A NEW VISION FOR RELIGIOUS EDUCATION

The Evolution of Divergent Models of Religious Education
Towards a Convergence Based Upon New Metaphors

Mark Chater

APPENDIX

Ph.D.
University of Edinburgh
1997
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONTENTS</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Footnotes to Chapter 1</td>
<td>377</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Footnotes to Chapter 2</td>
<td>390</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Footnotes to Chapter 3</td>
<td>414</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Footnotes to Chapter 4</td>
<td>425</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Footnotes to Chapter 5</td>
<td>445</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statistical Tables to Chapter 5</td>
<td>476</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Footnotes to Chapter 6</td>
<td>490</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Footnotes to Chapter 1

1. Sutcliffe, 1984, p284. This is John Hull's entry on the nature of religious education.

2. See, for example, Wolfe, 1995.

3. Hull uses Coventry Cathedral, a symbol of recovery and reconciliation and a centre of study and dialogue between faith communities, as an image of the two models. Walking up the nave, Hull records his impression of the altar seen from afar, and of the "words of witness" seen to either side. So, Hull says, faith seen from the outside, "from the street", presents the viewer with questions and challenges. Reaching the altar and turning to look down the nave, the words of witness have disappeared, and the panels of stained glass are seen. So, Hull says, faith seen from the inside transforms the viewer and the environment with light. Hull suggests that these two perspectives are not mutually contradictory, but he identifies them as belonging to two different approaches to revelation and to religion (Hull, "The Bible in the Secular Classroom", in Astley and Day, 1992, p209).


6. My experience is reflected and affirmed by the autobiographical work of Clare Richards, a confessional teacher and author, who relates her experience of conflict over educational and theological visions. She believes that confessional religious educators are frequently targets of criticism from both conservative and liberal perspectives, but that they must try to maintain a genuinely open, critical and neutral line (Richards, 1994, pp6-7). She cites the experiences of other teachers in disagreement with the educational practice of their school or parish (ibid., pp59-60)

7. According to a 1987 BBC Scotland poll, 64% of Scots described themselves as Presbyterian or Protestant; the next group down from this was the Roman Catholics, making up 15% of the population (Marr, 1992, p32).
8. Ibid. But see also the long term study which suggests a surge in attendance and membership between 1925-1931, and a steepening decline from 1956 onwards (Brown, 1994, pp51, 53).

9. Storrar, 1990, pp26ff. In his visionary book, Storrar uses literature and anecdote to identify both strengths and weaknesses in Scottish (mainly Protestant) religious consciousness (Storrar, 1990, pp86ff). He concludes "thankfully" that Scottish triumphalist religion is dead (ibid., p102), and looks forward to the emergence of the "other Scottish Christ" who will be recognizeable in his suffering humanity and who can inspire a vision of a humbler, more human Scottish nation with values of justice, mercy and humility (ibid., p109). Connections could be made between this vision and the marginalised base communities envisioned by liberation theology - a movement to which I turn in the final chapter.

10. The cultural (and, arguably, spiritual) effect is exemplified by discussions about the place of St Andrew's Day and suggestions that this festival be given a new multicultural role (Maan, 1994).

11. A sociologist comments on how the Kirk is "firmly rooted in the life of the community", more so than the English established church, and how people identify closely with it (Jenkins, 1975, p27). Furthermore it acts as a "focus" of national consciousness, a "custodian" of national heritage (Jenkins, 1975, p30) and, in association with other institutions, as a "ventriloquist" of nationhood (Marr, 1992, p48). Presbyterian religion may even act as a "thwarted nationalism", to a small degree analogous to the churches under east European communism (Brown, 1994, p74). Through a combination of history and myth-making surrounding figures such as Knox, Melville and Chalmers, the Kirk is associated with positive values such as democracy, individual conscience, and universal education. Through more recent events such as the 1989 report of the Church and Nation Committee, criticising Westminster government (Marr, 1992, p168), the Kirk has become more overtly associated with political, economic and constitutional criticisms of government, and therefore with aspirations for change. Thus Calvinism, while associated by some with sour self-righteousness and dogmatism, has also justified its reputation for sharp realism, moral and intellectual rigour (Jenkins, 1975, p31), and a heightened sense of the public good and of accountability (ibid., pp35-6).

13. The decline in Mass attendance is discussed in the context of secularism under the religion section: see section 2(c) below in the main text of this chapter.


15. The existence of Roman Catholic schools continues to be controversial but is accepted by some conservative Christians within Protestantism who see them, and their religious education, as a bulwark of Christianity and Christian culture (Douglas, 1982, pp95 and 102).


18. Ibid., pp26ff.


22. Martin Palmer reflects on this process and suggests the education system as a scapegoat for social failure: "States load the goals of education with all the value expectations which the society would like to have, but which it does not have" (Palmer, 1991, p15).

23. Fairweather and MacDonald, 1992, p34.

24. One Christian writer criticised the liberal-individual view of education as "flawed and dangerously so", on the grounds that "we are not of our own creation and cannot bring knowledge and value into being ex nihilo" (John Haldane in (eds) Francis and Thatcher, 1990, p191).

25. "We think of individuals .... as taking pride in their achievements and of being conscience-stricken about their shortcomings" (Peters and Hirst, 1970, pp 91-2); on his own, Peters is able to go a little further, speaking of the human self-concept, and of the "serious concern for truth" which is "built into" our consciousness (Peters, 1966, pp232 and 164ff) In another of its mutations, liberal education aims to "induct pupils into the general commitments of our society" (Fairweather and MacDonald, 1992, p32), but commentators are usually vague about the nature of those commitments or values.


28. See, for instance, the attack on the assumption of unlimited progress, on short-sighted orientation to market needs, and on reduction of all educational effort to meeting those needs (Lane, 1992, pp499-450). Management approaches which apply top-down or centre-periphery techniques to the process of curricular change have also been criticised as ineffective and undemocratic (Luby, 1995, p26). Regret at these and other developments is expressed personally by a retiring educator (Wilson, 1993); to the extent that his frustrations are shared in the teaching profession, there are psychological implications which become relevant in my discussion of the therapeutic metaphor in chapter 6.

29. The spiritual concern is seen, for instance, in the claim that homo economicus is firmly in the ascendant (T.H.E.S., March 15, 1996, p11) in the educational thinking of both major political parties. The warning note is struck most strongly by John Hull, who sees money as developing a spirituality of its own, all-pervasive and domineering, affecting not only management approaches in education, but the entire consciousness and atmosphere in which education is conducted: "The global power of money has reached proportions today which were unimaginable even as recently as one hundred years ago.... money is the very air we breathe" (Hull, 1995, p1). Hull believes that "spiritual education" can and must be an antidote, seeking to inspire children to lead selfless lives (ibid., p9).


32. "Modern society is secular, open and pluralist, and this is reflected in the attitudes and questions of the pupils in the classroom" (Fairweather and MacDonald, 1992, p33).

33. Between 1990 and 1995, Sunday Mass attendance in Scottish Roman Catholic churches declined by 13%, a steeper decline in attendance than any other Scottish church (Bunting, 1995). Despite the drop, nearly a third of the Scottish adult population were attending
church in 1995, a higher proportion than in England (ibid). A long-term study questions the theory of ongoing steep decline, arguing instead that twentieth century Scottish Roman Catholic adherence at first grew, then decelerated in its decline, by an increasing birth-rate (Brown, 1994, p54). The measures taken by churches to check or reverse their decline have raised counter-concerns about the behaviour of the churches in marketing themselves. Kenneson fears that marketing approaches may "misname those challenges facing contemporary churches" (Kenneson, 1993, p323).

34. Berger’s classic study defined secularisation as "the process by which sectors of society and culture are removed from the domination of religious institutions and symbols" (Berger, 1969, p113). His definition neatly brings together both intellectual and social patterns, but rather begs the question of what is defined as a religious institution, a religious symbol, or a religious idea. Yet sociology of religion also questions assumptions of widescale secularisation. Beckford and Luckmann reject a triumphalist secularisation (Beckford and Luckmann, 1989, p3). They are supported by Greeley, Martin and Gill, who argue that secularisation is hard to define and not as strong as it seems (Gill, 1996, p96). Beckford and Luckmann further point out its contradictory and paradoxical features (Beckford and Luckmann, 1989, p3), and note in particular how religion has penetrated the political area usually regarded, post-Enlightenment, as secular (Beckford and Luckmann, 1989, p3 and pp13ff). Again, Berger notes that religion, or else a substitute for it, is necessary for world-construction and world-maintenance (Berger, 1969). One other stream of thought calls secularisation into question: the research into religious experience suggests a very widespread and inbuilt spirituality and awareness of the other (Hay, 1986, 1987; Robinson, 1977).

35. See, for instance, Shaw, 1978. His discussion of scientific and political thought portrays it as basically inimical to religion. But more recent thought has raised the possibility of secular scientific discoveries promoting spiritual and moral awareness independently of organised religion, in a process sometimes referred to as postmodernism. For instance, one of the scientists who discovered DNA reflects on how the double helix structure lay undiscovered for several billion years, and this may lead to states of wonder and also to grappling with moral issues of genetic engineering (Connor and Wilkie, 1993).
36. See, for instance, the comment on feminism’s roots as a reforming movement and its present radicalised position in relation to Christianity (Noss and Noss, 1990, p530); this is exemplified in a spectrum of theologians from, say Rosemary Radford Ruether, pre-eminent among feminists because of her founding role, with her emphasis on Mary, exclusive language and Womanchurch (Radford Ruether, 1977), to Sandra Schneiders, who emphasises the sinful nature of patriarchy permeating Christian theology and the church (Schneiders, 1991).

37. Feminism has criticised the model of knowledge presently used in the curriculum as being too cognitive, resulting from male domination, and has called for a more person-centred approach. This approach is seen as "focusing on my experience" and has as its purpose "freeing me from being a passive object" (Barbara S. Mitrano, "Feminist Theology and Curriculum Theory" in Francis and Thatcher, 1990, p51). I return to this theme when discussing liberation theologies, including feminism, as sources for a new model in the final chapter.

38. One theologian believes this is because "the points it (biblical criticism) makes are too sophisticated" (Cupitt, 1984, p101), and this is especially the case with children. Cupitt’s criticism might justifiably be levelled at other theological disciplines.

39. See Hebblethwaite, 1993, and Challenor, 1994, for radical Roman Catholic views on the Papacy and its way of wielding authority. The conservative-radical split, often over matters of education and authority, is well exemplified by the long-running dispute over Weaving the Web, (Chater, 1993) and by the dispute in Clifton diocese over the activities of the conservative group, the neo-Catechumenate (Barnes, 1996).

40. If traumatising seems too strong an evaluation of the effect, I cite the commenting on Freud’s impact by J.W.D. Smith, who suggests that "Christian apologists have recovered from the shock" but Christian thinkers have not always admitted the "positive significance" of his findings (Smith, 1969, p55). The theme of extreme reactions appears again, in a different form, in a biography of Erikson:

"Men like Kierkegaard, Darwin, ... and Freud always generate both dazzle and fear, so that it often takes a generation or more for their views to receive attention that is free of fearful hostility or stylish and uncritical acceptance" (Coles, 1970, p10).
The point could be extended to apply to the impact of critical forces in general, and the cautious or hostile reception given to the responsive thinking of such as Cupitt and Jenkins. This supports the general feeling that most Christian thinkers and institutions have yet to give positive credence to the findings of their critics.

41. Chris Arthur wonders whether Freud, Marx, Durkheim — and by implication others — have "effectively shattered all the mirrors" of self-understanding and religious insight (Arthur, 1986, p45).


44. See, for instance, Schillebeeckx's project to change "the language game of the church" which has become as problematic for members of the church community as for those outside it (Schillebeeckx, 1974, p14).


47. Tracy, 1987.


49. Ibid., 1987, pp73ff and pp99-100.

50. Cupitt uses some of the very tools which attacked Christianity. "Critical thinking uses methodical doubt as a way to truth" and beliefs are "human products" with provenances which the specialist identifies (Cupitt, 1984, p252).

51. Tracy, 1987, pp99-100. I have some doubts about Jung's place in this category, and I might add others such as Kung and J.V. Taylor.

52. Teilhard de Chardin's acceptance of scientific research is one example of this reconstruction in relation to Science: for him, there is "less difference than people think between research and adoration" (Teilhard de Chardin, 1959, p275). Again, the movement of theological-ecological thought around the work of Matthew Fox reflects on how dualistic theologies (for instance, of fall and redemption) have unhealthily dominated western Christianity, and attempts to recon-
struct it using a holistic, creation-based spirituality (Fox, 1993, p267).


54. Smart, 1969, pp40, 643. There is, here, a recognition that "the religions are moving together: but they are also diversifying at the edges" Smart, 1969, p699. See also the arguments for religious openness by Hick, 1973/1993, pp146ff, and (in an educational context) by Melchert, 1995, pp347-9.

55. The fundamentalist response to any intellectual or academic approach to religion may include a "fear (of) the corrosive power of critical thinking" which is seen as "hostile to faith" (Cupitt, 1984, p250). For examples, see Goldberg, 1993, and McDonald’s comment on the "pathetic" creationist vs evolutionist controversy as a symptom of arrested development (McDonald in Francis et al, 1984, p52).

56. These attitudes include the expectation of global crisis associated with the eschaton, the dominance of charismatic male authority figures, and the distorted and selective use of texts and tradition, among others (Marty and Appleby, 1991, pp814ff).

57. In some cases, this response has left religious belief and practice looking like a "hobby" (Cupitt, 1984, p11). Kung may be describing this hermeneutic when he refers to the "crisis of orientation" which makes people live in a "vacuum in meaning, values and norms" (Kung, 1990, pp103-4).

58. In the midst of this public concern, the SCAA National Symposium on Education for Adult Life, held on 15th January 1996, focused on the spiritual and moral development of pupils. In his unpublished address to the symposium, the chief executive of SCAA offered a critique of both apathy and relativism as ways of interpreting and responding to society, claiming that "if ever a dragon needed slaying, it is the dragon of relativism." He called for a broader national agreement on values which society could authorise schools to teach on its behalf (Tate, 1996, paras 26 and 29).

59. See, for instance, Fowler's critique of precocious identity formation, often associated with fundamentalism and producing a rigid, brittle faith and personality (Fowler, 1981, p132).
60. In making this warning, I do not dispute the positive contribution of increased knowledge and the critical spirit. But "our knowledge has increased so enormously that our ancestors seem to us to have been like men living in a dream. They explained from above, we explain from below" (Cupitt, 1984, p30). Pupils inevitably pick up and use this superior, but dangerous approach to religions. Recently one religious educator has argued that the subject should make a stance against the indoctrinating force of secularisation, sowing seeds of doubt into the current widespread acceptance of the secular (Watson, 1993, pp24ff).


62. David Hay used the question: "Have you ever been aware of or influenced by a presence or power, whether you call it God or not, which is different from your everyday self?" (Hay, 1987, p129). 40% of people in Scotland reported having a religious experience (ibid., p129). This was slightly higher than the British average, although subsequent research with a wider question placed the British average at 50% (ibid., p151).

63. Hay's question (see fn 62 above) is framed to include the possibility of positive responses from both religious and non-religious people; main categories of response included peak experiences in and with nature, dreams, consolation in grief, the paranormal, answered prayers, and evil. There may be some question as to the coherence of the category "religious" when applied to these experiences. Hay argues confidently that he has brought out into the open a very high incidence of these sorts of experiences, thus "breaking a taboo" (ibid., p137). His research and that of others makes a contribution not only to the religious, but also to the underlying human context, which I later refer to as anthropology (see main text below).

64. See, for instance, Maslow on the transcendent nature of humanity (Maslow, 1970, p xvi).

65. See the research into European trends in secularisation, which found that many interviewees made a distinction between "religion" as practice, habit, institutions (which was widely rejected) and "the religious" as experience, which was widely accepted (Giorgi, 1992). One writer eloquently illustrates this by recalling how the institutional church "seemed to come down like an iron curtain between me and my own religious feelings" (Van der Post, 1976, p38). This
trend is commented on in personal development programmes (Hurley and Dobson, 1993, p19). One youth worker draws a comforting conclusion that while young people may be "resisting certain ways of being religious, they are not resisting religion itself" Di Giacomo, 1993, p34.


68. Fowler’s discussion of stage retardation forms one of the most exciting and relevant themes of his 1981 work. He attributes retardation to, inter alia, "conversional change that blocks or helps one avoid the pain of faith stage changes" (Fowler, 1981, p286). In his treatment of this problem, Fowler comes very close to the language of pain and healing, to which I return in chapter 6.

69. For instance, a writer involved in youth ministry suggests that "new" (post-Vatican II) Roman Catholics are typically at Stage 4, posing a threat to those adults at Stage 3, and that "such an analysis goes far to explain the painful dislocations and polarisations" seen in Roman Catholicism since the Council. "The Vatican I church, with its strong discipline and its stress on obedience to authority and institutional loyalty, inhibited and even stifled the normal transition from stage three to four" (Di Giacomo, 1993, p69).

70. See, for instance, the suggestion that "in some religious traditions, for one to move beyond... stage 3 is to place oneself, from the point of view of the particular religious tradition, outside religious faith itself" (Grimmott, 1987, p175). This view is shared by others (Davidson, 1994, p31). A limited awareness of the possibility and danger of stage retardation is also shown in Pope John Paul II’s reference to non-existent assimilation and lack of understanding (John Paul II, 1979, para 55). People at stage 5, who may be more comfortable with ambiguity, tension and mystery, can become useful as peacemakers between stage 3 and stage 4 (Di Giacomo, 1993, p69). This insight could perhaps be extended to other churches and to structures in secular education.
71. But Fowler counsels against making developmental faith stage progress an explicit aim of religious education (Fowler, 1987, p81).

72. Non-acceptance of these schemes usually, but not always, belongs on the conservative wing of the churches, where faith is seen as a divine gift, not a human characteristic. This raises differences in understandings of religion, which forms the third of my analytical categories (discussed below in this chapter).

73. See especially my discussion of divisions in the denominational sector in Scotland (chapter 5).


75. Francis found only 35.6% believing that the subject should be in the curriculum at all (Francis, 1996, pp223ff). Wider findings appear in Francis and Kay’s full-length book (Francis, Leslie and Kay, William Drift from the Churches Cardiff, University of Wales Press, 1995).

76. But see the claims for children’s spirituality made by Hay and others, quoted above in main text, and in fns 61 to 65.


79. See, for instance, Fowler’s call for a new spirit and a new theological language to carry us forward into the 21st century, and his optimism (from his own theistic viewpoint) that such a movement will happen: "I have deep confidence that a creative, saving and sustaining God is involved integrally in the process.." and in "the weaving of a new creation" (Fowler, 1991, p25). See also Matthew Fox’s belief that a scientific-technological phase of humanity is drawing to a close and giving birth to an emerging ecological phase, a new creation "calling us forth even as it is remolding us from the inside" (Fox, 1993, p253).

80. Acceptance of religious pluralism is welcomed by the Dalai Lama: "We cannot hide the philosophical differences that exist among the various faiths - nor can we hope to replace the existing faiths by a universal belief. Each religion has its own distinctive contributions to make, and each in its own way is suitable to a particular group of people. For I believe
that each of them basically aims at transforming man into a better and more decent human being. Humanity needs all the world’s religions to suit the ways of life, diverse spiritual needs and inherited national traditions... to enrich human experience and world civilization.” (Dalai Lama, 1993).

83. "A bombardment of persuasive 'images' in the fields of politics, education, special causes, advertising, religion, medicine, industrial relations, and guidance has bred cynical and paranoidal responses in listeners" so that the communicator must "refrain from imposing a set of values, a point of view, or a problem solution upon the receivers", lest their "suspicion that hidden motives exist" heightens resistance (Gibb, 1989, p196).
84. Perhaps the most eloquent illustrations of the natural spirituality of children are to be found in Robinson, 1977, and Coles, 1990; the argument on suppression and taboo of religious experiences is carried forward in Hay, 1990, p90. The more recent work of the Children and World Views Project gives both a sense of children's spiritual depth (Erricker and Erricker, 1997, pp8ff) and a critique of the adult society's inability to respond to it (Erricker, 1996).
85. A brief look at theoretical work on religious education reveals that, for all the simplicity of the "two-models" design, it is not without its critics. The work of several of these (Rummery, 1975; Arthur, 1982; Hull, 1984 et al; Moran, 1989; Slee, 1989; Watson, 1993; Hill in Astley and Francis, 1994; Wallace, 1995) is analysed in chapter 3.
86. See fn 85 above.
87. I argue, in chapter 6, that the closer these two categories can be, the healthier for the human learner and the subject.
88. Phenix, 1964, pp ix and 5.
89. Smith, 1969, preface.
91. Ibid., p35.

93. Theissen adds ethical theory as a fourth area of unclarity (Theissen, 1993, p215).


95. Van der Leeuw, 1938, pp191 and 23.

96. An alternative and supporting term might be Hans Kung’s "humanum", that defining aspect which is "basic to human life" and which "binds it to a direction in life, to values in life, to norms in life, to meaning in life" (Kuschel, 1990, p106).

97. Rahner sees anthropology as a necessary and fruitful starting point for theology (Rahner, 1972, pp28ff). For him it will be a transcendental anthropology (ibid., p29); he uses the alternative term ontology (ibid., p34).

98. A recent study of religious epistemology argues the possibility of philosophical proof of religious experience and knowledge (Hay, 1996, pp197ff). Experiences will be of several kinds but can be divided into two broad categories, numinous experience (relating to theistic belief-systems) and enlightenment experience (relating mainly to Jainism and Buddhism (ibid., p198). To this study we may add the several publications attesting the reality of human religious experience and knowledge, reported biographically (Robinson, 1977) or presented statistically (Hay, 1987). These studies suggest anthropological insights, as implied by the title of Hardy’s The Spiritual Nature of Man (Hardy, 1979) and imply definitions of religion and faith as natural human characteristics, spirituality as a natural form of human awareness, a biological given in the broadest sense (Hay and Nye, 1996, pp6ff).


100. See chapter 2.

101. See chapters 3 and 4.

102. See chapter 5.

103. See chapter 6.


3. It may be suggested that catechetical effort has flourished at particular times. Sometimes, this flourishing has been when Christianity was in conflict with neighbouring ideologies. Most of my references are to the apostolic and patristic ages, when Christianity was struggling to define itself in pagan society; the reformation, when competing forms of Christianity were in struggle with each other and needed to preserve and hand on doctrinal purity; and the aftermath of the enlightenment up to the present, when Christianity has been struggling to express itself in a world of new insights about humanity and the physical environment. It may seem that when Christianity has been hardest pressed, then its catechetical effort has been most creative and intense; however, my analysis of the church's present efforts shows that this is not always and everywhere felt to be the case.


6. Butler argues that the church is the prior agent in historical religious education, having an "actuality" which precedes anything else in the theological or educational process. He defines the church theologically, not denominationally or as an institution (Butler, 1962, pp1-9). Newman and other Catholic theologians would not disagree with this; for them the Christian communities, as human contexts, were the essential human context in which the Kerygma must evolve. Although evangelical theologians might prefer an approach which takes the Word or Kerygma as the prior reality, I follow a Catholic approach in emphasising the community of the church as context for the emergence of the Kerygma and of religious education.

7. See, for example, the reference to continuing steadfastly in the Apostles' teaching (Acts 2:42).
8. Westerhoff astutely notes that "conflict is a powerful force in building identity", (Westerhoff, 1981, p43); Butler echoes the conflict theme with his study of the early church's need to "stand against" some elements of Jewish culture, the Didache being an unresolved example of this conflict (Butler, 1962, p24).


10. As in the case of the Ephesus community (Acts 19:1 ff).

11. As in the case of circumcision and food laws, and the resulting confrontation between Peter and Paul (Acts 15:1 ff).

12. As in the reference to "those who slander you when you are living a good life in Christ" (2 Peter 3:16) which is attributed to a dispute with antinomianism (Caird, 1955, p146).


15. 1 Corinthians 9:19-23.

16. Perhaps the clearest example of the ambiguous attitude is in Alexandria. Clement and Origen, both teachers, made contrasting uses of Greek philosophy. Clement spoke of parallels between the Bible and Homer, and saw divine inspiration in Pythagoras, the "Magi of Persia" and the "Gymnosophists of India" (Danielou and Marrou, 1964, pp130-131; original source unknown). He saw philosophy as a necessary preparation and discipline (Stromateis 1,5) and praised the divinely inspired power of other religious thinkers (ibid., 1,20, both quoted in Bettenson, 1956, pp168-9). But Origen had a lower view of Plato and the Hellenist tradition, although he was not averse to quoting them, (Chadwick, 1967, p101) and insisted on no salvation outside the church (Homily on Jeremiah, 20,3, quoted in Bettenson, 1956, p244). In the third century catechetical literature of Celsus and Hippolytus, one scholar detects a vigorous sectarian strain, setting up clear contrasts between Christian and pagan life (Harmless, 1995, pp39ff). The church's subsequent history shows other examples of this ambiguity, for instance in the sixteenth century work by Jesuits in India and China.

17. Ulich, 1968, p34.

19. Tertullian’s Treatise on the Resurrection (Tr Evans. 1960) has citations of Plato by Justin (pp xxv) and Tertullian (p11).

20. Westerhoff, 1981, p118; see also Torrance, 1959, for an analysis of the reformed Catechisms, referred to again below (Fn 27).

21. Butler, 1962, pp87-88, offers Pestalozzi and Froebel as examples. But it is possible, given their deistic positions, that Christianity’s dominance continued as much for cultural as for doctrinal reasons.

22. Paul Migne (1800-1875) and John Henry Newman (1801-1890) were leaders in the renewal of interest in Patristics, while the Papal encyclical of Leo XIII in 1893, Providentissimus Deus, heralded a renewal of scriptural scholarship. Biblical study was encouraged more widely in Pius XII’s Divino Afflante Spiritu of 1943. While some critical thought was countenanced, these movements mostly constituted a return to the safest and oldest Christian content at a time when the content itself was increasingly questioned.

23. See, for instance, the work of Chrysostom, for whom "the catechumen is a sheep without a seal; he is a deserted inn and a hostel without a door...we who teach you are making strong and secure the walls of the inn" (Baptismal Instructions, Tr Harkins, p195); see also Chrysostom’s strict attitude to nurture as habit-forming and discipline as effective forms of nurture, and his negative attitude to secular pursuits such as the theatre, expressed in his Vainglory and quoted in Laistner, 1951, p118.

24. The clearest early example of a high anthropology and consequent learner-centred method is that of Augustine. For him, the soul — a rational being — lends the individual the will to learn and grow (Howie, 1969, p70) and so the whole person is naturally attuned to the perception of truth through divine illumination from within (ibid., pp122-3). Howie argues that both Herbart and Dewey echo Augustine’s insights. Also, Groome’s shared praxis owes much to Augustine’s view of the learner (Groome, 1991). Augustine’s thinking is further discussed under epistemology (see below).

25. Any association of Augustine with progressive, learner-centred methods, and Chrysostom with
traditional, would be crude: other factors were at work in their differences. Augustine's relatively open, dialogical tendency was the fruit of his years as a teacher and of his own journey through Platonism and Manichaeism to Christianity; while Chrysostom was strongly aware of the hostility of the surrounding pagan society, with which the church often compromised, from which it borrowed learning, but in which it remained "a despised and often a persecuted sect" (Laistner, 1951, p5).

Also, different audiences may have invited the two thinkers to develop divergent methods: Augustine's handbook *De Catechizandis Rudibus* may be assumed to relate to the needs of adult candidates, whereas Chrysostom's *Vainglory* is addressed to parents and discusses children.

Butler suggests a contrast between baptismal preparation (happening strictly within the life of the church), and post-baptismal education (which sought to use philosophy as a way of extending and deepening the understanding of faith). He argues that the latter type is the root of the liberal Protestant dream of education (Butler, 1962, p30).

For these three reasons alone, high and low anthropologies may not be equated with contemporary epistemological polarities. Nevertheless, there is an undeniable divergence of thought between Augustine and Chrysostom which has some contemporary relevance.


27. Torrance, 1959, p xlviii. For Calvin, doctrine and common formulae were important; but catechesis must be a call to personal involvement, never simply content (Westerhoff, 1981, p112).

28. Butler attributes the psychological motifs of personality and selfhood, the complexity of self, and the concept of development, to the Protestant source (Butler, 1962, pp 198ff and 206ff).

29. Westerhoff, 1981, p207. This was hardly surprising given the heavily Thomist, clericalist and papal tone of Tridentine theology (Dickens, 1968, p132).

30. Jungmann singles out Canisius (for his catechisms), Bellarmine and Borromeo, among others, for praise (Jungmann, 1959, pp21-24).
31. Rousseau acknowledges his high optimism in the preface to Emile (Rousseau, 1911 (1760), preface).

32. The extent of Rousseau's anthropological influence on Pestalozzi may be varyingly gauged, but the latter's utopian tendencies are recognised (Bantock, 1984, p64; Mayer, 1960, pp283-4). Pestalozzi's belief that the child's love of God is formed and learned through her experience of maternal love, care and trust suggests an interesting anticipation of Erikson's emphasis on basic trust as an essential skill of the personality, an anticipation of which Erikson does not seem to have been aware. Froebel believed that the human society of the school forms an important factor (Butler, 1962, p86).

33. For a more detailed discussion of Jungmann, see the section on Epistemology below. Groome's anthropology is analysed in detail in chapter 4.

34. Butler offers an array of words to describe the learning process in early Christian education: he identifies paideia which he translates as education, didache (instruction) and catecheo (several meanings including hearing and instruction). Within these words, he implies, but does not develop, a conflict of priorities between whole-person education and cognitive, formal instruction (Butler, 1962, p26).

35. Cyril of Jerusalem delivered lectures in batches of 18 or 20 (Westerhoff, 1981, p59). Cyril's primary reference was scripture: "concerning the divine and holy mysteries of the faith, not even a casual statement must be delivered without the Holy Scriptures" but he was not adverse to using philosophical categories (Sawicki, pp133-4). He would also enquire into the moral life of catechumens (Westerhoff, 1981, p51). Typically, catechists would insist on strict adherence to moral purity before and after initiation. Cyril's insistence on secrecy about the mysteries of the faith (Procatechesis 12, ed Cross 1951, p47) is in marked contrast with modern practice. Chrysostom (the "golden-mouthed") was a gifted preacher who taught through exhortation (von Campenhausen, 1963, pp145-6) stressing the control of passions and "right tension of the soul" (Laistner, 1951, pp94-110).

36. The themes of love for, and dialogue with the learner are praised by Howie (Howie, 1969, p150; see also Devitt's complimentary reference to Augustine's rich psychological insights (Devitt, 1992, p34). Augustine's belief that different learners needed different strategies, his emphasis on love and his
dictum that "the same medicine is not to be applied to all" (see De Catechizandis Rudibus, 399, chapters 15, 17 and 23, and the Cassiciacum dialogues recorded in De Vita Beata, quoted in Howie, 1969, pp 142, 151-2 and in Laistner, 1951, p37) suggest both an early form of differentiation and also an epistemology of personal involvement which is echoed in this century by Freire and by aspects of psychotherapy. Augustine's insights remind the contemporary reader again of the error of using labels such as traditional and modern.

37. Scholasticism has been defined as "the attempt to support the Christian creed by a philosophical structure... to withstand... doubts among Christian theologians" (Ulich, 1968, p70).

38. The fourth Lateran Council of 1215 called for "competent masters" and theologians to teach, if possible, in every cathedral town (Sawicki, 1988, p219): but this was always more an aspiration than a reality. Suspicion between Roman theology and University philosophy ran deep, and is acknowledged by even the most hagiographic of Thomist studies (Maritain, 1942, p29; Gilson, 1924, p12).

39. Westerhoff links the word Catechesis not only to echoing the faith, but also to celebrating and imitating (Westerhoff, 1981, p2). Butler adds the meanings "hearing" and "becoming acquainted" (Butler, 1962, p26). In the early church, breaking of bread in memory of Jesus was a feature closely related to teaching. Clearly for Saul/Paul it is a central and early element, which he uses not only ritually but also for re-telling the story and for moral exhortation (1 Cor 11:17 ff).

40. The argument that these movements emerged as a form of unconscious compensation is hinted at in Huizinga's discussion of the lack of sympathy between the medieval theological mind and the artistic world (Huizinga, 1955, pp255ff). See also his comments on the almost neurotic intensity of the new spiritual movements (ibid., pp184ff). The pattern of separation between ritual and instruction may be connected with the medieval shifting of initiation rites to infants (Fisher and Yarnold in Jones, Wainwright and Yarnold, 1978, pp116-7); but liturgy's educational role in the medieval scene is upheld by Jungmann, 1959, p17, as "a formidable force of tremendous effectiveness".

41. Bantock, 1984, p78. Rummery and others raised this issue again in the twentieth century (see chapter 3).
42. Jungmann, 1959, p ix, acknowledges this.

43. The movement grew from practical work, magazines and conferences (Jungmann, 1959, p32). Ulich, 1968, p267, mentions Steiglitz's role.

44. See Jungmann’s chapter on the needs and stages of pupils (Jungmann, 1959, pp284ff); Butler, 1962, p90 suggests the enlightenment origins of this practice.

45. As part of a wider theological struggle to free the church from neo-scholasticism, Jungmann called for a restoration of the power and clarity of the Kerygma (Jungmann, 1959, pp387ff), parallelling in educational terms the efforts of his contemporaries to clarify the kerygma existentially (Bultmann) and doctrinally (Barth). Jungmann reached towards a realisation of the importance of epistemological concerns in his insistence on the "theology of the message" (ibid., p210); he believed that "Subject matter should not only be imprinted on the child's memory but also be grasped by the understanding." (ibid., pp32-33).

From a twentieth century perspective, this implied a significant step towards child-centred learning, in that the Munich movement placed "much more emphasis on children learning than on teachers teaching" (Smart and Horder, 1975, p152). This concern made the movement critical of some catechisms, such as that of Baltimore, for being "pedagogically unsuitable", for having "incomprehensible language" and for "the stunting of thought processes involved in questions that contain complete answers" (Sawicki, 1988, p279). Again, in this critique we see the beginnings of a concern for what is now called child-centred education.

46. For instance, Richard Rummery notes the contemporary demise of written catechisms "which offered a short, clear and easily memorised summary" of faith content. In recent times, confessional religious education moved away from these documents because of their limitations in helping the religious learner to absorb appropriately, rather than engage in rote-learning. "An ability to repeat the catechism text often meant very little as regards the more important understanding of the doctrinal truths of the catechism. The precise wording of the catechism which was necessary to safeguard the orthodoxy of what was expressed often made its inherently difficult subject matter even more difficult to understand. After all, a catechism was a compendium of theological statements and such statements were already at one remove from the realities which had inspired such reflection." (Rummery
in Smart and Horder, 1975, p152). His critique owed much to the earlier concerns of the Munich movement, and was in itself influential in later British and American Catholic catechetical developments of a pupil-centred nature.

47. In the U.S.A., George Albert Coe, influenced by Dewey and by the social Gospel, called for an abandonment of old methods of indoctrination and a new attentiveness to insights of psychology, placing a high premium on individual freedom and social progress as goals of religious education (Ulich, 1968, p273ff). His more conservative Protestant colleague, Randolph Crump Miller, questioned the "so-called life-centred or progressive teaching" of Coe and others, calling instead for a synthesis of progressive methods with traditional credal content (ibid p275).

48. The 1918 legislation in favour of publically-funded Roman Catholic schools led only gradually to the withdrawal of clergy and the emergence of lay teachers (Dealy, 1945, pp206 and 251).

49. The efforts at religious education "were affected by the absence of suitable textbooks as well as by lack of time", and, later on, when lay teachers took over in larger numbers, lack of expertise (Fitzpatrick, 1986, p148).

50. The Council produced a Declaration on Christian Education, Gravissimum Educationis. The declaration lays on the church a "grave obligation" to see to children's moral and religious education. Roman Catholic schools should be "animated by a spirit of liberty and charity" and the role of the church in the school is to orient culture towards salvation and the Kingdom of God. Parents have a duty to support such schools (Flannery, 1975, pp732 ff).


53. Sacred Congregation for the Clergy, General Catechetical Directory, 1971, para 77, p67. The section is entitled "Catechesis According to Age Levels". It contains general statements on the needs and challenges of each stage of life up to adulthood, and offers some advice about appropriate aims and content for each stage.
54. See Fn 36 above.

55. *Catechesae Tradendae* (Catechesis in Our Time) speaks of catechesis as a duty and as the right of every baptised person (John Paul II, 1979, p16). There should be integrity of content, so that teachers are not selective as to doctrines presented (ibid., para 30, p31). Social praxis should form an important part of content, with emphasis on the church's teaching about the poor (ibid., para 29, p30). Ecumenical considerations should also be taught, but without reductionism (ibid., paras 32, 33, pp32-34). Treatment of other world religions is permitted, so long as it is objective, but this activity properly belongs in state schools and is not catechesis (ibid., pp34-5).

Attention should be paid to methods of pedagogy (ibid., para 31, p32) and a balance of old methods such as memorisation with newer ones such as dialogue (ibid., para 55, pp50-51) with clear emphasis being placed on the virtues of the older methods. There is a veiled reference to pupil-centred learning, but it allows no contradiction between this and traditional methods, since "revelation is not... isolated from life or artifically juxtaposed to it" (ibid., para 22, p24).

56. "We first help people name experiences of God's salvific presence, and then share with them the community's (i.e., the Roman Catholic church's) formulas for articulating this salvation in our midst - our Creed" (Morris, 1989, p33). The emphasis is on naming, sharing and community. But this approach applies only to the parish-based Rite of Initiation of Christian Adults; there is no guarantee that the method permeates into schools, although in my personal experience it has to a limited extent.

57. See, for instance, the manner in which Augustine's example of loving interest in the learner's concerns and interests is praised, and his example admonished upon modern catechists: "For catechesis has a pressing obligation to speak a language suited to today's children and young people" (John Paul II, 1979, para 59, p54); but see also how this example is sternly qualified with a warning not to let adaptation to learners change the credal content under any pretext (ibid., para 59). The tone, and the ambiguous mixing of open and closed approaches, are in some ways typical of this Pope. Jungmann is not mentioned in this encyclical.
58. Catechesis takes its beginning from the revelation of God's love (Sacred Congregation for the Clergy, 1971, para 10, p21); it is part of the pastoral ministry of the church (ibid., para 17, p26); it "cannot be dissociated from the church's pastoral and missionary activity as a whole", and it is a stage in evangelisation (John Paul II, 1979, para 18, p20). Its specific aim is "to develop, with God's help, an as yet initial faith" and it is a matter of "giving growth, at the level of knowledge and in life, to the seed of faith sown by the Holy Spirit... and... transmitted by Baptism" (ibid., para 20, p22). These add up to an unambiguous restatement of missionary, faith-oriented aims.

59. I argue in chapter 5 that English thinking has permeated Scottish confessional practice to some extent.

60. Quoting from Catechesae Tradendae, the project literature stresses that the parish is the "prime mover and pre-eminent place" of catechesis (John Paul II, 1979, para 67, pp60-61; Gallagher, 1988, p 24). This role is shared with the home and the school.


62. Ibid., p15.

63. Subsequent work in New Zealand and Australia made the same distinction. R.E. is established as a subject in its own right, and given the aim (among others) of valuing and reflecting the multi-cultural nature of society (Finlay, 1996, pp6,11). An Australian educator argues for a new integrated model of R.E., and offers a "typological-critical" model for use in both church and state sectors (Lovat, 1989, pp86ff). The latter may owe something to Rossiter's earlier theoretical call for a "creative divorce" between catechesis and school-based R.E. (Rossiter, 1982, pp21ff).

64. James Arthur (1995, p67) makes more of the significance of the adaptation than I would wish to. He suggests that the National Project is designed to fit in with local agreed syllabuses, and fails to follow the Pope's exhortation in Catechesae Tradendae. Whatever the degree of the adaptation, it caused controversy. My discussion of the controversies over the textbooks which came out of the National Project, Weaving the Web and Here I Am, showed how they had been criticised for, among other features, their inclusion of some world religions material. I argued that the
divisions over these revealed deeper disagreements about theology and education (Chater, 1993).

65. Rhymer in Francis et al, 1984, p34.

66. Some Roman Catholics believe denominational schools to be divisive (Lafferty, 1992, p93), and "many" support a model of partial integration something akin to Grampian Region's provision (ibid., p95).

67. The school development plan Faith and Learning (Catholic Education Commission (Scotland), 1992) and the curriculum guidelines Religious and Moral Education 5-14: Roman Catholic Schools (Catholic Education Commission (Scotland) with Scottish Office Education Department, 1994) are analysed, with other documents, in chapter 5.


69. "For centuries, education was assumed to consist primarily of accumulated knowledge.... Teaching followed a primitive magisterial model.... Such a model is seriously deficient.... the learning experience is expected to move beyond rote knowledge" (his emphasis) Duminuco, 1996, p23. This is Duminco's view; I have tried to argue that the confessional tradition has wrestled with this problem and has been more ambiguous, and perhaps less deficient, than he believes.

Contemporary catechetical materials usually favour use of progressive and child-centred methods. For instance, The Art of Being a Catechist emphasises learning experiences which are personalised, learning which involves the whole being, and the relevance of the developmentalist to the understanding of the growing child (Salombard and Ory, 1994, pp66-70).

70. We find this blend model supported by many theorists and practitioners. Sawicki sees it as a pattern of word, care and celebration (Sawicki, 1988, p286). The RCIA insists on the "intertwining" of celebration and catechesis (Morris, 1989 p 9). The Brussells "Lumen Vitae" catechetical literature has four sources for catechesis: scripture, liturgy, doctrine and Christian life (Westerhoff, 1981, p228). Westerhoff’s own definition of catechesis as aiming "to aid persons and their communities to know God, to live in relationship to God, and to act with God in the world" (Westerhoff, 1981, p3). Harris supports and develops the same idea in her vision of contemporary religious education as being based on the major identifying characteristics of the early church:
koinonia, leiturgia, didache, kerygma and diakonia (Harris, 1989, pp75ff): these cover emotional fellowship, liturgical celebration, teaching of doctrine, and morality through service.

Some confirmation on this balanced epistemology is discovered in contemporary definitions of religion: see Groome’s comprehensive definition of the Christian tradition (Groome, 1991, p216) and Cantwell Smith’s "objective religious data" which make up a "cumulative tradition" (Hughes, 1986, p10). Both definitions cover ritual and affective as well as intellectual phenomena.

71. For instance, one pessimistic writer surveys the last 25 years and sees young people suffering from "religious illiteracy" and "a shrinking capacity for commitment and... perseverance" which is, he believes, mostly the result of progressive catechetical methods and progressive theology (DiGiacomo, 1993, p7). His thinking illustrates the connection between low anthropology and cognitive-based epistemology.


73. While the conflict between scholasticism and humanism has sometimes been overstated, there was a clear contrast, in which the latter was a framework for new disciplines (Kristeller, 1961, pp92ff) and for a new sense of the individual (Huizinga, 1955, p207).

74. Although Pelikan suggests a lack of interest, on Luther’s part, in human structures (Pelikan, 1968, pp134ff) this is rebutted through a documentary analysis by Bornkamm, 1983, p139 and Butler, 1962, p33.

75. Calvin’s letter to his old teacher, Cordier, quoted in Boyd, 1947, p198. See also Parker’s analysis of the new Geneva university, where humanist subjects were encouraged by Calvin as a preparation for theology (Parker, 1975, pp128-9).

76. (ed) Laing 1895, pp209 ff.

77. The Ratio Studiorum of 1599 has been called "the most cogent and coherent educational program of the western world" (Ulich, 1968, p125). Their slogan ("Puerilis institutio renovatio mundi") links individual human learning with visions of the renewal of society.

79. Astley questions the usefulness, for present-day Christian education, of the enlightenment concern for individual autonomy. In support, he cites Moran and Kleinig (Astley, 1994, p207 and fn).

80. Fackenheim, 1967, p225. Empiricism further weakened the reliance on external sources, although this confidence was not shared by every enlightenment thinker: see Carlyle's disparaging comments on Locke's 1690 Essay on Understanding (Carlyle, 1986/1829, p68). Carlyle was not against rationality, but was aware of the "notable absurdity" of ignoring the mysterious (ibid., p78).

81. Arnold, On Dover Beach, 1867.

82. Hegel used the emerging German idealism to place religious feeling into an independent philosophical framework (Fackenheim, 1967, p117).


85. See, for instance, van der Leeuw, 1938 (1933), p646 (fn); Smart, 1973(a), pp53ff and 77-8.


87. See, for instance, Maritain, 1955, pp58ff; Barth, 1975 (1936), pp161ff; Barth, 1956, pp325ff.

88. Open and universal educational plans such as Robert Owen's were seen as radical (Bantock, 1984, pp131ff).

89. Osborn, 1934, pp191ff.

90. Schleiermacher's distrust of clergy and of traditional theological language (Sykes, 1971, p38-44) created a mutual divergence between him and traditional ecclesial educators. Pestalozzi disliked catechisms and wanted to see religious education as part of the whole educational process (Ulich, 1968, pp224ff).
91. "A copy of the Authorised Version ... was the only religious text available for study in schools" because of an agreement between Christian bodies that the Bible could be taught "without infringing denominational interests" (Sutcliffe, 1984, p48). Niblett, 1960, p78, illustrates this. Butler adds that church history was also widely taught (Butler, 1962, p213).

92. Sutcliffe, 1984, p310 and 63.

93. McDonald in Francis, 1984, p58, equates Scottish religious education with Presbyterian instruction. See also Fairweather and MacDonald, p5. Smith comments on the "shades of authoritarianism" associated with the nurturing and instructing ethos (Smith, 1990, plO).

94. Fairweather and MacDonald, 1992, p3; McDonald in Francis, 1984, p55.

95. Definitions of indoctrination were and remain elusive; but in the period of neo-traditionalism, it was seen as a hugely negative concept, and indeed remains with a negative definition so that, "like murder", it is "partially constituted by those characteristics which make it undesirable" (Kleining, 1982, p55). Snook (1972) attempts criteria for definition based on rationality. More recently, Newbiggin adopts a "Tu quoque" riposte to the accusation, pointing at the Sciences' expectation of uncritical reception (Francis and Thatcher, 1990, p 96). Theissen defends religious nurture (confessional religious education) from the charge of indoctrination, and to question the claims of liberal education (Theissen, 1993, pp xi and 3).

96. See Hull’s pithy distinction of religious education from indoctrination, Hull, 1984, p182.

97. It is impossible and unnecessary to summarise the considerable body of research here. For a summary, see Hyde, 1990; but see especially Loukes’ work on adolescents’ values, 1961; Peatling’s early use of Piaget, 1973; and Goldman’s flawed, but classic and influential use of Piaget to form a critique of Bible-based methods (Goldman, 1964).

98. The effect of Goldman’s research was "to render suspect much of the traditional work" of primary R.E. at that time (Sutcliffe, 1984, p294).

99. The exceptions are the Durham report, with its main focus on church schools (Ramsey, 1970) and the Schools Council Working Paper 36, with its discussion of
understanding based on objectivity (Schools Council, 1971, pp21ff).

100. Bastide, 1987, p35-6. For examples, see Learning for Life, the ILEA (Inner London Education Authority, 1968). This was theme-based for primary schools, but dominated throughout by Christianity. The range of Christian topics was broader than in traditionalism: it included early church history and ethics. There was a small unit on "the comparative study of religions" for sixth form (ibid., pp85ff). See also Palmer’s critique of From Fear To Faith, which spoke of "primitive" faiths of indigenous peoples, "polytheistic" religions of Hinduism and Buddhism (sic), and presented Judaism and Christianity as the climax of development. Islam, Sikhism and Bah’ai, coming after Christianity, were not mentioned at all (Palmer, 1991, p28). Some phenomenologists had written in similar terms (for example, van Leeuwen, 1964).

101. The Swann Report links confessional and neo-confessional religious education causally with the racial attitude known as assimilationism (Swann, 1985, p474). See also Cole’s comment on teachers’ attitudes (Cole, 1983, p162).

102. In his unpublished thesis, Arthur ascribes phenomenology as a religious position to Johann Heinrich Laubert in 1764, and as a method to Edmund Husserl in 1913 (Arthur, 1982, pp63ff). But Jackson ascribes the first use of the word to the Dutch comparativist P.D. Chantepe de la Saussage (Jackson in King, 1990, p108). Pettazzoni had hailed it as "the most important innovation which has come about in the realm of our studies during the last half century" (Pettazzoni, 1954, p217); its understanding of, and approach to, faith was held to be a science sui generis (ibid).

103. The eidetic reduction is essentially an attempt at a pure vision of typological forms, reducing the different manifestations and even the self in order to clarify the typological categories running within and between traditions and underlying religious phenomena (Arthur, C., 1995, p452).

104. van der Leeuw, 1938, p646 fn.


106. Smart, 1973(a), p69.

108. Ibid., p12.

109. Schools Council Working Paper 36 (1971) was supported by Smart’s Religious Studies department at Lancaster University.

110. Phenomenology influenced the Birmingham Handbook (City of Birmingham, 1975), which included units on Humanism (ibid., p189) Communism (ibid., p169) and Secularism (ibid., p158), and was the first to free itself explicitly from a religious justification (Sutcliffe, 1984, p258 and 285). Phenomenology was used and defended as a valid systematic investigation and classification of religious phenomena (Hultkrantz, 1970, pp74-75). Owen Cole defined the subject as seeking “to study religion in order to understand its place and functions as an aspect of human activity” (Cole, 1983, p81).

111. West Germany saw a questioning of the “church in school” model of the 1950s followed by new attempts at integration with life-themes and child-centred approaches in the 1960s and 70s, and work towards formulating educational justification and philosophy for religio-education, most notably by Karl Ernst Nipkow (Sutcliffe, 1984, p363).

112. Smart himself shows openness to this softening (Smart, 1973(b), p3). Bastide takes the “understanding religion” approach to mean “sympathetic understanding” of religion together with related attitudes such as respect and empathy (Bastide, 1987, p3).

113. For instance, the internal debate in Sikhism about whether or not to have pictures of Guru Gobind Singh in Sikhism textbooks presents, for phenomenology, a dilemma on how to present Sikhism objectively. Since Sikhism itself is divided upon this point, there are no facts in this context. Smart goes some way to acknowledging this difficulty over facts (Smart, 1969, p675) and recognises dilemmas, for instance over whether the believer should always be counted as being right (Smart in (ed) Juergensmeyer, 1991, p7).

114. The problem of “representative selectivity” (Marratt in Felderhof, 1985, p88) means that every teacher or resource writer, in selecting facts about a religion, and every learner who does the same, changes that religion and thus undermines the methodological purity claimed for phenomenology.
115. See the attacks on the viability of *epoche* in Zaehner, 1970, p5. Arthur, 1986, p83, and the caricature in Hammond *et al.*, 1990, p11. Of particular importance and force is Grimmitt, 1987, pp45 and 87, where bracketing out is seen as invalidating the educational process by anaesthetising the student from any personal encounter with the religion.

116. A completely unprejudiced approach is "not only impossible but positively fatal" (van der Leeuw, 1938, p645). *Epoche* is only possible in the light of one's own experience which can never be freed from its own religious "determinateness" (ibid., p646). The supposition that "one may adopt any desired position or abandon it at will, as if it were possible to choose any Weltanschauung whatever, or to abstain provisionally from all partisanship", was "a grave error", because it prevented the investigator's complete personality engaging in the scientific task (ibid., pp645-6). To these essentially epistemological strictures he adds the religious one that the traditions "are not wares that one can spread out on a table" (ibid., pp645-6).


120. Hirst, 1974, p182ff.


125. Smart, 1973(b), p160.

126. Exactly when the tide turned is probably indefinable; but Hay's attack on the hermeneutics of suspicion in religious education processes (Hay, 1985) was an important moment.

127. Dunne argued that passing over and coming back leads to a union of the self with God, as experienced by Jesus and Gautama (Dunne, 1972, p224).
128. Fitzgerald, 1995, pp38ff. See also the application in adult fields of study (Sutherland, 1988) and the divergences over method and philosophy (Bettis, 1969).

129. Grimmitt's approach uses "depth themes" or recurring themes which are of intrinsic importance to the child (Grimmitt, 1973 and 1987). This is interpreted as very positive and a genuinely non-confessional improvement on Goldman's life themes (Bastide, 1987, pp 35-6). Although Grimmitt belongs firmly to the non-confessional tradition, he encourages the exploration of core values "within the context of a religious view of life" (Grimmitt, 1987, p132), thus anticipating elements of experiential education, despite his subsequent criticisms of it (see chapter 4).


132. Ibid., p57.

133. Ibid., pp26-27.

134. See Otto, 1923.


136. Robinson (1977), Hardy (1979) and Hay (1982, 1987) were particularly influential.

137. Enger, 1992, p444. Enger described the experiential dimension as that "scarlet thread" of religious life, without which no other dimension could exist (ibid., p435).

138. At its best, this discussion saw spirituality as another name for religious experience: not restrictive, but open, global and pluralistic (King in (ed) Felderhof, 1985, p99).


141. Hammond et al, 1990, popularised the approach and fended off criticisms of crypto-confessionalism (ibid., pp6 and 16); books on artefacts (Gateshill and Thompson, 1993) and spiritual awareness techniques (Stone, 1995) furthered its practical application.
142. SCAA, 1994(a), Model Syllabuses 1 and 2, p11. The apparent support for experiential perspectives was given more substance by SCAA’s public discussion of spiritual and moral development (SCAA, 1995). The balance of cognitive and experiential is also seen in county Agreed Syllabuses: “Religious Heritage and Personal Quest” (Berkshire, 1990); “Expectations and Experiences” (Gateshead, 1992); “Coming Alive” (Dorset, 1994).

143. SCAA, 1994(a), model 1, pp14ff; model 2, pp9ff.


146. This year marked the publication of the Millar report on moral and religious education, charged with reviewing current practice and making recommendations for improvement (Scottish Office, 1972, p5).

147. It is of interest, though not great relevance here, to speculate on the question of why the phenomenological approach was so much less widely and persistently implemented in Scotland than in England. Historical and political reasons associated with the relative influence, in the two countries, of universities and church, may be a factor; so might the smaller size and relative homogeneity of the Scottish education system.

148. Millar uses the phrase “religious education” throughout, only referring to the previous provision of “instruction” (Scottish Office, 1972, paras 1.1, 1.2, 1.3).


150. Millar indicated the subject’s future direction, with its recommendations on establishing and staffing R.E. departments (Scottish Office, 1972, section 5), supporting them with an advisorate and a curriculum development framework (ibid., section 7), and supervising the subject officially (ibid., paras 8.5 and 8.6). Thus in 1974, the Scottish Consultative Committee On Religious Education (SCCORE) was set up as a subcommittee of the then Consultative Council on the Curriculum, and took over control of the subject from the Scottish Joint Committee on Religious Education. The latter’s membership was and remains a combining of churches, trade unions and professional bodies in an essentially voluntary co-operation; SCCORE, by contrast, came under an arm of government. The change
in educational status was clear.

151. Smith, 1969, p68. He called for an experiential element in which "the personal search for meaning" was balanced with the objective study of the phenomena of religion to produce a "dialogue with experience" and a "dialogue with living religions", the one reinforcing and interpreting the other (ibid., p43). This anticipated English experiential work by more than a decade and the SCAA-based balance of "learning about" and "learning from" by twenty-five years. Here, perhaps, lies another root cause of Scotland's distinctive capacity for convergence.


154. SCCORE Bulletin 2, 1981, p1; see also the first aim, ibid., pp2-3.


157. S.O.E.D., 1992, National Guidelines: Religious and Moral Education 5-14. Here a balance was kept between cognitive information on world religions and reflective work on the personal search, reflected in the targets (ibid., pp8ff). By contrast, England's historical and contemporary documentation on the moral mode is separate (McPhail, 1972; School Curriculum and Assessment Authority, 1995).

158. The inspectors deal with "religious education"; the examinable courses are in "religious studies". Even SCCORE seemed anxious at times to separate the modes (SCCORE Bulletin 1, 1978, pp6-7).

159. Sutcliffe, 1984, p223; Fairweather and MacDonald, 1992, p75.

160. Synnoetics (personal knowledge), Ethics (moral meanings and decisions) and Synoptics ("comprehensively integrated" areas such as history, religion and philosophy, which "gather up the entire range of meanings" (Phenix, 1964, pp6-8).

161. Ibid., pp6-8.
162. Rodger, 1992(a) and (b).

163. Rodger, 1994(a) and 1994(b) pp2-3.

164. Five years before a similar balance was struck by SCAA, the subject in Scotland was defined officially as "two distinct but interlinked areas of activity; the study of religion and the associated development of religious awareness" (S.C.C.C., 1989, p30).

165. In chapter 5, I discuss the impact of some English developments including denominational resources. The Westhill Project material (Read et al., 1989) and the experiential handbook (Hammond et al., 1990) are two resources widely used in Scotland. But this has not upset the balanced rationale of Scottish provision.

166. My analysis of Scottish examination courses in chapter 5 uncovers epistemological meeting-points between the two models.

167. "Marrying out" provides one example of the clash of patterns for Jews (Bunting, 1996); secularisation is a comparable issue for Muslims (Shamsavari, Saqueb and Halstead in Tulasiewicz and To, 1993, p159).


172. Historical Islamic scholarship's ambiguity towards the west is documented in Watt, 1962, pp91ff; see also Hewer, 1992, p307.


176. This was most powerfully expressed by a leading Jew at the launch of the SCAA model syllabuses: "I speak on behalf of a people which for nearly four thousand years has lived on the precipice of instability, never knowing when the next expulsion or persecution would come. How did Jews survive? By
obeying the Bible's command to teach our faith diligently to our children, and by predicking our entire continuity on Religious Education" (Sacks, 1994).


184. Coverage of Judaism has been criticised as "inadequate", "superficial" and "highly suspect" (Strathclyde, 1981, p73); "most Jewish parents" are sensitive about the fear of Christian indoctrination in school (Cox and Cairns, 1989, p94). Strong feeling is reported in Glasgow regarding the handling of Islam by non-Muslim teachers where Muslim pupils are involved (Strathclyde, 1981, p74).


187. Difficulties about Jewish children learning other faiths are reported in Stratchclyde, 1981, p73.

188. Halstead offers four "models" of Islamic education in Britain and other secular states, as follows: Assimilationism, Liberal multi-culturalism, Islamic participation, and Isolationism. He argues that the second of these is on offer from most education authorities, but is unacceptable to Muslim parents because it involves a common form of multi-faith R.E. for all pupils (Halstead in Tulasiewicz and To, 1993, pp165ff). As an alternative, Muslim parents are relying on the supplementary Madrasah schools system, many of them seeing these schools as a second-best to establishing their own system of full-time schools (p171). Muslims also think in terms of adapting national curricular frameworks with content that suits their beliefs, or - more radically - of beginning with
an Islamic framework and within that incorporating aspects of the National Curriculum (Parker-Jenkins, 1994).


190. See, for instance, Radhakrishnan on education as not only the training of the intellect but the refinement of the heart and the discipline of the spirit (Sebaly in Tulasiewicz and To, 1993, p37).

191. For example, the Jewish plans to evaluate their own schools' curriculum include criteria on pupils' responses to Jewish values throughout the curriculum (Rosenberg, 1996, paras 3.1 (a) and (b)). At that time, Rosenberg was also involved in work towards SCAA definitions of spiritual and moral development (SCAA, 1995, 1996).


193. Jewish, Muslim, Hindu, Buddhist and Sikh representatives had been delegated by their communities to help SCAA shape the syllabuses. Typical among the comments is Khan-Cheema's description of the syllabuses as a "major positive step forward" (Khan-Cheema, 1994). Although the intensity of support varies, all speeches offer support for the syllabuses. Much earlier, the Sikh community in Glasgow reported no objection to its own pupils widening their knowledge through study of other world religions; nor did they object to the teaching of Sikhism, provided that this was done objectively (Strathclyde, 1981, p75).


195. Christian education (which includes Roman Catholic religious education) is defined as a sub-set of generic Religious Education in McBrien, 1977, p28 and Fig 4.1.


197. "One cannot intelligently and freely practice any religion today without some understanding of the other (religions), some backdrop of comparison." (Moran, 1989, p 230). See also my discussion of the development of confessional programmes in England in the 1980s (above, main text).
198. See chapter 5 for my analysis of this. Lafferty, 1992. analyses parental attitudes and educational positions regarding denominational schooling in Scotland.


201. "To know one religious tradition well is more illuminating than to know several slightly" (Eric Sharpe, "The One and The Many" in Smart and Horder (eds) 1975, p198).

202. The importance of personal meaning over factual knowledge is highlighted by the despairing cry of the Scottish pupil, "But what has this (a project on Hinduism) got to do with me?" (Kincaid, 1991, preface). This eloquent question implies a need to link epistemology with anthropology, a connection I explore further in chapters 3, 4 and 6. It also implies a thirst for a non-confessional form of knowledge uniting the informational with the emotional; Groome’s word for this form of knowledge, "conation", is discussed in chapter 4.


204. Attfield, 1993, p42.

205. A phenomenon I call cultural Christianity, an expression of nostalgia for a sense of Christian nationhood combined with a distaste for multi-culturalism, is discussed in chapter 5.

206. Grimmitt's "transformational" curriculum (Grimmitt, 1987, p138) may be placed alongside Groome’s fifth movement of shared Christian praxis, wherein participants have opportunities to take decisions affecting life (Groome, 1991, p266).

Footnotes to Chapter 3

2. Ibid., p127-8.
3. Ibid., p128.
4. Ibid., p131.
5. Ibid., p131.
6. Ibid., pp132-3.
7. Ibid., p133ff.
10. The resemblance to Schools Council Working Paper No. 36 is seen in the insistence on both the objective study of religion and the search for meaning (Schools Council, 1971, p43).
15. Ibid., pp98ff. These are Pierre Babin’s animation culturelle; Moran’s critique of catechesis as "intramural"; Joseph Colomb’s similar critique focusing on language; Sacramentum Mundi’s assertion that "a system of schooling that teaches a particular world view clearly fails to educate"; and the Medellin conference’s placing of catechesis within historical and social context. It is surprising that Rummery does not draw out the liberative theme in this and the other examples he gives.
17. See my discussion of Watson in main text below.
21. Rummery worked with Smart at Lancaster University on Schools Council Working Paper No. 36.
22. The ILEA no longer exists, neither does the Schools Council: and SCAA's model syllabuses have provided in England a template for development much as 5-14 and other initiatives have done in Scotland.
24. Ibid., p166.
25. Ibid., p169.
27. In my chapter on evidence of practical convergence (chapter 5), I demonstrate that a variation on selectivity is happening in Scotland.
28. Rummery supplies no governing categories for a theoretical base corresponding to my anthropology, epistemology and religion. His discussion focuses on models rather than on philosophy. For this reason, it is not appropriate to analyse his thinking in terms of my three categories.
29. See fn 15 above.
31. Ibid., p188. John Hull confirms and develops this point in his discussion of teachers' intentions (Hull, 1984, p222); Palmer and Rodger provide Christian theological reflection on it in ways which support Rummery's decision (Palmer, 1991, p54; Rodger, 1982, p121).
32. Rummery, 1975, p176. Rummery was followed, in later years, by another Australian religious educator calling for a "creative divorce" between catechesis and confessional R.E. (Rossiter, 1982). Both thinkers saw the separation as a necessary loosening of ties and a sine qua non of any convergence with non-confessional efforts.

34. Ibid., p185ff.

35. My own professional experience sheds some light on this. As a trainer sending non-confessional student teachers into placements in confessional schools in Scotland in the period 1992-1994, I discovered some openness and willingness to allow the student freedom to handle material equivalent to Rummery's model 2, model 3 and even in some rare cases model 1. However, my experience as a departmental head in a confessional school has revealed a very strong resistance to letting such open arrangements become permanent. This remains a sensitive area and one in which, by its nature, no hard data are available. Perhaps its most sensitive aspect is the questions of the objective treatment of Christianity as one world religion among others; this is dealt with by Rodger (Rodger, 1982, pp122ff). In my view it is unlikely that Rummery's principle would work both ways.


38. Rummery, 1975, p177.

39. See, for example, Rodger, 1992 (a) and (b); 1994 (a) and (b)).


41. Ibid., p191.

42. Ibid., p191.

43. Ibid., pp192-3.

44. See my section on Moran (main text below).


46. Most teaching, he argues, is not a teaching of words but a teaching of activities (Moran, 1989, pp80-1); his epistemology is oriented towards behavioural outcomes of a liberating character, much as Groome's is. Elsewhere he argues that adult education has liberating potential (Moran, 1979, p7).

47. This reflects the four life stages of Hinduism and the four seasons of Levinson (Levinson, 1978).
48. Moran, 1989, p76. This epistemological position between objectivity and commitment is reminiscent of Hulmes' discussion (Hulmes, 1979).


50. See my discussion of SCCORE, COPE and other relevant documents in chapter 5.

51. Faith is important in education: discussing the British non-confessional tendency to define religious education in contrast to, or apart from, faith, he regrets "a loss for education in general, (and for) religious education in particular" (Moran, 1989, pp108-9).

52. See above in this chapter.

53. See chapter 2.


55. Ibid., p47.

56. Ibid., pp47-48.

57. Ibid., p108.

58. Ibid., p48. By this he means Jews teaching Catholicism or, presumably, Hindus teaching Islam.


62. Ibid., p211.

63. Ibid., pp210-211.

64. Ibid.

65. Ibid., p41. See also Hull in Astley and Day, 1992, p209; and Hull, 1984, p180.

66. Hull, 1993, para 1. This point, while valid, does not take account of the concerns of Muslim parents rejecting multi-faith religious education.

71. Ibid., p284.
72. Ibid., p279.
73. He criticises the "arid factuality" of some religious education in the 1960s and 1970s (Hull, 1982, pxiiv).
76. Ibid., p194.
77. Ibid., p211.
78. Hull is not alone in seeing a dichotomy between critical openness and Christian educational intention. McKenzie addresses it as examination versus reception (McKenzie, 1982, p36); Nipkow, borrowing phrases from Hans Urs von Balthasar, expresses it as "sitting theology" as distinct from "kneeling theology" (quoted in Astley, 1994, p79); and for Theissen, it is a tension between autonomy and authority (Theissen, 1993, p219), and between critical creative thinking and initiation (ibid., p272). I conclude that the tension between critical and formative impulses in education is well attested to by contemporaries.
79. Theissen argues that the teacher's role in nurture should be to model the virtue of being open-minded and critical about her own beliefs, and that this will be variable depending on the teacher's maturity (Theissen, 1993, p172).
81. This position is shared in Theissen, 1993, pp168ff, 171-2). Theissen and Astley seem to agree on the need for nurture as a prelude to, and sine qua non of, critical openness. Astley recalls R.S. Peters' quip, parodying Einstein, that "content without criticism is blind; but criticism without content is empty" (Astley, 1994, p81). The second half of the aphorism would appear to support a role for nurturing education in order to give the learner raw material and skills for critical thought. Theissen agrees: "The development of
critical openness presupposes that children have first of all been initiated into certain traditions" (Theissen, 1993, p169). Astley further argues that critical education must, by its nature and for its survival, always behave formatively when giving the learner critical skills and attitudes (Astley, 1994, pp85-6). These points combine to remove any sense of blame or accusation from the debate, introducing instead a sense that the two emphases need each other.

82. His main discussion of this is in parts 4 and 5 of his 1984 book, in which he uses the terms "convergence" and "divergence". By "convergence", Hull means the act of the teacher who "converges" her own beliefs with the taught content, failing to differentiate education from instruction (Hull, 1984, pp181ff). But since this use of the word "convergence" is quite different in meaning from my own, for clarity I do not use it in Hull's sense.


84. For instance, in pointing out that Christian theology usually sees Jesus inaugurating not a religion but a new humanity (Hull, 1991, p40) he attacks those who, in a discussion of religious education, would set up Christianity in contradistinction to other religions, and argues that a Christian approach to R.E. is one which, as in Peter's dream (Acts 10:10), declares all foods clean and therefore all religions acceptable (Hull, 1991(b), pp37ff).

His attack on "religionism" - a prejudice like racism or sexism - leads him to call for a deconstruction of exclusivist religious positions (Hull, 1992, pp69ff); elsewhere he argues that "loyalty to one's own faith is not inconsistent with a sympathetic insight into the faiths of others" (Hull, 1991(b), p43). (See also Haussmann, 1993, pp13-14.)

85. Hull, 1984, pp212ff. Straight away, it is possible to detect a resemblance between the four tensions, as all of them revolve round paradoxes in classical Christian theology.

86. Hull, 1984, p221.

87. Ibid., p235. He calls this absolute denial "Hirst's razor" (Ibid., p245) and claims that it contradicts Hirst's other work.

88. Ibid., p241.
Writing with a more global overview of religious education, Palmer makes a similar point, believing that Christian religious educators need a new theological model of diversity characterised by "an acceptance that God works through diversity and diversity, therefore, is part of the way of God on earth" (Palmer, 1991, p54): and that Christians must show an "integrity of intention" in which they judge all their Christocentric claims by the standard of diversity (ibid., p58).

Hull's example of these compatible forms of theology is the secular theologies of Harvey Cox and others. He traces connections between the morality of such theologians and the morality of secular education, inviting us to consider how "the seeds of secularisation of education lie within Christian faith" (Hull, 1984, p244).

Cully argues that these characteristics make process theology compatible with education (Cully, 1978, p2).

See Grey, 1989 and 1993, for examples.

John Hick provides an example of a theology which is both committed and open with his "copernican revolution" in the constellation of faiths, placing God, not Christ, at the centre (Hick, 1980, p52; 1993, pp120ff).


Hull, 1984, p222.

Astley argues that critical openness "cannot serve as a shibboleth for proper Christian religious education" and suggests it can be qualified by Christianity, to become something called "Christianly-based openness" or "Christian critical education" (Astley, 1994, p99). His suggested phrases do not trip lightly off the tongue, and are open to misunderstanding.

Hull, 1984, p222.
102. Ibid., p223.

103. See Lohan and McClure, 1988; Byrne and Malone, 1992; and my discussion of their work. in chapter 5 below.

104. See chapter 2 above.


106. Ibid., p223.

107. Ibid., p223.

108. Ibid., pp223-4.

109. Astley is not the first to see how worship has a primary and central role in people learning Christianity (Astley and Day, 1992, p150).

110. The distinctions may "make little practical difference in some situations", in his view (Hull, 1984, p224).

111. Hull, 1984, parts 4 and 5 are dedicated to this issue.


113. Ibid., p ix.

114. Ibid., pp19ff and 29ff.

115. Ibid., pp76ff.


118. Ibid., pp97ff.


120. Ibid., p126.
121. Watson, 1993, pp21-25.
122. See my discussion of Slee above in the main text of this chapter.
123. Watson, 1993, pp38ff.
124. Ibid., p38.
125. Ibid., p46.
126. Ibid., pp47-8.
127. Ibid., p48.
128. Ibid., p49.
129. Ibid., pp51-2.
131. Ibid., pp79-80. Arthur's twin critique is referred to in chapter 2 above.
133. Ibid., p475.
134. Ibid., p163.
135. Ibid., p163.
136. Arthur graphically has the learner "...walking a
tightrope strung out between the poles of settling for
unreflective (because uninformed) acceptance or
rejection of his own indigenous belief system, and
postponing indefinitely coming to any decision about
religion" (Arthur, 1982, pp439-440; see also Arthur,
C., 1995, p458). This unity of learner with content has
some similarity with Groome's concern for the
integration of epistemology and anthropology, which I
discuss in chapter 4.
139. Smart, 1973(b), p3.
141. Ibid., p355.
142. Ibid., pp478ff.
143. Ibid., p484.
144. Ibid., p489.
145. Ibid., p476.
146. Ibid., abstract.
147. Ibid., p440.
148. Ibid., p476.
149. Hill in Astley and Francis, 1994, p143.
150. Ibid., p143.
151. Ibid., p150.
152. Ibid., p149.
153. Ibid., p149.

154. Hill argues that his approach is capable of "authorising the school and the teacher to exemplify in themselves commitment to values believed to be true" (ibid., p149). This means that, in Hill's belief, this approach does nothing to weaken the specific denominational commitment of a school or a teacher. Hill lacks evidence for this claim.

The Scottish Inspectorate observes a pattern which may correspond to Hill's exemplary study. Their report suggests that pupils may deepen their awareness by discovering different views and different ways of being committed, within one faith community (S.O.E.D/H.M.I., 1994, para 2.14). If this were true in Roman Catholic schools, in the sense that their own beliefs were explored in this critical and plural way, it would open up creative possibilities. See my discussion of denominational participation in non-denominational courses (chapter 5).

155. Ibid., p149.
156. Ibid., p149.
157. Ibid., p149.


161. Ibid., pp20ff and p48: the latter is a "most unfortunate dichotomy".

162. Ibid., p12.

163. Ibid., pp56ff.

164. Wallace uses the word immersion (ibid., p62) and it is assumed that he means something corresponding to family- and faith-community-based nurture.

165. Ibid., pp62-3.

166. Ibid., p76.

167. Ibid., p52.

168. Ibid., pp64-5.

169. Ibid., p80 (his emphasis, meaning the theological understandings).


172. Ibid., p63.
Footnotes to Chapter 4

2. Ibid., p25.
4. Ibid., p12.
5. Ibid., pp19ff.
8. Ibid., p30.
9. Catechesis classically combined the three elements of content-based instruction (which was of a cognitive nature) with liturgy (which was of a cognitive and affective nature) and attention to morals (which was of an affective and behavioural nature). This pattern of "word, care and celebration" (Sawicki, 1988, p286) is not seen in every age but accurately reflects the broad sweep of historical catechetical endeavour including its highest moments.
10. Groome, 1991, pp32-33. In contemporary confessional circles, Groome is not alone in his epistemology. The "door of entry" for faith is not the mind but the heart (Nebraska, p69); Pope John Paul II acknowledges the weakness of methods based solely on memorisation and assimilation, and he calls for a judicious balance of reflection and spontaneity, dialogue and silence (Pope John Paul II, 1979, p50). He identifies, as one essential condition of successful catechesis, that there must be an aim to give "a better knowledge of the mysteries of Christ, aimed at true conversion and a life more in conformity with God's will" (ibid., p46). Implicit in his statement is a plea for the catechists to attend to mind, heart and will.
11. His epistemology points out the deficiencies of enlightenment-based "disembodied knowing" which leads to "forgetfulness of being" (Groome, 1991, pp61-62) and, in our times, to technical rationality and the threats posed by nuclear and other technologies (ibid., pp81-83).
12. Ontology asks questions about being and humanity, and corresponds to my category of anthropology.


15. Ibid., pp77ff.


22. Ibid., p20.

23. Ibid., pp43ff.

24. Ibid., pp92ff.

25. Ibid., p50.


27. Ibid., pp68ff. His discussion of this area corresponds with my analytical category of anthropology.

28. Ibid., pp143ff.

29. Ibid., pp265ff.

30. Hull might seem a prime non-confessionalist candidate to place in the ring with Groome. But Hull increasingly makes his own Christian commitment visible in his work (Hull, 1991(a); 1995; 1996) whereas Grimmitt's rationale is secular (Grimmitt, 1987, pp20ff). Again, whereas Hull is critical of Hirst (Hull, 1984, pp229ff), Grimmitt stands with him on the value of the curriculum and forms of knowledge. Hull has already been discussed (see chapter 3 above); for purposes of finding a positive, strongly non-confessional contrast to Groome, Grimmitt had the edge.

Moreover, in a secular plural society some people will be "humanised" or influenced by that very plurality, so that they live "in the cracks" (ibid., p123) between belief-systems, shaped by the ambiguity and inconsistency which that brings. Confessionalists such as Westerhoff warn that such an existence has its dangers, and that general movement and growth towards autonomy is not sufficient: "a society founded on autonomy is destined to suffer from... anomie" (Westerhoff in (ed) Felderhoh, 1985, p57). People in society therefore need not only openness, but also identity: "unless a person knows who he or she is and feels good about that self, he or she cannot be truly open to others" (ibid., p57).

The plural society is itself in the grip of very powerful myths about the nature of humanity as secular and modern (Grimmitt 1987, p117). To make any anthropology conditional on wide acceptance within such a society presents a major challenge, perhaps an impossible one, with the reality of a plurality so wide that it has been long accepted that state schools live in a post-Christian society and cannot, on their own, offer a vision or way of life which unifies the community or society (Smith, 1969, p68). This pessimism is reflected from a very different source, that of a man serving sentence for robbery and assault: "There is no set of applied rules, no common cause to hold us together, no one to look up to. Each chooses his own way. There is no glue to hold the youth, no sense of belonging to an extended family" (Observer, 1988, quoted in Cox and Cairns 1989, p68). This frightening picture of a society unhinged from any cohesive sense of meaning or value tends to support Grimmitt's reservations.

33. Grimmitt, 1987, p136. For him, promoting religious consciousness is distinct from promoting consciousness of religion. While there may only be shades of difference between the two, only the latter is legitimate (ibid., p137). Religious consciousness involves a framework of meaning which can only be created and sustained in the context of a community of religious faith (ibid., p136). He also places skills relating to the formation of attitudes (which he calls "applied religion") must come after knowledge and understanding ("pure religion") (ibid., p263.) In relation to the SCAA attainment targets (SCAA, 1994, p6) this would place "learning from religion" either outside legitimate classroom R.E. altogether, or else (and at best) as second to and conditional upon "learning about religions".
34. See chapter 2 above for a fuller discussion of Grimmitt's critique of phenomenology.


36. Ibid., p45.

37. Ibid., p137.

38. Ibid., p44.

39. These papers include commissioned work on values education (Rodger, 1992(a) and (b)), unpublished addresses (Rodger, 1993 and 1994(c)), and two articles in the *Scottish Journal of Religious Education* (Rodger, 1994(a) and 1994(b)).


42. Rodger, 1994(a).

43. Rodger, 1992(a) and (b).

44. Rodger, 1982, pix.

45. Ibid., p135.

46. Ibid., p135.

47. Ibid., p51.


49. Ibid., p50.

50. He does use the word convergence, but only in the sense that religious education and moral education have a convergence at the point where the justification of morality is sought (Rodger, 1982, p150).

51. I have already argued, in Fn 12 above, that Groome's category of ontology corresponds with mine of anthropology. I discuss his theory of being and his views of the learner in this category.

52. Of his theoretical framework, the most developed aspect is his theory of conation, which falls into my epistemological category. But this theory is itself underpinned by what Groome believes about humanity and being.
53. The paper was given to a conference entitled "The Contemporary Catholic School and the Common Good" in Cambridge, England, in 1993.


55. Grimmitt, 1987, p215. To underline his view, Grimmitt compares and contrasts Islamic and western secular principles of humanity, society and education (ibid., p47).


57. Ibid., p18.

58. Ibid., p3.

59. Ibid., p3.

60. He cites Genesis 1:27 and the Council of Trent. He could also appropriately have used and developed the theological models of Thomas Aquinas or Teilhard de Chardin.


62. Kung uses a variety of sources in his description of human nature. His "Humanum" harmonises much religious and secular thinking, and "represents a point of Convergence in the great religions" (Kung, 1990, p117) along ethical lines suggested by, among others, Jesus of Nazareth, Rabbi Hillel, K'ung Fu-Tse, and Immanuel Kant, and according to other guiding lights such as the 1948 Universal Declaration of Human Rights, the 1970 Declaration of the Japan Conference of Religions for Peace, and the 1993 Declaration on Global Ethics of the World Parliament of Religions. The U.N. declaration is identified also by Grimmitt as an indicator of core values in a plural society (Grimmitt, 1987, p135).

The 1970 declaration of the Japan Conference of Religions for Peace is quoted by Kung as an example of his vision of the "Humanum", and may serve also as evidence for convergence in anthropological thinking within, between and even beyond the religions. The conference announced its belief in:

" - a conviction of the fundamental unity of the human family, of the equality and dignity of all men and women;
- a sense of the sacrosanctity of the individual and his or her conscience;
- a sense of the value of the human community;
- a recognition that might is not the same as right....;
- the belief that love, compassion, selflessness and the power of the mind and inner truthfulness have, in the end, more power than hatred, enmity and self-interest;
- a sense of obligation to stand on the side of the poor and oppressed;
- deep hope that good will, in the end, will triumph." (Kung, 1990, pp118-9).

67. Describing behaviourism, Grimmitt believes that it holds human beings as "passive mechanisms responding in a predictable way to their environment" (Grimmitt, 1987, p53). He concedes that it works in some educational contexts, but he is clear that this is not all that is to be said about human beings, and implies that our other qualities - he names imagination, creativity and self-awareness among others - are too important to be left out (ibid., p53). It is not assuming too much to interpret Grimmitt's view of behaviourism as negative, and to conclude that Grimmitt prefers a more positive anthropology.
68. Ibid., p72.
69. Ibid., p79.
70. Ibid., p128.
71. Many religious thinkers now openly admit that moral values are not dependent on religious beliefs. For instance, Kung follows Kant in accepting that "men and women possess a truly human autonomy... without believing in God" (Kung, 1990, p108) and that "a human being without religion can also lead a life that is genuinely humane" (ibid., p113).
A convergence of values in a plural context is noted by Midgley: "anthropologists now advise against exaggerating the diversity. Different human societies do have many deep structural elements in common... Among these, the kind of consideration and sympathy for others that is generalised by the Golden Rule." A common morality, she argues, is therefore possible, because we are naturally social beings (Midgley, 1991, quoted in Rodger, 1992(b), p33). Moreover, "the survival of any healthy society ... requires general acceptance of a significant range of fundamental values - e.g. truth telling, consideration, fairness. In such a society there will be an extensive, but not unlimited, range of acceptable values" (ibid., p29).

Heidegger, 1959, p1. It is possible that Heidegger devised this question as an attack upon the tradition of the ontological argument for God's existence, developed by Leibniz among others.

One Roman Catholic philosopher surrenders to the temptation. For Caputo, Heidegger "unearths a deeper and richer level of meaning lying beneath the surface... of western philosophy" (Caputo, 1986, p262). He sees Heidegger's vision of being as like play in that it cannot be rationalised and is without "why" (ibid., p81). In this sense, Heidegger's being is a "mystery" (ibid., p81). Human beings are caught up in this play or mystery, to such an extent that they cannot see it clearly. This inability to see being clearly is connected with mortality (ibid., p84). For Caputo, Heidegger has occupied a point of convergence in anthropology: "To my knowledge there is no more eloquent, powerful and penetrating defence of the humanity of man in the twentieth century" (ibid., p264).

82. Jung, Tr Jaffe, 1961, p413.
84. Jung, Tr Jaffe, 1961, p373.
86. Rahner, 1975, p496.
88. Otto uses a descriptive and analytical phenomenology similar to that of William James, together with critical analytical and linguistic tools, to deal with the category of holiness as experienced and understood by human beings. His work is of interest to anthropology because he can identify the numinous as a category of valuation and interpretation used by human beings (Otto, 1923, p5). Otto’s method was phenomenological, but his starting-point was theological, and he relies on Biblical and Thomist categories more than his mentor James, whose work is based more on human experience.
90. Erikson’s identification of life stages and virtues (Erikson, 1959), Evans’ spiritual interpretation of Erikson (Evans, 1979), and Maslow’s identification of needs (Maslow, 1954), are some examples of a psychological acknowledgement of otherness. 
91. Rodger, 1994(c), p1, his emphasis.
92. Ibid., p8.
94. Ibid., p30.
95. Serendipity is described as "the gift of finding valuable or agreeable things not sought for" (Grimmitt, 1987, p99).
96. Grimmitt’s favoured way of expressing this dimension is by reference to Berger’s Rumour of Angels (Grimmitt, 1987, p101).
100. Groome, 1993, p11.
102. Ibid., p17.
103. Patten, 1992, p1256.
104. See Tate, 1996, in the context of the National Forum on values in education.

106. In particular, its capacity to deliver liberative education along Groome's lines is severely hampered by its emphasis on individual responsibility and its downplaying of communal forces. This warning note is sounded by Moran, who describes as "reactionary" the view that "a moral education should turn out moral people" (Moran, 1989, p167).

111. Ibid., p123.
112. Groome, 1993, p15. This is a view which has always been supported intellectually by the Thomist tradition, which sees humanity as "an animal endowed with reason, whose supreme dignity is in the intellect" (Maritain, 1955, p63).

113. For Kleinig, "human social experience... has a self-reflective dimension which expresses itself in the rational ordering and evaluation of experience and practice" (Kleinig, 1982, p261). For this reason, it is "intelligible" and "possible" to have religion in the curriculum (ibid., p260).

114. Peters sees the individual as a centre of "valuation, decision and choice" (Peters, 1966, p 211) and ascribes this view to Kant.
115. Grimmitt is reliant on Wall’s five “selves” which develop in the adolescent and lead to maturity: physical, sexual, vocational, social, and philosophic (Grimmitt, 1987, p96).

116. See, as examples of the enlightenment tradition’s suspicion of pure reason, Carlyle’s withering dismissal of Descartes’ dictum: “Who am I?...”Cogito ergo sum”... Alas, poor cogitator, this takes us but a little way” (Carlyle, 1830, p90).

More recently, a glimmer of going beyond rationality may be found when Peters and Hirst identify “the basic structure of man as a rational animal” as only the “LCM” of anthropologies (Peters and Hirst, 1970, p56); their view of the “HCF” does not completely go beyond rationality, but “consists in developing... rational capacities to the full” (ibid., p 56). Some secular thinkers connect human rationality with the ability to think philosophically and to be open to mystery. Such growth and development is not always rational and measurable; for Holt, “birds fly, fish swim; man thinks and learns”, and this process in the mind is a “mystery” (Holt, 1968, pp188-9).

Nevertheless, this tradition is criticised heavily by Groome. See my discussion of Groome’s and others’ epistemology below in the main text of this chapter.


118. Ibid., p16.

119. Rodger supplies the example of Wynne’s “For Character” programme (Rodger, 1992(b), pp20-21. Wynne favours presentation of values and formation in them rather than discussion; although based on Lickona, the programme does not reflect the latter’s commitment to co-operative work towards healthy development in the community (Lickona, 1991, p395).


121. A religiously educated or religiously literate person is “spiritually open, aware, sensitive, honest and faithful” (Rodger, 1982, p82).

122. His work on spiritual education sees human fulfilment or flourishing as a “life work”, a way of life that is “pervasive of all aspects of the person’s living and unifies the life around one centre. It provides direction, purpose, values and a sense of meaning for the person whose life is shaped by it"
123. Grimmitt accepts that "education does things to people; it is a form of socialisation and human shaping; it is the means by which a particular model of the human being is perpetuated..." (Grimmitt, 1987, p29).

124. Asking ultimate questions "pushes our meaning-making strategies to their limits and places our taken-for-granted conception of reality under threat" (ibid., p140). Again, there is implied, but not acknowledged ontological change here.

125. Ibid., p165.

126. Ibid., p213.


129. For Rodger, education should have a freedom provision (Rodger, 1982, p39). If it is an honest educational process, it should afford the child opportunities to grow sensitively at every level of human concern (ibid., p41).


131. Ibid., p6.

132. Ibid., p10.

133. For Grimmitt "formulating and holding beliefs is an integral part" both of meaning-making and of becoming and being human (Grimmitt, 1987, p91). Straughan, echoing Mary Warnock, believes "it is educationally important that children must not be deprived of the spectacle of a teacher who holds, and clearly expresses, moral views" (Straughan, 1988, p16).

134. The human being "tends to value those objects, experiences and goals which make for his survival, growth and development, for the survival and development of others" (Carl Rogers, 1964, quoted in Rodger, 1992(b), p8).
For instance, it is felt that Kohlberg "does not explain why we should care to engage in genuine moral reasoning, nor why... we should care enough to act on it" (Kleinig, 1982, his italics, p252).

Rodger, 1994(c), p5, his emphasis.

It is so used by the genetic epistemologist Piaget (Piaget, 1972, pp1ff).


Ibid., p17.

Ibid., p32.

For instance, his assessment of the "assets and liabilities" of Plato's theory of ideal forms (ibid., p41) draws attention to the positive legacy of an awareness of a certain measure of truth which is not of human making, but also to the less positive legacy of dualism. For another example, Groome identifies the three "lives" of Aristotle - "theoria, praxis, poiesis" - as having the potential to promote conation (ibid., p46). Groome goes on to evaluate and select insights from, among others, Augustine, Aquinas, Descartes, the empirical tradition, Marx, Husserl, and existentialism.

Groome is not alone among religious philosophers in his concern for a balanced epistemology. Leslie Newbigin points to a "breakdown" of epistemology, most evident in assumptions about scientific and religious knowledge. He calls on educators to recover "the unity of human knowledge" (Newbigin in (eds) Francis and Thatcher, 1990, p98). In the level of his concern for non-cognitive forms of knowledge, Groome has been overtaken by several disciplines.

Christian philosophy sometimes concludes that subjective knowledge, of one who "feels an infinite concern for his own relationship to God in truth" has the most significance (Santoni, 1968, p228, commenting on Kiekegaard's position): Lewis and Whitely identify intuitive, affective factors as being far more dominant in typical encounters with, or expressions of, transcendent mystery (Lewis and Whitely in Santoni, 1968, pp256-265).

Religious knowing sometimes defies the cognitive domain altogether, or rather turns it on its head, as in the case of Tertullian's paradoxes about Christ...
At other times, it renounces attempts to express itself in cognitive terms (Holmer in Santoni, 1968, p246). In extreme but admirable cases, religious knowing in the experiential sense is seen as vastly superior to, and surpassing, cognitive efforts. This is especially so in mystical traditions. For instance, the mystic Al-Ghazzali is quoted as follows: "Thus I had learned what words could teach of Sufism, but what was left could be learned neither by study nor through the ears, but solely by giving oneself up to ecstasy and leading a pious life" (James, 1960 (1901-2), p388). For an example, Al-Ghazali uses the difference between knowing the definition of health and being healthy (ibid). James draws the conclusion that this sort of truth exists for the person who has the experience, but for no-one else (ibid, p391). It is purely subjective and cannot be touched by cognitive factors.

Compared with these epistemologies, Groome’s is indeed balanced.


145. Groome, 1992, p44. He believes that "people already have as existential to their being an inner structuring capacity" which fits them for whole, conative learning (Groome, 1991, p116). Human beings, as religious learners, are therefore naturally active agent-subjects, not passive receptacles. Some sources in the non-confessional tradition arguably support his concept of conation and his epistemic ontology; this is less true of the phenomenological movement, and more so of the experiential and moral education movements.

William James, a seminal figure for what later became the experiential approach, discusses the limits of merely rational methods in affecting an individual: "If we look on man’s mental life as it exists,..., we have to confess that the part of it of which rationalism can give an account is relatively superficial" (James, 1960 (1901-2), p87). Importantly and shrewdly he continues by arguing that the part explained by rationalism "has the prestige undoubtedly, for it has the loquacity, it can challenge you for proofs, and chop logic, and put you down with words. But it will fail to convince or convert you all the same" (ibid., p87). For us, James demonstrates a clear causal link between anthropology and epistemology of the same sort that Groome is anxious to make.

Straughan makes the connection through behaviour: "religious beliefs are capable of exerting a powerful
influence on how one feels and behaves towards other people... because of the distinctive view which a religion may convey of what man is" (Straughan, 1989, p87). Phenix ends his anthropological essay with an "appeal to the imagination" (Phenix, 1964, p342) in which he bemoans the mistaking of the "functional" for the "fully meaningful", a mistake which leads to the neglect, in education, of the "awakening of the inner life" (ibid., p346). Moral teaching is, he claims, "plagued by unimaginative practicality and obviousness" (ibid., p348) while religion is interpreted in a "utilitarian" fashion (ibid., p349). Both realms need to be treated in a way which allows a return to mystery (ibid., pp348-9). In essence, his anthropology has spilled over into epistemology and a critique of its imbalance.

147. Rodger, 1994(c), p41.
149. Rodger, 1982, pp82-84.
160. See, for instance, the pastoral cycle, a theological education process developed in Holland and Henriot, 1983.
162. Rodger, 1992(b), p29. As practical exemplars, he mentions (among others) Matthew Lipman and Catherine
McCall's community of inquiry approach, for its ability to improve thinking skills, reasoning, and personal development, and its capacity to alter behaviour in some cases (ibid., p17); and also Gilligan and Noddings' approach to moral education, which corrected the rather cognitive bias in Kohlberg's model and oriented learners more towards caring attitudes using story, narrative and dialogue (ibid., p23).

164. Rodger, 1992(a), p13 (his emphasis).
166. Ibid., pp32ff.
168. Ibid., pp79ff.
171. Ibid., p106.
173. Pannikar's critique of epoche is particularly strong: it is "psychologically impracticable, phenomenologically inappropriate, philosophically defective, theologically weak and religiously barren" (Pannikar, 1978, p43).
174. Ibid., pp50-51.
175. Jurgen Habermas' neo-Marxism of the Frankfurt school is a distinctive and important source (Groome in Astley and Francis, 1994, p221ff). Habermas "broadened" and "deepened" a concept of praxis to include, crucially for Groome, a self-reflective dimension based on the subject (the thinker) (ibid., p223). Habermas also broadened the action element of praxis to include more than Marx's objectified labour. For Groome, this makes Habermas' epistemology an emancipatory one, presumably in the spirit of both Jesus and Marx, and fitting well with Groome's overall concern with the reign of God and with values of justice and peace.
178. Ibid., p5.


181. Descartes’ argument from doubt to cogito, which has become a foundation of the critical tradition, was criticised in the nineteenth century (see fn 116 above) and in the present: Arblaster, 1984, p127 discusses the tendency of the western tradition to induce "anomic isolation from the world" (Arblaster, 1984, p127).


183. At the fountain-head of the empiricist tradition, Locke’s focus on knowledge as sense-experience was of importance, but is now recognised in the liberal tradition as having produced other forms of imbalance in epistemology. It had a capacity to lead to reductionism if promulgated widely through education (Arblaster, 1984, p139).

184. Polanyi, 1958, pvii.

185. Ibid., p249.

186. Ibid., p256.

187. Heidegger, 1959, p160. Groome salutes and builds on Heidegger’s attempt "to re-unite epistemology with ontology,... making the latter primary" (Groome, 1991, p 77).


190. Ibid., p160.


193. Martin in Flew and MacIntyre, 1955, p95.


195. Ibid., pp 130-131.

197. Ibid., p204.

198. Ibid., p211.

199. Ibid., p208.

200. "Text", in this passage, means more than printed works, but refers to the entire living tradition with all of its phenomena (see Groome, 1991, p216).


202. Calling to the witness stand many figures from the patristic age, including Clement, Origen and Augustine, Groome points out that from its beginning, Christianity has recognised how faith is deepened by understanding, how revelation is the completion of reason (Groome, 1992, p43).


204. Ibid., p16.


206. Freire, 1972, p53. Developers of Freire's work see this practice as in itself democratic (Faundez, 1989, p45).

207. Metz, for instance, associates the word "God" with a liberative utopia (Metz, 1980, p67); Moltmann's God of hope has "the future as his essential nature" (Moltmann, 1967, p16); but such projections of the transcendent are criticised as vague about God (Cobb, 1980) and the whole idea of secular restatements of supernatural doctrine is linguistically problematic (Van Buren, 1963, p63) and possibly unnecessary (Ibid., 1968, pp163ff).


210. His approach takes religious phenomena empirically, as displaying power, rather than as topics for evaluation (Smart and Konstantine, 1991, p29).


216. Groome, 1992, p231. The phrase "hermeneutic of retrieval" is borrowed from Tracy. (Tracy, 1987) perhaps to emphasise a post-modern use of tradition, not a traditionalist use for its own sake.

217. Groome, 1992, p232. The phrase "dangerous memory" is borrowed from Metz, 1980, p90 and indicates his characteristic liberation orientation.


222. Ibid., pp248ff.

223. Ibid., pp257ff.


228. Ibid., pp189-90.


230. SCCORE 2, 1981, p1. The same phrase has now become part of the English understanding, with the introduction of twin outcomes, "learning about religions" and "learning from religion", in the SCAA model syllabuses (SCAA, 1994, p5).

231. Groome, 1992, p236.


234. Ibid., p237.

235. This criterion may, however, sit uncomfortably
with criterion (g) (main text above) because of tensions between local and universal expressions of faith, manifested for instance in relations between Rome and liberation theologians.


237. S.O.E.D., 1992, p10

238. Rodger, 1982, p121. By Christianity, I take Rodger to mean Christian educators. This question is of importance because the treatment of Christianity as a world religion, removing its special status, is a hallmark of non-confessionalism and, if adopted in confessionalism, would make convergence reciprocal.

239. Ibid., p121.

240. Ibid., p122.

241. Ibid., p135.

242. Groome, 1991, pp191ff. Groome’s disclaimer is attractive, but it sits uncomfortably with his commitment to the reign of God as an overarching hermeneutical factor. A theory of convergence needs to bear this in mind, and to adopt as its test the harder position.


244. See my discussion of Schrag, Polanyi, Heidegger and others in the epistemology section (main text above).

245. For instance, in dealing with sacramental reconciliation participants will first be asked to explore and name their feelings about it, the frequency and nature of their use of it, or their assumptions about it. This will consist of people telling and sharing their stories and experiences. The important point is that it should be a personal statement, not a theoretical one (Groome, 1980, p208). This first, learner-centred movement is characteristic of the change from old "didactic" to new pedagogies which "honour and engage people’s own praxis" (Groome, 1991, p179).

246. Groome, 1980, p211.


248. Ibid., p188.


251. Ibid., p217. Groome's later work develops and clarifies movement four, defining it as "dialectical hermeneutics" which appropriate the Christian story and vision to that of the participants (Groome, 1991, p249ff).

252. Ibid., pp251ff.

253. This is the "ah-ha" moment when an insight is accommodated, worked on critically and re-invented by the participant (Groome, 1991, p252). For Piaget, this assimilation is a skill from concrete operations onwards, beginning with manipulation and subjection of objects through action (Piaget, 1964, 1980, p62). Subsequent research on Piaget's ideas confirmed how children take ownership of material, so that their knowledge is dynamic, "not merely a reading, but also a transformation of reality" (Firth, 1977, p65).


256. Groome, 1991, p266.

257. The fifth movement is indeed obviously Christian and confessional, because it is strongly oriented toward faith decisions which will advance the reign of God (Groome, 1991, p274). It is also, perhaps, less accessible for educators within non-confessional contexts, partly because the inheritance of liberal education theory discourages outcomes which might apparently seek to infringe personal liberty or to impose behavioural norms (Peters and Hirst, 1970, p85).

258. Movement five "reflects and promotes the hope that participants will choose, by God's grace, a response of renewed Christian praxis" (Groome, 1991, p267). Decisions will clearly be open, whether individual or communal, behavioural ("what to do") or existential ("who to become") decisions (ibid., pp267ff).
Footnotes to Chapter 5


2. He points to agreements on inspection, S.E.B. short courses, and 5-14 as examples. He suggests that "divisions between 'faith-based' and 'educational' or 'phenomenological' R.E. have never been so sharply drawn in the Catholic world as compared to non-church circles" (ibid., p21).

3. Further information on convergence attitudes could, of course, have been gleaned through extensive interviews with, say, Principal Teachers of R.E. in both sectors. This approach was not used here because of its lengthy and potentially intrusive nature, and also because it would essentially have reflected the views of individuals on convergence, when what was sought was evidence for or against systemic trends towards convergence.


5. S.O.E.D. Correspondence, 1995.

6. SCOTVEC Correspondence, 1994-5.

7. See Table 1.
8. This is done in summary here by means of a table giving very simple statements on the convergence potential of each curricular initiative, comparing the evaluation made of them in curricular terms with the evaluation in statistical, participation terms:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Resource/Course</th>
<th>Similarity in Curricular Terms</th>
<th>Denominational Participation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>R.M.E. 5-14</td>
<td>High</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weaving the Web</td>
<td>High</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standard Grade R.S.</td>
<td>Limited</td>
<td>Limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.E.B. Short Courses</td>
<td>High</td>
<td>Unknown but could be high</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Higher R.S.</td>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.S.Y.S. in R.S.</td>
<td>Very Low</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCOTVEC Modules</td>
<td>Limited</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Statistical evaluation was not applicable for 5-14 since all schools are expected to use it as a framework, either in its mainstream or in the denominational form.

Statistical evaluation of the use of Weaving the Web in Scotland was impossible without contacting Principal Teachers in schools, a method discussed and rejected (see fn 3 above). However, my experience as a Principal Teacher during some of this period leaves me to believe that use of the series was limited to one or perhaps two denominational schools.

The Scottish Examination Board was unable to provide any statistical information about use of the short courses based on school and sector. The global figures for the five years were provided and an attempt has been made to interpret them (see main text and footnote 63 below). The rest of the figures are briefly discussed in footnote 9 below.
9. Congruence between curricular similarity and denominational participation is clear: for instance, where a non-confessional examination course such as C.S.Y.S. offers little that is similar or attractive to the confessional vision, participation reflects this. In one case, that of the SCOTVEC modules, there is limited similarity in terms of curricular rationale, but a high denominational participation, for reasons which are analysed. In no case does curricular similarity fail to be matched by an equivalent or greater level of denominational participation. This pattern suggests a sense of purpose and choice in denominational participation.


14. H.M.I. began with a view that non-confessional religious education ought to emulate its confessional counterpart (S.E.D./H.M.I., 1986), and moved to recognition of a uniting overall set of aims with confessional approach embracing these aims but going further with additional aims (S.O.E.D./H.M.I., 1994).

15. Faith and Learning (C.E.C.S, 1992) is the official school development programme for Roman Catholic schools in Scotland.

16. Distinctiveness is stressed through an unmistakeably strong emphasis on the faith aspect of the school. Roman Catholic schools are seen as part of the church's evangelising mission, and it is this mission which gives the schools their distinctive character (C.E.C.S., 1992, Introduction p1). This distinctiveness is important in a social context of secular forces and a cultural scene dominated by individualism, consumerism and materialism (ibid., p2). This climate, at times indifferent and at other times hostile, increases the need for Roman Catholic schools as a genuine alternative to other forms of schooling (ibid., p2).

But the document also stresses how denominational schools participate in the wider education system, absorbing positive aspects of the Scottish educational tradition and being ready to respond to radical curricular and organisational changes (ibid., p1).
Two emphases, therefore, co-exist. The first suggests a vision of divergence and separateness, even alienation from the surrounding secular culture and educational mores: the second suggests convergence and cooperation. The document seeks "to effect a fusion" of the emphases (ibid., p2) by which secular teaching will be infused with religious awareness. There is no discussion of the terms secular and religious, nor of how they might overlap or relate to each other. Despite its wish for a fusion, the document tends to lean towards distinctiveness, and uses this word frequently.

17. The aims of the Faith and Learning Programme are:

"1. To affirm the principles upon which Catholic schools are founded

2. To assist the Catholic community to a clearer understanding of the purpose of the Catholic school and its distinctive character among other educational establishments

3. To provide a forum wherein the Catholic aspects of the school may be discussed, evaluated and developed

4. To assist Catholic schools to analyse realistically their present situation and to provide guidelines for planning improvement

5. To propose practices and activities which could enhance the Catholic identity of the school

6. To help senior management and School Boards understand the uniqueness of their educational responsibilities in the Catholic school" (C.E.C.S, 1992, p3).

The second, fifth and sixth aims emphasise the difference of a Roman Catholic school, using words such as "distinctive", "identity" and "uniqueness". Since these developmental programme aims stress distinctiveness, the corresponding criteria for successful R.E. may be expected to reflect a divergent mentality.

18. Module 2 of the programme, entitled "Faith Development", sets out the criteria for religious education as one aspect of faith development. The other two aspects are Chaplaincy and Curriculum Permeation.

The thirteen criteria for successful religious education are as follows:
A planned progressive religious education curriculum gives direction to religious teaching in the school.

The religious education curriculum is approved and adheres to current church teaching and the Catholic Christian tradition.

The religious education curriculum makes provision for:

- scripture
- doctrine
- Christian morality
- liturgy and Sacraments
- prayer and worship
- social teaching
- traditions of the church.

The religious education curriculum provides an appropriate balance of knowledge, skills and values.

Contents, materials and methods in religious education are suited to the ability and readiness of pupils.

Individual and group progress in class are regularly monitored and assessed.

Religious education teaching is positively resourced in terms of recommended time allocations, finance, accommodation and staffing.

A structure exists within the school for the effective co-ordination and development of the religious education curriculum and resources.

Religious education teachers are knowledgeable about current church teaching.

Religious education is an integral feature of the schools' staff development programme and activities.

Religious education teachers work closely with and are supported by diocesan advisers.
Opportunities exist for parents to become involved in the school's religious education programme.

Local priests are involved in the school's religious education programme and in other appropriate ways" (C.E.C.S. 1992, Faith Development, pp4-5). As in all aspects, space is provided for extra criteria, allowing the school to adapt the programme to its needs.

19. These criteria (1, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, and 10) cover aspects such as planning, outcomes, pupils' needs, assessment, resourcing and management.

Two detailed comments may be made about this type. It includes in the sixth criterion an unambiguous statement in favour of assessment in religious education. Up until only a few years before, this was a moot point among confessionalists; but the Commission has decided the matter clearly in a direction which agrees with non-confessional thinking.

The fourth criterion calls for a balance of knowledge, skills and values. This choice of outcomes accords broadly with non-confessional thinking as expressed in the aims of 5-14 (S.O.E.D, 1992, p2) except for the exclusion of the words beliefs and attitudes, which might in some minds be included in values, and the words understanding and investigation, which are distinctive enough in meaning from knowledge to warrant their own inclusion if they were intended. Also excluded is the mention of personal search and critical evaluation. These are not serious omissions when it is considered that the sixth criterion is not intended as an aim, and was published in the same year as 5-14, making it unlikely that any opportunity arose to take 5-14 into account. Qualified by these two comments, we may say that seven out of the thirteen criteria are consistent with non-confessional values.

20. Criteria 2 and 3 deal with content. The balance can be seen in the attention paid to disputed issues. The inclusion of the word "current" (ibid., p4) perhaps suggests that teaching should not be out of date (for instance, in relation to social teaching), neither should it anticipate developments (for example, the ordination of women) that have not taken place. It is a call to teachers to adhere to the magisterium of the church as presently expressed, falling prey neither to reaction nor to hopes considered inappropriate. This is matched by the ninth criterion, a requirement that
teachers should be abreast of "current" church teaching (ibid., p4).

Broad areas of content do not include world religions. These are not explicitly excluded, and are specifically included in the Commission's denominational 5-14 guidelines of two years later (C.E.C.S. 1994). This represents either a failure to be consistent or a development towards convergence in response to a non-confessional initiative. Alternatively, the omission of world religions here may simply reflect a focusing on Roman Catholic distinctiveness, as would be expected in the programme.

A disagreement over content areas does not, in itself, represent a serious obstacle to convergence. Content varies between all schools and is not prescribed nationally. As long as confessional communities do not exclude aspects of content, they may still be said to hold broad content areas in common.

21. Religious education's relationship with the wider church is alluded to in Criteria 9, 11, 12 and 13.

22. But two qualifications exist. First, see the attempts of the Committee On Primary Education (COPE, 1985(a) and 1985(b) to establish a rationale and content for home-school-community links, including the church. Second, see McDonald, 1987, and McDonald in Francis et al, 1984, for findings on chaplaincy indicating a positive educational role for chaplains in non-denominational schools. Even here, however, there is no authentic replacement for the sense of communion and authority emphasised so deeply by Catholic theology. Perhaps it is impossible to find full convergence in this aspect.


24. S.O.E.D., 1992, pl. Moral education was further defined as the development of "responsible attitudes towards others, and skills of moral judgement" (ibid., p1).

25. The SCCORE rationale is influential:

"Religious education is concerned with the development of the understanding of religion as a significant area of human experience....(it is also) the pupil's own search for meaning, value and purpose in life" (SCCORE, 1981, p1).

451
The indebtedness of 5-14 to the ideas of SCCORE is clearly seen in the identical phraseology ("religion as a significant area of human experience....meaning, value, life").

26. Grimmitt's dimensional and existential approaches (Grimmitt, 1973, pp88 and 49) can claim to be influential on the identification of some strands (S.O.E.D., 1992, pp8-11) and the personal search outcome (ibid., pp12-13). Several strands bear close resemblance to Smart's dimensions (Smart, 1968, 1989).

27. In 5-14, religious and moral education aims to help pupils to:

"develop a knowledge and understanding of Christianity and other world religions and to recognise religion as an important expression of human experience;

appreciate moral values such as honesty, liberty, justice, fairness and concern for others;

investigate and understand the questions and answers that religions can offer about the nature and meaning of life;

develop their own beliefs, attitudes, moral values and practices through a process of personal search, discovery and critical evaluation" (S.O.E.D, 1992, p2).

Indebtedness to SCCORE is again seen. SCCORE-based R.E. aims:

(a) to help pupils to identify the area of religion in terms of the phenomena of religion and the human experiences from which they arise

(b) to enable pupils to explore the nature and meaning of existence in relation to the questions religions pose and the answers they propose

(c) to encourage pupils to develop a consistent set of beliefs, attitudes and practices which are the result of a personal process of growth, search and discovery" (SCCORE, 1981, p3).

Here we see a pattern of similarity, but in this case 5-14 has developed the earlier SCCORE thinking. 5-14 simplifies the first aim by removing the word "phenomena", perhaps wishing to distance itself from
aspects of phenomenology which had come under criticism (see chapter 2 above). 5-14 introduces a new second aim relating to appreciation of moral values, something not seen in the SCCORE aims. The third aim of 5-14 corresponds very closely to the second in SCCORE. The fourth aim of 5-14 develops the third in SCCORE by adding moral values and by introducing critical evaluation as a process.

Clearly then, 5-14 rests on earlier non-confessional foundations and develops them, especially through its interest in moral education.


30. Ibid., p1. Evangelisation takes place "in a formal and explicit way in R.E. lessons, but is reflected in all aspects of the school community"; it should be done in a way that "upholds the dignity of the individual and respects the living experience of all members of its community" (ibid., pp1-2).

31. Ibid., p1. The final section (ibid., pp89-93), dealing with staff development, chaplaincy and community links, emphasises the church connection again and is more developed than in the mainstream document.


33. The seven aims of R.E. in the Roman Catholic 5-14 document are to help pupils to:

"know, love and worship God as Father, Son and Holy Spirit, and to know and love Jesus Christ and his Gospel;

know and understand the doctrinal and moral teachings of the Catholic church, which flow from the revelation of Jesus Christ;

develop their faith in the light of Scripture, Tradition and the teaching of the Church;

accept Christian moral values and live by them;

investigate and understand the meaning and purpose of life, with the guidance of the Scriptures and the Tradition of the Catholic Church;
acquire an appreciation of other Christian traditions:

acquire an appreciation of some other World Faiths through an appropriate knowledge of their principal beliefs, spiritual values and traditions" (C.E.C.S./S.O.E.D., 1994, p3).

In contrast to the mainstream document, these aims are largely Catholic and doctrinal. Aims 1 to 5 are substantially different. Aim 1 corresponds only to the phrase "develop a knowledge and understanding of Christianity", in the first aim of the mainstream document. Aim 3 corresponds only to the phrase "develop their own beliefs" in aim 4 of the mainstream document. Aim 5 corresponds only to the phrase "investigate and understand" in aim 4 of the mainstream document. Aims 2 and 4 are a very long way from the phrase "appreciate moral values" in aim 2 of the mainstream document. The sixth aim is presumably necessary because it is not implied in the first; this implication alone reveals a lacuna in the ecumenical imagination of the authors. The seventh aim corresponds to the "other world religions" in mainstream aim 1, but knowledge and understanding is replaced with "appreciation", and knowledge to be acquired is qualified with the word "appropriate". The entire list of aims is thickly hedged about with the words Catholic, Christian, Church, Scripture and Tradition, suggesting that all knowledge and understanding should be qualified by them and placed within these limits.

34. C.E.C.S., 1992, pp4-5.
41. These syllabuses, Weaving the Web and Here I Am, are referred to and discussed elsewhere in this chapter. For a list of educational aims in a denominational secondary school context, see Weaving the Web's teacher's book, Lohan and McClure, 1988(a), pp10ff.
42. In Christianity, the beliefs strand is taken out and a new strand - "Sacraments" - is placed before Celebrations (C.E.C.S./S.O.E.D., 1994, pp10-11). In Other World Religions, there are four strands only, the Beliefs strand being taken out (ibid., pp12-13). In the case of both Christianity and Other World Religions, several of the Beliefs attainment targets are redistributed in other strands. In Personal Search, the three strands become four. The Natural World becomes Awareness of Creation; Relationships & Moral Values becomes Awareness of Others; Ultimate Questions becomes Awareness of God; and the new strand is Self-Awareness (ibid., pp14-15).

In Other World Religions, the earliest pupil level (Level A) prefaxes targets with the phrase "where appropriate in the local context" (ibid., p12). This phrase appears in some targets of Other World Religions in the mainstream document also (ibid., p10). The document explains the phrase thus: "If there are pupils from world religions other than Christianity in a class, it would be important to acknowledge, where possible, the major festivals which these children celebrate in their faith communities" (ibid., p56). The phrase occurs only at Level A, being omitted from Level B onwards. This may be taken to imply that from Level B onwards, Roman Catholic pupils ought to learn about world religions regardless of their class make-up.

43. The attainment targets in the mainstream guidelines (S.O.E.D., 1992) and denominational guidelines (C.E.C.S./S.O.E.D., 1994) are numerically compared here.

**Christianity**

1992 targets: 59  
1994 targets: 83  
Targets unchanged in 1994 document: 9

**Other World Religions**

1992 targets: 35  
1994 targets: 27  
Targets unchanged in 1994 document: 18

**Personal Search**

1992 targets: 34  
1994 targets: 50  
Targets unchanged in 1994 document: 11
44. In Christianity, the denominational document has substantially more attainment targets. The number of targets with more or less the same wording as the mainstream document, and for the same level, is 9. The majority of the targets are worded in explicitly Christian theological language, with more precision, e.g. about Jesus, Mary, particular sacraments and practices (C.E.C.S./S.O.E.D., 1994, pp10-11).

45. Both documents contain fewer targets for Other World Religions than for Christianity. But when we examine Other World Religions, we see that the denominational document has accepted, more or less verbatim and at the same level, a higher proportion of Other World Religions targets than of Christianity targets. This indicates that, consciously or not, the Catholic writers were more happy to accept and be led by the mainstream document when it dealt with the relatively unfamiliar territory of other world religions, and less happy to do so when Christianity was at stake.

46. In Personal Search, the denominational guidelines contain more targets. The number of targets with more or less the same wording as the mainstream, and for the same level, is 11. There are two main differences. First, several new denominational targets are oriented to personal development of the pupil and coincide largely with Personal and Social Development 5-14 (S.O.E.D., 1993) especially in the strand named Self-Awareness. The other difference is that the denominational targets are usually geared to Christian or at least theistic belief, whereas in the mainstream document they tended to be open-ended. For instance, mainstream "Recognise that there are different points of view" (Levels C-D; S.O.E.D., 1992, pp12-13) becomes denominational "Recognise that there are different ways of understanding God" (Level D; C.E.C.S./S.O.E.D., 1994, p15). Missing from the denominational document are: application of moral principles to prejudice issues (Level E); and awareness of and concern for the needs of others in society, e.g. through the work of charities (Level D). As with the omissions from Other World Religions, there is no discernible reason or pattern behind these omissions (ibid., 1994, pp14-15).


49. Here, the aim of religious education is "to promote knowledge and understanding of the Catholic faith, its relevance to the ultimate questions of life, and the
skills required to engage in religious thinking" (National Board, 1994, p7). Epistemologically, this statement is dominated by cognitive processes and marginalises personal or affective knowledge. Religious education is seen as a closed and content-driven exercise, taking the universal catechism as its reference point (ibid., p8). Respect for other faith traditions is mentioned (ibid., p13), but the four broad areas of content and attainment are dominated by the Catholic tradition (ibid., pp13ff). The English Roman Catholic vision for religious education may therefore be said to have gone some way towards openness in the late 1980s and early 1990s, before being firmly pulled back - at least in official documents - in the mid 1990s.

50. The aims for Standard Grade and S.E.B. short courses are:

"To promote an enquiring, critical and sympathetic approach to the study of religion;

to encourage pupils to reflect on their own experience of life to date;

to develop insights into situations which pose moral and social questions, and capacity to respond to these situations in a balanced and understanding way;

to explore the contribution of religion to human identity and fulfillment, both individual and corporate;

to contribute to understanding of the multicultural dimension of the society in which pupils live." (S.E.B., Edinburgh, 1993).


52. "We only really know what we understand"; and "in religious studies, the reproduction of facts without understanding would be a meaningless exercise" (ibid., pp2-3).

53. Ibid., p3.

54. See Table 2.

55. See Table 3.

56. See Table 4.
57. See Table 4 and the explanatory note. The pattern of decline is confirmed by newspaper comment at the time (Henderson, 1989).

58. See Table 4.


60. Ibid., p10.


62. From Tables 3 and 4, we see that in 1989, 8.49% (= 64) denominational pupils were presented from 8.84% (= 10) schools. In 1994, 8.39% (= 76) denominational pupils were presented from 5.19% (= 4) denominational schools. The pupil participation is declining only gently while the school participation is declining substantially.

63. See Table 5.

64. See Table 5.

65. Mostly it will deliver the first three aims:

"to promote an enquiring, critical and sympathetic approach to the study of religion;

to encourage pupils to reflect on their own experience of life to date;

to develop insights into situations which pose moral and social questions, and capacity to respond to these situations in a balanced and understanding way" (S.E.B., 1993).

66. It can help to deliver one of the extra aims identified in the denominational interpretation of the short courses:

"to assist pupils to consider the implications of Christian belief in their lives". (Liston, 1991, p6).

67. See Table 5.

68. See Table 5.

69. See Table 5.

70. See Table 6.
71. See Table 7.

72. From Tables 6 and 7 we see that in 1989, 16.93% (=52) denominational pupils were presented from 10.6% (=7) denominational schools; in 1994, 10.62% (=98) denominational pupils were presented from 11.47% (=14) denominational schools.


74. Ibid., p2. See also my discussion in chapter 3 (fn 154) of how Hill’s model is partially reflected in the Inspectorate’s observation of learning and teaching patterns (S.O.E.D./H.M.I., 1994, para 2.14).

75. Personal reflection and response formed the key concern in several documents:

"Aim 1: To address important questions about value, meaning and purpose in life" (Lothian, 1994, p2).

"The principal aim ... is to encourage pupils in the development of their own beliefs and values" (Fife, 1994, p18).

"1. To develop an awareness of and sensitivity towards those widespread human experiences from which religions arise" (Shetland, 1991, para 4(a)).

Tayside identifies as its "main aim" one of the aims in 5-14, to help pupils to "develop their own beliefs, attitudes, moral values and practices through a process of personal search, discovery and critical evaluation" (Tayside, 1995, p4). Tayside is also distinctively oriented towards convergence in its inclusion of a "Recognition-Reflection-Response" cycle (Tayside, 1995, p8). This cycle explicitly envisages both personal relevance and action outcomes for the pupil, in a way which resembles Holland and Henriot’s pastoral cycle and other progressive confessional cycles devised for theological education (see, for instance, the cycle of experience, exploration, reflection and response described as a new way of being a theologian, (Green, 1990, pp24ff) and Groome’s fourth and fifth steps (see chapter 4 above).

Personal formation was also given strong emphasis by the Scottish Consultative Council on the Curriculum. Its description of personal and social formation in moral and ethical foundations as "imperative" and "the heart of the matter" brings their thinking close to
long-established confessional concerns (S.C.C.C., 1995, p1. The S.C.C.C.'s definition is couched in inclusive non-confessional terms, including awareness of self, of relationships, of rights and responsibilities, and of work. The process is seen in terms of attainment of knowledge and understanding. "dispositions" (meaning attitudes) and skills (ibid., p7).

76. Knowledge and understanding formed a major prime focus of many policies:

"Develop a knowledge and understanding of Christianity and other world religions and to recognise religion as an important expression of human experience" (Grampian, 1994, p8).

"Recognise religion as an important expression of human experience" (Strathclyde, 1993, p3).

The influence of SCCORE and 5-14 thinking is clear in the phraseology of both aims, suggesting that where Regional policies accepted SCCORE thinking wholesale, they remained with knowledge and understanding at the top of their list of priorities; but where they moved the thinking forward, reflectiveness usually topped the list of priorities.

77. The formation of moral attitudes and other affective stances – typically open enquiry, responsibility, toleration and respect – was another very important common strand (Highland, 1991, p2; Borders, 1980, pp4-5; Western Isles, 1991, para 6.1(e)). One Region went further than most in aiming to "develop a concern for the well-being of others and to give this concern some practical expression" (Grampian, 1994, p8). Another Region encouraged "compassion through expressing and valuing love, concern and forgiveness" (Strathclyde, 1993, p4). Generally the emphasis on moral behavioural outcomes is stronger than might be expected in SCCORE-based thinking, and brings non-confessional religious education closer to the confessional model of formation.

78. Evaluation, together with other skills focusing on the investigation and expression of ideas, formed a fourth popular priority (Lothian, 1994, p2). A phrase used in more than one policy in relation to the evaluation of beliefs was "confirm, deepen or come to their own" (Highland, 1991, p2; Strathclyde, 1993, p3). Generally this evaluative outcome was less widely mentioned and less emphasised than might be expected from a stereotype of non-confessional objective study, which is expected to set great store by letting pupils
make up their own minds and express their own opinions. Indeed, one region had for some time been critical of this process, finding the idea that pupils should undergo R.E. lessons in order to have a choice between religions was "ludicrous" and was in itself a form of indoctrination (Strathclyde, 1981, p39).

79. Social cohesion as an argument for religious education was a theme recurrent in some documents. Only in one policy did it form an aim:

"appreciating the part played by religion in determining individual and community values, standards, behaviour and conduct" (Highland, 1991, p2).

Two other documents had it in the rationale:

"Pupils should be helped to relate constructively to the local environment and to the wider contexts of Britain and the world" (Shetland, 1991, para 2). See also Western Isles, 1991, para 4.3.


82. Ibid., pp8 and 61-62.

83. "Sadly, most formal religion does little to legitimate or aid this journey" (Palmer, 1990, p2).

84. McDonald, 1987, p1. He goes on to remark that this distinction is not always clear to all members of the church.

85. Ibid., p3.

86. Ibid., p32.

87. Ibid., p32.


89. The traditionalist criticisms, and similar associated criticism of the later primary syllabus Here I Am (see below), generated lively debate (Chater, 1993).
Among its aims, the series has:

"coherence of process:

meeting the learning needs of all pupils in their varying ages, stages and backgrounds;

learning about and learning from religion;

using a range of active learning techniques;

cross-curricular and cross-phase liaison" (Lohan and McClure, 1988(a), p5).

Coherence of process is felt to be important because religious material is chosen not for doctrinal or theological reasons, but with an eye to its coherence and progression in the experience of the child. A similar point is made by Grimmitt (Grimmitt, 1987, pp211 and 229). Meeting the needs of all pupils is considered important not only because of mixed abilities, but also because of the national project's acknowledgement of the mixture of faiths found in denominational classrooms. The limitations of school-based R.E.'s ability to catechise are acknowledged (Gallagher, 1988, p27) and therefore its role is to see to the religious development of all pupils (Gallagher, 1988, p26). Its role is distinct from catechesis and evangelisation (ibid., pp14-15). The phrase "all pupils" is a significant connecting thread between the strategy of Gallagher and the tactics of Lohan and McClure.

The combination of learning about and learning from is not new, but it indicates a desire for balance seen also in Groome's epistemology and also in the non-confessional thinking of SCCORE (SCCORE, 1981, p1). The range of active learning techniques and the desire for cross-curricular and cross-phase liaison are indicators of modern educational thinking being taken up in Roman Catholic religious education.

The series authors acknowledge their indebtedness to two non-confessional sources, Grimmitt's 1987 book which focuses on the contexts of pupils' experience, and the Westhill Project teacher material which offers a similar pupil-centred and developmental approach, aiming "to help children mature in relation to their own patterns of belief and behaviour through exploring religious beliefs and practices and related human experiences" (Read et al, 1992, p2).

The connection with Westhill is seen more closely
when the three "principles" upon which Weaving the Web rests are examined.

First, "Religious Education is for all pupils" (Lohan and McClure, 1988(a), p10). It must be "intrinsically worthwhile", having an educational justification of its own. The recurrence of the phrase "all pupils" again suggests a congruence of thinking with the National Project, while the phrase "intrinsically worthwhile" suggests an echo of Hirst and Peters' criterion for educational justification. The Westhill project supports this point of view by stating, as its second principle, that R.E. "has a particularly important contribution to make to spiritual, moral and social development of children" and, as its fourth principle, that "the teaching of R.E. must be related to the ages and abilities of the children being taught" (Read et al, 1986, p2).

The series' second principle is that "Religious Education demands a process rooted in experience" (Lohan and McClure, 1988(a), p10). This experience must be not only the "outward journey" of accumulated experience of religion, but also the "inward journey" of the spiritual development of the learner. Support from Westhill is evident in its second principle, quoted above, which concerns the spiritual and other development of the learner, and its fifth principle, that "R.E. will help children explore a range of religious beliefs and practices and related human experiences" (Read et al, 1986, p2).

The third principle states that "the role of the R.E. teacher is primarily that of educator" (Lohan and McClure, 1988(a), p11). The teacher will enable the learner to develop towards human maturity, a continuing life-long process. Here Lohan and McClure are in harmony with the thinking of Groome, for whom the teacher is an enabler, a "leading co-learner" in partnership with learners (Groome, 1991, p449). Also supportive is Gabriel Moran with his vision of R.E. as lifelong process, based on the earlier work of Bernard Bailyn (Moran, 1989, pp39ff). From the non-confessional model, Bastide supports the idea of the teacher's role being educational, not leading the pupils; the teacher's role is "not to give answers, because there are no answers which are universally agreed. It is rather to help children to move along in the process of finding their own meaning" (Bastide, 1987, p33). Finally, Westhill also supports this role for the teacher when it states, in its first principle, that "children need to develop their own beliefs and values and a consistent pattern of behaviour" and, in its
seventh principle, that "R.E. does not make assumptions about, or preconditions for, the personal commitments of teachers or children" (Read et al, 1986, p2).

92. Lohan and McClure, 1988(a), pp6-8. Although it is unstated, there is a clear resemblance here to the movements of Groome's shared Christian praxis. Relating and analysing experience correspond to Groome's first and second movements; action to learn correspond to the third and subsequent movements. Groome's system is not referred to, but the resemblance is there and indeed not surprising in a progressive denominational series.

93. Ibid., p8.

94. Christianity is often approached as a global religion. For instance, one of the stated learning intentions for a Level 2 unit on Christianity is: "Explore the image of Jesus as liberator; Examine the experience of Christians in another part of the world where being a Christian involves an option for the poor" (ibid., p52). A liberationist sub-theme runs through the series, giving it a resemblance to Groome's model of religious education.

95. Lohan and McClure, 1988(a), p11.


97. For example, in aiming to make pupils "aware of spiritual reality" and help them "understand how this is expressed and celebrated" (Cleveland County Council, 1992, p5), this process resembles Weaving the Web. See also Berkshire, 1990, and Dorset, 1994.

98. For example, Piers Paul Read denounced its "subversion of the Catholic church", its portrayal of Christ as "a Che Guevara of the ancient world" and its "bias in favour of non-Christian religions" (British Broadcasting Corporation, November 1991). The language of this denunciation indicates a hostility towards liberation theology and other world religions.

99. See section 2(c), main text above.

100. The six S.E.B. short courses and Standard Grade have a common SCCORE ancestry (S.E.B., 1993, p1; SCCORE bulletin 2, 1981, paragraph 1.5).

101. Moral Education is defined as the process whereby a person acquires knowledge, understanding and experiences which "allow the development of responsible
attitudes towards oneself and others, and skills of moral judgement about what is right and wrong" (S.E.B., 1993, p1).

For moral education, an attitudinal and action-based outcome is strongly implied in that "moral education is concerned with a code of behaviour that is not dependent on the rigid application of a set of rules, but is characterised by actions which show a respect for others and a sensitivity to their feelings, interests and needs" (ibid., p1).

102. Ibid., p8.
104. Ibid., p1.
105. See, for instance, p54.
107. Ibid., p2.
108. Ibid., p2.
109. Ibid., p2.
111. Ibid., p3.
112. Ibid., p3.
113. Ibid., p3.
117. Ibid., p3.
118. Ibid., p3.
119. Ibid., p4.
120. The values are: freedom, honesty, integrity, justice, tolerance, and personal and social responsibility (S.E.B., 1993, p1).
122. Ibid., p5.
122. See fn 88 above.


124. For instance, his paragraph on pupils' evaluative skills in relation to expressing opinions is finely balanced between educational and confessional concerns, but comes down in favour of educational ones: "While it is understood that the pupil will acknowledge the church's viewpoint, it is recognised that he/she may express a personal opinion which differs from, or is critical of, the church's teaching/practice. In this situation it would be counter-productive for the teacher to reject such a personal view, and, as such, would be poor education" (Liston, 1991, p9).


129. Key concepts should emerge from a Roman Catholic understanding of religious and moral education, featuring scripture, doctrine, liturgy, life experience and morality (Liston, 1991, p8).

130. Proposed content for the four courses developed (which include Issues of Belief and Living in a Plural Society) is overwhelmingly Catholic (Liston, 1991, pp12ff).

131. Recommended resources are largely confessional, being mostly from Roman Catholic publishing houses or from official diocesan material (ibid., pp19ff).

132. See Table 8.

133. See Ethics 1 and Religion and World Conflict in Table 8.

134. See 1992 in Table 8.

135. See Religion & Community and Practical Investigation in Religious Studies in Table 8.

136. See Religious Belief & Expression in Table 8.

137. See Table 9.
138. For instance (see Tables 8 and 9). Religion & Morality in 1991 attracts 57.6% denominational pupils from 30.76% denominational schools: in 1992, 69.2% denominational pupils from 43.18% denominational schools: in 1993, 69.6% denominational pupils from 38.29% denominational schools. That is to say that in 1992 and 1993, over half the pupils enrolled were from denominational schools, although under half the schools participating were denominational – and this disparity is widening.

139. See Tables 8 and 9. The very high 1991 figure of 82.8% denominational pupils was reduced in subsequent years as more non-denominational pupils enrolled. In 1992 and 1993, about one fifth of the pupils enrolled were denominational, but slightly over this proportion of schools were denominational. From this we may deduce that the module is less well supported within the denominational schools (by the pupils) than it is by the denominational schools themselves.

140. For Religious Belief & Expression, 80% of the schools using it were non-denominational (see Table 9).


142. See Table 10.

143. For the Standard Grade and 'O' Grade figures, see Tables 2, 3 and 4; for the S.E.B. short course information, see Table 5; for the Higher figures, see Tables 6 and 7; for the SCOTVEC figures, see Tables 8 and 9. For the C.S.Y.S., four schools in Scotland presented pupils in 1993 and four in 1994 (S.E.B., 1995); none of them were denominational schools.

144. This is born out by the raw material, which names the schools.

145. See Tables 3 and 4.

146. It is briefly and provisionally suggested here that there may be two forces at work causing this reversal. These forces have been observed in my experience as a teacher. First, there may be a considerable change of attitude among pupils who move into post-16 education, even when they stay in denominational schools. This change of attitude expects a post-16 culture of freedom, educational choices, and release from compulsory subjects which dominated the 14-16 curriculum. Thus the compulsory nature of R.E. in a denominational S5 and S6 sits uncomfortably with their other subjects all of which are chosen, and
causes it to be unpopular among pupils, who may seek ways of evading it.

Second, there may be a widespread feeling of teacher helplessness in the face of not only questioning pupils but also a considerable paucity of acceptable R.E. material for use in denominational S5 and S6. Denominational teachers may thus be attracted to courses which give structure. Even if the courses do not fully reflect denominational priorities, the element of faith nurture can supplement or "top up" the modular structure.

It must be stressed that no clear evidence, beyond that of my experience, is available to support this argument. If it is true, however, that many denominational teachers of S5 and S6 R.E. are tending to reach for the SCOTVEC modules faute de mieux and without successfully convincing their pupils of the worthwhileness of the courses, this places a question-mark against the strength and reality of any convergent interpretation of the SCOTVEC participation data.

147. See, for instance, Western Isles, 1991, para 4.2, and the reference to the study of other religions and non-religious viewpoints only be "at appropriate stages" (ibid., para 5.2); Shetland, 1991, para 6, giving a clear order of priorities with Christianity preceding other religions; Grampian, 1994, p14; Strathclyde, 1981, p41. See also my subsequent analysis in fn 155.

148. SCCORE, 1984, p2. In a unit designed for S1 or S2 pupils, called "Encounter With Jesus", the first aim is geared to pupils' spiritual development and their response on an imaginative and emotional level (ibid., p19). This unit is highly appropriate to the needs of pupils in the confessional sector. A Supplementary SCCORE document suggested a unit for S5 and S6 on the role of the church in Latin America (SCCORE, 1985, p1). The overall aim of the unit is cognitive but inclusive, and would naturally form something of interest to some confessional practitioners at least (ibid., pp2ff). The approach of subsequent resources in the confessional sector, such as Just Seniors (Russi, 1990(a) and (b)), would complement and complete this. Overall, this non-confessional material allows Christianity to predominate, and in this sense behaves very like confessional material. A similar pattern is seen in the work of the Committee On Primary Education (COPE, 1985(a) and 1985(b)).

149. SCOTVEC offered one module, Religious Belief and
Expression, on a denominational basis. The module was written by and for denominational Roman Catholic schools. But pupil uptake of this module from 1990 to its demise in 1992 was never higher than 3.74% denominational; over 95% of pupils taking this module were, therefore, from non-denominational schools. In the same years, the proportion of denominational schools using this module was never higher than 20%; the other 80% were non-denominational (SCOTVEC, 1994-5).

150. Roman Catholic schools were held up as exemplars for their schemes of work, their religious observance, and their classroom religious education (S.E.D./H.M.I., 1986, p23). Those Roman Catholic schools which had a "modern scheme" in use, "related to children's conceptual development", were singled out for praise (ibid., p12).

151. Subsequently, the Inspectors developed a kinder treatment of non-denominational R.E. SCCORE-based initiatives, including all SCE examination courses, S.E.B. short courses and SCOTVEC modules, had "reinforced" the place of R.E. (S.O.E.D., 1994, para 2.5), and the SCCORE-based approach itself was commended as a basis for regional, divisional or departmental policies (S.O.E.D., 1991(b), pp2-4).

152. One region prefers to give a framework of aims and a comment on Christianity, with some exemplar topics (Fife, 1994, pp21ff).

153. Western Isles has Christianity at the heart of its programme of study for its own cultural and historical reasons (Western Isles, 1991, para 5.1). Grampian quotes from SCCORE Bulletin 2 a cultural and historical argument in favour of Christianity's pre-eminent place in the curriculum:

"Christianity is a world-wide religion, significant in its impact on human history and development. A creative element in the culture and ethos of western European society, it is for Scots, the faith which has shaped their history and tradition and which claims the allegiance of most of those religiously committed or adherent in Scotland. For children of other faiths it provides the historical basis of (the) society in which they find themselves. It should, therefore, feature as a major component in the curriculum of all pupils" (Grampian, 1994, p13).
In an earlier report, one Region gives Christianity a distinctive place for positive reasons of parental expectation and also because it is the main religion to which pupils have access (Strathclyde, 1981, p41).

154. Grampian includes a resolution from its own Education Committee that "Christianity should be the basis of Religious Education" (Grampian, 1994, p14). However, this cuts across the clear efforts at balance seen elsewhere in the policy, where reliance on national guidelines and SCCORE thinking is considerable (ibid., pp3ff). The Christianity resolution is immediately followed by a discreet rush of diplomacy:

"... it seems wise to reflect in Grampian the flexibility that is advocated at a national level. In accepting the clear intention of the above Education Committee decision, schools are reminded of the need to have both elements. in determining the appropriate balance, schools should take into account the nature of the community..." (ibid., p14).

If nothing else, this textual knot reveals some of the controversy involved in non-confessional attitudes to Christianity.


156. McDonald in Francis et al, 1984, p53.

157. See, for example, this argument in The Times:

"Culturally, Britain is a Christian country and has been for 14 centuries...it is scandalous that children are passing through our schools without being taught in depth and in detail the incidents and the thinking that gave rise to Christianity.... it is Christianity which should have primacy because of where we are... Christianity is more than a religion. In Britain it is the main cultural force which has made us what we are today" (Elkin, 1996, p36).

The reasoning here is weak, making no attempt to define culture or the term "Christian country". Furthermore, the argument ends by belittling Christianity itself, placing its cultural role before its inherent spiritual or salvific importance; Elkin suggests that knowledge of the Good Friday events is essential, mainly because it will help pupils understand Handel's Messiah (ibid).
This article, with the weaknesses in its argument, is merely typical of the frequent expressions of the cultural role of Christianity in both England and Scotland.

158. The harshest critique is by Bates, who argues that the Christian right has been instrumental in reasserting the centrality of Christianity, and that this influence is seen in the 1988 Act, the 1993 Act, and the 1994 model syllabuses by SCAA. He condemns "Christian England" nostalgia as "politically insensitive and provocative" in the context of a plural society. "establishmentarian" and "imperialist" (Bates, 1996, pp85ff).

159. Strathclyde’s policy begins with a statement of four guiding principles. The second of these announces that R.E. "is concerned with the spiritual growth of the pupil...For some, namely the denominational schools, such experience will be interpreted within their own tradition" (Strathclyde, 1993, p3). The implication here is that exactly the same process of spiritual development should take place across the sectors, the difference being only the faith-community in which the process is contextualised.

Lothian’s policy also sets out four principles, clearly stating that these "apply to all schools, non-denominational and denominational" (Lothian, 1994, p1). The first principle states that "children have a right to an education which contributes to their spiritual and moral development" (ibid). Although stated in terms of children's rights rather than the duties of parents or church, it nevertheless leans towards the confessional vision of the spiritual presence in education. The other three principles, however, clearly expect the confessional thinking to reciprocate by leaning towards the non-confessional:

"Principle 2 Educational considerations must be pre-eminent. This can be satisfied by teachers adopting an open approach which leads to sensitive and critical enquiry....

Principle 3 The individual pupil must hold the central place. This can be satisfied through a process of dialogue....

Principle 4 Pupils must not be subjected to authoritarian practices.... Teachers in this curricular area can ensure they satisfy this principle by following professional guidelines and
by adhering to the first three principles. The relevant professional guidelines are those approved by the Education Authority or, in the case of Roman Catholic schools, approved by the Archdiocese" (Lothian, 1994. p1).

"Authoritarian practices" are clearly taboo, but the explanatory paragraph is opaque and gives no clue as to what kind of authoritarianism is at issue. Fundamentalism and indoctrination may be the target; these, of course, can be features in schools of either sector.

Uniting all schools, in both sectors, under the umbrella of four principles gives a striking and newly confident sense of unified or converged purpose. This effect is taken further when a similar approach is taken with the aims:

"This statement of aims refers particularly to non-denominational schools, although it corresponds closely to what is recommended for Roman Catholic schools" (ibid., p2).

Five aims are then given, identifying reflectiveness, knowledge, skills, attitudes and evaluation (ibid., p2). The policy continues:

"Lothian's Roman Catholic schools share these aims, and have an additional and distinctive aim:

To help develop personal beliefs in the light of Scripture and the traditions of the Church through gaining knowledge and understanding of the Bible and Church teaching, and through experience of being part of the school faith community" (ibid., p2).

Again, there is an impression of strength and unity, with confessional school participating in a shared educational enterprise with others outwith their faith community, but adding an extra dimension of knowledge and experience in their own schools.

This impression of an extra dimension is shared by Central Region's statement on denominational schools:

"Denominational schools have a statutory right to provide their pupils with an education which is designed to lead them to personal and responsible commitment in accordance with the teaching of the Church Authorities."
In addition to the aims listed for all schools, denominational schools have an extra element of instruction in the tenets of a particular faith..." (Central, 1987, p5).

The first paragraph raises issues about the propriety and possibility of such an education, and these issues have already been aired in company with Hull and Hirst (see chapter 3 above). But the inclusion argument is clearly seen.

160. "While generally accepting" SCCORE-based aims, Roman Catholic schools "would wish to go further, emphasising faith development" (S.O.E.D./H.M.I., 1994, para 2.12). In doing so, denominational schools should take account of pluralism (ibid., para 2.11). This position is similar to that taken by three Regional policies discussed in fn 161 above.


162. See fns 134 and 139 above.

163. See fn 148 above.

164. The raw material names the very limited number of schools; the use of non-confessional courses is, of course, restricted to the phases S3 to S6.

165. See fn 151 above.

166. No research has been done on the possible changes of aim, ethos and content happening in those non-confessional schools which use Weaving The Web; this could be an indicator of counterbalancing change.

167. The tentative movements from the denominational side are: Faith and Learning, Standard Grade participation, S.E.B. short course participation and Higher participation. Strong movements from the denominational side are: Weaving the Web, Liston's response to the S.E.B. courses, and SCOTVEC module participation.

The tentative movement from the non-denominational side is the implied epistemology of Standard Grade. Strong movements from the non-denominational side are: the regional policies, the implied epistemology of the S.E.B. short courses and an associated textbook, and other texts such as Palmer, 1990 and O'Brien et al, 1992.
Mutual movements are the inspectorate's observations and the 5-14 documents. The latter is debatable, given that the two sets of guidelines were not simultaneous; but my discussion has identified convergent features in both documents.

The Church of Scotland's support for Standard Grade is in a category of its own, being neither denominational (in the Roman Catholic sense) nor non-confessional.

168. S.O.E.D., 1991(c)
169. Orkney, 1993, para (c).

171. Lothian's policy takes the lead in imposing a set of principles on religious observance activity. These principles are intended to qualify the requirements of Circular 6/91 so that educational concerns (rather than political, social or ecclesial ones) are paramount. The principles include freedom of conscience, inclusiveness and satisfying the educational philosophy of the school. In the third principle, it is stated clearly that "in non-denominational schools religious observance should not constitute worship" (Lothian, 1993, p2). Here a clear attempt is being made, within the limits set by the Circular, to lead religious observance toward the reflective end of religious education, thus giving it an educational justification.

172. See the aims in Hyland, 1991(b), p7, in which world religions come last; and Walsh, 1994, pp103ff.

173. See Hyland, 1991(a), contents pages; for a less extreme example, see Walsh's Reason To Believe, with its coverage of the history of ideas in relation to belief in Europe, including critiques of religion (Walsh, 1994, pp5ff). This book is intended for pupils in S5 and S6.

174. See the bishop's foreword in Russi's progressive Just Seniors, which states that the book has "a clearly Christian perspective, based on the gospel of Jesus Christ" and drawing on the strong tradition of the social teaching of the church (Russi, 1990(a), p4).


176. S.E.B., 1992, p4. Note the emphasis on critical understanding and research skills. Denominational
participation in the C.S.Y.S. for the period studied is non-existent; this tends to confirm a theory of Roman Catholic selectivity.

177. Of the tentative patterns, many are one-way (Faith and Learning, denominational participation in Standard Grade, S.E.B. short courses and the Higher, and the epistemology of Standard Grade). The same is true of the stronger evidence (Weaving the Web, Liston’s work on the S.E.B. short courses, denominational participation in SCOTVEC courses, regional policies, epistemology of the S.E.B. short courses, and Palmer’s 1990 and 1992 textbooks). SCOTVEC participation is selective; regional policies give evidence of cultural convergence and convergence by inclusion. The instances which escape these conditions are: the tentative evidence of the Inspectorate; the strong evidence of the 5-14 guidelines, and the Church of Scotland’s support for Standard Grade.

178. My discussion of these and other differences is in chapter 2.

179. See chapter 4.


On the following pages I have set out statistical information from the S.O.E.D., the S.E.B. and SCOTVEC giving figures for school involvement and pupil presentation in the various courses. I received the raw material from the organisations on request in 1995. Usually it came in the form of computer printouts. I have presented and interpreted it here in order to shed light on the extent of denomination participation.

The crucial figures, against which all others should be compared, are those in table 1, showing Scottish Roman Catholic secondary schools as a proportion of all Scottish secondary schools.

Oddly enough, the S.E.B.'s raw material for each of the years concerned included entries for Standard Grade R.S. by what looked like the entire cohort of a London denominational school. Since my focus is on denominational participation in Scotland only, I have removed these figures from the "total" row, the "denominational" row, and the percentages in each S.E.B. table.
## The Tables

The tables are as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 1</td>
<td>Roman Catholic Secondary Schools as a percentage of all Education Authority Secondary Schools, 1989-1993</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2</td>
<td>Numerical and Proportional Extent of Denominational Pupil Presentations for Standard Grade Religious Studies, 1991-1994</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 3</td>
<td>Numerical and Proportional Extent of Denominational Pupil Presentations for 'O' Grade Religious Studies, 1989-1991</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4</td>
<td>Numerical and Proportional Extent of Denominational Schools Participating in 'O' Grade or Standard Grade R.S., 1989-1994</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5</td>
<td>Pupil Presentations for S.E.B. Short Courses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6</td>
<td>Numerical and Proportional Extent of Denominational Pupil Presentations for Higher Grade R.S., 1989-1994</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 7</td>
<td>Numerical and Proportional Extent of Denominational Schools Presenting Pupils for Higher R.S., 1989-1994</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 8</td>
<td>Percentage of Denominational Pupil Enrolments to SCOTVEC National Certificate Courses, 1990-1993</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 9</td>
<td>Percentage of Denominational Schools Enrolling Pupils for SCOTVEC Modules, 1990-1993</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 10</td>
<td>Participation of Denominational Schools in All Examinable S.E.B. Courses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
<td>'89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of RC Secondary Schools</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RC Secondary Schools as a % of all Secondary Schools</td>
<td>16.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Scottish Office Education Department correspondence, 1995)
**Table 2**
*(ref fns 54, 143)*


(Standard Grade R.S. first appeared in 1989. For its first two years, during the stage of transition from Ordinary Grade, the presentations were not numerically significant.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Denominational Presentations</th>
<th>Non-Denominational Presentations</th>
<th>Denominational Presentations as a % of all Presentations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>517</td>
<td>8.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1992</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>669</td>
<td>11.74%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1993</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>746</td>
<td>7.21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>829</td>
<td>8.39%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(S.E.B., 1995)
Table 3
(ref fns 55, 62, 143, 145)


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Number of Pupils Presented</th>
<th>Presentations from Denominational Centres</th>
<th>Presentations from Non-denominational Centres</th>
<th>Denominational Presentations as a % of all Presentations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1989</td>
<td>753</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>689</td>
<td>8.49%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>769</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>711</td>
<td>7.54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>333</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>265</td>
<td>20.42%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(S.E.B., 1995)

Explanatory Note to Table 3

The figures for 1989 and 1990 show a percentage roughly comparable to those inherited by Standard Grade. The figures for 1991 show a sharp fall-off in total presentations for 'O' Grade, large numbers having transferred to Standard Grade, but denominational presentations remain at roughly the same level and thus, by a quirk of statistics, form a much higher percentage in that year. This is not to be interpreted as evidence of convergence, merely of denominational loyalty to the old 'O' Grade as against the Standard Grade.
Table 4
(ref fns 56, 57, 58, 62, 143, 145)


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>'89</th>
<th>'90</th>
<th>'91 O</th>
<th>'91 S</th>
<th>'92</th>
<th>'93</th>
<th>'94</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total Schools Presenting for O or S Grade R.S.</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denom. Schools Presenting for O or S Grade R.S.</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-denom Schools Presenting for O or S Grade R.S.</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denom Schools Presenting as a % of all Schools Presenting</td>
<td>8.84</td>
<td>6.86</td>
<td>11.76</td>
<td>5.55</td>
<td>66.57</td>
<td>4.54</td>
<td>5.19</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(S.E.B., 1995)

See explanatory note on next page
Explanatory Note to Table 4

There are two sets of figures for 1991, the change-over year between O Grade and Standard Grade. Figures before 1991 are all O Grade; after 1991, all Standard Grade.

The highest percentage of participation, 11.76% in 1991 for the 'O' Grade, was achieved not through a surge in denominational support but through a drop in non-denominational support, nearly half of which moved to Standard Grade in that year. In 1994, the slight lift to 5.19% is explained by a drop in non-denominational support, while the number of denominational schools presenting remained the same as the previous year.
Table 5  
(ref fns 63, 64, 67, 68, 69, 143)

Pupil Presentations for S.E.B. Short Courses
(The S.E.B. was unable to break the figures down into denominational and non-denominational centres.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course</th>
<th>1992</th>
<th>1993</th>
<th>1994</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AWOV</td>
<td>1262</td>
<td>3613</td>
<td>5358</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIPS</td>
<td>184</td>
<td>2103</td>
<td>4962</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MIIT</td>
<td>927</td>
<td>1904</td>
<td>3187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CT</td>
<td>824</td>
<td>1937</td>
<td>2543</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IAR</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>340</td>
<td>483</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IOB</td>
<td>564</td>
<td>2711</td>
<td>4884</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Key to Courses:
AWOV  A World of Values
LIPS  Living in a Plural Society
MIIT  Moral Issues in Technology
CT    Christianity Today
IAR   Investigating a Religion
IOB   Issues of Belief

(S.E.B., 1995)
Table 6
(Ref fn's 70, 72, 143)


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>'89</th>
<th>'90</th>
<th>'91</th>
<th>'92</th>
<th>'93</th>
<th>'94</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total Pupil Presentations</td>
<td>307</td>
<td>346</td>
<td>472</td>
<td>715</td>
<td>861</td>
<td>922</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denom. Pupil Presentations</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-denom Pupil Presentations</td>
<td>255</td>
<td>302</td>
<td>412</td>
<td>620</td>
<td>763</td>
<td>824</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denom Pupil Presentations as a % of all Pupil Presentations</td>
<td>16.93</td>
<td>12.71</td>
<td>12.71</td>
<td>13.28</td>
<td>11.38</td>
<td>10.62</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(S.E.B., 1995)
Table 7
(Ref fns 71, 72, 143)


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>'89</th>
<th>'90</th>
<th>'91</th>
<th>'92</th>
<th>'93</th>
<th>'94</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total Schools Presenting Higher Grade R.S.</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denom. Schools Presenting Higher Grade R.S.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-denom Schools Presenting Higher Grade R.S.</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Denom Schools Presenting as a % of all Schools Presenting

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>'89</th>
<th>'90</th>
<th>'91</th>
<th>'92</th>
<th>'93</th>
<th>'94</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
<td>10.6</td>
<td>13.09</td>
<td>11.57</td>
<td>9.73</td>
<td>10.71</td>
<td>11.47</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(S.E.B., 1995)
Table 8
(Ref fns 132, 133, 134, 135, 136, 143)

Percentage of Denominational Pupil Enrolments to SCOTVEC National Certificate Courses, 1990-1993

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Old Courses:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RAWC</td>
<td>20.4%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethics 1</td>
<td>33.9%</td>
<td>41%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethics 2</td>
<td>0.77%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RILC</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAR</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RBAE</td>
<td>3.74%</td>
<td>2.78%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Courses:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITR</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RAC</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>54.9%</td>
<td>15.5%</td>
<td>15.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RAM</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>57.6%</td>
<td>69.2%</td>
<td>69.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RAP</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>82.8%</td>
<td>21.49%</td>
<td>24.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PIRS</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>33.3%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Key to Module names:
- RAWC: Religion and World Conflict
- RILC: Religion in the Local Community
- TAR: Thinking About Religion
- RBAE: Religious Belief and Expression
- ITR: Introduction to Religion
- RAC: Religion and Community
- RAM: Religion and Morality
- RAP: Religion and Politics
- PIRS: Practical Investigation in Religious Studies

The 100% support in 1992 is a dwindling of non-denominational support as many schools adopted the new set of modules.
Table 9  
(Ref fns 137, 138, 140, 143)

Percentage of Denominational Schools Enrolling Pupils  
for SCOTVEC Modules, 1990-1993

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Old Courses:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RAWC</td>
<td>14.28%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethics 1</td>
<td>31.1%</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethics 2</td>
<td>9.09%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RILC</td>
<td>12.5%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TAR</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RBAE</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>14.2%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Courses:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITR</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RAC</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>16.6%</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>16.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RAM</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>30.76%</td>
<td>43.18%</td>
<td>38.29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RAP</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>44.44%</td>
<td>26.31%</td>
<td>27.27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PIRS</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Scotvec, 1995)

Key to Module names:

RAWC  Religion and World Conflict  
RILC  Religion in the Local Community  
TAR  Thinking About Religion  
RBAE  Religious Belief and Expression

ITR  Introduction to Religion  
RAC  Religion and Community  
RAM  Religion and Morality  
RAP  Religion and Politics  
PIRS  Practical Investigation in Religious Studies

(for explanatory note, see next page)
Explanatory Note to Table 9

In the case of several modules, from old and new sets, denominational schools form a substantial minority of overall schools enrolling. (Only in two cases, Thinking About Religion in 1990 and Ethics 1 in 1992, does the denominational sector dominate, and this is with 100%, the total number of schools in both these cases being one.) We note the highest denominational support is still for the modules dealing with morality and politics. This suggests that denominational support is tagged to those modules or courses which deliver particular content, or raise particular issues, felt to be appropriate.
Table 10
(Ref fn 142)

Participation of Denominational Schools in All Examinable S.E.B. Courses

(ScotVEC Modules and S.E.B. Short Courses are not included.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>'89</th>
<th>'90</th>
<th>'91</th>
<th>'92</th>
<th>'93</th>
<th>'94</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total Schools Presenting</td>
<td>141</td>
<td>151</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denom. Schools Presenting</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-denom Schools Presenting</td>
<td>135</td>
<td>137</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>131</td>
<td>135</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denom Schools Presenting as a % of all Schools Presenting</td>
<td>11.34</td>
<td>9.27</td>
<td>12.41</td>
<td>9.65</td>
<td>8.75</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denom Secondary Schools as a % of all Secondary Schools</td>
<td>16.8</td>
<td>16.5</td>
<td>16.0</td>
<td>16.0</td>
<td>15.9</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Year | '89 | '90 | '91 | '92 | '93 | '94 |
|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|

(S.E.B., 1995)

Explanatory Note to Table 10

The figures show that denominational schools have reduced minimally their overall use of S.E.B. examinable courses, both in numerical terms and proportionally, suggesting at face value a gentle withdrawal from participation and thus the opposite of convergence. However, as has been seen with analysis of more detailed figures relating to particular courses, the picture is more complex.
Footnotes to Chapter 6

1. In chapter 3, theorists who had argued for some degree of convergence or realignment of existing models were critically reviewed. It was argued that "reconcilers" such as Slee, Rummery and Moran came to a halt in their arguments; the work of Hull was developed further, yielding more agreement. The models proposed by "prophets" - Watson, Arthur, Hill and Wallace - had weaknesses, usually because they referred themselves to the two old models or lacked sufficient detail in terms of theoretical rationale. Despite the weaknesses, these "prophetic" models had important characteristics which are attractive for convergence.

All eight theorists have been important in consciously developing a climate of convergence debate, and elements of their work are essential as conditions for the formation of a converged model.

2. In chapter 4, the work of Thomas Groome on the philosophy for shared Christian praxis was analysed in terms of the three categories, and brought together with the anthropology, epistemology and religious approaches of Grimmitt, Rodger and some other non-confessionalists. Very substantial agreement on the underlying anthropologies was found, but Rodger entered one caveat on potential divisiveness in anthropological language. Groome's epistemology was supported to a very high degree by non-confessonalists. There was no total agreement on approaches to religion; obstacles were the commitment to the reign of God, which might be expressed in non-confessional circles through values but could not be expressed in overarching Christological terms; another obstacle was the commitment to living a faith, partially but not totally overcome by the Scottish non-confessional view of Personal Search. The theoretical dialogue succeeded in gaining substantial agreement but the obstacles remaining were considered important enough to prevent any claim of total compatibility.

3. Chapter 5 indicated how some statistical and documentary evidence points against convergence, particularly in official regional documents and syllabuses. Evidence for convergence exists, most strongly in recent curricular programmes such as 5-14, the denominational response to the S.E.B. short
courses, and some aspects of denominational participation in non-confessional courses, but with caveats. Instances of apparent, or phantom convergence were evaluated and dismissed as evidence of any real mutual convergence. The chapter concluded that there had been movement, some of which could be taken as desirable prelude, but none of which possessed the momentum to continue to full convergence.

4. The peaking and decline in denominational participation, and the apparently fixed theological and pedagogical position of confessional authorities, identified in chapter 5 above, will deliver either a standstill or a reverse in the convergence process.

5. Butler, envisioning further development of a model of religious education, is happy to see a process of taking what is appropriate from older models, including transmissive and training models, in addition to developmental theory (Butler, 1962, pp235-6).

6. See chapter 3 above.

7. Catechesis clearly had no resonance beyond faith commenities and, I have argued (see chapter 2 above) has only partial resonance within them; the scientific metaphor never rid itself of the impression that it was the enemy of faith commitment (Ibid).

8. Grimmitt (1987, p215), Rodger (1992(a), p iii) and Palmer (1991, pp23ff) have referred to the plural nature of British society and the difficulties, or opportunities, this raises for the discovery of shared moral values or common philosophical bases for education.

9. For Gutierrez, the embracing of secular concerns, methods and movements of thought (including Marxism) must be part of doing theology as critical reflection on praxis (Gutierrez, 1973, pp6ff).

10. See, for instance, the argument that developmental understandings in psychology represent a new expression of Judaeo-Christian beliefs: Kirschner, 1996, pp63ff) and see others who acknowledge explicit spiritual experiences (Watts and Williams, 1988, pp24ff and 109ff).

11. See, for instance, Lealman, 1982, on the artistic and aesthetic as ways of expressing religious insight, and her more recent attempt (Lealman, 1993). Harris describes the artistic as a way of knowing and valuing, an important corrective to developmental systems such
as Kohlberg's (Harris n.d.). Smith, 1987, offers beauty as the criterion for judging the value of religions (unpublished paper).

12. This wisdom is quoted in Hammond, Hay et al, 1990, p37, where it is attributed to Krishnamurti. I have been unable to find its source.

13. See my discussion of Groome, Rodgers, Polanyi and others in chapter 4 above.

14. For instance, Jung's practical experience with patients showed him "that many neuroses are caused primarily by the fact that people blind themselves to their own religious promptings because of a childish passion for rational enlightenment (my emphasis). It is high time the psychologists of today recognised that we are no longer dealing with dogmas and creeds but with the religious attitude per se" (Jung, 1953-79, Vol xvi, para 99).


16. J.D. Butler argues for an evolutionary theology of the self becoming self before God: "in order for a self to be a self it must participate in its own becoming" (Butler, 1962, p217). His emphasis on the becoming self looks back to Chardin and forward to Metz. Such growth, for Butler, is the only way to become a fitting object for the divine love. Implicit in his stress on growth and development of the self there is a theme of personal change. It is noted here that he also authored "Theology and Psychology: Some Points of Convergence" in Encounter, Autumn 1958, Vol XIX No 4, pp391-406. This article has not been seen by me, but its title is suggestive of an embryonic interest in a therapeutic analogy.


18. "We have to give children a cognitive grasp of their emotions... we are trying to improve their rationality in the sphere of the emotions" (his emphasis) (Wilson, 1971, p244).

19. Wilson, not dated, p12, quoted in Astley, 1994, pp216ff. However, Wilson will only allow some similarity with the world of psychotherapy, which for him awakens emotions but does not necessarily teach an understanding and control of them (Wilson, 1971, p245). His model of emotional education transcends
psychotherapy, occupies cognitive territory, and rejects distinctions between reason and the emotions: "It is utterly fatal to fall victim to a pseudo-antithesis of 'reason' and 'emotion'" (Wilson, 1971, p250).


21. Hammond et al, 1990; see also Coles' use of counselling and therapeutic skills in order to question pupils about spiritual issues in a secular environment: Coles, 1990.

22. See, for instance, Hay and Nye's search for a solid rationale for the present public concern for spiritual and moral development: they conclude that "spirituality cannot be taught. It can be and is very often crushed out of awareness during education. We urgently need to understand more about the processes that produce spiritual damage, so that they can be countered adequately, particularly in the school classroom" (my emphasis) (Hay and Nye, 1996, pp13-14).


24. For instance, the woman in the house of Simon the Pharisee (Luke 7: 36-50) and Zacchaeus (Luke 19: 1-10). Emotional healing is implicit in both encounters. The encounters themselves are salvific.

25. They are not only etymologically connected, but mutually related to education, since both take place in individuals in a public domain, according to Stephen Schmidt (Schmidt, 1994, pp170ff).


27. Both use "similar cognitive processes"; both require openness, through which the subject sets aside stereotypical, cliched or obsessive world-views, whether in relation to doctrinal positions about externals, or to internal beliefs about the self; and both, at their best, call for a middle way between the rational and the emotional (Watts and Williams, 1988, pp152-3).


29. Erikson noted that patients suffered most from the problem of what they should believe and who they should - or indeed might - become (Erikson, 1965, p27).
Similar human senses, particularly the loss of meaning, are mentioned in the clinical work of Jung, for whom "meaninglessness inhibits fullness of life and is therefore equivalent to illness" (Jung, 1961, p373).

30. Rodger, 1994(c), p44.

31. For a personal theological and pastoral account of this, see Richards, 1994.

32. Jung connected meaninglessness with mental illness, and growth in sense of meaning with each step of development (Jung, 1961, pp391-392). His argument that, were life wholly meaningless, its perceived meaningfulness would diminish increasingly as each life-stage passed, has an Anselmian simplicity and brilliance. See also Jung’s claim that, having treated many people from different cultures, "among my patients in the second half of life - that is over 35 - there has not been one whose problem in the last resort was not that of finding a religious outlook on life. It is safe to say that every one of them fell ill because he had lost what the living religions of every age give to their followers, and none of them has really been healed who did not regain his religious outlook" (Jung, 1953-79, Vol xi. paragraph 509).

33. See Evans’ application of this insight to parental nurture: "If parents have an assurance of meaning they can pass it on to their children" (Evans, 1979, p24); and see Erikson’s placing of the insight into a framework of children in communities which give meaning, with his claim that "there are... few frustrations in either this (first) or the following stages which the growing child cannot endure if the frustration leads to... a final integration of the individual life cycle with some meaningful wider belongingness" (Erikson, 1965, pp249-50).

34. Philip Phenix suggests meaning as the distinctive human characteristic (Phenix, 1964, p5) since "all the distinctive human functions are varieties of meaning, and all of them together... comprise the life of meaning, which is the essence of the life of man." (ibid., p21). Phenix allows an ambiguity in humanity in that "people both resist and deny meanings and seek and affirm them" (ibid., p30), and "the fact of meaninglessness" presents a challenge, not least to education (ibid., p38). Phenix’s six "pure and archetypal kinds of meaning" (ibid., p8) are symbolics, empirics, esthetics, synnoetics, ethics, and synoptics (ibid., pp6ff). Although he consigns religion and philosophy to the sixth category, we could easily see
present-day religious and moral education processes in empirics (factual descriptions and theoretical formulations, meanings expressed as probable empirical truths), synnoetics (personal knowledge, relational insight, "largely a product of ordinary social experience" but "not without benefit of theoretical study" (ibid. p196), and ethics (moral meanings, personal conduct, decisions) as well as the sixth category of synoptics. Phenix implicitly agrees with this when he says that "disciplines are not always clearly assignable to a single realm" (ibid. pp28-9) and that the realms are "integrated and complementary" (ibid. p9), reflecting facets of humanity. Disappointingly however, Phenix presents the religious facet of human meaning-making in confessional terms - "a creature of God partaking of the divine nature" (ibid., p20) so that his language might not prove universally acceptable as anthropology for a plural secular society.


36. Ibid., p1. The word "grazed" (gestreift) is interesting, suggesting to my mind three things. First, it suggests a wounding - that to be pierced by the pain of ultimate questions is a universal human characteristic; second, it suggests a question which strikes a glancing blow and passes by, perhaps returning; third, to be gestreift may also mean to be touched, scraped or even kissed, verbs which denote not only harm but also intimacy. This human wound, then, which will not heal unless it is attended to, can also be the beginning of something good.

37. Smith, 1969, p95. Adolescents, at their stage of development, are particularly "grazed" by the loneliness and mystery of human existence.


39. Ibid., p12.

40. Ibid., p12.

41. Ibid., p2.


44. Cooper, 1988, pp47-8.

46. Ibid., p84.

47. This hurt may correspond with Fowler's "precocious identity formation" (Fowler, 1981, p286), associated with premature transitions, leaving the subject hungry for learning and change, yet so easily traumatised by it.

48. For Richards, the religious educator is one who experiences pain which is inherent in the process of theological education (Richards, 1994, p30). This is the pain and difficulty of meeting the needs both of the young learner and of the tradition with integrity. Pain is also experienced through the struggle to bring about change (ibid., pp80ff).

49. This was noted and accepted by one Scottish region, whose policy statement encouraged commitment, along with attitudes of informed understanding and appreciation (Strathclyde, 1981, p42).

50. These may be determined (both at present, and in a therapeutic model) by the teacher's maturity in terms of psychometric theories such as Fowler's. Alex Rodger points out that it would be self-contradictory for the spiritually mature person to advocate or proselytise in favour of a particular way. (Rodger, 1994(c), p42). Also of importance is the teacher's ability to have resolved conflicts in themselves, being at Erikson's young adult stage or above. Erikson calls for teachers who are healthy and relaxed; he implies that if they are, they will feel trusted and respected by the community (Erikson, 1959, p92).

51. Receptivity, for example, is a quality which brings out a response in others: "In many people the receptive person discerns and evokes a capacity for receptivity, breaking through their wariness to some extent because she is so obviously not out to deprive them or harm them and is willing to give without asserting power over them" (Evans, 1979, p59). This could be true of other developmental qualities named by Erikson, such as trust and purpose. If it is possible to transmit these qualities healthily, as Evans suggests, this could answer some of the confessionalist fears about a converged model failing to provide personal transformation.

52. Rodger comments rightly that "we cannot hope - and should not try - to engage our pupils in learning if we are not prepared ourselves for the discipline of
submitting to the reality we claim to be studying" (Rodger, 1994(c), p45).


55. Ibid., p89.

56. "Holism" is evident in the view that, "properly understood, religious education is an incomparable source of personal equilibrium and of dynamic creative optimism" (Balocco in Nichols, 1980, p97).


58. Tuby in Cooper, 1988, pxxv.

59. Philip Phenix spoke of the realm of personal knowledge (Synnoetics) as exploring meanings in which "a person has direct insight into other beings (or oneself) as concrete wholes existing in relation" (Phenix, 1964, p193).

60. See chapter 2 above.

61. Phenix warned of the damage to persons done by ignoring or defacing this realm of personal meaning: "Personal meanings are impaired" if/when choices are made which negate freedom and love. He identified this realm as essential for restoring "personal and interpersonal wholeness", and this process should, he felt, include therapeutic methods (Phenix, 1964, p211).


63. For Lonergan, knowing must consist of more than "taking a look"; enquiry and insight go beyond the sensible (Lonergan, 1957, p635). True knowing is an act of the whole person, to which the notion of being is essential (ibid., pp644ff). With his neo-Thomist background, he believes that to understand being is to understand God (ibid., pp657-8). Any act of understanding is, arguably, a human response to the divine.

64. Watts and Williams, 1988, p23.


68. Watts and Williams, 1988, pp70-71.

69. Ibid. I also note that in therapy, attending to the client is of prime importance: distinct from listening, it is a non-verbal way of "being with" the client (Culley, 1991, p35). This, I would argue, is an ontological state of solidarity, making connections with the liberative metaphor (see main text below) and unifying knowing with being. The phrase is also part of a spiritual tradition (see, for instance, Weil, 1959). Attentiveness is thus a quality underlying and unifying authentic therapy and authentic prayer with authentic academic study.

70. Groome, 1980, pp22 and 25, in his definitions of religious education.

71. A fascinating and moving development of the notion of balanced epistemology is to be found in Miller Mair's work, where he calls for a balance of theory with practice, feminine intimacy with masculine objectivity, and learning with teaching (Mair, 1989, pp6ff). In passionate tones, and using Polanyi for support, Mair calls for a more public recognition of personal knowing (ibid., pp234ff).

72. See Groome's critique of the western tradition, discussed in chapter 4. See also the large and growing body of feminist epistemology criticising excessively cognitivist and dualistic forms of knowing, and calling for dialogical, imaginative, holistic forms (Siejk, 1994, pp271ff; Gilligan, 1993 (1982)). Acceptance of feelings and emotional responsiveness as an "organ" (Watts and Williams, 1988, p89) - I prefer the word indicator - of knowledge.

73. Cantwell Smith calls for a "humane knowing" which will foster global peace and inter-cultural understanding (Hughes, 1986, pp139ff), offering a form of educational and psychological antidote to attitudes associated with domination and oppression. "One reason Smith has created this model is to dismantle the sense of superiority that he finds in Western investigators" (ibid., p160). This knowledge is a "corporate critical self-consciousness" (ibid., p150ff); it has a close connection with Rogerian counselling techniques.


75. Donald Evans, writing in 1993, quoted in Rodger, 1994(c), p35.
76. Evans, 1979, pp21ff
77. Ibid., pp66-67.
78. Fowler, 1981.
79. Evans, 1979, pp91-94.
80. Ibid., p99.
81. Ibid., p169ff.
82. By a series of logical steps, Evans unfolds the theology within his system of attitude virtues, and we can explore the ways in which this theology supports epistemology for a healing and freeing model of religious education:

(a) trust as an attitude-virtue implies a belief that there is a focus of trust;

(b) since basic trust, as an attitude-virtue, is externally pervasive and unifying, it implies belief in a focus which is cosmic;

(c) the cosmic focus of basic trust is God (Evans, 1979, pp174-175).

This argument is engaging, but suffers from a weakness similar to Rahner's position on anonymous Christians, namely its openness to the accusation of annexing areas of human experience and compulsorily baptising them. In this case, the entire human experience of trust is annexed. Evans may be half-aware of this problem, as he uses the word God nervously, in inverted commas, and acknowledges the possibility of having a stance of basic trust without a belief in God (ibid., p177).

83. Evans, 1979, p155. Arguably this amounts to growth in holiness. If so, I would feel uncomfortable about so tight a definition. Astley (1994, pp137-9) relies on Evans' attitude-virtues for a definition of progress in the affective, attitudinal or emotional domain of religion, but seems to stop short of any claims for the ultimate orientation of the progress.

The danger with any developmental scheme is that it might become a modern scala perfectionis; Fowler warns of this and wishes to assert God's grace and freedom which is "not confined by the models we build" (Fowler, 1981, pp302-3).
84. Training material for counsellors includes sketches in which the participants will typically begin with some of the following phrases:

"As I understand it... it sounds like... I don't think... I worry about..." (Culley, 1991, p28).

85. See, for instance, the neo-Orthodox inclination to place subjective faith as subordinate to the object of belief, the Trinity (Barth, 1949, p15).


87. Smart accepts that the ineffable otherness of the Divine must inevitably lead to a concept of revelation, since God cannot be reduced to experiences (ibid., p119). He dismisses accusations of relativism by claiming that this approach still posits the possibility of inner truth (ibid., p93); indeed, elsewhere he describes his method as "soft non-relativism", admitting it is a "dreadful phrase" but proceeding to explain it as the taking-up of theological or philosophical positions with a softness, an acceptance that they can be proved wrong, and illustrating it with the example of Jainist "maybeism" (Syad-vada) (Smart, 1996, p10; see also Smart, 1995).

88. For Smart, in a plural world there can be no definitely proven or demonstrated religious positions; "proofs wither into hints" (Smart and Konstantine, 1991, p84); and we have "only soft reasons at best" for choosing between world views (ibid., pp88, 93).

89. Alexander, 1995, p379. See also the Coleridgean concept of subjective religion and creative fidelity developed by Nichols (Nichols, 1996, pp185-191).


91. Ibid., p434.


93. I am dependent on interpretations of faith as a human universal (Fowler, 1981, p5), as a quality of human living (Hughes, 1986, p15), and as a universal phenomenon not confined to religious belief (Jacobs, 1993, p26).

94. Fowler's analysis of precocious identity formation (Fowler, 1981, p182) suggests this.
95. Broadribb, 1995, p155. However, Broadribb elsewhere sees religion as a bridge between the individual and the environment and an aid to individuation, Jung's term for the maturing task of the second half of life (ibid., p262). This is a more positive view.

96. Watts and Williams, 1988, p96.

97. Watts and Williams, 1988, p127.

98. Ibid., p126.


100. Watts and Williams, 1988, p151.

101. Watts and Williams tend to minimise this obstacle. While it is awkward from the non-theistic perspective, it is not, they argue, a point on which theists will insist, since it is for them a natural and almost taken-for-granted item. This position could be theologically developed with an emphasis on the relational, non-dogmatic nature of faith, for instance in James Day's poetic presentation of faith as

"living, anti-ideological, never determinable as a metaphysics. Christian faith is a relational practice. It's something we're invited to, not as a museum but as a living conversation.... Wanting an abstract principle far off and in control I am given a person, born as a baby..." (Day, 1994, p18).

The reality of God is pictured in similar terms, emphasising intimacy and mystery, by Miller Mair (Mair, 1989, p241). Such language seems very close to that of the mystics.

However, this only reduces slightly, and certainly cannot remove, the obvious divergence which will remain between theists and non-theists.

102. Rogers, 1983, p283, his emphasis.

103. On methodology, Rogers believes: "If I am truly open to the way life is experienced by another person... then I run the risk" of seeing life in that person's way (Rogers, 1989, p244). His use of the word risk in this positive, open sense resonates with the life-giving potential identified by theologians in the risk of faith.
Using the work of Carl Rogers as a basis, Hammersley suggests a checklist of ten questions which the teacher can use to monitor the health of his or her relationships with pupils:

"Can I be perceived as trustworthy, dependable, consistent and congruent?

Do I communicate clearly and unambiguously without giving any mixed messages or conveying difficult feelings?

Can I allow myself to experience the positive attitudes towards the other person of warmth, care, interest, respect?

Can I be strong enough to allow the other person their separateness, their own needs and feelings?

Am I secure enough in myself to allow the other person ideas and feelings different from mine?

Can I enter his world of meanings to begin to see his private world as he does?

Can I accept the person as he is?

Can I act sensitively so my behaviour is not perceived as a threat?

Can I free the person from the threat of critical judgement?

Can I meet the person as someone who is becoming (his emphasis) or will I be bound by the past?" (Hammersley, 1990, p18)

Hammersley's checklist bears the hallmark of Rogerian counselling, with its use of terms such as congruent, mixed messages, becoming, and the counsellor's four-fold attitude of warmth, care, interest and respect.

Questions 3 and 4 balance intimacy with distance. Hammersley describes the teacher as an affirming person, strengthening the child's capacity to experience basic trust, the first of Erikson's personality stages (ibid., p18).

The categories have a special relevance for religious education, making the pupil the locus of vital, perhaps sacred emotional and intellectual content which will sometimes be a mystery to the
teacher. In doing so, they make an anthropological statement about the learner as sacred being, but also about the object of study as mysterious and important, beyond the legitimate control of the teacher. Hammersley suggests that, as religion helps individuals to harmonise their experience, religious teaching can help this harmonisation process along by promoting awareness (ibid., p18). This promotes a therapeutic understanding of religious education.

Hammersley suggests that if the quality of the teacher-pupil relationship can be described in positive responses to the above ten questions, it may then be compared with the counsellor-client relationship (ibid., p17). However, he is aware of Rogers' warning that teaching aimed at personal change will usually be unsuccessful (ibid., p18). Clearly, then, in Hammersley's view the counsellor-client metaphor for religious education cannot be taken absolutely or limitlessly.

106. Ibid., p70.
107. Ibid., p68.
108. Ibid., p164.
110. Ibid., p285.
111. Ibid., pp37ff.
114. Phenix sees personal education as a therapy process which leads to understanding mechanisms used in the conduct of life and which learns to change "by substituting more mature and realistic ways of feeling and acting" (Phenix, 1964, p202).

115. Peters and Hirst, in search for a way of defining education, considered a parallel between "curing" and "educating" but found it unconvincing: for whereas curing implies a lapse, education carries no such suggestion but is rather concerned with values, worthwhileness, and understanding (Peters and Hirst, 1970, p19). Although we might nowadays substitute healing for curing, and argue that healing assumes no lapse, the
basic analogy when presented in this way is still flawed.

116. For instance, the use of Rogerian non-directive counselling techniques in group-work in Christian religious education in France was rightly critiqued as a "baptising" of pupils' personal experiences into a Christian context not of their free choosing (Ayel in Francis and Thatcher (eds), 1990, p296).

117. Commenting on Scottish R.E., McDonald calls for a dynamic structure of learning which causes learner, content, context and teacher to interact (McDonald in Francis, 1984, p51). Cole calls for dialogue to be part of religious education in all its encounters: between the child and experience, the child and knowledge, the child and the teacher, and the child and his peers (Cole, 1978, p95). Cole follows this with a concept of deeper, interior dialogue - some might call it prayer - which he claims can only be an accidental by-product of religious education, and would be improper as a planned aim (ibid., p96). A therapeutic model develops this concept of dialogue and allows it as a legitimate planned aim, as indeed much experiential religious education already does.

118. For Dunne, religious understanding depends upon the successful completion of this double journey. "What one does in passing over is to try to enter the feelings of another person, become receptive to the images which give expression to his feelings, attain insight into those images, and then come back enriched by this insight" (Dunne, 1972, p ix).

119. Ibid., p ix.

120. See fn 104 above.


122. There is a need for further development of what it means to say that a religious tradition is wounded. My meaning here focuses on the nature of change in a tradition and on how this can sometimes undermine or corrupt a central insight. For an example, I point to the jubilee teaching in Leviticus 25, and the way in which liberties are extended to all except foreign slaves and their children (Leviticus 25:44-46). The implied idealism of jubilee, both utopic and liberative on economic and ethnic levels, is qualified, marred and wounded by the exception made in these verses. Several other examples of the woundedness of traditions may be found in their contemporary crises over the role of
women and over the use of power. Where the practice of a tradition appears to be in contradiction with the genius of its original vision – for instance, in the present Roman Catholic position against the ordination of women – the tradition may be said to be disfigured because its original and authentic features are partially obscured or damaged. Disfigurement may be a preferable term to woundedness.

Acknowledgement of fault in a tradition does not belong to radicals alone. Pope John Paul II’s instructions for celebration of the millenium include a serious examination of conscience for the church, including acknowledgement of sins and crimes committed by representatives of the church over two thousand years (reported in Commonweal magazine, October 21, 1994, and in Harris, 1996, p98). There is more theological reflection to be done on this.

125. Ibid., p15.
127. Coe, 1919, integrated social gospel insights into religious education; this tradition was continued by Elliott, 1953, and revived by Schipani, 1988 and Moore, 1989. Boys is critical of Coe’s liberal assumptions about America, contrasting them with Freire’s critical analysis of social and ideological forces (ibid., pp124-5).

130. In this vision, religious education aims "to enable people to appropriate the gospel of the reign of God...to promote social transformation" (Schipani, 1988, p100).

131. Ibid., p1.
132. Groome sees religious education as "a political activity" oriented to "the vision of God’s Kingdom, the seeds of which are already among us" (Groome, 1980, p25).

133. Butkus believes that religious education "holds the potential for freeing us from a controlling past".
and "to subvert existing ideologies and unjust social structures" (Butkus, 1989, p222). Metz's concept of the dangerous memory, critically subverting the controlling assumptions, ideologies and unjust structures of past and present (Metz, 1980, p90) is deployed effectively by Russell Butkus. The Christian community's critical memory or remembrance - in Groome's language, its story and vision - brings about a social consciousness and social action (Butkus in Moore, 1989, p222). Butkus sees this critical, dangerous memory functioning in the second movement of Groome's shared praxis, when communities critically reflect on their experience, and in the third and fourth movements, when communities access and reflect on the Christian memory.

134. See, for instance, Howard Summers' Religious Education for Transformation, written in the South African context and offering a methodology of empowerment for transformation (Summers, 1996, p143). Teaching is oriented towards the Kingdom of God on earth, in South Africa, in terms of justice, truth, love and freedom (ibid., p149).


136. The primary school programme, Here I Am (Byrne and Malone, 1992) and the secondary Weaving the Web (Lohan and McClure, 1988).

137. Elsewhere I have argued that Weaving the Web succeeds educationally and politically only when it raises issues which the conservative religious forces would rather leave aside (Chater, 1996). The agency of the teacher in taking up these issues is also pivotal.


139. Harris, for instance, cites work by Gilligan and others to identify ways in which girls take part in their own silencing in education. She calls on educators to "engage in the work of fostering active resistance in girls to anything that would be destructive of their full personhood" and to stand in solidarity with others (Harris, 1993, pp52ff).

140. Aquinas' belief that humanity is a naturally social and political animal is usually traced back to his celebrated statement that "men even in the state of innocence would have lived in society" (Aquinas, 1965, 1:96:a.4) but is also attributable to his reliance on Aristotle and Augustine for a rationale for the government of free people towards the common good. The emphasis on freedom and the common good is important.
for my discussion of freedom as a hallmark of a liberative religious education.

141. See, for instance, Preiswerk, 1987, pp91ff, on the relationship of a liberative Christian education to its conditioning elements, including the social context.

142. For instance, Hirst and Peters, with their emphasis on autonomy, tend to be suspicious of instrumentalist views of education and therefore say little about its social context. For them, an educated person is self-motivated and capable of resisting social trends (Hirst and Peters, 1970, pp110-111). Peters’ emphasis is different; he recognises that "respect for persons and a feeling of fraternity" must underpin education, and he relies on Marx in his acceptance of the influence of social traditions and contexts; he insists that, for the sake of a clear educational theory, collectivist and individualist philosophies should collaborate on their "concept of man" (Peters, 1966, pp227-235).

143. See chapter 1, particularly the section entitled Context.

144. Freire, 1972, p16. Freire sees freedom as a historical and economic goal, but never defines it in pure form, preferring to focus on the struggle, which itself is part of human existence.

145. Human beings are "engaged in the ontological and historical vocation of becoming more fully human". (Freire, 1972, p41).

146. Ibid., p24.

147. The struggle "requires an intense faith" in humanity, in particular in human creativity and vocation (Freire, 1972, p63). This creativity is not only manual and intellectual, but psychological, including the ability to envision new social structures and new political possibilities. Here we see a connection with Erikson’s emergence of hope as an early, essential attitude-virtue.

148. For Freire, "immobility is a fatal threat" (Freire, 1972, p57).

149. Exodus 14:5-14.

150. Freire, 1972, p24, but see also pp23-25.

152. Freire’s vision can reveal a profoundly religious view of humanity. His vocabulary uses some explicitly religious terms with regularity, such as sin (Freire, 1996, p88) death and conversion (Freire, 1972, p36). He invests some humanist terms with metaphysical meaning: quest and struggle, for instance, conjure up the image of the pilgrim, while oppression and liberation are spiritual states comparable with sin and salvation. This may or may not be a conscious use of language, but it lends his vision a religious backdrop. Radical Christianity of the 1970s and later decades followed his use of language consistently.

Freire’s upbringing was Christian. He refers vividly to his "love for Christ" which led him to Marx; he ascribes his hatred of poverty and injustice, and his formation as a progressive educator, to Christianity (Freire, 1996, pp86-87).

153. In his book about the contemporary human rights martyrs of Guatemala, significantly entitled Death and Resurrection in Guatemala, Bermudez writes:

"We Christians see in this struggle the drama of Christ on the cross, the challenge to death that Christ hurls from a cross of injustice, oppression, and genocide. But we also see, in this same struggle, the clear sign of a resurrection" (Bermudez, 1986, p xi).

154. See Fowler, 1991, pp3 and ff. Optimistically, Metz prefigured much subsequent new age thinking in his belief that some period of spiritual turmoil and birth in humanity — typically radicalising Rahner’s terminology, he coined the phrase "anthropological revolution" — would be bringing to power the non-dominant virtues (Metz, 1981, pp42ff).

155. See Hull, 1996. His desire is for religious education, together with some other areas of life such as sexuality and childhood, to act as pockets of resistance to money’s penetration of the human spirit (Hull, 1995, p5).

156. Freire is clear that knowledge consists of recognising objective reality and is followed by action towards its transformation (Freire, 1972, pp26-27). Praxis is a holistic knowledge consisting of both critical reflection and action (ibid., p41). The key to transforming situations lies in recognition and consciousness (ibid., pp44, 58).
157. In Freire’s critique of capitalist, banking education, there is a division of labour in which teachers produce knowledge elsewhere and simply transfer it to the learner in the classroom. This is an alienating process, preventing any sense of ownership or active involvement by students (Freire and Shor, 1987, pp.7-8). A corollary is that, if the two steps follow each other in close succession in a cycle, learning can become liberative. Knowledge is produced in the classroom when learners and teacher discover it together. It is perceived at the same moment and in the same place, leading to new questions and so to new production.

158. In Freire’s work, this process is achieved through the generating of themes. The theme is the essential starting-point for a non-banking, liberative opening-up of the participants’ understanding of their historical situation. One of Freire’s most important themes, and perhaps his favourite, is the participants’ understanding of the culture they live in: he refers to this as "the anthropological concept of culture" (Freire, 1972, pp.92ff). Some possible religious themes, and the way in which they might be generated, are dealt with in subsequent sections.


160. This theory can be extended to become an educational option for the poor. Segundo offers, tentatively, some biblical support for this. He sees in the gospels an inverse proportional relationship between people’s knowledge of God’s revelation in Jewish scripture and their recognition of Jesus: in other words, the greater their formal religious knowledge and certitude, the weaker their personal openness and responsiveness. He argues that this reveals a Gospel priority for praxis over doctrine (Segundo, 1976, pp.81ff); it could equally reveal a Gospel priority for personal, intuitive knowing over informational, and for the awareness of the marginalised over that of the powerful. See also Grey’s consideration of the perspectives of the marginalised on revelation (Grey, 1993, p.18).

161. Women’s experience, so often marginalised or silenced, can act through story-telling to question received certainties and methodologies (Mantin, 1996, p.7) but only if it listens to children’s experience and consciously directs itself to equality and against oppression (ibid., p.11.) See also Mitrano in Francis and Thatcher, 1990, p.51, for a personal account of the
power of this approach.

162. The subversive and disruptive theme is shared with socially radical educators in Latin America. Preiswerk sees Christian education as a denunciation of the present, and a praxis which builds the future (Preiswerk, 1987, p97). Chris Arthur’s warnings about the power of advertising to blunt spirituality and produce transcendence blindness suggest that liberative religious knowing is in some way opposed to consumer knowing (Arthur, 1990, pp84-85). Arthur goes on to suggest that religion itself is in some way disruptive of the ordinary certainties held to be adequate or admirable by society at large (Arthur, 1990, p89).

163. Freire argues the case for subjectivity on the grounds that the oppressed internalise their oppression (Freire, 1972, p27).

164. The New Testament verb lēgo can hint at liberative knowing, connoting speech, naming, declaration or assertion (Newman, 1971, p107). From this flows a knowledge which is active naming of evils, denunciation of policies and announcement of divine priorities.


166. Grey, 1993, pp84ff.


168. Gilligan works in a therapeutic context. Grey, who does not, retains therapeutic themes of "embodied knowing" which will enable the learner’s "home-coming", meaning his or her sense of belonging and right (Grey, 1996, pp90-91). Grey might also be understood to mean that "gathering" and "making connections" imply a collecting and integrating of all that is known within a person, including that experience of which the knower is not consciously aware, while "listening" and "desire" imply an attitude of openness and welcome toward the intuitive knowing of others when it is voiced.

169. Freire’s methods are not wholly alien to Scotland, and the story of their implementation in the Adult Literacy Project based in Edinburgh’s Gorgie-Dalry recounts the use of generative themes such as children’s playing in the terraces (Kirkwood and

170. Freire implies the feasibility of his method with all levels: "regardless of the educational setting where progressive education may work - elementary, secondary, tertiary ... - they have no choice but to ensure coherence between their democratic discourse and their equally democratic practice" (Freire, 1996, pp175-6).

171. See Groome, 1980, pp149ff. This thinking is also supported in the British context by Kevin Nichols, who adds that a liberative form of religious education includes the process of conversion from error, illusions and rationalisations (Nichols, 1986, p146). This phenomenon would not be so different from the liberation concept of emerging from false consciousness.

172. I am referring chiefly to issues of myth, historicity and exclusivity of revelation. Arguably, some other areas such as natural theology and theodicy are also matters of indifference to theologians engaging in contexts of oppression.


177. An excellent example is the Metz doctrine of faith as the "dangerous and ... liberating memory" passed through generations and compelling Christians to question contemporary bourgeois world-views (Metz, 1980, p90); and see Moltmann's focus on the Messianic strain in Judaism and Christianity as giving hope to the suffering, abandoned and those who hunger for righteousness (Moltmann, 1995, pp109-114). From a third-world, and perhaps less optimistic perspective, see Ballasuriya's call for the Eucharist to be released from its elitist and capitalist captivity in order to retrieve its full power (Ballasuriya, 1977). From an Orthodox and third world perspective, Mar Osthathios models earth on Heaven by offering the Trinity as model for human society (Mar Osthathios, 1979).

178. The teaching originates in the "sabbath of sabbaths" of Leviticus 25, is returned to in prophetic
mode in Isaiah 61, and in Messianic mode in Luke 4. The
decalogue (Exodus 20:8-10) is usually taken as the
original basis of the Levitical mitzvot to rest.


180. Harris. 1996, pp2-3. Harris interprets these
themes as a five-fold cyclical movement.

181. Harris. 1996.

182. Ibid., pp2-3.

183. Examples would include the practice of suttee in
Hinduism, and the internal strain of anti-semitism and
racism in Christianity.

184. See the section on the Internal Dynamics of the
Therapeutic Metaphor, above in the main text of this
chapter.

185. One British R.E. programme which raises liberative
issues is Weaving the Web, the major Roman Catholic
secondary series in use in England. The series
courages the teacher to raise issues such as the
image of Jesus as liberator and the experience of
Christians who embrace the option for the poor (Lohan
and McClure, 1988a, p52), the necessity of priests, the
possibility of women priests and the contribution of
young people to ministry in the church (Lohan and
McClure, 1988b, pp14-15). Elsewhere, I have argued that
Weaving the Web includes at least three ways of
displaying the radical and liberating dimensions of
religions and of human life, and that, of the three
ways, the direct raising of issues for pupil discussion
is both the most educationally professional and
credible, and also the most effectively liberative
(Chater, 1996).

186. The Christological notes of Chung Hyun Kyung
reject traditional monarchical and hierarchical titles
for Jesus and affirm him as God-with-us, adding newer
titles of liberator, revolutionary, politician, martyr
and mother. Chung claims the right to do this from the
perspective of Asian women (Chung in Sugirtharajah,
pp223ff). Arguably, Chung and others are merely using
an intellectual process akin to the "scribe who becomes
a disciple of the Kingdom of Heaven" who is likened to
a "householder bringing out of the storeroom things
both new and old" (Matthew 13:52).

187. Hull argues that spiritual development and
spiritual education, as concepts in the public and
official mind, have become privatised, spiritualised (i.e., removed from the material), divorced from particular historical and social contexts, and aestheticised. The net effect of this process is to make spirituality - and religion - once again the property of the refined and wealthy. Hull rejects these understandings as false, self-deceptive and originating in the interests and cultural productions of "the money economy" (Hull, 1995, pp8-9).

188. See, for instance, Maslow, 1970 and 1976; Maslow's theory of needs has political connotations (Farmer, 1994).


190. Ibid., pp69ff.

191. Freire's examples of conversational openings to generating themes include "I'd like to talk about .... "; "What does .... mean?": "Why is a discussion of .... of any interest to us?" (adapted from Freire, 1972, p95.)


193. Grimmitt, 1987, pp272ff. But Grimmitt's construction, while broad and liberative in many themes, remains wedded to a coverage of at least five world religions. One gains the impression that these religions must be addressed, even if the generative themes do not raise them; and this position places Grimmitt closer to banking education than to an authentically generative process.

194. See the section on liberative epistemology above in the main section of this chapter.

195. In Latin America, liberative thinking on Christian education is reliant on Freirian processes to the extent that educators are called on to give up coercive power, identify themselves with the problems of the quality of life of the people, and avoid reduplicating divisions of labour in their management of knowledge (Preiswerk, 1987, pp101-2). In another continent, Jesus the teacher is seen as educating from the periphery, where the marginalised are; the crucified Lord has a "periphery-oriented authority" which calls into question the authority of the teachers who work from the centre of power and status (Koyama in
196. In the extreme and explicit forms of oppression manifested in Latin America, this process has sometimes been known as naming idols. Its established theme in the praxis of Latin American and other theologians and is well expressed in Romero's address, "The Political Dimension of the Faith from the Perspective of the Option for the Poor" (Romero, 1990, pp292ff). Sobrino's interpretation of death in central America strikes a similar chord, especially in Sobrino, 1990, where he narrates Romero's direct naming and condemnation of evils such as the agrarian reform programme and the political repression. Popular Christian education in Latin America envisages confronting idols and idolatrous thinking, especially when it attempts to turn religion into an ideology of oppression (Preiswerk, 1987, p98). For an extension of the idols metaphor, see also Schaul, 1988, as an example of how this terminology is used in the international political arena.

197. Pace Postman and Weingartner (1969), this is learning considered as a subversive activity. The critique of culture can be understood theologically in terms of cultural icons: Moore calls on educators to "engage boldly and courageously with those cultural icons that present themselves and confront us with competing values" (Moore, 1996, p26).

198. This pattern is part of Latin American thinking in so far as the "irruption of the poor within the church" (Preiswerk, 1987, p103) has provoked new thinking and teaching along the lines of Sobrino's definition of the true church as the church of the poor, not in the sense that there exists an heretical or schismatic church which is not of the poor, but in the sense that among the poor the church has the "basic substance of ecclesiality" (Sobrino, 1984, p98), in other words that it is most true to itself. Thus the learner's critical interaction may lead a religious tradition back to authenticity just as the learner's therapeutic listening may lead the tradition to the healing of its disfigurement.

199. The praxis cycles now have many variations, but are usually thought to take their theological rationale from Segundo's hermeneutical circle of change in society and change in biblical interpretation (Segundo, 1976, p8). Other works are Holland and Henriot, 1983, and Green, 1990.

201. Insight is often achieved through a "laborious and creative process in which the patient is fully involved. By elaborating a new conceptualisation of himself, he can feel that he is winning his own freedom" (Watts and Williams, 1988, p108). The political possibilities of Maslow's hierarchy of needs are explored in Farmer, 1994.

202. For Jewish theology, religious and human growth is a leaving behind of slavery in Egypt and a movement towards freedom to serve the Holy One (Newman in Cooper, 1988, pp138-9). In this theology, knowledge takes the form of Teshwah - a real existential repentance or grief (ibid., pp140-1), a crying out of the depths (Psalm 130:1) which is also an act of decision, leading to growth and transformation. The psychological stance involved in this form of knowledge is analysed and re-expressed as a release from the numbness of despair, an expression of hope, and a prophetic and political act leading to both inner and outward change (Brueggemann, 1978, pp62ff).

203. Percy's critique of modern healing movements from the perspective of praxis for marginalised communities (Percy, 1995, pp122ff) pictures Jesus taking on the suffering, affliction and ostracisation of the people he cures. Percy contrasts this incarnational involvement with what he sees as the "spiritualised" non-involvement of some modern healing movements in the church.

204. This is a major difference from phenomenology, where the religious phenomenon is the main text, and where the learner, through eidetic reduction, makes herself nearly invisible. Confessional education, with its interest in personal formation, would not find this approach so alien.

205. Althaus-Reid, 1995, p143-4. She shows the potential for critiques of world and church (see ibid. pp146-157). See also Whelan's advocacy of bodily knowing (Whelan, 19954, pp184ff) and the South Korean women theologians' "epistemology of the broken body", an approach which comes to knowledge of the world on the basis of suffering and oppression (Grey, 1996, p82).

206. Hill in Astley and Francis, 1994, pp143ff. But see Theissen's doubts about the state's ability to provide such a context (Theissen, 1993, p269 and 274) in contrast to Halstead's conviction of its democratic possibilities (Halstead, 1995, pp360ff). The issue of
whether church schools would be necessary or desirable under a new metaphor remains open.

207. Arthur, 1982, p489. Under a new therapy metaphor model, therefore, there is a clear case for a gentler, more sustainable pace of personal learning in religion.


209. Propositional emphasis usually belongs with more conservative theologians. For instance, see the definition of religious knowledge as "only truly communicated in a set of specific theological categories or symbols" and "in the context of a particular theological framework" (Fahy, 1992, p21). For a discussion of this problem, see Bitter, 1984.

210. Freire pithily warns that "schools either reject questions or they bureaucratize the act of asking them" (Freire and Faundez, 1989, p40). What is true of schools' treatment of critical liberative questioning could also be true of the search for personal wholeness.

211. For example, teachers' organisations in dialogue with professional counselling bodies could produce guidelines and training; similar work could be done with radical democratic campaigning and community organisations.