it was not forbidden to give Scripture instruction even to students of another religion, and civil servants naturally had their own personal opinions about the value of Bible teaching.

Religious convictions and prejudices apart, the degradation into which Hinduism had fallen was another strong argument in favour of the Westernising policy to which education was the key. Over two hundred pages of Duff's own "India and India Missions" are devoted to descriptions of the system and its evils. And while his views would be classed today as one-sided, there is no doubt that Hinduism at this period was at its lowest ebb. This is a fact acknowledged by the most ardent of Hindu revivalists. "The darkness that descended on India in the Eighteenth Century" writes S. Mitra, of the Rama Krishna Mission, "was nowhere so dark as in Bengal. Apart from the decadence of her cultural life, she fell a sorry victim to wanton exploitation by foreign intruders." (29) A more impartial and reasonably sympathetic observer who actually lived in those times was Sir Charles Grant, the introducer of the "pious clauses" intended for the 1813 Charter. In attempting to describe conditions as he saw them, he revealed an understanding of the complexity and value of the Hindu social system, but was not flattering in his description.——

NOTES.

(28) Ram Gopal, op.cit., p.220.
(29) S. Mitra, op.cit., p.44.
of Bengali society. "Discord, hatred, abuse, injuries, complaints, litigations, all the effect of selfishness unrestrained by principles, prevail to a supreme degree." (30) This was not so much a condemnation of Hinduism, for he could have pointed with equal force to the many evils rampant in the life of the Christian Britain of those days. But it was to give an account of darkness and appeal for light. And it was in fact quite impossible to present even the most elementary facts of modern knowledge without contradicting the teaching of the old.

"How far even educated people had been touched by European ideas", wrote Bishop Mylne, "May be estimated by a single fact, that the first scientific conception which Duff had to communicate to his pupils, who belonged to the most intelligent classes, was that rain was not to be accounted for by the spouting of a celestial elephant discharging water from its trunk". (31)

Certainly from the time when Duff held his first public examination, opinion on all sides started swinging over towards the advantages of Western education and amongst its most enthusiastic supporters were missionaries who had formerly opposed it. Mission schools offering English in their syllabus began to spring up all over the country and Alexander Duff came to be revered as the pioneer and father of a revolutionary missionary method.

This change of emphasis was a matter of great importance. In the first place, many Western Missions, including those from Scotland, came to the conclusion that the indirect means of attack through higher education was likely to be more successful than those of direct evangelism. Ten years /

NOTES.
(31) Quoted L.G. Mylne, "Missions to Hindus", pp. 132-133.
after the inception of the Institutions Duff told a Scottish Assembly how he rejoiced in the company of the missionaries who engaged in the simple preaching of the Gospel to the heathen. But his attitude towards them was that "while you engage in directly separating as many precious atoms from the mass as the stubborn resistance to ordinary appliances can admit, we shall, with the blessing of God, devote our time and strength to the preparing of a mine and the setting of a train which shall one day explode and tear up the whole from its lowest depths." (32) Other Missions, believing Duff's prophecy likely to be fulfilled, proceeded to establish schools and colleges of their own and became in many parts of the country the first in the field with higher education.

They thus acknowledged that their policies now contained a double object. To put it in military terms, they set before themselves an intermediate and a final objective. This dual aim was defined by Duff when he said, "Our greatest object was to convey, as largely as possible, a knowledge of our ordinary improved literature and science to the young persons: but another and more vital object was to convey a thorough knowledge of Christianity with its evidence and doctrines." (33) This meant that a Mission's ultimate objective became dependent on and in a sense posterior to the successful running of educational institutions. And as a corollary, conversion to Christianity no longer became the sole or even the chief criterion of a Mission's success. The leaven was believed to be working within the lump, until one day that whole lump would be leavened in what Duff himself envisaged/

NOTES.

(32) Quoted G. Smith, op.cit., p.57.
(33) Quoted Ram Gopal, op.cit., p.220.
as a landslide movement towards Christianity, first on the part of the nation's intellectual leaders, then their caste fellows, and finally the masses.

Accordingly, to future criticism of the small number of converts made by the Institutions, Duff would reply that he never expected the whole, or a majority, or even a large proportion of pupils to become Christians in his day. But he pointed to the number of well-educated young men -- the future leaders of the Church -- who did become Christians, thereby giving Indian Christianity the much-needed character of a self-propagating religion. He also drew attention to how many others were Christian now by intellectual conviction, even if they had not mustered courage to make the break with their families and caste. (34)

He himself never ceased to believe that the educational method, while apparently slow, would be the quickest in the end. "The pioneers of Immanuel have been busily at work all round, preparing materials for the great assault", he told a packed meeting at Exeter Hall. "Sapping and mining operations have long been carried on with various success. Some of the outworks have been carried and demolished and an occasional explosion has left visible rents and chasms in one or other of the battlements. The day is coming -- when assuredly the great central citadel itself should fall." (35)

The acceptance by Missions of the double objective involved another important change, in aligning them from now on as co-workers with the Government. As we have already seen, the Government's own attitude, as represented by the Governor-General and his Council, had reached a major point of change. The/

NOTES,


earlier hostility shown towards missionaries by the East India Company, the cause of which was anxiety over valuable commercial interests, had given way to permissiveness and on occasion to a rather guarded approval. It was no longer typical for a Company Director to grumble that "he would rather see a band of devils in India than a band of missionaries". (36)

The influence of Anglican chaplains of deep sincerity and force of character, men like David Brown, Claudius Buchanan and Henry Martyn, had succeeded in raising the moral tone of the European community in Calcutta as well as touching English consciences regarding a Christian's duty towards the lightening of the heathen darkness. (37) The evangelical spirit was spreading and it is significant that the introduction to a new edition of Richard Baxter's "Reformed Pastor", published in 1829, should be written by Daniel Wilson, Bishop of Calcutta. (38)  Evangelical Christians were not as yet conspicuous among leading British soldiers and civil servants, but there was a growing sense of obligation towards their Indian subjects. The community of ideas between men such as Macaulay, Bentinck and Trevelyan on the one hand and Duff and his colleagues on the other, was a new phenomenon. And once the new educational policy had been put into operation a fresh phase in the relation between Government and Missions had begun.

For the Missions too this meant a good deal of readjustment of their ideas. Even after the embargo on missionary work, which was never of course/

---

NOTES:
(36) Quoted Ram Gopal, op.cit. p.212
(37) C.H. Robinson, op.cit. p.84
complete (39), had been lifted, the British Government's neutrality on matters of religion had been the cause of some criticism and resentment. The type of rationalist teaching favoured by many of the Anglicist party had prejudiced missionaries against any form of alliance with the Government in the most obvious sphere, that of education. And indeed the dislike and suspicion of Government-sponsored education which lacked the ballast of Christian truth and moral standards were sentiments which were to continue. In 1840 we find John Wilson of Bombay writing in a letter, "The fruits of the ungodly system of the education of the natives so long pursued by the Government are beginning to be matured in the conceit, pride, infidelity and insubordination of the more active part of the rising generation". (40) Nevertheless missionaries were now aware that in adopting this method of propagation they would have the good wishes and co-operation of a civil power on which they were necessarily dependent for protection and numerous other facilities. It would be a great mistake to describe this as a marriage of convenience and not as, what in fact it was, a genuine partnership of two groups with similar aims. When Duff opened his Institution, "one chief object of which is to diffuse Christian knowledge among the natives", he was aware that the Government would not be prepared to support such an /

NOTES.

(39) No reference has been made in these chapters to the work of other European missionaries before Carey, the first British missionary. Among the most honoured and successful of those who laboured in India during the earlier days of the Company were the Roman Catholic de Nobili and the Lutherans Ziegenbalg and Schwartz. See J.M. Ogilvie, op.cit., or any history of Missions.

organisation. Yet as far back as 1831 he was foretelling, "A short time in this respect will produce very great changes." (41)

In less than four years he had not only proved himself right on that account but revealed his own conviction that the rule of a firm Christian Government and the teaching and influence of Missions were complementary to one another. Speaking to the Assembly about the rebellious and critical spirit of Hindu youths who had been educated at the Hindu College, and comparing them with others who had been converted to Christianity through the influence of the Calcutta Institution, he said, -- "As soon as some of these (proteges of secularised education) become converts to Christianity -- how totally different their tone of feeling towards the existing Government. --- Their bowels yearn over the miseries of their countrymen. And their spontaneous feeling was 'Ah, woe be to us if the British Government were destroyed and the Hindu dynasties restored! --- We pray for the permanence of the British Government, that under the shadow of its protection we may disseminate the healing knowledge which alone can secure their present welfare and immortal happiness.' --- So clearly and strongly did this appear to many members of the present Government in India that instead of regarding us with jealousy and suspicion as enemies, they looked upon us as the truest friends of the British Government, the staunchest supporters of the British power." (42)

It is clear that we are now being presented with a double re-orientation of missionary policy -- first there is the acceptance of a double objective, one intermediate and the other final; then there is the alliance with the British Government in the sphere of education, which was to lead in turn to other forms of co-operation. Alexander Duff himself had some responsibility in bringing about these changes, but it is possible to overestimate his part.

---

NOTES.

(41) MS Letter from A. Duff to Dr. Inglis, 5 Oct. 1831. Scottish National Library.
(42) A. Duff, address to General Assembly, 1835, quoted G. Smith, op. cit., p. 134.
If the experiment of the Assembly's Institution had not been initiated by him it would no doubt have been tried by some other missionary and the use of educational methods was certainly not confined to India. The system was universally adopted by Protestant and Roman Catholic Missions alike and it became the rule rather than the exception for colonial Governments to work hand in hand with the Missions for schooling and medical care. This was a recognised feature of missionary advance in an era of colonial expansion.

Yet there is one thing which can hardly be exaggerated, and that is Duff's influence on the development of Scottish Mission work in India for generations to come. Invalided home on furlough in 1834, he spent over three years in Scotland, and having first converted his own Committee to the aims of an educational Mission he went on to become the most powerful advocate for the cause of Foreign Missions which the country has ever known. His address to the General Assembly of 1835 brought him an ovation without parallel in Scottish Church history and 20,000 copies of the speech were ordered for distribution in Scotland and beyond.

Duff was then commissioned by the Assembly to carry out a scheme of his own devising and plead the cause of Missions by touring the Scottish Presbyteries. It was a form of appeal which had never been permitted for any other cause and it became in due course the basis of the system adopted by the home departments of the various Scottish Foreign Missions Committees. Duff's fame, enthusiasm and oratorical powers made him particularly well suited to such a task, and although the controversial issues which in another few years were to lead to the Disruption were already dividing the Church into two sections, stress was laid from the beginning on the fact that the cause of Missions was a non-party matter. To Duff's and his Committee's emphasis on this, and the fact that the Committee itself was broadly representative, credit must be given. It was largely responsible for the determination with which the Church of Scotland set out to carry on and extend its work after the/
disaster of 1843. Meanwhile Duff was also encouraging the organisation of local Missionary Associations and interesting young men in the call to service overseas. The "Missionary Record" magazine was started in 1838 and the next year saw the publication of two volumes of Duff's addresses under the titles "Missions the Chief End of the Christian Church" and "India and India Missions". It is no exaggeration to say that at this point Alexander Duff and the cause of Foreign Missions were for Scottish churchmen almost synonymous. (43)

On his return to India he visited the Mission at Bombay recently adopted by the Church of Scotland and then travelled on to inspect the new Institution at Madras. (44) And over the next twenty-three years, before leaving India for the last time, he gained an unrivalled knowledge of Protestant missionary work on the sub-continent. In 1849 he visited every Protestant Mission of importance from Ceylon to the Punjab, thus acquiring a detailed knowledge of conditions quite unique for that day. (45)

On his retirement in 1867 and for the next eleven years he acted as Professor of Evangelistic Theology, a chair specially founded for him to fill, and also as superintendent of the Free Church's Foreign Mission work. During this period he helped to establish the new Mission in Santalia, in a section of Bengal which he had himself reconnoitred a few years earlier. (46)

NOTES:

(43) For the most detailed account of Duff's work in organising what would today be termed the Home Department of Foreign Missions, see G. Smith, op. cit., Chs. 10-12, pp.123-172.

(44) Ibid., Ch.13, pp.182-185.

(45) Ibid., Ch.18, pp.232-244 and passim.

(46) Ibid., Ch.25, pp.325-337; also J.M. Macphail, "Our Church's Work in India: Santalia", published for the F.M.C. of the Free Church of Scotland, Oliphant, Anderson and Ferrier, pp.33-34.
truth is that he became far too influential. His ideas and his personality cast a long shadow, so long that after his death his successors still continued to walk in it. The passionate eloquence of his younger days gave way to an equally passionate but now wearisome prolixity. He was no lecturer, his lectures at New College being described by Henry Drummond as "magnificent torsos", for it was seldom that he got past the introduction. "He never used one word where ten would do", and his endless orations in the Assembly and elsewhere became notorious for boring a younger generation to tears. (47) Twice Moderator of the General Assembly and universally revered, he became the Grand Old Man of Missions. But unfortunately this was not an age in which grand old men could be persuaded to retire gracefully. By the time of his death in 1878 his outlook had been dominating Mission policy for nearly half a century, and this was at least a dozen years too long.

The consequence was that the mould in which Scottish Mission work was set became far too rigidly the mould Duff had shaped during the first few years of his service. The Free Church followed his lead with enthusiasm, Dr. William Miller of Madras becoming the protagonist of missionary higher education for the next generation. The Church of Scotland also tagged along, though less willingly, and with recurrent complaints from workers and supporters who disliked the too exclusive emphasis on educational methods.

Rivalry between the two Churches, success on the part of the Free Church and a dislike of admitting failure on the part of the Church of Scotland, together with genuine admiration and loyalty towards the pioneer of Scottish/

NOTES.

Missions, all combined to set the "Institution" solidly at the heart of Indian missionary work. How far a similar pattern would have emerged without Duff's guiding hand it is impossible to say. But so much controversy has raged ever since about the method which Scottish Missions adopted as their own to a special degree that before going further we must face up to certain questions.

First, was Duff justified in the assessment which led him to choose higher education in English as the key to evangelism for the India of his day? And second, what were his motives and those of his colleagues and immediate successors? In departing from the traditional methods of the New Testament, were they in fact seeking a different end from that of the Apostles? In place of the Kingdom of Heaven, was their vision no more than a spiritualised version of political imperialism?

In dealing with the first query, concerning the wisdom of Duff's Institutional method, we find a startling divergence of opinion even among informed men of similar aim and background. For instance, if we select the reactions of three Anglicans, all men with a marked ecumenical viewpoint, we find that Bishop Gore, speaking at the Edinburgh Conference in 1910, some thirty years after Duff's death, could say, "If you look at the diffusion which has taken place of Christian ideas and ideals, far beyond the region of any specific Church membership or Christian belief, and if you ask who are in the main responsible for it, I answer unhesitatingly, in the main Christian educators. Again if you ask what has most powerfully impressed even the hostile imagination within the charmed circle of Indian Society --- I say once again, Christian educators." (48)

NOTES.

(48) Quoted J.N. Ogilvie, op.cit., p.423; The speech is quoted as a tribute to the results of Duff's methods.
At the opposite extreme, Bishop Stephen Neill, writing in the 1930's, attaches to Duff's policy the simple and damning label "disastrous". (49) While a contemporary assessment by Dr. Max Warren, formerly secretary of the Church Missionary Society, sees the establishment of the Calcutta Institution as a matter of Christian opportunism which was at once laudable and inevitable. (50) The respective dates behind this variety of opinion indicate first of all a period when the aims and value of missionary education were uncritically applauded, followed by one in which they were too critically dismissed. More recently there has emerged a more balanced view of both its virtues and weaknesses.

It need not be questioned today, for instance, that Alexander Duff looked on Hinduism and all it stood for with an eye that if it was perceptive so far, had the blind spot shared by most men in that age. Macaulay and the majority of his European contemporaries, whether soldiers, civil servants or missionaries, saw Hinduism from the outside only and everything they saw was evil. In his private letters to Scotland -- in which we may expect to find Duff's personal feelings revealed with less restraint -- the words "Hinduism" and "India" have what almost amounts to perpetual epithets attached to them. Hinduism is invariably "this pagan system", "this heathen religion", "that abominable religion". And India is "this benighted" or "idolatrous land". (51) Missionary hymns of the period and later remind us, of course, that this was the usage of the day and, even for men of such wide/

---

NOTES.

(50) Opinion expressed by Dr. Warren in a private letter.
(51) See various letters from A. Duff to Dr. Inglis, Dr. Brunton, etc., Scottish National Library.
learning and sympathies as William Carey or John Wilson of Bombay, Hinduism was never anything else but the "abomination of desolation." "The grandest living system of human error" was how John Wilson described it to the General Assembly. And Carey, who is remembered warmly in present-day India for the printing of books in Bengali, produced other books and pamphlets which were banned by the East India Company for their open denunciation of Hindu beliefs and practices. There was nothing out-of-the way in Duff's attitude towards Hinduism, which was in fact quite typical of his day.

Nevertheless, it was wholly unsympathetic. A competent Bengali speaker, though never fluent, Duff never became an Oriental scholar like Wilson or his colleague, Murray Mitchell. He studied Hinduism with the sole purpose of learning enough about it to destroy it. John Wilson, on the other hand, saw that it was necessary to understand and even up to a point to appreciate what one was seeking to destroy. In particular he saw something of its value as a social system. "The systems of faith which have so long exercised their sway in this country" he told the Asiatic Society in one typical address, "Are valuable as they illustrate the tendency of those systems in their concern for public and social life. Destitute of a knowledge of these systems and the works in which they are embodied, the native character and state of native society will never be sufficiently understood, a right key obtained to open the native mind and all desirable facilities enjoyed for the introduction among the people of a body of rational and equitable law, the propagation of the Gospel and the promotion of general education.--The more a knowledge of Hinduism and of Hindu

NOTES.

(52) John Wilson, address to the Free Church General Assembly on "The Apostasy and Conversion of India.", 18/10/43; "Missionary Pamphlets", Vol. 22, p.121, F.M.C. Secretary's Library.
(53) S. Mitra, op.cit., p.47.
literature is possessed by any teacher, the more patiently and
uninterruptedly will he be listened to by the people." (54)

It was Wilson’s view in 1835 that “Colleges, though they be admirable
institutions in the instruction of Christians, are but clumsy instruments
in the making or conversion of Christians.” And while later successes
in the Bombay Institution and a warm friendship with Duff himself caused him
to modify this attitude considerably, he never ceased to regard Duff’s
championship of the English medium as too exclusive. (55) Evangelism must
be conducted in many forms and the work of the Institutions provided only one
form, though an exceptionally valuable one. (56)

Alexander Duff, in contrast, stands revealed as a man whose attitude
towards the social as well as the religious aspects of Hinduism, and so his
ideas also of what was good for India, grew fixed during his early years
abroad and never altered. A Christian’s first sight of India, according to
the picture he drew, was that of the “Moloch of the East sitting enthroned
amidst the representative emblems of that cruelty and vice which constitute
the very essence of his worship.” (57) This was always his dominant
theme and it never changed.

Yet we should not deduce that because he hated their religion Duff had
no real sympathy for Indians nor admiration for their gifts. He genuinely
loved the country of his adoption and only wished to Westernise as
closely as this helped to Christianise. He worked hard to open country stations for
his Mission near Calcutta and to further the causes of regional education and/

NOTES.

(54) John Wilson, address given as President of the Bombay Asiatic
(55) Ibid., pp.55-57.
(56) Ibid., pp.348-349 (Speech to the General Missionary Conference
Allahabad, 1873).
literature. If he had had his way, the Government would have given much
more attention than it did to the opening of rural schools. (58)
He was a strong believer in self-propagation and said repeatedly that
only Indians could preach effectively to Indians. (59) He never doubted
that Indians were capable of learning everything Europeans could learn and
there was no element of personal superiority in his attitude. (60)

"He left behind him an impression on the minds of our youths which
nothing will efface", wrote John Anderson after Duff's visit to the Institution
in Madras. "Their bright eyes seemed to say, as they sparkled with delight,
'This man loves the natives, especially native boys.'" (61) No one would
question that, as Duff himself said towards the end of his life, "I did and
do most fervently long for the intellectual and moral, the social and
domestic elevation of the people of India." (62) And it is quite
ridiculous to imagine that so many converts would have accepted the Christian
faith largely as a result of his personal influence if, possessing so many
other gifts, he had lacked the bond of love.

It remains true, however, that he loved Indians as fellow-creatures and
as souls to be saved better than he understood them as Indians. As William
Paton points out, he was an iconoclast in his attitude to all things Indian,
and while he did not want to see his Indian friends outwardly westernised,
his did want to see them accommodate themselves to the type of Christian
society with which he was familiar. (63) For these reasons he had a limited/

NOTES.
(58) See e.g. W. Paton, pp.101, 125, 181, 210 and passim.
(59) Ibid., p.107.
(60) Ibid., pp.99-100
(61) G. Smith, "Life of Alexander Duff", p.185.
(62) Ibid., p.369.
understanding of Hinduism and underestimated its power. And in his main
purpose, which was the destruction of the Hindu system, he failed.

His method was chosen as a matter of expediency, however, and not
of principle. And while he over-emphasised the importance of the educational
agency, he never saw it as the sole instrument of any Christian Mission. He
did not advocate that his method should be used universally, but applied it
to Indian conditions where the presence of an educated and cultured leadership
and the relation of the Indian people to the British Government and Western
civilisation made it the key to emancipation. The weakness lay not in
promoting English education or basing a system on the teaching of Scripture
but on doing so without an adequate understanding of the Indian background
or of respect for it. The lack of balance was the trouble, not the
introduction of the system itself. And it led not to disaster but simply
to comparative failure.

A too rigid Mission policy, unable to adapt itself quickly enough to
changing conditions, proved a second major weakness. A College is the
most expensive possible item of missionary equipment, far costlier even
than a hospital in terms of missionary manpower. The Scottish Colleges
became invested interests, Mission Cunarders which once launched could
neither be diverted nor adapted but must plough their way steadily along
the course originally charted for them. What had been a piece of brilliant
strategic opportunism developed into an incubus on the Mission and a puzzle
for the growing Church.

For this inflexibility Duff himself was partly responsible and it remains
a question whether, if he had been there to view the missionary situation with
fresh eyes one, two or three generations later, he would not have seen the
need to make more radical changes of policy than were in fact attempted.

But now a second question arises. Duff's policy involved in an extreme/
form an indirect method of attack, westernising tendencies and an alliance with an alien Government. Did this stem from the fact that his motives and those of his fellow-workers differed in some radical way from those of the missionaries of the New Testament? Where the builders of the early Church had worked for the glory of God or the establishment of Christ's reign on earth, had the men of this generation confused Christianity, for instance, with Western civilisation? And did they go on to compromise to a fatal extent with political or social aims which had nothing to do with a spiritual kingdom? It is a common accusation that something of this order took place among the majority of Western Missions at work in colonial dependencies. And if there were any truth in the indictment it would certainly be likely to apply to Scottish Missions, with their indirect approach and strong Government connection.

For many educated Indians today it appears clear beyond any need for argument that Christian Missions took blatant advantage of both the colonial umbrella and the carrot of Western education. "Besides vilifying Hindu society and Hindu religion", writes Sisirkumar Mitra of missionary activities in Calcutta during the 1830's, "The Christian missionaries were carrying on their proselytising campaigns, and their immediate victims were the students of the schools run by them -- this was 'foreign' and also inimical to Indian thought and culture." (64)

There has been no lack of English voices either, to express the same idea with equal force and a strong streak of irony. "The lofty aspirations of evangelical imperialism found perfect harmony with commercial interests", writes Reginald Reynolds. (65)

If this were even partly true it would be a serious charge and more than enough to explain why the history of the younger Churches of the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries differed so greatly from those of the first three centuries.

NOTES.

(64) S. Mitra, op.cit., p.83.
(65) R. Reynolds, op.cit., p.59.
of the Christian era. And it is not an accusation which can be dismissed out of hand. There is evidence enough to render it credible, and to make it necessary in the next chapter to assay a brief examination of the motives lying behind Duff’s actions and those of his Scottish colleagues. We shall have to try and determine how far they were sincere, how far they consciously but necessarily or wisely departed from New Testament patterns, and how far they may have been misled by contemporary conditions or prejudices.
CHAPTER III.

GENERAL SOURCES.


"India and India Missions", John Johnstone, Edinburgh, 1839.


C.H. Robinson, "A History of Christian Missions", (see Chapter II)


G.M. Trevalyan, "British History in the Nineteenth Century and After", (see Chapter II)


MS letters of Alexander Duff in the Scottish National Library.

Printed addresses, etc. in the Library of the Foreign Mission Secretary of the Overseas Department of the Church of Scotland.
Despite the wide range of New Testament scholarship, to the best of our knowledge no detailed study has ever been made of the motives which first impelled Christian believers to begin preaching the Good News of the Resurrection through Jerusalem and then beyond. We have an insufficient picture even of the beginnings of the very early Christian mission before Paul set out on his journeys (1). And in consequence any glimpses we have of the spiritual driving forces behind the first missionaries are more sketchy still. For what information is available, we must rely almost wholly on Paul, who as he developed in his letters an individual view of the Christian mission also revealed in many places the impulses lying nearest to his own heart. "It is of course beyond question," writes Ferdinand Hahn, "That he built (his views of the Christian mission) on the presuppositions of the primitive Church." (2) We may be allowed to assume that if the Pauline conception of mission was a natural development from the ideas of the very early Church, then his motives and aims were also similar. We shall also take the further step of presuming that the authors of the post-Pauline books — the Synoptic and Johannine writers — do not in their turn show developments which are a contradiction of earlier trends. In other words, we shall for the purposes of this excursus be treating the New Testament as a unit.

This is not to deny that there must have been a growth of understanding of their own motives in the minds of those missionaries. To take an outstanding example, Paul's declaration to the saints at Corinth, "for I determined not to know anything among you, save Jesus Christ and him crucified" (3), may fairly be regarded as a reaction to the fiasco on the Areopagus. (4)
A deliberate attempt to adopt the philosophical approach had failed and Paul felt himself driven back on the basic motif of the Christian evangelist — the message of the Cross.

Nevertheless a study of the ideas of the early missionaries concerning their own mission, while it does not reveal a uniform conception, shows the various lines of thought converging. We may therefore act on what seems to be a reasonable assumption, that the motives and aims behind this shared sense of mission, while not uniform either, still radiated from the same centre. The impulses of a Paul may be taken as representing the missionary spirit of the New Testament period, and he shared with his fellow apostles the same springs of action. This is the more reasonable because even a preliminary investigation suggests that the fundamental motives of the Christian mission vary remarkably little from age to age, in spite of the very great difference in conditions brought about by historical, social or environmental changes. When dealing with motives, we shall find the constant factors counting for a great deal more than the variable. To say so at this point is to anticipate our conclusions, however, and we must now outline the reasons for making such an assertion.

The only accurate and thoroughly documented study of missionary motives yet made is that produced by J. Van den Berg. Entitled "Constrained by Jesus' Love", it investigates the motives of European and American missionaries and their supporters during the Eighteenth Century, particularly during the period of the Great Awakening in America and the early years of the Evangelical Revival. Dr. Van den Berg provides a useful classification, and while it is not part of the purpose of his study to trace each motive to its Biblical origin, for the sake of convenience we may borrow some of his headings.

The Motive of Obedience

The Motive of Obedience, even if it cannot be called central, is of

NOTES

(5) F. Hahn, op.cit., P.164.
great importance and was the first to appear on the surface. The mission to
preach and baptise was given to the disciples as a dominical command — "Go
ye therefore and teach all nations, baptising them in the name of the Father, and
of the Son, and of the Holy Ghost: teaching them to observe all things
whatsoever I have commanded you: and lo, I am with you alway, even unto the
end of the world."(6) Alongside this we may set the assurance given to the
Apostles that on receiving the power of the Holy Ghost they would be witnesses
to Christ, "both in Jerusalem, and in all Judea, and in Samaria and unto the
uttermost part of the earth."(7)

The element of obligation in obedience to a specific command continued
to have its place in the minds of the New Testament missionaries. So Paul,
justifying himself before Agrippa and describing his conversion on the road to
Damascus, which he also defined as his call to be a minister and witness, declared
that he was not disobedient to the heavenly vision, but began to show people in
Jerusalem, then Judaea, and then to the Gentiles, the message of repentance and
turning to God.(8) Luke records Paul's vision at Troas and their immediate
response, the reason being, on this occasion "that the Lord had called for us to
preach the Gospel unto them."(9) This call to obedience, while it could not be
separated completely from the free response of love, could at the same time,
due to its associations with Old Testament teaching and the calls of the prophets,
be felt as a sense of overwhelming compulsion. When Isaiah received his vision
in the temple he felt driven rather than led, and Paul also could cry, "Woe unto
me if I preach not the Gospel."(10) The compulsion -- and here again the
prophetic associations are very strong -- is accompanied by a sense of personal/

NOTES

(7) Acts 1, 8. The question of the actual date and authenticity of these
sayings would be a matter of importance if we were trying to trace the
development of missionary motives during New Testament times. But here
it is sufficient to accept what need not be questioned, that if the wording
is of later date it is nevertheless an interpretation of a command which the
Apostles believed they had received from the risen Christ.
(9) Acts 16, 9-10.
(10) 1 Cor. 9, 16: Ct. Isaiah 6.
/ unworthiness on the part of the person called. "I am the least of those sent", said Paul again. "That am not meet to be called an apostle (or missionary) because I persecuted the Church of God."(11)

An almost identical motive of obedience is immediately recognisable among the European missionaries of Carey's day and Duff's. "Go ye unto all nations" was indeed the key text used by the missionary-minded as their authority for stirring up the consciences of their less enthusiastic brethren. The subject for discussion daringly suggested by young William Carey at a meeting of Baptist ministers in Northampton in 1786 was "whether the command given to the apostles, to teach all nations, was not obligatory on all succeeding ministers to the end of the world, seeing that the accompanying promise was of equal extent."(12)

One result of this unsuccessful attempt to rouse interest in the missionary cause was Carey's famous pamphlet, "An Enquiry into the Obligations of Christians to Use Means for the Conversion of the Heathens", published in 1792. This treatise, read eagerly on both sides of the border, reveals the important place taken by the idea of Christian obedience in the minds of the leaders of the missionary movement in Britain.

The missionary obligation had, as we observed two chapters earlier, slipped into the background of Christian thinking, but it had never disappeared. When it came to thrashing the matter out in religious meetings or church assemblies, debate centred round interpretations of this command and its implications and not in plain assertion or denial. Dr. John Erskine of Greyfriars, who kept up a personal correspondence with William Carey (13), put virtually the same arguments concerning Christian duty before the Assembly of 1896 as the founders of the Baptist Missionary Society had been using./

NOTES
(11) 1 Cor. 15, 9: Ct. Isaiah 6, 5, "I am a man of unclean lips."
(12) Quoted George Smith, "Life of William Carey", p.31
(13) Ibid., p.24
We may say confidently with Van den Berg that in evangelical circles the missionary command was universally recognized and obedience to it seen as "a duty highly incumbent on every Christian."(14) It was never taken in isolation, however, nor seen in the light of a cold obligation, but "integrated with the motives of love and expectation."(15) Carey took as his motto the words, "Expect great things from God, attempt great things for God."

In Scottish missionary circles, the sense of obligation was equally noticeable. The Scottish Confession of 1560 had been prefaced by the text and motto, "And this glaid tydings of the Kyngdom sall he prechit through the baill world for a witness unto all natious, and then sall the end cum."(16) Although strict Calvinism could interpret the injunction as binding on the Apostles alone, the text could at any time be produced as a cudgel for the lax and lukewarm among their present-day descendants. Meanwhile the warmth engendered by the new evangelical spirit enriched the obedience of the early Scottish missionaries with the graces of charity and joy.

When Alexander Duff stated that he was prepared to reply to the Committee's request in the words of Isaiah's call, "Here am I, send me", he was clearly accepting the moral imperative of a divine command.(17) When John Wilson, in a farewell address to students, told them that "the work of preaching the Gospel in foreign lands is attended with trials and dangers and sacrifices. But have we forgotten where is now the promise of Christ, Lo I am with you alway, even to the end of the world", he was implying that the rewards of Christian obedience were well worth the sacrifices.(18) In the case of Robert Hesbit, also of Bombay, we find a note common in evangelical Calvinism, that hypersensitive sense of personal unworthiness which can become introspective and unhealthy. There was much duty but little joy in his decision to be a missionary. "The thing is as clear as the light of day", he wrote, "The emotions and suffering of a missionary cannot make me more uncomfortable than I am: nay, I trust that God will so bless/
Nesbit spoke of doing God's will for fear of the consequences of acting otherwise. "My purpose of becoming a missionary to the heathen originated from a desire to do what I conceived to be the will of God: from a fear of His frown should I refuse to go forth as his ambassador to the most distant regions of the globe."(20)

Nesbit's attitude, the result of a too self-analytical and morbid temperament, was not typical. Yet duty, the stern daughter of the voice of God, was always well to the fore among the Victorian virtues, and as the century grew older the call to serve God on the Mission field seldom failed to be presented without the inclusion of this element — as a response to God's will in Jesus Christ. The two texts from Matthew's Gospel were those most frequently cited. "The command of Divine obligation is not, 'Go to the people of Scotland or England', but 'Go into all the world and preach the Gospel to every creature', wrote Duff in 1839(21) and nearly thirty years later we find John Wilson as Moderator of the Free Church Assembly quoting once more the introduction to the Scottish Confession — "And this glad tidings —"(22). It would not be too much to say that certainly among the first generation of Scottish missionaries the notion of obedience to a divine command always lay somewhere at the back of their decision to serve overseas and it remained with them in their work.

The Theocentric Motive

A second motive force in the minds of the Apostles was the Theocentric Motive, the desire to declare and promote the glory of God. In Paul's letters, the whole plan of salvation in Christ is seen as the means by which God's glory will be revealed to man and acknowledged and praised by man. It is to the praise

NOTES

(20) Ibid, p.36
(21) A. Duff, "Missions the Chief End of the Christian Church", p.27
(22) G. Smith, "Life of John Wilson", p.341
or God's glory that we have redemption and forgiveness of sins (23), our present rejoicing is in the hope of the glory of God (24), and Christ is received in us to the glory of God. (25) The salvation of mankind is itself to be seen as part of the foreordained plan of which Christ and His work is the culmination, and so Christian witness and Christian teaching are minister to it. We are Christ's to the Glory of God (26) and it is to His glory that we confess Him Lord: our thanksgiving and even our eating and drinking of the Sacrament belong to that glory. (27)

This motive for preaching the Gospel is in fact so all-pervasive that it becomes unnecessary for it always to be defined or directly acknowledged. Of God are all things (28), so that even in humble and sinful men God is making known the riches of His glory. (29) Yet Christ Himself is the Lord of glory (30), and the consummation of human history itself is that every tongue should confess Him Lord to the glory of God the Father. (31)

With the theocentric motive which enabled the apostles to see in the preaching of the Gospel the fulfilment of God's glorious purpose there went hand in hand an eschatological note. The time was short (32), the day of the Lord was at hand (33) and Christ's messengers must redeem the time (34). They must do their Lord's work, for the night was far spent and the day at hand. (35)

Another idea can also be taken in here. The realm of God's glory is the same as that of His Kingdom and His power (36). To be a Christian is to

NOTES

(23) Eph. 1, 6: Ct. Phil. 1, 11.
(24) Rom. 5, 2.
(25) Rom. 15, 7.
(26) Phil. 1, 11.
(27) 2 Cor. 4, 15 and 1 Cor. 10, 31.
(28) Rom. 11, 36, with other passages.
(29) Rom. 9, 23: Ct. 1. Cor. 11, 7.
(30) James 2, 1.
(31) Phil. 2, 11.
(32) 1. Cor. 7, 25.
(33) 1 Thess. 5, 2.
(34) Eph. 5, 16.
(35) Rom. 12, 12.
(36) Matt. 6, 13.
be called into his Kingdom (37), to testify to the Kingdom (38), and to stand for judgment at the appearing of the Kingdom (39). Christians inherit the Kingdom of God (40) and are also workers towards it (41).

These ideas may all be found among the expressed motives of the early English and Scottish missionaries. "Surely" pleaded Carey at the end of his Enquiry "it is worth while to lay ourselves out with all our might in promoting the cause and Kingdom of Christ." (42) But as Van den Berg points out, what he defines as the theocentric and soteriological motives were so closely integrated as to represent the opposite sides of one coin. (43) This was very noticeable in Calvinist Scotland, where the glory of God and the salvation of souls were inseparably linked. The answer to the opening question of the Shorter Catechism left no doubt concerning man's chief end, and that it was to glorify God and enjoy Him forever. And zeal for the glory of God and the salvation of men was regarded as the primary inducement behind a genuine call to the Christian ministry. (44)

So Alexander Duff wrote to Dr. Inglis about his decision to answer the Church of Scotland's request, "In these circumstances nought remained but to enquire whether I do consciously feel myself possessed of the qualifications/

---

NOTES

(37) 1 Thess. 2, 12.
(38) Act 28, 23.
(39) 2 Tim. 4, 1.
(40) 1 Cor. 6, 9 etc.
(41) Col. 4, 11.
(43) J. Van den Berg, op.cit., p.156.
(44) Presbyteries of the Church of Scotland were enjoined to ask each ordinand, among other questions, "If he had been led, in his designing the work of the ministry, by a single and sincere love to God, and aim at His glory in the Gospel of His Son, and not by filthy lucre and the motives of worldly gain, as the great inducement moving him to the ministerial work." But while ordinands were also required to pledge themselves to the pastoral tasks of "praying, preaching, catechising and discipline", there is no explicit mention of "saving souls", which is apparently not one of the duties of a parish minister. "Zeal for the glory of God, love to the Lord Jesus Christ and a desire for the salvation of men" is a later form of the same question and reflects a more evangelical outlook.

necessary to constitute the true missionary character and whether I can accept
the offered appointment unactuated by any but the proper motives, a desire to
promote God’s glory and the welfare of immortal souls." (45) His letters and
addresses were frequently to touch on the same note. “Surely it would be to
believe all our profession of the intrinsic value of immortal souls” he told the
Assembly in 1865, “If we did not sincerely and honestly believe — that such
additions to the Church militant on earth and ultimately to the Church
triumphant in heaven, were more than worth all the money and pains expended
on them.” (46)

The theme is equally characteristic of Duff’s brother missionaries.

“In sincerity and humility of soul, let us say “Thy vows are upon us, O God; we
will render praises unto thee”, wrote John Wilson. (47)

“The knowledge of the Lord Jesus Christ be spread. I will go to India
and do what I can” said John Anderson to his friend Braidwood before sailing for
Madras. (48)

The best part of a generation later John Hunter, founder of the Church of
Scotland’s Mission in the Punjab, wrote from Sialkot a few days before his death,
“May his glory be advanced by our sojourn here — His glory in the regions beyond.” (49)

Not long afterwards William Martin of Rajputana was describing “the one
great object of the missionary, the spread of Christ’s Kingdom.” (50)

And later still the Free Church of Scotland’s report celebrating the Jubilee
of the founding of the Calcutta Mission declared “The one great end for which the
Church of God exists, is the glory of God and the salvation of the human race.” (51)

Numerous similar examples could be unearthed by anyone interested. It
would indeed be strange if desire for the glory of God did not have a strong hold/

NOTES
(46) A. Duff, Address to the General Assembly, 26 May, 1865, printed for the
F.M.C., p.3. (F.M.C. Secretary’s Library)
(48) John Braidwood, “True Yoke Fellows of the Mission Field”, p.1
(49) John W. Youngson, “Forty Years of the Punjab Mission”, p.87
(50) W.F. Martin, “Martin Memorials”, p.184
(51) Free Church Report, 1879, p.18
on the descendants of the Covenanters.

Where the eschatological motive entered in, however, the emphasis differed from that of the First Century. A sense of urgency was imparted not by the expectation of an imminent Second Coming but through the conviction that Christians had long been neglecting their God-appointed task. The completion of that task was seen as the establishment of God’s Kingdom rather than the announcement of the Day of the Lord. Evangelical Christianity differed in that age from our own in that it conceived the judgment of God in personal rather than cosmic terms. It was a terrible thing for souls to appear before the Throne who, not having heard the Gospel preached, could not claim the mercy of a loving Redeemer. It was an obligation laid on Christians to call such souls from death into life, to offer them the cup of salvation while they might receive it. “We call upon you by that wondrous scheme for the redemption of a ruined world, which from all eternity engaged the counsels of the Godhead, to compassionate the poor dying perishing heathen — We call upon you by the miseries of earth, the torments of hell, the joys of heaven —“ pleaded Alexander Duff.(52)

So far as God’s wider purpose was concerned, the full revelation of God’s glory would be the coming of His Kingdom. While the bringing in of that Kingdom was part of the evangelical appeal, it was commoner to think of working “for Christ” or “for Christ’s cause” than “for His Kingdom.” But as the Victorian age developed, with its ebullient optimism and belief in progress, the vision of the coming of the Kingdom was given a more definite shape. Nearer and nearer was coming the time when the earth should be filled with the glory of God as the waters covered the sea.(53)

This vision, as it seemed to be taking practical form, often merged with humanitarian efforts to redeem and transform social systems, but always with the underlying belief that by such means God was working His purpose out, and these were the signs that His harvest was ripening. It was of spiritual miseries that/

NOTES

(52) A. Duff, “India and India Missions”, p.255.
(53) Arthur Ainger’s hymn was composed in 1896 and appeared in the “Church Missionary Hymnbook” of 1899.
Duff was thinking when he wrote, "Let (the Church) under a deep and sympathising sense of the woes and miseries of universal humanity, now hold fast bound, as Satan's empire, by the iron chains of malevolent demons — pray the Father that his Kingdom may come —"(54). But as schools, hospitals and orphanages were built up, as churches grew and missionaries found their lives becoming intimately bound up with the everyday trials and sorrows of their people, the relief of pain, sickness, poverty, oppression and the evils brought in their train came to rank as equally important signs of the Kingdom. Ideas such as these were uppermost in the mind of Tom Dobson of Jalna when he wrote in the 1920's, "Not in our day will we see a perfect Church here, no more than Paul, poor chap, did in his. But we can go on as well as we can in the effort to clear up some of the mess — It is one of the finest things in the world to see "the knowledge of the love of God" actually at work in uplifting poor, depressed and despised people. Flowers of thy heart, O God, are they."(55)

The Motive of Love and Compassion.

This brings us by a natural progression to the feeling of love and compassion for the lost and miserable which was a mark of the New Testament mission. The coming of the Messiah was the fulfilment of the promise of the preaching of the Gospel to the poor, the healing of the broken-hearted, deliverance to the captives and sight to the blind.(56) Jesus was the healer of men's ills and the comforter of their sorrows and His apostles had in their turn received power to heal and looked on help and healing as an integral part of their mission. "Come over and help us", was the form of the appeal which Paul heard in his dream at Troas.(57) Peter cured the lame man at the Gate Beautiful (58), Paul performed acts of healing at Lystra, Troas and Cyprus(59) and there is/

NOTES

(54) A. Duff, Address to the General Assembly, 26th May, 1865, p.13. See Note 46.
(57) Acts 16, 19.
(59) Acts 14, 6-10: 20, 10-20: 20, 8.
abundant evidence in the Epistles that if the Gospel is primarily a message for the remission of sins, it is also for the healing of the sick (60), the comforting of the sorrowful (61), the freeing of the prisoners (62) and the strengthening of the oppressed (63).

This motive can be seen in operation once more at the beginnings of the modern missionary movement, but it ran closer to the surface among English Methodists and Baptists, for instance, than among the more reserved Lowland Scots. William Carey, speaking of those who had "no Bible, no written language -- no ministers, no good civil government", went on to cry, "Pity therefore humanity, and much more Christianity, call loudly for every exertion to introduce the Gospel among them." (64)

This "love of souls" was unquestionably present in Scottish hearts also, but generally it takes a little more digging to unearth. It was often better illustrated by the deeds of missionaries than by their words, especially when feelings were aroused by direct experience of the human misery to be seen in the course of an ordinary day's work. "Do not send men of compassion here, for you will soon break their 'hearts', cried Duff. "Do send men of compassion here, where millions perish for lack of knowledge." (65)

Whereas in Africa it was the horrors of the slave trade and the cruelties of many primitive tribal rites that could move a man like Hope Waddell to describe reaching Old Calabar as arriving "among scenes to the eye the loveliest, to the heart the blackest that can be imagined" (66) in India it was the evils which missionaries invariably attributed to the baneful influence of Hinduism that brought about pity and revulsion. It was their hope to replace "the self-inflicted tortures, the frightful suffering and wretchedness, the cravings of famine and the scourges of pestilence" with "the gentle consolations, the kindness/
and the serenity of the Christian faith.(67)

Alexander Duff himself, with his Celtic strain, was more ready than most of his fellow-countrymen to express such sentiments. But we should also take into account such things as the action of John Wilson, who added two years of medical training to his divinity course — this a good forty years before the medical missionary became a popular figure.(68) He was to be the first of a long line of doctors who made their mark on the development of Scottish Mission work. A typical example of these was Dr. James Shepherd of Udaipur, whose tough Aberdonian shell could be split by blind, sick rage at the sight of a maltreated animal. "His whole instinct was towards kindliness. He could not bear to see suffering in man, woman or child" wrote his biographer.(69)

As the humanitarian movement gathered strength in Britain and theology itself began to flirt with humanism, and as the number of women missionaries increased, simple pity for human suffering loomed larger among missionary motives. Love for former pupils, former patients and the children reared in Mission orphanages kept men and women contentedly at work which was in other respects unfruitful. Yet the motive was always there. It was a rare occasion when a man like Tom Dobson actually suffered death at the hands of a youth he trusted as a friend. But many died or mourned the deaths of wives and children, still finding in their hearts a compassion which made them wish to work on. "In the native Church there are many imperfections" said Gavin Martin, "But there is still enough of love and activity to convince us that Christ is in our midst."(70)

The Motive of Christ's Love.

The love of one's brother cannot be easily separated, in the Christian mind, from the love of God in Jesus Christ. The Apostles' own strongest spring/
of action was a profound and complex motive in which obedience, desire for the glory of God and compassion for men were subordinate to and part of an overwhelming sense of God's love towards them, directed through Jesus Christ. The response to this love, although it did not exclude a sense of indebtedness, was not of debt but of grace. (71)

"The love of Christ constrains us", said Paul of himself and his fellow-ambassadors for Christ. (72) Here a profound obligation to share with other men the Good News of God is almost overshadowed by his infinite debt to Christ. The awe and wonder of it are mingled with joy, and from this springs his compassion for human souls. For this love involved a self-renunciation to which there can be no parallel. He who was in the form of God had emptied himself by taking on Him the form of a slave, and being found in fashion as a man He had humbled Himself, becoming obedient even as far as death on the Cross. (73) The human experience of Jesus, with all its suffering and shame, was for Paul the unique proof of God's love. (74) The only adequate response which could be made to it was self-forgetting service laid as a gift at Christ's own feet. It was for this that all Paul's talents and achievements were counted but loss for the knowledge of Christ. (75) It was for this that his sufferings and frustrations were reckoned as a glory not to him but to God. (76) Paul himself is more than a conqueror through Him that loved him. (77) So while to live — and to carry on with the work of a missionary — is Christ, to die is gain (78), for death will not separate Him from the love of God which is in Christ Jesus his Lord. (79)

This motive, complex as it sounds, is the basic urge behind the Christian/

NOTES

(72) 2 Cor. 5, 14 and 20.
(73) Phil. 2, 6 ff.
(74) Rom. 8, 5. For a description of the central motive which sent Paul out as an apostle to the Gentiles, see T.R. Glover, "The Missionary Motive", J.R.M., April, 1934, pp. 85-95.
(75) Phil. 3, 8.
(76) 2 Cor. 12, 10-11.
(77) Rom. 8, 37.
(78) Phil. 1, 21.
(79) Rom. 8, 39.
mission and it stands independent of time or circumstance. To preach the Gospel was for the missionaries of the modern era also to proclaim the love of a Saviour in which the demands of duty and the joy of an unconditional response met together.

"But why should we appeal to duty and responsibility alone?" asked Duff. "Why not the exquisite enjoyment experienced by those who know the privilege of being fellow workers with the great God Himself? — We appeal to all who have basked in the sunshine of the Redeemer's love — that he might see the travail of His Soul and be satisfied. — It is a joy rich as heaven, lasting as eternity."(80)

Flowery though his wording may be, Duff is describing the stimulus which took him out to India. It is a force identical with that behind the simple prayer written by John Wilson in the privacy of his journal before he set sail for the first time. "Do thou prepare me for preaching Christ with love and power, do thou make me effective in saving many souls for Christ."(81) He could repeat with equal sincerity before his last voyage to India, from which he did not return, "I go bound in the Spirit to India to declare the Gospel message of His love."(82)

Of this we can be sure, that Christian missionaries of any and every age will be agreed that the constraint of Jesus' love is the one essential motive which must lie behind all true evangelism and all true church-building. "All other motives", says Dorothy Stewart, writing about the missionary motive today, "Are secondary in the sense that they are not the fundamental urge and dynamic which impel the action and which produce the power."(83)

NOTES

(80) Origin untraced.
(82) Ibid., p.343.

Other articles which may usefully be consulted here are:
The few examples given above, selected from a very much larger mass of evidence available, should be enough at least to establish our main point: that whatever the full range of motives behind the surge of missionary activity in the Nineteenth Century, the dominant and central motives were identical with those which moved the Apostles. The Nineteenth Century, as Dr. Warren has pointed out, was not a self-critical or introspective age. (84) George Bennet put this more strongly when he said, "Imperialism and self-confidence go together and the nineteenth century Englishman was convinced of his own righteousness and ability." (85)

There is truth in both statements, although "rightness" rather than "righteousness" would be a more accurate word to describe the attitude of most missionaries. They did not think of themselves as righteous but of their cause as right.

They would have been even more astonished than indignant at the kind of judgment delivered by a historian like Professor Knorr, that the missionary movement of the 1780's to the 1850's was "in essence — an aggressive cultural imperialism, propaganda for the spread of European ideas and ideals over the face of the globe." (86)

This was certainly not how those missionaries saw their own work and in fact Knorr himself goes on to remark that in England (for which we may read 'Britain') "the missionary movement — was totally dissociated from the Government." (87) We may remember that William Carey and later the American Congregational missionaries who diverted their work to Bombay were refused admission by the civil power in Calcutta. If missionary imperialism existed, in other words, it was cultural and not political. But even here exception must be taken to the suggestion that the movement was "in essence — imperialistic."

Its essence, as we have attempted to show, was evangelistic. The chief/

NOTES

(84) Max Warren, op.cit., p.43
(85) George Bennet, op.cit., p.15
(86) Klaus Knorr, op.cit., p.381
(87) Ibid.
inducements by which missionaries were consciously driven were obedience to Christ's command, desire for the glory of God and the salvation of souls, compassion for the lost or suffering and, pervading all, the constraining love of Christ. These all sprang from their evangelical faith which was in turn rooted in and fed by Scriptural inspiration and examples. Such motives were in every fundamental respect identical with those of the Apostles. Yet the fruits of the labours undertaken by modern missionaries were to result in a form of Church and Christian community which differed widely from New Testament models. If this was a surprise and disappointment to them, it should be less astonishing to us when we realise that in no age since the first Christian century have the results of that century been with any exactness reproduced.

The reasons must be found in the changes and developments which had taken place in human, European and ecclesiastical history during the intervening centuries. There had been the christianising of Europe and the founding of the Corpus Christianum. Then along with the renaissance of classical culture and the Reformation of the Church on what was held to be Biblical models there had come the invention of printing, the growth of European literacy, and the expansion of the European nations in exploration and trade as imperial powers. There were the far-reaching advances made by Western countries in technical knowledge and skill and in material standards of living. And ecclesiastically there were church traditions now accepted as normative and under divine sanction through the sheer weight of age and custom; the impact of various forms of alliance between Church and State; and above all the rule of a way of life which was Western in form, yet could be and was widely regarded as "Christian Civilisation."

Out of the conditions produced by the movements of those seventeen hundred years we may select three factors in particular which rendered the approach of the Nineteenth Century missionaries very different from that of their predecessors.
The Factor of a More Advanced Culture.

The most important difference derived from the fact that Western missionaries went out as heirs and representatives of a culture which, in some elements at least, was more highly developed than the culture of the nation to which they travelled. On a continent such as Africa, the gap between European civilisation and the tribal cultures encountered by European explorers, missionaries, settlers and administrators appeared too wide for any possible form of rapprochement. And although British administrators in Africa often took great pains to use and preserve local customs, exercising rule by indirect methods, those primitive cultures were in fact able to offer little resistance to the bewildering changes brought about by the influx of Western ideas, products and ways of life.\(^{(88)}\)

The ancient civilisations of the East offered a far greater resistance, yet there also Western impacts had the effect of turning their established world upside down.

The missionaries of the New Testament times were also accused of turning the world upside down \(^{(89)}\), and considered themselves to be the bearers of a message and way of life superior to anything the world of their day could offer. But their superiority lay entirely in the realm of the spirit. Their Gospel was one of abundant life and a more excellent way.\(^{(90)}\) The Jewish and pagan worlds alike lay under condemnation and God had sent them out to turn men from darkness to light.\(^{(91)}\) They went out as beggars to the rich, declaring that their wisdom was not of man but of God.\(^{(92)}\) In terms not only of numbers but also of education, culture, social standing, influence and prestige, no one could fail to see the poverty of their equipment. It was by the foolishness of preaching and the base things of this world that God in Christ was going to overcome the powers of this world.\(^{(93)}\) The missionaries themselves were, with/
rare exceptions, humble men and women so obscure that the Church itself forgot their names and sometimes never knew them.

The situation of their successors of the modern era was vastly different. Here were evangelists who, besides being supported by and representative of many centuries of Christian tradition, were heirs of a civilisation more advanced in terms of man's ability to control his environment than anything the world had yet seen. Its superiority appeared self-evident both to those who brought it and those to whom it was carried.

It was a civilisation superior in wealth. The East had its rajahs with their coffers full of jewels, its noblemen, its landowners and its well-endowed temples. It was the traditional home of fabulous riches and a poet might well speak of Western traders as keeping "the gorgeous East in fee."(94) But the majority of its people were desperately poor. By contrast, the clothes, houses and manner of living of the poorest European pointed to him as a member of a more fortunate race.

They appeared equally superior in power. While few in number and in fierce competition with one another, they showed on the fields of Plassey and Wandewash and in countless minor skirmishes the superiority of their fire-power and military discipline against huge armies of half-trained local levies.

They displayed similar advantages in venturesomeness and initiative. Indian traders had been crossing the Eastern seas since at least King Solomon's time (95) but the ships of these modern adventurers roamed the world and they were/

---

NOTES

94) W. Wordsworth, "On the Extinction of the Venetian Republic". The wealth of the mysterious East had of course been a legend since Marco Polo's day. The great voyagers of the Fifteenth Century were searching for a route to the Indies. And Milton was writing in "Paradise Lost" two centuries before Wordsworth about,

"the wealth of Ormus and of Ind.
Or where the gorgeous East with richest hand
Showers on her kings barbaric pearl and gold."

(Book 2, 11 2 - 4)

95) The "ivory, apes and peacocks" of 1 Kg. 10, 22 are, in the original Hebrew, direct transliterations of Tamil words, and would be purchased at Middle Eastern ports from Tamil merchants.
undisputedly the new masters of trade. They made treaties, demanded rights, penetrated further into new territory, exhibited a fearsome aggressiveness and ability to strike bargains and followed up their successes with unswerving determination.

Above all, they were clearly superior in knowledge. They were not only literate men moving among peoples still largely illiterate. They brought with them a technical mastery which was quite new and startling, and this more than anything else presented itself as the key to their successes. Their wealth, their military prowess, their commercial enterprise and their gifts for government and diplomacy could all be traced eventually to the superiority of the new wisdom from the West. In comparison, the famed wisdom of the East appeared tawdry and impractical, unproductive and effete.

It was natural that men of such a race should be addressed by men of the deeper-coloured races, as Sahib, Tuan or Durai. Their lordliness was everywhere apparent. The missionary too was a lord, the evidence being that he looked, lived and talked like one. He was no Paul coming empty-handed, but appeared rather in the guise of an emissary from some powerful government, bearing with him promises of reward and advancement, or at least the key to them. Whatever the spiritual content of his message — and his hearers in India came from the most religiously-inclined nation on earth — it was accompanied by a realisation of his capacity to open many doors.

The missionary himself saw those to whom he preached as not only sinful idol-worshippers whose eyes must be opened to the truth, but men who were also ignorant, poverty-stricken, backward, diseased and oppressed. For such, Christianity meant liberation from their chains.

Missionaries spoke with authority of a world which stood for stable and honest government, improvement in men’s standard of living, educational enlightenment, the cure and prevention of disease, release from economic slavery and compassion for the weak, the outcaste and the unfortunate. They

NOTES

96) Literally “lord”.

96

111
spoke of a God who cared that men should possess such blessings. They taught
the ideals of faith, hope and charity, yet inseparably bound up with these stood
other virtues of cleanliness, honesty, self-respect, sobriety, hard word and
literacy. They taught that the practice and application of such virtues would
add to godly living the benefits of a fuller, free-er and happier life. With
their institutions and welfare schemes, they helped men to develop their gifts
and improve their material standards.

Christian schools and colleges liberated men from the shackles of super¬
stition and provided them with a means of obtaining freedom from the restrictions
of caste by qualifying for better-paid work. They also opened a path along which
women might emerge from frustrating seclusion. Laws promulgated by men of
Christian conscience suppressed age-long practices which under the sanction of
religion had led to much misery. Western hygiene and medicine in Christian
hands demonstrated their power to halt the scourges of disease. Christian money
gave employment. And sometimes Christian skill working through agriculture or
industry raised the material lot of a community.

The spiritual benefits went hand in hand with the material ones. And
if missionaries found it difficult to distinguish the first from the second,
this was a feat quite impossible for most converts to achieve. At the highest
level, acceptance of the Christian faith meant acceptance also of the liberating
knowledge and skills with which it was associated. It meant putting away the
idols and turning to the worship of a righteous and loving God. It also meant
learning to read and sending one's children to school, being adopted into a new
community and becoming familiar with a new vocabulary and different customs.
At the lowest level, it could mean the emergence of "rice-Christians", a category
which would have been quite incomprehensible to earlier ages. Christianity had
become a religion which offered material benefits.

This situation, in which it became impossible ever to separate Christianity
entirely from the culture of the West, is not one to be condemned but rather
observed and understood. It could hardly have happened otherwise and
missionaries did not bring it about but were caught up in forces beyond their/
Christianity did come to India from the West and Western culture, in spite of its serious flaws and defects, was in many respects superior. "The blessings of Christian civilisation" were for those missionaries both their gift and their opportunity. "Are we so little aware of the vast superiority even of European laws and institutions, and far more of British laws and institutions, over those of Asia", asked William Wilberforce, "As not to be prepared to predict with confidence that the Indian community which should have exchanged its dark and bloody superstitions for the genial influence of Christian light and truth, would have experienced — an increase of civil order and security; of social pleasure and domestic comforts —?"(97)

Missionaries wished to diffuse what they considered to be the highest riches of their own inheritance and would have thought themselves ungrateful to God in not being ready to share them and blind not to use them. Not being fools, they were aware that God's gifts must not be confused with those of mammon. They knew the dangers of offering men a Gospel with one hand and promises of education, uplift, healing and material support with the other. They took care to guard against this danger. They were less wide awake to the peril of churches and Christian communities becoming disassociated from their natural environment. They could not foresee the extent to which a religious nation would turn to Western learning for its own sake and even more for the advantages it offered, while spurning the faith in which so much of that learning had living roots. And while they often perceived very clearly the disruptive and corrupting effects which uncontrolled westernisation and modernisation could bring in their wake, they could not foresee the actual disintegration of the Western culture in which they themselves had been cradled./

NOTES

The alien nature of the Christian religion, underlined by its association with a foreign culture, was further emphasised and perpetuated by the fact that its heralds were themselves aliens and never ceased to remain so. They were not, like the apostolic missionaries, simply “strangers and pilgrims on the earth” but strangers to the land and the people among whom their working lives were spent.

The Apostles had no established base from which to work, although Jerusalem might be looked on as their mother church. They were dependent, under God, on their own resources, and after that on the hospitality of the Christian community among whom they were residing. The modern missionaries, on the other hand, had behind them the pledged support of powerful Churches or Societies founded by the members of these churches. However half-hearted that support might be at times, it possessed great potential and helped to foster an atmosphere of security and permanence. Missionaries might feel isolated, ignored, over-worked and unappreciated, yet always they knew that in fact there lay behind them responsible bodies with great resources.(98) They invariably worked in conditions of greater security than did the Mission’s national employees. And quite a large part of their attention, undertaken through correspondence or by personal appeals when home of furlough, was given to harnessing home forces to provide man-power, money and prayer.

The result was that the development of missionary work and of the young churches raised by Western missionaries remained closely tied to the life and traditions of churches and Christians many thousands of miles distant. It was seldom that the direction of missionary policy was radically altered by a need to/

NOTES

93) The desire for security sounds a most unlikely missionary motive. Yet it has been spoken of as one to be guarded against. “We need eternal vigilance against three motivations”, writes Tracey Jones. “The first is escape—the second is security for ourselves—”. The Missionary Vocation”, I.R.M., October, 1951, p.403.
accede to the wishes of the home authority or its supporters. We shall in fact come across no major instance of this happening in our study. But the extension of evangelistic efforts and the growth of churches often depended on the power of those at the home base to respond to appeals for more missionaries or more money. Opportunities were missed and fertile fields remained unsown because the authority and initiative did not lie with those on the spot.

This factor had also a major part in determining the form of church that was founded. The aim of the missionaries was primarily to spread the Gospel and extend the bounds of Christ's Kingdom, the founding of churches being an inevitable corollary. The non-sectarian nature of some of the early Missionary Societies, notably the London Missionary Society and the two Scottish Societies, showed that denominational labels mattered less to the missionary-minded than to most of their fellow churchmen. The important thing was evangelistic fervour.

Yet when new churches came to be formed, they invariably took on the colour and pattern imposed in all good faith by their missionary founders. The London Missionary Society itself, though inter-denominational, was supported largely by Congregationalists, a form of church order which was faithfully reproduced in the daughter churches. In this way denominational differences were perpetuated, not from any burning sense of conviction but from lack of any master model to copy from and out of loyalty to the church at home. Presbyterian missionaries from Scotland founded churches which were Presbyterian in form and doctrine and in this followed the practice of their colleagues of other denominations.

It was still another significant result of this factor that while leaders of the apostolic Church were fellow-citizens as well as fellow-saints, Western missionaries were foreigners from another homeland, speaking a different language and unavoidably advertising their foreignness by the colour of their skin.

Paul and Silas were indeed once mistaken for gods by the superstitious inhabitants of Lystra. And European missionaries were often greeted by /

NOTES

isolated tribal people with equal signs of fear and awe. "In many villages—the sahib is still an object of terror", wrote Dr. J.M. Macphail from Santalia, "The women flying, children screaming and dogs barking—".(100) Paul might also take great pains, when introducing Christian workers to sister congregations, to underline their common heritage by speaking of them as brothers or sisters in Christ.(101) The fact remains that, once acquaintance had been made, he and his fellow-evangelists were recognised and accepted as men who shared the same background as their hearers. To the Jews, Paul spoke as a Jew, to the Gentiles as a citizen of Rome and one tolerably familiar with the teachings of Graeco-Roman folklore and philosophy.(102) There were many sub-cultures within the Empire held together by Rome. But they were linked by a multitude of bridges and even Judaism, the most suspicious and separatist of them all, had by means of its Diaspora penetrated and been penetrated by non-Jewish culture. At a more personal level, when Paul visited a church he shared the hospitality of local homes and worked at a familiar trade. And when he was absent from them, his fellow-Christians knew that he would be pursuing the same way of life somewhere else among similar surroundings. In short, once he ceased to be a stranger he also stopped being a foreigner.

The modern missionary had a far wider gulf to overcome. The most significant thing about him in this respect was the fact that, with very rare exceptions, "home" for him was neither heaven nor the place where a life-time of dedicated service might be given but the country of his birth, of which he was still a loyal citizen. There were a few missionaries, like the American George Bowen of Bombay (103), who adopted native dress and customs, going so /
far as to live among the poorest of the city. But this was an exception notable enough to underline the prevalence of the rule. There were many missionaries who so immersed themselves in their work that they practically lost contact with Europe and their fellow-Europeans. Many adopted India as the home-land of their hearts. They retired there or died still in harness. But for the great majority of Protestant missionaries the harshness of the climate, the education of children, the modest pleasures of furlough and a genuine human need to keep contact with their countrymen and the culture in which they were reared rendered this an impossibility. The very real difficulties of living in native fashion while retaining accustomed standards of health and sanity added to the importance of home ties and prevented them from renouncing the old home-land, even when they went a long way towards adopting the new. And most significantly, in the realm of ordinary social relations there was little natural mixing between missionaries and converts, while inter-marriage was almost unknown.

It might be thought that the mere passing of time would smooth out differences and that through friendship, familiarity and the gradual interaction of cultures the gap between European missionaries and Indian Christians would gradually lessen. But in fact for more than a century the trend was rather in the opposite direction, and if the gulf did not widen, at least the consciousness of its existence grew stronger and became the cause of tensions.

"By the Nineteenth Century the West had progressed while the East stood still, so that there was a great gap between them," wrote Donald McCayran in "The Bridges of God". "The gap widened with the passage of the years, for the progress of the West continued to be greater than that of the East. While it is true that the missionaries tried to identify themselves with the people, they were never able to rid themselves of the inevitable separateness which the great progress of their home-lands had imposed on them.

"This gulf became very clear in the living arrangements which European and American missionaries found necessary. Their standard of living at home/
was many times higher than that of the average citizen on the Mission fields, though it could not compare with that of the few wealthy Chinese, Japanese and Indians. Modern medicine was unknown. Health demanded big bungalows on large sites. Servants were cheap and saved much domestic labour. The people of the land generally walked, but the missionary was accustomed to a conveyance and so he used one. The colour of his skin set him apart. He could not melt into the generality of the land as Paul could. He was a white man, a member of the ruling race. To this day in the rural districts of India, seven years after independence (i.e. 1954), the white missionary is frequently addressed as darkar, (Government) —— There were practically no bridges across this gulf. There was nothing even remotely similar to the Jewish bridge over which Christianity marched into the Gentile world."(104)

We may add that when his country went to war, the call of patriotism often appeared to the missionary more urgent than the call to spread the Gospel. "I intended to write to you last month upon a matter which has been exercising my mind a good deal since the Prime Minister made his appeal to India for redoubled efforts in helping the Empire", wrote one young Scottish missionary to his home base. "Since the appeal was made there has been a movement in that direction largely augmenting the Indian army. Now it may be necessary and at any rate desirable for me to offer myself for the I.A.R.O." (105)

As a result of such conditions, there grew up in India, even more markedly than in other parts of the British Empire, that sub-culture of sahibs and mem-sahibs which has become associated for all time with the English East of Suez. This was the little world of Anglo-India of which Kipling, though he was a great deal more, was among other things the poet. G.M. Carstairs, an anthropologist and son of a Scottish missionary, speaks of revisiting childhood scenes in the Mission compound at Hasirabad, to find the society of a military cantonment which he remembered so vividly vanished as completely as the glories/

NOTES

105) MS letter from Allen Cameron, Calcutta, to Mr. McLauchlan, dated 26.5.1918, S.N.L.
of bygone Indian courts and temples: and so goes on to describe that life as a transitory phenomenon. (106) No doubt it was transitory when viewed sub specie aeternitatis. But for well over a century it showed remarkable vigour and cohesion and for better and worse exerted its influences. And while Western missionaries seldom mixed in the social life of their compatriots, yet their language, colour and way of life proclaimed that they belonged to the foreign enclave which refused to assimilate to Indian ways.

In one respect, this was a good thing. It discouraged a permanent dominance of the young churches by a spiritual oligarchy from overseas, just as control from London and the rigid separateness of the British community denied the British occupation the permanent character of another Norman conquest. When, as frequently happened, churches had to do without the services of a missionary, they learned to depend on themselves and each other. A permanent "colony" of missionaries periodically augmented by recruits from Europe would have been infinitely worse. But even as it was, the effect of resident foreigners in control could be negative and injurious. And we shall find evidence to suggest that when the Mission itself was a "strong" one — that is, strong enough for the overseas missionaries to form a small but self-contained unit of their own — the injurious effects were magnified.

Taken together, these two characteristic conditions of the Nineteenth Century missionary movement - that Christianity went out clothed in the garments of Western culture and that its ambassadors continued from generation to generation to be members of an alien race - rendered the situation radically different from any previous age. The fact that in both their culture and their foreignness Christian Missions were associated with the powers of government brought an added complication with which we shall have to deal in due course./

NOTES

106) G.M. Carstairs, "This Island Now", (Reith Lectures), printed in "The Listener", Nov. 15., 1962, p.794.
The Factor of National Religions

In India, the situation was further shaped by a third factor of great importance, namely the fact that there already existed in the country a number of ancient, highly cultured and popular religions whose roots were deeply imbedded in the soil. Of these, Mohammedanism alone was an importation, Hinduism, Buddhism, Jainism and the Sikh religion all being of indigenous origin. They were extremely powerful forces in the lives of India's peoples and Hinduism in particular had over thousands of years provided both the mould for Indian thinking and the cement which held Indian society together.

A head-on clash with other systems of belief was of course nothing new for Christianity or its apologists. To reach its supreme position in Europe it had first been required to conquer and eliminate the three great religions influences of the Graeco-Roman world - Judaism, the pantheistic culture of Hellenism and the Mystery religions. (107) Historically as well as spiritually, Christ came in the fullness of time, when the religions of a magnificent empire were too weak, narrow or corrupt to give it sustenance and the greatest of Rome's national poets, Virgil himself, was declaring that the religions and philosophies of mankind must be thought over anew. (108) So far as rival religions were concerned, Christianity's basic conflict in that age was not with Judaism, which was by-passed rather than over-run, but with polytheistic paganism, at one and the same time a popular, political and philosophical force. (109)

NOTES

109) Adolph Harnack, ("The Mission and Expansion of Christianity", tr. James Moffatt, William and Norgate, 1908) writes "The relations between Christianity and paganism simply meant the opposition of monotheism and polytheism". (P.24)
In this battle the victory it won was decisive and complete. "Never have religions so deeply entrenched in the culture of a civilised people been eradicated so completely over so wide an area", writes Latourette. (110)

Not for another fifteen hundred years after Constantine, until in the expansion of the Nineteenth Century it met with the animistic religions of Africa, the Asiatic hill tribes and the Polynesian peoples, was Christianity to make again a comparable conquest.

But in the long-established and sophisticated religions of the East it was to meet a much more formidable type of antagonist. In Hinduism especially, and in Islam, Christians discovered the two toughest opponents their faith had yet encountered. While no satisfying definition of Hinduism has been coined up to date, it has often been likened to a vast sponge which absorbs all that enters it without ceasing to be itself. Not a religion at all in the strict Western sense, but rather a gargantuan hotch-potch of contradictory customs and ideas, it yet possesses enough pervasive power and self-protective ability to assimilate or resist passively for centuries every system which comes into contact with it. Its caste system especially has been a most powerful instrument for holding a huge and variegated population together. The words "India" and "Hinduism" derive from the one root and the religion has a right to claim that it has moulded and also reflects to a unique degree the character of the people. (111) The strength of the Muslim faith, which originally spread in India through the power of conquest, lay rather in the simplicity of its creed but also in its equal genius for creating a closely-knit community life in many ways comparable to the Israel of the Old Testament. (112)

No religion of the Roman Empire can be compared with either of those two systems for age, sophistication or the sheer number of their adherents. And of Judaism alone in the ancient world could it be said that it had to an equal extent penetrated the minds of its worshippers and impregnated their /

NOTES

111) Percival Spear, "India, Pakistan and the West", pp. 57-75
112) Ibid., pp. 76-91.
everyday patterns of thought and behaviour. The campaigns of early Christianity may be likened to a lengthy series of advances and skirmishes against a many-sided enemy. By contrast, the battle against Hinduism developed into the interminable siege of an enemy who often seemed almost on the point of collapsing from within and yet continued to present a massive and impenetrable front. "In India", says Latourette again, "Christianity was confronted by one of its greatest challenges - the bond was religion."(113)

Some of those who took an active part in the struggle went so far as to suggest that here Christianity was in fact meeting its match. Abbé Dubuis, the first of European authorities on Hinduism, had written in 1822, "It is my decided opinion that, under existing circumstances, there is no possibility of converting the Hindus to any sect of Christianity".(114) And Dr. Norman McLeod, quoting his words nearly fifty years later, commented, "I hesitate not to express the opinion that no such battle has ever before been given to the Church of God to fight since history began and that no victory, if gained, will be followed by greater consequences."(115)

Reports from the fields frequently commented on the obdurate quality of the front which missionaries found themselves up against. Of this we may be sure", wrote J.S. Beaumont from Poona, "The combat deepens in India. Idolatries die hard. Old ways of resistance are given up but new ones are assumed."(116)

A few years later one of his colleagues was recording the following first impressions. "Before leaving home", wrote Dr. A.G. Mowat, "I was advised to go to India with a mind open to receive impressions from what I saw and heard. - the result has been the upheaval of many of my former ideas. I had thought that India was 'Waiting for the Gospel' and that the missionary had merely to go/
in and 'possess the land.' — In such work as I have seen this has not yet been verified.

"I believe the work to be at least as hard as any to be found in our home slums: for after removing much ignorance and superstition the missionary has to create and then satisfy an appetite for the Gospel.

"One is not long in India before being struck by the fact that the Hindus are a very religious people. Hinduism is not a religion of the past. — That the common people, for the most part, are sincere in their beliefs cannot be denied... Many of the educated classes, on the other hand, have ceased to hold many of their former beliefs and perform religious ceremonies because it is the custom to do so. India, I should say, is the most conservative country in the world. The Hindu is intolerant of change."(117)

"Be it remembered", ran an article in the "Missionary Record" of the Church of Scotland, "that you may convert the fifty millions of the simple aboriginals of India to a man, yet never touch the fringes of the great religious sects of India — the Hindus and the Mohammedans."(118)

"You must plough deep in India if you want to see an abundant spiritual harvest", wrote A.B. Mann, one of Duff's successors in Calcutta, "The minds of the people in this particular are very different from their soil."(119)

The strength and disposition of the religious forces requiring to be overcome had, as we have seen, a great deal to do with the forms of attack which Western missionaries chose as likely to prove most effective. Hinduism was learned but ignorant, long-established but effete, lofty in theory but riddled with contradictions, superstitions and corruptions, and it seemed reasonable to suppose that once its walls had begun to crumble it might disintegrate of/

NOTES
117) MS letter from A.G. Mowat, Poona, to Dr. Smith, dated 30.9.1891, S.N.L.
118) Quoted John F. Youngson, "Forty Years of the Punjab Mission of the Church of Scotland, p.264.
119) C. of S. Report, 1891, p.64.
its own accord. True knowledge was par excellence the weapon to be used against false knowledge and Western missionaries only seized the opportunity which they felt Providence to be placing in their hands.

In the Northern parts of India, where Islam was the religion of the majority, it proved an equally stout opponent, with its powers of resistance centring again on the force of immemorial custom. Political, social and legal sanctions were bound up with the spiritual to weld the Muslim community into a compact body, a fact confirmed by the emergence of two such widely separated groups as make up the Muslim State of Pakistan. Here again, a planned attempt was made to break down the initial barrier by presenting Christianity as true knowledge confronting the false.

These were the three new factors with which the Nineteenth Century successors of the Apostles found it necessary to reckon. The basic Christian motives had not altered and their purpose was essentially the same - to preach the Gospel of Christ to the heathen for the glory of God and the salvation of immortal souls. But the presuppositions they carried with them and the conditions they met with on arrival caused them to choose different weapons and this in turn helped to modify their purpose by introducing secondary aims. When Christ sent out the seventy, it was with a minimum of material resources. "Carry neither purse nor scrip nor shoes," they were told,(120) And the weapons which Paul spoke of/necessary for the Christian soldier were all spiritual - the breastplate of righteousness, the Gospel of peace for sandals, the shield of faith, the helmet of salvation, the sword of the Spirit.(121)

For the missionaries of the modern era also, these remained basic, yet they would have to be supplemented. Additional and much more cumbersome articles of equipment were required. And soon great baggage trains were busy bringing supplies from far-distant Western armouries, until the mere maintenance of the forces in the field became a major task.

__________

120) Luke 10, 4
121) Eph. 6, 13-17.
The Romantic Motive

Because the Nineteenth Century was an age of discovery as well as conquest, and offered alluring prospects of new worlds to conquer, we find in the missionaries of the period a romantic motive which had its roots in contemporary history and not in the New Testament. There was undoubtedly in the minds of men such as Carey, Duff and Wilson a sense of the great adventure on which they were embarking. Something a little similar may perhaps be discerned in Paul himself, the intrepid traveller, with his desire to reach Spain and to preach the Gospel in the regions beyond. But in this he spoke as an individual and one whose restless spirit, always "pressing on towards the mark of our high calling in Jesus Christ", made him the outstanding missionary of history. He cannot be taken as typical of his age or the Church of his day, for romantic flights were not part of the Jewish tradition or of Graeco-Roman culture, and the witness of the average Christian believer was given in conditions of the starkest realism.

Very far removed from this was the spirit of adventure which had become part of the British islander's character and was being constantly fanned through links with colonists of the new continent across the Atlantic and tales from other distant lands.

William Carey eagerly devoured Brainerd's "Life" and Cook's "Voyages", and had a very large map, consisting of several sheets of paper pasted together by himself, on which he had drawn a place for every nation in the known world and entered into it whatever he met with in reading, relative to its population, religion, etc."(124)

While his sober judgment was a safeguard against unrealistic fancies, the call of the unknown had clearly a place in arousing and developing his interest. /

NOTES

122) Rom. 15, 24; 2 Cor. 10, 16
123) Phil. 3, 14
124) George Smith, "Life of William Carey", p.30 (Quoting Fuller)
As Max Warren remarks, "It was Columbus and Captain Cook as well as St. Matthew and St. Mark who provided the perspective" of modern missionary enterprise. (125) The clearest examples are the missionary-explorers of Africa, and with a man like David Livingstone, whose imagination was stirred, by the sight of morning smoke rising from a thousand villages which had never heard the name of Christ, it is hardly possible to separate the evangelist from the adventurer. But the mystic East also cast its spell.

Alexander Duff listed the two periods of romantic literary interest as God's preparation for the present era of religious interest. (126) And his high-flying rhetoric concerning Christ's call to mission, however wearisome it may sound in our ears, is in the idiom of his day and perfectly sincere. Even for the imperturbable John Wilson, obedience to the divine command was accompanied, in his youth, by a sense of adventurous faith. (127) And the popular missionary literature of the next two generations was nothing if not romantic in tone.

St. Paul was not the only missionary to suffer hunger, cold and shipwreck in the course of his journeyings, and no reader of the accounts sent home by the pioneers of the modern movement, with their detailed descriptions of the scenery and customs of far-off lands, can fail to understand that, while they were naturally anxious to capture the interest of supporters, they were at the same time caught up by the adventurous nature of their task. The generation of Duff and Wilson was also of course the era of the romantic revival, when Walter Scott's novels were being gobbled up in Scottish homes. Missionaries merely applied the same spirit of enquiry and wonder to their own work. In the doing of God's will there were marvels to be seen. And expectation and excitement, as well as faith, often helped to keep the fires

Notes
125) Max Warren, op. cit., p. 22
126) A. Duff, "India and India Missions", pp. 10 ff.
127) See Note 18
of enthusiasm burning in conditions of monotony, sickness or frustration.

Professor Knorr remarks in a passage of his book to which we have already referred to the false picture painted by such over-romantic notions and the consequent collapse of missionary enthusiasm in the 1840's. "The task, greatly romanticised, carried the gratifying flavour of adventure. Only in the forties began missionary enthusiasm to ebb. Actual achievements were disappointingly disproportionate to expectations and efforts. The romantic conception of the enterprise faded before the certainty of difficulties, hard labour and slow success. The various missionary societies experienced financial difficulties."(128) Such recessions, however, were never more than local and temporary. For the Scottish Churches, the 1840's was a period of advance, not stagnation or withdrawal. And in the second half of the century Protestant Missions surged into their most striking decades of expansion. While they acquired a much more accurate and realistic idea of the conditions to be met with, still "the great adventure of Missions" did not lose its appeal.

The truth is that the Victorians had an ability which we may envy to combine realism with an equally genuine romanticism. The result was that the romantic motive, while not in any way essential to the successful propagation of the Gospel, did far more good than it did harm. The most influential Scottish missionaries in India were all men who lived out their working lives in one Province, getting to know the people and their language, background and customs. Their policies and any changes made in their approach were dictated by a careful appraisal of the facts based on direct knowledge and many years of experience. They built, that is to say, on a very solid and down-to-earth foundation. Yet after thirty years of gruelling labour the lyric touch had not deserted many of them and fires which burned more steadily burned no less brightly. The enthusiasm we see in the Alexander Duff of the 1860's is to be found again in the J.A. Graham of the 1890's and again in the Nicol Macnicol or the G.E.O. Carstairs of the 1930's. And while it may have/

NOTES

128) Klaus Knorr, op.cit., p.381
had the effect of blinding them to certain realities — hope kept springing eternal, the walls of Jericho were just about to crumble, and all their geese were swans — yet it built up more than it destroyed. Men need their dreams to keep them going through the dust and heat and if romanticism sows delusions it is at least a better fertiliser than cynicism can ever be. We may recognise this motive as one peculiar to the age and a child of Victorian optimism rather than of the New Testament. Nevertheless it could be used and blessed by God, to strengthen men for spreading the Good News.

The Civilising Motive

That cannot be said with anything like the same confidence about the civilising motive which has played such a significant part in modern missionary expansion. From the missionary's side, it was never a motive of more than subsidiary value and arose from the conviction that, as in the first century of the Christian era, so again in the nineteenth, the "fullness of time" had come. As the Roman Empire had been ripe for Christ, so the wider world of their own day was being prepared by God for a new and glorious day of Christian expansion. The difference was that since Christianity had already created a civilisation of its own, political, cultural and educational resources could be ranged behind the Gospel instead of being marshalled against it.

It was almost inevitable that in the opening chapter of his apology for missionary work in India Duff should draw an analogy between the Roman Empire at the commencement of the Christian era and the present-day position of the British in India: and that he should then go on to compare the opening up of India as a missionary field with the events of that other age of Christian expansion.(129) The scholars of that day were Classicists almost to a man and also knew their Gibbon. For citizens of an expanding Empire comparisons with Rome were always the first and most natural ones to make and C.E. Trevelyan, scholarly and honest though he was, had already produced some/

NOTES

129) A. Duff, "India and India Missions," p.31 ff.
disastrously misleading analogies in likening the India of his day to the Gaul of Caesar's wars. Duff, like Trevelyan, was only giving voice to a conviction shared by thousands of Britons. As Rome had broken down the barriers against inter-communication between the nations and peoples of antiquity, so now the Pax Britannica was clearing the way for the modern ambassadors of Christ.

It was the resulting alliance between civil and missionary forces which has given rise to the common accusation of "Christian imperialism." But in fact there was nothing deliberate about this drawing together. It came about because two parallel movements found that, having much in common, they might help each other. In certain parts of Africa, in Nyasaladd, to take one instance, and again in Uganda, it was the Missions which persuaded a reluctant Parliament to accept powers of responsibility in order to kill the slave trade and protect their converts. In India the missionaries who in the late 1700's and early 1800's had been small independent groups fighting against the powers that be found themselves after 1835 under a Government which might be prepared to give strong support to their efforts. The volte face was confusing and many missionaries were duly confused. They simply wished to preach the Gospel and were suspicious of any form of Church-State alliance.

Nevertheless, coming from the "Christendom world", very few could fail to believe that Western civilisation was both a result and an instrument of the Christian outreach. David Livingstone's solution for the ills of Africa — "Christianity and Commerce" — while recognising that each used the other, also clearly distinguished between the two. And in fact the evangelical emphasis between the "worldly" and the "unworldly", the "secular" /

NOTES
131) See e.g. G. Bennet, "The Concept of Empire", p.13.
132) Ibid.
and the "sacred", kept constantly seeking to underline the difference between what was spiritual and of God and what was earthly and of man or mammon.

"Wherever, whenever, and by whosoever Christianity is sacrificed on the altar of wordly expediency, there and then must the supreme good of man lie bleeding at its base" wrote Duff in criticism of the Governor-General's actions when they fell short of his ideal.(133) Like John Wilson and other missionaries who felt sufficiently well-informed to comment on public affairs (and like many more far less competent), he was never slow to criticise government measures which he considered to be inadequate or misdirected.(134) Missionaries on the whole were only too ready to tell the civil power where its real duty lay. To take a further example, when in the 1850's Indian education appeared once more on the parliamentary agenda Duff laid down the law to Lord Ellenborough, a man branded by the evangelicals as secularist-minded, in no uncertain terms. "I have never ceased to declare that if our object be not merely for our own aggrandisement but very specially for the welfare of the natives, to retain our dominion in India no more effective plan can be concerned, etc. etc."(135)

The truth is that civil servants and soldiers often found missionaries making rather uncomfortable bed-fellows. Many of the former were sincere and earnest Christian men themselves, and quite sure that the decency, law and order they sought to impose, along with a few Western ideas to stabilise their development, were in fact Christian seeds taking root. And for a great number of able and eminent British statesmen, during the century which separated Wellesley from Curzon, Christianity was in essence the synonym for/

NOTES
133) Quoted George Smith, "Life of Alexander Duff", p.98
134) Ct. e.g. George Smith, "Life of John Wilson", pp.569-570
135) George Smith, "Life of Alexander Duff", p.265
peace and orderly government. (136) "Till India is leavened with Christianity she will be unfit for freedom; when India is leavened with Christianity she will be unfit for anything else — "proclaimed Lord Palmerston. (137) The point to note, however, is that it was never the missionaries who made this crude and emphatic identification of Missions with Western culture. (138)

On the contrary, it was their view that secular interests, while right and proper in their place, were not to be confused with what should always remain the highest aim of Christian people and a Christian government. They never tired of reminding the slothful or unawakened of their duty, "Arise then, ye Christian men of England —" cried Alexander Duff at Exeter Hall, "Through you, let Britain discharge her debt of gratitude and love to the ascending Saviour — More especially, through you let her discharge her debt of justice, not less than benevolence, to India, in reparation of the wrongs, numberless and aggravated, inflicted in former times on India's unhappy children. India, at once the grave of Britain's sons and the chief source and mine of their princely affluence and power." (139)

NOTES

136) On political grounds, a soldier like Wellesley was against the admission of missionaries to India. Yet this was not to deny a divine purpose behind British control of the country. "We feel it would be not only impolitic but highly immoral to suppose that Providence has admitted the establishment of the British power over the finest provinces of India, with any other view than that of its being conducive to the happiness of the people, as well as to our material advantage." (S. J. Owen, "A Selection from Wellesley's Despatches", p. 687). So a hundred years later Lord Curzon, not an orthodox Christian believer, said of British rule in India that "it must depend on the eternal moralities of righteousness and justice" ("The Times", 21 July, 1904). In both cases, and on countless occasions between, we may accept that statesmen and administrators saw the Christian religion, when reasonably presented, as offering a spiritualised form of their own more practical purpose.

137) See Reginald Reynolds, "White Sahibs in India", p. 59.


139) A. Duff, Address "India and its Evangelism", 1850; Printed in "Missionary Pamphlets", No. 22, pp. 79-80. (F. M. C. Secretary's Library)
The secular arm of the civil power, then, was seen by missionaries as a God-given tool to be used for their own much higher purpose. They were not its instrument, but it was theirs. And it would be shameful for a Christian nation not to accept this most exalted of all privileges and responsibilities. "India has rightly been chosen by the Church of Scotland for especial cultivation" ran one official report of the 1870's. "No foreign country presses with anything like the same force on British Christians. Her vastness — her singularly influential site — her extraordinary variety of population — the stupendous difficulties in the way of her evangelism — the opportunities which Providence has opened — these together with burdens of past neglect and wrong combine — with the remarkable fact of a common Sovereign and Government, to throw that land upon our conscience with an urgency altogether peculiar."(140)

British missionaries believed, along with the bulk of their fellow countrymen, that without their nation's firm hands on the controls India would revert back to chaos. But on the other hand they left their compatriots in no doubt about their duty to set an example of Christian living to the Indian population. So Alexander Duff, noting with approval the improved tone of European society in Calcutta in the second quarter of the Nineteenth Century, told a Scottish congregation, "Formerly, one of the greatest hindrances to the spread of Christianity in the East arose from the vicious, ungodly lives of our European countrymen. — We think of the time when in India the dismal expression 'Christian religion, devil religion' had passed into a proverb — Blessed be God, what a change now! The Christian Sabbath, with its hallowed ordinances, may truly be said to be as well observed in Calcutta on the part of the British population as in any commercial town in Great Britain —".(141)

It is true that missionaries were not alone in exhorting Europeans to set higher standards of personal and social morality. John Bright had told /

140) C. of S. Report, 1875, p.5.
141) A. Duff, "Missions the Chief End of the Church", pp.54-55.
the House of Commons just a few years earlier that, "If we desire to see
Christianity, in some form, professed in that country, we shall sooner attain
our object by setting the example of high-toned Christian morality, than by
other means we can employ."(142) But for the missionaries, this became a
theme of which they never tired.

At the same time they were correspondingly gratified when they saw that
efforts made by their fellow countrymen, both official and unofficial, were
smoothing the path for their own work. Two of the earliest Scottish fields
in India, those in Madras and Nagpur, owed their inception to the interest of
Scottish Christians on the spot.(143) And it is in a vein of appreciation
for such forms of Christian witness that we find the Rev. Murray Mitchell
writing to Dr. Brunton in 1841, "Among the influences which tend to humanise
and soften the fierce tribes (in Gujarat) we must not forget the efforts of the
British political agent, Captain Lang, whose mild yet earnest entreaties have
lately prevailed on the Raja of Ahmednagar to prevent the Sati of his brother's
wife — a fact which bears eloquent testimony to the progress of European, if
not Christian, ideas. A few years ago, before the country had fallen under
the political administration of Britain, it was the theatre of perpetual feuds
and massacres. Already the rule of civilisation has commenced, the blessings
of peace are secured — even the Christian missionary has now gone thither and
received a welcome and we may hope that, if the prayers of Christians be earnest
and sustained, that Almighty God will shed down His heaven's grace and teach
the haughty Rajput to bow at the name of Christ."(144)

Relations and co-operation between missionaries and government officials
tended to vary, within certain limits, according to the personalities and
predilections of the individuals involved. We find the Rev. John Douglas /

NOTES
142) John Bright to the House of Commons, 3 June 1833, (Speeches on Questions
143) See Chapters 5, 8 and 9.
144) MS letter from J.M. Mitchell to Dr. Brunton, 22/7/1841,
Scottish National Library.
complaining from Nagpur in 1897. "Our Chief Commissioner, I am told on good authority the other day, issued a circular to District Commissioners in which he expressed his regret to hear that they had been too readily handing over famine children to missionaries and advising greater caution with respect to giving children to 'proselytising bodies.' The latter expression was an unfortunate one and may have an injurious effect."(145)

But two years later when a Mr. Fraser, a Scotsman and an old friend of the Mission had been appointed as Chief Commissioner for the Province he could write with much more confidence, "The outlook for the Provinces is very dark. Famine prices prevail. Relief works are in operation all around --- It is well that we have at the head of the administration a man so competent and who knows the Provinces as Mr. Fraser does."(146)

Generally speaking, missionaries regarded government officials to be working on their side and the ends of freedom, peaceful government and education were regarded as weapons which a Christian might legitimately add to his armoury --- "Our Christianity is recommended to the natives by our secular knowledge", said Stephen Hislop.(147) Yet while they paved the road for Christian truth they were also part of the Christian heritage and it was the duty of both individuals and governments to pass on such blessings. "Liberty, the free development of the nations under Christian institutions or influences was what he sought", says Duff's biographer under the heading of "Christian Imperialism."(148)

We may at this point quite firmly state, therefore, that for the overwhelming majority of Christian workers, their basic motives were spiritual and centred on a desire to spread the love of Christ. In the words of young Stephen Hislop, "The most essential of all requisitions is a singleness of heart and aim — an increased devotedness to Christ and his cause."(149)

NOTES
145) MS letter from John Douglas, Nagpur, to Dr. Lindsay, dated 18.3.1897, S.N.L.
146) MS letter from John Douglas, Nagpur, to Dr. Smith, dated 17.11.1899, S.N.L.
148) George Smith, "Life of Alexander Duff", p.363
Missionaries went overseas not to teach, uplift or civilise, but primarily to convert. And in the earliest days at least most of those who found themselves engaged in the former activities wished it could be otherwise. "Some of our friends are disposed to say we are professors, not missionaries", wrote Robert Nesbit from the Institution at Bombay. "But this great work must go on and our Mission is evidently one of those that must grapple with it."(150)

Even in the work of evangelism itself, missionaries were not entirely blind to the weakness of their own hearts and the possible unworthiness of their motives. Beside the practical distinction between European and Christian ideas made, for example, by Murray Mitchell (151), we see also the deeper searching for inner contradictions or inadequacies. "I cannot say that I feel a glow of compassion for the perishing heathen", wrote Robert Nesbit again, "Or that I burn with desire to make known to them the words of eternal life: and although I am alive to the honour of my God and Saviour, I cannot say that I am impelled to the work of missions by a disinterested zeal for His glory."(152) We may regard these words as the soul-searchings of a very young man, neither very mature nor very healthy. Yet they represent an attitude which was to some extent reflected in the minds of most missionaries and which can not simply be dismissed.

We cannot help being struck by their sheer unwordliness. They not only talked much of the joys of heaven, but regulated their lives in the belief that the sorrows and discomforts of earth counted for little in comparison. Murray Mitchell could write with real appreciation about the rule of civilisation and the blessings of peace being secured. This is a very different thing from saying that these were the chief ends he had in view. "India is certainly a land of strange vicissitudes" he is to be found writing to Dr. Brunton only a few months earlier. "Arrivals, departures, removals, deaths,/

NOTES

150) J.M. Mitchell, op.cit., p.157
151) See Note 144.
152) J.M. Mitchell, op.cit., p.37
follow one another in so rapid a succession that we are most emphatically reminded that here we have no continuing city and most emphatically warned that we should seek one which is to come — We, the labourers who remain, must be also ready — to give our account with joy and not with trembling."

The tone is characteristic of the time — sermonettes on the brevity of earthly life have been an accepted element of Christian practice in every age but our own — but we have no reason to doubt the writer's sincerity. This was how men talked but it was also the belief by which many of them lived.

We may take by way of example a family like that of the three brothers Martin, all of whom were dedicated at birth to the Mission field. Two Brothers died at Rajputana, the youngest, Gavin, at 36, and William the oldest at 48, having already lost two wives and two of his six children. One may say of such men that their sacrifices were misguided or wasteful, and this is a legitimate opinion. But to say that they were in fact setting out to serve a cause quite different from that which they claimed to serve is nonsense at any level. It cannot be said that Missions were essentially an arm of political imperialism. The work of missionaries was aimed essentially at serving the glory of God and the salvation of souls, for the love of Christ. Nor were they unaware that they must constantly face the temptation of compromising with lower and lesser aims. "Our plans exclude everything that has not distinct bearing, directly or indirectly on the grand ultimate and contemplated by all, the conversion of souls to the Saviour", wrote Alexander Duff, and his words are fundamentally true for the intention of his colleagues also.

This may be said not only of the pioneers but of their successors also up to the present generation. The charge of religious imperialism has/

---

**NOTES**

153) MS letter from J.M. Mitchell to Dr. Brunton, 1/12/1840, Scottish National Library. Italics are the writer's.

154) W.F. Martin, op.cit.

155) MS letter from A Duff to Dr. Inglis, 10/6/1833. Scottish National Library. Italics are the writer's.
usually been levelled most strongly by either nationalist or Communist circles. "Under the powerful rise of nationalist liberation movements in colonial and dependent countries, the attempts of missionaries to strengthen the position of the imperialist states in these countries are suffering complete failure", stated the Great Soviet Encyclopaedia in 1958.\(^\text{(156)}\)

The best answer to such a charge, so far as India is concerned, is simply to point to the fact that when the nation became independent not a single missionary expressed a wish to leave.

Having made this point, however, we must recognise that, being men of their time and sharing the limited vision which is given to all men, those missionaries fell far short of their intentions. Their motives were unconsciously modified and their aims confused and diverted to secondary channels. It was inevitable that the message they carried should be treated by their hearers as foreign and therefore false. The very same situation had arisen two hundred years earlier when Robert de Nobili, coming to Madura, discovered that Christianity was a despised religion because the Hindus identified becoming a Christian with following the customs of the "Prangui", or Europeans.\(^\text{(157)}\)

The foreignness of Christianity, as we have already had occasion to note, was due to the Hindu system as much as to the Western approach. Nevertheless, in identifying themselves so closely with a strange culture and a foreign ruling race, and in failing to adapt to Indian ways of thinking if not actual day-to-day living, missionaries emphasised the foreign nature of their faith, to the detriment of the Church's growth.

It was equally inevitable that Western missionaries should bring with them their native culture. Not only was it the sole culture with which they were familiar but it was itself largely the fruit of eighteen hundred years of Christian values percolating through society. Ideas and spiritual values must/

---

**NOTES**

\(^\text{156)}\) Quoted W.A. Visser't Hooft, *op.cit.*, p.53

\(^\text{157)}\) See e.g. S.C. Neill, "Builders of the Indian Church", Turnbull and Spears, Edinburgh, 1934, Ch.4. pp.54-70.
of necessity be incarnated in human customs and social systems: Christ Himself was born of Mary, not of the Holy Spirit: Paul spoke as a Jew by birth, a citizen of Rome and a student of Greek philosophy, in order to speak as a Christian: and to carry truth in even the most earthen of vessels is not necessarily to degrade it. The material, the mental and the spiritual cannot live in isolation from each other and Western culture was without question the only possible vehicle through which in the circumstances of the period the eternal Gospel might be transported.

The fault lay not in accepting the vehicle but in doing so too uncritically, too complacently and with far too exaggerated an idea of its intrinsic superiority. This led first of all to an inadequate understanding of Christianity itself. "The missionary activity of the Nineteenth Century is not rightly understood if it is looked upon merely as one element in the great movement of Western expansion", writes Bishop Michael Hollis, one-time Moderator of the Church of South India. "But it was a part of that movement and it shared in large measure its arrogant sense of Western superiority and its unexamined assumption that Western civilisation and Christianity were, at least in large measure, convertible terms." (158)

This attitude led in the second place to a failure on the part of missionaries to understand the people to whom they were preaching. Many things of great value in the religious and cultural background of India were ignored or deliberately swept aside. In some cases this was necessary iconoclasm, in others it was the result of prejudice and often still of plain ignorance. European customs of little meaning to an Asiatic people were held out as in some way connected with true faith and enlightenment. And it became impossible to separate spiritual aims from those of material advancement after Western models. Thus for all their unworldliness, those/

NOTES
missionaries tended to become themselves victims of the materialistic fallacy, and confusing God's Kingdom with worldly empires they failed to convey to an alien people the essentials of true Christian civilization. For if it is a fact, as Toynbee asserts, that "civilisations are not, in spite of perverted notions to the contrary, built of such bricks as — sewing-machines, tobacco and rifles, nor even of alphabets and numerals. It is the easiest thing in the world for commerce to export a new Western technique — It is infinitely harder for a Western poet or saint to kindle in a non-Western soul the spiritual flame that is alight in his own" — then the Western saints failed lamentably to kindle in the souls of the saints of the East the flame of Christian faith and living.

(159) Their hearts were remarkably pure and they possessed great wisdom. But they were not quite pure enough and their wisdom was not always of God.

The Motive of Planting Churches.

There remains one further motive to be examined. It did not, as we shall try to show, greatly affect the success or otherwise of Christian Missions in India, but a brief study of it will prove relevant to the history of the Scottish Missions with which we are concerned. This was what Van den Berg has designated the ecclesiological motive, or desire to raise Christian churches. Since it is the history of certain churches we are studying, it should clearly be of some interest to us.

To what extent, we may ask before leaving this chapter, did Western Missions and Scottish missionaries hold before them as a reason for their work the planting and nurturing of Christian communities? How large a place did the thought of the Church take in their minds?

We may anticipate our conclusion by answering: "It did not take a very prominent place. The founding of churches was seen as an unquestioned result of successful evangelism. The New Testament writers did not spend time and energy arguing for the existence of the Church. And for the missionaries of/

NOTES

the Nineteenth Century also it followed logically that the Iletoi should be called into the ekklesia.

We may indeed question how far it is possible at all to separate the idea of planting churches from that of preaching the Gospel. The New Testament demonstrates the two aims as inextricably interwoven, with the preaching of the Gospel coming first in time but the nurture of the churches steadily growing in importance. As recent insights have emphasised, the second is the fruit of the first and not an end in itself but the instrument of further evangelism.

There are variations of emphasis, however, and while missionaries came out from established churches which might, in theory at least, have laid stress on the reproduction of certain ecclesiastical features, there was little of this among Protestant Missions. We have noted that missionaries did, in fact, found churches similar in doctrine and order to the sending bodies from which they came. But there were many exceptions and the new churches, if similar, were not identical. The ecclesiological motive, as Van den Berg illustrates, was always subsidiary, to such an extent that the evangelicals were sometimes accused of preaching "a Gospel without a Church."(160)

As we might expect, a body like the (Anglican) Church Missionary Society, founded "on the Church principle", paid more attention to this aspect and paid it earlier. The Anglican-Methodist schism carried weight here, as did the Anglican emphasis on episcopal orders. Yet the Church of England's outlook, in those days before the Oxford movement had exalted the theory of episcopacy, was much more tolerant than it is even at the present day. Anglican Missions were quite prepared to dispense with episcopal sanction for their work in South India, and the C.M.S. stressed that "the great thing — was personal piety, not office."(161)/

NOTES

160) J. Van den Berg, op.cit., pp.159-160
161) Quoted Ibid., p.160
We may remember that it was the Anglican Henry Venn, Secretary of the C.M.S., who first concerned himself with defining the nature of the churches which Missions were seeking to raise. And we can understand how the non-Anglican evangelical Missions, among which were numbered the Scottish Missions, showed less concern about the actual form of the churches they founded and also stood much more loosely to denominational differences.

It was naturally regarded as a sign of a Mission's success when it had made enough converts to unite them into a congregation. The labours of Schwartz and his fellow-Lutherans in South India and the work of the C.M.S., the Moravians and others had already resulted in the formation of "Protestant churches" or congregations, and these were facts of which Scottish churchmen were cognisant. (162)

Scottish missionaries in turn showed their pleasure when it became possible to found the first congregation or erect the first building for worship. These were new steps of great significance. "I formed a native church on Presbyterian principles. Eight members joined it and I administered the Lord's Supper to them and to some Europeans", reported John Wilson triumphantly from Bombay in 1832. (163) "A mature church, with men, women and children, few in number but remarkable for intelligence, scripture knowledge and much of the simplicity and loveliness of Christianity has been formed and has been fed with the sincere milk of the Word" declared Alexander Duff from the pulpit in Calcutta. (164) "The rising church of India calls me to leave Scotland. I do not speak of the whole Church in India but of that in the districts of Bombay and Poona", ran Robert Nesbit's parting message to the General Assembly. (165)/

NOTES

164) Pamphlets, "Indian Missions", Vo. V, p.15 (F.M.C. Secretary's Library)
165) J.M. Mitchell, op.cit., p.292
Yet on the whole, because evangelism was their first interest, and actual churches were still few and small, it was the Church rather than the churches of which evangelical missionaries spoke.

“...because evangelism was their first interest, and actual churches were still few and small, it was the Church rather than the churches of which evangelical missionaries spoke.

“I hope in a little while to see a Church formed for God in India” said William Carey. (166)

“You cannot say that God wills not that India’s millions should be added to His Church” — so Duff once again to the Calcutta congregation. (167)

Their concern was genuinely with the Church of Christ and not simply in the success of the Mission or denomination to which they belonged.

We have in fact seen how they moved well ahead of their contemporaries at home in working for unity and co-operation among denominations. William Carey apologised for the fact that the Baptist Missionary Society, of which he was a founder member, would be restricted to his own group, and as far back as 1806 it had been his “pleasing dream” to summon a meeting of all denominations of Christians at the Cape of Good Hope somewhere about 1810. (168) Duff and Wilson both spoke out strongly on occasion about the damage done to the missionary cause by narrow denominationalism. The former, referring to the fact that in 1869 there were twenty-five separate Protestant Societies at work in India, told the General Assembly, “One can hardly go anywhere in India without asking, ‘To what body of Christians do you belong? — How are we to understand which of you is right and whether any of you be right? Go and first settle the differences amongst yourselves and when you have agreed as to what Christianity really is, then come to us’.” (169) Five years earlier still John Wilson had moved in the Free Church Presbytery of Bombay that it should overture the General Assembly for a union of the United and Reformed /

NOTES

167) Pamphlets “Indian Missions”, Vol.V., p.11, (F.M.C. Secretary’s Library)
169) Address to the Free Church General Assembly, 24 May, 1869, printed for the F.M.C., p.7
Presbyterian Churches. (170) And there were many other Scottish missionaries who felt, with David Livingstone, a strong dislike for what the latter described as "geographical Christianity." (171)

To understand the more positive attitude of the Scottish missionaries towards the planting of churches, we need only to note their very live concern for the training and ordination of a national Christian ministry. The trained ministry and the worshipping congregation were their dual criteria for an established church. Krishna Mohan Banerjee, Duff’s most brilliant convert, was ordained in the Anglican Church in Calcutta largely because no Presbyterian church existed. A considerable number of Duff’s other converts also became members or pastors with other denominations, and it is of those he spoke a little regretfully when he referred to souls "lost to us — though not to the catholic cause of our adorable Redeemer." (172)

As we shall have an opportunity to learn, the early Scottish missionaries took great personal pains at the earliest possible moment to train suitable converts for the ministry of a national Church and to persuade the home Committees to grant them wider powers. (173) Addressing the second Free Church Assembly of 1843, John Wilson dwelt on the two questions which lay at the foundation of the indigenous church, namely native congregations and native ministers. (174) "From the first" writes George Smith, "Foreseeing men like Wilson felt that they were laying the foundation of the future Church of India and that it was an evil thing to introduce into it the purely historical sectarian controversies of the warring churches of the West." (175) During the anxious years proceeding the Disruption, although the missionaries followed the course of events with detailed concern, they were even more concerned /
that possible divisions at home should not affect the spirit of the young church. "Hence the echoes of the Ten Years' Conflict were somewhat dull in India" remarks George Smith again.(176)

When the time came at last for the ordaining of Indian ministers, there was great rejoicing, and much correspondence went into arranging the details of their authority, responsibilities and salaries.(177) John Wilson especially was particular that Indian pastors should be placed from the beginning on an equal footing and supported the stand of his Parsi convert Dhanjibhaé when the latter declared that unless given full evangelistic powers and liberty he would not enter the Free Church. "We are for natives being ordained after due probation as missionaries or evangelists like ourselves", ran his stated opinion.(178)

We may conclude by stating simply that for Scottish missionaries the founding of churches was an integral part of the evangelical aim. They were more concerned with the new churches possessing the right spirit than the right order: and that order in turn they saw as dependent on the provision of a trained Indian ministry. In this respect their Presbyterianism was firm but not rigid. It cannot be charged against them that they neglected to form churches or to foster them once formed. It was their conception of the Gospel itself, and not of the Church, which was at fault. And out of this came many difficulties.

---

**NOTES**

176) Ibid.
178) George Smith, "Life of John Wilson", p.228
General Sources


K.S. Latourette, "History of the Expansion of Christianity".


Reginald Reynolds, "White Sahibs in India", Socialist Book Centre, Ltd., London. Third revised edition, 1946. (Unfortunately in this war-time edition all references have had to be omitted.)


"Life of Alexander Duff"
"Life of John Wilson of Bombay"
"Life of Stephen Hislop", John Murray, 1889.

Percival Spear, "India, Pakistan and the West", O.U.P., 1949.


"Missionary Pamphlets", F.M.C., Secretary's Library.

Annual Reports of F.M.C.S.

MS Letters, Scottish National Library.
CHAPTER V.

SCOTTISH MISSIONS AND INDIAN CHURCHES

1. Before 1857

In this chapter we shall attempt a brief survey of Scottish missionary work in India as a whole. There is one simple fact which must be grasped at the onset, namely that any such overall approach is bound to be limited in its effectiveness. India is a large country and the eight fields opened up by Scottish Missions were widely scattered over its surface. As a result, although there was occasionally some interchange of missionary personnel, even this was strictly limited due to the variety of languages in use, and there was never any prospect of two fields eventually combining or even working together in some type of composite unit. Development, that is to say, must be treated primarily as the individual development of eight separate fields.(1)

If the hard facts of geography made this inevitable, the isolation of the Scottish fields from one another was accentuated by the natural tendency to make fraternal contacts and then more binding links with neighbouring churches which were not necessarily Presbyterian in background. The movement which took place during the last quarter of the Nineteenth Century towards the alliance of a number of Presbyterian bodies began, with the dawn of the next century, to flow into broader streams.(2) Thus rather than combining with and cross-fertilising each other, the churches raised by Scottish Missions found and strengthened ties with other churches near at hand whose origins lay neither in Scotland nor in Presbyterianism. Thus while a general view of Scottish/

NOTES

1) It is for this very good reason that official histories deal with each field separately and make no attempt at a composite history. The sole exception, R.W. Weir's account of the Church of Scotland's Missions, is as a result much more informative about the Home Committee than about work on the fields.

2) See Chapter XIV. The Presbyterian Alliance of India was formed in 1875 and led in 1904 to the constituting of the Presbyterian Church of India. See Chapter XIV.
missionary policy is possible, a composite history of these churches is not.

Nevertheless, some advantage is to be gained from trying to obtain a bird's-eye view, however sketchy. Even when allowance is made for the individual factors which led to varying forms of progress in one field or another, all fields felt the impression of certain impulses in common. There were national events and movements which made an impact on every part of India. There were developments within Protestant Christianity which affected Indian churches. And there were changes in the structure or outlook of the Scottish churches which influenced all the fields where Scottish missionaries were at work. The aim of this chapter will be to present a picture of these developments in panoramic form before turning a telescopic lens on to each individual field in turn.

Compared with the Presidencies of Calcutta and Madras, Bombay in the early years of the Nineteenth Century had only a handful of missionaries. Yet it was here that the first Scottish missionaries began work. In 1818, when with the defeat of the Maratha confederacy Western India was opened up to British commerce and influence, the Scottish Missionary Society decided to make it their new field. Their first candidate, the Rev. Donald Mitchell, who was sent out in 1822, died within a year of reaching Bombay but was closely followed by three more ordained missionaries. In 1827 and 1829 two more young men were added to the strength who were to give long and distinguished service and set the Mission on a firm footing - Robert Nesbit and John Wilson.

The Mission's work had begun with the establishment of village schools in the Konkan district, a fertile strip of coastland roughly sixty miles South/
of Bombay city. The teachers themselves were Hindus, for a handful of pioneers from the London Missionary Society, the (Congregational) American Board, the Wesleyan Mission and the Church Missionary Society had as yet failed to make a single convert against what appeared like an impenetrable wall of ignorance and indifference. But since schooling of any kind among all except the high-caste Brahmin communities was for all practical purposes non-existent, it was hoped these vernacular schools would be a means of making some initial contacts. Other Protestant Missions were beginning to adopt this method and the pioneer Scottish Mission decided to fall into line. In the few months before his death, Donald Mitchell opened ten village schools and by 1827 the Mission was responsible for over eighty of them with a total of over 3,000 pupils, 300 of these being girls.(4)

Yet it soon became apparent that such a system was extremely limited in its scope. Both boys and girls left school when very young, only non-Christian teachers were available and it was difficult to supervise such numbers, besides leaving far too little time for what every Protestant missionary recognised as priority work - the direct preaching of the Gospel. The opening of those schools did lead the provincial Government to embark at last on a programme for elementary education. But in its aim of making converts, the results of this early venture were negligible. In 1831, with the promise of better openings in Bombay and Poona, the Konkan Mission was closed.(5) The arrival of Alexander Duff in Calcutta and the immediate and startling success of his Institution can thus be seen in its proper light as a new point of departure from which Scottish Missions began to make their first real advance.

Within six years, parallel lines of progress were being pursued in the

NOTES

4) Our Church's Work, Maratha Missions, pp. 19-20.
5) Ibid., pp. 20-21.
capitals of the other two maritime Provinces. Duff in Calcutta, Wilson in Bombay, and John Anderson who set out for Madras in 1835, were all laying the foundation of the Institutions which were to develop from small beginnings into first-grade University Colleges and for many years to act as the heart of each Mission's life.

In the course of the next few years, a remarkably similar pattern was repeated in each of the three centres. There was the initial stage of hesitation on the part of an interested but suspicious population, followed by a rush of students avid for Western learning. There was then a period of increasing popularity interrupted by protests and some boycotting when caste barriers were ignored. A lull followed, then an even more vociferous outcry at the conversion of one or two young men from high-caste Hindu or Parsee families. And this again was succeeded by acceptance of the Institutions' worth, acquiescence by students and their parents in the compulsory lessons on Scripture and Christian doctrine, and the gradual expansion of the syllabus and the upgrading of educational standards. The very similarity shown by the early history of the three Institutions shows that Duff had weighed up the situation with astonishing acumen. The Calcutta and Bombay Institutions especially rapidly gained in prestige among the educated population for the learning of their teachers and the excellence of their instruction. And meanwhile other Missions, noting that at last a method of crashing the caste barrier had been devised, prepared to follow suit. Their hands were greatly strengthened by the passing of the Educational Minute which paved the way for Government support of higher education through the medium of English.

NOTES

6) British India at this point consisted of the three original Provinces with the addition of Agra, which in 1835 was given the title of the North-West Provinces. Later, with Oudh, it became part of the United Provinces; P.E. Roberts, "History of British India", p.307.
7) See P.E. Roberts, op.cit. p.304; J.C. Powell Price, "A History of India", p.516, etc. Arthur Mayhew in "The Education of India" points out that the aims of the 1835 decision, while not closely defined, were definable. (P.25) The Government had committed itself, though not in so many words.
Along with the expansion of the Institutions there came an extension movement towards strategic village centres or to strongholds of Hindu orthodoxy like the Marathi-speaking Poona or the Tamil Conjeeveram. As in the cities — and this in spite of the publicity attendant on the conversion of a few caste converts — the great majority of converts were drawn from the lowest social groups. Local schools were organised, evangelists were trained at the Institutions or by the missionaries at their own bungalows and sent out to work in the country districts (8), and tiny Christian communities began a struggling life.

Then in 1843 the shadow of the Scottish Disruption fell even on those distant outposts. Every attempt had been made to prevent any breath of the controversy from poisoning the infant churches. And fortunately, and to the credit of those most nearly concerned, the effects of the schism were minimised by the determination of each of the newly divided Scottish Churches to maintain to the best of its ability the impetus which up to that time had been shared. Every Scottish missionary but one, a lady, threw in their lot with the Free Church. (9) Buildings owned by the Missions, by far the most valuable being the newly erected college in Calcutta, remained the property of the Church of Scotland, but the Free Church pledged its support, fresh premises were secured when necessary, and the work went on practically unhindered. From the point of view of pupils and even of Indian Christians, little re-orientation was required. They adhered through personal loyalty to the missionaries whom they knew. And these in turn did their best not to stress the differences which:

NOTES

8) Later generations of missionaries, and even more, the creators of missionary policy, tend to forget in their criticism of the "mission compound" system how much personal attention was paid by the early missionaries to the converts and enquirers and how few were the social barriers of that age. "One of our Roman Catholic pupils, a youth of fair talents and attainments, lately entered the Free Church," wrote John Wilson to Alexander Duff. "Another of our pupils was lately baptised at Mangalore — Hadjee, the young Beloochee, gets on very well and so does the young Brahmin who followed us from Kathiawar. Altogether, I have a very full house here. The last individual who joined us is a Chaldean Christian from Baghdad." Letter dated 2nd Nov., 1850, quoted George Smith, "Life of John Wilson", 1878 edition, p.451.

9) Miss Saville, of the Ladies' Association in Calcutta, alone adhered to the Church of Scotland. R.W. Weir, op.cit., p.52.
divided Presbyterians in Scotland. (10)

The new Free Church of Scotland, well off in manpower and lacking only the ready money to support its lion's share of the inheritance, guaranteed the necessary funds. Meanwhile the Established Church's Committee, denuded of its workers, was reporting to its 1844 Assembly, "If the time should ever come when the Church of Scotland loses its missionary spirit, then indeed will its death-knell be rung...." (11) In response to this appeal, before another two years had passed three missionaries had been sent out to Madras to start a school at Blacktown, and two had gone to Bombay and one to Calcutta to re-open the Assembly Institutions. (12) For a full generation to come, however, a shortage of missionary volunteers and the lack, on their part, of the kind of success likely to inspire the minds and loosen the purse-strings of Scottish congregations set a severe limit to the Established Church's endeavours. (13)

For the more active Free Church Missions, the period immediately after the Disruption also saw women's work beginning to gather way. In Bombay, John Wilson's first wife, formerly Margaret Bayne, had opened the first girls' school (14), and soon unmarried women missionaries began to follow in all three capital cities with schools for girls and zenana work - the visitation, with elementary education and Bible instruction, of women and girls whom religious and social sanctions prevented leaving their homes. /

NOTES

12) Ibid., pp. 58 ff.
13) The Church of Scotland's reiterated complaint about a shortage of missionaries was in striking contrast to the Free Church's situation. By 1860, men were volunteering but the Church of Scotland confessed it had no money to employ them. "God has sent us men", reported the Convenor plaintively, "But we cannot send them out for lack of material means." By 1870, the four divinity halls of the Establishment had only supplied three ordained missionaries, the senior of whom had not been overseas for more than three years, and there had been no new volunteers for three successive years. C. of S. Reports for 1861, p. 13: 1862, p. 18: 1871, p. 8. See also 1867 Report, p. 26 and other Reports of the period, passim.
14) George Smith, "Life of John Wilson", pp. 22 and 50
Energy and resources were even found for the initiating of a fourth field. In 1842, the year before the Disruption, John Wilson had received from an army officer, a certain Captain Hill, an offer of £2,500 if his Church would open work in the cantonment city of Nagpur, in Central India. Despite the variety of calls being made on it at the time, the Free Church decided to take up the challenge and the Rev. Stephen Hislop, travelling up-country from Bombay, founded the Nagpur Mission in January, 1845. Itinerative evangelism was attempted in the country districts round the city, but again it was through education and especially higher education in English that the missionaries hoped to win success. In their efforts they had the warm support of several army officers and other Government officials. But to begin with conversions were few and by the time of the Indian Mutiny there had not been more than forty baptisms, although over seven hundred pupils were enrolled in schools. (15)

By the 1850's, the Church of Scotland was finding itself in the not very satisfactory position of supporting one flourishing institution in Calcutta and two others which were only just managing to stay in existence. The Missions had made a few converts, two of whom were training for the ministry, but they were without Christian communities to which such men could minister. Towards the end of the decade informed opinion in Scotland grew stirred by and rather envious of the new ventures into the interior being made by other Missions, and hints were put out that instead of continuing to uphold expensive institutions it would be better to concentrate on India's newly opened territories. By the time another few years had passed, the Assembly's own Committee was going to make this an official recommendation. (16) But this is to move a little too far ahead. The Church of Scotland's missionary efforts had not yet recovered from the shock of the Disruption, and they were not to do so until another twelve or fifteen years had passed.

NOTES

In the longer-established Free Church Missions, the situation was much more promising. On his return to India in 1850 Robert Nesbit remarked on the differences to be seen compared with when he had landed twenty-three years earlier. "A beginning had been made of the evangelism of India. Native sentiment is being modified and swayed by the presence and pressure of Christianity. The native mind is awakened and the native conscience quickened. Native converts have appeared and native churches have sprung up that, taken together, number hundreds of converts. The native Church appears to prosper and be in health: and both conversion and enquiry throw a pleasing light upon its state and prospects". (17) A new beginning had been made in the abandoned field of South Konkan, and on the fringes of Calcutta and Madras also the number of village Christian communities was growing.

By 1857, the end of an era for Indian history, the Free Church Missions at their five centres of Calcutta, Bombay, Poona, Madras and Nagpur could table the visible results of their work as follows:

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Outstations</strong></td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ordained Missionaries</strong></td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Indian Missionaries or Licensed Preachers</strong></td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Preachers or Readers</strong></td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Trained Catechists</strong></td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Communicant Members</strong></td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Christian Community</strong></td>
<td>628</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Baptisms during the past year:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Adults</strong></td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Children</strong></td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Schools</strong></td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Scholars and pupils</strong></td>
<td>8566</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For lack of comparable figures, it is difficult to assess so exactly the progress made by the Church of Scotland, but the following statistics relating to 1865 give some idea of their comparative achievements.

**NOTES**


18) Free Church Report, 1858, Statistics.
Missionaries and European Agents 13
Indian Pastors 4
Trained Catechists 10
Christian Teachers 32
Communicant Members 250
School Pupils 2500 (19)

For both Churches, a start had been made, but progress had not yet gone far enough to define even in outline the shape of things to come.

2. 1857 – 1900.

The Mutiny stands out as one of the great water-sheds of Indian history. It may be regarded from the viewpoint of an unabashed imperialism — "Perhaps a more fortunate occurrence — never took place in India" (20); or from that of a passionate and indignant nationalism — "For India, (it meant) organised exploitation, loss of freedom and dignity as a nation" (21). Either way, it divided as by a narrow ridge the rivers running back into the antiquities of early Aryan culture from those which flow forward through the period of British rule and the achievement of independence into the future. It began the formation of modern India.

The Mutiny was certainly no isolated incident, but on the contrary provided a point of fusion for forces which had been coming into closer contact with each other for over two centuries. Yet for India and Britain alike, those few months were decisive. Had European supremacy not been confirmed, the British occupation of India might well have proved little more than a passing phase in the latter's history, exerting little influence on its future course. In the event, these two highly dissimilar races were for three further generations bound together in one bundle of life. In the clash between East and West, the West, which claimed to stand for progress against obscurantism and humanitarian enlightenment against ancient corruption and

NOTES
19) Church of Scotland Report, 1866, Statistics.
20) Sir Lepel Griffin, quoted in "The Oxford History of India", p.725.
21) Sisirkumar Mitra, "Resurgent India", p.50
superstition, had for the moment emerged triumphant. For the better part of another century it was to underline, to its own satisfaction at least, the essential rightness of such a victory. (22)

The East India Company, which in 1813 had lost its legal monoply of trade and twenty years later been deprived of its commercial functions, was after 1858 superseded by the British Crown itself, which governed by a system of dual control through the India Secretary in London and the Queen's Viceroy in Calcutta. For the next half-century this government was to follow a steady course whose direction seldom wavered. After those months of violent and dreadful events there came a period of peace interrupted only on the fringes of this huge sub-continent by the second Afghan and third Burmese wars. With the exception of a series of famines, of which the first caught the Government unprepared and one other proved catastrophic in the number of deaths it caused, it was a half-century of peace and reasonable prosperity. (23)

NOTES.

22) European authorities call the event "The Mutiny", Indian authorities call it "The Rebellion." Strictly speaking, it was a sepoy and not a national uprising, a spontaneous and not very well organised attempt to throw off the British yoke. To this extent it was technically a mutiny on the part of the Indian army. Yet behind it lay many social, political and religious factors which gave it the character of a conservative reaction against increasing pressure from the West. In this sense it did indeed express rebellion. To avoid confusion, the traditional term has been used here. See e.g. P.E. Roberts, op.cit., pp.360, ff.; J.C. Powell Price, op.cit., pp.546 ff.; J.M. Mitchell, "In Western India" David Douglas, Edinburgh, 1899, pp.359, ff.; G.M. Trevelyan, op.cit., pp.319 ff.

23) In the famine of 1866, which was at its worst in Orissa, the death roll in British territory alone is estimated to have come to between one and two millions. Within another two years, when another famine hit Rajputana, the principle had been established that the civil authority must take all possible steps to avert starvation. There followed a famine of modest severity in 1873-74, then the worst and most widespread of all in 1876-78, when again many millions died. Finally came the prolonged drought and famine, followed by recurrent epidemics of plague, in the closing years of the century. See P.E. Roberts, op.cit., pp.403-404, 421, 452, 514. The two famines which most directly affected the work of Scottish Missions were those in Rajputana in 1866 and the widespread distress of the 1890's. There is no subject on which British administrators and Indian nationalists disagree more violently than the adequacy or inadequacy of the British Famine Code.
It was also a period of material, moral and intellectual progress, in which changes and reforms took place without revolution. The improvements in communications which had been begun before 1857 under Lord Dalhousie, and which contributed their share both to causing and quelling the Mutiny, were continued. Along with them went other developments in commerce and education, in agrarian and legal reform, in the constitution of the army and the civil service, and in religious toleration and the further control of religious excesses. State universities were established, roads and railways and the telegraph systems extended, local forms of taxation were revised and diplomacy embarked on a new series of treaties with Native States (24).

From the point of view of the Christian missionary especially if he was British and a Protestant, this was all to the good. It should be clear from the previous chapter that missionaries by no means supported every government measure. And Christian consciences always remained aware of the wrongs perpetrated by Britons in the past, for which they felt some form of reparation was required.

But during the shock and horror of the Mutiny itself, the white population of India had naturally drawn together for protection and support. Public prayers such as the following produced by the Church of England left the Almighty with no room for doubt where His duty lay — "Defend, we pray Thee, our countrymen from the malice and treachery of the sons of violence who have risen up against them, rebuke the madness of the people and stay the hand of the destroyer — Teach the natives of British India to prize the benefits which thy good Providence has given them through the supremacy of this Christian land." (25).

NOTES

24) See "Oxford History of India", pp.732 ff; P.E. Roberts, op.cit. pp.387., etc. The complicated and detailed reforms carried out by the Indian Civil Service are described by Michael Edwards, who is in other respects a refreshingly sane and impartial observer, as "the most outstanding series of experiments in administration ever known." ("The Last Years of British India", P.17).

25) Quoted R. Reynolds, "White Sahibs in India", p.54.
even men like Alexander Duff, who would have shrunk from using such language, faithfully did their musket drill until the danger was over. (26)

The typical attitude of the Scottish Christian may be described as a compound of relief that the terror was over, guilt for past wrongs and confidence that the Almighty was opening new doors of opportunity. "Dark and troubled as is the Indian sky" ran an editorial in the U.P. "Missionary Record" in 1858, "We perceive in the distance the bow of promise. We have obtained possession of India by means which no one can justify - Let us make the best amends we can for past wrongs governing that great country on the just and equal principles of the Gospel - A happy future, in our opinion, is before India." (27)

A few years later the Church of Scotland, for whom the link between Church and State was a matter of much importance, was declaring, "A higher honour cannot be bestowed by Almighty God upon our Church than His permitting us to take part in the greatest work in His universe - that of advancing the Kingdom of His Son upon earth - The region of the earth assigned to us as the sphere of our labour is now a portion of the British Empire, conquered by our arms, obtained by awful sacrifices of human suffering and life, and given to us by a series of Providences which mark it as a solemn gift from God to be used by us for great and noble ends." (28)

If Providence had established British rule in India, then clearly it must be behind every effort to minister honourably the needs of the people. This was certainly the assumption on which Western Missions acted from this time forward. As St. Paul had pursued his journeys under the protecting hand of the Pax Romana, so now to a far greater extent his successors in the preaching of the Gospel to all nations accepted the Pax Britannica as an instrument of divine blessing. In education, after the founding of the three Provincial universities and the offer of grants-in-aid (29), the expansion of missionary work frequently depended on the amount of grants received.

**NOTES.**

26) Quoted R. Reynolds, "White Sahibs in India", p.54.
27) U.P. Missionary Record" editorial, Jan. 1858, pp.3-4.
28) C. of S. Report, 1865, P.27. A distinct difference of outlook will be noticed between the Church of Scotland, which was Tory and pro-establishment, and the U.P. Church which had strong Liberal leanings.
29) Both stemmed from the Education Despatch of 1854.
Schools, now staffed whenever possible with Christian teachers, provided contacts with non-Christians and a means of training converts. When elementary education also came to be included in the grants-in-aid system, these subsidies could account for 30% and more of a Mission's total income. (30). And the moral and practical support given by soldiers, government officials, planters and other British civilians had much to do with the success of all but the very isolated Missions, especially in the early stages of their growth. (31).

Of almost equal importance to Western Missions in India, besides the fact that they grew under the shadow of an imperial administration which aided their work, was the whole question of the relationship between the British and Indian races. It affected alike the attitude of the missionary and that of the Indians with whom he came in contact. In his contacts with non-Christians it greatly influenced the results of the missionary's efforts at evangelism, while his relations with Christian converts shaped the character of the Church. For reasons outlined in the previous chapter, the relationship was not a natural one.

Accordingly, in spite of good intentions on the part of missionaries, it was the cause of many difficulties. And although these had been inherent in the situation at an earlier date, after the Mutiny they became greatly magnified. At the root of the trouble were the white man's foreignness and the sense of superiority which it was seldom possible for him to hide.

From the time of Plassey onwards, the number of Europeans resident in India, though never large, had been growing steadily. After the traders came the soldiers and then in their wake the administrators.

---

**NOTES.**

30) Consult the statistics for almost any large Mission from the 1880's onwards. The proportion could on occasion be over 50%.

31) Of the eight Scottish Mission fields, only Santalas was too isolated to have contacts with Europeans. And here the early missionaries stood almost in loco parentis for the Government, obtaining in return support and privileges.
Communication with the homeland being slow and often erratic, involving as it did a round trip of almost a year by the Cape of Good Hope (32), these men — and the men greatly outnumbered the woman — found their interests in the country of their exile. Frequently their moral standards were not of the highest, drink, gambling and the European zenanas being the accepted relaxations of their leisure hours. Quite a few of the better educated maintained social contacts with cultured Indians of both the Hindu and the Moslem faiths. And being tolerably familiar already with the Greek and Roman classics, some Company officials studied Sanskrit, Persian or Arabic and acquired in time a genuine appreciation for Indian literature and philosophy. It was men of this type, able also to converse fluently in the national language of their Province, who formed the "Orientalist" group in Calcutta in the early years of the Nineteenth Century. Their links were those of liking and respect rather than intimacy. Yet there were other Europeans too who mixed at less intellectual levels. Sometimes through marriage, more often by unofficial relationships, they made alliances, and through their wives and concubines and Eurasian children acquired a strong personal stake in the country.

**NOTES.**

32) A letter written by Warren Hastings to his wife in 1785, after his family had left India to return to Britain, informs us that it took eight months for him to learn that they had safely reached St. Helena. (Quoted Hilton Brown, "The Sahibs" p.85). The overland route from Suez across Egypt was not introduced until about 1830.

33) Of mixed Anglo-Indian or Anglo-Eurasian marriages, an article appearing in the "Asiatic Journal" in 1835 says: "The female Eurasians constitute a large proportion of the married women at up-country stations. Many of them are united to persons of respectable condition, in both services, at the presidencies: and for the most part, they perform the part of wives with tolerable effect." (Quoted from "Anglo-India Social, Moral and Political", a collection of Papers from the Asiatic Journal", 3 Volumes, London, W.H. Allen & Co. 1856, p.135. Of other relationships we read that in the time of Warren Hastings it was considered a faux pas for the Governor to invite to a social function "Mr. So-and-So and his Wife". The more tactful form of invitation was addressed to "Mr. So-and-So and lady". (Quoted Hilton Brown, op.cit. P.142). By the time of the Mutiny it was becoming a moot point whether a regimental officer should be permitted to appear at a public function such as a race meeting with an "unauthorised companion". (See Russell, "My Diary of India, 1857-58", quoted Hilton Brown op.cit., P.258)
As the number of British residents increased, however, there began to
grow up a separate social life. From this Indians were not at first deliberately
excluded. But as the British function slipped from trade to empire and from
embassies to administration, there was less of dependence on Indian co-operation and
and more of responsibility taken voluntarily on British shoulders. Purely in the
interests of efficiently, those shoulders began to bow under the earliest
 intimations of the white man's burden. In the 1780's, Lord Cornwallis had laid
the foundations of a new and white-skinned aristocracy by excluding Indians from
higher government posts, thereby stamping out corruption at the cost of
 participation. His successor, Sir John Shore, carried the movement into the
social sphere by ceasing regularly to invite Indians and Eurasians to entertain-
ments at Government House. The atmosphere round the ruling oligarchy grew more
olympian and aloof. And "The habit of speaking or writing of Indians as of some
strange order of beings unaccountable in their constitution and actions — from
being the custom of the Calcutta class of 'low Europeans' became the fashionable
and dominant attitude."(34)

"It is one of the ironies of European relations in India", writes T.G.P.
Spear, historian and social commentator, "That the purging of the administration
coincided with the widening of the gulf".(35) A double current may here be observed.
As the European population increased, and the imperial net spread wider, there grew
up a more general acquaintance with the surface characteristics of Indian life.
At the same time there developed a contempt for things Indian as irrational,
superstitious, dirty, barbaric and inferior.

The causes of this attitude were as complex as its results and cannot
simply be traced back to the public school upbringing of the English upper classes.
It became practically universal. "Europeans have little connexion with natives
of either religion, except for business", wrote a Captain Williamson in 1810.(36)

NOTES

35) Ibid., p.129
   Vol. 1, p.347
"This mixture of nations", observed a young Englishwoman visiting Calcutta about the same time, "Ought, I think, to weaken national prejudices. But among the English at least, the effect seems diametrically opposite. Every Briton seems to pride himself outrageously on being a John Bull." (37).

Among the most superior and aloof, and with least reason for it, were the British women who were more and more setting the tone for Westernised society. "It is wonderful how little interested most of the English ladies seem by all the strange habits and ways of the natives", remarked another young visitor. "I asked one lady what she had seen of the country and the natives since she had been in India. 'Oh, nothing,' she said 'Thank goodness, nothing at all about them, nor I don't wish to: really I think the less one sees and knows of them the better'" (38).

John Cobden, who was of the opinion that the British character was being deteriorated and its love of freedom impaired by our acting the part of "despot and butcher" in India (39), also spoke scathingly of women he had met who were the wives of British Officers in India. They commonly referred to Indians as "niggers", and one woman congratulated herself on her broad-mindedness in allowing an Indian officer to sit in her presence when he came to her husband for orders. "Such things", remarked Cobden, "would be bearable if the English in India displayed exalted virtues and high intellectual powers", but he feared the reverse was the case. (40)

The combination of prejudice, ignorance, insensitiveness, conceit and bad manners is unfortunately only too familiar. Here were its beginnings. As women echoed the opinions of their fathers and husbands, and men accepted from their women-folk the boundaries of a social circle based on a rigid hierarchy, spiced with gossip.

---

NOTES:

38) "Letters from Madras" by a lady 1836-38. Quoted Hilton Brown op-cit. P.250.
40) Quoted R. Reynolds, op.cit., P.56.
gossip and drawing its knowledge of Indian character from the misdeeds of domestic servants, and the Anglo-Indian community, as it grew larger, also grew narrower. And proportionately as more men found it possible to live something approaching a normal home life, the horizon of that life contracted.

One might hope that Christian faith and ethics would have furnished a force sufficient to counter the trend, but unfortunately that was not the case. The more regular became the church-going, the wider grew the gulf. And by another irony the same influences which helped to stiffen the moral fibre of Anglo-Indian society also emphasised its separation from its environment.

The practice of the Christian religion had, at least in its outward forms, been strictly observed in the early days of the Company. For most of the Eighteenth Century it had in fact been the focus of the life of the European "factory" or trading post. Daily prayers were compulsory, Sunday services a form of state function, and each provincial Governor had been required to lay down a series of fines to be levied for the offences of blasphemy, lying, drunkenness or adultery. (41) Yet the very fact such strictness was necessary shows how prevalent such vices must have been, and throws light on Clive's description of India's capital as "one of the most wicked places in the Universe". (42) Company chaplains were seldom men of much character, however, and by the end of the Eighteenth Century a more easy-going moral outlook had turned the Sunday morning parade into a mere form and a convenient occasion for examining new arrivals off the latest ship to dock. The church dropped out of the centre of official corporate life, to be replaced by the race-course and the Governor's balls and levees. (43).

The Nineteenth Century brought more sincerity back into the observances of religion, as evangelical zeal joined hands with the Victorian respect for duty, order and sobriety. After David Brown, Claudius Buchanan and the saintly Henry Martyn, there came a new school of chaplains who refilled the churches, though fashion still preferred the race-course and the balls. (44).

41) T.G.P. Spear, *op.cit.*, P.12.  
42) Quoted Taya Zinkin, *"India",* Thames and Hudson, 1965, P.41.  
44) See C.H. Robinson, *"History of Christian Missions",* p.84.
Evangelical influences like those radiating out from the Clapham sect grew stronger and, by the 1850's, soldiers and civil servants like Herbert Edwardes, John Nicholson and the Lawrence brothers were as popular with missionaries for their proselytising enthusiasm as they were disliked by some of their seniors or colleagues for stirring up the fears of orthodox Hindus and Muslims. (45) Scottish lay men and women were among those who shared most strongly in the missionary spirit.

Yet admirable though such Christian enthusiasm might be in itself, like Macaulay's black-and-white opinionativeness it was only too often unable to see any but its own point of view. We have already taken note of the fact that for Alexander Duff Hinduism could never be described as plain Hinduism, but must be "that hideous and gigantic system of Pantheism and Idolatry". (46) It was rare to find a man like Schwartz of Tanjore who was able to rise above the view which automatically blackened all things Hindu, and even Carey, for all his breadth of vision, was fundamentally at one with his fellow-missionaries in this. Indiscriminate criticism of Indian religion led to undiscriminating contempt for Indian society as corrupt beyond redemption. And the well-intentioned strictures of missionaries against the "abominations of heathenism", besides causing resentment in the minds of their hearers, more often confirmed Europeans in their sense of superiority than it roused them to action as ambassadors for Christ.

NOTES

45) "The evangelising zeal of some of the best Englishmen in India, lay as well as clerical, is generally reckoned as one of the causes contributing to the Mutiny" concludes G.M. Trevelyan. (Op.cit., p.319).

The Governor-General when the Mutiny started, Lord Canning, had a genuine personal admiration for the Lawrences, particularly for his immediate successor, Sir John. But he is reported to have said of the equally evangelical Herbert Edwardes, in a fit of irritation, that he was "exactly what Mohammed would have been if born at Clapham instead of Mecca". (Quoted Hilton Brown, op.cit. p.62.)

After the Mutiny, the political, social and religious tendencies which we have been describing were all accelerated and Anglo-Indian society started hardening into its fixed mould. The "brightest jewel" became after 1858 an official ornament of the Crown. (47) India's rulers became more and not less of a race apart. The steamship, the telegraph and, most revolutionary of all changes, the Suez Canal, progressively reduced the problems of communication and thereby added to the size and mobility of the European community. And strengthening links with Europe meant weakening links with Asia. (48)

These processes of modernisation brought with them the white women and the white children. By 1874, when a notice appeared in "The Times" of the birth of the infant Winston Spencer Churchill, it was immediately followed by no less than four notices of upper-class English babies born to English mothers in British India or Burma. (49) The actual administrative force kept in India by Parliament was always incredibly small for the size of the country. British military and civil personnel together probably never exceeded 170,000 in number. (50) Yet if the numbers were insufficient to prevent a sense of isolation, they were enough to supply custom and order and build up a self-sufficient white culture within a brown nation.

Fear played its part in this. The shadow of the Mutiny lay darkly on European minds, and began by shaking to the foundations the mutual confidence.

NOTES

47) It was the Scotsman, Henry Dundas, who had spoken of India many years earlier, after the loss of the American colonies, as "the brightest jewel that now remains in his Majesty's crown". Parliamentary History, Vol. XXII, c.1265.

48) The telegraph line between Britain and India was opened in 1865, the Suez Canal in 1869. According to British historians, it was one very significant result of this improvement in communications that rule by the Governor-General in India was now superseded by a system of dual control from London and Calcutta. See e.g. G.M. Trevelyan, op.cit., p.323.

49) "The Times", issue No. 28,176 of 2nd Dec., 1874. The succeeding four entries are of births to military families at Rangoon, Bombay, Ranchi and Belgaum.

50) See Kate L. Mitchell, "India Without Fable", Alfred A. Knopf, Inc., 1942. Figures for 1931 are 168,000.
which had slowly been growing between incomer and Indian. "Everything here is at a stand-still and all life has gone out of us", wrote Murray Mitchell from Bombay, the capital of a loyal Province in which not one European death had occurred. "European society and native society are like cliffs which have been torn asunder". (51) And John Wilson's biographer, George Smith, himself a civil servant of considerable experience, added on later reflection, "The ruling class, the civil, military and mercantile communities who emerged from the two years' conflict with barbarism at its worst had lost all confidence in the permanence, not of our rule but of our intentions. They ceased to trust the natives and to like the country." (52)

Too much weight must not be placed on such opinions, for the shock passed and the British went on to place in their institutions more confidence than ever. Yet the fear remained, no less powerful for being driven underground, the Mutiny supplying a point of focus for that instinctive and revulsive terror against what is different, incalculable and dangerous. Being largely subconscious, it would for the most part go unrecognised on the part of those who were afraid. Yet to the more astute Indian observers it was apparent. "The fear of the people runs through all their thought and policy", declared Jawaharlal Nehru in more recent years, "For they did not want to and could not merge with them and were destined to remain an isolated foreign ruling group surrounded by an entirely different and hostile humanity." (53) It gave the European, so heavily outnumbered, a sense of security to realise his innate superiority to the Indian who was either servile and effeminate or faithless and cruel. He - and even more to the point, she - was more than the equal of the black man creeping through the darkness with a knife gripped between his/

NOTES
51) J.M. Mitchell, "In Western India", p. 359
52) George Smith, "Life of John Wilson", p. 318
Though it can easily be exaggerated, the element of fear was a very relevant factor in the relations between Indians and Europeans. It was often mutual, and it had its effect on the Indian Church.

As a bulwark to him in his isolation, the Britisher also had his church and his religion, which he supported with a loyalty that could be deep and genuine. Yet though he believed, on the whole, that the christianisation of India would be good for the country and the people, he did not conceive of such a process as actually bringing Indians closer to him in thought and outlook, much less in other ways. Sometimes his low opinion of Indian Christians, who invariably came from the most backward classes, led him to think that Indians were better to remain under their own system. Either way, while his religious faith helped him to do justly and love mercy, it did not encourage him to walk with great humility. It was a comforting element of his national background rather than a challenge to his whole way of living.

In this heathen land, where religious toleration forbade the Government to favour one religion against another (55), it was yet the ordinances of the Christian religion which were maintained by the Indian exchequer. It was the duty of the Britisher to back up his chaplain and he did so. Church-going became a recognised custom, Sunday was made a statutory day of rest for government employees, and Anglo-India adopted the mantle of Victorian respectability. Its sobriety was such that it was remarked of the Parisian-born Viceroy, /

NOTES

54) For a well-documented discourse on the presence of an element of fear, see T.G.P. Spear, op.cit., pp. 141-142.

55) The Indian "Magna Carta", proclaimed on 1st November, 1858, promised in the revised draft requested by the Queen that "so far as may be, our subjects of whatever race or creed, be freely and impartially admitted to office in our service, the duties of which they are qualified by their education, ability and integrity duly to discharge". (Quoted P.E. Roberts, op.cit., p.384)
Lord Lytton, that "The Puritan and Philistine graces of Simla were repugnant to him". (56)

In Britain, the Victorian age was already past its zenith. The dust of the Mutiny had hardly settled before, three thousand miles away, Darwin's "Origin of the Species" and Huxley's vindication of scientific freedom against the orthodox theology of Bishop Wilberforce had sown the first seeds of intellectual doubt and revolt against religious beliefs and conventions. (57) But it was to be another twenty years before the results would be visible in terms of widespread social change. And even then the flouting of popular Christian sanctions was enough, in the case of Parnell, to bring down a government. (58) In this respect Anglo-India, for all its professions of gaiety and fashion, was well behind the times. If its women-folk gossiped and talked scandal, the very great majority still held the home and the marriage-bed to be sacred. In its profession of the Christian faith it was sincere. But the distinguishing lines between worship of the Father of our Lord Jesus Christ, pride and loyalty towards the Empire and adherence to the moral standards favoured by the small regal figure whose statue stood in so many of India's public parks were no longer very clear. The result was that, for the bulk of India's people, the religion of the Britisher was a matter of irrelevance. It was an aspect of his foreignness. The missionary's words were not commended in his hearer's ears because this faith was one whose power and truth were being witnessed to by others of the/

NOTES


58) Ibid., pp. 404-408.
missionary's race. What the missionary said about Christianity bore little relation to what the Indian saw reflected in the life of the white sahib. On the other hand, it could be a point against the missionary that he must be identified as one of that foreign race.

The situation of the Western missionary was similar to that of the Western soldier or administrator in this respect also, that besides being a foreigner and isolated he had great power and usually believed it necessary to use that power. British colonial expansion in the East had taken place primarily out of a desire to further and protect the nation's trade. But once Parliament found itself responsible for dependent territories a policy for their oversight was gradually evolved. This policy, generally given the title of Trusteeship, rested on two main pillars: first, that colonial government must be for the good of the people governed; and second, that it should lead in time to independence and self-government.

The principle of responsibility, or government for the good of those governed, had been enunciated for India by Edmund Burke when he told Parliament in 1783, "All political power which is set over men, and -- all privilege claimed or exercised in exclusion of them, being wholly artificial and for so much a derogation from the natural equality of mankind at large, ought to be some way or other exercised ultimately for their benefit." (59) From 1784, The Company's administration had come under Government control. And gradually it was accepted that "commercial connection involved for the stronger of the two parties a moral obligation to ensure, as far as might be, that the weaker party did not suffer from that/

NOTES

59) Edmund Burke, Speech on Fox's East India Bill, House of Commons, 1 December, 1783.
This sense of responsibility was strongly reinforced, by the 1850's, by the belief that the rule of India was a trust given to the British not by man but by God. "We have not been elected or placed in power by the people, but we are here through our moral superiority, by the force of circumstances and by the will of Providence. This alone constitutes our charter to govern India," stated John Lawrence, the newly appointed Governor-General, in 1858. (61)

His colleague, Sir Herbert Edwards, reviewing the events of the Mutiny, showed himself even more firmly convinced when he said in a public speech reviewing the providences of God during the Mutiny, "These things are wonderful. In them we hear the voice of God. And what says that voice? The voice says, 'India is your charge. I gave India into the hands of England. I did not give it solely for your benefit. I gave it for the benefit of my 180 millions of creatures. I gave it to you to whom I gave the best thing man can have - the Bible, the knowledge of the only true God. I gave it to you that you might communicate this light and knowledge and truth to these my heathen creatures.'" (62)

This responsibility was not thought of, to begin with, as more than a temporary burden. It was not an issue that in the course of time India would achieve independence. In 1818 the Governor-General of the day, Lord Hastings (not to be confused with Warren Hastings), had explained how he looked forward to "a time not very remote - when England will, on sound principles of policy, wish to relinquish the domination which she has/

NOTES

gradually and unintentionally assumed over this country." (63) It was seen as the duty of the British administration to work towards such a consummation. "It ought undoubtedly to be our aim to raise the minds of the natives and to take care that whenever our connection with India might cease, it did not appear that the only fruit of our domination there had been to leave the people more abject and less able to govern themselves than before we found them," wrote Sir Thomas Munro twelve years later. (64) And it was taken as self-evident that it would be despicable for the British power, however long its rule lasted, to seek for its own ends to delay the hour of emancipation. "I am very far from wishing to proceed hastily in this delicate matter", Parliament was told by Macaulay, "I feel that, for the good of India herself, the admission of natives to high office must be effected by slow degrees. But that, when the fullness of time is come, we ought to refuse to make that change lest we endanger our own power -- this is a doctrine which I cannot think of without indignation." (65)

The British Government then, was committed officially to an administration which would rule India for its own good and at the same time to working for the country's eventual independence. The trouble was that the two principles could appear contradictory and to the British they appeared so increasingly as time went on. There became evident a growing reluctance to hand over the reins of power.

British rule had to do its best, but "in doing the best we can for the/

NOTES


people we are bound by our conscience, not theirs." (66) And while it must be England's policy to set India free, her first duty, as Sir Herbert Edwardes pointed out, was to fit her for that freedom. (67) The result was prevarication and delay in every instance when responsibility might have been placed in Indian hands. It becomes one of the most striking aspects of Britain's occupation that, while it started as a temporary phenomenon, the longer it lasted the more permanent and necessary it was claimed to be. The sense of responsibility remained, but the practical end of freedom receded.

In 1818 the Governor-General might speak publicly about the relinquishment of British domination. But forty years later this vision was much less clear and by the time seventy or eighty years had passed it had faded almost entirely. "In India", wrote Sir Robert Montgomery in 1871, "We set the people aside altogether: we desire and say that such and such is a good thing to be done and we carry it out without asking them very much about it." (68) By the 1880's the British historian Seeley was writing, "A time may conceivably come round when it may be practicable to leave India to herself, but at present it is necessary to govern her as if we were to govern her for ever." (69) In so saying, he was doing no more than echo the opinion of the men on the spot. "We cannot foresee the time in which the cessation/

NOTES

66) Lord Bentinck, quoted M.D. Lewis, op.cit., p.65.
67) Sir Herbert Edwardes, quoted M.D. Lewis, op.cit., p.67.
of our rule would not be the signal for universal anarchy and ruin" wrote Sir John Strachey in a similar vein, "And it is clear that the only hope for India in the long continuance of the benevolent but strong government of Englishmen. Let us give to the natives the largest possible share in the administration. But let there be no hypocrisy about our intention to keep in the hands of our own people those executive posts -- on which -- our actual hold of the country extends." (70)

A full generation later, the idea of imperialism as a state of permanent occupation had reached its full flower under one of India's greatest Viceroy, Lord Curzon. "I am not one of those who think" he made it known, "that we have built a mere fragile plank between the East and the West which the roaring tides of Asia will presently sweep away.... As the years roll by, the call seems to me more clear, the duty more imperative, the work more majestic, the goal more sublime --- To me the message is carved in granite, it is hewn out of the rock of doom --- that our work is righteous and that it shall endure."(71)

The current did not always run without a ripple and under Lord Ripon, significantly the only Viceroy ever to find himself more popular with Indians than with his fellow-countrymen, a deliberate attempt was made to divert the stream back to its original course. "It is not primarily with a view to improvement in administration that this measure is put forward" he explained, when introducing one of his reforms. "It is chiefly desirable as an instrument of political and popular education." (72) The waters were running/

NOTES


71) Quoted P.B. Roberts, op.cit., p. 556.

72) Quoted Ibid., p. 465.
much too strongly to be turned, however. Peace, justice, good order and above all the efficiency on which those things rested appeared more and more plainly to depend on British leadership. The reversal of this trend was not a voluntary act, but forced on the British by Indian pressure.

These developments are of importance because the attitude of the civil servant was reflected in that of the missionary. It was not a case of politics influencing religion, but of men from the same background, sharing the same unconscious assumptions while performing work of a similar nature. The missionary also had a strong sense of responsibility. There was no question but that he was seeking the good of the people. And the rise of an independent national Church was one of his professed aims and dearest desires. Yet that very sense of responsibility, coupled with a feeling of God-given superiority, helped to set him more or less permanently in a dominating position from which he was loath to retire. In the following chapters we shall be meeting constantly with statements made by missionaries in which they deplore lack of progress or their converts' lack of independent spirit, and decide with honestly professed reluctance that they must continue to take charge. The heresy of "gradualism" was indeed, as Donald McGavran points out, a weakness of most Western Missions. (73) Because the Church failed to grow, missionaries settled down to the idea that the present stage would be one of consolidation, and growth the characteristic only of some unforeseeable future. "Much success cannot be claimed from the baptisms which have taken place in the/

NOTES

Mission" wrote the Rev. James Dawson from Chindwara. "If a flourishing congregation, a largely attended church or largely attended schools, or both, be regarded — as an indispensable condition of a successful Mission, then I must frankly say that my mission all these years in Chindwara has been a failure. But there may be sowing without reaping, there may be some fields in which one may have to sow and another reap." (74) In the case of Indian Missions, the presence of the civil power gave an added sense of permanence to scenes of missionary occupation.

The conquest of India within its own natural frontiers being now completed, after 1858 the British Government took over full responsibility for its pacification, protection and administration. Four years before the Mutiny, the Indian civil service had, on Macaulay's advice, been thrown open to competition and the long tradition of patronage under the Haileybury monopoly passed away. (75) For a few years, until the older hands had got used to the change-over, there were sneers at the "Competition Wallahs" (76) Yet the increase in efficiency was very great, and although administration and reform grew more impersonal, the machine eventually achieved a standard that has not been surpassed before or since. Nor is it just to suggest, although some of their experiments revealed a certain frigidity, that the attitude of British civil servants was predominantly one of cold impartiality. "They did much/
good, for their tyranny was inspired by the belief, however arrogantly expressed, that they knew what was best for India", writes Michael Edwardes. He goes on to make the point that many British administrators became "passionately involved" in India. (77)

This activity of organisation and reform, as we have already seen, was regarded by British church people as an aid to their work and a preparing of the way of the Lord. "Inveterate prejudices are overthrown" declared one typical Mission Report of the 1850's, "Roads are opened: electric communications are employed: moral marvels have been wrought: European media of civilisation of every kind are rife: in short, Providence and Revelation, like two witnesses, attest that the day of India's emancipation has dawned." (78)

The conviction that God was using the civil power to further His greater ends continued to grow, until a new peak was reached with the Queen's Jubilee Report of 1887. That report called on Scottish churchmen to note that "our Empire has grown until we have become responsible for a fourth of mankind --- Our wealth has swollen even more rapidly. Our mother tongue has become the Christianising and civilising speech of the earth, carrying to a thousand million --- that divine revelation who, to all who believe, is the power and wisdom of God unto salvation." (79)/

NOTES

77) Michael Edwardes, op.cit., p.17.

78) F.C. Report, 1853, p.6. Though written a few years before the Mutiny, the extract can be matched with many others over the next two decades. See e.g., letter from Alexander Duff to the F.C. Committee, included in the Report for 1856 or C. of S. Report 1875, p.5.

79) F.C. Report, 1887, p.5.
No present-day reader could fail to discern in statements such as those quoted in the foregoing a note of unconscious arrogance which was bound to cause certain resentments. It could on occasion, because it was the father of ignorance and indifference, lead to injustice and even cruelty. But its most disastrous effect was to render impossible natural and friendly relations between white and brown, ruler and ruled. The dust raised by India’s Independence Day has hardly settled long enough for an objective assessment to be made of the virtues and weaknesses of the British Raj. Certainly "impartial" studies up to date vary tremendously. There are those who would claim ninety years at least during which justice was firmly administered, peace kept among rival communal groups and progress made in agriculture, industry, trade and education. And it is anybody’s guess how the loss of millions of lives in famine years might have been balanced against loss through war and massacre, had the races of India retained their autonomy or some other European power had stepped in. Yet by no means at the other extreme, reputable, middle-of-the-road Congress historians can describe the same period as a record of terrorism, selfish oppression, middle and overweening humiliation.

Among such controversial issues there is one fact which stands out in dreadful clarity. It was not maladministration or economic exploitation which turned educated India, and then the uneducated masses, against British rule. Mistakes can be forgotten and even acts of cruelty or injustice be forgiven. It was the arrogance of the ruler which rankled and the humiliation experienced by the ruled which was remembered. It was the men who were kept waiting on the verandahs, spoken about in loud voices as if they were not bodily present, barred from clubs, denied promotion, thrown out of railway carriages and covered by dust from the passing European’s carriage who turned to history and read into it a story of cunning and deliberate/
exploitation. Mahatma Gandhi turned against the British administration not on grounds of past history but because of its contemporary attitude.

"It stands to the credit of those Englishmen who, holding the higher posts in the administration, have been the actual rulers in India, that with few exceptions they have behaved like gentlemen" writes Sir Reginald Coupland. "If, being British, they have been stiff and undemonstrative and have tended to keep themselves to themselves, there have been many cases of close and equal friendships between them and their Indian colleagues. Unfortunately, however, Englishmen in India have not all been gentlemen, whether by upbringing or nature. Too many of them - and of Englishwomen also - have claimed from Indians a deference inconceivable on any grounds but those of race and, worse still, sometimes enforced the claim with unpardonable insolence." (81)

This is a reasonable statement, but does not allow for the fact that the insolence spoken of was a characteristic not only of certain individuals but of much of the administration itself. "As if to negative this (i.e. positive and progressive) side of British rule", says Ram Gopal in judgment, "There was the haughtiness of the British rulers. They looked down upon Indians and insulted and humiliated them". (82) As late as 1938 a handbook published by/

NOTES

80) This is very significantly the main difference in outlook between a man of the Congress right-wing centre like Ram Gopal and a left-wing extremist such as R. Palme Dutt. The two pictures of British exploitation are similar in outline, but while the latter speaks in terms of "the masses" or "the people", the former speaks from that personal sense of recollected humiliation which is as typical and sincere as it is sometimes exaggerated.


82) Ram Gopal, op.cit., p.34: see also Chapter V, pp.107 ff.
the Indian army for the guidance of British troops and widely distributed described the outstanding characteristics of the native, particularly of the servant class, as those of the habitual liar and giver and taker of bribes. "Indian servants should not be allowed to become "upish" or "insolent" it added: and with a crowning touch of wisdom, "It is inadvisable to throw an Indian out of a railway carriage: yet he no more wants your company than you want his." (83)

This whole atmosphere, which we may seem to have taken a long time to describe, became a matter of almost incalculable importance to the Indian churches whose history we are to follow. For while cruelty, injustice and oppression were certainly not marks of missionary activity and benevolence was, yet the unconscious sense of superiority was carried over into the things of the spirit and sometimes also the underlying fear. Those qualities experienced a mutation, since the missionary was not a wholly distant figure, but a father-in-God, representing the love of a Saviour as well as the wisdom of a Creator. He knew the convert's language, he spoke with him at his work and prayed with him in his home. The cold efficiency of the administrator was turned into a firm, warm paternalism. Yet because within his own sphere he also had the power, even as the administrator was feared, obeyed, respected and sometimes hated, so the missionary, though he was sometimes loved, was also respected, feared and obeyed. Because in both relationships the Indian's position was one of helplessness, there grew up resentment. At the political level, this issued in revolt. Within Christian communities, it resulted in withdrawal. Because they were not really treated and trusted as wholly adult and responsible human beings, Indian Christians did not behave as such.

NOTES

Or at least they reached such standards of behaviour only slowly and partially.

The social barriers put up by missionaries emphasised the cleavage. Those barriers not only divided men, but rather than separate the Christian from the heathen they separated white from black. Hospitality was extended to the white atheist, drunkard or adulterer, not because he was the missionary's friend but because he was his equal. That same hospitality was denied to the black saint whose soul might be pure but his body carried fleas.

Such distinctions were not calculated, neither were they total or universal. But they were implicit in the situation, so that Indian Christians also came to accept from their mentors the superior quality of Western civilisation and the belief that it came to them from God's hand. The first convert made by the Church of Scotland's Mission in Madras, the Rev. P. Rajahgopaul, could therefore speak of the future of Christianity in India in words such as these: "One of the providential helps in which we are to rejoice and not to despise is the British sovereignty in India. We cannot read the history of British India — her small beginnings, her steady growth, her ultimate sovereignty throughout the length and breadth of the country — without seeing the finger of God in it. However much her intelligence, the courage and discipline of her soldiery and the vigour of her constitution may have contributed to her greatness, there was much more in the over-ruling providence of God, in that Divine wisdom which putteth down kings and raiseth up anew — which, in spite of British failures and sins, has brought the whole country, kingdom after kingdom, under her control...I rejoice that/
we are under the banner of a British Government, because it is Christian." (84)

Leading Indian Christian opinion, as expressed above, was in line with advanced opinion among the better educated Indians. The spiritual successors of Ram Mohan Roy, such men formed a small but influential middle-class with strong Western leanings and actually became the founders of the Indian nationalist movement. (85) Yet the fact that Indian Christians possessed such an outlook was sufficient to estrange them from most of their orthodox countrymen.

"Missionary enterprise is condemned in the minds of some as foreign and incompatible with patriotic ambition" complained the Free Church of Scotland's Indian missionary, Ganpatrao Navalker. (86) As the strength of Indian nationalism increased, the small Christian element, which combined nationalism with Westernism, faded out (87) Accordingly, while some educated Christians contentedly accepted the British "Ma Bap" (88) government as they accepted the paternalistic Mission, other Christian leaders were torn between two loyalties, that of their race and country and that of their new faith.

For the great majority of Christian converts this conflict did not arise and was only to appear in the lives of their children or grandchildren. They were of outcaste origin, and accustomed to think of themselves as the sweepings/

---

NOTES

84) Rev. P. Rajahgopaul, "The Past History, Present Aspect, and Future Prospect of India Missions", contained in "The Dawn in the East", Johnstone and Hunter, Edinburgh, 1854, p.25. This viewpoint, it should be pointed out, if universal among Christians, was almost as common elsewhere. Even Gandhi, though he later spoke of Britain's "Satanic Government" could in 1915 describe British rule in India "an act of Providence". (See Taya Zinkin, op.cit., p.62)

85) Consult e.g. P.E. Roberts, op.cit., pp.496-497; Ram Gopal, op.cit., pp.278-282.

86) F.C. Report, 1885, p.27.

87) K.C. Banerji, of the Free Church Mission in Calcutta, had been one of the early leaders of Congress and also of the Christo Samaj. But apart from his nephew Brahmapandab he had no successors. See R.H.S. Boyd, op.cit., pp.182 and 227.

88) i.e. "Father and Mother".
of the dregs. They had an even heavier burden to carry, for their problem
was not a sense of inferiority and outrage against the white man but of total
helplessness, hopelessness and unworthiness. For a score of centuries they had
been taught to think of themselves as inferior and the missionary's difficulty
was not to raise them but to create in them a willingness to be raised.

"How can you bear to be in that state? Don't you want to be clean?"
asked a woman missionary of a filthy pariah woman. "Why should I want to be
clean? I am a pariah", was the frank reply. (89).

The discipling of such people was no simple business and a missionary like
the Rev. Adam Andrew of Chingleput spent so much time and effort in
championing the outcastes against oppression by caste communities that he
became known as "Pariah Andrew" or "The Pariah's Friend". (90)

"I think it would interest you to know precisely the details of this
special work of christianising and emancipating such a class" he wrote.
"Much has to be done in preparing the way for the introduction of favourable
conditions by means of which they can improve in character and obtain a more
comfortable livelihood. We have to become an intermediary between the two
opposing forces and try to stem the tide of evil flowing from their masters
and effect a reconciliation, or at least a via media for them, and to mould
their characters and lives with Christian truth. This is no easy task when
conducted among an Oriental people, so unlike the people of the West." (91)

NOTES

89) J.C. Heinrich, "The Psychology of a Suppressed People", p.3. Heinrich,
who was a missionary with some training in psychology, makes in his book
some interesting comparisons between the outlook of Indian Christians of
outcaste origin and American negroes.

90) MS letter from A. Andrew, Chingleput, to Dr. Lindsay, dated 12.3.1894, S.N.L.

91) MS, letter from A. Andrew, Chingleput. (First page missing, therefore no
date or address. Probably about 1904, S.N.L., Folio 7849)
For the average Indian Christian of the first or second generation, therefore, the contrast between their own and Western ways of life was not a cause of tension. The gap was so great as to make comparisons meaningless and the difference between their standards of living and those of their caste neighbours was a matter of much more importance to them.

An estimate is preserved of the monthly income of the membership of the "native congregation" in Poona in 1882, at a time when a Scottish male missionary received a salary of perhaps Rs.330 a month. Out of 104 members, 37 were classified as having a measurable income, of which the total came to Rs.734. (92) A return a few years later from Amraoti and its two linked congregations in the Nagpur area gives the number of communicant members as 56 and the Christian liberality for the year as £7.16.0. On this the missionary comments, "Considering the condition of the members I call this a fair realisation". (93)

The new groups of Christians, and particularly their leaders, were encouraged to turn their backs on the past and build up a new community spirit, Mission workers being brought together periodically for sessions of training and moral strengthening. "Many of our native workers are stationed in lonely places and surrounded by rampant heathenism and superstition" we find Adam Andrew writing again. "It is not to be wondered at if they sometimes become cold in their spiritual life. Such meetings, which bring so many of them together, must encourage them more than we can tell." (94)

NOTES
92) MS return on "native congregation, Poona", for 1882. S.N.L., Folio 7828
93) MS return for Berar, Nagpur Mission, 1888. S.N.L.
94) MS letter from A. Andrew, Chingleput, to Dr. Smith, March, 1904, S.N.L.
Great efforts were expended in fostering among new congregations a feeling that their existence and growth were matters of importance to themselves and others. "After consultation I decided to develop self-responsibility and the feeling of church life," states another letter from the Eastern Himalayas. "Having given each catechist a church roll book for his congregation. They are very pleased as this will given them in time a valuable history of their own congregation." (95) And in the course of time there normally grew up among missionaries and their converts an atmosphere of genuine trust and affection which became most plainly visible in the hour of stress or sorrow. "We have been having an awful time with the plague this year," wrote the missionary from Gujrat in the Punjab, "It has been hard work just to face each day as cheerfully as may be — We feel the loss of Miss Mary MacKichan very keenly — She must have taken the infection somewhere in the city — No one stayed away from the funeral through fear of infection. It was splendid to see the calm courage and loyalty of our Christians." (96)

The Christian societies raised largely from those depressed classes did not miss a heritage which had never offered them much and they accepted the new culture as they accepted the religion, as something infinitely better than they had ever known before. "These classes have not felt the foreignness of the Christian movement" wrote Rajappan Immanuel of the Harijans who had come to form the great bulk of Protestant Christian communities by the 1950’s. "Because they have not felt the Indian consciousness of their culture — They were glad to flee to the Christian movement as a refuge from the past which they were happy to forget and from which they were glad to run away." (97)

NOTES

95) MS letter from Mary H. Scott, Siklim, to Mr. M’Lauchlan, dated 15.1.1924, S.N.L.

96) MS letter from R. McChyne Paterson, Gujrat, Punjab, to Mr. M’Lauchlan, dated 18.6.1924, S.N.L.

Nevertheless, impressions could be stored away by even the humblest and evidences of superiority, material, mental and spiritual, were met with the basic reactions of love, fear, envy, admiration and rage. "You are our father and mother" they told the missionary, before proceeding to the inevitable request for help. And in their mind's eye, when in church they heard the story of the Rich Young Ruler who went away sorrowful, for he had great possessions, they quite innocently pictured the man returning home up the steps of the missionary's bungalow. (98)

For Indian Christian leaders on whom the immediate future of the Church depended, the situation could become immensely difficult and the strain almost unbearable. Caught between the upper and nether millstones of Western dominance on the one hand and the lazy, subservient indifference of cut caste Christian communities on the other, isolated and torn in two directions, they thought their heads were going to split. (99) They were constantly having to excuse, to Europeans, the backwardness of their own people, and while they seldom said so openly they must often have thought, "You yourselves come of/

NOTES

98) An amateur silent film on the life of Christ produced by Indian Christian students at Madura in the 1950's actually used a Mission bungalow as background for this incident. The house was conveniently situated and no double entendre was intended.

Occasionally, with men of high ability but little self-control, the damped-down fires burst into flames. "The Rev. Ganpatrao Navalkar appeared to me an earnest and devout Christian with quite a literary gift", comes a report concerning one such case, where a member of the Wilson College staff was at loggerheads with the Principal. "He was however consciously vain and irritable, resisting fiercely any criticism, continually measuring himself against Europeans and contemplating his superiority to them. He was prone to criticise others, especially European missionaries, used very bad language and imputed bad motives very freely ---" (101)

NOTES

100) Missionaries continued to be tireless in exhorting their fellow-Europeans to set an example of Christian faith and morals. This did not always endear them to their compatriots, who could be highly critical of the Indian character and of the untrustworthiness of Christian servants. "I feel hopeful that though things move slowly, Christ's person and words and Cross will gently overwhelm India", wrote Mr. White, missionary and chaplain to the Scottish planters at Sylhet, in Santalia. "It is natural to expect bitterness. I am surprised there is not more. Europeans should regard the extension of Christian truth and morals as one of the reasons for their existence in the country." (U.P.C. Report, 1902, p.18) The behaviour of British troops in particular and their part in spreading venereal disease was one of the most bitter causes of complaint on the part of Indians. Mainly for reasons of delicacy, it finds little mention in Mission reports and similar publications. It is not spoken of, for instance, in one English or two American biographies of Pandita Ramabai. (See K.S. Latourette, "The Expansion of Christianity", Vol.VI, p.195, footnote 627) But it was often spoken of by Pandita Ramabai herself, from experience in her orphanage, and is mentioned in an Indian biography. (See Srimathi Appasami, "Pandita Ramabai", C.L.S., for India, 1947)

101) MS statement from Bombay or Poona, probably 1907. S.N.L., Folio 7325.
Meanwhile, to the Hindu and Muslim communities which surrounded those little Christian enclaves, Western Missions more often than not appeared to be encroaching on their ancestral rights while doing little good for the people they claimed to be rescuing from slavery. By way of illustration there survives this petition from the non-tribal inhabitants of a part of Santalā sent to the Foreign Mission Committee:

"We beg to inform you humbly and submissively about the things which are going on in the missions --- having seen these things we think that our religion is far better than Christianity. We plainly see that Christianity is only to maintain the flesh and not the souls --- We see every clergyman treating the Santals like a beast and making money for themselves. These poor Santals cant do anything --- though calling themselves Christians they have no good eating, dressing, etc. --- they are be thought just like dogs --- Schoolboys are not getting any cloths or blanket etc. for the winter season we hear every year that the mission boy is coming for the Christian children and school boys and girls but never we see a bit. Everythings within the missions are going on treacherously. We see if anyone intends to be christian there clergy coax them by giving money and cloths etc. but where he got baptize they dont think about new christian whether he is dying, starving ---- So please make any plan or root out the missions works from our vicinity or change the clergy ---- We Hindus and Mohammedans about the mission we feel shame having seen these things and so we report it to you that our religion too might not be go wrong!

"Sir, we remain yours obediently servants,

Villager Hindoos and Mohammedans." (102)/

NOTES

102) MS letter to F.M.C. Secretary (Free Church of Scotland) dated 25.8.1896. S.N.L., Folio 7843.
It would be naïve to regard such a statement as impartial. Nevertheless, there remains a sediment of sincerity and it is clear that if such ideas were in any degree typical missionaries were a long way from gaining the sympathy or even understanding of the higher castes.

A very large proportion of the Indian population therefore resented the encroachments made by Christian Missions. Early converts themselves, though docile and obedient, were usually lacking in spirit. Indian leaders were slow to come forward, all the more so because missionaries continued to regard the churches as weak and immature and independence as a distant goal. Christian communities developed a life and fellowship of their own which could show loyalty and warmth, but congregations were slow to stand on their own feet. And when finally, often with Christians of the third generation or later, leadership and independence of spirit did emerge, strong tensions could be set up between Church and Mission.

The turning point of this process of development was for India the Mutiny of 1857. Had it succeeded, and had India for the next ninety years not been ruled according to the dictates of British imperial policy, then the history of Western Missions and their churches in India would have turned out very differently.

The difference made by the suppression of the Mutiny was a matter of intensification — faster and solid building on a foundation already laid — and not a change of direction. Yet it marked a change, for the age of the Nabob had finally given way to the era of the Sahib. "The good old hookah days are past", mourned one Anglo-Indian of the earlier generation, "Cheroots and pipes have usurped the place of the aristocratic silver bowl, the cut-glass goblets, the twisted glistening snake with silver or amber mouthpiece — The race of Eurasians is not so freely supplied with recruits — there is now no bee-bee's house (the European zenana) — there are now English rivals to/
these ladies". (103) Such expressions of regret could be echoed by missionaries also, if from a rather different angle. We find John Wilson, while welcoming the opening of the first Indian railway, which ran from Bombay in 1848, complaining that its desecration of the Sabbath is a sad drawback. (104) This can be explained in part by the natural conservatism of old age and also by the chaotic conditions which affected Bombay in the years immediately following the Mutiny. Disbanded soldiers and their deserted wives and families roamed the streets, the price of land rose astronomically, there was much speculation and several personal tragedies. But there were other doubts not so easy to express in concrete terms. "The change has not been for the good of the people either politically or socially so far", wrote George Smith. "India is undoubtedly better ruled so far as systems of administration are concerned. Is it more wisely governed as to the mode in which those systems are applied?" (105)

Such doubts were not shared by the new generation of British residents or missionaries, nor by Alexander Duff who was for another twenty years to guide the policies of the Free Church's Missions.

The key note was one of optimism. "There is every reason to believe that a great and decided change, most beneficial for India, has already begun", ran the Church of Scotland's report for 1859. (106) And it quotes in turn the opinion of its new missionary in Madras: "I can assure you that a bright hope/

---

**NOTES**

105) Ibid., p.318.
for India fills the hearts of all God's people here. There is a spirit of enquiry abroad among the heathen as to the British such as has never been before -- Do not suppose that this is merely the feeling of sanguine youth. Nay, in this matter the old men who have been in India for half a century and can contrast the past with the present are most sanguine."(107)

This was essentially the spirit in which Scottish Missions launched out on a new series of advances. The establishing of British dominion had a settling effect on the country as a whole. Through the 1860's, missionaries kept remarking on the change of attitude among Indians, the growth in toleration, the appreciation of Christian teaching, the lack of protests when converts were made. The Bombay Mission's first convert, the Rev. N. Dhanjibhai, wrote cheerfully, "I think we may put 1865 as the year in which the conviction prevailed generally among young Indians that of all forms of religion, Christianity is the best."(108) There were storms ahead, of which the clouds were already beginning to gather. But they were not yet visible to the mortal eye. It was in a spirit of hope and optimism that Scottish Missions set out on a fresh series of advances, taking steps for the first time to occupy not great cities but a number of rural centres.

With one exception, no Scottish Mission had been directly affected by the fighting during the Mutiny, which was confined to the North and the army of Bengal. The exception was the Church of Scotland's newly founded Mission at Sialkot, in what is now West Pakistan. Its pioneer, the Rev. Thomas Hunter,

---

NOTES

107) Rev. Stewart Wright, quoted ibid.

108) Quoted Hewat, p. 47.
had served in his Church's Institution in Bombay and as a result of his efforts seven young men had been baptised. One of these, a former Muslim, Mohanet Ismael, accompanied Hunter and his wife to the Punjab in 1857. A few months later, the Mutiny broke out and Hunter and his family were killed. But two volunteers from Glasgow University went out to re-open the Mission a couple of years later. And with the difference that the Christian message was here being preached to Sikhs and Muslims as well as Hindus, work developed along familiar lines. Schools and orphanages were established, outlying stations opened up and small congregations began to grow.\(^\text{109}\)

While fear ran through the country, every other Scottish Mission area had remained untouched by revolution or bloodshed.\(^\text{110}\) And within thirteen years of the Mutiny, as the country was progressively pacified and made safe for Europe, missionary ventures were started in three further areas.

The United Presbyterian Church was already at work in seven different countries but as yet had no obligation in India, where a practically virgin field lay open in the North. Advice was obtained from the experienced and widely travelled Free Church missionaries in Bombay, Rajputana was chosen as the new field and in 1860 the first U.P. Missionaries reached the area, a vast stretch of country almost the size of the British Isles. The Rajput were descendants of a warrior race and the Native States which occupied/

\begin{notes}

\text{110} The nearest to danger appears to have been Stephen Hislop in Nagpur. He is said to have helped stave off the danger of a rising in Central India. See Chapter 9.
\end{notes}
the greater part of the Province were still ruled by hereditary Rajahs in a spirit of authoritative but paternalistic feudalism.

Mission stations were established at four centres in British territory, one unusual feature of the advance being that during a desperate year of famine in 1868-69, no less than 6,000 orphans were at one point left to the care of the Mission. A second notable occurrence was the opening up of work in four separate Native States, the pioneer in each case being a missionary doctor who won the confidence of ruler and people. Medical work, on the men's and women's sides, played a large part in the development of the Church in Rajputana, along with schools and orphanages. And a mixed population of Hindu and Muslim communities required that evangelism should be capable of speaking to either (111)

The Santal Mission, founded in 1869, took missionaries into a different kind of world, distant alike from the teeming cities, the famine-stricken countryside and the battlefield of contesting religions. The Santal people belong to the largest aboriginal tribe remaining in India, and while primitive in their way of life and largely illiterate, they were, like so many hillmen, a brave, vigorous and independent race. An uprising in the 1850's, brought about by hatred of Hindu moneylenders, had been put down by Government forces, but from then on the Bengal Government had begun to take an interest in these isolated tribes and to encourage Missions to settle there. Alexander Duff had gone on a camping tour of the Pargana hills during the cold seasons of 1861 and 1862 and had been particularly taken with the jungle-covered hills/

NOTES

111) "The Story of our Rajputana Mission", included in "Our Church's work in India": Hewat, pp.127 ff.
round Paresanath. Lack of money, however, precluded any possibility of starting a Mission at that time. But in 1869 the Free Church Mission in Calcutta sent an Anglo-Indian worker from the Bible Society to try and start work at Pachamba and he was joined two years later by the first European missionary. After a number of early setbacks, the Mission began to progress, establishing village schools and making converts. In 1890, with the settling of Dr. J.M. Macphail in Bandah, there was initiated the long tradition of medical service which was to be so intimately connected with the work of this field and the building up of its churches. (112)

The last of the eight Scottish fields was started in the Eastern foothills of the Himalayas in 1870 by the Church of Scotland. The Mission's pioneer, the Rev. William Macfarlane, took with him to Darjeeling a group of Nepalese boys from an orphanage started in Gaya. The mission's situation was unique in that Darjeeling stood close to the border of the three closed lands of Bhutan, Nepal and Tibet and in consequence contained an exceptionally cosmopolitan population. Its progress during its early years was unusually promising and within 30 years it could boast a Christian community of mixed races totalling nearly 2,400 souls.

In 1883, a Universities' Mission was formed in Scotland which decided to open work in Sikkim, to the North of Darjeeling, and arrangements were made for its first native workers to be trained at Kalimpong, in the Church of Scotland field. A few years later the Church of Scotland's Young Men's Guild adopted Kalimpong as their special responsibility, with the neighbouring forest-belt and the tea estates of the Duars. Of all the/

---

NOTES

112) "Santalia", included in "Our Church's Work in India": Hewat, pp. 144 ff.
fields served by Scottish missionaries and occupied by a Church of their founding, this field remained the most varied and in many respects the most challenging and hopeful. (113)

With the exception of the little Mission at Seoni, which was opened by the United Original Secession Church in 1872 and came under the Church of Scotland's supervision in 1956, when it was linked with Nagpur, this completes the number of new fields occupied. (114) Only one addition has since been made, by the Free Church of Scotland (Continuing).

When in 1900 the existing Free Church missionaries in India all decided to throw in their lot with the United Free Church, the continuing body was left without work in the country. But in 1905 Miss Elizabeth Macleod joined the staff of the Seoni Mission and in 1925 medical work was begun nearby at Chhapara as a separate Free Church venture. This was later moved to Lakhnadon. It continues as a double-station mission with a small congregation but its work will not come within the limits of this study. (115)

From the 1770's onwards, Scottish missionary activity was concerned with extension and consolidation on foundations already laid. In 1891 the Church of Scotland closed its single school in Bombay, reckoning that its men and its women would be better employed elsewhere, but with a strong force of/

---

**NOTES**


114) Hewat, pp.168-171

women missionaries in Poona it retained its stake in Western India.
Otherwise the geographical location of Scottish Missions remained in all
essentials unchanged.

Those thirty years from 1870 until the end of the century were for all
eight fields a period of expansion. This was due in the first place to a
continuous growth of missionary interest at home. Livingstone's journeys,
the holding of the first Protestant Missionary Conference in India, and other
events which helped to bring about something in the nature of a revival in
England (116), made "foreign missions" the first and most steadily burning
interest of Scotland's non-established churches. At the same time one or
two able and eloquent missionary leaders home on furlough from growing churches
in the Punjab and the Eastern Himalayas had some success at last in injecting
enthusiasm into the hearts of Old Kirk members. The 33 missionaries serving
in India about 1860 had by the end of the century grown to 170, of whom just
about half were married women. (117) In 1892 the Free Church alone had 158
missionaries on its various fields and in its divinity colleges no less than
90 young men who said they were prepared to offer their services for the
Mission field. (118) The number of serving missionaries was to grow further
yet, but this was the true hey-day of advance for British Missions.

NOTES

116) "The year 1872 is a convenient landmark, for in it -- there was a
definite revival in the work of Missions overseas", says L.E. Elliott-
Binns in "Religion in the Victoria Era", Lutterworth Press, London, 1936,
pp.386-387. He is, of course, referring here to England.

U.F.C. Reports, 1902.

"The Victorian age has truly been the missionary era," commented the Free Church's report in the year of the Golden Jubilee "Since the immediately post-apostolic days no half-century of the Church's history has recorded a similar advance." (119)

A parallel cause of success was the favourable mental climate prevailing in India. Hindu orthodoxy and natural conservatism did not cease to resist all threats to the social structure, but among the newly emerging upper middle class whose minds were most sympathetic to Western ideas, and to whom the liberal education of the Mission Colleges appealed, there was much interest in Christian teaching. A high tone of optimism could everywhere be heard.

The Rev. G.F. Laha wrote from Calcutta, ''A sensible change has taken place: the seed sown is germinating already -- the once stately and seemingly impregnable citadel of Hinduism has been undermined and a break made through which the soldiers of the Cross may boldly march in to effect its downfall." (120) A few years later it was being said in Madras, "The missionaries of our own Church, like those of other Churches, are full of hope and speak with stronger assurance regarding the great change that is visibly taking place in the mind, heart and conscience of India." (121)

It is true that the number of conversions among the educated and liberalised Indians with whom those city missionaries had contact was not large. "Christianity is not extensively professed. But its power is increasing much more rapidly than the number of additions to the Church suggests", it was explained. (122) There were many references about this/

NOTES

119) Ibid., 1887, p.5.
120) C. of S. Report, 1875, pp.41-42.
period to "secret disciples", who only needed a courageous Indian reformer to lead them in. Many Indians thought themselves that some day a national movement towards Christianity would take place. (123) In the provincial capitals, Christianity was the coming religion of the day - "Even our non-Christian newspapers are adapting the language and sentiments of the Bible, and that in spite of themselves" declared Dr. Sheshadri of the Free Church's Mission in Hyderabad. (124) And Dr. William Miller in Madras was able to claim with even greater force in the 1890's, "Few things were so prominent in the India of today as the attempt to read Christian thought, Christian ethic and as much as may be of Christian spirit into the forms of the ancient system." (125)

It would be wrong even to suggest that the first stirrings of a new national consciousness and the opening meeting of the Indian National Congress in 1885 acted as a brake to this movement, for the founder members of the Congress themselves came from the small minority which was a product of Western education. (126) It was not until the last years of the century that Hindu conservatism combined with political radicalism to create in nationalism under Tilak a popular and explosive force. (127) And it was late in the 1890's before missionaries in Calcutta noticed a stiffening of the opposition. Hinduism, which had been adapting to Western ways and Christian/

NOTES

123) Ibid., 1881, p.64.
124) FC. Report, 1879, p.36.
125) W. Miller, "Educational Agencies in Missions", 1893, p.15. For further information about this influential pamphlet, see Chapter 15.
126) See e.g. Michael Edwards, op.cit., p.22.
127) Ibid., p.25.
ideas "in spite of itself", now began to use modern techniques. Books written in English were being published on "The Life and Teachings of Krishna", "Lord Gauranya" and "Hindu Theism." (128) This was something new, but it was also accompanied by an atmosphere of growing scepticism among the better educated. "As I think of their eagerness to learn and of their potentialities", wrote A.G. Mowat of the young Brahmins in Poona, "My one regret is that they are not under more regular religious instruction, especially at this time, when a wave of scepticism is rolling over the length and breadth of the land." (129)

Lastly, along with the fivefold increase in missionary personnel and the advantages of a receptive atmosphere, Missions in the last quarter of the century were making converts in larger numbers and churches were expanding. The 550 Indian communicants shown by the Scottish Missions in the early 1860's grew in the next forty years to almost 5,000, the total Christian communities probably coming to about three times that number. Expansion was greatest in the new rural Mission areas and among outcaste groups. (130)

Mass movements had been getting under way in South India and elsewhere, and the Church of Scotland had shown itself restive in the 1860's and 1870's with barely a thousand converts while in Timevally the C.M.S. could count seventy times that number. (131) "Six lions are not the same as six sheep", it was told, but would not be comforted. Unlike the Free Church, the Church of Scotland would have been perfectly happy with a few more sheep. (132)

NOTES

129) MS letter from A.G. Mowat, Poona, to Dr. Smith, dated 30.8.1891, S.N.L.
132) Ibid., 1878, p.9.
It got its wish in the 1880's, when the Punjab Mission found itself in the middle of a mass movement among the Churhas. And meanwhile in the Eastern Himalayas, Hyderabad and the Chingleput district of Madras, Scottish missionaries were saying for the first time that converts were coming in faster than they could be dealt with. Even in the sandy wastes of Rajputana, Christian compassion in time of famine was bringing in the souls which Christian preaching had failed to win. And in Santalia the Free Church was building up Scotland's only Indian tribal Mission. The Nineteenth Century ended on an almost universal wave of optimism.

As the churches grew — and while the number of missionaries had increased five-fold the churches had increased eight-fold — we find also the beginnings of a concern for their structure and spiritual health. An important section in the Free Church's report of the Mutiny year is headed "Native Churches and Native pastors" and draws attention to "a new stage in the progress of our Missions".

"The time has come", it continues, "When it seems desirable that native congregations should be formed, native ministers called and a right church organisation set up, — One native congregation, that at Bombay, consists of no fewer than 67 members, Madras has 74 and Calcutta 58."

The Report goes on to record that the Committee has for several years been corresponding on this subject with its missionaries, who are fully in favour of the project. One of the Bombay missionaries, the Rev. A. White, explains in a letter their desire that native churches should be founded as early as possible, his reasons being sound and informative.

In the first place, native churches, with native pastors, are after the apostolic model. The aim is also in accordance with the original plan of our missions. "Excellent as our educational efforts are, they are nevertheless apt to degenerate into school routine — unless Christ's Church be seen advancing."

That the office of pastor of native churches should be held by European missionaries is evidently a temporary measure, which should come to an end as soon as possible. The Church is thereby kept in "an infant condition", and is in this
respect "behind other Churches". In Bombay, there are men eminently capable of taking on the pastoral care of a native congregation, and while payment of a pastor would no doubt have to be met initially from Mission funds, "the native Church would doubtless give something from the very first if rightly exhorted to do so." (133)

From this time onwards the "native church" became a reality in the minds of Scottish missionaries and while evangelism and the running of institutions took priority for time and attention, "the care of the churches" was accepted as an essential element of the Mission's work. There also began to emerge the dyarchy of control between Mission and Church which was in a later generation to become a source of embarrassment.

The Church, it was assumed from the start, would be Indian and independent in character, yet Presbyterian in form, if only because in the eyes of Scottish missionaries this was self-evidently the "Bible-pattern" Church. But the emphasis was less on its form, which was taken for granted, than its independent status. There was regret in the Free Church Mission that their three city congregations did not yet have native pastors, rejoicing that converts were now being won by Indian ministers rather than by overseas missionaries and delight when the Duff Church in Calcutta became the first self-sustaining congregation. (134)

While such ideas were already in the air, it was the Church of Scotland and not the Free Church which first openly committed itself to the possibility that an indigenous Church might be something more than Presbyterian. "Such a church will not reflect any one of our several Western sects or denominations: but warned by all our differences and encouraged by all that we have in common, may end in representing better than any of ours the primitive church in doctrine, worship and social Christian life, coloured necessarily by Oriental forms and ideas." (135)

It is a little difficult to distinguish variations between principle and practice. It seems generally to have been the case, however, that a congregation

---

NOTES.

(134) F.C. Reports, 1858, p.32; 1863, p.9; 1867, p.100.
(135) C. of S. Report, 1870, p.18.
was not accorded full status until it was within reach of paying the salary of its own pastor. In practice, Scottish Missions adopted the system in general use, that of setting a congregation on its feet and then gradually withdrawing control and financial assistance. Meanwhile errors were countenanced with a firm but kindly eye - "a few blunders through freedom are more useful than correct conduct under restraint." (136)

As we saw in the first chapter, by the 1870's the triple formula defining what was required of an indigenous church — self-support, self-government and self-propagation — had passed into common currency among Protestant Missions. (137) And in Scottish Mission circles, concern about the duty and ability of Indian congregations to fulfill these obligations became more obvious.

"The native church should be made available for conducting aggressive (i.e. evangelistic) attacks." (138) "— the self-propagating power of the Gospel —" (139)

"No greater calamity can befall the missionary enterprise than the idea that — the churches at home are to sustain the churches abroad." (140) "The time has come to make a new departure in the matter of Native Church organisation." (141)

Such ideas are to be found scattered freely through the reports and letters of these decades.

They were taught and discussed, moreover, at humbler levels than that of Mission Boards and Presbyteries. In the year 1889 Mission workers at Chingleput were asked, at their Annual Bible examination, to write an essay on, "The most suitable constitution for the national Church and the means that should be adopted to make the Church independent, self-governing and self-propagating." (142)

---

NOTES,

(136) Ibid., 1873, p.11.
(137) See Beverhaus, p. 28.
(139) F.C. Report, 1879, p.18.
(140) Ibid.
(141) Ibid., 1883, p.6.
(142) Ibid., 1890, p.21.
The practical requirements for the setting up of an independent Church were at this stage seen to be three: a trained Indian ministry, congregations able to support them financially and some form of ecclesiastical organisation outside the Mission which would provide at least the skeleton framework for a nation-wide Church.

Much thought, discussion and hard work was given to the raising of an adequate Christian ministry and here Scottish Missions, like their neighbours, unquestionably suffered from the curse of denominationalism. In the early days, the problem had been solved by missionaries taking suitable candidates into their own homes or at least personally supervising their course of instruction. As churches grew, other demands on the missionary's time became heavier, the number of candidates rose and higher standards also were required, this was no longer so easy. Theological colleges were the answer, but such bodies could only be run on a co-operative basis. Here matters of Church order and doctrine entered in, however. Missions quite prepared to co-operate or recognise a system of comity so far as Arts Colleges, Teacher Training or High School education were concerned, hesitated when it came to a question of theological education. The Scottish Missions themselves provide an excellent example of a group too scattered over different language areas to think of organising a theological college in which all Missions might co-operate. Eventually co-operative and inter-denominational theological colleges were established. But a definite time-lag can be observed between the earlier period of individual instruction under the missionary and the formation of higher-grade theological colleges. The training of evangelists at local Bible-schools was usually done quite competently. But higher training for the ordained ministry became quite unintentionally the Cinderella of Mission work. In this respect the record of Scottish Presbyterian Missions falls a good way behind that of Anglicans, Lutherans or American Presbyterians. In the new century Scottish Missions helped to found or support a number of theological colleges, but their contribution in the last quarter of the Nineteenth Century was not proportionate
to what might have been expected. (143)

It is sufficient to note at the moment that the missionaries of this period were beginning to see the pitfalls of setting too high an academic standard for Indian ministers on the one hand and neglecting their training on the other. (144) On the whole, because a number of the earliest men to enter the ministry had been high-caste converts of intelligence and ability, Scottish Missions erred on the side of demanding academic attainments which were both too high and unsuited to Indian conditions. (145) One Indian leader, Dr. Sheshadri of Jalna, was backed up by missionaries in a campaign for a more realistic type of training, but the home Church - in this case the Free Church - with its own lofty but rigid requirements, failed to understand or respond. (146) It was not until the last decade of the century that the Free Church Assembly finally asked its Committee to consider, "whether the demands made in the way of study and equipment for the National Ministry may not require revision." (147) Yet one must conclude that for all the thought given to the matter, the home Churches were here at fault and missionary policy did not adapt sufficiently to the local situation. As we have seen, the missionary staff multiplied five-fold and communicant members eight-fold in these forty years, yet the number of ordained or licensed pastors had only risen from 16 to 35. (148)

The goal of financial self-support was dinned into every congregation year by year, but even the Free Church's launching of an Indian Sustentation Fund, while it helped to float some new rural congregations, was not enough to set the local churches solidly on their feet. (149)

NOTES.

(143) See Appendix II
(146) Ibid., 1880, p.21: 1881, p.23.
(147) Ibid., 1896, p.13.
(149) F.C. Reports, 1881, p.8; 1885, p.11.
The Missions of the Church of Scotland and the United Presbyterian Church were in a similar position. The salaries of African pastors were by now being met entirely by the congregations and the Free Church reminded its members that "for several years no subject has been so frequently the subject of careful action as that of the development of the native Church on a self-supporting and missionary basis." (150) Not so serious a drawback as the shortage of pastors, self-support was nevertheless regarded by Missions as a matter of very great importance.

The third recognised need, that of an ecclesiastical organisation, was met through the union of the Scottish Mission churches with each other and with sister churches of other Presbyterian Missions in the Presbyterian Church of India, a body formed in 1904. (151) Yet while in a technical and legal sense the Indian churches were independent, in practice they were still largely subservient to the guidance of missionaries and so closely tied up with the Mission organisation that free action was an impossibility.

The situation by 1900 may be summed up by saying that while the Missions showed concern about the independent nature of their churches, any discouragement here was more than outweighed by satisfaction at the signs of expansion and hopes for the future. Missions had their problems but did not themselves yet constitute a problem. As the greatest of missionary centuries came to a close, there seemed little reason to doubt that the next century might be greater still.

1900-1965.

Before Independence.

Among the movements which helped to shape Scottish Mission policy during the Twentieth Century we may distinguish three strong moulding influences.

NOTES.

(150) Ibid., 1896, p.13.
(151) See Chapter XIV.
First came the home background, the rise and fall of missionary enthusiasm in the Scottish Churches, which affected the scale and character of their outreach. Next came the influences of supra-national Christianity, especially as represented by the ecumenical movement. Lastly, and by far the most important, there were the changes taking place in India itself. These changes rose to the proportions of a flood which Christian Missions had themselves helped to precipitate, but on the waves of which they were now swept along as helpless victims.

The Scottish Background.

The following figures for the number of Scottish missionaries serving in India during the first six decades of this century give some idea of the enthusiasm with which the cause of Foreign Missions was being supported. They include both men and women missionaries, but not wives.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1900</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1910</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1920</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1930</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1940</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1950</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1960</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The figures tell a good part of the story. The recession began with the first world war but up until 1930 and the union of all but a small remnant of the Scottish Presbyterian family into one body again, the tide of missionary interest continued to flow. It was possible for Dr. Mackichan, in his Chalmers' lectures in 1926, to refer to the claim that with the exception of the Moravians the Scottish churches had, in proportion to their resources, been second to none in their contribution to the missionary cause. (153) At the time of the union in 1929, the combined missionary strength in all fields was just a little short of

NOTES.


800 men and women. (154) But from 1930 onwards, the number of overseas missionaries maintained by the Scottish churches has in almost any given year been less than the previous year.

The reasons are complex and the situation has been one familiar to all the larger and older Protestant Missions. Two world wars, the industrialisation and mechanisation of society, the decline of Great Britain as a first-grade power, the rise of Communism, the emergence of the Asian and African nations - these had their consequences in Scotland as elsewhere and to them and the changes they wrought in men's ways of life and the climate of their thought may be traced both the decline in church-going and a weakening hold on fundamental Christian convictions. Scotland, more isolated, more homogeneous, more conservative and with a national Church whose grip was stronger, held out longer than England. But as with the slow shaking of the foundations the grip of Christianity and its embodiment in the Church grew weaker, its overseas Missions also lost supporters. Interest in all the schemes of the Church lessened with the decline in active Church membership. Yet even among active and committed members, the appeal of Foreign Missions no longer held undisputed pride of place, for attention began to be concentrated nearer home. There is no question that European Christians, in their zeal to send the Gospel to the heathen far across the seas, had neglected the spiritual and bodily needs of the neighbour on their doorstep. In Scotland, the processes of industrialisation and the break-down of the parish system in the cities had caused the Church to lose contact with the weekly wage-earning classes. With the coming of the hungry thirties and the failure of the newly united Church to rally to the side of the unemployed, many families adopted towards organised Christianity an attitude of hostility or indifference. For the first time since the Reformation, the Presbyterian churches of the nation could no longer claim to represent the nation, and on becoming aware of this they sought belatedly to set their house in order.

NOTES.
The rise of Socialism and the relevance of its teachings played their part in turning the attention of the Scottish Churches back to the basic needs of their own people and nation. Christianity and Socialism united to become the spiritual parents of the Iona Community. Yet British Socialism had little positive effect on the missionary movement. Left-wing political thinking, as represented by a journalist like Reginald Reynolds, classed Western Missions as a form of imperialistic exploitation and treated them with scorn or indifference. Most British Missionaries, like most British churchmen, were conservative in outlook and viewed the Labour Party with suspicion. Yet we have seen that by the time of the Tambaran Conference much more intelligent study was being given to such subjects as the indigenous Church's social and economic background, and in 1936-37 Wilson College organised an original research project into the economic and social conditions of Christians in Bombay City.

In Scotland, the demands of Church Extension in the new housing areas, social service projects and latterly also aid for refugees and the destitute of other nations have presented to Christian minds progressively strengthening appeals. But just as Britain, loosening the bonds of an Empire from necessity and out of respect for other men's freedom and its own promises, also shuffled off responsibilities it no longer cared to acknowledge; so there was a similar tendency on the part of Scottish churchmen to disclaim a wider obligation by pointing to the

---

NOTES.

(155) The very title "Church Extension" is an interesting example of the contraction of horizons. Explicitly, it suggests extension without limits. Implicitly, it is understood to mean a very necessary but limited extension within the bounds of the nation. As the fallacy of the idea of a "foreign" mission has now become apparent, so some day should also the too narrow compass of this "extension".
urgency of those nearer to hand. Indifference to the Church's total mission was disguised as concern about its local mission. Nevertheless much of this turning inwards was vital and sincere, and where the cream of the Church's manhood and womanhood had once been attracted to Africa, India or China, in the post-war world Church Extension, Youth Work and a variety of secular ministries seemed to present a clearer call. The overall result on overseas work has been, first, less money and the recurring danger of compulsory retrenchment; and second, fewer missionaries and the constant need for re-adjustment in the distribution of man-power.

The shortage of missionaries has been greatly aggravated by the fact that after the second world war short-term service became much more common. In earlier days, a call to the Mission field was normally accepted as a call for the duration of one's working life. Missionaries gave their thirty or thirty-five years of service, which might on occasion stretch to forty years or more. (156) Although with their wives and children they frequently died on the field, and even in the 1920's it was comparatively rare for a missionary family not to have lost at least one child, yet their average length of service was considerable.

Among the post-second-world-war generation of missionaries this attitude had changed. Most missionaries, particularly women, were better prepared for their work through a preliminary course of instruction at St. Colm's College in Edinburgh. And attendance whenever possible at well-organised language schools gave a thorough

---

NOTES.

(156) Official retiring dates were after thirty years service for women, after thirty or thirty-five for men. The record is held by Dr. Hutchison of Chamba who retired in situ in 1930 after sixty years service, and continued to give voluntary help until his death six years later. (C. of S. Reports, 1931-1937, passim).
grounding and time for acclimatisation and adjustment in the country itself. Yet fewer missionaries were willing to make of their service a life commitment. Restlessness and dissatisfaction with the type of work a missionary was required to do brought some home. Health, the education of children and the security of the family circle on the part of married men; health and obligations towards elderly parents on the part of unmarried women; financial hardship, especially among those with large families; loneliness and the lack of any social life which were the result of these very changes; and a perfectly sincere conviction that, language difficulties notwithstanding, a few years of service overseas would be a rewarding experience and a personal contribution to the cause of the world Church, were among other factors which accelerated this trend.

In consequence, the new generation of missionaries, while less autocratic and patriarchal, and much more ready to work with and sometimes under their Indian colleagues in a spirit of brotherhood and partnership, seldom got to know the country, the language and the people so well. They were accepted and welcomed as brothers-in-Christ rather than fathers-in-God. But as their knowledge was more superficial and their commitment less total, so their involvement was not so deep. Because their Indian brothers and sisters sensed this, the influence of such missionaries was not so great.

The Ecumenical Movement.

The rise of the ecumenical movement has already been referred to in the first chapter and its influence on the Indian Church union movement will have to be considered later. Itself a child of the Nineteenth Century Protestant missionary enterprise, it helped to mould the life of both older and younger Churches. Its birth at the World Missionary Conference held in the United Free Church's Assembly Hall at Edinburgh in June, 1910, was one of creative events of Christian history. The Scottish Churches acted again as hosts at the Faith and Order Conference held at/
Edinburgh in 1957. The second meeting of the International Missionary Council to be held outside Europe took place in the Madras Christian College's new buildings at Tambaram in 1958. And the most recent meeting of the World Christian Council, when it was integrated with the International Missionary Council, was held at New Delhi in 1961. (157) The two earlier meetings of the I.M.C. held at Jerusalem in 1920 and at Madras ten years later were of particular significance in giving the younger Churches an opportunity to speak their own thoughts openly. One whole session of the Jerusalem meetings was concerned with the relationship between younger and older churches and an attempt to find what constituted the nature of a truly indigenous church. (158) At a session of the Tambaram meetings which went under the title of "The Growing Church", these issues were taken up again in the light of further experience. (159) Whereas at Edinburgh in 1910 there had been no more than seventeen representatives from the lands newly evangelised, at Jerusalem they made up a third of the total and at Tambaram they equalled those of the older churches.

The influence of the World Christian Council and its constituent or associated bodies on missionary policy and church development was extensive and diverse. It stimulated the organising of inter-denominational missionary conferences. And by encouraging the establishment of an organisation such as India’s National Christian Council it gave practical opportunities for co-operative work. The National Christian Council’s most important and effective function, however, was to furnish an atmosphere in which churches might move towards unity together. It was often in a position to speak as the voice of Protestant Christianity in India. And through Subsidiary Regional Councils it provided a valuable link between Missions of different

---

NOTES.


(158) "The Younger and Older Churches", Jerusalem Meeting, Vol III. See Chapter I, General Sources.

(159) "The Growing Church", Tambaram Series, Vol. II. See Chapter I, General Sources.
denominations working in the same area. (160)

At present it will be sufficient for us simply to note the importance of the Ecumenical Movement which Professor Latourette, referring to Twentieth-Century Christianity, describes as "The most striking of the new movements issuing from Protestantism." (161)

Indian Currents.

Yet of all human factors determining the shape and progress of Indian churches, the strongest derived unquestionably from the changes which were taking place in India itself. These changes, while their causes were often social or religious in origin, exercised a new force because they now took political form. In the course of less than forty years, from 1909 to 1947, the organs of Indian administration passed through an evolution which had in Britain extended over five or six centuries. The Indian National Congress, first under Tilak and then under Gandhi, became the organised vehicle for expressing a growing popular desire for independence either within or without the British Empire. The movement which resulted in autonomy for India had certain distinctive features, and owed more than its leaders realised to Western and Anglo-Saxon models. It demanded and got Western forms of democratic parliamentary government. Thanks to Mahatma Gandhi's leadership and his insistence on adhering to the Hindu principle of *ahimsa*, it followed to the end the path of a non-violent revolution. Because it harnessed Hindu loyalties in order to achieve success, it incurred opposition from the large Muslim minority, with the result that at independence the country was divided into two nations, separated by their religion. Yet while Mohammedanism became the official religion of Pakistan and Hinduism the prevailing religion of India, in both States freedom of religion was accorded to minorities.

NOTES.

(160) See Chapter XIV.
India's journey towards self-determination and the course it followed affected the Church in two ways. Nation and Church were travelling the same road and many of the younger and better-educated Christians who were the natural leaders of the future supported the national movement. "For some years the attitude of Indian Christians to the nationalist movement was a difficult and precarious one", writes R.H.S. Boyd.

"The missionaries who at least up to 1920 constituted the real leadership of the Christian Churches were mainly anti-nationalist, and at first comparatively few Indian Christians found it possible to throw in their lot whole-heartedly with the national cause." (162) Yet there began something of a parallel drive towards autonomy for the Church. Indian Christian leaders became more outspoken and demanded greater freedom from European control and supervision. Most Western Missions, beginning to find themselves embarrassed for lack of European staff and a shortage of funds, professed themselves ready to grant what was asked. Yet the transfer of responsibility was not so smooth nor so rapid as both interested parties would have liked it to be. We find the United Free Church complaining after the first world war that missionaries were in short supply, but while more national workers were available they needed training before they could be entrusted with responsible posts. (163). Twenty years after this, the National Christian Council was still pressing on Missions the transfer of their responsibilities, pointing out how much more quickly the change-over had been effected in China and suggesting that Western/

NOTES.

(162) R.H.S. Boyd, "The Place of Dogmatic Theology in the Indian Church", p.227. As already remarked, there was a hiatus in Christian support for the Congress movement between the time when it declared its opposition to the British Government and the last few years before independence was won. (see note 87) At a meeting of Congress held in Calcutta in 1933, only 2 out of 1,500 delegates were Christians. The very much smaller Parsi community, which has never exceeded 120,000, was represented by 7 delegates and Hindus outnumbered all the other communities combined by about 14 to 1. (Ram Gopal, op.cit., p.345).

Missions, like the Western Government, were here treating the Indian Church as if it were a subject and inferior race. (164)

The form taken by the nationalist movement through the pacific influence of its leaders was a factor of equal importance, ensuring as it did that there should be continuity between the old India and the new. The reins of government changed hands but its character altered remarkably little. Western institutions were accepted and allowed to function undisturbed, a spirit of goodwill was shown towards resident Europeans, including the British, and Christianity was not dubbed a lackey of imperialist aggression. This presented a marked contrast not only to the situation in China but to what sometimes took place within other emergent nations in Africa or the East. In India, Christian churches and Missions were able to carry on with little change or interruption. A fact of great significance, it is one which Western reaction against a number of small and in some ways disturbing changes has tended to obscure. No British missionary was deported for his activities by the Government in power before independence, and, to the best of the writer's knowledge, no British missionary has been required to leave since. The same cannot be said of many other countries where British rule or influence and British Missions have both been represented.

In addition to the nationalist movement, several other currents were operating which made an impact on Christian evangelism and the life of the Church. It has been noted that the National Congress achieved success by using the Hindu religion, or more accurately by combining Hindu revivalism with political agitation. Traditional Hinduism, fed by its immense reservoirs of sentiment and social custom, had never ceased to resist the onslaught of Western culture and Christian teaching. Now turning to make use of different and more modern weapons, and encouraged by Societies like the Arya Samaj, the All-Indian Hindu Mahasabha and the Ramakrishna Mission, it shifted on a broad front from defence to attack.

NOTES.

(164) Quoted C of S. Report, 1945, pp.296-297.
"The direct onslaughts of missionaries on the citadel of Hinduism which have been carried on for a century and more have proved absolutely abortive, at any rate so far as the higher castes are concerned", ran one article in an Indian paper in 1909. "Recognising the bitter truth, they are beginning to change their tactics and are preparing to capture the fort by taking it in the rear. — For us Hindus, however, the conclusion is a foregone one. We watch confidently all such flank movements and surprises, knowing full well that there is not the ghost of a chance of Christ captivating our hearts to the exclusion of our own saviours — Any attempt now at the evangelisation of India will be so much labour and energy wasted." (165)

Missions working among educated people now began to report hardening resistance to Christian teaching. "The Swadeshi movement is bitterly anti-Christian and students' minds are not receptive as before," reported a member of the Wilson College staff. (166)

The movement was not uniform, however, and advanced hand-in-hand with a desire to adopt liberal and humanitarian ideas, and often with scepticism and secularism. It contained in itself, as Hinduism is very well able to do, a number of contradictions. Thus it was possible for a religious reformer such as Gandhi to choose as his right-hand man Jawaharlal Nehru, a Brahmin and an agnostic; for educational missionaries to complain that indifference rather than orthodoxy was their chief enemy; for Wilson College to report from Bombay in 1932 that there were "signs of awakening interest in the Christian message" (167); for Indian reformers to commend and copy Christian examples of social service (168); and for Stanley Jones, an American missionary in close touch with Gandhi, to call on missionaries to "evangelise the inevitable" — that is, to travel with the national movement towards independence. (169) Most rural districts remained untouched by this new Hindu/

NOTES:

(165) Quoted U.F.C. Report, 1909, p.10
(166) MS letter from R. Scott, Wilson College, to Dr. Smith, dated 7.12.1907, S.W.L.
militancy, the support of institutional religion in temple cities was on the
decline and sometimes political uncertainty actually led to a greater readiness to
listen to the Gospel being preached. (170) The overall effect of the Hindu
resurgence, whose roots were national as well as religious, was a far less favourable
atmosphere for the dissemination of Christian truth. And Indian Christians were some-
times wounded by accusations of being unpatriotic. (171)

Yet at the same time there were two other currents within the Indian environment
which proved of importance to the churches and worked to their advantage. The first
was the appearance of another series of mass movements towards Christianity from
among the "untouchables" or depressed classes. Gathering force about the end of
the first world war, it was at its strongest in the Punjab and South India. Protestant
Missions reported half a million baptisms within a few years, there were now
400,000 Christians in the Punjab alone, and Scottish Missions there and in Hyderabad
and South India all reaped some fruit from the movements. The mass phenomenon posed
something of a problem to Protestant Missions, especially those with a strong evangelical
and individualistic emphasis, and provided a subject for much debate. (172)

It also received within Indian society a certain amount of popular sympathy, and
there were less protests than there might have been because of Gandhi's campaign on
behalf of the "untouchables" to whom he gave the name of "Harijans" or "Children of
God." Conservative though it was in other ways, Gandhi's reformed brand of
Hinduism included the destruction of caste barriers and the acknowledgement of women
as equal partners with men. Of "untouchability", he wrote in 1924, "It is the sin
of the Hindus — theirs is the shame and theirs must be the glory when they have
purged themselves — " (173) To the annoyance of his more orthodox followers and /

NOTES.

(171) See P.D. Devanandan "Resurgent Hinduism", Christian Institute for the Study
of Religion and Society, Bangalore, 1959).
(173) Quoted T. Zinkin, op.cit., p.145.
the disgust of the extreme political left, Gandhi after his release from prison in 1933 turned his attention to this problem in preference to politics, declaring the equality of all men in the sight of God and calling on the temples to open their gates and all good Hindus to embrace their outcasted brothers. But the desire to win emancipation, self-respect and a future on the part of many millions of the underprivileged had a momentum of its own, which Christianity had helped to stimulate. Under their leader, Dr. Ambedkar, they claimed their rights, stating also that they would seek for a religion where their equality of status would be recognised. For a time Dr. Ambedkar was attracted towards Christianity but in 1956, shortly before his death, he led 200,000 Harijans at Nagpur into Buddhism.

Thanks to Gandhi's influence in the new India, the depressed classes were given special educational privileges. Here the Christian community suffered, Christians of outcaste origin not being accepted as "Harijans". But the "untouchable" movement, being fundamentally a revolt against the social and economic restrictions imposed by the Hindu system, brought many more into the Christian churches than it kept out of them. (174)

These currents and cross-currents within the Indian sub-continent made a greater impact on the Church than did either the changes in missionary resources/

NOTES.

M. Edwardes, op.cit., pp. 61-62.
and emphasis or the influence of international Christianity.

"Down to the year 1914" says Latourette, "The Indian environment had much less effect upon Christianity than Christianity had upon the environment. This was to be expected. Christianity was either confined to minor enclaves — or had been so recently propagated that it was still dependent upon foreign initiative and had only begun to take root in Indian soil. Moreover, the great majority of the nineteenth century converts were from the depressed classes, groups which by tradition had a servile attitude and were disposed to accept passively both foreign leadership and imported customs. Yet by 1914 a few evidences were appearing that India was beginning to place its stamp upon Christianity and, especially, that under the stress of rising Indian nationalism missionaries were seeking to make the Church less Occidental and Indian Christians were endeavouring to put an Indian impress upon the forms of their faith and to assume more and more responsibility for the Church. After 1914 this movement was rapidly to gain momentum."
The Indian Churches

It was against such a background that Scottish Missions worked and their churches grew over the first half of the Twentieth Century. On one issue Scottish and Indian leaders were agreed. The Indian Church must show itself to be indigenous and independent, with roots dug into Indian earth. As we have seen, the aims were achieved in part in the early 1900's.

"Comity", or the operation of a rough-and-ready "parish system", co-operation among Missions in the running of higher institutions and the work of the Presbyterian Alliance of India had all helped to prepare the ground for a union of Indian Churches. (176) In 1901, the churches of the two Madras Missions, Church of Scotland and United Free Church, joined with the American Arcot Mission to form the South India United Church. And three years later all the churches connected with the Scottish field united under the name of the Presbyterian Church of India. (177) Indian churches, after this, were in principle autonomous bodies, subject neither to Foreign Mission Committees nor the Home Church.

The real position was of course much less straightforward, for the Indian churches were not in fact purely ecclesiastical structures, nor did they feel that their life and health chiefly depended on matters appearing on the official agenda of their own courts. The Church was overshadowed by the Mission as Walpole's town was dwarfed by its cathedral. The majority of the churches' leaders and a host of their humbler members were employed in Mission Institutions on which they relied for a livelihood. Their pastors had been trained in Mission-run colleges with Mission subsidies. The congregations to which those pastors ministered were more often than not unable to raise even their modest salaries. Again, when the shoe pinched, it was invariably the Mission which stepped in to ease the situation. In some congregations which actually balanced a budget it was the church offerings.

NOTES

176) For a fuller treatment see Chapter XIV.
of the missionaries which alone made this possible. And this financial
dependence was only one symptom of a universal and deep-seated dependence.

The Mission, and not the Church, was responsible for evangelism,
for it was the Mission which paid and directed the activities of an army of
evangelists, Bible women and teachers on the growing edges of the community.
The Mission was further responsible in the areas of contact between Christians
and non-Christians - in colleges and schools, boarding homes, hospitals and
dispensaries. The policy of those institutions could not be directed by
the Church, since it lacked individuals with the technical qualifications,
the confidence, the experience or the integrity to run them. The supervision
was done by missionaries. And even when Indians were available, their
abilities tended to be overshadowed by those of the Europeans, who were almost
automatically given the deference and the preference. Control of these
institutions remained in the hands of Mission Councils, on which Indians were
represented but usually in small numbers, and the axis of operation of these
Councils was not the Mission and the Church but the Mission and the Home
Committee. Indian members did not always find it easy to understand the
background of discussions and decisions, and since meetings of Mission Council
were held in English, not in the local language, it took longer for Indian
members to "speak freely". (178) There was in addition a greater security
for an Indian worker in belonging to a "Mission" rather than a "Church"
organisation - he could at the very least be certain that his salary would be
paid regularly. A certain prestige value also attached to Mission activities
and policy committees as distinct from those of the Church proper.

The powerful position occupied by Mission Councils and often by
individual missionaries as well was not a matter of deliberate choice but an
unforeseen development. Yet it was real, and affected the spirit and
government of the churches in two ways. When missionaries themselves took/

NOTES
a leading part in the courts of the Indian Church, or when courts were composed mainly of Mission employees, church policy became a reflection of Mission policy or even of an individual missionary's wishes. Mission reports from the 1850's onwards keep recording the "submissiveness" and "obedience" of congregations, and while not wishing to demean such virtues they clearly long for a few sparks of independent spirit. On the other hand, when missionaries purposely absented themselves from the government of the local church, it was to discover how limited was the group's orbit. Their independence was exercised within a narrow world which they seemed to have no desire to extend, their interests lay with themselves and they had little curiosity, let alone concern, about the doing of their non-Christian neighbours. Such congregations were then criticised by missionaries as being "complacent", "parochial", "ingrown" or "inaactive". The problem had been foreseen, but was very difficult to deal with, being a phenomenon common to almost every minority group. "If these children of Christian parents) are to become strong and useful members of the church they must be trained and taught that it is not enough to belong to the 'Christian caste' as I have been told many believe: but that a personal acceptance of Christianity is necessary for all", stated a letter from Poona written early in the 1890's. (179) The next few chapters will supply many examples of a submissive willingness to settle down as part of just another natural community.

The problem, as the Jerusalem and Tambaram Conferences clearly showed, was that of the relationship between Mission and Church, or between older and younger Churches. However much both parties might wish for the independence of the younger Churches, yet by the methods they had chosen the older Churches had already determined in a great measure the pattern of the younger Churches&/
life. No one questioned that David must take over Saul’s responsibilities. The problem was what to do with Saul’s armour. As the theory or theology of this relationship became one of the main themes of ecumenical discussion, so its practical solution began to dominate Mission policy.

The Scottish Missions and their churches were as thoroughly entangled in this complicated pattern as any in the world and the story of these years reveals the progress of attempts to untie the knots without damaging the fabric. Responsibility had to be transferred without on the one hand crushing the young Church with burdens it was unable to carry, or on the other hand abandoning or committing to the dustheap all the sharpened and tempered weapons over a century of patient labour.

The name given by the majority of Western Missions, including those from Scotland, to the transfer of responsibility was first that of “Devolution”, and then of “Integration”. The change of title indicated, as we have seen, a change of emphasis occasioned by new insights gained from experience and the pressure of outside events. Devolution and Integration might be described as two roughly parallel roads towards the same goal, the second of which was adopted when it was found superior to the first. The need for some such form of transfer was stressed at Edinburgh in 1910 and in 1912 India’s National Missionary Conference passed a resolution that the work of evangelism be gradually passed over to the Indian Church. (180)

Devolution describes the form taken by the process of transfer as worked out by Western Missions in the 1920’s and early 1930’s and was a word still popular at the Jerusalem Conference in 1928. It was informed by a genuine sympathy with the aspirations of the Younger churches, a spirit of penitence on the part of Western missionaries, and a recognition of the need to place power and responsibility firmly into Indian hands. "We ourselves/
are the greatest hindrance to progress" declared an article in the Scottish missionary magazine early in the 1920's. "We block the initiative in the people about us. We must repress ourselves even when we see things going wrong and remember that there is a Power working in us and in our Indian fellow workers and that the work is not ours."(181) Eagerness to shoulder the loads given them was often displayed also by Indian leaders. But there was as yet little actual understanding of the Church's wants and weaknesses. According to Dr. J.W.C. Dougall, formerly Secretary of the Church of Scotland's Foreign Mission Committee, "devolution was never accepted by the Church of Scotland as part of its policy". (182) But this is to give the word a particular interpretation which it did not always possess.

"Devolution", as first understood by Scottish Missions, was a comprehensive term which covered a number of possibilities. Two schemes of devolution were placed before the United Free Church in 1921 and a meeting of their missionaries held in India that year agreed that "devolution of responsibility from the Mission to the Indian Church should be the accepted policy of Mission Councils."(183) Among the suggestions made were these:

1. More Indians should be appointed to Mission Councils. But this would perpetuate the division between Church and Mission.

2. The transfer of a particular area to the Indian Church. This would give the Church complete if limited responsibility, but little power to undertake it.

3. The transfer to the Indian Church of particular departments of work. (184)

Within the next ten years or so, every one of those suggestions was experimentally put into practice in some Scottish field, and every field tried to work out its own most fruitful form of devolution.

Meanwhile other Missions working on schemes with the same end in view,

NOTES

181) Ibid.
182) Letter to the writer from Dr. J.W.C. Dougall.
183) "Conference", Feb., 1921, p.5.
184) Ibid.
had been taking rather different courses of action. The American Presbyterian Mission in the Punjab, for instance, with which the Church of Scotland's Mission had close fraternal associations, took the view that devolution meant eventually the abandonment of the area by the Missions. They held that all power and responsibility should be transferred to the Church as its leadership and finances proved able to accept them. Meanwhile a strict rule was observed that so long as the Mission retained financial responsibility, control also should rest in its hands. When the process of devolution had been completed, the Mission would then be free to divert its resources elsewhere. A development of Venn's theory of euthanasia, this highly individualistic viewpoint emphasised the New England virtues of self-help and self-reliance. But it allowed little room for fraternal bonds within the Church Universal and tended to define responsibility in terms of financial self-support. It also took little account of the scale on which Western Missions had been operating.(185)

A different line of approach was taken by the Methodist Episcopal Church, with which Scottish Missions in Northern India came increasingly into contact from the 1930's onwards. This Church rejected the view that the Mission should gradually leave the Church to carry on work formerly undertaken by the Mission. Support at every level must continue to be given, but responsibility must stage by stage be handed over until finally the Mission as such ceased to exist, its functions having all been absorbed into the Church.(186)

There was a third possibility, namely that a Mission might simply hand over its assets to the Church and walk out. But this was a course too irresponsible to be considered, amounting as it would to a denial of /

NOTES
185) Ibid. In the 1950's, American Presbyterian Missions still considered that the Church should only control work that it was able to finance. See "Conference", Feb. 1954, p.4.
friendship and a betrayal of trust. The real choice, it came to be seen, lay between the first and second alternatives.

After another six or seven years had passed, Scottish Missions had had time to assess the results of their devolution policy. The general consensus of opinion, as reflected at one of the United Free Church's Biennial Conferences held in Bombay in December 1927, was that devolution was a failure or at best a very moderate success. It was true that Indians now felt they had some real control and a place in which creative work might be done. But there were not many signs of the Indian Church seeking to accept responsibility, as distinct from power, and there was even some resentment because Indian Christians thought the Scottish Church was trying to evade its obligations. (187)

This last suspicion, though unjustified, was intensified in the years immediately to follow, for with the advent of a world-wide financial depression most Western Missions were discussing the need for retrenchment. (188)

Meanwhile Scottish missionaries, many of whom "dislike the word Devolution", preferred to speak of "co-operation". Objecting to the artificial separation of Church and Mission they even spoke sometimes about an immediate merger - "The Mission as a separate entity ought to be dissolved at once and - we missionaries should serve in, under, by, with and for the Church of Christ in this land of India." (139)

The position was clarified somewhat when the reunited Church of Scotland appointed a Survey Commission to decide on what scale work might be continued. An accumulated debt of £53,000 at the time of union had been wiped out, only for the next year to produce a deficit almost half as big, and the Survey Commission's primary task was to look into spending. (190) Nevertheless it also presented a valuable review of Mission policy over the preceding years./

NOTES
187) "Conference", Feb. 1928, pp.1-6
188) C. of S. Report, 1933, p.528
189) "Conference", Feb. 1928, pp. 1-6; Feb. 1934, p.10
190) C. of S. Reports, 1933, p.528; 1935, p.609.
and concluded with the words, "None of the main departments of our work can be dispensed with without loss." (191) The question of retrenchment was not settled, for offerings were going down as expenses soared. (192) The possibility of having to abandon a whole field was seriously discussed. (193) But again the gap was temporarily plugged, and much more emphasis now began to be placed on the fact that the future of the older Churches was indissolubly linked with that of the younger. (194)

The second world war now intervened, but the Church of Scotland had already rejected Devolution insofar as it rejected every interpretation of it save one. The Mission must not abandon the Church, which through no fault of its own, was too dependent on Western leadership and institutions. Nor must it wash its hands of responsibility by handing Mission institutions over to the Church as a gift and walking out, leaving the Church on the spot to cope as best it could. Nor on the other hand must it simply jog along maintaining the status quo, and by increasing Indian representation on Mission Boards perpetuate a system of dyarchy. The only solution left was to merge.

The war had not yet ended and political independence was still the crucial issue of the day when the National Christian Council began demanding that missionary work be directed through the Indian Church and by that Church and urged that Missions transfer their administrative functions. (195)

The principle of "devolution" now gave way to that of "integration", and it was to this that attention was increasingly directed. For Scottish Missions, the situation was complicated by the fact that they were integral parts of the home Church, and not of an independent Society. In their desire/

NOTES

192) Congregational offerings which totalled £235,000 in 1929 went down in 1936 to £205,000. C. of S. Reports, 1930 and 1937.
193) C. of S. Report, 1933, p.590 f. The three most expensive fields, each costing the F.M.C. more than £20,000 annually, were Rajputana, Manchuria and Madras.
194) C. of S. Report, 1933, pp. 566-573. The unbreakable nature of this bond was one of the themes of the Tambaram Conference in 1938.
to create independent Churches they had indeed gone out of their way to keep this organisation separate from that of the Indian Church. The umbilical cord, which had in principle been cut many years back, was that between Western Church and Mission on one side and Eastern Church on the other. In the case of Anglican Missions, although it was not until 1930 that the (Anglican) Church of India, Burma and Ceylon was established, the work of their Societies had been placed under the control of the one national Church. While this allowed for rather too much domination not only by Western missionaries but by the mother Church in England as well, it greatly eased the process of integration.

"It is a curious fact" ran the 1947 Report, "That the Church of Scotland -- should have created in India a missionary organisation parallel to and in many ways independent of the Indian Churches which grew out of the missionary effort. There are historical reasons for this and the motive was a good one - the creation of free and indigenous churches which, though like our own in worship and government, were in no sense a part of the Church of Scotland. At the same time the present situation leaves us with a problem of integration far more complicated and difficult than Anglicans or Methodists have to face. The Evangelistic Board of the Punjab has one line of approach, the Mission Board of Nagpur another, Madras through its Circle Committee another. -- It is for us to hear what the Spirit is saying to the churches, whether younger or older."(196)

If the problem was essentially a spiritual one, it was also partly a matter of administrative technique. An operation must be performed so that the Mission might now function as part of the daughter Church rather than that of the mother. With national independence, partition and the founding of the Church of South India, all events which had taken place only a few months earlier, delegates from the Scottish Mission Councils met together to make positive /

NOTES

196) Ibid., 1947, pp. 346-347.
proposals for Integration. Uniformity was not demanded for all eight fields but a certain unanimity of opinion was hoped for, and in fact only the Rajasthan Mission Council differed markedly in its approach from the others. (197) In the winter of 1950-51 a small but high powered delegation came out from Scotland to tour all the fields and on the strength of their recommendations, taken with those of the respective Mission Councils, it was agreed to effect organic union between Missions and Churches. All work was now to operate through Church courts or committees of the United Church of Northern India or the Church of South India. (198)

In practice the merging operation was a lengthy one, never centralised but taking place in each field in a separate series of stages. It was not until the 1960's that with the dissolution of the last Mission Council it was technically completed. Then only the higher educational institutions, under separate Boards of Control, remained outside the jurisdiction of the courts of the Indian Churches.

Even so, since the process involved Christian workers growing together in obedience to God, integration required rethinking. The concept of independence for the younger churches had to be balanced by a sense of partnership on the part of the older. "The principle of integration is as it were a triangle" wrote the Rev. Frank Ryrie. "Its two basic ideas — the autonomy of the indigenous Church and the partnership of the older Church — are united by a third ruling idea, the unity of the two Churches within the one Universal Church —" (199) We may here recognise a development in line with the current trends of ecumenical thinking. The relationship between older and younger churches, however, being live and not static, is one which requires periodic adjustment. Until some new word is coined to describe it "integration" will continue to bulk large among discussions in Indian church/

NOTES

197) Ibid., 1948, pp.350-353.
198) Ibid., and F.M.C. Minute No. 522 of 18 July, 1950
After Independence

The situation of the Indian Churches in the period - now almost twenty years - which has elapsed since India became two independent nations, has not altered in any radical respect. This has been due largely to the smooth take-over from British to national rule. The massacres which preceded and followed on Partition had an immediate effect on the Christians of the Punjab, some of whom lost their lives, but otherwise the change was a peaceful one. Freedom to propagate as well as profess and practice their religion was granted to Indian Christians (201), and at the higher levels of administration this regulation has been adhered to very fairly. Anything that smacks of "proselytising" is frowned on, however, understandably because Hinduism is not itself by tradition a proselytising religion. At lower levels there has been a certain amount of interference by bodies like the Rashtriya Soma Samgh, and educational authorities have found it difficult to accept Christian "exclusiveness" when it comes to the type of syncretistic worship encouraged by Basic Education institutions. (202) And enquiry into Christian missionary activities in the Central Provinces, occasioned by the questionable behaviour of some small missionary units not connected with the National Christian Council, has served in the nature of a warning. (203) But evangelism continues, virtually unhindered. And while it is a hardship for Christians of outcaste origin to be denied Harijan educational grants, this cannot be classed as religious discrimination.

---

**NOTES**

200) See e.g. reports on the General Assembly of the UGC, N.I., "Conference" Mar. 1966, p.2.
201) The Constitution of India, Article 25 (1), declares, "All persons are equally entitled to freedom of conscience and the right freely to profess, practice and propagate religion". The word "propagate", which applies of course to all religions, was included at the strong insistence of Christian representatives.
Hinduism itself, while it is in one sense more popular than ever, is being rapidly secularised and its ancient symbols taken as representative of national aspirations rather than any deep spiritual truth. Philosophical Hinduism has cut itself off from Hindu mythology, while for most people the cinema, rather than the home or the temple, has become the chief medium of religious instruction.

The smallness of the Church has continued to be a major problem, with Christianity in many areas barely keeping pace with population growth. In 1962, the Foreign Mission Committee spent 34% of its income in Africa, 36½% in India and 7.5% in Pakistan. Yet the African Christian communities outnumbered those on the Indian sub-continent by more than ten to one. Where the Indian Churches counted 22,000 communicant members, the African Churches had 242,000. This goes a long way towards explaining why Indian congregations have been slow in attaining financial self-support and why the burden of so many institutions has proved so very much greater than they could bear. Since the Christian monopoly of service towards the poor and underprivileged has long ended, contacts with non-Christians have in proportion decreased. And this in turn has lessened the opportunities for evangelism and strengthened the Church’s leaning toward becoming an isolated community.

NOTES


207) It also explains why in African movements for political autonomy, and the national governments which took over, African Christians played such a very much more prominent part. With the exception of Jomo Kenyatta and the Muslims of Nigeria and North Africa, most African nationalist leaders of Nigeria and North Africa, met-African nationalist leaders of any note have had at least a nominal Christian connection. In Africa, it has been African Christians who have often acted in an unchristian way. In India, on the other hand, non-Christian leaders were influenced by many Christian ideas. See J.W.C. Dougall, "Christians in the African Revolution", St. Andrew’s Press, Edinburgh, 1963.

The standard of the ministry and its numbers, or lack of numbers, also occasions anxiety, the comparative neglect shown by Church of Scotland Missions towards theological education being without doubt partly to blame.(209)

For all that, churches have been developing along a variety of lines, in women's work and youth work, lay training, volunteer evangelism and stewardship training. The U.C.N.I. has maintained a missionary in Kenya to work among Indians there and the C.S.I. has supported Indian missionaries in Papua and Thailand. Both Churches have also made strides towards the further healing of denominational divisions.

The two outstanding dangers faced by the Indian Church appear, to Western eyes at least, to be those of absorption and of self-absorption. The spirit of syncretism is native to the Indian soil and Hinduism, which has assimilated so much of the Christian ethic, is only too willing to take the whole Christian religion into its system. A visitor is reported to have been told by an Indian leader - "I see a great future for Christianity, but it is a future of absorption."(210) Ten years later a missionary was giving it as his opinion that, "There is real danger that the Christian Church may be absorbed into a reformed Hinduism - the Church is far too isolated from the world."(211)

The enemy here is the basic pantheistic assumption that all religions, if not the same, are complementary. A popular picture sold in Indian bazaars depicts Gandhi sitting cross-legged before the globe of the world: behind him looms the shape of the Cross and behind that again the shadowy figure of the Buddha. Certainly tolerance has in the history of Christianity proved an enemy far more dangerous than intolerance. Yet three points to be noted here are, first, that the Hindu belief in the equality of all religions has in itself led to a certain attitude of intolerance towards those who, as Christian do,

NOTES

211) Ibid., 1960, p.443.
insist on the unique qualities of their own faith. (212) Secondly, it is undoubtedly a fact that warnings against the perils of absorption come on the whole from modern lips. (213) And thirdly, Indian Christian theologians are themselves deeply concerned at present with expressing Christian truths in language comprehensible to Hindu hearers. This is a very necessary advance. (214) 

If the Indian Church's present-day Scylla is the spectre of absorption, then its Charybdis is self-absorption. "There is the temptation for a small church to withdraw, safeguarding its prestige and privileges." (215) "The Church needs closer identification with the currents of thought and action that are at work in the country," (216) "It is parochial." (217) "The Church is far too isolated from the world." (218) Such statements are typical of those trying in recent years to assess the spirit of the Church.

"Undoubtedly there has been in increasing pre-occupation with the Church itself," wrote J.M. Paterson, the Church of Scotland's Asia Secretary, on his return from a field tour. "The Church has settled down as almost a community within a community, concerned principally with itself, a Boro church content with the Boro people and not reaching out to Hindu neighbours, a Santal church content to leave the Bengalis to find their own church, a Bengali church unable to reach out to the Santal immigrants round its doors; and everywhere a church made up almost exclusively of Christians from the depressed classes tending to become inbred and introverted because it lacks the constant contact with the higher classes." (219) This is a temptation which we may recognise /

---

NOTES

216) Ibid., 1957, p.356.
217) Ibid., 1958, p.430.
218) Ibid., 1960, p.444.
219) Ibid., p.448.
as common to churches of all ages. Yet it can be seen as the more pressing of the two dangers which threaten the Indian Church at present.

But while it necessary to try and understand something of that Church in its strengths and weaknesses, the last word should not remain with it alone. In 1947, the Church of Scotland's Foreign Mission Committee approved an important Minute on the relation of the older and younger Churches, to which the preamble read:

"The foreign missionary work of the Church of Scotland is part of the evangelistic effort of the universal Church, by which it seeks to draw men in all lands through repentance and faith into membership in the Body of Christ and to build them up in unity in Him in whom all human divisions of race, class and culture are transcended. The Church of Scotland has from the beginning regarded its foreign mission enterprise as an integral part of the life of the Church, springing of necessity from the nature of the Church itself. It has, in the same way, placed at the centre of its concern the bringing into being of other living branches of the Church in other lands which should accept for themselves the same missionary obligation, the discharge of which is one of the essential marks of a living Church. The Foreign Mission Committee has on many occasions reiterated its convictions that the fulfilment of this task was the purpose of all its manifold labours and the measure of their success."(220)

This Minute cleared the way for that process of integration at the end of which the "Mission", as an organisation, ceased to exist. But the relationship, the partnership between Scottish and Indian churches in the Church's whole mission, continues. We have reached a new point of departure and it is too early yet to foresee what direction the next stage of the journey will take./

NOTES

220) F.M.C. Minute 3799 of 1947.
It is already evident that the relationship is less unilateral and much more bi-lateral. The overseas Council’s most recent step in this direction was to invite to a "Consultation" in St. Andrew’s in the autumn of 1965 delegates from all Churches and Church Councils with which the Church of Scotland shares in mission. (221) Among those present were four delegates from the Church of South India, ten from the United Church of Northern India and two from the United Church in Pakistan. In separate papers prepared by the Pakistani and Indian delegates on, respectively, "The Muslim and the Christian" and "The Hindu Community and the Christian", equal stress was laid on the need to understand those two faiths. The approach with the Christian message must be made in a spirit of love and humility, and through selfless and sacrificial service. An address given by the newly retired Moderator of the U.C.N.I. was entitled "Fellowship in the Furtherance of the Gospel", and as the theme of the Consultation was "mission", so the emphasis was appropriately laid on the Church’s corporate responsibility for mission. (222) We shall now go on to consider the individual histories of the churches raised by Scottish Missions, with a view to assessing how capable they may be of carrying their fair share of this responsibility.

NOTES
221) The General Assembly appointed an "Overseas Council" as the combined successor of the Foreign Mission Committee, the Jewish Mission Committee, and the Colonial and Continental Committee.
222) "Report of the St. Andrew’s Consultation, 1965" passim.
General Sources.

H. Kraemer, "The Christian Message in a Non-Christian World" (see Ch. I)
K.S. Latourette, "A History of the Expansion of Christianity", Vols. VI and VII.
J. Murray Mitchell, "In Western India", David Douglas, Edinburgh, 1899.
J.W. Pickett, "Christian Mass Movements in India", (See Ch. I)
R.W. Weir, "Foreign Missions of the Church of Scotland".
"Our Church's Work in India", published for the U.F. Church.
"The Relations Between Younger and Older Churches", Jerusalem Meeting Report of I.M.C., Vol. III (See Ch. I)
"The Growing Church", Tambarani Series, I.M.C., Vol. II (See Ch. I)
Annual Reports of the Foreign Mission Committees,
Correspondence, Scottish National Library.
"Conference" magazine.

Great Britain

India, etc.
G. Banerji, "The Concept of Empire", (See Ch. IV)
J.A. Dubois, tr. G.U. Pope, "A Description of the Characters, Manners and Customs of the People of India", Higginbotham, Meir, 1853.
Michael Edwardes, "The Last Years of British India", George Allen and Unwin, Ltd., 1954.
General Sources (Contd.)

S. Mitra, "Resurgent India", (See Ch. IV) W.H. Moreland and A.C. Chatterjee, "A Short History of India", Longmans, Green, Ltd., London, 1945 impression.
P. Spear, "India, Pakistan and the West," O.U.P., 1949
PART II

THE FIELDS.

Introduction.

Our aim is to mark the establishment and trace the development of responsible Indian churches in the eight fields where Scottish Missions set to work. It is not to recount the actual history of those Missions.

That ground has already been covered, though necessarily in a curtailed form, in Dr. H.G.K. Hewat's official history and in earlier publications. There is also a considerable body of literature dealing with the lives of individual missionaries or with the work of some particular field or section of it. Such books and pamphlets describe in detail the year-by-year triumphs and vicissitudes of those Missions. There would be little point in attempting a fresh summary more extensive than that contained in the previous chapter. And a full history of each Mission's operations would constitute a major work, besides requiring first-hand experience in the fields concerned.

Our aim is a much more limited one. The Indian churches sprang from the work of the Missions, and as a direct fruit of their evangelistic efforts. But while it was the primary aim of every Mission to plant a Church, and to Christianise Indian thought, habits and culture towards that end, the methods adopted by Western Missions led to the erection of a multifarious network of activities. Immense volumes of time, thought and effort were expended, of which the immediate results were often meagre in the extreme. This is not to suggest that those labours were therefore wasted or misdirected. It is simply to point out that indigenous churches were invariably very small kernels within very large nuts.

To take an example almost at random, in the year 1883 the Bengal Free Church Mission had a full-time paid staff of 5 ordained, 2 lay and
7 women missionaries; 6 Indian pastors; 22 trained men and 21 trained women. The total Indian Christian agency, including untrained workers numbered 57, and there were employed in addition 83 non-Christian teachers. The Mission maintained a University College and 52 schools, with an enrolment of 369 undergraduates and 3,172 pupils. Local contributions towards the upkeep of this work totalled £5,592, most of it coming from fees, government grants and donations from interested friends. The Gospel was preached to tens of thousands of non-Christians in several hundred villages, and thousands of Gospel portions were sold.

The visible product of all this activity, which had by now been expanding steadily for over half a century, was a scattered Christian community of 428 souls, 132 of whom were children. Their number had been added to in the course of the year by the baptism of 4 adults and 12 children. The amount of money being raised by this community annually for the support of their church was in the region of £100. (1)

It is with this visible kernel that we are chiefly concerned, however. Accordingly it will be necessary to take largely for granted the mass of work being carried on in schools and colleges, dispensaries and hospitals, through the education of girls and the visiting of women in their homes and in a variety of other social efforts. We must even accept as an invariable background the huge number of man-hours spent on direct evangelism, on preaching in city streets and squares, in villages and market centres, at festivals and by the roadside as well as through constant personal contacts. This background will only be referred to in general terms, and in particular when some specific phase of Mission work or development of policy observably affected the local

NOTES:
Church's growth and character.

Ultimately, of course, Church and Mission were so closely interrelated that neither can be considered except in terms of the other. Yet a distinction between them can be made and does indeed appear in both Church of Scotland and Free Church Mission Reports from the 1860's onwards, under the heading of "The Native Church". It is the history of these "native churches" that we shall in the following chapters attempt to follow.
CHAPTER VI.

THE CHURCH IN WESTERN INDIA.

On 4th February, 1831, with prayers of thanksgiving, the first Presbyterian congregation in India was formed at John Wilson's house at Ambroli, Bombay. It consisted of John Wilson himself, his wife and nine Indian members. Five of them were converts whom Wilson had baptised earlier that year. One was a Christian of African descent who had been baptised in his youth. One was a Brahmin convert from the Konkan area, another had been baptised in Bombay two years earlier and the last was a Roman Catholic convert. John Wilson explained the nature of Presbyterian Church order and was elected moderator and pastor (1).

The Directors of the Scottish Missionary Society objected to the action taken, on the grounds that they were not unanimous in recognising Presbyterian principles or ordination vows. But the congregation continued as constituted and this was one of the reasons why a few years later the Western India missionaries petitioned the General Assembly and the Church of Scotland accepted responsibility for their work, (2).

Their initial venture, the opening of a rural mission in the Southern Konkan and the establishment of vernacular schools under non-Christian teachers, had shown little sign of success. When John Wilson, arriving after the Mission had been at work for six years, joined the Mission Council at Bankcote in 1829, it was to witness the baptism of a convert, but only the second to have been won in those years. (3)

NOTES.

(2) Ibid., p.52.
(3) Our Church's Work, "The Story of our Maratha Missions", p. 20; Smith, op.cit., p.40.
It had already been decided two years earlier to place one man in Bombay. And Poona also, where John Stevenson had settled in 1831, looked a more fruitful field. A year later the rural mission was closed, its small Christian community of 42 baptised members being more or less left to fend for themselves (4), and Bombay and Poona, the latter an orthodox Hindu city about 120 miles to the South-East, became the two centres of work. Schools giving instruction in English were opened in both places (5) and while the missionaries still firmly held to the belief that direct evangelism and the distribution of Bible portions and Christian literature were a Mission's primary agents, they laboured to make these schools a focal point from which Christian truth might be brought to bear on the educated classes. (6)

The Bombay school, later to become the Assembly Institution and eventually Wilson College, proved itself an instrument as powerful as the original model in Calcutta and by the end of its first year had a roll of over 400 pupils, the great majority being high caste Hindu youths. (7) Unlike Poona, however, Bombay was a highly cosmopolitan city, containing a mixed community which included Parsees, Muslims and "Bene Israel" Jews. Missionary work in the capital was of a many-sided character and never shaped to present a challenge to Hindus alone. It was a group of three Parsee students who, influenced by John Wilson's lectures, were the first to beg for baptism some eight years after the

NOTES,

(4) Our Church's Work, p. 32.
(5) Ibid., p. 21.
(6) See Wilson's address to the Free Church Assembly of 1843 - Smith, op.cit., p. 220.
(7) Our Church's Work, p. 21.
school's foundation, and while one was carried off by his friends the other two took refuge in Wilson's house. Both these men were baptised and later ordained to the ministry. One of them, Hormasji Pestonji, served for a period with the Scottish Mission in Bombay and later became pastor of a Baptist Church in Poona. His companion, Dhanjibhai Nauroji, went to study divinity in Edinburgh and returned to serve with the Scottish Mission in Bombay and then in Poona. (8)

A third notable convert, from caste Hinduism in this case, was made four years later in the person of Narayan Sheshadri and a fourth, a decade later still, was Baba Padmanji, a brilliant student who was to become a prolific writer in Marathi. These two men also studied for the ministry and were ordained to work alongside the European missionaries. (9) Through the winning of four such men of exceptional calibre, the Bombay Mission had made what it considered to be the first step towards the establishment of a national Church, namely the recruiting of a dedicated and highly trained Indian ministry.

It is worth noting that the Mission's Home Committee was not entirely in agreement about the methods employed or happy about the rate of progress achieved. The Committee and its supporters naturally tended to judge success in terms of the number of converts gained. It was equally natural to make comparisons with the development of the Church in New Testament times. Year by year, doubts were expressed at the emphasis being placed on teaching institutions and the amount they took up of a missionary's time and energy.

NOTES.

(8) Ibid., p. 24.
(9) Ibid., p. 25.
Just as repeatedly, in missionary reports and replies, we find it stressed that quality must be balanced against quantity. The men who were being converted through the influence of the Institutions, though they might be few in number, were potential leaders who would be trained to convert others. Missionaries further pointed out that the amount of time expended on academic work was more than equalled by the time spent every week on street and bazaar preaching, in the conduct of regular Services of Worship, in the giving of Christian lectures and in the preparation and distribution of Christian books and pamphlets.

Direct evangelism was being carried on with unceasing vigour by the missionaries themselves, and, in increasing numbers, by Indian workers. But results, whether in the city or in the country, were still meagre. It was Indian Christians who were best fitted to preach to and persuade their fellow-countrymen. And with this end in view the Institutions were key centres, from which men of immense value to the Church's future were brought to Christian conviction and trained for Christian service. (10)

In Bombay, and Poona, therefore, as in Calcutta, Madras and Nagpur, the beginnings of the indigenous Church are during this period vastly overshadowed by the work of the Mission as a whole, which is concentrated on the task of evangelism by a variety of methods. The picture is that of a large factory at work, and at the same time expanding and testing new machinery, the production side of the enterprise being still in its infancy.

There is great activity. Buildings are going up and institutions multiplied, extended and improved. Missionaries and their Indian colleagues teach, preach, lecture, write, translate, visit homes, entertain enquirers/...
and travel widely into country areas. In Bombay, with its variegated population, this ministry is conducted in many languages—in English, Marathi, Gujarati, Hindustani, Persian, Arabic and Portuguese—and the converts who are made come in from every one of those language groups and communities (11). That this could be done at all was due to the fact that the Bombay mission was fortunate in having, in John Wilson and Murray Mitchell, two exceptionally fine linguists, each of whom gained a reputation as an Oriental scholar. Much care and thought was also taken that each Indian worker should be trained to work among the community with whose language and customs he was most familiar.

The full story of these activities is recorded both in original reports and letters and in the Mission histories compiled with their aid, and we are not here concerned with it. It is simply necessary for us to appreciate something of the overall situation. In any long-established Church, set in a country which has acquired a Christian background, Christian concern centres on the nurture and activities of the Church community. The situation which confronted these missionaries and their converts was very different, and the upbuilding of the gathered Church took only a small proportion of their attention. Even the energy of the Indians who had now been ordained to the ministry was directed to teaching and evangelism rather than to tasks of pastoral care. The Church was neither large enough to require a full-time pastor nor was it in a position to support one, and the idea of an unpaid or partially trained ministry was not one which commended itself to missionaries of the period. There was a top-heaviness about the situation of which the Mission's leaders were well aware, but they regarded this as temporary and worked hard to rectify it.

NOTES.

By 1853 the strength of the Mission at Bombay, Poona and the newly-opened stations at Satara and Surat had reached a total of six ordained missionaries, 8 ordained Indian pastors, 2 licentiates, 2 ordinands, 15 Christian teachers or other trained workers and a number of paid workers of lesser capacity. Apart from the Bombay Institution, with its 340 students, there were 20 to 30 boys' and girls' schools, with a total enrolment of over 1300 pupils. But the number of adult baptisms reported for the year only came to 5 for Bombay, 3 for Poona and for Satara and Surat none at all. (12)

The report from Poona for the previous year speaks of "the native Church", with its 27 communicant members, 18 baptised children and 4 adults baptised during that year. (13) But that Church was only a group of humble men and women gleaned mainly from outcaste communities, grouped for the main part round the Mission compound and often dependent on the Mission for employment or other support. The local missionary can speak with feeling about "the vicissitudes to which infant churches in heathen lands are subject" having tried his faith and patience. (14).

The new venture at Surat, the first to be opened by a native convert, the Rev. D. Nauroji, among the Dheds — "A low and much neglected caste" — had still to make its first convert. (15) Even the mother church in Bombay, with its 35 communicants and 26 baptised adherents, most of them children, was only the part-time charge of a busy missionary and met to worship in Marathi at his bungalow.

NOTES.

(13) Ibid., 1853, p.25.
(14) Ibid., 1855, p.5.
(15) Ibid., 1854, p.21.
It was still a matter for exceptional rejoicing when the number of adults baptised in a year reached double figures and each convert is reported on individually, the story of his spiritual pilgrimage being a little triumph on its own. Both in terms of numbers and of self-sufficiency, the Church of the 1850's was only in its infancy. But that is not to say that its growth, nurture and character were regarded as matters of relative unimportance.

"The mere number" (of converts), runs part of a report in 1856, "Conveys to those who are distant but a poor and inadequate impression of what, by God's blessing, has actually been achieved. To realise this one must witness for oneself the small assembly when engaged in worship, and enter by lively sympathy into the greatness of the change or transformation which it indicates. Then indeed the marked cleanliness and tidiness, decency and sobriety, in the general appearance of old and young, male and female, contrasted with any mixed audience of mere heathens --- their staid attention --- the awakening intelligence --- the devoutness of their manner and the heart and soul thrown into their voices when singing --- would soon convince the most backward or sceptical that Christianity was at least beginning to take root in this long long barren land" (16) This somewhat lyrical passage, typical of Dr. Duff who was visiting Bombay at this time, is backed up by the rather more sober judgment of Dr. Wilson when he declared, "our native Church has long been distinguished for the intelligence, piety and devotedness of its members."(17)

NOTES.

(16) Ibid., 1856, p.13. Written by Dr. Duff consequent on a visit to Bombay.
(17) Ibid., 1859, p. 15.
Intelligent, pious and devoted though they might be, the majority of those Bombay Presbyterians were men and women of very humble position. Of the 8 adults baptised by the Mission in 1858, it is remarked that "they were of less high position than some earlier converts." (18) And from Poona the next year came a similar report of "3 influential converts" but no educated young men from the Institution, "though many say they are praying for conversion" (19). As Dr. Hewat points out, the missionaries in Poona, of whom there were seldom three and occasionally only one, had a heavy task. Besides having to cope with and raise money to support numerous schools, catering in the mid-fifties for about a thousand pupils, they acted as ministers to the Scottish regiment stationed in the Cantonment, did Evangelistic work in the city and the surrounding district and cared for the Indian congregation, even although for much of the period the Mission had no building of its own. (20)

Both in Bombay and Poona, the missionaries themselves indicated clearly some of the factors which were hindering the growth of the Church. Aggravating the shortage of missionary staff was the fact that the Home Committee was unwilling to pay the salaries of native agents. The Committee took the view, hampered as it was by lack of funds, that it should support "ordained Missionaries", whether European or Indian, but all other agents should be dependent on money raised locally. This naturally limited the amount of work which could be attempted.

At the same time, the Bombay Mission pointed out that they had no wish to see all their converts as official propagandists. Other Missions had made the mistake of pressing into paid service converts

NOTES:

(18) Ibid., p.11.
(19) Ibid., 1860, p.41.
(20) Hewat, p. 54.
whose experience and abilities were unsuitable, the chief temptation being
the common one of having to help find employment for caste converts disowned
by their families and communities. The Scottish Mission preferred to see
even able Christians obtaining useful employment elsewhere — one of their
converts had been appointed headmaster of the Presbyterian orphanage and
another was assistant secretary of the Bombay Bible Society. And among
converts under training, they were proud to have men of first-rate calibre,
such as two young Parsis and a Jewish convert now training for the
ministry and a former Muslim who wished to become a medical missionary.
The emphasis was still on quality rather than quantity and on long-term
effectiveness rather than immediate results.

Under pressure from the Home Committee, however, there can be seen
about the beginnings of the 1860's two forms of development which directly
affected the growth of the Church (21).

Early in 1862, a Conference on Missions, appointed by the Free
Church General Assembly, was held in Scotland, during the course of which
several misunderstandings on missionary principles were cleared up.
The first point at issue was the dominant position of the "Institutions",
and while it was confirmed that the institutions at Calcutta, Chinsurah,
Bombay, Poona and Madras be kept on, agreement was also reached that
rural missions should be encouraged. Several new missionaries were appointed
and there was a fresh surge of interest in extension into country areas (22).
One important result of this new emphasis was the foundation of the "rural
Mission" in Santalia. And in Western India, the Mission Council was
persuaded to release the Rev. Narayan Shoshadri from work in the Bombay
Institution in order that he might open a rural Mission near Indapore, in
the Deccan (23).

NOTES.

(22) Ibid., 1862, p.3.
(23) Ibid., 1863, p.31.
The Conference further arranged for Committees of Management to be formed in each area to supervise the institutions and Mission work in general, it being laid down that those Committees should not interfere with the duties of the local Presbyterian. (24). This move had a double aim. It sought to increase a Mission's efficiency while leaving a way open along which an independent Church might develop. Correspondence had already been taking place about the need to appoint Indian pastors over native congregations with a minimum of delay and this had been agreed to in principle by the missionaries on the field. (25) In Bombay, the situation was made the more urgent because the buildings at Ambroli were going to be lost to the Mission. (26) By 1859, plans were already being made to build a church and call a native pastor, and while it was to be ten years before that object was finally attained, the movement towards it was to continue steadily (27).

1860 - 1900.

In the forty-year period between about 1860 and 1900, which can be described as the second generation of its life, the Free Church Mission developed work in four directions: in Bombay itself, through the College, direct evangelism and the city congregation; through rural work which was taken up again and extended further in the Konkan area; round Poona; and in the Mission begun by Dr. Sheshadri at Indapore, of which Jalna later became the centre. Of these the last was, from the point of view of indigenous growth, by far the most remarkable and will repay more detailed study.

NOTES.

(24) Ibid., 1862, p. 20.
(25) See Chapter 5.
(26) P.C. Report 1860, p. 43.
(27) Ibid., 1861, Appendix 7, p. 50. See also Our Church's Work, p. 32.
The Marathi congregation in Bombay, which at the beginning of the 1860's consisted of 75 communicant members, with a total community of 150, did not yet have a pastor of its own. Dr. Wilson acted as Moderator while Nauroji, though an ordained minister and resident in Bombay, was employed by the Mission for evangelistic work. (28) In character the congregation was both mixed and scattered, with members continuously on the move. Many of those on the roll did not live in the city at all — out of 89 communicants in 1867, thirty-five are listed as non-residents, a good proportion being paid agents. (29) Others, being poor and living at a distance from the Mission chapel, where Services were held, did not come regularly to worship and in order to foster a proper congregational spirit a plan was drawn up and funds were raised for the erection of a church in the centre of the city. The new building was dedicated in 1869, at a cost of Rs. 51,000, three-quarters of the sum being raised locally, though mainly from European friends and sympathisers. (30) Proudly reckoned "the most suitable church in India" (31), it soon proved, as had been hoped, a centre for the development of a fuller congregational life. We may note at the same time that the outward forms of that life were without exception based on models taken from evangelical Protestantism. Activities included a weekly prayer meeting, a mothers' meeting, a Sabbath School, a catechism class for children and a weekly Young Men's Class. A more original effort was the institution of "love feasts", other congregations being invited to join in.

NOTES.

(28) Ibid., 1862, p. 42.
(29) Ibid., 1868, p. 29.
(30) Ibid., 1868, p. 17; 1869, p. 18.
(31) Ibid., 1869, p. 18.
"We have found it necessary" wrote Nauroji, who had taken charge of the congregation in John Wilson's absence, "to have something like reunion and social gatherings among us. Our converts are cut off from all entertainments taking place among their brethren according to the flesh and they are too poor to have such things themselves —- We have consequently got up our Love Feast. On such occasions we invite some of the brethren of other churches and we try to turn the social intercourse into a means of cultivating Christian intercourse." A start was also made at teaching the virtue of systematic giving, and a sum of about Rs 50 could be counted on each month from collections and subscriptions. (32)

Efforts to create a spirit of Christian community were obviously needed for a group of such a polyglot nature. Services were normally conducted in Marathi and English but on occasion in Gujarati and Hindi also, and a list of the six adult converts baptised in one particular year indicates the unusual diversity of this congregation's make-up. It includes a Gujarati woman, a Muslim of partly European parentage, a Hindustani speaker, a Roman Catholic (possibly of Goanese extraction), a Kanauj Brahmin and a Rajput Brahmin. (33)

With a small, but steady influx of adult converts year by year --- 9 in 1861, 14 the next year and 8 the next --- one might have expected the church to grow more rapidly than in fact it did. But newly trained Christian agents were constantly being sent to work elsewhere, and poorer members who had migrated to the city in search of employment moved on. Girls from the Boarding School also, who in one year, for instance, accounted for 10 out of the 13 adults baptised, would return to their own villages to marry. (34) And periodic famines, followed/

NOTES.

(32) Ibid., 1871, p.18.
(33) Ibid., 1870, p.25.
(34) Ibid., 1873, p.21.
often by plague, sometimes had a devastating effect both by increasing
the death rate and scattering families from their homes in search of
work and food. By the turn of the century the total Christian community
had only risen to 230, about half of these being communicant members. (35)

The object of self-support, while kept constantly before their minds,
was not rapidly reached. "It is hoped that in the course of time the
congregation will be trained to that habit of sustained and regular
contribution to the support of the Gospel ordinances, so that they may
are long be in a position to choose a native pastor for themselves",
wrote Nauroji a matter of six or seven years after the erection of the
new church. (36) But it was not until 1884 that the congregation's
first pastor was ordained and nine years later the Kirk Session, while
it had launched a Poor Fund for its own members, was only contributing
Rs. 30 a month of the Rs. 75 required for its pastor's salary. (37)
Meanwhile there were those modest triumphs and failures which accompany
the growth of Christian character. There came the year when there were
no adult converts and 8 members had to be suspended for lapsing from
faithful practice. (38) Yet the church could be described as
reflecting "a spirit of love and union, and a ready sympathy with
suffering Christians of all denominations." (39) The business of the
congregation was reported as being carefully conducted by the Kirk
Session --- "It is their earnest desire to promote a spirit of worship/

NOTES.
(36) F.C. Report, 1876, p.19.
(37) Ibid., 1884, p.26. : printed statement "A Short Account of the Poor
Fund in connection with the Ambroli Free Church", Nov., 1893 (S.N.L)
(38) Ibid., 1871, p.18.
(39) Ibid., 1883, p.36.
and devout piety." (40) By the end of the century it could be stated, perhaps a little optimistically, that all families conducted family worship and instructed their children in the truths of the faith. (41)

By the 1870's, it had become clear in Bombay, as in Poona and other Indian cities, that Hinduism was beginning to offer fresh resistance. Dr. Hewat, in her history of Protestant Christianity in Bombay, speaks of this as a decade of new methods, (42), and this was at least partly due to a realisation that Hindu morale was stiffening. "We thank God," wrote the Rev. Ganpatrao Navalkar, "that the heathen are raging: for ignorant zeal is better than moral deadness." (43) One consequence of this fresh wave of opposition was to awaken Indian Christians to a greater sense of responsibility. "The evangelisation of India, humanly speaking, depends mainly on the burning and shining lives of those who are gathered into the fold of Christ from among its peoples" wrote Nikambe, the Marathi pastor. "The responsibility therefore of those who have the management of the infant churches of India is very solemn. What the majority of the people of the country need in studying Christianity is not the Bible but the lives of those who profess it." (44) The immediate fruit of this call to witness was a series of religious meetings whose object was to stir church members to take an active part in the evangelisation of their city. Nikambe is to be found writing again a few years later: "It is important to mix with our Hindu friends and manifest Christ in our walks and talks with them, so as to /

NOTES.

(40) Ibid., 1889, p.27
(41) Ibid., 1890, p.38
(42) E.C.K. Hewat, "Christ in Western India," Chapter 8.
(44) Ibid., 1889, p.29.
remove all wrong ideas they have about Christ and his holy religion."(45) Small and scattered though this group of city Christians was, it was beginning to give indications of independent life.

In the 1880's, the Mission had instituted a course for the training of a new generation of pastors and while these were not men with the outstanding attainments of early converts like Nauroji or Sheshadri, the fact that they became pastors rather than "missionaries" added to the strength of the churches.(46) Their course of instruction was inevitably based on Scottish models, including classes in Greek and Hebrew, but the study of Hinduism and high proficiency in the vernacular were also required (47). While these pastors were supported in part by the Mission-raised Sustentation Fund, an increasing proportion of their salaries came to be carried by their congregations. And while still tending to lean on the Mission for the employment of its members and moral support, the Bombay congregation at least had a Kirk Session which took seriously its responsibility both for internal discipline and for the evangelism of its Hindu neighbours.

The Church of Scotland, through its Institution, also attempted to maintain a foothold in Bombay city and during the 1860's had two catechists employed in evangelistic work and 2 ordinands in training. Services in English and Marathi were held in the premises of the Scots Kirk, but the native Christian community never seems to have risen above the fifty mark. For years at a time, one lay missionary was left to run the Institution single-handed and by 1890 it was finally decided to/

NOTES:

(45) Ibid., 1894, p. 29.
(46) Ibid., 1881, p. 23; 1884, p. 7.
(47) Ibid., 1884, p. 7.
close the Bombay Mission. From this time onwards the Church of Scotland concentrated its efforts on the strong women's Mission in Poona, which in 1900 had no less than 10 women missionaries on its strength. (48)

Of the Bombay Free Church Mission's rural work in the Konkan districts it will not be necessary to say much at this juncture because, as was the case also in Bengal, the end of the century saw no organised country churches yet established. After half a century of neglect, a new start was made in 1876 with the planting of a small medical station at Thana, in Northern Konkan.(49) A dispensary and a small hospital were opened in charge of Dr. Lazarus, a qualified Indian doctor, and contacts made with the Mahars, a depressed and low-caste Hindu group. In the Southern Konkan, a high school was opened at Alibag and later an Indian pastor, the same Ganpatrao Navalker who later returned to Bombay, did good work there for about twelve years in the face of difficult conditions. "If the good people of Scotland knew the kind of people we have to labour among, I feel confident they would feel much sympathy with us" he wrote once. "We have to deal, in the whole of this district, with Brahmans and Parbhus, the two most intellectual and intelligent classes of people in the Konkan, whose pride of caste and religion is as great as the unregenerate heart could feel; and their opposition to Christianity is intensified by a misconception which has been associated with the political aspirations of the time. Missionary enterprise is condemned in the minds of some as foreign and as incompatible with patriotic ambition. Scepticism appears to be our greatest foe in this country. Agnostic publications are imported largely into our great cities and their influence is felt even in the villages and small towns." (50)

NOTES.

(48) C. of S. Reports 1860-1900 passim.
(49) F.C. Report, 1878, p.27. The medical unit was started at Golward and moved to Thana the following year.
(50) Ibid.,1885, p.27.
Complaining that he had too much to do, Navalkar pointed out that other missions put more of their resources into district work. "In other missions they have two Europeans for a High School, one European for the English Service, a pastor for the vernacular service, a European for evangelistic (?) work and other men for literary work. But at Alibag one man does it all." (51) Yet the city missionaries, while determined to build up the College, were eager to extend operations in the country too. "We have not abandoned hope of being able to give substantial aid towards the extension of district work", wrote Dr. Mackichan. (52).

Christian influences were spreading to some extent and some converts being made, mainly from among the Mahars, but on occasion from the high castes too: sufficient for an appeal to be made that a European Missionary should take over the Konkan work and unite it. The Rev. Wilkie Brown was appointed to this post in 1894 and increased the number of primary schools, besides opening preaching stations at Kalyan and Karjat in the Northern districts. The last years of the century were famine years, and while this hampered work already in progress it brought the Mission in touch with the wild and primitive Katkari tribe who came to Karjat for famine relief. A catechist was set apart to teach them and a church, school houses and dwellings for Mission agents set up near a Katkari hamlet. As yet, however, /

---

NOTES.

(51) MS letter from G. Navalkar, Alibag, to Dr. Smith, dated 2.1.1891, S.N.L.

(52) MS. letter from D. Mackichan, Bombay, to Dr. Lindsay, dated 2.11.1893, S.N.L.
these small groups of converts in the country were not considered advanced enough in the faith to be established as a congregation in their own right. (53)

The Church In Poona.

The Mission in Poona, a strong point of traditional Brahminism, found progress very slow and difficult. About one fifth of the city's population of 100,000 were reckoned to be Brahmins and their power, through the control of government departments and by the priesthood, was political and economic as much as it was religious. In order to win their support the British Government, when taking over in the 1820's, had established a Sanskrit College which tended to become a centre of opposition to Christian influences.

Continual service over a period of more than 30 years by the Rev. J. Murray Mitchell, who had started the work in Poona in 1834, enabled the Mission to gain a foothold through its schools. And the healthier climate, which caused it to be selected as a military cantonment, also encouraged the establishment of a strong Women's Mission (54). By the 1860's, the Free Church Mission had 3 Anglo-Vernacular and 7 Vernacular schools, with a total of over 1,000 pupils (55), while the Women's Mission was running 6 day schools and a Boarding School for girls. In the same decade missionary efforts were further reinforced when the Church of Scotland transferred its women's work to Poona, and later Miss Annie Small of the Free Church started a venture among Muslim women and girls. (56)

Regular evangelism was carried on by Mission agents both in the city and in villages within a radius of 8 to 12 miles and a Christian community 

NOTES.

(53) Our Church's Work, Chapter 4.
(55) F.C. Report, 1862, pp. 10 and 36.
(56) Hewat, p. 56.
had been gathered of about 90 people, who met to worship in Marathi in the Mission chapel. No native pastor had yet been appointed, but a Missionary Association was encouraging church members to support evangelistic work of their own. It could be claimed that there were very few people in Poona or its immediate vicinity who had not heard something of the Gospel, yet converts were few and Hinduism still presented a solid front. (57)

Clearly there were many obstacles to be overcome before this small congregation could regard itself as in any sense independent. To begin with, it remained for far too long Mission-based and Mission-orientated. To nearly the end of the century, services continued to be conducted in the chapel in the Mission compound, which was some distance from the city centre, and to which Hindu enquirers could seldom be persuaded to come. (58). In addition, too high a proportion of its members were Mission agents — in the year 1892, these still accounted for 66 out of 154 communicants. "This is our vulnerable point" confessed the Rev. D.G. Malkar, pastor at that time. (59) A third adverse factor stemmed from the fact that the majority of other converts were poor and constantly leaving the district in search of work. The situation was further aggravated by the refusal of many Caste Hindus to give work to Christian converts (60) Through its Orphanage and by various other means, the Mission tried to find employment for Christian boys, but the problem remained a thorny one.

The lack of an independent community spirit being recognised as a weakness, a suggestion was made in the 1860's that in order to bring

NOTES.

(57) F.C. Report, 1863, pp.40-42; 1865, p. 78.
(58) Ibid., 1868, p. 70.
(59) Ibid., 1893, p.59.
(60) Ibid., 1863, p.42; 1865, p.78.
Christians into one locality houses might be put up in the compound for rental. "Thereby their Christian fellowship and harmony might be greatly promoted and their spirituality advanced." (61) Fortunately the drawbacks of such a scheme were appreciated and it was not pressed.

One of the Bombay Mission's ablest converts, the Rev. Baba Padmanji, a prolific writer in English and Marathi, was appointed pastor of the congregation in 1866 and ordained the next year, while a Kirk Session composed of two European and two Indian members was elected. This Session went about its work most conscientiously, meeting one year as often as 17 times, exercising discipline and visiting the homes of church members and the go-downs of servants of the European community. But not surprisingly, it took time before Christians recognised its authority. "The Session is quite a new thing to our people here; they are apt to connect it with the Mission", reported Baba Padmanji. "I have endeavoured to show that our authority to sit in judgment is derived from the Lord Jesus Christ, who is the sole Head of the Church."

In this atmosphere, the tendency to lean on the Mission and the lack of any desire to accept responsibility, either for the support of their church or for the sacrificial business of Christian Witness in a heathen community is only too easily understood. Yet it was a constant cause of complaint from both Missionary and Indian leaders. "We must learn that in the Church of Christ we are to be something and not merely to get something." (62) "We would like to remove/
children from their parents\' influence, which is not always healthy" (63) "Evangelistic work is urged on the congregation as their proper work -- but they are not as yet really responsible." (64) "We seem to have arrived at a time when it is necessary to review our work -- we are losing ground relatively." (65) And during a prolonged vacancy --- "the people do not realise their duty and are content with a missionary." (66)

Such comments are typical, and a chronic shortage of missionary staff does not by itself account for the lack of progress. The failure of the native church to accept for itself the task of winning Hindu neighbours was all the more disheartening because while educational methods were not gaining converts neither was the more direct evangelistic approach. "The idolatries of India die hard. The difficulties of evangelism increase. Old ways of resistance are given up but new ways are assumed", wrote John Beumont in the 1880's. (67) A year later he confirmed these words by a review of the efforts of the Salvation Army, which after three years had decided to withdraw from Poona: "The collapse of the Army is complete. It would be incorrect to say, the great citadel of Paganism remains intact... It will not have been effort thrown away if it throws Christian men back on the old paths of plod, prayer and patience". (68)

The Poona missionaries had hopes of getting their High School raised to the rank of College but eventually it had to be closed, this being regarded locally as a calamity to the Mission, which "lost much of its/
prestige and a means of contact with the educated classes." (69)

Yet by 1890 the Christian community had reached the 300 mark and a few years later the congregation raised for the first time the entire salary of its pastor, contributing something also to the support of the poor. (70) More than a third of this came from Europeans taking an interest in the church, however, and the pastor felt that "the likelihood of an increase of supplement from the congregation is very small, for with three or four exceptions our Native Church Members are hopelessly in debt." (71) To a suggestion from Scotland that the congregation should try to emulate the achievements of a nearby American Mission, the missionary replied that "In that Mission what is called self-support is in reality a fixed contribution from the incomes of the Mission agents, so large is the proportion of Christians employed by the Mission.--- A thoroughly spontaneous and independent support of the pastorate cannot be secured until you have an independent community." (72) Finally, by 1895, a new church -- "the largest in the city" --- was constructed in a commanding position, to prove a real source of encouragement. (73)

While its cost was borne mainly by Mission funds, many church members contracted to give a month's salary to the building fund. And with improved attendances on Sundays and at weekday meetings, the production of a monthly newssheet, the launching of a series of revival meetings and the formation of a branch of the Christian Endeavour, there was evidence of a new spirit. (74)

NOTES

(69) Our Church's Work, p. 44: MS papers, 1888, S.N.L. (Folio 7827)
(70) F.C. Report, 1896, p.36
(71) MS letter from D.G. Malker, Poona, to Rev. J. Forgan, Clerk to the Free Church Presbytery, Bombay, dated 28.4.1886, S.N.L.
(72) MS letter from Rev. J. Small, Poona, to Dr. Lindsay, dated 16.8.1886, S.N.L.
(73) Our Church's Work, p.48.
(74) F.C. Reports, 1895-1901 passim.
Yet there was very little outreaching beyond the city limits, mainly because the small missionary staff were only occasionally free to visit the villages. "The work in the districts -- we can attend to only for a month or two out of the year with such staff as we have here and Poona is then deserted", explained the Rev. J. Small (75).

The pressure of the famine which was sweeping the country at this time and a virulent outbreak of cholera now brought, with widespread tragedy, new forms of opportunity to both Church and Mission. Hindus took note of the sacrificial service given by several Christians, and of the fact that among Protestants the number of casualties from plague was remarkably small. (76) By 1900 the congregation had 130 communicants on its roll, with about the same number of adult adherents and children. (77) And it was a unique and happy feature of the local situation that, since the Church of Scotland had no male missionaries in the area, Christian converts, usually girls, who had come in through the work of the Women's Mission joined the Marathi congregation, so making it "informally, yet in reality, a union church." (78)

The Church in Jalna.

No Scottish Mission in India achieved a more promising start than that begun in Jalna by Dr. Narayan Sheshadri in 1864, and none offered more encouragement to home supporters questioning the value of city institutions.

The original appointment was for Sheshadri to supervise the opening of rural work at Indapore and at Jalna, two towns nearly 150 miles apart. But the Jalna Mission which he began by visiting twice

NOTES.

(75) MS letter from J. Small, Poona, to Dr. Lindsay, dated 16.8.1886, S.N.L
(76) Ibid., 1898, p.41. The death of a recent and very promising convert, one Shankar Sonatali, a forest ranger, who died of cholera while doing famine relief work apparently made a strong impression. See Torrance, op.cit., p.48.
(78) Our Church's Work, p.47.
a year, proved so fruitful that it soon became the centre of operations.
A Brahmin and a convert of the Bombay Institution, Sheshadri was a man
who combined rare intellectual gifts with a silver tongue, and his
personal charm enabled him to win the confidence of men of any class,
creed or nationality whom he might happen to meet. With all this
he was a selfless and dedicated missionary, though with more in him
of Barnabas than of St. Paul. As a lecturer at the Institution in
Bombay, he had shown his compassionate interest in the poorest of the
poor by starting a sweeper Sunday School. In the course of the next 27
years he succeeded in building up single-handed from among the degraded
Mangs the largest Indian Christian church yet gathered in by any
Scottish Mission.

Jalna is situated in the State of Hyderabad, a little over 200
miles West and slightly North of Bombay. When the Mission opened, it
was very much an upcountry station, only to be reached by a journey of
almost 100 miles over rough cart tracks from the nearest railway halt.
Villages in the district were populated chiefly by Kumbis, a sub-caste
of small farmers. But dependent on them were the Mahars and Mangs
of the outcaste "cheris", most of whom were landless labourers. It was
from the second of these groups, aboriginals who had been absorbed into
Hinduism, that the Church drew the majority of its converts. The Mangs
are described as a "despised and down-trodden people to whom is allotted
much of the menial work of the village, such as blowing a horn and beating
a drum before the temples every evening, making hempen ropes, watching
in the fields.— Not even the Mahars, from whom an outsider cannot
distinguish them, will enter their quarters for fear of defilement."(79)

NOTES.

(79) F.C. Report, 1897, p.42.
In taking the Gospel to these people and building up a church among them, Sheshadri put into practice some highly original ideas. He was, as Dr. Hewat remarks, in many ways far ahead of his time, especially in his appreciation of the fact that renouncing Hinduism did not necessarily mean turning one's back on every local or national custom. While working through the accepted Mission system of paid workers, he early on developed methods of evangelism which appealed to his hearers as rooted in their own traditions. One of his assistants was set to composing hymns in Hindustani, Marathi and Telegu and setting them to native tunes. A blind musician with an orchestra of "fine strings, cymbals and a drum" went round singing these Christian lyrics from village to village. Indian Kirtans or song-dramas, which might last all night, were baptised into Christ. And as the Church grew, the Christian Mela, or community festival, became a regular feature of its life. Apart from the content of these presentations, the main difference insisted on was that Christian performers never accepted alms.(80).

Within 2 or 3 years, a community of almost 100 Christians had been baptised and with yearly accessions of 30, 40 and sometimes as many as 60 adult converts, there was very soon the nucleus of an indigenous church of unusual strength and vitality. "If there be not a caste movement" wrote Sheshadri, "there is certainly what may be called a family movement. They have been bringing over their relatives and friends to think in the same way as themselves."(81)

As the number of converts multiplied, however, the problem became more pressing of how such groups were to support themselves. With their

NOTES.

(80) Ibid., 1867, p.75 ff; 1875, p.26 and passim.
(81) Quoted Hewat, p.62.
humble origin, the question of out-casting did not arise, and they were allowed to remain in their villages. But duties such as the beating of a drum before the village idol obviously ran counter to Christian professions, yet if on becoming Christians they refused to do such work, the traditional dole of charity and other forms of employment would be taken from them. Sheshadri did not insist on their renouncing such activities, but instead conceived the idea of a "Model Christian Village" where landless labourers might be set up on small farms or taught honest trades.

The village of Bethel, for which he charmed 800 acres of land out of the Muslim Nizam's government, was founded in the 1870's to consist eventually of a Church and manse, school houses, mission workers' houses and private dwellings. Plots of land were allotted, and some help given with animals and equipment, while other men and youths were trained as masons, carpenters, smiths or gardeners. (82).

These efforts were all part of a clearly expressed aim, that of founding a Church which should be indigenous by nature ... "We have all along earnestly desired to see a vigorous and indigenous Christianity taking deep root in the soil." (83); and again, "We are anxious, under the blessing of God, to produce an indigenous and self-supporting body of Christians."(84) In the pursuit of this purpose, the elements of self-propagation, self-support and self-government were all given their place.

Self-propagation was in fact taught from the earliest years. "It is our earnest endeavour to turn our native churches into missionary churches indeed" he was writing in 1868, "What we have longed to see is the New Testament Christianity acted over and over again."(85) Six years later,

NOTES.

(82) Our Church's Work, pp. 54-55; Hewat, pp. 61-63.
(84) Ibid., 1869, p. 28.
(85) Ibid., 1869, p. 27.
he was encouraging the formation of "Associations of Christian Young Men" to travel round as bands of volunteer preachers. And a year later still a Home Missionary Society was founded (86) While many of his converts were illiterate, they are described as being fluent at discussion with friends and relatives, until ordinary people complained that they were not able to speak with Christians.

Such natural forms of Christian witness were made the easier because Sheshadri followed what is now the recognised practice of baptising converts in their own villages, with their headman and neighbours looking on, and encouraging them when possible to transform their surroundings rather than move from them. (87) With Bethel as the example, the intention again was to teach ways of life which would be distinctively Christian without appearing strange or foreign. The morning at Bethel started with a daily prayer meeting run on informal lines. "He who presides at the meeting invokes a blessing, gives out a hymn to sing, and when that is over he makes the congregation read the appointed passage verse by verse. Then, to bring out the salient points of the passage read, he puts a few questions on it or makes a few practical remarks and concludes the exercise with prayer."

Sheshadri's personal habits made it simple for him to encourage such a programme. "In my own dear father-land I am generally up at 4 o'clock" he wrote on one occasion to Murray Mitchell on his return from a visit to Scotland. "At five o'clock a number of young men belonging to our Christian Association come to seek the work of God. We have taken a leaf out of the old Puranik system. At 6 o'clock I go down with my hurricane lamp --- into the body of the church when a bugle is blown and a number of men/

NOTES.

(86) Ibid., 1875, p.26: 1876, p.23.
(87) Ibid., 1887, p.45.
(88) Ibid., 1885, p.29.
women and children flock to Zion for a short morning service."(89)

By 1885, there were groups of Christian families in 30 villages and four years later the number had risen to 40. The hope was that each of these would in turn become another Bethel. Gathered about its church and its schoolhouse, communities would grow through worship and in the Christian graces, which would include the desire to share with their neighbours the treasures of the Gospel.(90)

Accordingly, while paid workers, both men and women, going out not singly but in bands, would visit in a year over 1600 villages, preaching to nearly a quarter of a million people, every Christian was exhorted to regard himself as an evangelist. "The growth of the Church is evident from the readiness with which many of them take part in the services of the sanctuary both on Sundays and week-days. A large number of our people are encouraged to become what may be called local preachers in the villages where they reside." (91)

Self-support, the second plank of an indigenous church, was to be attained by training Christians to become economically independent both of the Mission and of their Hindu masters. The people of Bethel who had been given houses and allotted land or taught a trade were at the same time encouraged to support their church, though this was recognised as a long-term aim. "It is our earnest desire that our churches should be self-sustaining. But it will, I fear, be a long time before this is accomplished. Such of our converts as are agriculturalists are continually reminded to give one-tenth of the produce of their fields and some of them have willingly/

NOTES.

(89) MS letter from N. Sheshadri, Bethel, to J.M. Mitchell, dated 1.5.1878, S.N.L.
(90) Ibid., 1889, p.32.
(91) Ibid., 1867, p.75.
promised to do so." (92) In spite of such exhortations, however, generations of subservience and the generosity of a Mission able to support 50 workers combined to keep Christian liberality at a low figure. By 1900 a community of over 1,000 was contributing only Rs.950 a year. (93)

When it came to self-government, we find that Sheshadri had definite and progressive ideas about the training of suitable pastors. "For years past" he wrote in 1874, "we have been endeavouring to raise up a band of young men who may eventually become teachers and pastors of these congregations --- It is true that they may not be able to go through the same course of theological instruction as most of our ministers in the Presidency towns. But for village congregations such highly qualified ministers are not necessary. We hope to raise up a humble class of men, well grounded in the theology of the Bible and such subjects as will be absolutely needed." (94) The training such men received must have been given mainly in the course of the monthly workers' meetings which were a feature of the Jalna Mission's system and by work set for individual study.

Ten years later and about six years before his death, Sheshadri's scheme did not seem any nearer fruition. "Before we pass away from these earthly scenes, we should like to see (our) 30 villages --- wherein our Christians reside, supplied with pastors duly qualified, called, ordained and settled over their respective congregations. How is this to be accomplished? What divinity College in Scotland or India can supply us with such a large number of teachers and ministers of God's Word? We mean to submit to the Free Presbytery of Bombay, during the course of the year, a scheme of

NOTES.

(92) Ibid., 1867, p. 75.
(93) U.P.C. Report, 1901, Statistics.
(94) F.C. Report, 1875, p. 22.
studies to train up village pastors in connection with our Bethel Mission --- and hope will have their approval of the same."

In discerning the need to ordain men with a comparatively low standard of education for village congregations, Sheshedri was ahead of most of his contemporaries and his proposal would not commend itself in that form to a Presbyterian body with exceptionally high standards for its ministers. Yet European missionaries were equally sure that new systems of training would have to be devised before the Indian Church could achieve independence. "Self-supporting and self-governing churches cannot be secured in India as the result of a desire on the part of the Home Churches", warned Murray Mitchell from Poona in 1886. "...To secure the desired result we must legislate. We must adopt other plans when our own Churches require suitable pastors. The lads educated in the New College, Bombay, are not lads who will adapt themselves to the pay our Native Churches are likely, for a century to come, to give them. -- The College -- cannot on its present lines raise up a native ministry for Western India." (96) At the end of the century we find Dr. Mowat at Jalna still asking the Free Church to take up in earnest the systematic training of agents and emphasising the need of a central theological institution for the whole Marathi area. (97)

The fact must be faced that with all its original features and the excellent plans of its founder, the Jalna Mission was paternalistic, and grew more so as it increased in size. The creation of one man, it became too large for the type of personal supervision it required and the gap between intention and achievement grew wider. The Church relied on Mission funds not only for the support of full-time workers but for a great variety of material subsidies. As a Christian village, Bethel was/

**NOTES.**

(95) Ibid., 1885, p.39.
(96) MS letter from J.M. Mitchell, Poona, to Dr. Smith, dated 16.8.1886, S.N.L.
(97) Statement on Mission Agents to F.M.C. sent by A.G. Mowat, dated April, 1899, S.N.L.
no more successful than most similar experiments. Instead of providing a model of spiritual growth and self-help, it soon produced a crop of difficulties for Sheshadri's successor. (98) Most important of all, the Mission, after more than quarter of a century of growth, had produced no Indian leaders capable even in part of taking over the prophet’s mantle.

Alternatively, it is possible to hold that at this point missionary policy made a serious mistake, in replacing an experienced Indian leader with an untried young Scots doctor. Certainly there are few examples which reveal more clearly the difference of approach between Indian and European, particularly in their attitude towards what constitutes healthy growth. And it is a striking illustration of the danger of over-simplified notions concerning the building of a strong church among people who had for centuries been born and bred in slavery.

Young Dr. Mowat, who took sole charge of the Mission a few months after Sheshadri's death in 1891, and was joined three years later by an ordained colleague, saw his first task as the re-organisation of the Mission. In an area 40 miles long by 25 broad, with Christians living in 53 villages, he found that church discipline had become lax: Mission agents were mainly in debt; the majority were young and untrained, yet with the promise of usefulness; while schools, having been left to themselves, had become inefficient. (99) "When I took charge I found everything at Bethel in a most disgraceful state", Mowat was to report later. "There had been little or no discipline in the church for some time, the effect of which was that bigamists and others living in sin were in full communion. The attendance at church was most irregular.

NOTES.

(98) Our Church's Work, p. 56.
and unsatisfactory. Heathen customs were practised and the habits of the people were anything but cleanly. As I came to know them better and compared them with their Hindu neighbours I found them to be a lazy, ungrateful, thriftless, discontented people expecting the Mission to do everything for them and ready to revolt against all authority. The rules of the village were seldom kept and instead of attending school the children were allowed to run wild.” (100)

Full of zeal and energy, these two young men set out on a programme of internal reform. The kindliness of the gentle "Mang Guru" who tended to see all his geese as swans was superseded by a call to discipline and order, sacrifice and moral effort. The Church Roll was cut back drastically: village schools were attended to, standards raised and a system of training scholarships instituted: agents living in their own villages were moved to new quarters: a fresh course of instruction for workers was organised: a Kirk Session was set up and began to deal with cases of discipline, especially mixed marriages: a Boys' Boarding Home took over the task of teaching trades: a Provident Fund attempted to deal with the perennial curse of debt: several dispensaries were set up and then a small mission hospital: new contacts were made with the Mahars and with higher caste Hindus and Muslims and plans went forward for the erection of a church in Jalna. In short, as Mowat put it, a concerted effort was made to put the Church and Mission "on a firmer basis." (101)

One significant result was that for a number of years the steady stream of baptisms dried up completely. At the same time there were definite signs of a new sense of responsibility. The Kirk Session, however much it was Mission-directed, functioned as a representative authority. Some of/

NOTES:

(100) MS letter from A.C. Mowat, Jalna, to Dr. Smith, 15,3,1894, S.N.L.
(101) F.C. Reports, 1891-1896 passim.
the Bethel residents undertook the repair of their own homes. An elder made history by offering a gift of land for a church at Waipuri. (102) Mission agents agreed to subscribe one-sixteenth of their monthly income for building the church in Jalna, local contributions finally reaching a total of Rs. 900. A children's society began collecting clothes for the poor. "Our first work is to Christianise the Christians and we look rather to quality than to numbers in converts from Hinduism" wrote Mowat. (103)

With the succession of famine years which closed the century and brought widespread starvation, there were many applications for re-admission from excommunicated members. Clearly a good number of early converts had come in with mixed motives, or at least confused ideas. The Mission met the emergency by doing its best to supply work and food, the Jalna church being put up largely with famine relief labour. Many orphan children were also taken into the Boarding Homes.

By 1900, there were 150 candidates waiting for baptism, more than the church could adequately instruct, and a new church had also been built at Bethel. The Jalna congregation could not yet support a pastor and the elders were considered to have too inadequate a conception of the Church to be entrusted with full oversight, (104) but deacons had been elected, a Sustentation Fund set up, and there were hopes not only that a pastor would soon be called but for the establishment of a local divinity school. (105)

"Now that the Mission has been re-organised and the strain of famine/

NOTES.

(102) F.C. Report, 1896, p. 44.
(103) Ibid., 1899, p. 40.
(104) Ibid., 1898, p. 45.
(105) Our Church's Work, p. 58.
is meantime over, there is every prospect of a magnificent future for this large and vigorous 'Mission', runs the closing paragraph of the official history. (106). Unlike so many other hopeful prophecies this one was happily to be fulfilled.

Like its sister Mission in East Bengal, the Free Church Mission in Western India profited greatly from the high qualities of some of its earliest converts. Of the two Parsee youths who were among the first to be baptised, the Rev. Hormazdji Pestonji later joined the Baptist Church, but his friend and colleague, the Rev. Dhanjibhai Nauroji, gave the Presbyterian Mission and its church a life-time of faithful service.

Of Dr. Shehadri's achievements something has already been said, but it was also largely through his influence and example that Bapa Padmanji, a Hindu of the brazier caste, was converted. Working as a layman with the Bombay Bible and Tract Society, he became the best-known Marathi Christian writers. These four men all won reputations throughout India and beyond. (107).

1900-1920.

No Indian Province felt more directly and forcibly than Bombay the upsurge of national sentiment which accompanied the opening years of the century. Bombay itself, as a capital and university city and Poona as a meeting place for nationalist sympathisers, were strong points of the movement, while even up-country Jalna had its Swadeshi marchers and bazaar-corner speakers. (108) And with the growing interest in politics there came also a change of attitude towards Christian claims and Mission activities.

NOTES.

(106) Ibid., p.60.
A report from Wilson College written in 1904 describes the change of outlook in these words: "There are many influences at work in the thought of India at the present time that seem to be calculated to retard the progress of Christianity in the land. One result of the contact between East and West has been to invite comparisons between the character of the two contrasted types of thought supposed to be characteristic of each. Everything that is heard or read concerning the materialistic tendency of Western thinking as compared with the spiritual character of the ancient thinkers of India --- is assimilated with great readiness by the Indian mind, and often without the requisite discrimination. ----

--- This attitude of mind, together with a growing spirit of nationality, which regards Hinduism as necessarily bound up with maintenance of Indian nationality, constitutes one of the strongest forces that now oppose Christian progress among the more thoughtful classes in India. But the very strenuousness with which these positions are being maintained is one of the indications, that are increasing on every side, of the stronger approach of the claims of the Christian faith to the mind of India." (109)

As background to this atmosphere of hardening opposition to all things Western, of which Christianity was popularly reckoned to be one, we must set the ceaseless onslaughts of famine and plague which spared no corner of the Province and by 1904 was recurring in Bombay city for the ninth successive year. (110) And to add to the load of human misery we must not forget the all-prevaling "sloth, shiftlessness and debt" which horrified the shrewd eye and tender heart of Tom Dobson when he first reached Poona. (111)
In Bombay, Wilson College battled on through a variety of non-co-operation campaigns, and with a strong team of eight or nine missionary professors and the addition of two fine new hostels, the Mackichan Hall for men and the Pandita Rambai Hostel for women; had by the end of this period actually strengthened its hold on the student body. The most noteworthy advance was perhaps that being made among women. One student out of ten was by now a woman (112), the Girls High School with one hostel for Christian girls and another for Hindus was making a name for itself and women office bearers were beginning to take an active share in the work of the church. (113)

But as we shall see to be the case in the other cities also, the Christian community was too small, sheltered and concerned with its own quite genuine problems to be much affected by the greater winds of change. The little Ambroli congregation continued on its "largely independent" but unambitious way, with a community never exceeding about 270, until after nearly a hundred years of life it was faced with a new challenge and possibilities of expansion among poor Christian immigrants in the suburbs. (114).

District work, supervised by a district missionary who lived in the city, was carried on in the Konkan among a population of nearly

NOTES.


The beach in front of the College which was used for political meetings saw crowds of up to 100,000 people who overflowed into the College grounds and had to be dispersed by the police. See C. of S. Report, 1931.

(113) U.P.C. Reports, 1918, p.15; 1922, p.23; 1923, p.38; Hewat, p.49.

(114) U.P.C. Reports, 1909, p.30; 1915, p.30; 1923, pp.39 and 42; C. of S. Report, 1932, p.610; and passim.
100,000 people through the High School and leper homes at Alibag, the Thana dispensary and the Katkari settlement where a little mud-and-thatch hut was built for enquirers not yet baptised. (115) But while the number of baptisms sounded heartening -- there were 20 in 1921 and 27 a few years later -- these were almost without exception leper patients. (116) The native population stuck fast to Hinduism or found more interest in politics, and the remainder of the small Christian community, which never rose much above 200, consisted mainly of Mission workers and other immigrants. Little real progress was made against a number of fresh obstacles. (117) A Jesuit industrial school opened up among the Katkaris proved a strong counter-attraction, the Alibag High School lacked Christian boys to leaven the lump and a rival Government School began offering easy terms to pupils who had failed in their exams. (118) While there was among educated Indians in the district much sympathy with the precepts of Jesus, a definite response to Christian teaching was thought of as unpatriotic and there was as yet no question of appointing an Indian pastor or establishing an independent congregation. (119)

Poona, a breeding-ground for Indian intellectualism, had also by the twentieth century become a fine example of co-operative work among Missions, whose joint activities were considerable. We learn through these years of union prayer meetings and the Church's own inter-denominational /
Missionary Union: (120) also of social service activities in which non-Christians took part, such as the Society for the Protection of Children and the Poona Temperance Association, (121)

Of greater weight were the institutions through which the two Scottish Missions pooled their resources with other British and American Missions for evangelism and Christian training. The Torrance Hall, opened in 1904, became a centre for vernacular preaching: a joint High School was established, only to close again a few years later: while the Union Theological College, the Women's Training College and the weekly Christian magazine, Dnyanodaya, were all combined ventures supported by up to five separate Missions. (122) Simultaneously the Free Church Mission was experimenting with different forms of approach to educated Hindus at the John Small Memorial Hall, the Orphanage Press made great strides under the Scottish Mission Industries Company, and women's work was expanding with the founding of St. Margaret's Hospital. A network of schools and zenana contacts had meanwhile been built up by the Church of Scotland's Women's Mission, so that the united Mission which came into being in 1929 was a strong one, (123).

In this harmonious atmosphere, it is strange to find that almost the only discordant note was one sounded between the two Missions themselves.

NOTES.

(120) U.F.C. Reports 1902: 1908, p.32.
(121) Ibid., 1908, p.32: "Tom Dobson," p.83.
(122) U.F.C. Reports, 1906, p.34: 1911, p.21: 1921, p.33, 1923, p.45:
(123) U.F.C. Reports, 1905, p.31: 1909, p.31: 1911, p.21: U.F.C. and
C. of S. Reports passim. For a descriptive account, see
Just when the signs of spiritual advance looked most propitious ---
the Presbyterian Church of India had recently been formed, Missions of
different denominations were drawing closer together and the Nana Peth
congregation was on the verge of self-support -- the Church of Scotland
Mission decided to try and build up a congregation of its own. (124)
It seems clear that it was the Church of Scotland missionaries and their
agents rather than the home committee who insisted on this surprising and
disruptive action, which achieved nothing positive. (125) The Nana Peth
congregation lost about sixteen of its families, including two elders,
and the new congregation which at its maximum never rose above 200 had
to be cared for by a missionary, or in his absence the Scots chaplain. (126)
The original congregation was meanwhile reduced to about 300 people and
although its office-bearers rose to the occasion and managed to remain
almost independent of Mission subsidy, the death of its pastor was a heavy
blow coming at just the wrong time. (127) Happily the two congregations
were re-united in the middle of the war, and before it had ended they
were able to call as their minister the Rev. Rama Deshpande, a graduate of
Allahabad and a Brahmin convert whose personality was to be a source of
great spiritual power to the Church in Poona. (128)

While to Tom Dobson's eyes the native church in Poona appeared "like
the light of hope in verity -- the brightest thing I have seen since I
left home", he could hardly help remarking in the same breath, "How small/
are the numbers of Christians compared with other sorts of folks." (129)
For all the hard labour expended on it, it never grew much larger. Contemporary Brahminism continued to proffer an almost unbroken front, and while small groups of village Christians were being cared for round Paud, Lonsula and Saswad, little advance was being made among outcastes either. (130)
Contacts with the aboriginal Katkaris resulted in a few baptisms but within a few years all but three families had reverted to Hinduism. (131) There was no sign in this locality of a movement among the lowly Mangs. (132)
And while the town congregation, with its own Missionary Union, was taking part in street preaching and other forms of evangelism and village congregations could show themselves equally willing to follow any lead given them, what progress was made was Mission-organised. (133)

It was the expressed purpose of the Printing Press to "provide employment for converts, famine orphans and other adherents of the Mission and help such to become independent and self-supporting." (134) But it was a disappointment to find that when youths went out to earn their own living, the sheltered background from which they had come did not help them to make good workmen or develop personal independence. (135) The Christian community, loyal and conscientious as a whole, was still dwarfed and smothered by the institutions which provided it with protection and employment. Its proportion of responsible communicant members had increased and as, with devolution, evangelistic work was passed over to the Indian Board, the congregation responded by raising Rs. 1,000 towards it. Yet while it flourished on its own small scale, the surrounding atmosphere of unrest and

NOTES

(129) "Tom Dobson", p. 44.
transition was affecting it and on the other hand it was not really able to take advantage of those changes. (136)

For all the headaches it produced, it was the church round Jalna which offered the most immediate promise. Although after Dr. Sheshadri's death there had been a period of recession and it looked as if stricter control might finish the spontaneous movement among the Mangas, this did not turn out to be the case. A community which at the beginning of the century numbered a little over 1,100 doubled itself within ten years and by 1930 was nearing 4,000 (137)

"The outlook was never brighter" wrote Dr. Howat in 1901, and as the small mass movement gathered way again the two missionary leaders made it clear that it was the development of the native Church rather than the baptising of every enquirer which was their chief concern. Growth in spiritual life and interest in their own affairs was regarded as of more value than any more increase in numbers. "We aim at building up a strong, independent and self-governing church which will be missionary in character." (138)

There now began an era in which self-help and growth in Christian habits were accompanied by a gratifying expansion. Contemporary records give an illuminating picture of how these aims were translated into practice in the fifty villages whose people were still for the most part illiterate. By order of the Kirk Session, the roll was called at worship every evening and twice on Sundays. The Ten Commandments and the Lord's Prayer were repeated daily, every month an examination was held on the hymns/

NOTES.

which had been learnt by heart and the Gospel lessons which had been explained. The farmers of Bethel who had been living on Mission charity were now required to pay their rents regularly and at the same time seemed more contented. In Jalna the Christian Endeavour and the Children's Union kept the missionary spirit alive, the adults having their own Society which supported an evangelist.

Annual Melas with their devotional meetings and Communion Services, prize distributions for school children and singing competitions presented a scene "full of life," especially round the well in the morning and the evening, when all are drawing water, talking and washing their clothes. (139)

The idol worship connected with the Mang privilege of beating the daphadi was finally forbidden by the Kirk Session and while the rule held back enquirers it proved a benefit to those who were already Christians. (140) More were now coming forward to take instruction and vows of full membership, a spontaneous prayer movement sprang up and as church offerings increased people became aware of their duty to support their own schools. Pastors were installed and the central churches had to be enlarged. (141) Although there was on the surface still "much evil", Christian character was definitely rising to new standards, the refusal to panic in a time of plague being an example. As a result, the attitude of non-Christians towards this outcaste community was changing also. (142)

A great deal of the credit for the progress made must certainly go to the Co-operative Bank which by releasing farmers from the grip of money-lenders/
revolutionised the outlook of many families. As Dr. Sheshadri had so clearly foreseen, if men are to get their living from the land they must be free to reap its fruits and have an incentive to increase its yield. Debt arose not from extravagance but from custom and the lack of education which led to improvidence. The Co-operative Credit system which developed in time to co-operative effort through joint cultivation of crops was the only way to break the vicious circle. By 1918 over 400 farmers, some of them non-Christians, were enrolled in some twenty or thirty societies affiliated to the scheme and when a couple of years later famine struck again, it was this alone which saved many lives and homes. (143)

As the church grew in self-sufficiency and grace it was also growing in numbers, for Mahars as well as Mangs were now turning towards Christianity. The number of baptisms in a year went up from a hundred to over two hundred and in spite of the demoralising effect of famine there were always at least as many catechumens under instruction. (144) "We could go ahead almost without limit to the number of baptisms --- but who is to edify?" asked the district missionary. "We have small isolated bodies of Christians who are scarcely to be differentiated from their heathen surroundings." (145) The elements were present of the really sweeping type of movement which was taking place in parts of Hyderabad and of which Jalna was on the fringe. But the Scottish Mission was too cautious to baptise where it considered instruction and shepherding could not adequately be given. A staff of three ordained missionaries, twenty evangelists and seven Bible-women was still not thought of as large enough to fulfil this requirement. In the 150 villages where...

NOTES.

143) Ibid., 1912, p.33; 1918, p.15; 1921, p.32 and passim. See also "Tom Dobson", pp.109-146 for a detailed account of the workings of the Bank and its effectiveness.
144) U.F.C. Reports, 1913, p.34; 1922, p.26; 1927, p.83 and passim.
Christians were now living there were only twenty schools and with Mission funds being curtailed it was proving impossible to increase them. (146)

"If permanent workers and adequate after-care cannot be provided, are we justified in accepting large numbers?" asked the missionary again, "Concentration on the spiritual growth of the existing church is our present duty." (147)

A deliberate decision was therefore made here to sacrifice quantity in the interests of quality — "we are trying to build up this raw, primitive church." (148)

By far the largest of the three widely separated churches founded by the Western India Mission, the Hyderabad church was also at this rudimentary stage of its development the one in which natural forms of propagation were followed most readily. The custom observed in one village, where "every night the four or five Christian families came with their Hindu friends for worship to the teacher's house" accorded with a pattern that was encouraged and widely adopted. (149) Leadership still obviously rested in the hands of the Mission's full-time agents. And so far as self-support and government were concerned, while there were farmers who gave — or at least promised to give — a tithe of their produce, there was still a long road to be travelled. (150)

1930-1965.

The Christian community in the Western India Mission, now part of the U.C.N.I., increased during these thirty-five years from about 5,000 to/

NOTES.

(146) Ibid., 1924, p.49; 1925, p.44; 1927, p.85; 1928, p.30 and passim.
(147) Ibid., 1929, p.156.
(149) Ibid.
(150) U.F.C. Reports, 1918: p16; 1924, p.49 and passim.
to 7,000, the largest growth again taking place in Hyderabad. (151) The main problem facing church leaders was anything but unique but none the less very real. It was the two-fold difficulty of bringing converts in and, having once brought them in, of persuading them to look outwards.

"Parochialism is the besetting sin of the Church in Western India", wrote one missionary, and went on to explain that too many Indian Christians find an outlet for service through the Church and far too few in public service. (152) This applied particularly to the central congregations in Bombay and Poona, where lack of outward-looking interest led to quarrels and a freezing up of congregational life. (153) It applied in a different sense in Hyderabad, where a still-growing Harijan community continued to look to the Mission as the great provider. (154)

The problems of independence and integration, which were essentially the same thing and common to all Indian Missions, were here all the thornier because while the Church was weak in organisation and resources, the Mission whose responsibilities it must try to take over was heavily loaded with institutions, both educational and medical. (155)

The most significant advance to be made in Bombay came through the initiative of Wilson College which took most seriously the recommendations of the Lindsay Commission to work in closer contact with the Indian Church and was instrumental in starting up church extension work in the chawls and hutments of the suburbs among poor Christian immigrants from the country.

In the autumn of 1937, a sociological survey was made of the Indian

NOTES.

(152) Ibid., 1956, p.480.
Christian population of Bombay city. The planning of the survey was in the hands of James Kellock, later to be Principal of the College, and the field work organised by J.P. Ravade, an Indian student and ordinand. (156).

Happily the report of this survey did not suffer the fate of so many others and lie to gather dust on a library shelf. The concern of the church was aroused by the conditions revealed — of poverty, insanitary and overcrowded housing conditions, illiteracy, lack of religious education or any social life — and while the war intervened to delay much action being taken, in 1944 Ravade was appointed by the Mission to the full-time care of a "congregation" which had as yet no building to worship in. (157)

The original nucleus was a group of about 200 Christians, chiefly mill-workers, who met for worship in the Methodist church at Byculla. But with the help of students from the College and others, work was extended through house-churches, Sunday schools and home visiting in the Suburbs to the North where the city was greatly extending. (158) Pastoral care and social service moved hand in hand, it being one encouraging feature of the situation that quite a few of this floating population came from other U.C.N.I. communities round Jalna or Ahmednagar (159). By the 1960's, small "congregations" had been established in five suburbs, while there were other even smaller groups meeting in a house somewhere or in a room provided by the Municipal Housing Board. (160).

Co-operative work with the American Maratha Mission, the Congregational body whose churches were integrated with those of the Church of Scotland in the U.C.N.I., had now reached a stage when origins are neither easily/NOTES.


(159) Ibid., 1947, p.354; 1960, p.455.

distinguishable nor of much importance.

Of the six organised congregations coming under the Bombay Church Council, Ambroli is the oldest and most strongly established; Victoria Gardens congregation worships in a building that once belonged to the British Methodists, while the nucleus of its congregation once formed the Ume Memorial: Worli is a united effort and Parel a suburban congregation.

A certain amount of interest had been aroused among the more responsible church members when they learned of the conditions prevailing among Christian immigrants to the city, but the spirit of parochialism was very strong. A quarrel at Ambroli resulted in the congregation losing one third of its members, so that the Sunday School, pastoral visiting and finances all suffered. The affair was patched up and a few years later we read about occasional conversions and of members taking part in a "church week" or a stewardship campaign. (161)

But the general impression is of inbreeding, bickering and half-heartedness. Relations with St. Andrew's Kirk, still part of the Church of Scotland, have been personally most amicable, but the Scots chaplain claimed with some justification that apart from their not wishing to load the U.C.N.I. with additional problems, church union was obviously a different thing from Christian unity. (162)

A very worthwhile experiment has been made at Worli, where three congregations — U.C.N.I., Methodist and Anglican — use and help to maintain one new building in an expanding industrial suburb. A church, a hall and a residence were erected here in 1952 and over one thousand/

NOTES.


(162) "Conference", July 1964, p.3. See also article in this issue, "Unity in Separation".
Christians living in the area provided with a place for worship and social intercourse. (163)

The Bombay Church Council is also responsible for a fair amount of pastoral work among groups not yet formed into congregations. The Board of Evangelism and Church Extension, which was established as a result of integration in 1954, is the body in charge, with supervision of the pastors working in the city's Northern suburbs and of what remains of the rural Mission in the Konkan. Alibag High School was given up and leprosy work taken over by the Mission to Lepers, but pastoral care of the Christians in the Leprosy Home and of the handful of Katkari Christians is undertaken by the Board.

The original Gujarati-speaking congregation which had worshipped in Ambroli had also died out, but the body was revived again shortly before the first world war and under an active pastor soon grew into quite a flourishing fellowship. Since most personal connections were with the Irish Presbyterian Mission in Gujarat, however, this congregation, though it worships in the Ambroli church, comes under the Gujarat and Kathiawar Church Council.

The Bombay Council has its Central Fund to which in theory each established congregation contributes. But in practice each tends to struggle along on its own and it cannot be said that there is a healthy spirit of self-support at the congregational level or mutual support at the Council level. (164)

This is all the more regrettable since the College, while during this period of thirty-five years it had added its woman's hostel, built a chapel/

NOTES.


(164) Information obtained through correspondence.
and installed its first Indian Principal, was by this time working in a much more competitive situation and could no longer exercise the unrivalled influence of earlier days. (165) The number of women students had increased to over 30%, but the proportion of Christian students was actually on the decrease, with the result that Services in the chapel and the work of a body like the S.C.M. suffered accordingly and the task of making a Christian mark on either the student community or the city as a whole made that much harder. (166). So while on the wider canvas definite advances were being made in the direction of lay training and the development of women's organisations, Indian leadership and co-operative work, and to this extent the Church was keeping pace with the century, yet the gap between leaders and people was far too wide. There was a lack of spontaneous enterprise and the atmosphere resembled that of a none-too-confident self-help society. (167)

The situation in Poona, where the Mission was gradually being forced to retract through lack of missionary staff and funds, was hardly better. The orphan cottage home at Paud was transferred to Poona and St. Margaret's Hospital, after selling its lands and buildings to the Municipality in 1966, is being merged with the Mission's Wadia Hospital, (168). Meanwhile in the Nana Peth congregation -- now known as Christ Church -- a long vacancy was accompanied by quarrels and court cases, during which organisations lapsed and/

NOTES.

(165) C. of S. Reports, 1933, p.555; 1955, p.696 and passim.
and the church was at one point closed by a court order. (169) A lay training base, the "Spiritual Life Centre," was opened at Naarapur and much stress began to be laid on the need for Christian witness in civil work and non-Christian institutions. (170) When an unexpected challenge arose, like the flood which one year left tens of thousands homeless and turned church and mission buildings into refugee centres overnight, Christians proved themselves ready to respond with sympathy and service. (171) But the evangelical spirit which had helped to establish a second congregation, Kith Ganj, in Poona City in the 1940's, seems by the end of this period to have been confined mainly to groups of young men, whose inter-denominational Christian Youth Prayer Fellowship organised its own open-air meetings. (172)

As the home of Marathi culture and literature and also of some of India's great religious and social reformers, Poona could never have provided an easy target for Christian evangelism. Perhaps the establishment of a Christian college or the building up of a really good High School tradition would have helped. But as it turned out the Christian community has not up to date been sufficiently large or influential to make its presence much felt. Christchurch with a community of well over a thousand is one of the largest congregations in Maharashtra and with Ganj with less than 200 is already well on the way to self-support. But little fresh blood has been supplied through contact with virile if educationally backward rural communities, and as a result the salt has lost its savour.

Yet the Church in Poona has great assets behind it. In men such as Nicol Macnicol and the beloved "Brother Deshpande" it has had leaders of splendid gifts and genuine goodness. And thanks largely to the presence of a number of fine Mission institutions, its members possess a standard of

NOTES.

(170) Ibid., 1964, p.456.
education well above the average. The Church's main hope lies clearly with its youth and in strengthening its links with other Christian bodies. (173)

If there was too much of the parochial spirit to be found in the Church in Hyderabad as well, yet here it took a somewhat different form. The chief problems in this case were not those of isolation or inferior numbers, but of poverty, lack of education and natural leadership and a continuing sense of inferiority. Country customs did not allow the Christian community's outcaste heritage to fade quickly from memory.

The community went on growing, but the rate of growth was determined as before by the number of full-time workers available to teach and supply pastoral oversight. In the 1930's, with over sixty such trained workers on its staff, the Mission was explaining that there would be even more converts and a higher proportion of communicants if only they had more teachers. (174). With the end of the second world war the doors were still wide open, with 100 baptisms in a year and over 400 still under instruction and it was not unusual for a whole village to ask for baptism. But costs had multiplied four times over in the last decade, the Mission could no longer maintain so many workers on the field, and the question was how a poor church could pay for educated leadership. (175)

"All around one sees poverty, disease, ignorance and feuds", wrote the district missionary, "But the Spirit of God is in the heart of the people." (176) Unfortunately it seldom displayed itself in the form of a spirit of independence. The missionary still found it necessary to exercise his authority.

NOTES

(173) Information obtained through correspondence, etc.
(176) Ibid., 1949, p.349.
and even so the people were unable to live up to the training on co-operative credit and better farming schemes which they had been receiving now for about twenty years. (177)

"Yet how can they change?" it was asked, "Until there is a basic change in their economic and social environment?" Help and training along similar lines were re-introduced a few years later when Jalna became a project of the "War on Want" programme and also received assistance from Inter-Church Aid. An agricultural missionary was appointed, a tractor supplied -- "We could use ten" -- and villagers learnt to work on co-operative projects, ploughing, cleaning villages and irrigating crops. Yet the gap between self-help and a genuine grasp at independence has not yet been closed. (178)

This is not to say that no advances were made in this direction, sufficient to gain the sympathy or the respect of non-Christians. A typical incident occurred in the 1930's, when labourers working on a scheme for the Jalna water supply refused to begin work for fear of the river-god's wrath. A Christian group volunteered and on being asked how many goats and fowls they wanted for a sacrifice replied that they needed none at all and went off to work singing. (179) Even more significant, perhaps, was the day when Christian preachers speaking at a Hindu festival were in danger of being attacked by Brahmin youths only to be protected by the outcastes in the crowd. (180)

As the number of Christians round Jalna and Bethel continued to increase, a pastor was appointed to a third self-supporting congregation/

NOTES.

(179) "Conference" March, 1935, p.16.
with his headquarters at Dahipuri and villagers began to show greater willingness to build churches for themselves. The Central Fund, over half the contributions for which came, we are told, from the housewife's grain bags, received better support. (181) Co-operative courses for lay leaders were having their effect, so that elders and deacons readily gave up a day's work to attend Session Meetings. (182) Women's organisations were also contributing to church life, while in Jalna the first Youth Fellowship was launched. (183) Examples of personal initiative were not lacking either. One ex-hostel boy from Jalna started his own private village school and when the enquirers he had gathered were questioned before baptism they were found to have been solidly grounded. (184)

The level of education was rising and by the 1960's four B.A. graduates had been produced, with one intending to study for his B.D. degree (185) Yet the society as a whole was as yet unable to do without missionary leadership or take on responsibility for the institutions on which they relied. "The local Christian fellowship is not only poor but has lost its spirit through dependence on the Mission" ran a report in 1950, and ten years later, with War on Want in full swing, the picture was little different. "This is an ingrown Harijan community. How do we break it down?" (186)

Church union, for the Church of Scotland's Western India Mission, has led to many real changes and advances. Work in both Bombay and Poona is by now thoroughly integrated in and with the U.C.N.I. The

NOTES

(182) Ibid., 1954, p. 322.
fact that of the six established pastorates in Bombay Church Council the four in Bombay are separated from the two in Poona by well over 100 miles is a reminder of how thin is this Church on the ground, and the advantages which are likely to accrue from further church union.

The Godavari Valley Church Council, which covers the churches in Hyderabad, has about twenty pastorates, and perhaps a third of its strength is made up of the congregations round Jalna. The position here is rather fluid and accurate information is hard to get. There are at present six pastors working in the area, in and around perhaps twelve main centres which it is hoped will eventually develop into independent pastorates.

The Bombay and Godavari Valley Church Councils both form part of the Synod of Maharashtra, which also includes the Church Councils of Ahmednagar, Kolhapur and Nagpur. The whole of this area is Marathi-speaking, both Services and church meetings being conducted in that language. Very occasionally English or Gujarati may also be used. As elsewhere in the U.C.N.I. women are eligible for church office, though the proportion actually elected is small.

As has been indicated, co-operative work has played a large part in church development in the cities of Western India. Actual church union has brought the Scottish Mission churches into organic connection with those of the Irish Presbyterian Mission, the American Presbyterian Mission and the American Marathi Mission. The Bombay Church Council has been very active in fostering lines of communication with other Christian bodies, while the present plan of Church Union, once brought into effect, would lead to integration with five other denominations.

Two outstanding examples of co-operative work at different levels are the church at Worli, which is regarded as a pilot scheme for further church extension work, and the United Theological College in Poona. The
The latter is supported by Anglican and Methodist-Episcopal churches as well as the U.C.N.I. Here students may take a vernacular L.Th. course, or the Serampore B.D. and plans were being put forward early in the 1960's for a degree course in Marathi also. As the first course of such a standard to be offered in any Indian language it would offer a distinct advance in theological training, but for lack of financial support the scheme is at present in abeyance. As is the custom in theological colleges run by the younger churches, the wives of students are also given a certain amount of theological and practical training. (187)

A Theological Survey Report produced by the National Christian Council in 1943 describes very fully the pattern of training which was at that time being developed for pastors and evangelistic workers throughout Western India, and lists first among the problems in this sphere the recruiting of candidates for training. The U.C.N.I. compares badly in this respect with the Anglican church in Maharashtra and the point is one which will be taken up in our closing summary. (188)

The shortage is all the more serious because the Church of Western India has already in 130 years of history produced several men of outstanding character and ability. Among the Mission's earliest converts, Hormazdji Pestonji, Dhanjibai Nauroji, Narayan Sheshadri and Baba Padmanji were all men of great reputation. Narayan Vaman Tilak, baptised in Bombay, became perhaps the greatest of Indian Christian hymn-writers up to date. Others like "Brother Deshpande" and the Rev. John Malelu, who at the age of 70 started a faith mission of his own at Osmanabad, were essentially simple men whose influence depended on the strength of their convictions.

NOTES.

(187) Information obtained through correspondence, etc.
(188) N.C.C. Theological Survey Report, private publication, 1943: Information obtained through correspondence.
and the genuine quality of their lives. And there have been men of intellectual stature such as Prof. B.P. Hivale, the founder and first Principal of the Christian College at Ahmadnagar and Prof. J.W. Airan, the present Principal of Wilson College. (189)

What strikes the observer here is a point likely to recur when the history of other Indian churches comes under study -- namely the immense gap, spiritually as well as intellectually, between the more outstanding Christian leaders and the average church member; and as a corollary, the urgent necessity for such leaders to come forward with each generation. "The U.C.N.I. is essentially a working class and rural church. There is an apathetic attitude towards the state and outside the community" reads one commentary on the modern period, (190), and this may be taken as a reasonable description of the situation in Western India. Humble, loyal, dutiful and poor, the Church's membership has not yet shown, nor been placed in a position to show, that it has a creative and imaginative part to play within the Indian nation.

NOTES.

GENERAL SOURCES.

George Smith, "Life of John Wilson of Bombay."


"Our Church's Work in India: the Story of our Maratha Missions", by Rev. T. Torrance and Charlotte W. Crawford.

R.W. Weir, "Foreign Missions of the Church of Scotland."

E.G.K. Hewat, "Vision and Achievement"

"Christ and Western India", Mission Press, Surat, 1950


F.M.C. Reports.

"Conference"

F.M.C. Manuscripts, S.N.L.
CHAPTER VII.

THE CHURCH IN BENGALE.

1830-1860.

The Church of Scotland's first missionary venture, originally intended as a rural Mission, began under Alexander Duff's initiative with the opening of his Institution in Calcutta, and the city and the Institution continued to be its heart and centre. The Institution quickly came to be regarded, by many more than Duff's Scottish colleagues in the other fields, as an admirable model which ought to be copied for two good reasons. The young missionary seemed to have hit on the only method yet discovered for presenting Christian truth to caste Indians, under conditions in which they were genuinely ready to listen. He also made converts of a type for which every missionary had been praying.

Of the 4 young Hindus who embraced the Christian faith within four years of the opening of the Institution, Duff's second convert, the Kulin Brahmin Krishna Banerjea, was by far the most distinguished. A man of penetrating intellect, he entered the Anglican Church and rendered unusually fine service first as a pastor and then as a professor and theologian, becoming Bengal's first Indian Christian apologist. (1)

By 1840, baptisms were occurring regularly and within the next few years four more men were converted through the work of the Institution, who were to become missionaries in Bengal. Jagudishwar Battacharya served for nearly 30 years at the rural centre of Mahanadi; Prasanna Kumar Chatterjee served at Chinarah; Lal Behari Dey took charge of the Kalna Station and later acted as pastor to the Bengali congregation in Calcutta; and Behari Lal Singh opened up a Mission for the English Presbyterian Church at Rampore Boali and later became Professor of English Literature.

NOTES.

(1) Rev. Alex. Tomory and Mrs. K.S. Macdonald, "Our Church's Work in India: "Bengal, p. 18. Published Oliphant, Anderson and Ferrier for the Free Church of Scotland.
Literature at Calcutta University (2) By 1871, so Sherring records, of Duff's 48 educated converts 9 were ministers, 10 catechists, 17 professors or higher grade teachers, 8 Government servants of the higher grade, and 4 assistant surgeons or doctors. (3)

This is sufficient to indicate that Duff's aim was a much wider one than that of planting in Calcutta an Indian Church on the Presbyterian model. His purpose, and that of his colleagues at the Institution, was the impressive one of bringing Christian truth and influence to bear as strongly as possible on the prospective leaders of India, Calcutta, as the Government centre, being very much the hub of the wheel. And enlightenment for non-Christians was accompanied by the complementary aim of training Christian converts for leadership. The Institution was both a weapon of evangelism and, in Dr. Hewat's words, "a nursery for Christian workers," whose services were to extend far beyond the bounds of the Scottish Mission's compass.

By 1845, however, the number of converts was sufficient for a native Bengali-speaking congregation to be regularly constituted, with the Rev. David Ewart as its pastor. (4) And by the time another 7 or 8 years had passed, the Mission itself looked to be in a strong position for further advance. It now marshalled a strength of 5 missionaries, 3 Indian preachers, and 6 catechists, in addition to a number of teachers and other workers, and had pushed out to find a foothold in three country centres. Two missionaries

NOTES.

(2) Our Church's Work, p. 21.
(4) Hewat, p. 70, gives this date as 1848. The Free Church's P.M.C. Report for 1859, p. 28, seems sufficient authority for taking the earlier date.
with an Indian helper were working at Chinsurah, where there was a school for boys and another for girls, but as yet no converts. Another school at Bansberia was in charge of an Indian minister and Kalna also had a school run by two catechists. In the city itself, there was an Indian staff of 8 Christian catechists and teachers and 7 educated Hindu converts were students at the Institution. The total Indian Christian community, scattered about this area, was only about 60, but the standard was high and the atmosphere one of sober but cheerful optimism. (5)

The following year saw another 11 adults baptised and the year after a further licensing of native preachers. (6) By 1857 or so, though no converts had yet been made in the country districts, signs of Indian leadership were beginning to emerge. (7) The Bengali congregation in Calcutta was for all practical purposes under the charge of the Rev. Gopinath Nundi, who had lately escaped from a dangerous situation caused by the Mutiny further North. The Rev. Behari Lal Singh, who was a Rajput by descent, was conducting a Mission to the Muslims and continuing to live, even in those days of unrest, in the Mohammedan quarter of the city. 8 adult Hindus and 13 Muslims were brought into the Church within the course of a year. And a new station had been opened by an Indian minister at the market centre of Mahanad, key to a network of over 20 towns and villages. (8)

The Bengal Mission's response to the Assembly Committee's enquiries concerning the appointment of a pastor for the Bengali congregation was not/

NOTES.

(5) Report for 1853, p.4; p.5.
(6) Reports for 1854, p.24 and 1855, p.7.
(8) Report for 1858, p.16;
unlike that which went back from Bombay. It would be possible to make such an appointment but "there are practical difficulties and complications which tend to render postponement desirable." The missionaries were anxious to make a "settlement which can be put on a footing likely to be solid and lasting", and it was "better to go slow than to go wrong." The chief complications, as in Bombay, were those of erecting suitable church and manse buildings and ensuring that an adequate stipend could be paid. (9) Meanwhile, the congregation remained under the charge of a missionary and Christian workers and converts in the outstations were included in the roll of the Calcutta congregation. (10) To a greater extent than in Bombay, the Christian community in Calcutta seems to have been employed by the Mission authorities. But the little group of Christians at Chinsurah, numbering with children perhaps 50 souls, included, along with Mission workers and their families, a deputy magistrate, 2 students and a clerk in the collector's office. (11) There were as yet, however, no local converts from any of those outstations. (12)

This explains why the Home Committee's other appeal, for greater attention to be paid to the extension of Vernacular Rural Missions, did not meet with much sympathy in Calcutta. Dr. Duff pointed out that they were already engaged in rural work (13) with an ordained missionary and a medical colleague serving at Chinsurah and Indian leaders at the three other centres. It was difficult to find accommodation healthy enough for Europeans to live in elsewhere in the Nofussil round Calcutta, and by "rural missions" Duff understood a station manned by a European. The Chinsurah missionary, /

NOTES.

(9) Report for 1859, p.28
(11) Report for 1861, p.43.
(12) Report for 1863, p.28.
(13) The Kalna (Gulna) outstation was opened in 1843, Bansberia in 1847, Chinsurah in 1849 and Mahanad in 1857.
John Beaumont, gave it as his opinion that it was a mistake to spread over too great an area, or to spend money as their advisers would like them to do, on prematurely erecting places of worship. (14) Progress in these country areas was difficult and slow, and it was not till the beginning of 1863 that the first fruits of constant and extensive evangelism and teaching began to be gathered in. Then within a matter of three months ten new converts were baptised, but there was as yet no prospect of forming local churches. (15)

Rather than extend rural work locally, Dr. Duff recommended starting afresh in a tribal area, and suggested the large and isolated district of Singhbhoom, among the Cole and Santal tribes who had embraced neither Hinduism nor Mohammedanism. (16) This suggestion, as we know, was soon acted upon, the Santal Mission being started by an agent from Calcutta. But the Bengal Mission continued to concentrate on work already in hand and on the districts already manned, and was never in fact to extend its geographical boundaries further.

1860-1900.

With the 1860's, the Free Church's Bengal Mission entered the second generation of its life. In the 5 years between 1858 and 1863, its four missionary leaders, Doctors Smith, Ewart, Mackay and Duff all died or were forced on health grounds to leave the country for good. (17) "Had the work not been so well grounded, it would hardly have survived the loss of such great leaders about the same time: but it went on prospering" runs the official history. (18)

The prosperity referred to is concerned rather with the life of the Institution than that of the Church, however. In 1864, the number of pupils/
on its rolls reached a new peak of 1700. But now other schools were being opened up in Calcutta which took pupils up to the University matriculation standard. By 1871 the numbers had dropped to the 1200 mark, then during the last decade of the century, under an able Principal, Dr. Hector, greater numbers than ever were attracted in. (19).

Of more immediate interest to us is the fact that during those forty years of its history, up to the end of the century, the Free Church Institution was responsible for a number of notable conversions. Among the more influential of these were three lawyers - Kali Churn Banurji, a brilliant student who became a professor, and was a prominent member of the National Congress in its earliest years, and gave both Church and Mission much valuable service; Jnanranjan Banerjea, a convert of the next generation who became a professor, an elder and a gifted lay preacher; and B. Acharya, who took a leading part in the evangelistic meetings which the College continued to run for about 20 years on Sunday evenings in Beadon Square, Calcutta's "Hyde Park Corner." (20) The number of converts made directly through the influence of the College (The Institution was renamed "Duff College" in 1889) dropped considerably in the later part of the century.

But one notable gain was that of G.B. Mulkar, who was later licensed and became superintendent of the school at Chinsurah. (21)

The original Assembly Institution, whose building had remained with the Church of Scotland at the Disruption and been renamed by them shortly after, had meanwhile been developing along parallel lines. And while for many years dependent on the leadership of a single missionary, it remained in a much healthier state than either of its two sister bodies in Bombay and Madras. As the oldest of its Institutions, it received special attention from the Church of Scotland, and was fortunate in having as one of its Principals the highly

---

NOTES.

(19) Ibid., p.30
(20) Ibid., pp.30-33
(21) Ibid., p.33.
respected Dr. Ogilvie, who remained at his post for 25 years without once returning home on furlough. (22) The increase in competition from other schools and the fact that in Mission schools religious instruction was compulsory, meant that the roll of pupils was apt to fluctuate. In 1881 it was 725, by the end of the century it had dropped to 605. On the other hand, the more important college department increased its enrolment over the same period from 409 to 653, until it could claim to be the largest missionary college in Northern India. (23)

But though educationally successful, the failure of the College to make converts was a matter of sorrow to its leaders and led to some criticism among home supporters. "It is with the deepest regret that I have to inform you that I have nothing more to report on this point than for the last three years", wrote Dr. Ogilvie in 1860 (24). Ten years later he was suggesting that the growing popularity of the Brahmo Samaj was affecting baptisms, (25) and it had been, indeed, at one point, his considered opinion with which the Foreign Mission Committee concurred, that a sufficient number of converts had now been trained to act as the spearhead of a vernacular Mission and the Institution, having fulfilled its task, might now be closed (26). Hampered by lack of European staff, having at their disposal a certain number of Indian leaders of medium calibre but lacking a church for them to lead, alternatively criticised and then refused support by the home Church, the Bengal Mission of the Church of Scotland seems to have been plagued with many more worries than it could claim successes.

There was one contribution being made by both Scottish Missions to the life and growth of the native Church, however, of which no note has yet been taken,

NOTES.

(22) Church of Scotland F.M.C. Report for 1871, p.3.
(23) R.W. Weir, "Foreign Missions of the Church of Scotland", pp. 71 and 84-86.
(24) Church of Scotland Report for 1860, p.4.
(25) Ibid., 1870, p.10.
(26) Ibid., 1872, p.24 ff. This report summarises discussions on the position of the Colleges which had been going on from 1886, when the suggestion referred to was made.
though its importance can hardly be over-estimated. This was the campaign for the education and emancipation of women and girls, which was being led by Western women missionaries. The first attempt to offer a Western-style education to women was made in Calcutta itself by the Baptist Mission (27); Mrs. John Wilson of Bombay became a pioneer of the movement; Alexander Duff was always one of its strongest protagonists; and between 1850 and 1900 the advance of women's work in Calcutta was one of the most encouraging signs of progress.

"There is no country under the sun where women have more power than in Bengal" wrote the Rev. Charles Grant, Dr. Ogilvie's junior colleague, "And as long as the zenanas are what they are now - strongholds of ignorance and hotbeds of idolatry - we need expect little from the men. Had it been possible to prosecute this mission fifty years ago, we would have a different state of matters now. But people had to be educated up to the idea of female emancipation from zenana seclusion and ignorance." (28)

So far as the indigenous Church was concerned, this work was of immense value for the following reasons:

By procuring access to the conservative stronghold of the Hindu home, it found a means of turning many who might have been strong opponents of Christianity into sympathisers.

By sowing in the minds of Indian Women a desire for education, it further weakened the hold of traditional religion, with its emphasis on the female virtues of ignorance and seclusion.

By Christian teaching and example, in schools and even more through hostels, it made direct converts. One could usually rely on a fair proportion of the adult converts coming into the Church in any given year being residents or /

NOTES.


former residents of the Girls' Boarding School.

By educating the future wives and mothers of the Christian community, it helped to raise that community's standards morally, socially and economically.

And in the course of time, by training Christian women as teachers and for other skills and professions, it perpetuated the process already begun.

As we have already had opportunity to notice, women's work had a considerable part to play in the organisation of the Bengal Missions. Returns for the Free Church of Scotland for 1884 inform us about a full-time staff of 7 European women missionaries and 21 Indian Christian women. (29) About the same time, the Church of Scotland was maintaining four women missionaries in the city; 60 to 70 zenanas or Indian homes were being visited regularly by 8 Christian teachers, there were 16 girls in the Orphanage and 760 pupils attending the 10 girls' day schools. (30)

We may perhaps accept it as evident, without going into further detail, that both the Ladies' Auxiliary of the Free Church and the Women's Association of the Church of Scotland played a considerable part in the extension of Christian congregations in any area where they had workers deployed. And this will apply not only to the Churches of the Bengal area but in the majority of other areas, even where this is not specifically mentioned.

It is now time for us to return to the growth of the native Church in Calcutta and the fluctuating fortunes of the rural mission which was attached to it during this period of about 40 years, from 1860 to 1900.

By the time the dust of the Mutiny had begun to settle, the Protestant/

NOTES.

(29) See Ch. 6, Introduction, Note 1.

Missions of Bengal were in a position to give support and leadership to Christian efforts in several other parts of India. Their educated converts went out to act as leaders for younger Missions now starting work in more backward areas. Their churches were able to set an example of independence and vigorous evangelistic action which younger Christian communities might copy. In this respect the Bengali Free Church congregation, while it never grew large, possessed an influence quite out of proportion to its numbers.

"The Deacons' Court have resolved to declare the church self-sustaining from the first of July next, and to discontinue taking the F.M.C.'s supplement to the Sustentation Fund", writes its pastor, Mr. De, in 1864. So far as we know, there is no other Church in India which raises so much for its native minister." (32)

Healthy and encouraging though such an attitude was, and well ahead of its time, the leaders of the Calcutta Mission were still aware that home supporters might find it difficult to gauge the value of such spiritual maturity and keep looking for a growth in numbers which was slow in appearing. The truth was that, rather on the lines of the Duke of Plaza Toro's army, this was a church which produced more generals than privates. "The church at home may find satisfaction in the fact that, if she cannot point to a community gathered out of heathenism by her efforts and dwelling together in some Mofussil village or city compound, her converts are found in positions of importance as Christian workers throughout the whole of India." (33)

NOTES.
(31) For the comparatively strong and independent character of the Bengali Free Church in Calcutta at this time, see Sherring, op.cit., pp.129-130.
(32) Free Church Report for 1865, p.63.
(33) Ibid., 1866, p.52.
1872, the total Christian community in Calcutta, and the Mission's four country stations only totalled 137, 49 of these being children. (34)

But in that same year there came an interesting and welcome access of strength with a request from the L.M.S. that the Free Church accept responsibility for a small group of 30 to 40 Tamil and Telegu Christians, composed mainly of Madrasi house servants, who were without a pastor or proper supervision. The challenge was promptly accepted. Within a year a pastor, the Rev. Subiah Daniel, had been found, and the Madrasi congregation went on to develop a life of its own. Never influential, with a constantly changing membership, and very much a little enclave of foreigners in a strange land, it nevertheless supplied an obvious need, grew healthily and maintained a distinctive character. (35)

It seems clear that the Rev. Guru Das Maitras, who was inducted as pastor to the Bengali congregation in 1870, after a 3-year vacancy, was anxious to develop a firmer Christian fellowship along similar lines, while recognising that local conditions militated against it. "The prosperity of a Church depends not so much on a permanent settlement of families in its neighbourhood, but rather when it grows up in the midst of families. None of these elements enter into the formation of our (i.e. Bengali) Church. Those who worship here are like birds of passage. More have left it than those who joined from the ranks of unbelievers." (36)

The compensations, for a somewhat frustrated shepherd of souls, must have lain in the thought that what was loss to Calcutta was gain elsewhere. "As regards the exercising of a profound Christian influence on the people of this land", wrote Das Maitras' colleague, the Rev. Lal Behari Dey, "No/

NOTES

(35) Ibid., 1873 and 1874.
(36) Ibid., 1879, p.20.
Mission in India can be compared with the Bengal Mission of the Free Church of Scotland. In addition to those worthy men, ordained and unordained, who are daily proclaiming to their countrymen in their mother tongue the unsearchable riches of Christ, there is the noble company of Indian Christian teachers - all of them the fruit of the Free Church Institution, who have spread themselves all over Bengal, Behar, the North-West, Oudh and the Punjab, and who are giving Christian instruction to the thousands of Hindus, Musulmans and Sikhs; and there is the equally noble band of converts who have taken to the several walks of secular life and who, as Assistant Surgeons, as Deputy Magistrates, as Executive Engineers, as assistants in Mercantile and Government offices -- are exercising a powerful Christian influence on their countrymen."

As further encouragement, there was the ever burning hope that a major break-through to the Hindu mind and heart might soon be achieved. The changed attitude of educated Hindu towards the Christian message suggested that this might be imminent.

"Then--" wrote Das Maitras again, referring to the 1830's -- "Then no man of respectability or education would enter a chapel. Now the preacher quietly takes his seat amidst well-behaved, respectable and educated hearers, who come prepared with difficulties which they have met with in their daily enquiry and study." (38)

Meetings such as those, taken together with the fact that each year the Mission's agents were addressing about 30,000 people in the city and its suburbs, suggested that the times of blessing might not be far ahead.

"People are gaining in a healthy Christian intelligence" wrote Das Maitras/

---

NOTES

(37) Ibid., 1875, p.17.
(38) Ibid., 1874, p.16.
again, "They are being made ready for the Lord. Preparations are fast progressing for a Pentecostal Day in India." (39)

Members of the Bengali congregation supported their pastor in consistent efforts towards this end. "Four evenings in the week the Gospel is preached to attentive audiences. Four evenings a week it is proclaimed in the public streets". (40) But while there was little opposition, and much respectful attention, the direct response was disappointing. In 1876, the English Morning Service was dropped, to be replaced by one in Bengali and there was a record number of 22 adult baptisms for the whole Mission area. (41) But two years later there were no adult baptisms at all. (42) Clearly the Day of Pentecost had not yet arrived. And in view of the more spectacular advances being made by a younger sister Mission in Santalia, it was recognised again that a city church like this must continue to concentrate on quality rather than quantity. "Our congregations of English-speaking natives will thus differ from the more homogeneous but less missionary churches of the Santals, Kols and simple vernacular peasants. But it is the more desirable that --- however fluctuating --- they should prove models to their less instructed brethren in their spiritual organisation and aggressive vitality." (43) By the year 1885, the Bengali congregation in the city had a total membership of 129, while its much humbler Madrasi sister numbered 180 members and adherents. (44)

Then rather strangely, in the middle of the 1890's, that group of Tamil and Telegu Christians appears to have vanished from view. No more mention/

NOTES.

(39) Ibid., 1877, p.17.
(40) Ibid., 1878, p.21.
(41) Ibid., 1877, p.16.
(42) Ibid., 1879, p.20.
(43) Ibid., 1880, p.14.
(44) Ibid., 1886, p.17-18.
is made of them and their pastor's name no longer appears on the Mission's strength. Due to some dissension whose origin is obscure they decided to pursue an independent existence, only to reappear about thirty years later.

Meanwhile the Bengali congregation kept up its constant battle to increase in numbers and influence. Sunday and Missionary Services continued to be well attended by Hindu enquirers; in most years there are a few adult baptisms to be recorded and by 1893 there was talk of the need for a larger building, but the congregation did not consider itself capable of embarking on such an undertaking. (45) It had not yet achieved the object of supporting its own pastor, and in a capital city like Calcutta, where the cost of living was high, this was a serious problem. "For several years, no question has been so frequently the subject of careful action as that of the development of the Native Church on a self-supporting and missionary basis" runs the introduction to one F.M.C. Report of this period. (46) We may take note that even such a comparatively senior and well-educated community as this one in Calcutta was still not fully independent. Unable to find a full-time pastor with the education considered necessary, they paid an annual honorarium to the Rev. C.S. Banerjea, their senior elder, for services rendered, and reckoned that "until the right man appear, we must do the best we can". (47) The Moderator of the Presbytery and the Interim Moderator of the vacant congregation were both European Missionaries. It was only in the field of voluntary evangelistic effort that there appeared to be a genuine sense of responsibility. And by this/

NOTES.

(45) Ibid., 1894, p.20.
(47) Ibid., 1897, p.15.
decade the city evangelist's task was becoming more complicated and much more demanding.

Earthquake, famine and plague had all contributed their devastating effects to the stability of the period, and in 1897 the Indian Government had to spend ten million pounds on famine relief alone. (48) At the same time, Hinduism was beginning to revive under the impulse of a variety of reforming movements. A new type of English book was being offered to the educated public which bore titles such as "The Life and Teachings of Krishna", "Lord Gauranya" and "Hindu Theism" (49) Mrs. Annie Besant was touring the country delivering lectures on Theosophy, and Calcutta had "become the happy hunting ground for religious denominations of every shade of opinion" (50) English missionaries of the Oxford Mission were complaining that people would no longer attend their lectures on religious subjects and also claimed to detect a lessening of the bonds of sympathy between Europeans and natives. The Scottish missionaries were less pessimistic about the change of climate. Their voluntary lectures and the open-air meetings in Beadon Square were still being well attended and the native church seemed to be developing, however gradually. We learn that in 1896 the interior of the Bengali congregation's buildings was enlarged to allow for greater numbers (51), and efforts made to improve the singing of Bengali hymns. (52)

During the same period, while the efforts of the Calcutta missionaries of both the Free Church and the Church of Scotland had been concentrated in the cities, the rural Missions started by the Free Church in Dr. Duff's time/

NOTES.

(48) Ibid., 1898, p.6.
(49) Ibid., 1899, p.22.
(50) Ibid., 1897, p.15.
(51) Ibid., 1897, p.16.
(52) Ibid., 1899, p.24.
had been carrying on, in accordance with his deliberate policy, mainly under the leadership of Indian workers.

Kalna, first occupied in 1843, was a market town about 50 miles from Calcutta up the right bank of the Hooghly. It is described as a fertile arable district, where farmers were on the whole prosperous and contented, but were a prey to the constant scourge of malaria. School attendances were much affected by epidemics and the station was considered unsuitable for a European missionary. The Rev. Lal Behari Dey was in charge of the district for about ten years, and after a short interval was succeeded by the Rev. Baihantha Nath De, who stayed for 20 years. A number of the Mission's most valuable converts came from Kalna, later to distinguish themselves in city posts and strengthen the Church in Calcutta. (53) But Kalna itself was a temple town, with Brahmin priests subsidised by the local Maharajah. Hindu feeling was strong and the Christian community remained small and weak. (54)

The rural Mission at Bansberia was founded in 1847 with a gift of money from the famous soldier, Sir Charles Outram. But while its agents were hard working, it suffered even more than Kalna from malaria epidemics which kept driving people from the district and rendered settled work almost impossible. The Bansberia schools had to be closed, though evangelistic work continued for a while both there and at Tribeni, a nearby pilgrimage centre. (55)

In 1849, following the gift of a chapel from the London Missionary Society, the Free Church had opened at Chinsurah a school which soon had 600 pupils. For over 20 years this township, which was growing in importance, became the Calcutta rural missionary's centre. For another 20 years, it /

NOTES.

(54) Ibid., p. 39.
(55) Ibid., pp. 40-41.
became successively the charge of two Indian pastors, or technically "missionaries", the Rev. P.K. Chatterjea and the Rev. Kedar Nath De. The latter had been Chinsurah's first convert and up till the time when the rural mission was reorganised about 1890, it continued to be the most successful of the district stations. The High School was marked for its efficiency and relative freedom from malaria made constructive work much simpler. (56)

Work at Mahanad was opened up in 1857, a Calcutta convert, the Rev. J. Battacharya, being placed in charge and 6 years later it was chosen as a centre for a more intensive type of evangelism. Six district schools were established, which came to be described as the best circle of schools in the Province, and Battacharya led a group of Christian workers in the type of evangelistic effort which was also being attempted about this time by Dr. Sheshadri in Western India. Christian lyrics were composed in Bengali and sung to country crowds. (57) Within another year, Mission reports were speaking hopefully of there being a nucleus for a Church (58) and the schools had multiplied till they were 27 in number. Battacharya, loved and honoured by Christians and Hindus alike, was succeeded by the Rev. K.N. De from Kalna and then by the Rev. S.C. Banerjea. (59)

The fruit of all this effort under trained Indian leadership of a standard which no other Mission in the Province could boast was meagre, to say the least of it. By about 1890, Kalna had four Christian families, Bansberia had a Christian community of perhaps 45, Chinsurah had 60 and Mahanad 60 again. (60) The Council now appointed the Rev. W. McCulloch, an experienced missionary /

NOTES.

(56) Ibid., pp.42-43.
(57) Ibid., p.44.
(58) Free Church Report for 1864, p.27.
(59) Our Church's Work, p.45.
(60) Free Church Reports, passim.
with an exceptional knowledge of Bengali and a talent for organisation to set the rural mission on a firmer footing. Under his impetus, the support he was able to give when arguments arose with Hindu officials, and the further development of medical work under two young missionaries, Christian workers were at once encouraged and made more efficient, and there were a few more baptisms. But by the end of the century the number of Christians in the rural mission area did not exceed 125 (61), and it is not surprising that the field should be described as exceptionally stony ground. "Altogether a more God-forsaken aspect of things can hardly be imagined", wrote the district missionary, McCulloch, during a year of famine. "For even though one might match the hunger and disease and ignorance and superstition elsewhere, one certainly could not match the vampire Brahmans battening in the midst of it all." (62)

In assessing the prospects of the Church he gave it as his opinion that "we shall never have a Christian community other than Mission agents with a handful of hangers-on until a break is made amongst these people. And a man would need his whole time and thought and strength for this work." (63)

The Church of Scotland could meanwhile look on the size and quality of its Christian community with even less satisfaction. Concentrated as it was, until late in the century, entirely in the city, it could boast by 1866 a native "congregation" of about 20 souls formed under a catechist whose salary was paid by the St. Andrew's Association -- made up, presumably, of members of the Scots Kirk. A year or two later it had three Indian workers whose education had reached a standard entitling them to apply for licensing, and the delegation from Scotland visiting India at the time recommended that they should/

NOTES.

(61) Free Church Report, 1901, statistics.
(62) MS letter from W. McCulloch, camp at Hugli district, to Dr. Lindsay, dated 19.12.1891, S.N.L.
(63) MS letter from W. McCulloch to Dr. Lindsay, dated 12.10.1891, S.N.L.
be ordained. It seems that while Dr. Ogilvie was doubtful about ordaining them, the Home Committee was unwilling to support them financially, and it was only after protracted discussions that all three were licensed and offered positions under the Mission at £150 a year.

One of these three men, the Rev. B.C. Chuckerbutty, a Brahmin convert, was confirmed in charge of the Bengali congregation, but only succeeded in being ordained after much pleading. "To me it seems disgraceful that after having a Mission in the metropolis of India for over 40 years, we have not yet got a native church", he wrote plaintively to the Committee in Scotland. And a year later he requested that the Mission either ordain an Indian pastor or appoint a missionary as Moderator. Otherwise the congregation should be abandoned -- "I do not like to continue a thing which is not reality, but sham." (64)

One of his two colleagues, the Rev. T.C. Banerjea, left the Mission about this time following a difference of opinion about the usefulness of the Girls' Orphanage, and the other, the Rev. G.C. Laha, continued to serve but without taking any salary, having found suitable employment elsewhere. A hopeful suggestion on his part, that the Church of Scotland also open up a rural mission, failed to meet with any response. (65) But by 1875, with help from Mission sources, a small but well-situated church had been erected for the Bengali congregation which was elegant, plain and comfortable. Mr. Chuckerbutty was now ministering to a community of about 100 Christian souls, and could count on an attendance of 70 to 80 on Sundays. But there was as yet no question of self-support. (66)

NOTES.

(64) Church of Scotland Reports, 1871, p.47 and 1872, p.51.
(65) Ibid., 1873, p.45.
With the 1880s, the Church of Scotland, conscious of its need to supplement the work of its Institution with a more directly evangelistic type of Mission, opened up rural stations at Govindpur, Mattiabruz, Shamtaggar and finally Budge Budge, (67) and there were cheering reports of adult baptisms which on occasion included the conversion of high-caste Brahmins. (68) Unfortunately, the Church's reputation and the Mission's immediate development were not improved by a nasty case of discipline which, starting as a storm in a tea-cup, led to a series of court cases in Calcutta and Britain, the resignation of the College Principal, the abandonment of proposals to take over the German Gossner Mission's work among Santals, the dismissal on pension of poor Mr. Chuckerbutty, whose moral courage had failed to stand the test, and a general shake-up of the Home Committee, to which official histories, naturally, do not refer but which had its effect in shaking the Home Church's confidence in the maturity of native ministers and their congregations. (69)

By the end of the century, then, both the Church of Scotland and the Free Church had become parents of Church establishments not dissimilar in size and character. By concentrating on its central Institution, the Church of Scotland had managed to maintain the latter's efficiency, even although its two sister Colleges in Madras and Bombay were left for periods without a single ordained missionary. The local Bengali congregation benefitted from the support of such a strong missionary body, which was composed, at its maximum, of 5 male missionaries with their wives and three unmarried women.

NOTES.

(67) Church of Scotland Reports, 1882-1889, passim.
(68) Ibid., 1889, p.13.
(69) The Report of a Special Committee of the Church of Scotland appointed to consider the rights and wrongs and the ramified effects of Pigot v. Hastie occupies over 100 pages as an appendix to the 1884 Report.
The members of this church were poorer and less cultured than their Free Church neighbours and had progressed very little towards any form of independence, even its ordained pastors being employees of the Mission. The Church of Scotland Mission's Christian community in Calcutta consisted of 160 to 170 souls, with about 80 Christians in outstations. (70) In character, the church showed considerable fervour in worship, but its missionary supporters complained about a lack of practical enthusiasm or willingness to make sacrifices. It could, on occasion, lapse with startling suddenness back into paganism. (71)

The Free Church Mission had gathered a community roughly double this size. It shepherded a total of about 530 Christians, a little over 130 of these being scattered among 8 rural stations. (72) When the Mission was at full strength, this church could count on the support of no less than 7 ordained missionaries, their wives and 10 unmarried women. (73) Yet with a much greater volume of sustained effort in rural areas, not under simple teachers or catechists but under highly trained and educated Indian leaders, it could only boast a slightly greater measure of success than its sister Church. And while the city congregation held a high reputation in Calcutta, and would not consider calling as its minister any but a pastor of good qualifications, it was still not in a position to support such a man, should he be available. Of neither Church could it be said that they were within reach of independent life, either in terms of size or of self-sufficiency.

NOTES.

(70) Church of Scotland Reports, 1900, p.23; 1901, p.26 and statistics for 1901.
(71) Article, Rev. W. Hastie, in the Church of Scotland Monthly Record, June 1881, entitled "The Native Church".
(72) The balance of nearly 400 Christians in the city suggests that the Tamil-Telegu congregation was still counted on the Free Church strength.
(73) Free Church Reports for 1899, 1900 and statistics.
the Scottish Missionaries' main defence of efforts up-to-date being that no other Mission in the area had by use of other methods gained even such a limited measure of success. (74)

Nor at this point did future prospects look particularly bright. Missionary reports of the period referred frequently to the chaotic situation of Hindu society and the adverse conditions being met with by Christian workers. (75) The Free Church's experienced district missionary could sum up 70 years of endeavour in these words: "In no caste, high or low, is there as yet any discernible sign of an active stirring in the direction of Christianity sufficiently strong to push aside the obstacles that intervene." (76) In fact he wondered whether it might not be more profitable to divert their efforts elsewhere. "It seems as if Duff had chosen for himself the most stubborn district in all India. When one is told how by Duff's advice the Welshmen went to the Khasi hills and the Americans to the Sikhs of Oudh, he's strongly tempted to wish that the Free Kirk had got some of his advice instead of himself." (77)

1900 - 1930.

The efforts and achievements of the next thirty years can be summed up as follows:-

The two Scottish Missions united and a number of adaptations were made to meet changing conditions. The united Mission was on the whole unsuccessful, as were neighbouring Missions of other denominations, in making any real impression on the Hindu population and it struggled with only moderate success to build /

NOTES.

(74) See for instance Church of Scotland Report for 1882, p. 30, where Bengal.
(75) Church of Scotland Report for 1894, p.22.
(76) Rev. Wm. McCulloch, Free Church Report for 1901, p. 15.
(77) MS Letter from W. McCulloch to Dr. Smith, dated 25.6.1892, S.N.L.
up an Indian Church.

The College, now a single unit, flourished in spite of political agitation and became, for a time at least, the largest and strongest Christian educational institution in the country.

More emphasis came to be placed on rural work, but again with disappointing results, industrial suburbs rather than the country proper offering the best scope.

A new community was established on a gift of land.

The two Calcutta Missions, Church of Scotland and united Free Church, were the first in India to take the logical step of unifying in one organic unit. The move was made all the more natural because the churches they had raised were both part of the Presbyterian Church of India. The strength promised by a joint College was an added inducement; while co-operation among Missions in the area, organised through the "Christian Convention, Bengal," whose aim was to co-ordinate efforts for the evangelisation of the Province, was already accepted policy. (78)

The "Scottish Churches" Mission" came into being in 1908, the two Colleges uniting to adopt the name "The Scottish Churches' College" and other institutional work was also gathered under a single authority. (79).

At the time of this union the Free Church had four organised congregations, one in the city and three in the country. Its total Christian community was a little under five hundred, of which the greater part lived in the city. (80)

The Church of Scotland group was of roughly the same size and equally distributed. (81) Strong in missionary personnel, both churches seem at this juncture to have been short of pastors.

NOTES.

(78) U.F.C. Report, 1906, p.22
(80) U.F.C. Report, 1908, p. 11.
(81) C.of S. Report, 1909, p. 94.
The College continued to be the point at which the male missionaries concentrated their efforts. It was at one time in the happy position of having no less than twelve Scottish Professors on its staff. (82) "Full to overflowing," with a roll of well over 2,000 students and pupils, in the course of the next twenty years, as other city colleges developed, it had dropped to almost half this number. (83) Yet its prestige remained undimmed, while its hostels, now five in number, provided excellent opportunities for contacts with young Hindus. (84)

The time had by now arrived in Calcutta as elsewhere, however, when both Christian influence and the aims of education were going to be adversely affected by political agitation. "We would have had bloodshed in any other country" ran one report sent out from the Free Church College in 1906, "But here it takes the form of sullen aversion and hatred of all things British." (85)

Swadeshi agitation as seen in Bengal contained at least three elements. There was the political movement, demanding constitutional changes. There was a mercantile party, non-Bengali in origin, whose main quarrel was with the commercial aims of the Manchester merchants. And there was the body of ultra-conservative Hindus whose central motive was religious.

For the Colleges and later the united College, the results of this activity were loss of sympathy and an atmosphere of suspicion and small frictions which were felt in some ways to be more damaging than open persecution. Attention was distracted alike from class-work and from preaching. Mass meetings gathered to listen to political speakers and to sing national songs and Christian open air meetings were more than once broken up. (86) The agitation died down again.

NOTES.

(82) Ibid., 1913, p. 115.
(86) Ibid.
but kept recurring periodically and reached a new height in the 1920's. (87)

Of the two Bengali congregations in the city -- one from each Mission -- about the most that can be said is that neither lost ground. But the common attitude towards Christianity, which was as we have seen one of distrust rather than open hostility, was not one which encouraged conversions. Failing to make much impression on their Hindu neighbours, the two congregations jogged along and made little attempt either to improve their own position.

The results of a joint evangelistic campaign held in 1902 are described as "disappointing." (88) The congregation of St. Andrew's which a couple of years later could report 125 communicant members and one adult baptism in the year, was making little effort to reach self support. "They have seen from the beginning everything in the way of ordinances provided for them from the Mission funds," wrote the missionary who was acting as their Interim Moderator, "and that these are not stores of money to which they have a right, but yearly contributions by their fellow Christians, they find it hard to realise." (89)

The city churches raised by the Church of Scotland tended almost inevitably to become dependent on the large, rich established congregations of the "Kirks," under whose wings they took shelter -- Calcutta and Madras are the two most prominent examples of this. But even the Duff church, with a much more active and responsible congregation, seldom had a strength of more than 150 full members and as often as not lacked the services of a regular pastor, with the result that its influence was decreasing. (90)

Of neither congregation could it be said that here was a point of growth and it was becoming a question asked quite frequently about work in the city, how long it was wise to keep battling against closed doors. Educational work was reckoned to be valuable, but women missionaries were asking whether it would not be better to stop visiting the zenanas where they had been receiving a welcome for twenty to thirty years without visible results, and try instead to break new ground. (91)

NOTES.

(91) Ibid., 1923, p. 29.
Meanwhile lack of progress in district work, in spite of renewed efforts, was proving just as disheartening and it is hardly surprising that this impotence, after seventy years' occupation of what was the most heavily populated and intellectually and commercially the most important Province of India, should fail to inspire the small groups of Christians who were by now mainly of the second or third generation. It was not so much that Hinduism was reviving as that, although it was moribund it refused to die. "The Brahmin priest, the blacksmith and the potter, each of whom has his special part to perform in these idolatrous ceremonies -- are dying out", wrote the young doctor from Kalna in 1904. "This is a point preachers often make and I have heard audiences in every corner of our district heartily acknowledge its truth. In this populous region, where there is no sign of decrease in the general inhabitants, great houses are standing empty or only occupied by a few old women, the last of their race, and enquiry reveals that formerly idolatrous worship of Darza or Kali perhaps was once celebrated there with great splendour." (92) His senior colleague could say in a similar vein, "One is constantly being confronted with fresh evidence of the rapidly increasing degree to which Hinduism is losing its hold. Less money is being spent on it every year." (93) Yet it was necessary for him to add, "Educated Indians are still Hindu at heart and almost hysterically anxious to remain so -- (They) will have no Saviour but the Hindu one." (94)

The occasional handful of enquirers, such as the group from Shonatigri who did come seeking for instruction, were apt to draw back again for fear of losing their employment. (95) And in spite of the Free Church's decision to pay more /

NOTES:

(92) MS letter from Malcolm Macnicol, Kalna, to Dr. Smith, dated 1904, S.N.L.
(93) U.F.C. Report, 1902, p.15.
(94) Ibid., 1903, p.15.
(95) Ibid., 1905, p.23.
attention to district work, so that for a period three missionaries, two of them doctors, were working in the Chinsura-Kalna area; the High School at Chinsura had an excellent report; the hospital at Kalna was overflowing with patients; in addition to two Indian pastors there were teachers in 48 village schools; and visits were paid to over 280 Hindu villages in the year --- yet the number of enquirers who finally came forward to be baptised was normally nil. (96) "So far from there being any movement towards Christianity among the depressed classes up-to-date, hardly a single individual has been baptised in this district", was the sad report sent out in 1909, and the one which followed it after an interval of twenty years is almost a repetition: "We have just touched the fringe of the evangelism of Bengal --- conversions have been unknown in the past few years --- the desire is for Christian influence and Christian teaching, not Christian faith." (97)

The three little congregations at Chinsura, Mahanad and Kalna totalled among them a little over 200 people, and soon, for lack of missionary staff, the work in this area became spasmodic. The hospital at Kalna was closed temporarily, re-opened and finally shut down. (98) The Headmaster of the High School was ordained and became Moderator of the Session, while in Chinsura the Indian superintendent or missionary took the place of a pastor. (99) The old system, depending on mission subsidies in terms of both men and money, could/

NOTES

99) Ibid., 1924, p.29.
obviously not be maintained, and the Church was neither strong nor active enough to maintain itself. The district missionary of a new generation, faced with the need for other forms of service in addition to preaching, but also with the impossibility of continuing on the old lines, was after a while withdrawn to open a school at Chapra in order to "train village teachers for the church of Bengal". (100) The rural mission was not abandoned and women missionaries continued their work there, but continued lack of success coupled with dwindling resources meant that a community composed mainly of Mission workers had to be left more or less marking time. (101)

The difficulty was partly that of getting Indian workers to stay.

"Agents of the better class wont go there (to Mahanad) for the place has no end of a reputation for malaria," reported McCulloch. (102) There was also criticism of the laziness of Christian workers and of the missionaries too. "It is to be regretted that the present European missionaries assume the airs of the civilian class and thus fail to reconcile with the natives of this country" ran one of them. "Moreover they have grown less enthusiastic and put too much confidence on their native assistants to leave everything in their hands. It is a well known fact that conversion depends more largely on the zeal of the native evangelists than on the foreign missionaries, but the staff employed is not at all satisfactory." (103) Such accusations should/ 

NOTES

100) Ibid., 1924, p. 27.
102) MS letter from W. McCulloch to Dr. Smith, dated 11.10.06, S.N.L.
103) MS letter to the Secretary of the F.M.C., U.F.C., dated 22.7.05, from a member of the U.F.C. Mission, S.N.L. (Signed but illegible)
never be taken at their face value, and although the rural mission never again had men of the calibre of its first generation of workers, the chief drawback remained the aridity of the soil.

The outstations of the former Church of Scotland Mission at Mattiaibruz, Budge-Budge and Ghosery were nearer the city centre and thus accessible for superintendence by one of the College missionaries. A church was built at Mattiaibruz by money raised within the community and a local panchayat established there. (104) The Christians at Budge Budge did their best to follow suit with a building of their own and after the withdrawal of an American Methodist Mission the congregation was strengthened by the addition of some Hindustani Christians. (105) A retired headmaster was finally ordained to take charge and with a staff of six or seven full-time workers brought new vigour to evangelistic work. But again it was a case of sowing in hope rather than reaping any fruit from one's labours.

The only truly original experiment made during this period arose out of a scheme planned by Sir Daniel Hamilton to redeem a tract of swamp land at Gosaba in the Sunderbunds and to settle there a group of both Hindu and Christian families. Launched with great hopes, the scheme produced the disappointments familiar to workers among most such projects. But a new congregation was eventually formed in the Sunderbunds. (106)

For the Bengali Church, as for the united Mission, these thirty years were for the most part years of frustration and disappointment. While it could truly be said that in city and country alike the social fabric of Hinduism was dissolving, this was the result of Western education and European contacts rather/
than of Christian preaching.  

The "laziness and indolence of the Bengali character," an inheritance of his environment, did not help him to make the costly decision involved in becoming a Christian. And meanwhile new Indian leaders were appearing, their teaching framed round that of Jesus, whose appeal sounded much more attractive to Indian audiences. 

By 1930, with eleven men and seventeen women missionaries on the united staff, the total Christian community was still only fractionally larger than it had been a generation earlier. Still under a thousand strong, it had about 600 communicant members and 3 ordained Indian pastors. Its giving of £390 for that year made it proportionately the most liberal of all the Scottish Mission Churches. And the fifteen adult baptisms recorded that year do show that it was increasing, however slowly, beyond mere natural growth. But by no stretch of imagination could it as yet be described as responsible and indigenous.

1930-1965.

While it cannot be said that striking changes now began to take place in the Bengali Church, at least a few gusts of wind came along to blow it out of the doldrums of the 1920's.

After 1930, the rate of immigration into East Bengal increased and some of the newcomers proved much readier listeners to the Christian message. The influence of the Rev. D.A. Chowdhury, a distinguished Muslim convert, made itself felt and under his leadership district communities received a new lease of life. They began to take a fresh interest in evangelism and the possibility of self-support.

NOTES

107) Ibid., 1905, p.23.
109) Ibid., 1929, p.122.
Contacts were made about this time with Santal immigrants in Calcutta and near Chinsurah a number of families were baptised. The Santals were willing to start putting up their own small churches without looking for help from the Mission. (112) A number of students from the Hooghly College showed their interest by attending Services at Chinsurah. (113) And there was the nucleus of a small congregation composed of Nepali immigrants from the Central Provinces. (114)

For a number of years now, the former Free Church stations up the bank of the Hooghly had been losing their mercantile importance but were at the same time developing as industrial colonies round Calcutta. Chinsurah, once a thriving river port, was to be connected to the city by a fast electric train service. New industries had attracted families looking for work and so within travelling distance of such great factories as Dunlop, Hindustan Motors or the Alkali Chemical Corporation of India, there would be added to the already congested living conditions of the ancient streets and lanes straggling lines and huddles of booths built by refugees. What had forty years ago been a rural Mission was now a church at work in a new "black country" of thriving mills and factories and choking smog. (115)

With the 1930's, evangelistic work in preaching halls, bazaars and villages was intensified among both Bengali and Hindustani speakers as well as/
among Santals. In Budge Budge a little community of about 80 had managed by their own efforts to build a beautiful little church. Change and prosperity together had brought a revival of the desire to give personal witness and service, a case in point being the elder who decided to open up a homeopathic dispensary. And we hear of occasions on which a good half of a congregation took an active part in a Week of Witness campaign.(116) Rural construction work and a welfare centre had been opened at a village about twelve miles from Budge-Budge in 1935 and there evangelism was combined with training in village industries, sanitation and self-help. For the first time for over a generation, it could be said that the opportunities were greater than the Church with its limited resources could take advantage of.(117)

Up in the Kalna-Chinsurah area, the church was experiencing somewhat mixed fortunes. There was something of a revival of hope in the 1930's, Sunday Schools being re-opened, churches repaired at local expense and contacts with Hindu villages renewed.(118) During the next decade, this area was finally recognised as a full-time pastorate, but the whole Kalna section was reduced to a mere handful of Christians and hospital work finally closed down. Local Christians were by now becoming more church-minded and activity was expanding among the young.(119) Some converts were being made too from among/
the higher castes and those with an educated background. We learn that within a period of 18 months two high caste Brahmins, a Mohammedan moulvi, a Chinese and an educated Kayastha were all brought into the Church. (120)

Invasion scares, famine and troubles brought about by independence, a great inflow in refugees and a growing shortage of missionary staff had a material effect on the Church's life, the war here being a major disruption where in other areas it just brought strain and uncertainty. With the Japanese occupation of Burma city schools were requisitioned and their pupils evacuated inland. Some church workers had to be persuaded not to draw out all their Provident Fund money and flee for refuge further inland. And a couple of years later Calcutta became the springboard for the Allied counter-attack. (121)

The College which at the beginning of this period was proving "more popular than ever", had over a hundred women students besides 1500 men and had built a chapel (122), found itself faced after the war with a new series of challenges. When inter-racial riots and killings were terrorising the whole districts of the city, it opened its doors to refugees and attempted to act as mediator between Hindu and Muslim factions. (123) In the years which followed it had to deal at the educational level with such diverse problems as the partial displacement of English from the curriculum, the "conscience clause" concerning religious instruction and a group of students/

NOTES

123) Ibid., 1947, p.347.
who brought an idol into the grounds during the celebration of a Hindu festival.\(^{(124)}\) The number of Christian students was rising however, and the S.C.M. proving itself a splendid breeding ground for Christian leaders.\(^{(125)}\) A new constitution was put into force and in 1960 it became the last of the four original Scottish Colleges to install an Indian Principal.\(^{(126)}\)

The process of Indianisation was one already well under way through integration with the Church Council. A beginning was made in the 1930's when district work was handed over to the Council's jurisdiction and two most important steps were taken in the next decade when the churches associated with the L.M.S. joined the Bengal Church Council and with the opening of a Union Theological College in which the U.C.N.I. co-operated with Anglicans and Baptists.\(^{(127)}\) The Churches of the former Congregational Union were similar in size, character and distribution to the U.C.N.I. congregations, some of which were of English Presbyterian origin, and the move, though overdue, was one which gave the Indian Church a much-needed feeling of strength and unity. The regional college, which ran a common two-year course, after which students were differentiated according to denomination, and which opened under a Scottish Principal, had at first some difficulty in getting matriculated students. But it was further strengthened when it amalgamated with the Bishop's College Divinity School, to become the only non-Roman Catholic seminary in Bengal.\(^{/}\)

---

**NOTES**

Arrangements were made here also for the wives of married students to receive training. (128)

Unions and combined institutions led to the working out of a form of integration whereby all work should be gathered under a single authority which would be Church-controlled rather than Mission-controlled. The Church of Scotland Mission and Congregational Union Councils thus both handed over the last of their responsibility to the Church Council in 1952. (129) After another five years the Church Council was able to report that it had Indian pastors for all charges but one, only one High School was without an Indian Headmaster, an Indian woman doctor had been appointed in charge of a 130-bed hospital and Council Officers were, with one exception, all nationals. Women elders had also been ordained and one woman who was doing a theological course would shortly be installed as a supervisor of evangelistic work. (130) In making a decision progressively to reduce, over the next ten years, the amount of foreign money being received for evangelistic and pastoral work, the Church Council also showed a sincere desire to attain self-support. (131)

It should be noted, however, that the Church in Bengal gives a fair illustration of the Mission’s policy to aim for partnership rather than mere Indianisation. About the same time as Dr. N.K. Mundle was becoming Principal of the Scottish Churches’ College, a Scottish missionary, the Rev. William Stewart, was appointed Principal of Serampore College as successor to an/

---

**NOTES**

130) Ibid., 1957, p.359; 1959, p.436.
Indian Principal. And another young missionary spent three months at a Christian Ashram in the United Provinces with the purpose of being better qualified for district work. (132)

Under the Church Council, experiments were made of the type being developed all over the country. There grew up a new concern for the training of lay workers and an annual Church School was established for elders and other Church members. (133) A Youth Group was formed in the city, which started with over 80 members. (134) And through a number of ecumenical bodies such as the Bengal Christian Literature Society, the North-East India Ecumenical Institute of Society and Industry (for lay training and social study) and the Bengal Refugee Service, the Church broke fresh ground in the spheres of evangelism and social service. (135)

Small though it is, the Bengal Church with its fine traditions and high standards of education has from its earliest days been in a position to provide Christian leaders of ability and distinction. Among these the Rev. S.K. Chatterjee had the unique honour of being appointed for a second term as Moderator of the U.C.N.I. (136)/

NOTES


A total Christian community of about 4,000 is at present organised into six city congregations and five country pastorates. There are in addition a number of small and scattered worshipping groups South of Calcutta. About thirty in all, they are catered for by another two Indian pastors.

The number of ordained ministers available for pastoral work — there are twelve at present — is just adequate, but some are nearing retiring age and there is a shortage of candidates coming forward. Theological training is given at Serampore, Bishop's College, Calcutta or the Vernacular U.T.C.

Of three Bengali-speaking congregations in the city, one is the Duff church which has now been united with the former St. Andrew's congregation of Church of Scotland Mission origin. There is also a "Hill Christian" congregation of Nepali speakers from round Darjeeling and Kalimpong. Having no building of their own, they worship under their Nepali pastor in the Scots Kirk, but form part of the Bengal Church Council. A third congregation is an off-shoot of the Tamil-Telegu group which was started by the L.M.S., joined the Free Church Mission in the latter part of the Nineteenth Century and then chose to continue on an independent basis. Their history is complicated, but after a split, a section of them asked to be admitted to the U.C.N.I. Two other Bengali-speaking congregations and one which is English-speaking make up the Council's six city charges, while St. Andrew's Church retains its Scottish connection.

The Chinsurah-Kalna district, the Budge-Budge-Mattiabruz district and the Sunderabunds made up three separate pastorates of the multiple-unit variety, along with two other district pastorates of L.M.S. origin. And as already noted, two groups of villages not yet organised under their own Kirk Sessions are each supervised by an Indian pastor. Of those eleven organised and two unorganised charges only two, the Duff church and one other city charge, are fully self-supporting, the Central Fund being fairly strongly subsidised by money from overseas. Worship is conducted chiefly in Bengali, but also in/
those particular congregations in Nepali, Tamil, Telugu and English. Church Council meetings are held in both Bengali and English. Most congregations have a number of women elders.

As might be expected, the Church takes part in a number of co-operative efforts, some of which have already been mentioned, along with the Baptist, Anglican and Methodist churches. Besides having its representatives on the Bengal Christian Council it also contributes its share to the "Fellowship of Christian Workers". The Scheme of Union for North India should here give more effective power to these and similar bonds, of which the strongest has been the connection with Serampore College. (137)

The problems posed by the situation today, while not peculiar to Bengal, weigh the more heavily on account of the Church's limited size.

"The fact that there have been no mass movements to speak of in Bengal and that the general rate of progress has been slower than in other parts of the world has been looked upon as a reason for disquietude", wrote Dr. Urquhart in his farewell address on retirement from the post of College Principal in 1937.

"(But) it is conceivable that in some countries -- and I think Bengal is one of them -- what might be called peaceful penetration might be the better method" (138) This was indeed the strength of both Church and Mission in Bengal, that in spite of this having been the matrix of Indian nationalism, the barriers between European and Indian, Hindu Muslim and Christian, were probably lower than in any other part of the land. /

NOTES

137) Information obtained through correspondence, etc: "The Story of Serampore College", published by the Council of the College, 3rd Edition, 1961: see also Appendix II

Yet "peaceful penetration" could easily lead to syncretism and this was the danger against which one Indian minister was warning his church some thirteen years later. "There are serious souls who would not ignore the mighty challenge of Christianity and would desire to enrich their own religion by absorbing Christianity into it", he wrote. "This calls for the greatest vigilance on the part of the Church and all Christian institutions."

In 1943, the year of the Duff Church's centenary, the community which represented a hundred years of constant labour was still being described as "small, poor and with little increase"(140) yet this was one of the Council's two self-supporting congregations and its members were by Indian standards well-paid and comfortably off. Pastors were badly underpaid however, and with a Mission staff that once numbered 27 reduced to 4, were not receiving the same encouragement and support and had in practice much more ground to cover in the care of their people.(141)

Even at the Scottish Church College, where there are only twelve Christians on a staff of 75, and education and the outlook of students is yearly growing more secular, the witness of those dozen is apt to make little impression on the majority of students.(142)

Less isolated from the affairs of its neighbours of other religions and from the spirit of the nation than most of its sister churches, and well situated to express in Christian forms the best of both Eastern and Western culture, the Church of West Bengal is confronted with the difficulty of making its presence felt as a body which has not only tradition behind it but a distinct message of its own.

NOTES

141) Introductory Notes to St. Andrew's Conference, 1965.(F.M.C. papers)
GENERAL SOURCES.

"Our Church's Work in India: Bengal", Rev. Alex. Tomory and Mrs. K.S. MacDonald.

R.W. Weir, "Foreign Missions of the Church of Scotland."

"The Centenary of the Scottish Church College: A Book of Remembrance, 1830-1930" (F.M.C. Secretary's Library).

F.M.C. Reports.

"Conference".

F.M.C. Manuscripts, S.N.L.
CHAPTER VIII
THE CHURCH IN SOUTH INDIA.

1835 - 1862.

The early history of the Scottish Churches' Madras Mission bears a strong resemblance to the history of the Western India and Bengal Missions. This similarity is hardly remarkable, for the Church of Scotland's first three ventures in India had much ground in common. They all took root in large cities which were provincial capitals containing a mixed population and a number of European residents. All set out to overcome Hindu opposition by the establishment of a central institution teaching in English. And there was impressed upon them all the stamp not only of a single sending body but of that native Scottish character which is compounded of energy, thoroughness and a mighty respect for the power of education.

As Professor Latourette points out, moreover, this form of development followed a pattern common to most Protestant Missions of the period. "In spite of the multiplicity of societies and denominations engaged in propagating the Protestant form of Christianity" he remarks, "in procedures nearly all bore a striking family likeness. Nearly every society displayed unique features, and emphasis on one or another method varied from organisation to organisation. Yet through the programmes of most societies ran a common pattern. They also resembled those of 19th Century Christianity in other lands."(1) A comparison of the Scottish Missions in India during this period, with those of other societies and with the Free Church's Mission in Kaffraria would indeed confirm the truth of this observation.(2)

Yet the Madras Mission had it individual features. Its pioneer, the Rev. John Anderson, the son of a poor Galloway farmer, never achieved the kind of international reputation enjoyed by Duff or John Wilson. But he was/

NOTES
1) Latourette, op.cit., Vol. VI, p.189
2) The Institution at Lovedale was the Kaffrarian Mission's equivalent to the Indian "Institutions".
an able dedicated, perspicacious man and had the advantage of being able to work in harness for upwards of 15 years with two other equally competent colleagues, Robert Johnston and John Braidwood. It was these three "True Yoke-fellows in the Mission Field" who set the Madras Mission on a firm footing.

In contrast to the Bombay missionaries they did not long maintain their operations beyond a manageable area which was in the main Tamil-speaking, with only a few small pockets of outcaste groups whose language was Telegu. Any outlying stations difficult to supervise were later handed over to neighbouring Missions, American, Australian or English Methodist. They also reaped some benefit from particular characteristics of the South Indian situation.

Christianity was not, in this region, an entirely new or unknown religion; the legendary St. Thomas's Mount was less than ten miles from the outskirts of Madras and the Province already possessed a scattering of "Syrian", Roman Catholic and "Danish" Christians. The struggle for power among French, British, Dutch and Portuguese interests had been concentrated in this area, so that European faces and customs and the English language were more familiar. The list of Anglican chaplains at the Fort goes back to the 1630's and it is still not unusual, further inland, to find a roadside shopkeeper using as a paper-weight a cannon ball picked up from the field of Wandawash or Polilur. And while South India was traditionally one of Hinduism's historic strongholds, there grew up among the descendants of the original Dravidian inhabitants a feeling of hostility towards Brahmin dominance, social, religious and economic. These factors all had their place in making it a little easier to gain a hearing, especially in the outcaste villages, where Hindu ideas of worship were usually mingled with local forms of Dravidian animism. (3)

The presence of other Protestant Missions close at hand and a wise division of areas on a basis of comity also proved an advantage. It speeded/

NOTES

3) See. W.T. Elmore, "Dravidian Gods in Modern Hinduism" C.L.S. for India, 1925
up co-operative work and made much easier the formation of an Indian Church which was united in spirit and practice as well as in name.\(^4\)

The Mission began in 1835 through the work of two Church of Scotland chaplains who were impressed by the needs of the people and by what they had seen of Duff's Institution. Opening a school with English as the medium of instruction, they then applied to the Home Church for a missionary and John Anderson, arriving in 1837, took over the school, moved it to a more suitable building in the Georgetown district of the city and almost immediately met with the hoped-for response.\(^5\) Within a couple of months he was writing joyfully home, "I have succeeded far beyond expectation. The school is daily increasing, there being now 180 on the list."\(^6\) But before being joined by his first colleague in 1839, Anderson had to face the storm which arose when three Pariah boys managed to get themselves enrolled as pupils. In the course of the uproar which ensued, over one third of the pupils left, but the principle of equality in education was now firmly established and the strength quickly more than recouped itself. A very important battle, to be fought out for years in Government schools, had been won once and for all so far as Mission schools were concerned.\(^7\)

With the arrival of Johnston and Braidwood, it became possible to think of extending operations. A school had already been started at Conjeeveram, a famous temple city about 50 miles North-West of Madras, and others were opened at Nellore, a Telegu-speaking city 100 miles North of the capital and at Chingleput, a district headquarters 30 miles on the main road South. A second school was also established in the city's Triplicane district.

---

**NOTES**

4) See General Sources.
5) The opening prospectus of the school read "The Rev. John Anderson, an ordained missionary of the Church of Scotland, will open a school under its superintendence and support, similar in principle to the General Assembly's school in Calcutta, established nearly 7 years ago by Dr. Duff."
6) Ibid
7) Ibid, pp.29-32
and somewhat later a school at Trivellore, 30 miles to the West. (8)

A critical day in the Mission's history came after four years work when the two head pupils of the Georgetown Institution, P. Rajahgopal and A. Venkatarama, declared themselves Christians and were baptized in the Mission House. For six weeks the sound of protests continued and the school roll fell from 400 to 70. But when at the end of that period a third caste youth, S. Ettirajulu, was baptized, the opposition appeared to have melted away. Other baptisms followed, though not without occasional defection back to the ranks of Hinduism, and there continued from time to time to be strong family opposition, particularly in the case of one 19-year-old Brahmin youth. Again school classes were deserted, there were numerous street disturbances and beatings, and the panic seems to have spread hundreds of miles inland. But within a short time the pupils had again returned, and meanwhile the Mission had the nucleus of its native Church and, in its first three converts, three valuable Christian workers. (9)

In the year those three young men had been won, the Mission had held its first celebration of the Lord's Supper, the company consisting of "the three converts, with the missionaries, Mrs. Braidwood and two other native Christians." After the Disruption of 1843, a Presbytery of the Free Church of Scotland was constituted and the three converts, having by now spent five years in training, were licensed by the Presbytery in 1846, "in due form and with great solemnity". When another five years had passed, they were ordained and designated as "native missionaries." (10)

It is revealing to learn that during the major part of this ten year period, all the converts, with their families, continued to live in the Mission/

**NOTES**

8) Ibid., pp. 35-38
9) Ibid., pp. 39-41
10) Ibid., p.p. 43, 68 and passim.
house and were maintained by funds raised locally or taken from the missionaries' own salaries. "This care, that was thus lavished on them" says the official history of the 1900's, "was of great benefit in nurturing Christian knowledge and life, but it was not without its disadvantages. The flower that blossomed well in congenial surroundings did not thrive so well in a different environment." (11) Reading between the lines, it is not difficult to discern that of the three, Rajahgopal alone fully lived up to his early promise.

By 1851, the English Service which had been conducted regularly every Sunday was given up and a Tamil one took its place. With further baptisms and accessions a small congregation was formed, to which in 1858 Rajahgopal was inducted as pastor. The following year the foundation stone of a Church was laid next to the Institution and by 1862 this was ready for opening and dedication. (12)

The congregation was a mixed one, of Europeans and Eurasians as well as Indians. When Rajahgopal was ordained as pastor, 60 to 70 on the roll of communicants were Indians. And these are reported by him as including "men of faith, zeal and self-denial." "Yet they had much in their temper and habits which was antagonistic to the doctrines and duties of Christianity." (13) By the time of his death 30 years later, in 1887, there were over 100 native communicants, besides 100 adherents, many of the members added being further converts from the higher castes of Hinduism. While this meant that individually they were men and women of strong Christian convictions, it also led to the disadvantages of individualism, with the result that a generation after its birth it was still proving difficult to weld this city congregation into a homogeneous fellowship. (14)

Meanwhile, with the arrival of the Rev. William Miller in 1862, the school next door to the new church started on that long climb up the /
educational ladder which led to the establishment of the Madras Christian College and culminated with its resettlement on a new site at Tambaran, on the outskirts of the city. (15) The College was inaugurated in 1865 and reached first-grade status two years later. Ten years after that the C.M.S. and the Wesleyan Missionary Society gave it their support and their example was followed by other Societies some thirty years later to make the Madras Christian College a thoroughly co-operative institution. (16) At the same time the evangelistic efforts of missionaries and Indian workers in the country districts were slowly building up a number of small Christian communities, which in obedience to the pattern now so familiar remained closely connected with local schools. By 1862 the Mission, with its seven European missionaries, 4 ordained Indian pastors, 2 licensed preachers, 3 theological students, 20 to 30 school and district Christian workers and 103 native communicants, could claim to have a foothold in 8 different centres. The first medical missionary had started dispensary work in Madras and there were altogether 8 boys' schools with over 1,500 pupils. An attempt to begin female education had been made by Mrs. Braidwood as early as the 1840's (17) and within the next twenty years the number of girls' schools had risen to 10, with a roll of 750 pupils.

The Scottish missionaries were up until now all resident in Madras, district work at Nellore, Chingleput, Walajabad and Conjeevanall being in charge of Indian workers. (18) This may be taken as a convenient point at which to mark the end of the Mission's pioneer stage.

NOTES
15) Ibid., Ch. 4
Two significant features in the period which succeeded it were, first, the emergence of William Miller as a born leader who transformed the status of the College and gave the Mission new drive and direction; and second, the establishment of missionaries in the rural centres where Indian workers were already serving. Those missionaries took over the leadership and initiative and greatly enlarged the scope of the work being done.

Until the end of the century and beyond, the bulk of the Christian community still lived near the city. But the really vital movements took place in the mofussil, or country districts, which were to supply the Church with its numbers and a very necessary balance.

The Anderson Memorial congregation on the Esplanade continued to have a somewhat checkered history. In the 1860's they are reported as "trying to support their own pastor" and "in a fair state of prosperity."(19) Yet a decade later they are still "not as united a body as desired."— "it needs time to build them into one living whole."(20) With the subsequent loss of their pastor, the driving power was lost, weekly prayer meetings and the Sunday School being a failure. Spiritual interest seemed lacking, divisions became more apparent and "it was not possible to feel that they were a great power for good in our city."(21) Numbers were rising slowly, however, and if there was little sign of any evangelistic spirit among members, the pastor and the catechists attached to the congregation were preaching faithfully to Hindu audiences for 3 and 4 hours every evening and the baptism of fresh converts resulting from such efforts prevented the College Church from becoming too ingrown.(22) By the time of Rajahgopal's death in 1839, the Christian community numbered about 200 and annual offerings, which came to/

NOTES
19) Ibid., 1867 p.47 and 1869, p.32.
20) Ibid., 1880, p.20
21) Ibid., 1883, p.31
22) Ibid., 1886, p.24
about Rs 400, were well above the average for the period. (23) There followed five difficult years, with the congregation unable to agree on a successor and we find them seeking to justify their position before the Committee in Scotland. "It is well known", ran their petition, "That owing to causes over which neither the Pastor nor the Church members had any control, there have been no accessions to the Church for upwards of a quarter of a century, directly from any of the schools of the Mission. The records of the Church will show, however, that though these feeders failed to add to the roll of our membership, yet by the efforts of the late Pastor and the exertions of individual members upwards of 30 adults, some of whom were high caste Hindus, were brought into the Church." (24)

The Rev. P.B. Raghaviah, a graduate of the College and a "son of the Mission", was ordained in 1895 at the head of an independent Kirk Session and Deacons' Court. (25) At the same time, the purging of the roll had brought communicant membership down to 60 and there was concern about the building, which was clearly unsuitable. This awkward corner was turned by the remodelling of the Evangelistic Hall, which was handed over to the congregation, while the energy of the new pastor had its effect. Membership gradually began to increase once more, Sunday attendances improved and church organisations were better supported. A large proportion of losses had been due not to lapsing and indifference but to the fact that country members living well outside the city limits now belonged to their own district churches. And by 1900 the "College Church" as it was now called, had managed to gather round it again about 200 Christians, most of whom lived fairly near at hand. (26) The fact remains that while it had at last developed some stability, the congregation was no longer a growing point and the main extensions of the

NOTES

23) Ibid., 1888, p.25
24) MS Petition to Dr. George Smith, F.M.C. Secretary, from members of the Anderson Memorial Church, Madras, dated 20.9.1890. S.H.L.
25) F.C. Reports 1893 to 1896, passim
26) Ibid., passim. Our Church's Work, pp. 70-71.
Church were taking place elsewhere. If there is nothing very absorbing in its humble and unexceptional history, it furnishes another illustration of a city congregation which sprouted from the branch of a strong educational Mission.

A fresh and perhaps more natural point of growth emerged with the formation of a small congregation in Royapuram, an Eastern suburb of Madras. Originating about 1873, it was at first attached to a dispensary, and the man who became its pastor, the Rev. T.K. Itty, was only ordained after working for fourteen years as a dispenser-cum-evangelist. A poorer and much less sophisticated community than that belonging to the College Church, Royapuram grew more rapidly, and Services on Sunday were strengthened by the presence of children from the Rajahgopal Poor School and the Girls' Boarding School near at hand and presented attractive possibilities. "In the immediate neighbourhood there is a large native population", it was explained, "that around the church being of the poorer class and that a little further off containing a great number of the best native families in Madras. From Royapuram as a centre, then, we should look forward to a very fine evangelistic work, both among the educated natives and among the Tamil-speaking peoples". (27) Within eight years it could claim sixty communicants and one hundred adherents (28) and a regular inflow from adult baptisms. Eight are recorded in 1880, twelve in 1882, eleven the next year, sixteen in 1897 and eleven two years later. (29) Many of these were relatives of members and quite a few lapsed Roman Catholics. (30) Cottage meetings were well attended, within twenty years the people were within sight of supporting both church and pastor, and by 1900 there was a reasonably composite community of 400 living within reach of each other. (31)

As solidly Mission-based as its elder sister, Royapuram Church nevertheless had a suburban compactness and was also more outward-looking. Special /

NOTES

27) Letter from A. Alexander, Madras, to Dr. Smith, dated 27.2.1884 S.M.L.
29) Ibid., passim
30) Ibid 1888, p.99
31) Ibid., 1894, p.50 1900 p.61
services with Christian lyrics linked to popular tunes were held for Christians and Hindus to join in together and growth did not depend nearly so much on the work of full-time agents. (32) While managing to pay three-quarters of its pastor's salary, the congregation also had a direct missionary interest in the support of a catechist at Tangal, a village some four miles off, where there were already the makings of another congregation. (33) Village work was by this time being carried on in six districts on the outskirts of the city and Mission agents were making regular visits to more than eighty villages. (34)

The most fertile ground of all, however, was unquestionably the new field of work which came to be extended in the country areas South and West of Madras. Its germinating point was the town of Chingleput, 35 miles south of the city, set by a lake and surrounded by scrub-covered hills. Development started with the Rev. Adam Andrew who arrived there in 1879 and also took over the supervision, with the assistance of an increased force of evangelists, of the other outstations at Conjeeveram, Sriperumbadur and Walajabad.

Following a few years of ground work, a separate congregation was formed at Chingleput in 1883, and while the thirty people who made it up consisted almost entirely of Mission workers and their families, there had already been one triumph in the baptism of a caste convert. (35) Rural work had meanwhile been spreading out vigorously on established lines. Village schools and girls' schools were opened and a dispensary at Walajabad, to accompany the High Schools already operating at Chingleput and Conjeeveram.

In the 1880's, during the course of one year, visits are reported to have been made to 2,000 villages, and two years later we are told that a total of 4,200 addresses were given to 165,000 people, while 37,000 tracts were distributed. (36)

NOTES

32) Ibid., 1889, p.23
33) Ibid., 1889, p.56: Our Church's Work, Madras, p.72
34) Ibid., 1889, p.57
35) Ibid., 1884, p.29
36) Ibid., 1885, p.23: 1887, p.36
A pastor was ordained at Chingleput and district elders at Walajabad and Conjeevaram(37). Mission workers were by now being greeted and listened to with increasing friendliness — a cause of some concern to the orthodox Hindus of Conjeevaram.(38) And with the 1890's a pariah movement was clearly on its way, with secret enquirers from the outcaste chorie coming forward openly to ask for baptism. In 1891 a convert from a village near Chingleput brought 16 of his relatives for baptism and later 39 others.(39)

The movement spread to the other Mission centres and two years later there were 100 baptisms and over 380 catechums under instruction.(40) A church was erected at Chingleput, agents were planted in charge of village elementary schools and prayer sheds. In 1896 the Conjeevaram and Walajabad area was divided off as a separate pastorate and shortly after Sripurambadur with Vedal made a third and a new foundation at Kelrosapuram a fourth.(41)

The missionaries were by this time faced with the two familiar problems of self-support and of training in Christian faith and living. The difficulty of achieving the former aim was aggravated by the prevailing factor in almost every rural Mission. Converts were not just poor, but belonged to the outcaste section of their village, where they were dependent for their daily livelihood on the landowners from the caste section of the same village. Caste Hindu hostility often deprived them of work and on the Mission was thrust the responsibility of their economic support. The dangers of paternalism and of "rice-Christianity" were thus only too obvious, a fact of which the missionaries themselves were well aware.

Speaking of a large group from one village which appeared before him wanting baptism, Adam Andrew wrote, "During the interview I got to know their /

NOTES
37) Ibid., 1889, p.24
38) Ibid., 1891, p.38
39) Ibid., 1892, p.29
40) Ibid., 1894, p.51
41) Ibid., 1894-99, passim: information received through correspondence.
condition, surroundings and motives. They are of very humble origin — the social outcastes of Hindu society. — They are cruelly treated by Hindus and relentlessly persecuted. Every right they possess is being wrung unjustly from them and owing to the scarcity of the last two years their position became intolerable. — Being at their wits' end and they knocked at the doors of the Mission — their motives are mixed, the chief being of a worldly character. On account of the abundant preaching in high and low caste villages conducted by my assistants and myself since 1383 the villagers have everywhere been brought to understand that Christianity is a good religion and that Christians are kind and helpful to all, irrespective of caste. Ignorant and degraded as these low caste converts are, they believed that their worldly condition at least would be made better and their children educated if they attached themselves to the Mission at work in their midst. Accordingly they sought our protection and were received. They know scarcely anything of the distinctive spiritual truths we teach and can hardly be said to have begun the moral and spiritual life as presented by the Gospel. Nor can it be otherwise. The pariah village is the hotbed of every social iniquity — the common language of young and old alike is filthy in the extreme. — It is an Herculean task, when you understand their environment and how much reformation of life and morals is needed. Much progress in this direction cannot be expected of the older converts, as they can neither read nor write. Their habits are confirmed. But it is among the children we hope to see the greatest results produced."(42)

The fact that many of these people stuck to their determination to be Christians in spite of forms of persecution which included facing law suits and false charges, unemployment and being ousted from their land, showed that their motives were not entirely selfish, or that at least they were ready to make big sacrifices in order to be freed from servitude. "Their motives are/
mixed" wrote Andrew again, "But they see the rewards of education for their children, expect help in trouble, seek a better social status and look to the Mission for protection. —— The Church has an opportunity to mould them"(43)

The motives of enquirers continued for many years to be a matter of concern to the missionaries, who tried to strike a balance between false encouragement and outright rejection. "Too often they come with an expectation that by joining 'the way' they will see the end of their troubles and constant watchfulness has to be exercised to prevent the influx into the Church of a multitude of self-seekers," commented J.H. Maclean. "But though the desire for spiritual good may not be the most prominent at first it can be developed, and we have reason to think that it is being developed in some at least of those who have recently come to us."(44)

When this problem was coupled with that of finding sufficient trained workers to foster such scattered and indigent communities, the founding of Christian villages which would also act as training centres became an obvious solution. The Government was appealed to on behalf of the parish villagers and within a period of five years three Christian settlements were made in the Chingleput pastorate area — Andreyapuram, Melrosapuram and Overtounpetta. (45) The district churches had now grown to a community of over 1,000, with two ordained pastors. Villagers in the Christian settlements cultivated plots of land rented from the Mission and a number of simple village industries were started. Melrosapuram in particular was seen as a central nursery for Christian agents who would become pastors and leaders for village communities. "Men trained in this way will be the best qualified for the management of the village school or congregation, which is of prime importance in the prosecution of self-support and for the future well-being of village work. Highly educated/

NOTES

43) F.C. Report, 1893, p.38
44) MS Notes of Village Evangelism by J.H. Maclean, Madras District, Oct. 1901, S.N.B.
men cannot easily adapt to village work."(46)

By the end of the century Chingleput and Conjeeveram both had self-supporting pastorates. Village schools, Sunday Schools, boarding schools and agricultural schools were raising the standards of education and of living. At the Girls' Boarding School in Chingleput lacemaking was taught and a Boarding Home for Christian boys attached to St. Columba's High School provided a stepping stone to higher education for village boys. The ordained missionary at Conjeeveram had been joined by a medical colleague and a hospital built. The Madras Mission of the Free Church now had five organised congregations, the same number of ordained pastors, and one licentiate and three students in training at the American Arcot Mission's Theological Seminary. (47) The challenge of an independent Church had at the same time been kept to the fore even among the poorest converts. At the sixth annual examination held for evangelists and Bible teachers at Chingleput in 1889, for instance, an essay was required on "The Most suitable constitution for the National Church and the means that should be adopted to make the Church independent, self-governing and self-propagating."(48)

Yet even the older city congregations were still not self-supporting. The three district pastorates which had reached independent status could not have survived without their solid core of paid Mission workers. And in village centres such as Sriperumbudur it was recognised that the Mission must give charity, but do so with care.(49)

Yet Christian worship and nurture were being adapted to local conditions. In the Sriperumbudur pastorate, for example, Sunday Services were followed by a Sunday School attended by the whole congregation. Every morning the local teacher would conduct a short service at daybreak, followed after dusk, when the men came in from the fields, by an equally brief evening session. This/

NOTES

46) Ibid., 1894, p.52
47) Reports and Statistics, passim
48) F.C. Report, 1890, p.22
49) Ibid., 1900. p.62
This system, later discontinued, was geared to the needs of fostering an illiterate community still very much dependent on outside leadership[50].

The Church raised up by the Church of Scotland's small Madras Mission, about which nothing has yet been said, had meanwhile been developing on similar but less ambitious lines, and until district work was opened at Arkoatta in 1879 had shown few signs of indigenous strength. The Church of Scotland's Madras "Institution" was a one-man show, and suffered further because its single missionary leader also had laid on him the supervision of schools and congregations in the city and at Vellore and Secunderabad. After 60 years of life, the Church numbered 700 souls and it was the lone missionary's cry that "Madras still waits for justice." He went on to explain that lack of men and money was the reason why the Mission had never been a credit to its home Church.[51]

A congregation which worshipped in the chancel of the Scots Kirk had been formed in Madras under an Indian pastor in 1856. Described in the 1860's as "one of the most flourishing congregations in Madras"[52], its hard-working pastor, the Rev. Jacob David, who was a second-generation Tamil Christian from Ceylon, was a fine preacher. At the beginning of that decade, with 85 communicant members, it could count on a standing-room-only congregation of 200 worshippers on Sundays, while ten years later the Christian community had risen to 350. And while paying its own pastor's salary, it also supported a catechist and supported two poor schools.[53]

Yet even this modest appearance of success was rather illusory. The congregation was composed largely of the servants of European households, and not till a separate church building was erected at Choolai in 1879, by money raised mainly from European sources, could it claim to be embarking on an independent existence.[54] The new building's situation was not very suitable.

NOTES

50) Ibid., p.53
51) C. of S. Report, 1899, p.37
52) Ibid., 1885, p.14
53) Ibid., 1850-71, passim
54) Ibid., 1860, p.11
either and membership immediately began to drop due to competition with a Methodist congregation nearby. But a reserve fund was launched for the support of pastor and catechists and by the close of the century a community of nearly 400 was almost supporting itself by raising Rs 320 a year.(55)

By 1870, the Mission actually had three organised churches, each under an ordained pastor, at Madras, Vellore and Secunderabad. Yet none were truly self-supporting and the two latter centres were not only difficult to administer on account of distance, but situated where other and stronger missions were at work. The Church and school at Vellore were eventually handed over to the American Arcot Mission and Secunderabad was left to the S.P.G.(56)

The Church of Scotland had a strong sense of responsibility for providing services for overseas Scots, often planters or railwaymen, and it was a connection of this kind which led to the start of a promising piece of district work at Ardonam, a railway junction about 40 miles West of Madras and adjacent to the Free Church Mission's field, which had not yet been occupied by any other Mission. Here again, in the 1890's a movement began parallel to that in Chingleput. The Christian community, which in 1883 numbered 50, had risen in seven years to 360. That year there were 55 baptisms from pariah families, a brick church to seat 200 was erected in Ardonam and 7 elders were ordained to form a Kirk Session.(57) Only a small proportion of these converts lived in the town, the others belonging to one or other of 6 cheri villages, where with a school and a prayer-shed they were shepherded by a resident Christian teacher.(58) The character and organisation of this Church was, in all important respects, comparable to that of its neighbours across the boundary line of the two Missions: and in another few years, while the Missions remained separate, the churches themselves were to be united into one body. 

NOTES

56) Ibid., 1878, p.53, 1895, p.43.
57) Ibid., 1884, p.26: 1901, p.43
58) Ibid, 1898, p.50: 1901, p.43
In these sixty years or so, the Church had produced two people in whom exceptional devotion and ability were combined. The Mission's first convert, the Rev. P. Rajahgopal, had a large share in developing work in Madras and showed initiative in his manner of doing so. As the first pastor of the Esplanade Church, his preaching gifts and wisdom as a pastor had a lot to do with welding together a heterogeneous community. He was the founder of the Native Christian Literature Society and collected a respectable library for interested readers, both Hindu and Christian. He initiated one effort of lasting value when he founded a school for the children of day labourers at the Big Parcheri, where clothes as well as education often had to be provided. Later taken under the Mission's wing and renamed the Rajahgopal Poor School, it was started without Mission aid. It was Rajahgopal also who began educational work among girls by opening a school for the daughters of Chetty merchants in the vicinity of his church, a venture which prospered until he had 600 girls under his care.(59)

Rajahgopal's successor at the church on the Esplanade was the Rev. R.M. Bauboo and his wife. Mrs. Tabitha Bauboo was a woman of forceful character who had a gift for gaining people's confidence and affection. As a voluntary worker she devoted several hours a day for almost 30 years to the girls' school under her husband's charge and was the first to overcome the prejudice of Hindu parents against sending up their daughters for public examinations. As the first person to organise a Zenana agency in Madras, to provide female teachers for this work and to replace male teachers with women in the girls' day schools; and as editor of the Tamil periodical Amirthavachani and co-editor of South India's first Indian Christian Journal, the Eastern Star, she was a prototype for Christian women of later generations.(60)

---

NOTES

60) Ibid., pp. 25-32
It was in South India that the Church was to take the lead in self-government through unions which broadened and modified its Presbyterian basis. The first step of a series was taken when the two Scottish Missions united with each other and the American Arcot (Reformed) Church to form, in 1901, the South India United Church. Still Presbyterian in form, this body had a constitution based on that of the United Church in Japan. The union was seen at the time as a stepping stone towards the establishment of a Presbyterian Church for all India, a body which came into being in 1904, with the S.I.U.C. joining in as its South India Synod. The movement towards strengthening the bonds of Presbyterianism was redirected a few years later, however, when integration with other Churches nearer at hand and similar in policy was accepted as preferable for the future of indigenous growth. “Such a union was felt to be more practical than the other in view of language and other difficulties” wrote Adam Andrew, and in 1908 the S.I.U.C. was reconstituted on a wider basis to include the churches of the L.M.S. and the American Board.62

From this time onwards, increasingly close co-operation with neighbouring bodies rather than the maintenance of historical ties was the determining factor where any collective policy was concerned. Thus the union of the two Scottish Missions in 1929, while it naturally had some effect on local administration, made little difference to the life of the Church. It merely gave official sanction to links which had in practice been operating for more than twenty years. At the same time co-operative efforts with other Missions were paving the way for wider forms of union.

Already in the 1900’s a training school for workers had been functioning at Arkonam, to which the U.F. Mission and the American Arcot Mission also sent/
their students. (63) Between 1910 and 1912, Dr. Miller's dream of a central College for South India was fulfilled with the transformation of the Institution into the Madras Christian College, to which six missionary bodies now pledged their support. (64) Further steps in co-operative planning were taken with the founding of the United Theological College at Bangalore, St. Christopher's Training College for women teachers, its vernacular equivalent 'Gnanodaya', its male counterpart the Meston Training College and finally the Women's Medical College at Vellore. Such bodies were recognised and supported as serving the needs of Churches and Missions still separate in form. (65)

The founding of the Church of South India in 1947, after 23 years of negotiation, was thus from the practical point of view a move that was unnecessarily delayed because of theological difficulties, not least on the part of the home Churches. Nor is there any question of the practical benefits brought by the union to the churches of the former Church of Scotland Mission area. Since a more detailed consideration of those benefits will be deferred to a later chapter, it will be sufficient to note at present that the Church as a unit of Mission administration now finally ceased to exist. New lines of demarcation began to forge fresh bonds and inevitably tended to weaken older ones. (66) And while there continued to be reliance on Mission money and personnel, even in situations where the Mission still helped to pay the piper it was the Church that called the tune. Progress from 1947 onwards was largely a matter of translating into detail and /

---

**NOTES**

63) C. of S. Report 1904, p.130; 1905, p.157. This Training School later moved to Vellore.
64) U.F.C. Report, 1912, p.25
65) C. of S. Report, 1942, p.325: information received through correspondence.
66) The Madras Diocese of the C.S.I. was divided into 5 "Areas", corresponding in size and authority to small Presbyteries. Churches in the Chingleput and Conjeeveram districts now became part of the Chingleput Area, Arkonam of North Arcot and the city congregations of the central Area.
perfecting in practice processes of independent decision and action which had already been accepted in principle. The last two missing bricks were added to the structure in 1960 when the two "Scots Kirks" at Madras and Bangalore, which were still being administered under the home Church's Colonial and Continental Committee, were admitted to the C.S.I., making the Scottish contribution complete.\(^\text{67}\)

Madras was fortunate in this, that being a centre blessed with a variety of strong educational institutions, the standard of English in particular being unusually high, it was better served than most areas with educated Christian leaders. Nor was there any lack of country Churches and communities in which such training might be used and native talents further developed. Yet the process of integration still moved more slowly than might have been expected. One reason for this was the very complexity and efficiency of the Mission's work, which made the task of handing over a major operation. Back in the years of the First World War, it was being held up as an example of "a fully equipped Mission, with every type of educational, evangelistic and medical work represented, men's work and women's work well balanced and co-operation with other Missions well advanced."\(^\text{68}\) But as a result Indian leadership which would have been sufficient for a simple set-up appeared inadequate for the administration of higher institutions whose continuance nearly always depended on their economic solvency. These institutions remained the last to be manned by European missionaries and still remain outwith the Church's direct control.

A natural beginning towards integration was made therefore, not in the city but in the country districts, where elementary schools and evangelistic work were so closely linked with the church's daily life. In 1927 /

\(^{67}\) C. of S. Report, 1960, p.457  
\(^{68}\) U.F.C. Report, 1917, p.13
administrative control of this work in Conjeevaram was handed over to the Church which operated through a "Circle Committee" under a missionary chairman.\(^{69}\) The same system was soon adopted in the Chingleput and Arkanan districts.\(^{70}\) By the time of the 1947 union, the method was working well, with Indians as well as missionaries acting as chairman, and it continued to function in much the same fashion under a Board of the Madras Diocese.\(^{71}\)

The integration of Girls' Schools, High Schools, medical and other institutions was a slower process, but by the 1950's all were operating under Diocesan Boards. While with the appointment of Dr. E.A. Thomas as superintendent of the Rainy Hospital and Dr. Chandran Devanesan as Principal of Madras Christian College, the last and most important of the former Church of Scotland establishments came under Indian leadership, in the latter case, of a truly dynamic character.\(^{72}\) These appointments were as much a matter of necessity as deliberate policy, for the missionary staff of five men and six women was by this time less than one third of what it had been at its maximum thirty years earlier.\(^{73}\) The Church now governed most of the work connected with its own life and activity, including the location of missionaries and the ordination of probationers.\(^{74}\)

Turning to self-propagation, we find that while the traditional system of Mission-supported evangelistic agents continued, it was in the realm of evangelism that the initiative first began to move into Indian hands, as local congregations kept being stirred up towards a variety of voluntary efforts. In Madras itself a direct attempt was made to interest caste Hindus, with the opening of an evangelistic hall in Georgetown and during /

**Notes**

69) Ibid., 1936, p.39
70) C. of S. Report, 1936, p.571
71) Ibid., 1946, p.369. The Pastoral and Evangelistic Board of the Diocese became, after 1947, the administrative authority.
74) The first Scottish missionary was ordained a Deacon of the C.S.I. in 1948 and a Presbyter the following year. Missionaries already ordained became Presbyters of the Church. The position of lay and women missionaries took longer to regularise. In 1958 the Rev. R.C. Manson was appointed as pastor of St. George's, Madras, a former Anglican charge. (Sources various)
a series of gatherings described as unique in the city's history, there were attendances of as many as a thousand nightly.\(^75\) Seven years later evangelistic campaigns centred in this hall were still drawing caste audiences of five to seven hundred.\(^76\) Such an approach was hardly possible in the country districts, however. There caste barriers were proving so difficult to surmount that it was necessary to persuade outcaste converts of their duty to persist in attacking them. While the occasional caste convert came in,\(^77\) it was noted in Conjeeveram and Arkonam how few they were in number and the Christian community was adjured to pay more attention to its immediate neighbours. Particularly in the Brahmin stronghold of Conjeeveram, the changed attitude of the weaver people who were beginning to mock Brahmin customs and religious festivals was seen as offering an opportunity for Christianity to make a fresh appeal.\(^78\)

As was customary all over the country, however, the main response always came from the outcaste choris and it was to these that Church and Mission kept directing their chief efforts and in these villages that the Church spread. Missionaries might claim that the people were not sufficiently interested in evangelising their neighbours. "Church attendance is no better, agencies are not more efficient, people are less interested in evangelism and there are cases where discipline needs to be exercised", wrote the missionary at Conjeeveram in 1935.\(^{79}\) But so far as evangelistic effort is concerned the judgment is a relative one, for no congregation was ever allowed to forget that here lay its primary obligation. To take a few concrete and quite unexceptional examples, Conjeeveram in 1915 had 3 bands /

---

**NOTES**

75) U.F.C. Report, 1909, p.42
76) Ibid., 1916, p.16
77) e.g. C. of S. Report, 1924, p.173
78) Ibid., 1933, p.560; 1934, p.619
79) "Conference", Feb. 1935, p.56
with a total of 50 workers going out weekly. (80) The main difference twenty years later is that the “moonlight bands” included a bigger proportion of voluntary workers. (81) The young men in villages round Arkonam took part in village preaching. (82) Catechumens in the Chingleput district had come in through the voluntary efforts of Christian people, (83) the residents of Arni and other villages in the Madras area had heard about the mass movements further South and were evangelising among their own people, (84) and the Church was recognised to be growing “through the testimony of village converts.” (85) For about five years from 1947 there was considerable growth among village churches near Arkonam, Kilpaukam becoming the headquarters of a separate pastorate. Doors for evangelism remained open and a local report in 1953 declared that “there is an opportunity of work among the caste people now which we have never had before. Work among the crowds at the festivals has seen sales of Gospels which before would have seemed quite fantastic.” Successful evangelism was still being carried on in the 1950’s in the Chingleput district pastorates of Melrosapuram and Tirukalikunram, the latter registering a record number of 109 baptisms in 1963. (86)

Yet two distinctive features emerge. While the Church’s advance was a steady one, Chingleput on the Southern boundary of the Mission area being almost on the fringe of a mass movement (87), yet converts were coming in by families and by groups within the villages, seldom by a village en masse and never by groups of villages coming together. The rate of advance was swiftest in the first thirty years of the century, after which it slowed up but never came to a halt. The Christian community which in 1900 numbered a little over 2,000 trebled in thirty years and increased by about 70% in the next thirty. (88) /

NOTES

80) U.F.C. Report, 1916, p.18
81) "Conference", Aug. 1935, p.56
82) C. of S. Report, 1926, p.257
83) U.F.C. Report, 1928, p.37
84) "Conference", Feb. 1936, p.11
85) U.F.C. 1929, p.148
86) Information received through correspondence: "On the Coast of Coromandel", 1953, p.7
87) Ibid., 1917, p.19
88) Statistics for 1901, 1929, 1956
In the earlier period, even this rate of progress was becoming a cause of embarrassment if there were to be adequate instruction and growth in grace. In the 1920's, when about a third of the community consisted of catechumens, the Arkonam missionary was finding it necessary to prolong the period of probation for lack of teachers and because of the need to inculcate habits of self-reliance. (89) "We need to encourage self-support" he wrote again, "New converts must agree to support the work (i.e. of erecting churches and elementary schools) which we are doing among them." (90) On the same theme Chingleput was reporting "Until we can help with spiritual and educational uplift, there is little point in numbers increasing". (91) In the 1930's, as has already been remarked, growth was no longer so rapid. But the fact that between 1930 and 1960 the proportion of communicants rose from 27% to 40% indicates that the Church had become a maturer and stabler body. (92)

A second feature of which note should be taken was the rise of the Adi Dravida movement. Allied to the outcaste movement taking place all over India, it produced in South India its own distinctive form. Here antipathy to Brahminism and a desire for economic improvement combined with a nationalism based on differences of race and language.

So in other parts of the country it seemed in the 1930's as if the first rumblings of the Harijan movements for social betterment might well lead them into the Christian fold. "Several Adi-Dravidian groups have asked for baptism" runs one typical report from Conjeeveram about this time. (93) Another Dravidian and anti-Brahmin movement, the political Dravida Kazhagam, was supported mainly by the weaver caste and having a strong atheistic bias.

NOTES
90) Ibid., 1920, p.75
91) U.F.C. Report, 1922, P.22
92) Statistics for 1931 and 1961
93) U.F.C. Reports, 1922, p.39: 1929, p.148
was opposed to Christian as well as Hindu teachings. (94) As a result Christian tracts being distributed during the Conjeeveram festival in May were for the first time being countered by Atheist as well as Hindu literature, and by outcaste speakers as well as the orthodox Hindus of the Arya Samaj. (95)

On the whole, "atheistic" is too strong a word to use about the Dravida Kazhagam and its more influential successor, the D.M.K. So far as Church and Mission were concerned, the main effect of such movements was to divert men's attention from religion to politics and the observation of the Arkonam missionary that "The Harijan movement away from Hinduism is not leading here to Christianity" was basically true for the whole area (96).

But with Church and nation achieving independent status in the same year, several other political factors began to affect the Church's life. Communism, the rise of which was described by Bishop Lesslie Newbigin in 1949 as "the most important political fact in India" (97) did not provide the dominant influence in Madras which it did to the South and West in Kerala and Malabar and can for practical purposes be discounted. Not even in a place like Conjeeveram were there any great signs of a Hindu revival. "There is little sign of the change which is taking place elsewhere in India" wrote Dr. J.H. McLean in 1933. "The temples are still closed to Harijans. The crowds which follow the gods at the festival are less, but caste spirit is still strong." (98) The same could have been said 20 years later, the picture being not one of revival but of orthodox survival. (99) While little attempt was made to woo and win the allegiance of Harijans back to Hinduism, pressure/

NOTES

95) C. of S. Reports 1934, p. 619; 1937, p. 703
96) "Conference" May 1937, p. 30
97) C. of S. Report, 1949, p. 352
98) "Conference", April 1938, p. 16
99) C. of S. Reports 1950, p. 384; 1954, p. 322
was still exerted to keep them from embracing Christianity. Harijans from a village near Arkonam told the missionary that while they would welcome a second visit from the Church, their caste employers had warned them this might cost them their jobs. (100) It would be wrong, however, to discount the volume of sympathy on which Church and Mission could always count even on such occasions. The missionary's answer to the problem mentioned above was to plan a visit to the caste village in question, where among former High School pupils he would be sure to find some ready to intercede on his own and the Harijans' behalf. (101)

The real enemy which the Church found itself having to face after the advent of national independence was not open opposition, either religious or political, but the much subtler form of religious syncretism mediated through the Government's scheme of Basic Education. Educationally sound in principle, and a necessary corrective to the ever-emphasis on academic education, it was from the point of view of religion a good example of the attitude of all-embracing tolerance bred by centuries of Hinduism. Encouraging religious teaching, it assumed the value and comity of all religions. Thus it was recommended that songs and readings from Hindu, Christian and Moslem sacred books be used in turn at school and training college assemblies. Simple comparisons were made between, for example, the birth of Christ in a stable and Krishna in a cow-shed. And objections on the ground of Christian conviction were seen in all sincerity by Government inspectors as representing a totally unIndian exclusivism. "We respect your worship. Why can you not honour ours?" was the question they asked.

The danger was one which appeared more imminent to Western than to Indian eyes. "The Church is at the cross-roads" wrote one missionary. Yet while there were Indian Christians who saw no objections to the scheme, the |

NOTES
100) "Conference" Dec. 1937, p.73
101) Ibid.
problems of syncretism and of freedom to give Christian teaching in its schools continue still to be among the most difficult with which the Church has to grapple. The Government itself is not yet decided whether education is to be basic or part-basic, rigid or free, aided and Government or aided alone and the Church’s huge stake in education at all levels makes the form of those decisions, when they are taken, of immense importance. (102)

It was a natural concomitant of self-government that the Church should develop in self-expression and by adapting to new conditions while maintaining the methods and agencies found most valuable in the past. We may cite as a good example the Anderson High School at Conjeevaram, which in the 1950’s, under an imaginative and energetic young head-master, who raised both its education standards and its prestige, also had daily morning worship, weekly Bible Classes and a weekly evangelistic talk, a Sunday School for non-Christians, boys and C.E. meetings for Christians, a Christian Masters’ Fellowship, a Bible Study Group and a Juvenile Missionary Association. (103) Activities which had been originally Mission-inspired were now being carried on as part of the indigenous Church’s life and flourishing under local leadership and enthusiasm.

Adaptation became all the more necessary because the lack of pastors and other trained workers was beginning to be a drawback. ---“the more regrettable because there is an opportunity among caste people which we have never had before.” (104) As senior workers retired it was becoming more difficult to replace them from among a community whose standards of living were rising. The work of the old-style Bible-Woman was no longer attractive to younger women who were “unwilling to wait at the roadside for a bus, walk in the sun or spend the night in a village, bitten by mosquitoes.” The better educated youth of both sexes were attracted to the cities and did not want village work. (105). Fortunately there were exceptions, particularly at the higher/

NOTES
102) Sources various. See e.g. C. of S. Reports 1955, p.348 1956, p.402 f.
103) C. of S. Report, 1951, p.319
104) Ibid., 1954, p.322
105) Ibid., 1955, p.400
levels, such as that of the young B.D. pastor who went to the new village pastorate of Kilpaukkam, formerly part of the Arkonam district. Low salary scales were part of the trouble, and this was aggravated in centres such as Arkonam, where railway workers earned more than High School teachers.(106)

These difficulties, which were of course not peculiar to Madras, had at least the salutary effect of emphasising the part which must be played by Christian laymen and led to the first attempts at organising lay training as distinct from the training of full-time lay workers. The C.S.I. had already inaugurated a scheme for the training of "local honorary Presbyters" men who were normally of middle age and were ordained to a part-time ministry at a specified centre.(107) But lay training at all levels now became a feature of Church life. Staff Retreats such as one held at Arkonam were urged by the Secretary of the Layman's Movement to concern themselves with evangelising instead of leaving it to the "Mission-centred, Mission-organised, Mission-subsidised agents".(108) The Diocese opened a Lay Training Centre, under the leadership of a Scottish missionary, which ran short and separate courses for Christian training and for Hindu enquirers, the movement being one obviously due to expand.(109) Christian staff and students from the Madras Christian College had also for a number of years been coming more actively into the centre of the Church's witness. Since before the union of 1947 a Rural Service League reported to have a membership of 300 had been visiting groups of villages where cottage industries and night-schools were being encouraged, some simple dispensary work done and children's games organised.

(110) The paramount importance of lay witness was a theme which clearly no younger Church could fail to stress. But the emphasis, which in earlier days, had tended to single out full-time Mission workers, had now swung over /

NOTES

106) Ibid., 1947, p.357
107) Ibid., 1954, p.316
108) Ibid., 1958, p.424
110) Ibid., 1947, p.356
At present the congregations of the former Church of Scotland Mission comprise, in the Madras area, four city and two district charges. St. Andrew's — "the Kirk" — has a mixed congregation, European, Indian and Anglo-Indian (Eurasian). Services are conducted in English by a missionary who also looks after the English-speaking congregation of St. Thome. The other three city churches — College — (Anderson), Choolai and Royapuram have Indian pastors, as have the 2 composite congregations to the North of Madras, where industrialisation has helped development. The centres of these two charges are Lebanonpuram and Madhavaram on the one hand, Tondiarpet, Tangal and Tiruvottiyur on the other.

In the rural area there are eight charges which can include the supervision of as many as twenty village groups. In the Chingleput district, besides the town pastorate which includes some nearby villages, there are Melroseapuram, Tirukalikunram and the newly formed Tiruporur. Kancheepuram (Conjeeveram) and Sriperumbadur form a second district; a ninth pastorate being formed at Vedal, at present part of Kancheepuram, and a tenth at Nemeli, near Arkotam. All charges have Indian pastors, though in some cases these are probationers under supervision.

There is no surplus of pastors, however, and as a result older men have to carry on too long and there is a lack of contact with young people and of vigour in evangelistic work. The educational standards of the ministry have also dropped somewhat since the union. A number not only of the older men but of the younger as well have no college training apart from that received in theology and there are those who feel that there has been a failure to challenge and enlist graduates and others with higher educational qualifications.

Theological education is all on a co-operative basis. Prospective pastors take either the 4-year vernacular L.Th. Course at Tirumaiyur, where a Church of Scotland missionary is at present on the staff, or the English-
-based B.D. course at Bangalore. Occasionally a man goes on scholarship to Bishop's College, Calcutta, where rather high Anglican influences are apt to predominate.

All pastorates are self-supporting through a Central Fund, and each pastorate assessed at 56% of its annual income, which is sufficient to pay all Presbyters and Deacons with the exception of overseas Missionaries. The common pool system took some time to establish but is now in good working order. And while foreign subsidies still help the Fund, the poorer pastorates have more money to spare for local needs. It has also given the Church the great advantage of being able to launch new pastorates which are able from the beginning to stand on their own feet. This has been of particular value in the village areas near the city, where expansion has recently been greatest, and in church extension work in the city itself. 

The complex problems of self-support in a Mission-founded younger Church, where the maintenance of congregational life involves only a fraction of the Church's total responsibility and expenditure are still very much in evidence everywhere. The Christian liberality of the congregations mentioned above came, in 1955, to £2,600, a figure considerably higher than that raised by the Church in any other Scottish Mission field. Yet the total handled through institutions, mainly through Government grants and educational or medical fees in the same year is 25 times that total.

Church Services are normally held in Tamil, for while certain outlying sections of Madras Diocese lie in Telegu-speaking areas, only a few small villages near Arkonam are Telegu-speaking, and here the visiting preacher or resident teacher conducts Services in the people's own language. The single outstanding exception is "the Kirk" in Bangalore, now part of Mysore Diocese, where in addition to English Services the missionary pastor has begun to /

NOTES

111) Ibid., 1960, p.457
conduct worship in Canarese. There is no work in Malayalam, the fourth of the Dravidian languages of South India, although a Malayalam-speaking congregation near at hand has its mans in the St. Andrew’s Kirk compound at Madras.(113)

The architecture of church buildings, while varying widely in size, style and the materials used, is on the whole functional or traditional, few attempts having been made to adapt Indian forms. One village church in the Kancheepuram Pastorate and one in Kilpaukkan represent deliberate efforts in this direction. But in both cases the initiative came from Mission sources and it is a question how far the styles are accepted or appreciated by the people using them.(114)

The new programme for lay training, which hung fire after a good start, is now being linked with the Theological College for evangelists at Vellore.

The Tamilnad Christian Literature Society has greatly improved both the quality and variety of reading matter available both for evangelism and for the use of Christians. A Bible Correspondence Course begun by an American missionary has proved remarkably successful and the project has expanded. And the Christian Literature Society has among other experiments started to train and maintain workers of talent to edit and write for magazines in the regional languages. A former teacher in Kancheepuram has for some years been building up the circulation of a Tamil magazine for Christian homes.(115)

Other developments in Church life which might be mentioned — in work among women for instance, in forms of worship, in the strengthening of a Christian sense of responsibility, in youth work and in widening contacts with other churches — are all co-operative in form and will be better dealt

NOTES

113) See article by author, "Other Lands" magazine, Feb. 1954
114) Information obtained through correspondence.
115) Sources various.
In conclusion we may state simply that, whatever its defects, the Church of the Madras Mission, aided by the advantages of its situation, has advanced further towards independence than the Church of any other Scottish field. "The first part of our task has been accomplished -- A Church has been established with a life and character of its own."(116) This claim, made 15 years ago, is substantially true. As an indigenous Church, the Church of South India has indeed advanced far enough to look at itself critically. In a Report entitled "Advance and Renewal", published in 1964, it examines its own weaknesses and considers the direction in which progress or reformation is necessary. "It is not so much new methods as good pastors and leaders that we need" is one conclusion, and the judgment is one which displays the heartening ring of maturity.(117)

NOTES

116) "Sketches of the Field";
Madras, printed for the F.M.C., 1951, p.38
GENERAL SOURCES


"On the Coast of Coromandel", 1951--1953, annual reports printed for private circulation.

F.M.C. Reports.

Papers. Manuscript papers, S.N.L.
CHAPTER IX.
THE CHURCH IN CENTRAL INDIA.

1845-1863.

The Free Church of Scotland’s decision to start a Mission at Nagpur, the capital of the Central Provinces, was a courageous one. The Disruption which had just taken place had left the Church with the formidable and urgent task of housing its congregations, building theological colleges and establishing a complete new system of church courts and ecclesiastical administration. Its position on its Mission fields was somewhat easier, since it retained its missionary personnel and Indian workers and most of the property which now had to be vacated was rented, not owned. Nevertheless, the future was uncertain, money was short, and it might have been reckoned only politic to embark on no new ventures.

John Wilson of Bombay had already been approached, however, with a promise of £2,500 if the Church of Scotland would establish a Mission at Nagpur and the Free Church’s newly-formed India Mission Committee, taking the plunge, resolved "to take immediate steps towards the establishment of the proposed Mission." (1) The gift of money came from a Captain Hill who had been stationed in Nagpur. His wife had recently died from cholera, contracted while nursing a brother officer, and it had been her dying wish that a Christian Mission be founded for the people of Nagpur and Kamptee.

John Wilson himself had been greatly attracted by the likely scope of such a Mission. Over 500 miles East of Bombay and 700 miles West of Calcutta, Nagpur was the capital of a Province larger than Poland or Italy, and as yet no organised Mission had started work in it. From the point of view of communications, it looked a likely key point for the/}

---

(1) Quoted Hewat, p. 102.
India of the future. And indeed within 80 years it was to become an important railway junction, a University city and, with the building of two large cotton mills, a focus of industrial activity. (2)

The provincial language was Marathi, but in the city itself lived Mohammedans from the North and Tamils and Telegus from the South. This was the kind of cosmopolitan mixture with which Scottish missionaries were already familiar and which they had proved to be fertile soil. In this particular area, too, several individuals from among the European population had shown themselves unusually sympathetic towards Missionary aims. Indeed some small attempt had already been made at Christian work, and from a group of evangelically-minded officers the Mission inherited a small church erected by a Captain Hyslop, which came to be known simply as "the 1840" (3)

The offer was too promising to be rejected and in 1845 the Rev. Stephen Hyslop and his wife, accompanied on their journey inland from Bombay by the Rev. Murray Mitchell, reached Nagpur and the Mission was born. Taking over a little school at Kampti, the military cantonment ten miles North-East of Nagpur, he bought a "godly corporal" out of the army and appointed him as teacher. Starting with 30 boys, he soon had a roll of 70.

The first adult to be baptised by the Mission was a Tamil soldier. A year later, shortly after the arrival of a second ordained missionary, the first local conversion was made -- that of a Maratha. Not a pupil at the school, he had been led to this step through the reading of a Christian book.

NOTES:

(2) See General Sources.

(3) T.W. Gardiner, "The Nagpur Mission of the Church of Scotland."
The following year saw the fight for freedom from caste discrimination begin, when two low caste boys were admitted to the school and an order went out from the Brahmin authorities that all high-caste pupils should be withdrawn. One 14-year-old boy, Baba Pandurang, took refuge in the Mission House and asked for baptism. In the course of the upheaval which followed, he was imprisoned for nearly four months, but was finally released, after Hislop had appealed to the East India Company and then through the Calcutta Press, to become the Mission's first caste convert and later its first licensed Indian preacher. Further riots were to follow, until the old Raja died, when the Kingdom was placed directly under British control and the law proclaimed that individuals should have freedom to profess their chosen religion. (4) During the Mutiny, which followed shortly afterwards, Stephen Hislop was partly instrumental in saving Nagpur from the terrors of insurrection, the father of a Muslim pupil having conveyed a private warning which he passed to the authorities, and this in turn may have helped to save the situation in Hyderabad and Madras. His action greatly enhanced the reputation of the Mission and its leader in the eyes of many Indians as well as of Europeans. (5)

Throughout this period, the Mission's work in the city had gradually been expanding. By 1860, there were something like 900 boys attending 9 schools and an attempt had been made at starting education for girls. And by 1863, the year in which Hislop was tragically drowned while on tour, a new building for the "Institution" was in use and accommodating 350 scholars.

The number of converts to be gained through the direct influence of this

NOTES.


(5) George Smith, "Life of Stephen Hislop", Ch. 6.
educational work was very small, however, and Hislop, who was personally a staunch supporter of Duff’s method, sometimes had a hard job defending its worth for his own area. To his great distress, Baba Pandurang and possibly two young students who went to study medicine at Madras were its sole fruits. (6)

In contrast to the situation which developed in the three other Scottish Missions, therefore, the Church in Nagpur was raised through the more orthodox type of evangelism. As in its sister churches, its members were drawn almost entirely from the humbler classes, but it did not in the early years of its growth enjoy the same kind of leadership from a few able and well-educated caste converts. It was strengthened to some extent by the addition of Christians or new converts who were serving in the army and whose wives and families were living with them. But on the other hand, the language barrier and the fact that its military members were normally birds of passage did not help towards the establishment of a stable Christian community. And while not all its members were city-bred, the church itself was city-based, there being as yet no links with villages or any country district.

This was not for any lack of application on the part of Hislop or his colleague, Robert Hunter. As an evangelist, Hislop succeeded in covering a prodigious amount of ground. During the district tours which he conducted every cold weather, he preached continually and visited nearly every village on his route. In the course of his travels he covered thousands of miles among all the five districts of the Province, but seldom stayed more than a day or two at any one town or village, never long enough to make a permanent impression. (7) His method certainly /

NOTES.

(6) T.W. Gardiner, op.cit., p.20.
(7) Ibid., pp.26-27.
contrasts very markedly with the later system of concentrating on a limited area, as the Calcutta district missionary was already doing. (3) He was constantly on the search for even the glimmer of a genuine response, however, and it was one of his severest disappointments to meet with such unvarying apathy.

The Church in Nagpur began, then, as a city group or groups of mixed background. Some were Tamil or Telegu sepoys with their families. Others were local converts of humble origin. And among the remainder there were at least one Muslim, one Rajput, one Mahar and a variety of other Hindi speakers, both men and women. It can be imagined that it would not be easy to combine this company into anything which might be called a native Christian community.

Within five years of Hislop's arrival, there was a small Tamil-speaking congregation at Kamptee, with a membership of 23. (9) Another and smaller group of Tamil Christians met at Sitabaldi, the site of the Mission house, together with a few Marathi converts. (10) Services in the "1840" were conducted in English or Marathi. And the total Christian community, which in 1852 numbered only 39, had risen within ten years, and the time of Hislop's death, to 139. (11) The Mission by now had the services of two ordained Indian missionaries and two newly licensed preachers, the Rev. Baba Pandurang being engaged mainly in work among the Marathi population and the Rev. Ramaswami Venkatachallam working as pastor and evangelist among his fellow Tamilians. But, to quote the Mission Report for 1862, "no attempt had yet been made by the native Church for maintaining ordinances among them." (12) All Indian workers were still supported by Mission funds, and while there had been a spontaneous and welcome movement among some of the Tamil Christians at Kamptee to raise money for local evangelism, there was as yet no sign of a Church with any desire for the responsibilities of independence.

NOTES.

(8) Compare Chapter 7, the Church in Bengal.
(9) Our Church's Work, p. 63.
(10) Reports for 1855, p. 8.
(11) "Our Church's Work", p. 66.
(12) F.C. Report for 1862, p. 35.
1863-1930.

During the stretch of roughly 65 years which followed the establishment of the Nagpur Mission and Hislop's death, the Nagpur Church moved through its childhood and adolescence until its shape was determined. It will be helpful to summarise it in outline before descending to detail.

In terms of man-power, the Mission was never strong and the Church which developed was the smallest of those we are attempting to describe.

As with other Scottish urban Missions which preceded it, it continued to have a strong stake in the city. But while work was opened up and maintained in rural areas, there was no development of sturdy country communities either in distant centres or immediately outside the city limits. In contrast to the type of progress made elsewhere, most notably round Madras, the city always represented the bulk of the Christian community and the church the only body large, stable and mature enough to achieve independence.

It was however, a compensating advantage of the limitation in numbers that the High School, which attained College status during this period, retained a close connection with the Church in its daily life. This feature is much more distinctly marked than in any of the other three provincial capitals.

The Nagpur congregation itself, although it had a protracted adolescence, and relied on and was tied too long to Mission protection, was at the same time enabled fairly early to take a responsible share in the running of the Mission's work.

To put it in other words, Church and Mission both enjoyed the benefits and both suffered from the drawbacks of belonging to a very small and close-knit family. Progress followed along predictable lines, relations were amicable and triumphs and troubles alike were mostly of the domestic variety.

It is a mark of the toughness of the Duff tradition that while extensive tours were carried out in the cold weather, it was not until the 1830's...
that any effort at sustained evangelism was made in the villages round Nagpur. Hislop's successor, the Rev. J.G. Cooper, who was transferred from Madras, taught at the Institution, supervised the branch schools in Nagpur and Kempti preached in "the 1840" and the Kempti prayer hall and itinerated widely in the Winter months. (13) In all fairness, there can have been little time left to extend operations further and as soon as another missionary was available the opportunity was taken.

The Mission's first rural project came with the opening of work among the people of the aboriginal Gond tribe at Chindwara, about 80 miles North of the city. With the missionary, James Dawson, went a catechist and a native doctor, a school and a small dispensary being established. But little progress was made. After four years work, 12 adults had been baptised but only one of these would come to church. The only other two Protestant Missions working among two million Gonds were having much the same experience. "The people are very superstitious and idolatry holds them back. We have very little to encourage us but faith", ran one typical report. (14) One cannot help thinking that wider experience of the aboriginal character and a different approach might have led to a greater measure of success. After James Dawson's death, this project was handed over, in 1877, to a Swedish missionary society. (15)

A more fruitful opening proved to be the rural work started in 1882 among the Mahars at Bhandara, a town about 40 miles East of Nagpur and the centre of a district twice the size of Perthshire. One third of the picturesque countryside was covered by jungle and judging by one of the inhabitants' favourite proverbs, "Deceit is the perfection of wisdom", it

---

NOTES.

(13) T.W. Gardiner, op.cit., p.38
(14) F.C. Report for 1878, p.40
(15) Ibid. 1866-78 passim; T.W. Gardiner, op.cit., p.39.
could fairly be said that "their character was open to improvement." (16)

The Christian community in Bhandara began with the settling of one family and the interest of an Indian Christian lawyer and the British D.S.R. For 6 to 8 years, school and evangelistic work was carried on under independent support, after which the Nagpur Mission was invited to take charge. A dispensary under a medical missionary was added, and shortly before the end of the century a hospital was built.

Considering the independent character of the Bhandara Mission's origin, the missionary sent to take charge, the Rev. John Douglas, gives what sounds like a severe judgment on the Church he found there. "The slight interest taken in the work by some of the members of the native church shows how little they are alive to the responsibilities of their position of God's witnesses among the heathen. The influence of one or two has been positively harmful -- the remainder have by precept and example strengthened and encouraged (the extension of) God's Kingdom." (17)

Of the history of the Bhandara congregation during this period and the character of its members there is little information available. It suffered from the usual trials, and some not so usual. There were losses through families moving away and also through competition with a Mission of the Plymouth Brethren. (18) The lack of an Indian pastor was a serious handicap. (19) There was some opposition to preaching but converts were made, if only in penny numbers, a low-caste family of six became Christians and a few years later a Moslem was numbered among the new converts. (20).

As was to happen in other places, it was the famine years which closed/

NOTES.

(16) "Our Church's Work, pp.73-74.
(17) P.C, Report for 1885, p.34.
(18) Ibid., 1891, p.41.
(19) Ibid., 1892, p.35.
(20) Ibid., 1894, p.40: 1895, p.47.
the century that were to give the Bhandara Mission a new opportunity. Orphanages were opened for girls and boys, of whom about 200 were eventually taken in and an effort was made to combine academic and vocational training. The girls were sent on after a period to Nagpur but a number of boys were turned out after training as carpenters, smiths or masons, with a few as gardeners or house servants to Europeans. (21) With ten adult baptisms in one year, the small community rose in 1905 from 45 to 53 and a Pastor’s Fund was launched. Twenty-four youths from the now declining orphanage were baptised a couple of years later and the energetic evangelist in charge was urging his people to start a Home Mission of their own. (22) With the coming of the 1914 War the community had almost reached the 140 mark. But a fair proportion of these were Christian teachers and their families working in one of the Mission’s schools. (23) And in the 1920’s, although licentiates were available, the congregation was still unable to support a pastor of its own, while the closing of medical work and other curtailments did not help their position. (24) An organised congregation nearly 50 years old but with less than 60 communicant members, 8 of these being paid workers, could hardly be expected to have achieved self-support, but neither was there any real evidence of indigenous growth. (25)

The two other district churches founded by the Nagpur Mission were in an even weaker position — Nagpur district with 22 communicant members and Wardha and Amraoti with 36. (26)

The first of these groups had been "discovered" about 1891 when John Douglas, touring in the Saonar Tahsil area, reached the village of Dhapawada, about 18 miles North-West of Nagpur. He found there a handful of members who/
had been baptised by Hislop perhaps thirty years earlier and had formed the nucleus of a native church. But with Hislop's death they had been neglected and then forgotten and after standing firm for some time had eventually been readmitted to their caste. Yet the missionary was shown a much worn Marathi Bible, learned that at least one old man had been teaching his family the leading Christian truths as he understood them, and visited the next village to meet a certain "Sakharam who does not worship idols. He calls them mere stones. On Sundays he does worship and reads a book he has." (27)

The outcome was the founding of a Nagpur Vernacular Mission and a new concentration in this area. Agents were settled and schools opened, contacts being made in eight villages. (28) But the knowledge that their Christian teachers had abandoned them once, and the fear they might do so again, made the few Christians wary of separating themselves from their Hindu relatives and "backsliding" was common. There was hope of strengthening the church when interest was shown by the Kunbis of two villages - these were cultivators made of sturdier material. And in the years to come, while the church was slow to develop, it produced some staunch and original characters. (29)

Famine relief work through two kitchens again had its effect at the turn of the century. Lapsed Christians came forward to confess their faults and seven adults were baptised. (30) By 1901 a congregation had been formed at Dhapawada with 23 members and an equal number of adherents, under the/

NOTES.

(27) T.W. Gardiner, op.cit., p.46: "Our Church's Work", p.79
Free Church F.M.C. Report, 1893, p.43.
(28) Our Church's Work, p.80.
(29) T.W. Gardiner, op.cit., p.47, gives an interesting sketch of some of the descendants of Hislop's converts, who eventually became Christians in their turn and gave the Church very effective service.
(30) F.C. Report, 1898, p.32.
supervision of a missionary. (31) And a few years later, with the community now numbering over 80, a young man with medical training, the Rev. J. Misal, was ordained as pastor and money began to be raised to build a church. (32) Under his vigorous leadership, evangelistic groups with kirtan bands and a magic lantern went campaigning among the neighbouring villages. (33)

Calamity struck more than once, in the form of outbreaks of cholera which closed all schools, yet 20 years later the Mission was at work much as before and the Douglas Memorial Church had been erected at Saoner (34) It is a puzzle indeed to detect why the Christian community in Nagpur district churches should by this time have shrunk to so small a figure as 63, and one not explained by the necessity of retrenchment. For although there were only two Indian pastors, the Mission strength was at its maximum, with five male missionaries, 13 women, 14 evangelists and Bible women and over 100 teachers. (35) Migration and the pull of the city, with the hope of help from the Mission for education and sometimes for employment, appear together to supply the most likely explanation.

A fourth venture maintained by the Mission for nearly 40 years began with its adoption of a station at Amraoti in what was then the Province of Behar. Founded by the Rev. Sidoba Misal, father of the Dhapawada pastor, who had left the security of a settled congregation to be the first to preach the gospel in Berar, this little mission had started out as an act of faith wholly dependent on voluntary subscriptions from military officers, civilians and interested friends. In time, Misal's support was

---

NOTES.

(31) U.P.C. Report, 1902, p.26
(32) Ibid., 1908, p.39
(33) Ibid., 1905, p.39
(34) Ibid., 1929, p.162; 1930, p.637
(35) T.W. Gardiner, op.cit., p.50.
taken over by the Free Church Mission at Bombay and then transferred
to the Nagpur Mission, which ordained the Rev. S. Timothy as pastor and
missionary at Amraoti. (36)

A letter dated 1888 describes the tiny one-man mission, still under
the Free Church's Bombay Presbytery, as having three churches, one
organised at Amraoti and two still unorganised at Bhusaval and Yeotmal.
Three elders were solemnly ordained to form a Kirk Session with a
community of 61 people, 30 of whom were communicants. (37) "This
Province affords a large field for Mission work and I have reason to
believe it will be a fruitful one also", reported Sidoba Mshal hopefully
and went on to describe how local Christians had travelled all the way to
Nagpur to meet the new doctor in delight at the thought that he was coming
to work among them. (38)

Under their Indian pastor and their Indian missionary, now retired to
Bhusaval the little community at Amraoti grew slowly and was active enough
to be distributing Christian tracts to members of the Congress party when it
met in Amraoti at the end of the century. (39) But no other missionary,
Indian or Scottish, was appointed to succeed the senior Mshal. The little
church at Bhusaval was handed over to the Alliance Mission, now at work in
Bherar. That Mission finally took over evangelistic work in Amraoti also but
the congregation, which was shepherded for many years by the Rev. P.A. Yardi,
continued to come under the Nagpur Church Council. (40)

A larger and more extensive piece of work had meanwhile been initiated

NOTES.

(36) Ibid.
(37) MS report, unsigned, to secretary, F.M.C., dated Sep. 1888, S.N.L.
(38) MS report from Rev. S.B. Mshal, Amraoti, 1889, S.N.L.
(39) F.C. Report, 1898, p. 33.
(40) T.W. Gardiner, op.cit., U.F.C. Reports, 1906, p. 43 and 1928, p. 34.
at Wardha in the coalfields about 40 miles to the South-West of Nagpur whose existence had been pointed out by Stephen Hislop, no mean amateur geologist, in the course of his travels. An Indian - or probably Anglo-Indian - Christian employed on the railways had been visiting and preaching on his own and it was in response to his appeal that the new medical missionary, Dr. Revie, was sent there in 1889 with two Indian assistants to open a dispensary (41). Here as in Bhandara there commenced a period of exploratory itineration round the district with a full paraphernalia of tents and carts and bullocks, medicines and magic lanterns. (42) In spite of Hindu opposition, which grew stronger after the first baptism, three schools were opened and a block of houses presented by the municipality turned into a leper asylum. Twelve years after the station had been opened, a hospital was erected and the same year a congregation was formed with 35 communicants and several adherents, with Yardi in Berar as the visiting pastor in charge. (43)

There were conversions, but again they were normally from the poorest of the poor -- of eight adult baptisms in one year, four were inmates of the leper hospital. (44) And the Christian community remained small. The 120 Christians listed in 1914 were drawn, as the missionary reminded his readers, from a population of half a million. (45) The hope burned on that Mahar families, which were being drawn to Christianity further West round Jalna, might follow suit in Wardha as a few had done at Bhandara. But with a few personal exceptions it remained unfulfilled. (46) After the/

NOTES.

(41) MS letter from D. Whitton, Nagpur, to Dr. Lindsay, dated 16.5.1889, S.N.L.
(42) MS letter from Dr. J. Sandilands to Dr. Smith, dated 19.2.1891.
(43) MS report from Drs. Revie and Sandilands to Dr. Smith, dated 5.12.1891, S.N.L.
(44) Our Church's Work, pp.77-78 and F.C. Reports passim.
(45) F.C. Report 1900, p.57.
(47) Ibid., 1916, p.19; 1917, p.23.
opening of a Government dispensary during the 1914-1918 War, more emphasis began to be placed on education and direct evangelism and a hostel was opened for Christian boys. (47) Yet the shifting population of an industrial district and lack of any real response to open air preaching had by the end of this period reduced the Christian community to 83. (48) The church at Wardha was not as yet in a position to stand on its own feet.

Indeed by 1930 the city church, with a membership of just over 300 and a total community twice that size, was the only self-supporting congregation in the Mission and made up over two-thirds of those coming under the Nagpur Church Council. (49) Its independence had only been gained, moreover, after many years of striving and a good deal of financial help. While adequately led and gaining moral support and prestige through its connection with the College, which was raised from High School status in 1883 --- and later also from the Mure Memorial Hospital, established in a permanent building in 1890 -- it produced few leaders of exceptional quality. Growth in size was steady and respectable and in contrast to most of the other city-centres Missions, Nagpur's main strength, as already indicated, remained in the city. By the year 1900 it still leaned heavily on the Mission and the missionaries, in their turn, seemed reluctant to accord it adult status.

In 1876 the congregation was described as "maintaining their way". Givings were poor, but then so were the people, the average family wage being something between Rs 8 and Rs 16 per month. They showed "earnestness and zeal" and were good Church attenders. (50) For some time they were/

NOTES.

(47) Ibid., 1917, p.22: 1928, p.34.
(48) C. of S. Statistics, 1931.
(49) Ibid.
(50) F.C. Reports, 1875, p.29: 1876, p.26: 1869, p.34.
without an Indian pastor, Baba Pandurang having been removed from Mission service six years earlier. (51) Add it was difficult to find a man of character and experience who also possessed the academic qualifications required by Presbytery regulations, which made no allowance for Indian needs and conditions. It was a case of the proper Mission policy being held back by the traditions of the home Church. Missionary opinion was clear on this issue --- "It is in every way desirable that native pastors should be put in charge of them. However, under the present law of the Church, which requires the same standard of literary and theological education alike for pastors at home and abroad, this cannot be done until some modification of the law be effected. Catechists now do the work of pastors. If they were ordained, it would give them standing and power and would help the Church." (52)

Another feature of the church's life which can be regarded as both a strength and a weakness was the support given by the Scottish residents of Nagpur, who worshipped regularly at the English Service, the District Commissioner himself being for some time an elder. (53) While this was an aid to administrative efficiency and stable financing, it had the effect, in the eyes of non-Christians, of accentuating the foreignness of the faith. This was further emphasised by the fact that until half way through the 1890's, Services were conducted not in the city proper but in the Mission compound. In addition there continued the complication of trying to weld into one two distinct language and racial groups.

NOTES

(51) Ibid., 1870, p.19.
(52) Ibid., 1890, p.21.
(53) Ibid., 1888, p.28: 1897, p.53.
Competition which was started up by the opening of a Methodist Episcopal Mission in Kampti was not an aid to unity, and in 1889 the Free Church property was transferred to the newcomers. (54) And a revival of work among Tamils and Telegus at Sitabaldi did not last for long. (55)

To add to these difficulties, caste feeling on the part of the Hindu community was strong for many years. A caste youth, a former pupil of the High School, who was converted in 1874 was baptised at Allahabad to avoid disturbances. (56) There appears to have been no objection to the baptism of a Moslem convert a few years later. (57) But Hindu preachers in the 1890's ran rival meetings and distributed anti-Christian pamphlets in the streets to counter the effects of evangelism in the city and there was some violence when a Brahmin youth asked for baptism. (58)

One rather unusual and encouraging incident was the conversion of three policemen of caste background. They had been on duty keeping order during open-air meetings and were so impressed with the Gospel messages they heard that, resigning from the police force, they went to be baptised quietly elsewhere, in order not to cause trouble among their relations. (59)

The congregation, at the end of the century, was described as "drawn from all classes of society and presenting a picture of social union which Hindus and Moslems are vainly trying to find on other lines. A large proportion of them are well-educated and this, with their growing numbers, is giving them influence in the community." (60) Yet the baptism of one Mahar family could still be seen as a major triumph -- "even Mahars think Christianity below their caste." (61)

NOTES.

(54) Minutes of Nagpur Mission Committee dated 8.2.1889, S.N.L.
F.C. Report, 1878, p.32.
(55) MS letter from John Douglas, Nagpur, to Dr. Lindsay, dated 20.12.1894, S.N.L.
(56) Ibid., 1875, p.29.
(57) Ibid., 1887, p.39.
(60) Ibid., p.70.
The overall picture is a typical and not very exciting one, of a church advancing slowly but surely, with adult baptisms adding regularly to their number — eleven in 1867, thirteen in 1879, eight in 1888 and so on year by year. (62) Of the thirteen adults baptised one year, four were converted after having been patients in the hospital. (63) Meanwhile Christian liberality climbed in proportion — £30 in 1885, which was an increase of one third on the previous year, £55 in 1893 and by 1923, about £130. (64) Some share was taken in the evangelistic work of the Mission, young men from the congregation accompanying catechists on visits to neighbouring villages: family worship was conducted in most homes; and there were always personal contacts with individual enquirers such as the thirty who expressed interest one year after having been treated in the hospital. (65)

By the 1880's there were three teachers combining their school work with a divinity course. (66) A few years later the Rev. P. Timothy was ordained as the Nagpur pastor along with four elders who also acted as deacons, collecting the monthly subscriptions. (67) Shortly afterwards the Kampti section of the congregation, which distance, language difficulties and the fluctuating nature of the community of sepoys and native servants made it difficult to shepherd, was handed over to the American Methodist Episcopal Mission. (68) The formation of an

NOTES

(62) Ibid., 1868, 1880 and 1889.
(63) Ibid., 1898, p.33.
(64) Ibid., 1886, 1894 and 1929.
(65) Ibid., 1874, p.35; 1884, p.32, 1888, p.29.
(66) Ibid., 1881, p.34.
(67) Ibid., 1886, p.32.
(68) Our Church's Work, p.67.
"Indian Christian Association", whose purpose was to help all national Christians, irrespective of denomination, and the starting of a weekly prayer meeting and a Sunday School provided evidence that "the native church is beginning to show her life in spiritual matters." (69) And these stirrings were closely followed by the dedication of a new church building at Hansapuri in the city itself, with the hope it would become a centre of Christian activity. (70)

The events leading up to the erection of that building give us some insight into the stresses and conflicts which accompanied the struggle to make headway. Seen through the spectacles of the missionary in charge, the congregation which in 1867 was "still in its infancy and far from ideal in spirit, character and discipline", was still in the position under a fine pastor twenty years later "that it needs nursing" and was dependent on the Mission for aid. (71) It was the clearly expressed wish of the European missionaries that the congregation should take the initiative in supplying its own building. At the same time we have the impassioned cry of the Indian pastor: "It will bring our preaching to the people. And it will remove the appearance of a foreign creed in the strange fact that the people now have to leave their own city and come to the European station to hear the Gospel." (72)

The majority of the congregation appears to have been apathetic, however, and the new building owed its existence to Mr. Fraser who collected subscriptions for it both in India and at home. In his own words it was to be "testimony for Christ among the temples of Hinduism and in the midst of the people. It will facilitate aggressive Mission work." (73)

NOTES:

(69) Ibid.
(70) F.C. Report, 1896, p.49
(71) Ibid., 1869, p.37; 1887, p.39; 1889, p.34.
(72) Letter accompanying Memo from A.H.C. Fraser, District Commissioner, to Dr. Smith, Free Church F.M.C., 10th April, 1883. S.N.L.
(73) Quoted T.W. Gardiner, op.cit., p.66.
The congregation was reported as regarding with grateful feelings "a boon conferred on it, under God's blessing, by the Free Church of Scotland." (74)

Ironically enough, it never became popular with Indian Christians. During the plague epidemics of the next few years, Services were resumed in "the 1840" and the congregation proved reluctant to return once more to Hansapuri. As more settled in the suburbs, the time came when the old church was nearer than the new one and for a while both were kept in use. Eventually neither the Kirk Session nor the Church Council could suggest a use for the new building, it was demolished and the site sold. "The 1840" itself had by this time become too small and in 1929 the Agnes Memorial Church was put up in its place, a fair proportion of the cost on this occasion being met locally. (75)

The Rev. F. Timothy served as pastor for over 20 years, up until 1906, after which the Clerk to the College, the Rev. S. Bhiwaji, acted as Interim Moderator for three years. The Rev. R.P. Deshpande, who later went to Poona and achieved a unique reputation throughout Maharashtra was pastor up to 1917 and he was followed, again after an interval, by the Rev. E.S. Timothy who later became well-known for unusual gifts as an evangelist. The Nagpur Mission's Centenary booklet also mentions a number of elders who gave valuable service. (76)

With the formation of the Presbyterian Church in India, authority and administrative responsibility was transferred to a Church Council. By 1919, the Council's Evangelistic Committee had taken charge of all evangelistic/

NOTES:

(74) Free Church Report, 1896, p.49.
(75) T.W. Gardiner, op.cit., p.66.
(76) Ibid., pp.66-67.
work and in 1922 a further step was taken when a Mission Board on which the Church Council was represented took charge of evangelistic work, elementary education and village dispensaries. (77) The appointment of Professor G.N. Gadre as the first Indian Christian to have a seat on the College Senate was a parallel step towards Indianisation. (78) Due mainly to its limited size, the Church of the Nagpur Mission was thus early in beginning to take over the reins of self-government, but slow and late in reaching a position of self-support.

It is revealing too, to observe how little the Christian community was affected by the great social and political movements now sweeping the city, of which, due to its position, Nagpur was a storm centre. The College rather than the Church bore the brunt of any opposition and acted as a mediating factor. Organised disapproval of British managed institutions on the part of the Swadeshi movement is first recorded in 1906, when several Hindu students left the College. Ten years later the unrest seemed to have passed away, but early in the 1920's the Non-co-operation campaign was in full swing. Both the College and the High School met their most critical year up-to-date, being deserted by more than half their students and pupils and having to cut down on staff: While the decade which followed was one in which periodic flag demonstrations, hartals and picketing were taking place. (79) But if the calm surface of congregational life was even rippled by this wind, there is no evidence of it. The Church was still too small, too warmly sheltered under the Mission's wing and too closely concerned with its own affairs either to resent Western affiliations or to suffer for them. In justice it should be emphasised that/

NOTES:

(77) Ibid., p.66
(78) Ibid., p.44.
(79) U.F.C. Reports, 1907, p.34; 1917, p.22; 1922, p.27; C. of S. Report, 1931, p.652.
the happy spirit obtaining among Indian and European members of the College staff, fostered by the early moves to give Indians a greater share of responsibility, was a guard against internal conflicts. But it cannot be said of the Nagpur Church at this date that it represented an independent body both characteristically Indian and Christian in outlook.

1930-1965.

Progress in the Nagpur Church during the last thirty-five years has been on the whole a natural development from its earliest history. A small Mission has produced a small Church. A Christian community which numbered 954 in 1931 had risen in another quarter-century to nearly 1,500 and ten years later to over 2,000, about 40% of these being communicant members. (80) The lack of numbers continued to be a drawback in the christianising of educational institutions. In 1931 only one in twenty of the students at Hislop College was a Christian and only one in seven at the High School. The position was a little better on the medical side, the Nurses' Training School providing a steady supply of Christian girls with good qualifications. (81)

It should at the same time be noted that, small as it was, the Nagpur Mission was unique in being able, during this time, to double its numbers with something to spare. While special circumstances have to be taken into account, nevertheless the fact that a Church is growing has a strong psychological effect on its members and is a potent factor against mental stagnation.

Thus while the Church's influence on the community round about continued to be limited it had, as Dr. Hewat pointed out, the distinction of being a pioneer and the courage to make experiments. (82) In co-operation with/

NOTES.

(81) Ibid., 1933, pp. 599-601.
(82) Hewat, p. 112.
other Missions and denominations, in translating a policy of "partnership" into practical terms and in experimenting with new missionary methods, it set a most creditable example. The success which was gained in these spheres was due to imagination on the part of both Indian and missionary leaders, the advantages of working in a compact unit and probably also the stimulus of living so near to the heart of the Indian nationalist movement.

Wardha had been Mahatma Gandhi's home and five miles away was the site of his foundation, the Sevagram Ashram. Nagpur, the headquarters of the National Christian Council and several other Christian organisations, was also a power centre for Indian nationalism, with the result that before and after independence evangelism and welfare efforts among outcaste groups worked on lines parallel to those of the Congress' social uplift programme. Thus while in the 1930's nationalists were picketing the College, in the rural areas Hindus and Christians were working side by side among the "untouchables." One Indian pastor gave it as his considered opinion that "the Gandhi movement is not a hindrance to evangelism", and while Dr. Ambedkar finally carried his Harijan followers into the Buddhist faith, the Church round Nagpur had already reaped some fruits from its concern for the needy and the outcaste. (83)

While the College suffered for many years from attacks by nationalist enthusiasts, it succeeded in proving that its aims had nothing in common with imperialist ambitions and was able to do so largely because of the speed and smoothness with which integration had been achieved. "We are increasingly proud of the Indian Church and its progress in education, in character and in the place it holds in Indian public life", the College's Scottish Principal was writing as far back as 1927 "but its weak point is/
leadership. The feeling grows that in seeking to make the Church financially independent, we have greatly prolonged the period of its spiritual minority." (84)

It was on the grounds of this conviction that the Hislop College, moving well ahead of its contemporaries, began to effect the transfer of responsibility into Indian hands. A "Fellowship Scheme" was launched in 1937, whereby under a Board of Direction the affairs of the College were administered by its Indian staff members. The five-year experiment did not prove entirely successful, for the Fellowship never grew and gradually crumbled away. Yet it paved the way for Indian leadership and at the end of it Prof. D.G. Moses was appointed Principal and another Indian colleague Vice-Principal while the retiring missionary Principal continued to serve under their direction. By the end of the war, with the proportion of Christian students slowly rising, a strong S.C.M. and thirteen Christian members of staff, the College was making an outstanding contribution. (85) Students were taking part in social welfare work, their efforts in this direction making a particular impression on one Minister of the Provincial Government when he visited the College as its guest of honour just a year after Independence. (86) It is greatly to the credit of the College that when towards the end of the war the "Quit India" campaign was at its height, its spirit of fellowship stood firm and its classes remained full. (87) Ten years later, when the Nagpur Government set up its Commission to enquire into the anti-state activities of European missionaries, the College's report was good enough to turn the trial into a fiasco and vindicate the Church's position as a body second to none in the service it rendered to the community. (88)

In integrating the other activities of Church and Mission, Nagpur was

NOTES.

(84) U.P.C. Report, 1928, p.31.
    T.W. Gardiner, op.cit. p.68.
(87) Ibid., 1946, p.368.
(88) Ibid., 1956, p.413.
almost equally far ahead. In 1939, the Mission Board was given a new constitution which meant that from now on it acted as a Committee of the Church Council. This left the Mission with control only over the Mure Memorial Hospital, girls' education and property registered in the Mission's name. (89) When the war had ended, the first two of those spheres of responsibility were also taken over by the Board, which elected an Indian chairman. The result was that missionaries were from now on all working from within the Church. (90)

Directives concerning integration sent out from Scotland in the early 1950's were in this case describing ends which had already been for the most part achieved. And while other Church and Mission Councils were involved in the administrative details of integration, the Nagpur Church had already embarked on the next stage. Disposing of the office of Superintendent of Evangelism, it handed over to individual pastors and their congregations the responsibility for missionary effort within their own areas. (91)

A lead was still given by the Council itself, however, and there appears a refreshing willingness to try new methods even at the risk of losing what had proved of value in established traditions. So evangelism by the old, tried methods continued, and we keep reading through these thirty-five years about Weeks of Witness in which young people took a prominent part; bhajan bands going out to villages; bazaars preaching and the selling of Gospel portions. More recently we learn about open-air evangelism in a new housing estate being accompanied by the showing of "Fact and Faith" films. (92) "The old forms of service through the schools and hospitals are not obsolete", reported one Indian pastor in 1964 and this was equally true of direct efforts to preach the Gospel to non-Christians. (93)

NOTES.

(89) T.W. Gardiner, op.cit., p.68
(91) Ibid 1953, p.360. What was technically the last step in integration, the dissolution of the Mission Board, did not take place till 1958. ("Conference", May, 1958, p.7)
Yet in two directions a determined attempt was made to break new ground. The "Closer union of missionary effort with the Indian Church", one result of which, as already mentioned, was the transfer of responsibility from the Council to local congregations, was also forwarded by moving paid workers, when possible, from established fields to places where new work was being developed. (94) In pursuing this aim, European missionaries also left the supervision of established centres to Indians and moved out to the fringe areas.

One missionary family, soon to be followed by a second, moved to open a new type of rural centre at the village of Allipur, in Wardha district, and Dr. Martin left the Mure Memorial Hospital to concentrate on district work in and round Dhapawada.

The Allipur experiment, described as "a small-scale attempt to witness to the power of Christ in several directions, and to unite in one fellowship families separated by language, race, education, salary and standards of living", began when an ordained missionary and his wife, the latter a doctor, started a Maternity and Child Clinic in a mud house, the only one in the village with a fireplace. Mission grants for a dispensary which had already been running for forty years were withdrawn and the village itself required to provide the building and financial support.

The Allipur community which was founded on this basis consisted of two missionary families and the family of the Indian pastor, who had had a year's experience at Sevagram Ashram where in his later years Gandhi had laboured and carried on his experiments. It had three basic tenets concerning communal living, Christian service and training in self-help. An agricultural project was launched, a Leprosy Control Centre added to the clinics already in operation and a chapel built to an Indian design.

In 1958, the Church Council had agreed to use Allipur as a training and conference centre and permission was granted to buy more land. Groups of young

NOTES.

(94) Ibid., 1946, p.368.
Groups of young people, nurses and others from Nagpur and beyond and from a number of denominations are made welcome, and as the author of the project says, "This community may not solve every problem but we are learning to reconcile British and Indian ways through common meals, service and worship. It may open a way to others; we do it because it is our obedience, our salvation, our joy." (95)

The Church had at the same time been making other extensions on more orthodox lines. Shortly before the outbreak of war, a small but apparently genuine mass movement had taken place at Hinghanghat, a mill town about 23 miles South of Wardha where the Mission had been at work for many years without any open signs of success. As an indirect result of Dr. Ambedkar's Harijan movement a number of Mahar enquirers had come forward together, a pastor and two other workers were placed in Hinghanghat and there were sixty baptisms in a single year. The movement went no further and by the time another dozen years had passed the Christian community was beginning to feel isolated and in need of encouragement. But the Church was at least able to hold the ground it had gained. (96)

A rather different form of addition to the Church's strength came as a result of Church union in Scotland. The United Original Secession Church, which rejoined the mother Church in 1956, had its own small Mission at Seoni, about 80 miles from Nagpur. This single-station venture with its hospital, High School, orphanages and Christian community of about 300 under its own pastor now became an integral part of the U.C.N.I. and the Nagpur Church Council. A second pastor was added to the staff and while we learn of the growth of modern organisations such as a Youth Fellowship and a Vacation Bible School, the congregation also revealed what one might call an old-fashioned evangelistic spirit. One unusual opportunity of which it made full use occurred at the annual commemoration of Ghandi ji's birthday, when it was the custom for four speakers, a Hindu, a Muslim, a Jain and a Christian.

NOTES.


to address the crowds. The Seoni church welcomed this as a means of expressing its solidarity with the community as a whole and a chance to set forth the principles of Christianity. (97)

The Nagpur Church Council shared the emphasis now being laid all over India on youth work and the raising up of women leaders. As early as 1934 we came across a note of a Young People's Association and in the 1950's the Nagpur Christian Youth Council, a co-operative body, began to supply courses for youth leadership. In 1954, 120 volunteers from the Nagpur Youth Fellowship came forward to help with collections for the Prime Minister's Flood Relief Fund. Fresh strength was given to the youth movement, with the opening of Allipur as a training centre and camps became a regular feature of the Church's programme. (98)

Of the place taken by women in the Church, we need only draw attention to the fact that the Nagpur Mission, which never had more than five missionaries on the men's side, had in 1930, fourteen women missionaries on the staff. And while the number rapidly decreased from then on, the training of women and girls had by that time become well-established. The number of women communicants was unusually high and leadership was of a standard that churches in other areas might rightly envy. (99)

In addition to co-operative work at the institutional level, the Christian Bookshop being one project in which the Church Council helped to supply the needs of other churches, the Christians of Nagpur revealed a flair for demonstrating their unity in practical ways, in particular by united acts of worship. (100)

---

NOTES.

(98) "Conference" May, 1934, p.41; C. of S. Reports, 1955, p.351;
(99) C. of S. Reports, Statistics, 1951 and passim.
(100) Ibid., 1947, p.355; 1961, p.19 and passim.
Youth groups and bodies like the Nurses' Christian Fellowship straddled across inter-denominational boundaries. And on special occasions such as the United Christmas Carol Service and the Week of Prayer for Christian Unity, Roman Catholics as well as Protestants joined in. The spirit of worship deepened as up to 800 Christians gathered for eight successive nightly meetings in the R.C. School compound. While there is no doubt that proximity to the headquarters of the National Christian Council had much to do with it, we can also take this as an example how the pressures of Hindu nationalism encouraged such proofs of solidarity. (101).

The social background of the congregations which made up the Church was that common to the majority of Indian Christians. Most were of outcaste origin. There were, of course, the exceptions, and they continued. We learn of a caste convert from Bhandara in 1959 whose house became a centre for evangelism, of a Hindu clerk studying Christianity in spite of opposition from his family and of four young people from the Buddhist training centre in Nagpur receiving Christian instruction. Baptisms are recorded also from Allipur, of a Hindu and a neo-Buddhist girl. (102) These Buddhists would themselves, of course, be Harijans who had followed Dr. Ambedkar's lead. And although the Church Council had its plans for evangelism among educated people, the Reading Room at Seoni High School and the Nagpur Bookshop being steps in this direction, the greatest gains always came from outcaste groups or individuals. (103)

A typical example of community effort was the Month of Witness which took

NOTES.

place at Lewa, a village about five miles West of Nagpur. There full-time workers were joined by volunteers from round about and preaching, teaching and dispensary work were accompanied by a welfare programme for cleaning up the village and repairing its road while in the evenings there were films, songs and dramas.

The supervision of young Christian communities such as those at Lewa or Sonaper was still entrusted to a fully-trained catechist or teacher. But at the same time local leaders were invited to a training course for instruction in the faith. And at the monthly missionary conference attended by pastors and other workers, it was decided which groups were now sufficiently well-established to be able to maintain their own impetus. (104) Living standards generally were going up with the level of education. And self-help projects such as that at Allipur, where gifts from "War on Want" helped to buy a pump for irrigation and work out a milk marketing scheme, were transforming village life. (105)

After Independence, acceptance of the Christian faith no longer held out for Indian converts the same promise of material advancement. State laws differed, but for one year at least in the early 1950's when Nagpur was part of Madhya Pradesh, (or the Central Provinces), it was necessary for converts to declare their change of allegiance before a magistrate. (106) And again Government policy worked out in such a way that Christians of outcaste origin were not normally eligible for Harijan grants. "I have been a Christian all my life, not for gain of land or money and I do not need your land now" one elderly church member is reported to have said when he was urged to register as an outcaste rather than a Christian. (107)

NOTES.

(105) Ibid., 1963, p.446; and passim George and Mary More, op. cit., p.15.
(106) In 1956, Nagpur area was incorporated in the new State of Maharashtra (Bombay) where no such law applied. It is generally regarded as politic in this district, however, to inform the local authorities when an adult baptism is about to take place.
Obviously it was very important, in circumstances such as this, to stress the value and meaning of belonging to a community with an ethos and social life of its own. We can appreciate also why the Seoni Kirk Session with its evangelical background took an hour to catechise a class of new communicants and "ranged over the whole gamut of orthodoxy" in doing so. (108)

The Nagpur Church Council, which at present consists entirely of Church of Scotland Mission congregations, is divided into six pastorates. Of these Nagpur, with a Christian community of about 1,200, accounts for nearly sixty per cent of the whole, the next largest congregation being Seoni with about 300 people. The other four pastorates, Amravati, Wardha, Saonar and Bhandara have about six hundred souls divided among them.

In Nagpur there is also a splinter congregation which left the U.C.N.I. in 1937 and worships in a building of its own. It is discussing the possibility of returning to the maternal fold and would be made welcome. Members of the Nagpur congregation who live in the city ward of Dharampeth have their separate place of worship.

Wardha pastorate has congregations who worship in their own buildings at Wardha and Hinganghat. The Seoni and Amravati pastorates have each a central building to which villages come for worship. Bhandara has its central building and a number of outlying groups. And Saonar, with buildings there and at Sonapur, is composed again of several village groups.

With no less than eleven ordained ministers on its strength, the Council's staffing position is, on paper at least, more than healthy. Of those eleven, however, three are Indians engaged in key administrative or educational posts, two are missionaries and one is a retired man. And while there remain five pastors to minister to a community of not much more than 2,000, the Central Fund is only able to support three of these, with a very small surplus left over.

NOTES.

Nagpur congregation is more than self-supporting, Seoni very nearly so and the remaining four pastorates among them can give barely enough to pay a third pastor. The balance, amounting to approximately a third of the total, is made up from various outside sources. But annual collections taken on the "Day of Evangelism", a scheme instituted by the Church Council in the 1940's, whereby members were invited to contribute one day's income for work under the Mission Board, makes a considerable addition to the total liberality. The administrative work of the Church Council is almost wholly dependent on Mission funds, but this, in the circumstances, is understandable and excusable.

With three pastors having been trained in the last ten years, the Council has a good record for the production of ministers. The standard of theological education is above average too, the three men not in pastoral charges and the minister of Nagpur congregation all being graduates. Of the other four who are in charges, one has a Serampore L.Th, and the others have completed a three-year regional language course at a recognised seminary. Graduate students are sent to Bangalore and matriculates to Poona, or in the case of Hindi speakers to Shharanpur.

Worship in the three district pastorates — Amravati, Saonar and Bhandara — is conducted in Marathi. In Seoni the language used is Hindi. In Nagpur and Wardha it is both. And in Nagpur there is also an evening Service in English. Kirk Sessions use either Marathi or Hindi, while the Council and various Board meetings are held in English, with freedom to use either Indian language as required. It has already been remarked that the proportion of women elders, about 20%, is exceptionally high.

The fact that we have already had occasion to mention co-operative work and joint activities with Anglican and Episcopal Methodists as well as with Roman Catholics shows how closely, in this area, the witness of different Christian bodies is interwoven. The proposed Scheme of Church Union, once completed, would bring the Church Council into organic relationship with those other Protestant bodies and greatly increase both its power and its confidence.
The character of the Nagpur Church, with its peculiar strengths and limitations, should by now be fairly clear to our minds. Lack of size and of balance has been its chief drawback. The lack of leadership qualities about which one missionary complained nearly forty years ago was less marked even then than in most Indian churches of that period, and it has in the interval been more than made up. Men such as Dr. D.G. Moses and Mr. M.G. Dhararaj, now South-East Asia Secretary of the Y.M.C.A., if they are not entirely local products, may nevertheless be seen as representative of the Nagpur Church at its best. And the average educational level of its members is as high as that of any of the churches we are studying. (109)

The trouble is rather that of too much head and not enough body. Rising standards of living and education within a small society attached to a relatively large and powerful Mission have led here again to place-seeking, contentiousness and the closed mind. The relationship among Scottish and Indian leaders has been at times almost a model of harmonious thinking and imaginative action. But this spirit had hardly communicated itself to the Christians of the rank and file.

It is also a feature of this Church that its missionary leaders deliberately chose the path of pushing ahead with integration and the handing over of responsibility to Indians while it remained obvious that for many years the Church would have to depend on the Mission for financial support. Self-government, in other words, moved well ahead of self-support. Whether this was a policy that pays dividends is a question we shall later have to consider.

There remains the problem of a community which is not yet self-sufficient and yet reflects only too often an attitude of self-satisfaction, rigidity and indifference to the outside world. These are common faults which any fresh spiritual impulse, such as that which would be given by Church Union, would help/

NOTES.

(109) Information obtained through correspondence.
to overcome.

"There are new signs of hope in the Nagpur congregation in a number of directions" wrote one missionary very recently. "The Christmas programme was greatly enjoyed and the young people did a very good job. A greatly improved financial position also indicates a better state of health. There is much to be done, but are things perhaps a little less rigid than they have been? We hope so." (110)
GENERAL SOURCES.


"Our Church's Work in India: Maratha Country", by John Torrance.


George and Mary Nore, "This is our Life", Edin. Ho. Press, London, 1962.

Hewat

F.M. Reports.

"Conference".

MS Papers, S.M.I.