LANGUAGE PLANNING IN EDUCATION:
AN ANALYSIS OF THEORY AND PRACTICE

Gibson R. Ferguson

Ph.D.
University of Edinburgh
April 1988
DECLARATION

I hereby declare that this thesis was composed by myself and that the work is my own.

Gibson Ferguson
ABSTRACT

This thesis is a study of theory and practice in language planning in education.

Through a critical review of the literature it provides an overview of key concepts and principles in language planning in education at both a policy and a curriculum level. Among the topics discussed are the choice of media of instruction in developing multilingual societies, language norms for teaching, and the values and conceptions of education that shape the construction of language curricula.

The discussion informs the next stage of the thesis where major situational influences and constraints in language curriculum planning in Third World contexts are identified, and reasons for their significance articulated. Their identification and articulation permits the construction of a framework of contextual factors which, in turn, serves as a principled basis for gathering information on language teaching situations. The application of the framework is exemplified through a small case study, namely a description of the language education situation in Tanzania (Appendix 1).

It is intended that, once collected, the information specified in the framework should function as a resource for planning, and as an initial basis for comparative study of language education policies and their implementation.

Another important concern of the thesis is the conceptual, procedural and managerial aspects of implementing change in education, an area which has hitherto received little attention from applied linguists. From a critical review of literature, a number of prescriptive guidelines for implementation are elicited. Their application to problems of planning is illustrated in a brief discussion of the language education situation in Tanzania.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my thanks to my supervisors, Dr Clive Criper and Dr Alan Davies, for their advice and support during the writing of this thesis.

I am also indebted to the Institute for Applied Language Studies (IALS), University of Edinburgh, for the payment of study fees under its Ph.D scholarship programme, and to the Overseas Development Administration (oda) for the award of a bursary during my Diploma/MSc year 1982–83.

For their generous help in providing me with documents on Tanzania, I would like to thank: Dr Kenneth King (University of Edinburgh), Dr Hugh Trappes-Lomax (IALS) and Dr Jennifer Higham.

I am also most grateful to Shirley Laird for her help in the word-processing of the thesis.

Finally, I owe special thanks to my wife, Karen, for her care, kindness and patience through the difficult circumstances in which this thesis was written.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

1 **INTRODUCTION**

1.1 Aims of the Study 2

1.2 Organisation and Scope of the Study 3

2 **THE CONCEPTUALISATION OF LANGUAGE PLANNING: AN OVERVIEW** 5

2.1 What is Language Planning? 5

2.2 Language Problems and Language Planning 6

2.3 Types of Language Planning Activity

2.3.1 Language Planning Processes in Corpus Planning 7

2.3.2 Aims and Domains of Language Planning

2.3.2.1 Aims of Language Planning 10

2.3.2.2 Domains of Language Planning 11

2.3.3 Types of Language Planning Activity: A Summary 11

2.4 Procedures of Language Planning

2.4.1 Language planning in Comparison with Other Types of Planning 13

2.4.2 Fact-Finding in Language Planning

2.4.2.1 Sociolinguistic Surveys: An Input to Language Planning 15

2.4.3 Policy Determination

2.4.3.1 Decision-Making Systems in Planning and Language Planning 18

2.4.4 Implementation

2.4.4.1 Language Planning: The Analogy with Product Marketing 22

2.4.4.2 Language Planning from the Perspective of Language Spread 23

2.4.5 Evaluation

2.4.5.1 The Application of Cost-Benefit Analysis to Language Planning 26

2.4.5.2 Curriculum Evaluation in Language Planning 28

2.5 Conclusion: The Identity of the Language Planner 29
3 LANGUAGE PLANNING IN EDUCATION: THE POLICY LEVEL

3.1 Issues of Language and Nation

3.1.1 Nationalism and Nationism: The Quest for Integration and Legitimacy

3.1.1.1 National Language Policy and Nationalism/Nationism
3.1.1.2 'Authenticity' and 'Efficiency' in National Language Policy: A Summary

3.1.2 A Typology of National Language Policies

3.1.2.1 National Language Policy: Type A Decisions
3.1.2.2 National Language Policy: Type B Decisions
3.1.2.3 National Language Policy: Type C Decisions
3.1.2.4 An Assessment of the Typology

3.1.3 Demographic, Historical and Social Factors in National Language Policy Determination

3.1.3.1 The Cases of Tanzania, Uganda and Kenya

3.1.4 Conclusion: Language Education Policy and Descriptions of the National Language Situation

3.2 Issues in the Choice of a Medium of Instruction

3.2.1 The Choice of Medium at Tertiary Level

3.2.1.1 Linguistic Factors
3.2.1.2 Practical Factors
3.2.1.3 An Assessment of Factors at Tertiary Level

3.2.2 The Choice of Medium at Secondary Level

3.2.2.1 Educational Resources and the Feasibility/Desirability of a National Language Medium
3.2.2.2 Educational Arguments and Socio-Political Considerations
3.2.2.3 The Choice of Medium: Implications of Tertiary and Primary Levels of Education

3.2.3 The Choice of Medium at Primary Level

3.2.3.1 The Role of the Mother Tongue: Educational Issues
3.2.3.2 The Role of the Mother Tongue: Issues of Practicality
3.2.3.3 The Function of Primary Schooling and the Choice of Medium

3.2.4 Strategies and Options in the Choice of Languages as Media and as Subjects of Instruction

3.2.4.1 An Illustration of Strategic Options in Language Education Policy

3.2.5 Issues in the Choice of Medium: A Concluding Summary

3.3 The Choice of Language 'Norms'in Language Education

3.3.1 Educational Implications of the Emergence of Non-Native Varieties of English

3.3.1.1 An Assessment of the Arguments

3.4 Conclusion
4.1 Conceptions of Education as Inputs to Curriculum Design
  4.1.1 Definitions and Senses of 'curriculum'
  4.1.2 The Ends of Education
  4.1.3 Knowledge and the Curriculum
    4.1.3.1 The Nature of Knowledge
    4.1.3.2 The Forms of Knowledge and their Status
  4.1.4 Views on Childhood and Children
    4.1.4.1 The Status of Childhood
    4.1.4.2 The Moral Quality of Children
    4.1.4.3 The Intellectual Development of Children
  4.1.5 Views on Teaching and the Teacher
  4.1.6 Educational Ideologies: A Summary

4.2 Models of Curriculum Design
  4.2.1 The 'Objectives' Model of Curriculum Design
    4.2.1.1 A Critique of the 'Objectives' Model
    4.2.1.2 The 'Objectives' Model and the Language Curriculum
  4.2.2 'Process' Models of Curriculum Design
    4.2.2.1 'Process' Models and the Language Curriculum
  4.2.3 'Situational' Models of Curriculum Design
  4.2.4 A 'Naturalistic' Model of Curriculum Design
  4.2.5 Models of Curriculum Design: Conclusion

4.3 Curriculum Evaluation
  4.3.1 Definitions of Educational Evaluation
  4.3.2 'Objects' and Functions of Evaluation
  4.3.3 Processes and Methodologies in Curriculum Evaluation
    4.3.3.1 Decision-making Models of Evaluation
    4.3.3.2 The 'Countenance' Model of Evaluation
  4.3.4 Paradigms of Educational Evaluation
    4.3.4.1 The 'Agricultural-Botanical' Paradigm
    4.3.4.2 The 'Anthropological' Paradigm
  4.3.5 Political Dimensions of Curriculum Evaluation

4.4 Conclusion

5 SITUATIONAL ANALYSIS IN LANGUAGE CURRICULUM PLANNING

5.1 Factors affecting Educational Achievement: An Overview of Input-Output Studies
  5.1.1 Educational Achievement: The Influence of School and Non-School Variables
  5.1.2 Educational Achievement: The Influence of School Variables
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.1.2.1</td>
<td>The Effect of Teacher-Training and Other Teacher Effects</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.2.2</td>
<td>The Influence of Textbooks, Class Size and Other School Variables</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.3</td>
<td>Input-Output Studies: Implications for the Present Study</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Professional/Teacher Factors in Language Curriculum Planning</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.1</td>
<td>Teacher Language Proficiency and Competence</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.2</td>
<td>Teacher Education</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.2.1</td>
<td>In-Service Education</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.3</td>
<td>Teacher Morale and Motivation</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.4</td>
<td>Advisory and Teacher Support Services</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.4.1</td>
<td>Increased Supervision (1) - Innovative Developments</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.4.2</td>
<td>Teachers' Associations and Teachers' Centres (2 and 3)</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.4.3</td>
<td>The Professional Role of Headteachers/Senior Staff</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>Resource Factors in Language Curriculum Planning: The Material Context</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.1</td>
<td>The Environment of the School</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.2</td>
<td>School Buildings and Furnishing</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.3</td>
<td>Teaching Materials and Equipment</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>Organisational Factors in Language Curriculum Planning</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4.1</td>
<td>Time Allocations to Language Teaching</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4.1.1</td>
<td>Time as a Resource in Curriculum Innovation</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4.2</td>
<td>Class Size and Composition</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4.2.1</td>
<td>Class Size</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4.2.2</td>
<td>Class Composition</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4.3</td>
<td>Links between the Sub-systems of Education</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>The Role of Examinations in Language Curriculum Planning</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5.1</td>
<td>The Socio-Economic Functions/Meanings of Examinations</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5.2</td>
<td>Examinations and the Curriculum</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5.2.1</td>
<td>Proposals for Reform of Examinations</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5.2.2</td>
<td>Problems of Examination Reform</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5.3</td>
<td>Examinations and Curriculum Reform: Conclusion</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>The Machinery for Curriculum Development</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6.1</td>
<td>Control over the Curriculum</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6.1.1</td>
<td>Curriculum Control: Issues of Centralisation and Diversification</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6.2</td>
<td>Agencies of Curriculum Development and Implementation</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.7 Background factors in Language Curriculum Planning
   5.7.1 Politics 140
   5.7.2 The Economy 141
   5.7.3 Culture and Religion 141
   5.7.4 The History of Education 141
   5.7.5 Demography 142
5.8 Situational Analysis - A Concluding Rationale 142

6 IMPLEMENTING EDUCATIONAL CHANGE: METHODOLOGICAL PRINCIPLES 144

6.1 The Adoption/Rejection of Innovations: An Overview of Theoretical Approaches 144
   6.1.1 Theoretical Paradigms and Approaches in the Study of Social Change 145
     6.1.1.1 Systems Analysis and Phenomenological Approaches to Change 145
     6.1.1.2 Two Paradigms of Social Change 147
   6.1.2 Hypotheses concerning the Adoption/Rejection of Innovations 147
     6.1.2.1 Endemic Conservatism 148
     6.1.2.2 Variable Conservatism 148
     6.1.2.3 Properties of Innovations as Determinants of their Acceptability 151
     6.1.2.4 Communication Hypotheses 153
     6.1.2.5 Situational/Decision Analysis 157
   6.1.3 Conclusion 159

6.2 Strategies of Implementation 160
   6.2.1 Power-Coercive Strategies 161
   6.2.2 Rational-Empirical Strategies 162
   6.2.3 Normative-Re-educative Strategies 163
   6.2.4 Participatory Planning 164

6.3 Factors in the Implementation of Educational Change 165
   6.3.1 Teacher-Centred Factors 165
     6.3.1.1 The World of the Teacher: Implications for Implementation 165
     6.3.1.2 The 'Practically Ethic': The Teacher's View of Innovation 166
     6.3.1.3 In-Service Education and Professional Development 167
     6.3.1.4 Trialling Innovations 169
     6.3.1.5 The Complexity of an Innovation 170
   6.3.2 School-and-System-Centred Factors 171
     6.3.2.1 The Role of the Principal 171
     6.3.2.2 School Climate 172
     6.3.2.3 Staff Turnover 173
     6.3.2.4 Historical Antecedents of Attempts at Innovation 173
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.3.3 The Management of Innovation: Management Factors</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.3.1 Project Monitoring</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.3.2 Contingency Reserves</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.3.3 Managerial Training for Innovation</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.3.4 Time Horizons in Innovative Projects</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4 Conclusion: Guidelines for the Implementation of Change</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 A DATA-COLLECTION INSTRUMENT AND ITS APPLICATION</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1 Description of the Instrument</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2 Application of the Instrument</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3 Conclusions/Discussion</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3.1 The Language Education Situation in Tanzania: A Discussion</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3.1.1 Guidelines for the Management/Implementation of Educational Change</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3.1.2 An Appraisal of Reform Proposals for Tanzania</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3.2 The Data-Collection Framework: An Appraisal</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 CONCLUSIONS AND IMPLICATIONS</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GENERAL BIBLIOGRAPHY</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

APPENDIX: A PROFILE OF THE LANGUAGE EDUCATION SITUATION IN TANZANIA WITH PARTICULAR REFERENCE TO THE TEACHING OF ENGLISH

A.1 BACKGROUND FACTORS                                                  | 230  |
A.2 LANGUAGE SITUATION                                                  | 246  |
A.3 EDUCATION SYSTEM                                                     | 261  |
A.4 THE LANGUAGE CURRICULUM (ENGLISH)                                   | 282  |
A.5 THE EXAMINATION SYSTEM                                               | 302  |
A.6 LEARNERS                                                            | 311  |
A.7 TEACHERS AND TEACHING                                                | 320  |
A.8 THE MATERIAL CONTEXT OF EDUCATION                                   | 345  |
A.9 THE MACHINERY FOR CURRICULUM DEVELOPMENT                             | 351  |
A.10 GENERAL LIST OF REFERENCES/SOURCES                                 | 360  |
1.1 Aims of the Study

This thesis is a study of theory and practice in language planning in education. The aims of the study, and an explanation of them, are presented below.

The first two aims can be stated as follows:

1. To provide an overview of key concepts and principles in language planning in education at both a policy and curriculum level through critical reviews of the relevant literature.

2. To identify major situational influences/constraints in language curriculum planning in Third World contexts, and to articulate reasons for their significance.

The underlying intention here is twofold. First, it is to provide a guide to concepts and principles for those concerned with, or interested in, the field: Curriculum developers, ELT administrators, teacher educators. Second, it is, as stated, to articulate the major situational influences which need to be taken into account in language curriculum planning. The rationale is simple. It is summarised in Clark’s (1987:xii) axiomatic proposition that “... the search for an ideal foreign language curriculum to apply in all circumstances and at all times is illusory.”

Acceptance of this axiom suggests the need for context-sensitivity in teaching/learning plans to achieve a fit with local circumstances, and to minimise the inefficiencies, even absurdities, that can arise when the realities of schools, teachers, learners are overlooked. Reform proposals are more likely to achieve implementation to the extent that they are compatible with existing administrative structures and levels of resourcing. New curricular ideas have to compete with established assumptions about how teaching/learning should proceed.

All this implies a rigorous ‘situational analysis’, the basis of which is some prior account of those contextual factors of which heed should be taken.

The next two aims are a development of the ones above. They are:

3. To devise a framework (of contextual factors) which can serve as a
principled basis for gathering information on language teaching situations;

4. To demonstrate the application of the framework through the description of a language teaching situation (ie. a small case study).

The information so collected should function as an introductory information resource for curriculum developers, and as a platform for more specific situational analyses.

The final two aims are stated below as follows:

5. To draw attention to an existing, but neglected, literature on the implementation of change, its conceptualisation and management, and to point out its significance for applied linguists;

6. To exemplify briefly the application of some principles of implementation in a discussion of the language teaching situation mentioned in (4) above.

These last two aims arise from the notion that a certain inefficiency stems from too rigid a division between professional and administrative aspects of curriculum planning. The idea is made explicit in Chapter 6 which examines the conceptual and managerial aspects of accomplishing change as opposed to the design of the content of change. By virtue of their professional expertise in language education, applied linguists are often called upon to design change, then administer the change programme. In general, however, they are not familiar with principles of change management, nor with conceptualisations of the process of change in education.

1.2 Organisation and Scope of the Study

A description of the organisation of the study will simultaneously indicate its scope.

Chapter 2 provides an overview of language planning and the conceptualisation of its constituent procedures and processes. This establishes the setting for a study of language planning in education.

Chapter 3 looks at the policy level of language planning in education. The main issue discussed is the choice of medium of instruction at the various levels of formal education. Educational arguments for different media are reviewed, and practical/administrative factors affecting the choice identified. The principal frame of reference is multilingual African countries. Because choice of medium is
seen as influenced by national language policy, the chapter opens with a consideration of issues of language and nation.

Chapter 4 turns to curriculum planning in language education, the level at which policy is implemented. It provides an overview of some basic curriculum concepts, focussing on two important inputs to curriculum design and implementation: conceptions of education and models of the design process itself. An understanding of these assists the planner interpret the curricula he encounters.

In Chapter 5 an effort is made to identify and articulate major situational factors affecting the curriculum in operation, which consequently need to be taken into account by the planner embarking on curriculum renewal.

Chapter 6 offers a critical review of the literature on the implementation of change in education. The intention is to remedy neglect of the conceptual and procedural aspects of change management. It concludes with an outline of some prescriptive guidelines on the implementation of change.

In Chapter 7 an information-gathering framework is described. This pulls together and enumerates the contextual factors previously referred to. The framework is then applied in the description of a language teaching situation, that of Tanzania (see Appendix 1). The resulting profile is the basis for a short discussion of reform proposals in the light of the principles introduced in the preceding chapter.

In Chapter 8, the concluding chapter, a few suggestions for further research and development are outlined.
CHAPTER 2
THE CONCEPTUALISATION OF LANGUAGE PLANNING:
AN OVERVIEW

Language planning is an ancient activity but a relatively new academic discipline. In consequence, considerable energy has been expended on constructing descriptive conceptual frameworks for organising thought about the subject. The purpose of this chapter is to explore and interpret these frameworks. As a first step, it is necessary to examine what the term 'language planning' denotes.

2.1 What is Language Planning?

The term 'language planning' has been applied to a wide range of activities. Karam (1974), for instance, lists the following as instances of LP activity:

- the development of vernaculars into national languages
- the revival of ancient languages (eg. Hebrew)
- attempts to deal with conflicting language loyalties (eg. Norway)
- the expansion and purification of vocabulary (eg. Turkey)
- script reform (eg. China)
- the development of writing systems for unwritten languages.

In efforts to distil what is common to the set of activities above, several writers (Rubin & Jernudd 1971:xiv; Rubin 1971:218; Weinstein 1980) have proposed definitions of LP. Perhaps the best known of these is that offered by Fishman (1974a:79):

"The term 'language planning' refers to the organised pursuit of solutions to language problems, typically at the national level."

Analysis of the concept of planning further suggests that LP involves choices between alternative goals and the drawing up of alternative strategies for attaining these goals (Rubin 1983). By its very nature, therefore, LP is future-orientated.

From such a definition of LP, it follows that edicts enunciating language policy do not of themselves constitute planning. Thus, as Harries (1976) observes, the late President Kenyatta's 1974 declaration that Swahili was to be Kenya's national language would not constitute an instance of LP since no provisions were made
for the implementation of this change in language status.

2.2 Language Problems and Language Planning

Although definitions of LP are helpful in delineating certain core features, further understanding of the nature of LP is arguably best advanced by focussing on the language problems with which it deals.

There appear to be two basic ways of conceptualising the nature of these problems. The first, less favoured view associated with scholars such as Tauli (1974) suggests that the essential problem is one of improving language as an instrument of communication by reference to the criteria of economy, clarity and beauty. This puristic and narrowly linguistic view is, however, rejected by the majority of LP scholars. The latter (eg. Jernudd & Das Gupta 1971) argue that LP problems have an inescapably political and social character. As Rubin (1973) puts it, language problems arise within a social and political framework, and therefore LP must consider 'the facts of language within the fuller context.' In other words, the understanding and subsequent treatment of language problems requires not merely an appreciation of their technical linguistic aspects but insight into the socio-political motivation underlying their initial identification, and the demands that they be addressed.

Once the social and political dimensions of LP are conceded, one can better understand why LP has, as Kennedy (1982), points out, a multi-disciplinary flavour. Among the disciplines on which LP draws one can include sociology and economics. It is, however, the interconnections between language and politics that are to be particularly noted since LP activity typically involves interaction between politicians and 'technical experts' (ie. linguists) (Jernudd & Das Gupta 1971:197).

2.3 Types of Language Planning Activity

Considerable attention has been allocated to the description and categorisation of types of LP activity. Thus, on the basis of somewhat similar criteria the following ways of dichotomising LP activity have been proposed: policy vs. cultivation (Neustupny 1974); allocation vs. planning (Gorman 1972); language cultivation vs. language policy (Paulston 1974). It appears that the common basis for these dichotomies is whether the focus of LP activity is primarily concentrated on changing the language code itself to resolve
communication problems, or on changing the functions and status of a language viz a viz other languages in a speech community to satisfy political pressures. It is precisely this kind of difference that Kloss' (1969) distinction between corpus and status planning more satisfyingly and accurately captures.

Corpus planning, as suggested above, refers to planning involving changes in the language code, that is changes in structure, vocabulary, spelling or script. Status planning, on the other hand involves the planning of changes in the status (or functions of a language) viz a viz other languages in the community. Thus, while corpus planning is primarily code-orientated, status planning focusses attention on the societal functions performed by a language variety. The two are, however, interrelated since a change in language status frequently requires the engineering of changes in the language corpus. Typically, corpus planning is undertaken by linguists (applied linguists) mandated by political authorities. In status planning, by contrast, the main decisions are taken by politicians. Subsequently, linguists, educationists, broadcasters, or civil servants are required to execute the policy in question.

2.3.1 Language Planning Processes in Corpus Planning

Within corpus LP, the central processes remain those outlined by Haugen (1966a,b,1983). In essence, these are as follows:

(a) Selection (of norm): The choice of the language variety which will serve as the basis for the standard language, eg. the choice between urban and rural dialects in Norway, or the choice between the Kimvita and Kianguja dialects of Swahili with regard to which will be the basis of the standard language.

(b) Codification (of norm): The process by which norms of correctness and appropriacy are stabilised. Garvin (1973) suggests that a standard language possesses the property of ‘flexible stability’. Codification contributes to stability in that the output of the codification process is grammar and dictionaries which act as ‘norm stabilisers’.

(c) Implementation: Those activities necessary for the dissemination of codified norms. Writers, institutions (eg. academies), educational systems and the mass media may all act as agencies for the dissemination of codified norms. This apparatus may be further backed by regulations encouraging or requiring the use of the new norms in public domains.

(d) Elaboration (of norm): The process by which a language variety is refined to make it fit for new functions. Typically, elaboration consists of
developing or refining technical vocabulary for scientific/technological fields. Elaboration contributes to the 'flexibility' of a standard language (Garvin 1973) and promotes its 'intellectualisation', that is "... a tendency towards increasingly more definite and accurate expression ..." (Garvin 1973:784).

[Acceptance is sometimes cited as a further LP process. However, it cannot be so, for acceptance is not an activity performed by language planners but a response to language change by the target population for whom such changes were intended].

Haugen’s main concern in developing the conceptual framework of LP processes referred to above was to explicate the operations by which a vernacular is developed into a standard language. Fishman (1974), however, has argued that each of the above LP processes may also be applied to other ‘resultants’ of LP (Ferguson 1968). Apart from standardisation, these are:

(a) graphisation: (the development of a writing system for a language);
(b) modernisation: ('the development of intertranslatability with other languages', mainly through vocabulary elaboration. (Ferguson 1968).

By cross-tabulating Haugen’s processes with Ferguson’s ‘resultants’, Fishman (1974) produces the following matrix which he claims gives a fuller picture of LP processes than any single individual’s framework. Note that to Haugen’s processes is added a further process of ‘cultivation’ (Neustupny 1974). ‘Cultivation’ is defined as an approach which addresses “... questions of correctness, efficiency, linguistic levels fulfilling specialised functions, problems of style, constraints on communicative capacity.” (Neustupny 1974:39).
Figure 1: Fishman's (1974) Representation of Processes in and Resultants of Language Planning

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LP Resultants</th>
<th>Selection/ i) Implementation</th>
<th>Codification ii)</th>
<th>Elaboration iii)</th>
<th>Cultivation iv)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a) Graphization</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Standardization</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) Modernization</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From the above description of LP processes it becomes clear that corpus planning is essentially a process of norm creation and dissemination. Language planners are, therefore, norm-creating persons 'par excellence'.

In contrast to corpus planning, status planning comprises no distinctive language engineering processes. What there are, however, are procedures or stages of planning to which attention will be turned shortly.

2.3.2 Aims and Domains of Language Planning

One way of describing and categorising language planning activity is by reference to the planning 'object', that is the status or the corpus of the language. Another is through reference to the aims of language planners and to the domains within which LP may operate. In this section, then, these aspects of LP are considered briefly.
2.3.2.1 Aims of Language Planning

Evaluation of the outcomes of LP activity presupposes some understanding of the goals or aims of language planners. To advance such understanding Rubin (1977) has proposed a threefold classification of LP aims into linguistic aims, semi-linguistic and extra-linguistic aims. This classification is similar to that used by Rabin (1971) who uses the same terms with a slightly different meaning.

For Rubin (1977a) the basis of the classification rests on whether LP is directed toward the solution of communication problems in themselves with little reference to external political implications (linguistic aims), or whether LP is undertaken for essentially political purposes with language serving as an incidental instrument for accomplishing them (extra-linguistic aims).

Rabin (1971), in contrast to Rubin (1977a), bases his classification on the kind of expert who contributes to the planning process. Planning for extra-linguistic aims is claimed to fall primarily within the province of the political scientist or sociologist; semi-linguistic aims involve mostly linguists; and linguistic aims are, in Rabin's words (1971:279):

"... the province of the normative linguist in collaboration with the literary practitioner."

An interesting point about both these classifications is the extent to which the distinctions they embody seem to correspond to the broader distinction between status and corpus planning. For example, extra-linguistic aims may be seen as falling within the scope of status planning in that they concern "... the use of a given language block or relative extent of usage of competing language blocks" (Rabin 1971:277). Similarly, insofar as linguistic aims concern changes in vocabulary (elaboration or standardisation), they fall within the scope of corpus planning. Too rigid a classification of LP aims is, however, unwise since it may obscure the fact that in actuality several classes of aims are likely to be pursued simultaneously. Despite their questionable basis, Rubin and Rabin's classifications do at least draw attention to a recurring issue in LP studies, namely the extent to which LP is fundamentally a political process to which linguists make contributions, or a more autonomous activity of linguists, or some untidy mixture of the two.
2.3.2.2 Domains of Language Planning

According to Karam (1974:108), LP may in principle operate wherever areas of communication stress in society are identified. It is interesting, therefore, to note that Annamalai & Rubin (1980) have listed a number of domains in which LP may take place. Apart from education, these include law and administration, religion, publishing, work and the mass media.

Rubin (1983) points out that though education is traditionally the domain for which most status planning has been done, such planning has recently entered new domains. Cited here is the domain of work and business. For example, the provincial government of Quebec has over recent decades attempted to enhance the status of the French language. Thus, among other provisions, Bill 101 (1971) stipulates that business establishments employing over 50 persons should (on pain of sanctions) obtain francisation certificates (these testify to the firm’s use of French for external and internal communication). Rubin (1983) also mentions other domains (eg. computer technology) where LP operations are incipient.

Such examples illustrate the potentially wide scope of LP activity. In this thesis, however, the main concern is with LP in education.

2.3.3 Types of Language Planning Activity: A Summary

To conclude this section on types of LP activity, it may be useful to construct a diagram which attempts to capture in summary form the principal dimensions of LP and the distinctions that have been discussed in preceding pages. This diagram is presented overleaf.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimensions of Language Planning</th>
<th>2 Basic Types of Language Planning</th>
<th>REFERENCES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Nature of Planning Object</td>
<td>A. STATUS PLANNING</td>
<td>REFERENCES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Primarily Language Function Orientated</td>
<td>Kloss (1969)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B. CORPUS PLANNING</td>
<td>Cobarrubias (1983)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Change in Language Code eg. graphization standardization modernization</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mainly language specialists mandated by government authorities</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.4 Procedures of Language Planning

Rubin (1971, 1977a) has identified four procedural phases of planning as follows:

- a fact-finding stage
- a policy determination stage
- an implementation stage
- an evaluation stage

They need not, however, necessarily occur in the linear sequence depicted here.

One worrying aspect of the language planning literature is that these procedures or phases in planning are sometimes not distinguished from processes in LP. It seems preferable, however, that the two should be distinguished on the grounds that whereas such processes as elaboration or codification are specific to LP, the procedural phases identified by Rubin (1977) are common to types of planning other than LP. What, then, distinguishes LP from other types of planning is not so much the presence of these phases/stages in the planning programme but the forms they take in LP or the ways in which they are realised. Before considering how these procedural phases are manifested in LP and the bodies of theory/information that inform each phase, it may be useful to pause briefly to address the issue of comparability between LP and other types of planning.

2.4.1 Language Planning in Comparison with Other Types of Planning

LP is broadly concerned with bringing about, or preventing, changes in language behaviour, or behaviour towards language (Cooper’s distinction: Cooper (1980)). It, therefore, has a family relationship to a range of planning activities whose purpose is to manipulate economic, social or political patterns of behaviour in selected populations. In view of this similarity, it is not surprising that several LP scholars have borrowed concepts and methodologies from other forms of planning and attempted to apply them to LP.

One example might be the concept of ‘unexpected system linkages’. This refers to the phenomenon by which planning in one sector produces unexpected side-effects in other sectors through a complex cause-and-effect chain. Fishman (1974) illustrates the applicability of the concept to LP by pointing out that the elaboration of a language code for new functions may require the displacement
of other codes hitherto used for this purpose. However, this may mean a redistribution in the control over knowledge and a shift of power between groups. Such a shift may, in turn, provoke counter-planning from the threatened group.

The extent to which one can pursue parallels between LP and other forms of planning depends, as Fishman (1974) points out, on the degree to which language can be treated as a resource in the same sense as other resources (eg. land, labour, water). Clearly, there are major differences between the two. First, language is not a quantifiable entity, neither is it divisible in the obvious sense that land or water is. Second, unlike other planning 'objects', language is central to personal and group identity for which it is a symbol or token. To that extent, it may be more heavily 'value-encumbered' than other planning 'objects' (Khubchandani 1977; Eastman 1981). It is wise, then, to exercise considerable caution in attempts to apply to LP concepts and methodologies drawn from other types of planning. Nonetheless, as Fishman (1974:83) observes, this does not negate the general value of seeking analogies between language and other-than-language planning:

"... there is ... reason to seek analogies, as well as differences, between language and other-than-language resources and resource planning, and to expect that considerable clarification will flow from both efforts."

In the following sections there will be opportunities to assess the validity of analogies drawn between LP and other forms of planning.

**2.4.2 Fact-Finding in Language Planning**

Rubin (1971,1977) characterises the fact-finding stage of planning as one in which relevant information regarding the setting of the planning programme is gathered. This information is then used to guide policy-making and implementation. In LP this phase (of planning) is often realised through the undertaking of sociolinguistic surveys. It is, therefore, an opportune point at which to comment on the nature and functions of sociolinguistic surveys in the description of national language situations.
2.4.2.1 Sociolinguistic Surveys: An Input to Language Planning

Perhaps the best-known examples of sociolinguistic surveys are the Ford Foundation sponsored surveys of 'Language Use and Language Teaching in Eastern Africa' (five volumes, 1972-80, OUP), the Jordan survey (Harrison, Prator, Tucker 1975), and the 'Survey of Language Use and Attitudes toward Language in the Philippines' (Sibayan 1975). Apart from the surveys themselves, there is also a substantial literature on the methodology and functions of sociolinguistic surveys. Ohannessian, Ferguson & Polome (1975), for example, edit a collection of papers on methodological issues in survey work, and Cooper (1980) and Polome (1982) discuss the purpose and activities of sociolinguistic surveys.

Cooper’s (1980) overview article, in particular, provides a useful taxonomy of behaviours that may be investigated. These, he claims, divide into two broad categories: (a) language behaviour (eg. proficiency, acquisition and usage) and, (b) behaviour toward language (eg. attitudes and 'implementational behaviour'). Each of these behaviours may be assessed at two levels of abstraction: (a) a micro-sociolinguistic level (eg. Labov’s study on postvocalic /r/ usage in New York City), and (b) a macro-sociolinguistic level. The resulting taxonomy is depicted in the diagram below:
Figure 3: Cooper’s (1980) Taxonomy of Behaviours Assessed by Sociolinguistic Surveys

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Behaviour</th>
<th>Level of Observation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Micro</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language Behaviour</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Proficiency</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Acquisition</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) Usage</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Behaviour towards Language</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Altitudinal</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Implementational</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Surveys relevant to LP typically operate at a macro-sociolinguistic level of observation and are concerned with the investigation of what language varieties are spoken and understood in a given geographical area, in what contexts, for what purposes, and, more problematically, what attitudes are held towards those language varieties.

The main motivations for undertaking sociolinguistic surveys are fourfold (Cooper 1980):

(a) To serve the need for accurate, reliable information as an input to rational language policy decisions.

(b) To provide information to help execute a specific planning programme. (For example, if a literacy programme is to be implemented through the medium, say, of Amharic, it is important to know in the first place what proportion of the population is literate in that language, and to what degree the medium is intelligible to what percentage of potential learners (Cooper et al, 1976)).

(c) To assess the effectiveness of existing language education programmes. (Such evaluational surveys may be either research or policy orientated. An
example of the former might be Macnamara's study of Irish pupils achievement in school under varying language conditions (different mediums); an example of the latter, the Jordan survey (Harrison et al, 1975). After studying English language use and teaching, recommendations were made on language policy, curriculum change, teacher-training and research).

(d) To stimulate local interest and research in language, linguistics and language pedagogy (Prator 1975:147).

It is almost redundant to add here that the purpose for the survey will largely determine its design.

Sociolinguistic surveys may encounter various problems. Apart from the obvious logistical ones, the main and more insidious pitfalls are methodological in nature. With regard to data collection, there is the problem of (i) the reliability of census data and of self-report data (collected through questionnaires), and (ii) sampling (biased or excessively small samples will give a misleading picture of the language situation). With regard to data analysis, there is the danger of (i) erroneous or inappropriate statistical analysis procedures, and (ii) erroneous or unsupported inferences from the data. Stated thus, such pitfalls may seem easy to avoid, but, as Scotton (1978) and Romaine (1980) observe, it is not uncommon to find methodologically flawed surveys.

A final important question concerns the influence surveys actually have on policy-making. Whiteley (1973) doubts if they have any influence at all on policy-formulation. He argues that information calling into question pre-existing sets of policies is unlikely to be favourably regarded. On the other hand, surveys documenting or evaluating the implementation of existing policy are more likely to win the attention of the relevant authorities.

The extent to which Whiteley's views are justified is a matter for empirical investigation. If it can be shown that survey information is uninfluential in policy formulation, then this is a matter for regret since the information provided by surveys is clearly of great potential value to language planners, particularly those working in the field of language in education.
2.4.3 Policy Determination

In this phase of the planning programme actual policy formulation occurs. Decisions on goals are taken and means selected for their attainment, ideally with the benefit of information provided at the fact-finding stage.

In contrast to fact-finding, it is difficult to detect any distinctive realisation that policy determination has in LP. The nature of the decision-making process, if not the content of decisions, seems similar across several types of planning. Variation in the decision-making process is mainly introduced by the political arrangements of the planning setting. Consequently, an examination of the relevant political mechanisms and decision-making structures constitutes an entry point into the study of this phase of LP.

2.4.3.1 Decision-Making Systems in Planning and Language Planning

(a) Levels and Hierarchies in LP

LP has so far been discussed as if it were solely an activity conducted at national level. Several writers (Fishman 1974; Jernudd 1973; Tollefson 1981a,b; Kennedy 1982) have, however, debated whether LP may be said to be pursued at other, lower levels. Tollefson (1981a), for example, distinguishes between macro-policy goals and implementation decisions and micro-policy goals and implementation decisions. The latter pair of terms is reserved for planning activities at below the national level. Kennedy (1982), too, argues that the concept of LP may be extended to encompass a variety of hierarchical levels ranging from the Government and Ministry at the macro level to the classroom at the lowest micro level. His 'crude system of levels ...' is reproduced diagrammatically below.
The underlying argument for such a system of levels of LP appears (for both Tollefson and Kennedy) to be as follows:

The implementation of language plans typically takes place within a complex set of interlocking and hierarchically ordered institutions. To the extent that institutions lower down in the hierarchy enjoy some degree of autonomy, and to the extent that planning goals are broadly rather than narrowly defined, these lower levels may be said to engage in planning. They do so because plans arriving from higher levels may require further elaboration to render them appropriate to more specific situations of implementation. Continuity between levels is nonetheless preserved in that each level in the hierarchy serves as an implementation agent of the policy defined by the level immediately above it in the hierarchy.

For Kennedy (1982) the value of a crude model of levels of LP is that it may assist in locating the origins of problems in particular planning projects. As applied to the development of language teaching programmes, it might also stimulate the curriculum worker to enquire how his work, as a possible example of LP at the more micro-level, relates to higher and lower levels in the organisational hierarchy. This strengthened awareness, particularly of higher levels of planning, may, Kennedy (1982) suggests, eventually contribute to more effective curriculum planning.

(b) Centralised and Decentralised Language Planning Processes

Apart from the differences between the macro and the micro levels of LP,
a further distinction has been suggested (Tollefson, 1981b) between centralised and decentralised language planning processes. The motivation for this distinction is to throw light on the nature of decision-making systems in LP, and thus on some of the constraints under which planners work. The terms ‘centralised’ and ‘decentralised’, in Tollefson’s words (1981b:176), refer to:

"... the degree of local initiative involved in the formulation and implementation of a national plan and to the scope (local, regional, national) of the intended outcomes of the plan."

The degree to which planning is in fact centralised or decentralised in a given polity is to be assessed in the light of three criteria derived from the field of general planning theory and research (Berman 1978). These are as follows:

(i) **Degree of Coupling:**
As previously suggested, policies formulated by the central authorities (of a state) are typically implemented through a set of hierarchically ordered institutions. However, the interactions between these institutions may be complex since they may subscribe to goals and perspectives which differ not only from the central authorities but from each other. The degree to which units within the hierarchy operate autonomously and exhibit their own perspectives is termed ‘the degree of coupling within the system’. ‘Loosely-coupled systems’, then, allow considerable autonomy to individual units in the hierarchy to determine their own organisation and objectives. ‘Tightly-coupled systems’, by contrast, are ones where the central authorities exercise a high degree of control over the organisation, aims and perspectives of subordinate bodies.

In ‘loosely-coupled systems’ (i.e. decentralised systems) it is possible for plans implemented at local level to diverge significantly from those formulated centrally at national level. Whilst this permits plans implemented at local level to take more account of local sensitivities, it also affords more opportunities for well-intentioned plans to be subverted at local or regional level. Such, however, is the price of decentralisation.

(ii) **Degree of Plan Adaption:**
‘Plan Adaption’ simply refers to the well-documented phenomenon by which plans undergo reinterpretation and modification as they pass down through the implementation hierarchy. According to Tollefson (1981b), centralised LP is characterised by a low degree of plan adaption and decentralised LP by a high degree of adaption.
To illustrate the process of plan adaption, Tollefson makes an interesting reference to language education policy in India. Here, the federal 'Three Language Formula', which recommends the study of Hindi, English and the Mother tongue for the non-Hindi population, and Hindi, English and any other modern Indian language for the Hindi population, has in fact varied considerably in its implementation from state to state. In some non-Hindi states (eg. West Bengal) opposition to the spread of Hindi has prompted some local authorities to substitute the study of Sanskrit for Hindi. Likewise, in some Hindi states (eg. Uttar Pradesh) Sanskrit, not a modern Indian language, has been treated as the third language.

(iii) Macro- and Micro-Implementation Perspectives:
According to Tollefson (1981b), the implementation of plans may be viewed differently according to one's position in the implementation hierarchy. From the 'macro-implementation' perspective of the central authorities, the problem of implementation is essentially one of devising strategies to ensure local authorities execute the national plan effectively and with fidelity. From the 'micro-implementation' perspective of the local authorities, on the other hand, the problem is rather one of modifying the plan to suit local perspectives, and of devising and executing local policies and procedures.

In centralised LP the 'macro-implementation perspective' dominates, and since central and local authorities are 'tightly-coupled', there tends in practice to be little divergence between macro- and micro-implementation perspectives. In decentralised LP, however, where 'loose-coupling' obtains, there is often substantial divergence between the two perspectives, and the micro-perspective exerts a strong influence over policies and procedures established at the macro level. In practice, this means that macro-implementation decisions (taken at national level) strive to accommodate local interests and local organisations.

Surveying these criteria for distinguishing centralised and decentralised LP, one wishes to question to what extent they are truly independent of each other. Is it in principle possible, for instance, for plan adaption to occur in a 'tightly-coupled system'? If not, then the two criteria are not as distinct as sometimes presented, and one wonders, therefore, what extra discriminating power the second criterion contributes.

Notwithstanding these problems of clarity, the broad distinction between centralised and decentralised LP seems a useful one both for comparing LP in different settings and for providing constructs for the analysis of
constraints on decision-making. A knowledge of organisational constraints on decision-making (in centralised or decentralised systems) is of potentially considerable value to the planner since such constraints decisively affect the formulation and implementation of plans.

2.4.4 Implementation

The implementation phase, in Karam's words (1974:109), simply includes all "...the activity necessary for the execution of the plan". The forms implementation may take in LP are very varied and depend largely on the type of planning operation engaged in.

In corpus planning, where there is an output of LP products (codified norms, 'elaborated' vocabulary), the dissemination activities of the media, educational institutions, language academies, publishing houses, and creative writers, clearly have a significant role and merit study. In status planning the same agencies all play a part though the main burden of implementation usually falls on educational institutions. In LP in education, however, the implementation process devolves, one may suggest, on curriculum planning and is best studied, therefore, in terms of the theory and practice of curriculum renewal/innovation. The principal actors here are curriculum developers, textbook writers and ultimately teachers. Teacher education, thus, has an important role in the implementation of plans in LP in education.

Returning, however, to corpus planning, one can identify two interesting contributions to the study and conceptualisation of implementation. The first is an analogy with product marketing and the second a proposal for the study of LP from the perspective of language spread.

2.4.4.1 Language Planning: The Analogy with Product Marketing

Cooper (1979) has suggested that there is an illuminating analogy to be drawn between the dissemination of LP products and product marketing. Just as marketing managers may measure the success of a product in terms of sales, so may language planners assess the success of their implementation efforts according to the extent to which a given language change has been adopted by the target population.

The same analogy is also suggestive of ways in which product marketing/LP implementation may be improved. Marketing executives, for instance, sometimes
study the variables influencing the market environment into which their products are to be launched in the hope of shifting demand curves. Similarly, if LP is to be more effectively implemented, it is necessary, Cooper (1979) argues, that language planners investigate the mechanisms governing the adoption of 'communicative innovations' so as to secure more widespread acceptance of their 'products'. A suitable conceptual framework for this investigation is, in Cooper's (1979) view, that proposed for the study of language spread.

2.4.4.2 Language Planning from the Perspective of Language Spread

Although language spread differs from the diffusion of planned linguistic innovations (eg. new terminology), they are, Cooper suggests, sufficiently similar to be profitably studied through the same conceptual framework. Thus, it is argued, a study of the variables associated with the rate and extent of language spread (an expansion in the number of users, or uses, of a given language variety) will throw light on the conditions under which planned language changes are adopted by target populations. The framework to be employed for the investigation of these conditions is defined (Cooper 1979) in terms of a single composite question – 'Who adopts what, when, where, why and how?'. It may be worthwhile here to run over the variables that are to be investigated in the research programme.

'Who': Information is sought on the characteristics (socio-economic, cultural) that distinguish early and late adopters of innovation, and adopters from non-adopters.

'Adopts':

Evidence from rural sociology (the diffusion of agricultural innovation) indicates that adoption is not instantaneous but proceeds gradually. With this in mind, Cooper (1979) proposes four stages in the adoption of communicative innovation: (i) awareness, (ii) evaluation (forming an opinion about innovation x), (iii) knowledge (knowing how to use x), (iv) usage (frequent use of x). It is possible that different dissemination activities influence these stages of adoption differentially (eg. is broadcasting more effective with regard to awareness than to evaluation and usage?).

'What': Information is sought on the structural and functional characteristics of the innovation that are correlated with differences in the rate and extent of the innovation's adoption. In general, it has been suggested that the extent of an innovation's diffusion is linked to its degree of complexity – (but how is one to independently measure a communicative innovation's
With regard to structural characteristics, Cooper (1979) hypothesises that other things being equal, a language will be more readily adopted (i) if it is structurally similar to languages already known, and (ii) that relatively less elaborated (or functionally differentiated) languages will be more readily adopted than more elaborated languages. (Hence, Cooper argues, the preference for Malay over Javanese as a lingua franca in Indonesia).

'When':

With respect to individual adopters, information is sought on the time at, or over, which an innovation is adopted. This will permit the plotting of diffusion curves (number of adopters as a function of time of adoption) and the comparison of the characteristics of early and late adopters.

'Where':

Information is sought not on the geographical location of adopters but on the 'socially-defined' locations through which innovations spread (Cooper 1979:37). What, in other words, are the role-relationships that mediate the spread of innovations? (eg. are interactions between persons of equal or unequal status more conducive to spread?). Also, in what domains do potential adopters encounter and adopt communicative innovations? Given this kind of information, it would be possible to identify which social channels are particularly conducive to the diffusion of communicative innovations.

'Why':

Information is sought on the reasons or motives for adoption. In answering this question, one can enquire into the incentives (economic or social) for adoption, or into the facilitating value of an innovation (ie. what does adoption of the innovation permit one to do that one could not do before?).

'How':

Finally, information is sought on the key mechanisms that govern the diffusion of communicative innovations. Cooper (1979:41) proposes that in essence diffusion occurs when one individual A 'who is a potential source of influence' with respect to an innovation encounters another individual B who has 'not yet adopted the innovation'. It is important, then, to determine which individual change agents and what types of encounter are influential with regard to adoption.

One suspects, however, that these are questions already subsumed under the others previously mentioned.

The value of Cooper's (1979) framework is that it clearly identifies some of
the important variables regarding the spread of innovation that require further investigation if the process of diffusion is to be better understood. This understanding is essential to the improvement of dissemination strategies.

Haugen (1983) believes that the discipline of LP has remained largely descriptive and has not yet reached a stage of 'explanatory adequacy'. One may suggest, however, that the investigation of the variables identified by Cooper (1979) might constitute a small step toward the attainment of 'explanatory adequacy', at least in the field of implementation in corpus LP.

2.4.5 Evaluation

For Rubin (1971, 1977) evaluation is a process of assessing and monitoring developments at all stages of the planning programme, and hence has a broader scope than summative evaluation.

"The evaluation process must be conceived as a continuing one that is constantly providing new and relevant information that is to be incorporated into planning." (Rubin 1971:223)

Although the central purpose of evaluation is to assess whether the actual outcome of the planning programme matches the predicted outcome, it does, in Rubin's view, have functions to serve in various stages of planning. For example, in the policy determination phase the evaluator may help assess the compatibility of goals, and help determine whether strategies are logically consistent with goals, and goals with predicted outcomes. In fact-finding, the evaluator may help "... isolate the important parameters (social, cultural, and the like) that will be relevant to the establishing of his goals, strategies and predicted outcomes" (Rubin 1971:222). Finally, at the summative stage the evaluator may assist in the formulation of criteria to assess the actual outcome and measure it against the predicted outcome. In turn, these criteria help determine to what extent the programme has succeeded in meeting its goals.

It should be pointed out here that Rubin's notion of evaluation as an on-going process is not the only way in which evaluation is construed in the literature. Kennedy (1982:274), for example, outlines three forms of evaluation, one of which involves "... judging the effectiveness and nature of processes in complete language planning programmes." Evaluation in this sense, then, takes place after the completion of the planning programme and presumably aims at the assessment of alternative implementational approaches in different planning operations. It is thus comparative in its scope.
Whatever the precise sense given to evaluation in LP, the difficulties attaching to it are broadly similar. The principal one, familiar to educational researchers, is that it is often difficult to establish whether planning caused the hoped for outcome or whether other intervening factors were really responsible. Since language changes are often co-extensive with other social changes, it may be difficult, in other words, to trace out the causal relationships between strategies and the outcomes they were designed to bring about.

A second difficulty is that many LP operations do not have a pre-defined time frame for the accomplishment of goals. It is thus sometimes difficult to know if sufficient time has elapsed for a judgement of failure to be valid.

Third, LP by its nature encompasses many variables that cannot be precisely quantified and measured. To weight these variables appropriately without covertly introducing undeclared value assumptions is a continuing problem in LP evaluation.

A final difficulty is that of actual versus stated goals. Policy-makers may render evaluation difficult by obscuring their real goals or by simply failing to provide any. Rubin (1977,1983) exemplifies the point by referring to the case of the Gaelic League and the Movement for the Restoration of Irish (see: Macnamara 1971). If the goal of the Movement was to make Irish the language of everyday communication, it has failed. On the other hand, if the real goal was to establish an independent Irish state with language serving as a symbolic rallying point, then it may be said to have succeeded.

It is possible to identify at least two sources of theoretical input into evaluation in LP, namely, cost–benefit analysis and curriculum evaluation. It may be worth commenting on these briefly.

2.4.5.1 The Application of Cost–Benefit Analysis to Language Planning

Cost–benefit analysis is a well-established activity in many types of planning but, outside the work of a few writers (eg. Thorburn 1971; Jernudd 1971; Bachman & Strick 1981), its relevance to LP has not been very thoroughly explored.

The essential aim of a cost–benefit analysis is to state in rigorous terms the consequences of following alternative courses of action. In other words, the consequences of given planning alternatives are described by means of a systematic comparison of the costs and returns of those alternatives. Such a
comparison can, Thorburn (1971) argues, contribute to more rational decision-making. Since language planners seek in some sense to maximise returns from given amounts of resources, it is arguable that cost–benefit analysis is a potentially useful method of identifying the LP alternative that yields the greatest return per unit of costs incurred.

As one might expect, however, there are several problems in the application of cost–benefit analysis to LP. The first concerns time–horizons. In order to determine what consequences should be included in the cost–benefit calculation it is necessary that the calculation apply to some agreed given time frame. In LP, however, it can be difficult to set precise time horizons beyond which consequences should no longer merit inclusion in the calculation. Disadvantages attach to both too long and too short time horizons. The further away the time horizon is set, the more uncertain the planning environment becomes (ie. more unanticipated events can occur in a ten year span than a five year one). Too short a time horizon, on the other hand, is also disadvantageous for several reasons. First, as Cooper (1979) suggests, language changes (corpus or status) affect the behaviour of social groups (or individuals), but with a considerable time lag between cause and effect. Second, the non–monetary benefits of an LP operation (eg. a greater sense of national unity) may take a considerable time to express themselves in measurable economic terms (eg. faster growth rates).

The last point above raises the second major difficulty in the application of cost–benefit analysis to LP. Although the opportunity costs of a given LP operation (eg. translating textbooks into an indigenous language) may be expressible in monetary terms, it is often very difficult to place a monetary value on the benefits flowing from an LP operation. The benefits accruing to LP operations are, in other words, not easily quantifiable. That said, it is also easy to exaggerate the difficulty of quantifying the benefits of LP operations, turning a serious difficulty into an impossibility. As Blaug (1970), with reference to the economics of education, remarks: "... over long enough periods all objectives take on an economic character ...".

Despite the difficulties raised above, it must be said that the application of cost–benefit analysis to LP, in particular LP in education, needs to be more thoroughly explored than hitherto. It has, I suggest, a significant contribution to make for two main reasons. First, in the context of developing countries where resources are scarce and priorities pressing, it is vital that resources are judiciously allocated. Second, in the same context LP is often an integral part of
national development plans in which financial and economic concerns are salient. With its focus on matters of resource allocation, cost-benefit analysis offers one means of connecting LP concerns to wider ones of national development, a relationship that is sometimes overlooked in the literature.

2.4.5.2 Curriculum Evaluation in Language Planning

A second source of theoretical input into evaluation in LP is curriculum evaluation and its tributary discipline, language testing. Their contribution is, however, mainly limited to LP in education, to the evaluation of language education policies, and, in particular, their implementation in language curricula. As curriculum evaluation will be the subject of a forthcoming section (see Chapter 4, Section 4.3) little need, or should, be said here. It is, however, worth mentioning that many aspects of the curriculum can be evaluated, not merely, as is sometimes popularly supposed, achievement resulting from the curriculum. Thus, one can count the objectives of the language curriculum and the quality of the ‘curricular experience’ as potential evaluation ‘objects’, in addition to the learning resulting from the curriculum (Nevo 1983). Clearly, information about, and judgements on, all three aspects are invaluable in determining to what extent language education policies are working and at what points they need revision.

In many instances it is also found that existing language examinations are a powerful constraint on curricular, or indeed, policy reform. It is at this point that language testers and examiners may assume a planning role, for by undertaking examination reform they become agents in the reshaping of the language curriculum.

As has been indicated in this section, evaluation in LP may be understood in a variety of senses and may take on different forms depending on the language planning domain. Not all of these have been encompassed here. Nevertheless the general scope of evaluation, some of its processes, and its importance to the improvement of implementation in LP programmes have been broadly sketched. The final word belongs to Fishman (1974b:21):

"... without concern for criteria of success, without examination of alternatives, without cost-benefit concerns (Thorburn 1971, Jernudd 1971), without self-correction in methods on the basis of demonstrated experience, language planning is trivial, self-indulgent and self-righteous ...."
2.5 Conclusion: The Identity of the Language Planner

A question sometimes posed of LP is who actually does it. An underlying assumption here is that LP is comparable to other types of planning where there is a designated body of individuals bearing such titles as 'town planner' or 'educational planner'. In fact, however, as the present chapter has illustrated, LP is something of a superordinate or umbrella term encompassing a wide range of activities to which different kinds of specialist may contribute. It also draws on concepts and methodological approaches first developed and utilised in other types of planning. For this reason LP tends to be a collaborative enterprise involving specialists of different disciplines (e.g. sociolinguists, applied linguists, educationists, broadcasters, journalists, creative writers). These persons may recognise that on occasions they are engaged in LP activity but may be reluctant to accept that their main role or designation is that of language planner.

A second difficulty in answering the question above concerns the extent to which LP is a political or linguistic/applied linguistic activity. Many commentators would certainly concede politicians a key role in LP. In status planning particularly (where the status/functions of a language are altered) it is they who take the important decisions (e.g. on national language policy, on language education policy), and it is they who provide, perhaps through legislation, the authorisation for language specialists/educationists to devise the requisite measures for implementation.

Corpus planning, by contrast, is more specifically the province of the linguist/applied linguist who applies linguistic knowledge to the problems of language standardisation or vocabulary elaboration. Nevertheless, even here, politicians play a significant part in the selection of the language variety to be standardised, or in the definition of the scope and nature of vocabulary elaboration. (Consider the role of Attaturk with respect to vocabulary purification in Turkey, Gallacher 1971). It is also true that corpus planning is rarely undertaken independently of status planning.

It would seem, then, that LP operations typically involve some interaction between language specialists and politicians in which as Jernudd and Das Gupta (1971:197) put it:

"... the values and ideas of technical experts will be matched against those of the representatives of the community."
As will be seen shortly, this is as true of LP in education as it is of other areas of LP to which reference has been made in this chapter. These interactions give a multidisciplinary character to LP but at the same time make it difficult to define LP and identify the language planner.
CHAPTER 3
LANGUAGE PLANNING IN EDUCATION:
THE POLICY LEVEL

In principle, LP may operate in many domains. In practice, however, it has been education that has enjoyed most attention. Of particular interest to language planners have been policy issues in language education, and it is these that are the main topic of this chapter.

In the context of multilingual societies, the principal issues in the formulation of language education policy may be defined as follows:

(a) the choice of media of instruction at the various educational levels (primary, secondary, tertiary).
(b) the choice of languages as subjects of instruction.
(c) the staging or timing of introduction of the various languages into the curriculum either as subjects or instructional media.
(d) the choice of norms that will serve as models for teaching (see here: the educational implications of the emergence of non-native varieties of English: Section 3.3).

It should be recognised at the outset that issues (a) and (b) have a high political content. In other words, policy on these particular issues is not only decided by politicians but is often politically motivated. Applied linguists, sociolinguists, planners and educationists may collect information to guide the choice of medium and advance educational arguments in support of a particular medium. In the end, however, it is primarily political considerations, rather than educational principle that usually decides the choice.

The political considerations mentioned above should, however, be defined broadly. Although politicians decide language education policy, they are constrained by the status and roles already occupied by the various languages in the country (what Ohannessian & Ansre (1975) refer to as 'the patterns of language complementation'). Whilst these patterns of language complementation are partially determined by political decisions, they are also the outcome of a constellation of demographic, social and historical factors that lie outside political control.

Since language education policy generally reflects existing patterns of language complementation, factors shaping the national language situation may
be assumed to be of significant interest for the language planner in education. They are accordingly the subject of the next sections.

### 3.1 Issues of Language and Nation

One way of explicating the choices and factors involved in the determination of national language policy is in terms of ideological constructs derived from the notions of state and nation and their sources of legitimacy. Another way, perhaps more deterministic, is in terms of historical (e.g., colonial legacy, language history), demographic and social forces. Different configurations of these forces, it is argued, have produced different outcomes in respect of decisions on the national-official language, some states in Kloss' terms (1968) opting for an 'exoglossic' solution and others for an 'endoglossic' one. Let us start, however, with the ideological account.

#### 3.1.1 Nationalism and Nationism: The Quest for Integration and Legitimacy

To avoid internal strife and ensure long-term survival a state (or polity) must enjoy legitimacy in the eyes of its citizens. For Kelman (1971:23), there are two ultimate sources of legitimacy:

(i) the extent to which the 'national system' reflects the 'ethnic-cultural identity' of the population.

(ii) the extent to which the 'national system' "... meets the needs and interests of that population."

Corresponding to these sources of legitimacy at the 'system level', Kelman (1971) distinguishes two kinds of socio-psychological attachment to the national system at the individual level: (i) sentimental attachments, and (ii) instrumental attachments. An individual experiences sentimental attachment to the extent that he views the state/nation as reflecting or confirming his own ethnic-cultural identity; if it enters, in other words, into his own self-definition. By contrast, an individual is instrumentally attached to the state/nation to the extent that he views it as meeting his own needs/interests and those of his fellow citizens.

In Kelman's view (1971), these two forms of attachment are not mutually exclusive, indeed they are mutually facilitative. A sentimentally attached individual is more likely to believe that the state is concerned to meet his (and others) needs and interests. Conversely, a state that fosters instrumental attachments (through advancing its citizens' economic and welfare interests) may
in the long term develop a unity that induces a sense of national identity despite potentially competing ethnic identifications.

The important point is that these two forms of attachment, and their chronological and logical relationship, relate (Kelman 1971) to two forms of nationalism. In the first, where sentimental attachments precede instrumental ones, nationalism consists of a drive from nation to state. In other words, a sense of nationhood (of an existing ethnic-cultural identity) predates the acquisition of a political state. In the second, where the political and administrative structures of statehood are in advance of a national consciousness, nationalism consists of a drive from state to nation.

These two concepts of nationalism broadly correspond to Fishman’s (1968b, 1971b) distinction between nationalism and nationism. For Fishman (1971), nationalism involves a search for a sense of nationality transcending ethnic and local attachments. It thus focusses on questions of national authenticity, that is a sense of a unique identity differentiating the nation-state from others. Nationism, on the other hand, is more concerned with political than socio-cultural integration. The focus is primarily on the functional, instrumental needs of the state and its effective functioning as a political/administrative unit.

Because the political boundaries of many of the post-colonial states (in Africa and Asia) cut across and encompass diverse collections of ethnic and linguistic groups, they may be recognised to be in a situation of Kelman’s (1971) nationalism 2. In other words, statehood predates a true sense of nationhood; the drive is from state to nation. On the other hand, to survive these states are also compelled to function effectively as politico-administrative units, to meet basic instrumental needs, and to thereby win the instrumental attachments of their citizens. They are, therefore, driven by, and torn between, the concerns of both authenticity (nationalism) and efficiency (nationism). How, however, do these problems and concepts relate to the choice of a national-official language?

3.1.1.1 National Language Policy and Nationalism/Nationism

One may recall that the problem of many of the post-colonial states was that statehood was achieved prior to the development of a sense of nationhood. To overcome this problem, the elites of the new nations might resort to the invocation of symbols of the new nationhood, amongst which might be included a national language. The national language would serve in Kelman’s words (1971:31) as:
"... a major object and symbol of attachment by bridging immediate loyalties with transcendent ones."

or, as Fishman (1968a:6) puts it, as:

"... a symbol of supralocal ethnic-cultural identification at the nationality level (therefore: nationalism)."

In some societies a given language might also be regarded as the historic vehicle for sacred texts or cherished works of literature. The allocation of that language to a national role could thus affirm the authenticity of a national tradition or mission.

In these ways, then, the symbolic powers of language could be exploited to evoke sentimental attachments to the new nation. Some countries (eg. Somalia, Tanzania) were fortunate enough to have an indigenous language available to play such a role. The majority, however, (eg. Zambia, Nigeria) were not in such a favourable position. Not only did they encompass a diversity of ethnic-linguistic groups (unlike Somalia) but the total population of the country was inconveniently split between these groups (unlike Tanzania) (ie. no one overwhelmingly predominant group plus a myriad of very small groups, nor a myriad of very small groups of roughly equal size).

The choice, therefore, of one indigenous language and its associated traditions as the standard bearer of national identity would be likely to arouse sentimentally-based resistance among the non-favoured ethnic groups. In such a situation the elites opted for the 'exoglossic' solution, that is the choice of the neutral, or more accurately transcendent, ex-colonial language as the national language.

This might be considered in Fishman's terms (1968b,c, 1971b) a 'nationist' solution in that it was politically expedient and ensured a degree of administrative continuity and efficiency. It should not, however, be seen as a rejection of the 'nationalist' solution. At the time there was simply no 'nationalist' language available with suitable credentials. In some of these states there persists a craving for greater authenticity in matters of language.

Turning to instrumental attachments and the role of language policy, there can be little doubt that considerable advantages attach to a common national language. It tends to make for greater administrative efficiency and hence the
better servicing of citizens' instrumental needs. It permits a greater integration of socio-economic and educational institutions, and, as such, minimises suspicions of discrimination that can arise when different arrangements have to be made for different linguistic groups. If known to all population segments, it assists the more equitable distribution of educational and economic opportunities. No one group is disadvantaged by a lack of knowledge of that language which is a prerequisite of socio-economic or educational advancement. Thus, by contributing to greater efficiency and equity a common uniform language may strengthen instrumental attachments to the 'national system'.

To acclaim the instrumental virtues of language uniformity, even of monolingualism, as a unifying force is not, however, to assert that multilingual states are inevitably unstable or inefficient. As Fishman (1968a) points out, even "conscious and ... ideologized language differences" are not necessarily divisive at the national level. For instance, in diglossic situations (where languages are allocated to separate societal functions) language differences need not acquire a politically divisive salience.¹

That said, linguistic differences in multilingual states do sometimes become the focal point for instrumentally-based grievances, even if they do not lie at their root. The fact is that in many states linguistic differences are correlated with other religious, ethnic and socio-economic divisions that tend to reinforce each other. Thus, an aggrieved disadvantaged group may attribute its deprivation to the status of its language. Of course, such attribution may be incorrect (the real problem may be demographic or socio-economic). The point, however, is that if language is perceived to be a major predictive factor in the distribution of power, it is likely that language will become a focal point for the articulation of grievances. In these cases there is, moreover, the potential for an instrumentally-based conflict to escalate into one in which sentimental considerations play a dominant role.

The conclusion, then, has to be that multilingualism is a risk factor for

¹However, there may be a problem where different languages compete for the same prestigious functions. A complicating factor, also, is how societal diglossia combines with individual bilingualism (Fishman 1967). In some African countries the official language may only be known by a small elite (diglossia without bilingualism: see Fishman 1967), producing a 'communication gap' between the elites and the masses with potentially adverse effects on the state's stability.
political instability. It can, of course, also be a great cultural resource where diversity is valued.

3.1.1.2 ‘Authenticity’ and ‘Efficiency’ in National Language Policy: A Summary

As suggested earlier, it is possible to give an account of national language policy determination in terms of the ideological forces encapsulated by the terms ‘authenticity’ and ‘efficiency’. The first step is to recognise that the two forces may require different language choices for their satisfaction. Few states are fortunate enough to be able through their language policy to accommodate both ‘authenticity’ and ‘efficiency’ aspirations simultaneously.

The critical factor is the availability of a single language that both fulfils an integrating function in political/administrative terms and serves as a marker of the nation’s distinct identity. Since relatively few states have such a language available, the choice of national language may be seen as implicitly valuing one or other of ‘authenticity’ or ‘efficiency’ at a given time.

There can, however, be change over time. For example, in some states the need for cohesion and administrative continuity/efficiency in the immediate post-independence period may give rise to a ‘nationist’ (efficiency) solution of the issue of language choice. Later, however, once a degree of stability/cohesion has been attained, there may be a more ‘nationalist’ emphasis on ‘authenticity’. Then, the non-indigenous (exoglossic) official language may be superseded by an indigenous (endoglossic) official-national language which progressively displaces the former official language throughout a range of domains (eg. the case of Malaysia: Watson 1980).

Following the Lagos Conference (1976), the present trend in Africa appears to be a greater emphasis on the values of authenticity/identity. In the educational domain this implies an increased use of, and status for, African languages and the circumscription of the role of international languages (eg. English, French). As we will see, however, ideological aspiration is not always easily translatable into operational fact.

3.1.2 A Typology of National Language Policies

An interesting typology of national language policies is offered by Fishman (1971a). At its root lies the notion of a ‘Great Tradition’ which is defined as:
"... a pervasive feeling of unity of history, customs, values or missions traceable into the reasonably distant past." (Fishman 1971a:30).

There is commonly a close association between a 'Great Tradition' and language by virtue of the fact that this unity of values or customs is expressed through, or manifested in, a language and its literature.

In Fishman's (1971b) view, it is the perceived presence or absence of a 'Great Tradition' that leads to the differentiation of national language policy. Thus, three broad types of national language policy decisions (labelled A,B and C) are distinguished.

### 3.1.2.1 National Language Policy: Type A Decisions

Type A decisions are associated in Fishman's opinion (1971a), with the post-colonial states of Africa. In these states there is said to be neither a single 'Great Tradition' nor a sense of 'political-operational integration'. The choice of any indigenous language as a national language would be seen to unduly favour its speakers. Thus, the elite is led to the choice of the former colonial powers' language as national/official language. Since this is a fully-fledged standard language, there is little need for corpus LP activities. Education in the non-indigenous language is, however, crucial.

### 3.1.2.2 National Language Policy: Type B Decisions

According to Fishman (1968,1971a), Type B decisions are associated with the older, developing nations (eg. Thailand, Israel, Somalia). These states contrast with Type A ones in that they have an established sense of 'socio-cultural unity'. There also exists a single 'Great Tradition' manifested in a particular language. This language thus becomes the national language; the 'endoglossic' solution.

Since Type B states are modernising states, and since the indigenous national language may require 'modernisation' (Ferguson 1968), there is commonly recourse to corpus LP activities. This may imply the establishment of language academies. At the same time, there is often a continuing need for an international language alongside a national language. Thus, one may find such a language (eg. English) deployed in some specialised domains (eg. science faculties in higher education).
3.1.2.3 National language Policy: Type C Decisions

Type C decisions are characteristic of states where there is not one but several potentially competing 'Great Traditions' (eg. India), each of which is sufficiently strong "... to support and sustain any large-scale socio-cultural and political-operational integration." (Fishman 1971b:45).

This, of course, offers scope for nationalistic conflict and complicates the task of language policy-making. The problem is not so acute at the regional level where it is easy to identify the language embodying the regional 'Great Tradition'. At the national level, however, the choice is complicated since opting for any one indigenous language would be seen as discriminatory.

The Indian solution to this problem has been a form of compromise: a foreign language (English) is employed as a working official language but an indigenous language (Hindi), representing aspirations toward a greater, all-encompassing nationalism, serves as a co-official language.

As may be evident, Type C states place a high premium on individual multilingual versatility. The fully integrated citizen probably needs fluency in three languages; the indigenous national language, the non-indigenous official language and the regional language. This, accordingly, complicates language education policy. Corpus LP activities may be required in respect of the regional languages.

3.1.2.4 An Assessment of the Typology

Fishman's (1971a) typology is a relatively crude descriptive and explanatory device. In descriptive terms, it suffers the problem of many typologies namely that not all situations/cases fit well into the idealised typological categories. Where, for example, would one place Tanzania? In many respects it may be regarded as a 'Type B' state. On the other hand, it shares many characteristics with 'Type A' states. Like them, it is linguistically heterogeneous and has no single 'Great Tradition' on which it can draw. Instead, it is engaged in forging a new 'Great Tradition' based on Swahili, whose native speakers still constitute a relatively small proportion of the total population (Polome & Hill 1980). Similar remarks might be made of other states whose characteristics straddle the Type A and Type B categories.

As regards explanatory power, one may ask if the presence (or otherwise) of a 'Great Tradition' is really a satisfactory predictor of the type of national
language policy adopted. What is a 'Great Tradition' anyway? Is it really legitimate to concede a 'Great Tradition' to the Thais or Somali's but deny one to the Yoruba, the Ashanti, the Buganda, the Bemba or the Chewa? True, the languages of these groups have not always acceded to the status of a national-official language but this arguably is the result of a complex of factors, not simply a question of the presence of a 'Great Tradition'.

Despite these defects. Fishman’s typology at least throws some light on national language policy differences. It also contributes to an explanation of why the role of English in some African countries differs from that in some Asian countries. For these reasons it merits attention.

3.1.3 Demographic, Historical and Social Factors in National Language Policy Determination

Though illuminating, explanations of national language policy determination in terms of nationalistic ideologies or notions like 'a Great Tradition' are not entirely satisfactory. They perhaps concede too much freedom to human actors and de-emphasise the underlying forces that constrain the choice of a national/official language.

What, however, are these forces? In the literature reference is made to the colonial legacy, language history, demography, and political and social policies as particularly significant factors. Rather than discuss these separately and abstractly, reference will be made to three particular countries so as to illustrate in context the interplay of forces shaping the national language situation. The countries in question are Tanzania, Uganda and Kenya.

3.1.3.1 The Cases of Tanzania, Uganda and Kenya

Demographically, Tanzania and Uganda share certain superficial similarities. Both are linguistically heterogeneous containing a wide variety of ethnic and linguistic groups. None of these, however, is sufficiently populous or predominant to be able to establish its language as the national/official language. By virtue of size alone the only possible candidate for the national language in Uganda is Luganda. This, however, is only spoken by 16% of the total population, and is in any case ruled out from a national role by politico-historical considerations (Scotton 1978; Ladefoged, Glick & Criper 1972). Similarly, in Tanzania the largest vernacular language, Sukuma, has just over a million speakers, still a small proportion of the total population (Polome & Hill 1980).
Despite these broad similarities, Tanzania and Uganda have embarked on quite different language policies. To explain this, one has to refer to further non-demographic factors (i.e. history).

(a) Language History:
The different status of Swahili (and English) in the two countries may partly be ascribed to historical factors.

First Swahili is indigenous to Tanzania in a sense that is not true of Uganda. It has long had a foothold on the offshore islands of the East African coast (e.g. Lamu, Zanzibar), and from there was spread inland by trading caravans during the 19th century. This trade encouraged the spread of Swahili as a trading lingua franca among the peoples of the interior. Subsequent colonial administrations, both German and British, consolidated the position of Swahili by employing it as the language of lower level administration, and in the field of education.

The absence of any obvious unifying vernacular, and the availability of Swahili for securing inter-tribal integration, also meant that the pre-independence nationalist campaigns (from the Maji-Maji uprising 1905-1907 up to independence 1961) were largely conducted through Swahili. Swahili is in a true sense, then, a language of nationalism.

That developments in Uganda have not paralleled those of Tanzania may mainly be attributed to the presence in the former, but the absence in the latter, of a relatively strong, politically dominant kingdom dating from pre-colonial days. The kingdom referred to is that of Buganda. From the earliest colonial intrusions, its pre-eminence has defined, even if only negatively, the shape of subsequent language policies.

First, the British authorities, recognising the power of the Baganda, proclaimed a protectorate granting special status to Bugandan institutions and political arrangements. This, of course, enhanced the importance of the language, Luganda. The ensuing pre-eminence of Luganda acted as a barrier to the spread and use of Swahili, which in any case was perceived as associated with alien, Islamic influences.

The relatively privileged status of the Buganda and their role as the historic agents of the colonial power, have, however, always incited hostility and resentment (sometimes latent and sometimes overt) among the non-Baganda groups (Ladefoged, Glick & Criper 1972). Such hostility, coupled to the dismantling of Bugandan political pre-eminence in the period after independence, has substantially contributed to the failure of Luganda to establish itself as the national language. At the same time
opposition to Swahili on the part of the Buganda, its relatively alien origin and associations, and a stubborn defence of the authenticating role of local vernaculars has retarded the spread and importance of Swahili. Almost by default, as it were, English has therefore emerged as the major, neutral language at the national level.

(b) Political/Social Policies

Apart from the influence of historical factors, the political and social policies of governments may serve to entrench, or change, language policies. Scotton (1978), for example, sees the 1967 proclamation of Swahili as the official language of Tanzania as symptomatic of the government's move to a more socialist, egalitarian society (see: the Arusha Declaration 1967). In support, the following arguments can be advanced.

As an indigenous language similar to other Bantu languages, and as one spoken by 90% of Tanzanians (Abdulaziz 1971), Swahili affords greater opportunities for the masses and peasantry to participate in the 'national system', in business and government. In this sense it is an egalitarian language to an extent not true of English, whose acquisition is largely contingent on access to a small secondary education sector. The choice of Swahili as official/national language symbolises the break with the competitive, individualistic ethos of capitalism, whose principal language is English. It also affirms the African character of the nation. It is, then, a language well-suited to the furtherance of the government's socialist and egalitarian policies.

In contrast to Tanzania, the elites of Kenya (and Uganda) have opted for markedly different social and economic policies. Economically, these place a greater premium on private free enterprise, and socially they may be said to be conducive to the formation, and perpetuation, of an elite class. For Scotton (1978), such policies partly explain the continued de facto retention of English as an official language in Kenya in the face of the competing claims of Swahili. But how?

First, argues Scotton (1978), the use of English as an integrating official language in Kenya has relatively little practical linguistic justification since, unlike Uganda, Swahili is a widely understood lingua franca; up to 100% in some rural areas (Whiteley 1974). The real reason, then, for the continuing pre-eminence of English is political and social.

The elites have a vested interest in the continued use of English for prestigious functions because their high socio-economic status derives
partly from their previous mastery of the language. Moreover, to perpetuate their elite status they need to control access to high-status sectors. Here, English is a useful instrument for it serves to restrict socio-economic mobility. It acts as a filtering barrier between the elites and the masses because its acquisition is dependent on a lengthy, formal education. Therefore, as long as formal education opportunities are relatively restricted, English will remain a language of, and for, the elite. In support, Scotton (1978) here points out that a man’s proficiency in English is a good predictor of the type of job he holds.

There are, however, groups opposed to the privileges of the current elite. Acting in the name of African nationalism, these groups focus on an African language, Swahili, as a symbol to mobilise support for a change in the status quo. To pre-empt this challenge, the elite are, therefore, also motivated to appropriate Swahili as their language, as the best symbol of national authenticity. In the long term such pressures may lead to an expansion of Swahili’s national role.

Few would wish to claim that political and social factors are solely responsible for the contrast in language policy between Kenya and Tanzania. Clearly, the different demographic situations and history of the two countries have an important role. The point of the preceding section is to illustrate in context how a complex interplay of forces (demographic, historical, ideological, political and social) shapes the language situation and consequently national language policy. No mono-factor explanation of national language policy determination is, thus, likely to be adequate.

3.1.4 Conclusion: Language Education Policy and Descriptions of the National Language Situation

Language education policies (ie. the choice of languages as media or subjects of instruction) usually reflect existing patterns of language complementation. Descriptions of the national language situation and explanations of the factors underpinning national language policies should, therefore, hold considerable interest for the language planner in education.

Information on the language situation is, as previously mentioned, most usefully provided through sociolinguistic surveys. Several writers (Ferguson 1966a; Stewart 1968; Kloss 1968) have, however, suggested ways of summarising and classifying data to produce profiles of national language situations. As Bell (1976:164) points out, these national sociolinguistic profiles do have their uses:
"... (they) capture in symbolic form the linguistic situations of nations and thereby permit the comparison of states separated in time and space and suggest generalisable characteristics of language choice and social function at the macro-level of sociolinguistic description."

For most planning purposes they are, however, insufficiently detailed. Take demography, for instance.

Most profile schemes (eg. Ferguson 1966a; Stewart 1968) include information on the number of speakers of particular languages as a percentage of the total population but stop at that point. It is often important, however, to know not only the gross numbers of speakers of language X but also their distribution across different geographic regions. A language group that is small in relation to total population but concentrated in a sensitive geographical region may exert an influence out of proportion to those numbers. A large but widely scattered language group may find its influence attenuated. Again, a simple aggregate count of speakers (users) of a language may obscure significant differences between urban and rural areas. As Whiteley (1973) points out, a statement that English is used/spoken by 30% of the population may turn out to mean that 80% of the urban population speaks English as against 25% in rural areas.

In Africa it so happens that rural areas tend to exhibit greater linguistic homogeneity than urban areas. This has implications for language education policy. It may mean, for example, that it is feasible to utilise the mother tongue as an initial medium of education in rural areas. The urban classroom, on the other hand, may comprise native speakers of many different languages and this may militate against the selection of the mother tongue as initial medium. It may also mean that urban pupils gain greater exposure to lingua francas of wide currency.

In general, then, profiles do not provide sufficiently detailed information for many planning purposes. More comprehensive survey work is needed.

A second defect of profile schemes (which also applies to some sociolinguistic surveys: (Lieberson 1980)) is that they are cross-sectional not longitudinal, synchronic not diachronic instruments. They describe the situation at a given temporal point but do not observe change over time. In omitting the historical dimension, they thus often fail to explain how a given situation arose. Such an understanding is, however, often important to the language planner.
To conclude, it may be useful to enumerate a minimum level of information about the national language situation that might be useful to the language planner in education. The following information is necessary:

1. **Language Demography**: Numbers of speakers of each language and their geographic (and social) distribution.
2. **Language Functions**: The functions and status of the languages in the country.
3. **Language Attitudes**: The attitudes of the population to the languages spoken in the country.
4. **Language Structure**: Some information on the linguistic structure of the major languages in the country, their degree of mutual intelligibility, and their level of standardisation.
5. **Language History**: An account of historical developments with respect to language policy, and an interpretation of the causal origins of the present situation.

### 3.2 Issues in the Choice of a Medium of Instruction

In multilingual developing societies the most critical issue in language education policy is the choice of a medium of instruction. Whilst the choice is a highly political matter, educational, linguistic and practical concerns do, and should, enter into the deliberation. The purpose of the next sections is to investigate these, and some of the arguments advanced for or against particular media.

An initial point is that decisions on instructional media are normally required at three educational levels (primary, secondary, tertiary). They cannot, however, be arrived at independently since the output of one educational level is the intake of another. In practice, it is common for the higher levels of education to exert considerable influence over the lower levels. Thus, where a world language medium is employed at tertiary level, there is pressure for that language to be given an important place in the secondary school curriculum.

Since influence is primarily exerted downwards through the education system, it may be appropriate to begin by examining the issue of choice of medium at tertiary level.
3.2.1 The Choice of Medium at Tertiary Level

In many developing countries a world language remains the medium of instruction in tertiary institutions, especially in science/social science faculties (Nadkarni 1978; Fishman, Cooper, Conrad 1977). Desirable though it might be to use an indigenous national language, it has in practice proved difficult to displace the world language medium. This situation can be attributed to linguistic and practical rather than educational factors. Let us take the linguistic first.

3.2.1.1 Linguistic Factors

One predisposing factor for the use of a world language medium (English, French) at tertiary level is that some national languages presently lack the linguistic resources to serve effectively as media for advanced studies, especially in the sciences. The problem essentially is one of devising new terminology so that unfamiliar scientific concepts may be effectively rendered in the national language.

Several countries (see Alisjahbana 1974 on Bahasa Indonesia) have, of course, made substantial progress towards the goal of 'modernisation' and vocabulary elaboration. Nonetheless, the process is a long term one and the world language meanwhile acts as a 'stand-in'.

Nadkarni (1978) disagrees, however. He suggests that unless indigenous national languages are actually put to use in advanced studies, they are unlikely to expand their linguistic resources.

".... what must come first is scientific discourse....It is the quality and quantity of scientific and technical discourse and not the creation of terminology that is the critical factor in the modernisation of languages." (Nadkarni 1978:154)

The problem here is something of a 'chicken and egg' one. Does prior scientific discourse create an appropriate context for the emergence of new terminology or does terminology development make that discourse feasible? Nadkarni's view would seem to carry some credibility. However, the quantity of scientific discourse in a particular language is also probably a function of further factors eg; a particular level of economic and scientific development in the wider society.
3.2.1.2 Practical Factors

A more serious constraint on the use of a national language medium is the world-wide dominance of English in published academic writing, especially in scientific and technical fields (Fishman, Cooper, Conrad 1977). (Many French/German scholars are obliged to publish their work in English in order to attract the widest possible international readership). This factor alone, then, grants English an important place in tertiary education whether as a medium or as a servicing subject (eg. in Latin American universities, eg. Colombia).

The translation of textbooks into national languages has been suggested as a remedy for the need for access to specialised, academic literature. However, as Noss (1967) points out, this is not sufficient. Apart from the labour and expense of so doing, much academic work is published in journals and periodicals whose continued translation would be prohibitively expensive.

In terms of teaching staff, a world language medium is advantageous in that it permits the recruitment and use of expatriate academics. This can be important for some developing countries who do not as yet (the problem is becoming less acute) have sufficient qualified indigenous staff to fill all necessary posts.

A further minor point favouring a world language medium is that it facilitates academic exchanges, and contacts with scholars abroad. To deny a place for a world language in centres of higher education could, as Noss (1967:29) puts it:

"... effectively cut off large portions of their academic and research activities and throw themselves, at the same time, out of contact with most of the world."

3.2.1.3 An Assessment of Factors at Tertiary Level

The preceding explanation of the difficulties of dispensing with a world language in tertiary education should not be construed as an assertion of its desirability as a medium. One might in fact consider the use of a world language at tertiary level to be undesirable on the following grounds:

1. For nationalistic reasons. It devalues national culture, retards the 'modernisation' of indigenous languages and perpetuates dependency on foreign scientific and cultural resources.
2. For equity reasons. It disadvantages students from less favoured backgrounds who may have less contact with the world language.
Otherwise able students may be excluded from tertiary education because they have failed for some reason to acquire sufficient proficiency in the world language.

Whilst such arguments may have a powerful appeal and may indeed point away from the use of a world language medium, they do not address the central point of preceding sections. This is that it is difficult, given the international situation, to dispense completely with a world language in tertiary education. Students, in other words, need some proficiency in English to pursue tertiary level studies. If the world language is a medium, the proficiency level required will be high. If not, a high proficiency in reading English is still necessary. The question then is by what educational arrangements can this proficiency best be developed and sustained. This issue cannot be further explored without giving attention to the secondary level.

3.2.2 The Choice of Medium at Secondary Level

A significant function of secondary education in many developing countries is the provision of educated manpower to fill middle level managerial positions in commercial, administrative industrial and agricultural sectors of the national economy. Partly for this reason, and partly because secondary education is viewed by most governments as an appropriate vehicle for the implementation of national language policy, there are usually two practical options in the choice of medium at secondary level: (1) a national (or vehicular) language, or (2) a world language.

In ‘exoglossic’ states the national language is, of course, also a world language and thus it is usual for a world language medium to be employed at secondary level. Superficially, this has some attractions. It reduces the language learning burden that can be more onerous when one language is learnt for intranational purposes and another for international purposes. It can also mean, where the same language is a medium at tertiary level, that the student is better prepared for the language demands of tertiary study if only because he has had longer and more intense exposure to the world language.

In ‘endoglossic’ states the national language is not a world language. The choice of secondary medium is thus more open. Some countries, like Tanzania, retain English (though the official/national language is Swahili). Others (e.g. Malaysia) have switched from a world to national language medium (Malay). Yet
others have always had a national language medium. What, however, are the merits of these respective choices?

In the next sections attention is focussed on factors governing the feasibility and desirability of a national language as against a world language medium.

3.2.2.1 Educational Resources and the Feasibility/Desirability of a National Language Medium

If a national language medium is to be employed at secondary level, the requisite educational resources must be available. These can be divided roughly into three categories, each of which will be examined briefly: (a) linguistic resources of the language medium, (b) textbooks and educational materials, (c) the language proficiency, training and experience of the teaching force.

(a) Linguistic Resources of the Language Medium
The use of a national (vehicular) language medium requires that the language in question be sufficiently standardised or elaborated to serve such a purpose effectively. If it is not, corpus planning activities will be necessary, and these may be time-consuming and costly. It is, of course, arguable that use as an educational medium will itself encourage language 'modernisation'/elaboration (see Section 3.2.1.1 for related arguments).

(b) Textbooks and Educational Materials
A more important constraint on the use of a national language medium has been the shortage of suitable quality educational material/textbooks in the national languages. Materials in world languages are, by contrast, much more plentiful and easily available. It is this relative dearth of materials in national languages, and the presumed cost of creating such materials, that has constituted an argument from expediency in favour of a world language medium. Two points need to be made here, however. First, as Obura (1985:424) points out, without a thorough assessment of costs (note here the strain on foreign exchange resources that import of world language materials can impose), "...the hypothesis of unjustified expense, time and effort is still unproven."

In the short term it may indeed be more costly to develop national language material. In the long term, however, foreign exchange may be saved, and control over the content of educational materials restored to indigenous authorities. If a national language medium does enhance educational achievement, it is also possible that the high costs of developing local materials will be outweighed by gains in overall
educational efficiency which imply lower costs per unit of output. Obura (1985:425) notes that in Kenya small speech communities have successfully created materials in their languages. She points to the local income-generating potential of such materials development. A second point is that the necessary commitment of resources to materials development (by publishers, authors, educationists) in a national language might only follow a firm decision to adopt a national language medium – precisely because the effect of such a decision would be to guarantee a viable market for such materials. In this view, then, the argument against a national language medium on the grounds of insufficient educational materials in the language is both defeatist and self-defeating, for it places the cart (materials) before the horse (firm decision on medium).

(c) Language Proficiency, Training and Experience of the Teaching Force

The educational effectiveness of an instructional medium, whether it be a national or a world language, is very much dependent on there being sufficient teachers with the necessary language proficiency to teach competently through that language medium. Also important is the availability of sufficient teachers with training in language teaching methodology who can teach the language competently as a subject. Problems of teacher language proficiency are particularly likely to arise with a world language medium simply because it is a non-indigenous, foreign language. Several observers (eg. Wigzell 1983) have in fact noted that in some countries operating a world language medium the teaching situation is unsatisfactory. Teachers lack sufficient language proficiency, feel under-confident in using the language, or cannot in the foreign medium "...generate the kind of classroom interaction in which learning can flourish." (Ellis 1985:173). With reference to Kenya, Obura (1985:431) also claims that it is noticeable how much more easily and fluently teachers speak in a national (vehicular) language as compared to a world language. She does not make clear, however, whether she refers to primary or secondary level teachers.

Partly for these reasons above, and partly due to pupils' low proficiency, teachers may resort to local vernaculars for the teaching of some points, or may simply pay lip-service to the policy of a world language medium (see Criper & Dodd (1984:34) on Tanzania). Policy and practice then begin to diverge sharply.

Whilst the above points constitute potentially powerful arguments against
a world language medium, it should be remembered that in many countries the national (indigenous) language is for many teachers and pupils also a second/foreign language. Unless this fact is taken into account (in policy-making, teacher-training, classroom practice), results may be as equally unfavourable as when a world language medium is used by an unprepared teacher.

One other potential problem with a national language medium is that it precludes the recruitment of expatriate secondary school teachers. For countries with a shortage of suitably qualified teachers in key subjects (eg. maths/science) this could be detrimental.

In summary, then, information on the language proficiency, training and experience of the teaching force is an important input to rational decisions on the instructional medium at secondary and, indeed, other levels.

### 3.2.2.2 Educational Arguments and Socio-Political Considerations

#### (a) Educational Arguments:

Apart from practical and logistical factors, a crucial consideration is the educational/pedagogic desirability of either a national or world language medium. Which, in other words, is more conducive to higher educational achievement? Is there any evidence on this issue?

In recent years there has been increased disquiet over the effect on educational achievement of the use of a world (foreign) language medium. Indeed, associations between a world (foreign) language medium and low levels of educational achievement have been observed. There is, however, no consensus on the precise role of language in this. Some observers would attribute poor academic achievement fairly directly to problems with the medium (low proficiency among teachers and pupils) but would divide over whether this could be ameliorated within the existing policy (on medium), or would require a complete change of medium. Others note the association but are generally unsure of the extent to which language is a prime causal factor (eg. Harlech-Jones 1985).

For the present writer, it seems likely that problems with language are but one factor among others. One cannot be sure, however, since there appears to be a scarcity of research data on the effect on educational achievement (at secondary level in developing countries) of different media of instruction. As Obura (1985:417) points out with reference to Africa: "... we have not developed criteria of efficiency in this instance and we have not measured efficiency."
A number of further theoretical and empirical arguments against a world language medium (and by implication in favour of national language medium) are summarised below, along with a very brief assessment.

1. Observations that teachers can use the national language with greater ease than the world language, and are thus able to promote the kinds of "....classroom interaction in which learning can flourish." (Ellis 1985:143)

Assessment:
Such observations may be valid for some situations but not others. It all depends on the language proficiency of the teachers in question (see Section 3.2.2.1c).

2. Pupils have a greater ability to process/understand subject material in a national (vehicular) language than in a world language because their proficiency in the former is usually greater. This greater proficiency may be ascribed to:
(i) greater exposure in the environment to the national (vehicular) language than to the world language.
(ii) the greater structural/linguistic similarity of the national (vehicular) language to students' mother tongues as compared with a world language.

Assessment:
2(ii) is likely to be true but careful investigation of individual languages is needed to corroborate.
2(i) may well be true but its confirmation would require a survey of the national language situation and patterns of language usage.

It is worth noting here King's (1985) observation that whereas in the first phase of secondary school expansion (in Africa) schools tended to have a national catchment area and sizeable numbers of expatriate staff, in the second schools tend to be non-boarding, drawing their pupils from a district catchment area, and have few or no expatriate staff. Presumably, this diminishes exposure to English (or French).

As regards the main body of (2) above, it is in most cases likely that pupils have a higher proficiency in the national language than in the world language. However, the truth of this proposition does not logically follow from 2(i) and 2(ii). Therefore, it needs further empirical investigation and confirmation/disconfirmation.

That pupils understand subject material better in a national (vehicular) language is possible, even likely, but, as indicated above, not conclusively proven.

That said, some disturbing evidence regarding the use of a world language
medium is provided by Obura (1985:432). She cites a study from Lesotho showing that whereas a primary school leaver has been taught 1,000 lexical items, secondary school science textbooks employ 12,000. In similar vein, Wigzell (1983:7) is quoted on Zambia:

"...in practice many of the speech patterns in the primary and junior secondary school syllabuses are introduced and used in the content-subject lessons before they are taught in the English lessons."

This evidence, together with that of Criper & Dodd (1984) on Tanzania, clearly indicates that in some instances the world language medium policy is inefficient, or not being properly implemented. What it does not show, however, is that a national (vehicular) language would necessarily promote higher levels of educational achievement.

In summary, then, the above arguments against a world language medium are plausible, but they are not conclusive. Further research evidence on the educational efficiency of different instructional media is necessary.

(b) Socio-political considerations

There are essentially two main socio-political arguments in favour of a national (vehicular) language medium. First, it is claimed that a national language medium promotes social integration because a national language is familiar to, and widely used by, many sections of the population. It is not exclusive to any one social group, and hence divisive, in the way a world language might be.

Second, a national language medium is claimed to reinforce cultural identity and assist emancipation from undue foreign cultural and intellectual influence. This, at least, was the view of the Lagos Conference (1976) which called for "....the full and complete restoration of the national languages as languages of instruction...." on the grounds that this would bring about "....the reconciliation that the African needs with his environment and his integration into society at large...." ((UNESCO 1977:50; Treffgarne 1985:151)

Though one might concede that a national language medium probably is more conducive to social integration, and better protects cultural integrity, there remains the question of whether the socio-cultural utility of the national language outweighs the functional advantages, in terms of international communication, of a world language, or whether, indeed, the two can be effectively reconciled.
3.2.2.3 The Choice of Medium: Implications of Tertiary and Primary Levels of Education

Levels of education are not, of course, insulated from each other. In assessing the respective merits of a national or world language medium at secondary level, it is important, therefore, to take into account the effects of either on the tertiary and primary level, and, in reverse, the implications of choices at those levels for the secondary level itself. Let us start with the tertiary level.

(a) Tertiary Level:

At the outset it should be noted once again that the use of a world language medium at tertiary level creates pressure for that language to be used as a secondary level medium. The pressure is political and pedagogic.

On pedagogic grounds it may be argued that students will be better prepared for the language demands of tertiary level study because more intense exposure to the world language (through its use as a medium and more extensive teaching will, other things being equal, lead to higher proficiency.

There may, of course, be relatively few secondary school leavers who actually proceed to tertiary education. Nonetheless, it may be difficult politically, and in equity, to deny the aspirations of students, parents and the wider community who see lower levels of education as preparatory for higher and who accordingly demand that this be reflected in the language curriculum. A perceived association between a language and socio-economic mobility generally creates a demand for the extensive teaching of that language.

In some countries (eg. Somalia, Malaysia) the medium at tertiary level is different from that at secondary level. The switch can pose problems. In particular, the teaching of the world language as a secondary school subject may not guarantee students sufficient proficiency for tertiary level study 2. One response (or precaution) has been the introduction of pre-sessional EAP style courses in the world language (eg. in Somalia).

---

2Of course, its use as a medium may not either. Nevertheless, it has been suggested that in some cases where there has been a switch to national language medium at secondary school, overall levels of world language proficiency have dropped - with adverse effects on tertiary level education

53
Whether this is sufficient to promote the necessary level of proficiency remains unclear.

(b) Primary Level:
The effective use of a language medium at secondary level requires the prior teaching at that language in primary school. If the language is not effectively taught at primary level, its use as a secondary medium can be seriously vitiated.

According to Criper & Dodd (1984:24–34), this is the situation in Tanzania. Pupils arriving from primary school have insufficient proficiency to pursue secondary studies in the medium of English.

The general policy implication is that decisions on a secondary medium should take into account not only language teaching provision at secondary level (Section 3.2.2.1c), but also provision in the primary school.

In particular, assessment needs to be made of teachers' capacity to teach the world language effectively.

This seems an appropriate juncture, then, to turn to an examination of the choice of medium at primary level.

3.2.3 The Choice of Medium at Primary Level

With reference to African, Ohannessian & Ansre (1975) identify three options for a medium of instruction at primary level:

(a) the child's mother tongue (a local vernacular language)
(b) an African national language (or regional lingua franca)
(c) a world language

Of these, it is probably the role of the mother tongue as a medium in initial education that has attracted most attention from scholars. Partly for this reason and partly because it raises many educational and research issues of relevance to policy-making, this is the topic on which we now focus.

For convenience, arguments about the role of the mother tongue may be divided into two categories: those concerning its educational, cultural and psychological desirability and those concerning its feasibility and practicality. Let us begin with the first category.
3.2.3.1 The Role of the Mother Tongue: Educational Issues

The 1953 UNESCO Conference on the 'Use of Vernacular Languages in Education' declared that the mother tongue was the best teaching medium in initial education. This position has since been supported by various writers. The essentials of their arguments are summarised below as a basis for subsequent discussion.

1. It is claimed that a mother tongue medium narrows the gulf between home and school, and integrates the school better into the local community. Use of a non-mother tongue medium may, conversely, further distance the school from the community, and may accentuate the divisions between those with and those without education. It may also disrupt family ties (Ure 1981).

2. It is claimed that a mother tongue medium enhances the importance of the local language and helps maintain the child’s cultural and psychological identity. Denial of a role for the mother tongue may imply a negative evaluation of the language and values of this home, and this may be damaging to the child’s self-concept, confidence and emotional well-being (Ure 1981; Swain 1983).

3. As regards linguistic-cognitive development, it is claimed that cognitive maturation is better encouraged by a familiar language (ie. the home language) than by an unfamiliar one. Use of a second/foreign language medium may not only retard cognitive development but may be disfunctional in language learning. Furthermore, the attainment of initial literacy in a second/foreign language is said to be more difficult/problematic than where literacy in a second language follows the attainment of literacy in the mother tongue.

(a) Culture and Identity

Turning first to an assessment of the claims summarised under (1) and (2) above, one can recognise that they do have some validity and plausibility. The use of a non-local language medium (eg. English) may indeed further distance the school from the local community, and complicate the perception of its relevance to that community. Similarly, the use of a second/foreign language medium is hardly likely to foster a sense of identity and affinity with the local community. However, the general charge that denying a role for the mother tongue implies a negative valuation of the language and values of the home with potentially adverse psychological consequences is perhaps too strong. It has special relevance for the ethnic minority/immigrant situations of
western societies where a minority language confronts the prestigious, dominant language of the majority. Potentially, this is a situation of language loss, of unstable bilingualism.

In Africa, however, the situation is different. Here, national multilingualism is often such that learning a second/foreign language (or lingua franca) is accepted as part of life, as part of ‘getting on’. Moreover, if the national language is English or French, it is foreign for everyone. It does not ‘belong’ in any straightforward sense to a dominant advantaged majority for whom one ‘gives up’ one’s own language and values.

A further point is that in African primary schools local vernaculars are often taught as subjects alongside second language media. This may moderate the adverse cultural/psychological effects that can arise where the mother tongue has no role at all.

(b) Linguistic-cognitive development

In so far as they touch on pedagogic and learning efficiency, the claims summarised under (3) above are clearly critical for choice of medium.

A first point that can be made is that the crude notion that a home-school language switch invariably produces academic retardation (the so-called ‘linguistic mismatch’ hypothesis: Cummins & Swain 1986) has been refuted by the St Lambert immersion experiments in Canada. These show that primary education through a second language medium need not necessarily impair academic attainment (Swain 1984).

Equally, however, they do not demonstrate that initial education through a second language is everywhere desirable. The special circumstances of the St Lambert programme, and hence its limited generalisability, need to be recognised.

Perhaps the most significant distinguishing feature of the above programme is that the L1 of the participating children was that of the majority, the dominant socio-cultural group in Canada. Hence, the L1 would continue to be developed and maintained by contacts in the wider community. Also, L2 learning was for these children mainly a matter of choice not of economic or political necessity.

3 Other distinguishing features of St Lambert programme (not always replicated in other bilingual programmes) were that: 1. Teachers were bilingual in the L2 (target language) and the L1 (home language). Therefore they could respond to pupils’ early productive use of L1. 2. After grades 2/3, pupils received instruction in L1 skills. This increased in later education.
Lambert (1977) summarises this situation as one of 'additive' bilingualism. A second language is added to the individuals' repertoire without loss/weakening of the first. This contrasts with a situation of 'subtractive' bilingualism (and submersion perhaps) that is encountered by minority language speakers learning the language of the dominant majority. Because the minority language has low status and a very limited societal role, L2 learning may be accompanied by L1 loss.

The factors summarised by the terms 'additive' and 'subtractive' bilingualism (Lambert 1977) have been used to account for the contradictory findings of studies into the association between bilingualism and cognitive functioning (Swain & Cummins 1979). In particular, positive associations (i.e. bilingualism having a beneficial effect on cognition) are reported in situations of 'additive' bilingualism and negative associations in situations of 'subtractive' bilingualism.

A further hypothesis advanced to account for disparate findings on the cognitive consequences of bilingualism is the 'threshold' hypothesis (Cummins 1976; Toukamaa & Skutnabb-Kangas 1977). This postulates that a threshold level of linguistic competence in both first and second languages should be attained in order to avoid cognitive disadvantage and reap the potential benefits of bilingualism on cognitive functioning (Cummins & Swain 1986).

The policy implications deduced from the 'threshold' hypothesis are that language education programmes should strive for 'threshold' levels of proficiency in both L1 and L2. In particular, however, the L1 should be maintained and sheltered where societal factors threaten its erosion (Swain & Cummins 1979). Tosi (1984) also argues that the teaching of L2 should be delayed until the L1 is properly consolidated.

Yet a further hypothesis sometimes invoked to defend L1 medium policies in initial education (or at least L1 consolidation) is Cummins' 'linguistic interdependence' hypothesis (Cummins 1979; Swain & Cummins 1986). This, in turn, is held to contradict (and refute) the 'maximum exposure' hypothesis alluded to earlier (see section 3.2.2.3a) which holds crudely that if pupils need English (or any L2) and are deficient in it, they require maximum exposure to the language from an early date to succeed academically.

---

4 It is not clear, however, precisely what the 'threshold' is.
The fundamental reason why the 'linguistic interdependence' hypothesis contradicts the 'maximum exposure' hypothesis is that it denies that proficiency in L1 is separate from proficiency in L2. Instead, it is claimed that there is a common underlying proficiency\(^5\) (derived from experience with either language) such that the development of cognitive/academic skills in L1 contributes toward the subsequent emergence of cognitive/academic skills in L2 just as much as, if not more than, L2 exposure. In other words, proficiency in Lx (especially relating to cognitive–academic skills) will transfer to Ly, given adequate exposure to Ly and adequate motivation to learn Ly. (Cummins & Swain 1986:94).

In policy terms, this lends weight to the notion that for minority language students it is best that skills in L1 are first developed, even at the expense of exposure to L2, because these skills will later advantage the acquisition of the same skills in L2.

Whilst recognising the potential force of the policy implications arising from the 'threshold' and 'linguistic interdependence' hypotheses, one has to question whether concepts such as 'additive' and 'subtractive' bilingualism, or even 'minority language (group) speakers', translate easily to African (or Third World) multilingual situations. (For example, if everyone is in a minority with respect to their L1, does a minority/majority distinction make conceptual sense at all?) If they do not, then the policy implications deduced from these concepts may also be questionable.

Let us take the case of 'subtractive' bilingualism first. Are African primary pupils becoming 'subtractive' bilinguals? In general, the answer has to be that they are not. Unlike Western societies (eg. USA) where the minority language functionally confronts the majority language (unstable diglossia), the language situation in Africa is generally such that languages are allocated to functionally separate domains. Thus, it is accepted that the world language (eg. English), or an African national language, has functional predominance in public, prestigious domains. Local languages, however, continue to hold sway, and be valued, as languages of 'home and hearth'. In learning a world language L2, there is no question, then, of giving up the L1 in favour of the L2. Learning a L2 is simply necessary for certain instrumental purposes. This need not imply a denigration (by self or others) of the L1 on all other grounds. In short, attitudes to language

\(^{5}\)The nature of this 'underlying proficiency' is explored by Cummins (1983)
are divisible and complex.

Does this mean, then, that the African pupil, like the French immersion pupil, is involved in 'additive' bilingualism? The answer must, again, be a qualified no. First, in Africa the L2 is learned from instrumental necessity not choice. Second, in society at large the L1 does not enjoy equal, let alone superior status, to the L2. It is confined, both geographically to particular districts and socially to a small number of domains. This implies a weakening of the role and use of the L1 as the individual moves from the local to national community, but it does not entail its loss or 'subtraction'.

It would seem, then, that the concepts of 'additive' and 'subtractive' bilingualism simply do not accurately correspond to the complexities of African language situations. If that is so, the policy implications elicited from the interaction of the 'additive'/"subtractive' distinction with the 'threshold'/linguistic interdependence' hypotheses are neutralised in the African context. In other words, one cannot conclude from the arguments/analysis above that the L1 medium is necessarily preferable to L2 medium in initial education for African students.

Apart from the theoretical considerations above, there are numerous empirical studies which have set out to investigate the relative merits (in terms of academic achievement/progress) of:

1. Starting education in a L1 mother tongue as against a L2, and;
2. Of introducing reading (literacy) an a L1 (mother tongue vernacular) as against a L2.

Twenty-four of these are reviewed by Engle (1975) who singles out four for particular attention. These are: (a) the Iliolo I and Rizal studies in the Philippines (Ramos et al 1967), (b) the Modiano study in Chiapas, Mexico (Modiano 1973), (c) a Ugandan study (Ladefoged, Glick & Criper 1972), and (d) the St Lambert experiment, Montreal (Lambert & Tucker 1972).

The most striking aspect of these studies is their conflicting conclusions. Some of these are summarised crudely below:

- Iliolo I: Advantage to experimental vernacular approach over second language approach (but possibility of Hawthorne effect, Engle 1975).
- Rizal: Advantage to English over Tagalog mother tongue.
- Modiano: Advantage to Indian vernacular over Spanish as regards reading comprehension.
- St Lambert: No subject matter of reading skills retardation in English
speakers taught through French medium when compared with control groups.

Engle's (1975:26) overall conclusion is that:

"...The twenty-four studies .... summarized varied in every conceivable way, and most provided no substantial evidence as to which approach is better."

This view is broadly consistent with Dakin, Tiffin, Widdowson (1968:27) who argue that:

"...The superiority of the mother tongue is not everywhere demonstrated...."


"...many educators have accepted as axiomatic the idea that the best medium of instruction for a child is his mother tongue.... Are there empirical data which support this position? The answer would seem to be no. Does this mean the position is untenable? Once again, the answer would seem to be no."

What is one to make of the inconclusiveness of this research evidence? Some (eg. Engle 1975; Rubin 1977) point to the presence of confounding variables in the studies referred to. Amongst these are:

1. The socio-economic class of the subjects (Rubin 1977); the St Lambert children were middle-class, the Modiano children 'socially subordinate').
2. The general quality of the instructional programme (Paulston 1974; Prator 1975).
3. The 'ethnicity' of the teacher (Engle 1975).
4. The relative statuses of the two languages in the wider society (Engle 1975). In Engle's view (1975) future research should concentrate on controlling these and other confounding variables.

Others draw the tentative conclusion that language is not necessarily the major causal variable in scholastic achievement (Paulston 1974; Rubin 1977). Paulston (1978b) cautions in particular against the treatment of bilingual education as an independent variable with scholastic attainment the dependent variable. Instead, bilingual education should be viewed as an intervening variable with greater attention consequently focussed on the socio-political contextual factors leading to particular bilingual
programmes, in terms of which a more adequate evaluation of outcomes could be achieved.

The conclusion of this section is, then, that there may indeed be advantages attaching to the use of a mother tongue medium in initial education. However, the research evidence alone, as it pertains to African in particular, does not conclusively demonstrate that either a mother tongue medium or a second language medium is educationally superior in terms of its effect on academic attainment. Thus, without discounting research evidence, it is necessary to take specific social, educational and linguistic circumstances into consideration in the assessment of their relative merits.

3.2.3.2 The Role of the Mother Tongue: Issues of Practicality

Even if a mother tongue (MT) medium is shown to be educationally desirable, one may still ask if its implementation is in fact practical or feasible. Some of the potentially constraining factors are discussed briefly below:

1. Linguistic Heterogeneity:
The practicality of MT medium usage depends critically on the degree of linguistic heterogeneity in particular communities, and on the distribution of speakers of the various languages in towns and rural areas.

Some urban areas of Africa are extremely heterogeneous linguistically. Hence, urban classrooms are often composed of pupils speaking many different mother tongues. In these circumstances it is clearly difficult to introduce a MT medium policy.

Such a policy may, however, be more feasible in rural areas which tend to be linguistically more homogeneous. One must remember, though, that in some countries government personnel (eg. police, civil servants) are customarily posted outside their home districts. Thus, even rural centres may be linguistically mixed.

Finally, there are some countries which contain many different language groups (eg. Zambia with 72 languages). Given such alleged heterogeneity, is it sensible to attempt the implementation of a strict MT medium policy?

2. Language Standardisation and Development:
The use of the local languages as instructional media requires that they be sufficiently standardised or developed to serve such a purpose.

Also, there may be problems in deciding what constitutes a distinct language for educational purposes. In some cases local communities may
be prepared to overlook a degree of dialectal diversity. In others, they may not. Thus, decisions on this matter may not only raise technical linguistic problems but also be politically sensitive.

A further potential problem is with children who speak dialectal varieties that are somewhat removed from the standardised varieties proposed for use as media. In what sense do these children (like Negro children in the USA taught in standard English) actually experience a ‘mother tongue’ medium?

3. Materials and Cost:
For a MT medium to be employed, there must exist a sufficiency of materials in that language. A relevant factor, then, is the availability of materials in the language.

The production of diversified materials for small language groups implies high unit costs. A costly amount of time is also likely to be spent on the negotiation of their production, and on the training of personnel who can develop materials to a required level of quality.

In order to derive economies of scale and maximise revenue, commercial publishers are typically interested in the widest possible market. They are, therefore, unlikely to invest in materials production for small language groups.

4. Administrative and Political Problems of Curriculum Diversification
As Greenland (1981) observes, greater use of MT vernaculars implies more diversified curricula. There are, however, practical and political obstacles to such diversification. Some of these are described below:

a) **Teachers**: Curriculum diversification is likely to have complicating effects on manpower planning, teacher training and teacher deployment. For instance, it implies the calculation of manpower requirements on a district not national basis, and the training of primary teachers likewise.

b) **Examinations**: Diversification also requires the redesign of primary school leaving examinations so that they reflect variations in the curriculum but are at the same time perceived to be equitable. Primary school examinations are generally a highly sensitive subject in many developing countries. It is essential, therefore, that they be seen to be fair and equitable for all groups.

c) **Political Issues**: Diversification may be seen as a potential threat to national unity, and as likely to enhance awareness of regional economic inequalities which then become linked to issues of language.

It also implies a shift in power from the centre to the periphery (Schon
This may be disturbing for vested bureaucratic interests accustomed to centralisation of control.

Greenland (1981) perceives that in the African context there is some resistance to Western notions concerning the rights of minorities to an adapted curriculum. He suggests that the issue of a uniform, standardised curriculum versus a diversified, flexible one is in some sense a debate about the nature of the curriculum. His conclusion here is pessimistic: (Greenland 1981:116)

"...the dominant view of the curriculum in Africa is so prescriptive and utilitarian in terms of intended pupil outcomes and assumptions about under-qualified teachers that it resists a move toward flexibility and innovation...."

d) Parental Attitudes: In many situations, and for understandable reasons (see Section 3.2.2.3a), parents take a brutally instrumental view of education. Thus, where a mother tongue is seen to have a low marketable value and a world/national language a high value in terms of socio-economic opportunities/mobility, parents may demand the early introduction into education of the latter at the expense of the former. In short, the mother tongue may be valued sentimentally but regarded as irrelevant instrumentally.

In summary, the implementation of a mother tongue medium policy is likely to encounter numerous practical and political obstacles. It is also likely to be costly. It is essential, then, that the factors above be taken into account in assessing the merits of a mother tongue medium as against some other medium.

3.2.3.3 The Function of Primary Schooling and the Choice of Medium

In the debate over the role of education in development there have been intermittent calls for schooling to exhibit a greater relevance to individual/societal needs. In education in general, this has been assumed (fallacious though the assumption is: see Forster 1965) to imply a greater curricular emphasis on vocational/practical subjects (ie. less Chaucer, more woodwork).

In language education 'relevance' can be interpreted to imply a greater role for local, indigenous languages. These are held to be more relevant because they bind the primary school more closely to the local community and its needs.

There are, however, further arguments, based on relevance, for a greater role
for local, indigenous languages in the primary curriculum. These have to do with the essential purpose of primary schooling.

One widely (but often implicitly) held view is that the main purpose of primary schooling is to prepare pupils for secondary school. Given this view, it seems natural that the primary school curriculum should look to the secondary school, and that the language needs of secondary school study should strongly influence the primary language curriculum. Thus, where the secondary school medium was a world/national language, it might seem advantageous to introduce that medium into primary school as early as possible.

An opposing view is that primary schooling should provide a self-sufficient, basic education for all pupils, irrespective of whether they proceed to further education. It should, in other words, be self-contained in its objectives, and provide an education relevant to the needs of the majority who might remain in rural areas. A well-known exponent of this view is the former Tanzanian President, J Nyerere (1967:15).

"...Education given in our schools must be a complete education in itself...Instead of the primary school activities being geared to the competitive examination which will select the few that will go into secondary school, they must be a preparation for the life which the majority of children will lead."

In language terms, this implies a greater curricular role for local indigenous languages.

The view that primary education should be self-sufficient is lent weight by two further considerations. These are progression and attrition rates within the education system. First, progression rates.

A characteristic of many African education systems is that relatively few primary school leavers progress to secondary school. In Tanzania, for example, (which has one of the smallest secondary school sectors), the progression rate is about 4% (Criper & Dodd 1984). In Zambia, about 18-19% of primary school leavers go to secondary school.

In these circumstances, one may question whether primary education has, or should have, a preparatory function. One can also ask to what extent a second language medium best serves the interests of the majority who are unlikely to proceed beyond primary level, and whose future livelihood is likely to be found in rural areas.
The argument might be quite different, however, if 80%, say, of primary pupils went to secondary school. In general, the proportions of relevant age cohorts engaged in formal education at the various educational levels exerts a profound influence on the aims, content and nature of the educational process.

A second consideration is attrition rates. In Africa, it is common to find high attrition rates among primary school pupils. Taking Ethiopia as an example, Woldemikael (Bender et al 1976) reports that only 29% of pupils entering Grade 1 in a given area and year progressed to Grade 7. He comments (1976:330) that:

"...an average child leaving school prior to Grade 6 is bound to lose nearly everything he has learnt in school, because among other things his education does not relate to life situations."

Such high wastage clearly has serious adverse implications for education in general. It also affects language education. Where the attrition rate is high, is it not better, one might wonder, to emphasise educational activities with a high immediate surrender value. On this basis, a local language medium might permit faster progress in a limited range of subjects in a curtailed period of education.

Whilst high attrition rates and low progression rates apparently lend support to the notion that a local language medium is preferable in early education, there is a flaw to the argument. This is that many pupils, teachers and parents do in fact view the passing of the primary school leaving examination and the gaining of acceptance to secondary school as the prime purpose of primary education. Indeed, there are several reports of teachers in the last years of primary school gearing their teaching to the critical leaving examination. This is true even in Tanzania (Carr–Hill 1984), despite a progression rate to secondary school of only 4%, and despite official declarations about primary education being an education in itself. Such practices are, however, understandable in view of socio-economic realities, that is the wide discrepancies between the earnings of primary and secondary school leavers.

Here, then, one sees how the logic of educational facts (and of development), which points to the increased use of local languages, confronts the logic of aspirations, which points to the more extensive teaching of the world/national language. The latter may exert a strong pull even where primary school teachers have poor command of a world language (English), and where it is obvious that only low levels of proficiency in the language are attained, as in Tanzania (Cripper & Dodd 1984). As King (1985:452) suggests, parents and pupils prefer ".... the
opportunity to fail in English rather than be denied it altogether."

Evidence of such a preference arises from the high level of demand among richer parents for private English medium schooling (primary or secondary).

That said, these socio-economic driven preferences should not inhibit questioning of the fundamental advisability of allocating the world/national language a central role in the primary curriculum in situations where teaching of that language is poor, and attrition rates are high and progression rates low.

As a whole, then, this section illustrates the relevance of wider educational factors (such as the aims/objectives of schooling, educational ideology, and the structure of the education system) to the choice of medium. Accordingly, they should not be omitted from the language planner's vision.

3.2.4 Strategies and Options in the Choice of Languages as Media and as Subjects of Instruction

The choice of languages as media of instruction strongly influences decisions as to which languages should be studied as subjects. Indeed, the latter are often intended to complement those used as media in such a way as to further the aims of language education policy. Thus, where a world language medium is used at primary or secondary level, it is common for local languages to be studied as subjects. Conversely, a national (vehicular) language medium may be complemented by the introduction of a world language as a subject.

Such curricular arrangements, as previously noted, often follow patterns of 'language complementation' (2 or 3 language). They also permit the partial reconciliation of conflicting objectives. For example, the selection of a national (vehicular) language medium, serving cultural/educational aims, may be balanced through the study of a world language as subject, which meets the objective of providing access to the literature of science and technology.

In general, language education does not typically involve the pursuit of one or several objectives to the total exclusion of other desirable ones. Instead, it may be seen as a matter of relative emphases, of marginal gains regarding some objectives at the cost of marginal losses regarding others.

In deciding which languages will feature in the curriculum either as media or as subjects, policy-makers must also determine the optimal time for their introduction. Policy on this issue, as with others, can be seen as an attempt to
accommodate different, even conflicting, principles. For example, a local language medium may be used in the early primary years on educational and psychological grounds (see Section 3.2.3.1). In later primary school, however, there may be a switch to a world language medium partly out of practical constraints and partly to meet the needs of international communication and access to technology. Precisely such a switch can be observed in a number of African countries (eg. Nigeria, Ghana, Malawi, Lesotho, Botswana and Swaziland).

3.2.4.1 An Illustration of Strategic Options in Language Education Policy

It may be helpful to make brief reference to specific countries in order to illustrate a range of policy permutations regarding the languages used as media and taught as subjects, and their time of introduction into the curriculum. The motivations underlying these policies may also be touched on. The countries in question are in Southern and Eastern Africa.

1. Zambia: Zambia is an unusual African country in that since 1965 English has been the only medium of instruction throughout formal education. Local languages are, however, taught as subjects in primary and secondary school.

   A review of this policy has recently been undertaken as part of the educational reforms study (Ministry of Education, Government of Zambia 1976). Difficulties in the use of an English medium are recognised but retention of English is justified on grounds of practicality (available teachers, cost of local language media).

   The report acknowledges that pedagogic principles are not the only consideration in Zambian policy determination:

   "...a satisfactory balance should be struck between pedagogical principles, public acceptability and practicability in the choice of medium of instruction." (Educational Reform Proposals 1976)

2. Botswana: Unlike Zambia, there is a dominant language in Botswana; Setswana spoken by over 80% of the population. It is not surprising, therefore, that Setswana is a joint official language with English, and that it occupies a significant place in the school curriculum.

   The 1977 Report of the National Commission on Education in Botswana recommended that Setswana be the medium in the first four primary years with a switch to English in Standard 5. Setswana should also be given equal status with English as regards secondary school selection.
Weaknesses in the Setswana primary syllabus are recognised; in particular, the need for more Setswana readers and supplementary materials.

In secondary school English retains a central role as medium and subject, this being reflected in the final examination, the Cambridge School Certificate. Setswana continues to be taught as a subject.

3. **Kenya**: There are two official languages (and significant lingua francae) in Kenya, English and Kiswahili. Both feature in the school curriculum.

Current policy, as recommended in the Kenya Government Five Year Plan, is that the instructional medium in primary 1–3 should be the mother tongue (i.e., one of various local languages) with English and Kiswahili as subjects. Thereafter, from primary 4, English should take over as medium with Kiswahili as compulsory subject.

Thus, despite its status as a national-official language (President Kenyatta 1974), Kiswahili appears in the curriculum as a subject only. English, by contrast, is the medium for most school years.

In part, this policy may be seen as reflecting national language needs and patterns of complementation. Thus, in a country economically dependent on tourism, English is valued as an instrument for international communication. Kiswahili, on the other hand, embodies African values and sustains communication within the nation.

4. **Namibia**: Namibia is not, of course, an independent nation as yet. Nevertheless, language planning has been undertaken with this prospect in mind.

On grounds of unity ((the largest language group in Namibia is Oshiwambo spoken by 46% of the population, followed by Nama with 14%) UNIN 1981), feasibility, science and technology, and wider communication, English is envisaged as the future official language of the country. It is in this context that a number of options for language education within a nine-year basic education structure have been proposed (UNIN 1981:97). These are:

A. Local language as medium for six years, English as medium for three years and both languages as subjects throughout.

B. Local language as medium for four years, English as medium for five years, and both languages as subjects throughout.

C. Mixed medium – English and local language – both as subjects throughout.

D. English medium throughout, and English and local language as subjects throughout.
Option A above is commended (UNIN 1981) for giving ample time for the use of a local language medium. On the other hand, it may delay the introduction of English medium for too long. From the beginning of primary school English would need to be taught with efficiency and this "...presupposes competent and well-trained teachers who would use their English periods effectively, based on relevant course and supplementary material." (UNIN 1981:94).

Option B above is commended for allowing sufficient time for the local language to be established, and for the child to adjust to school. At the same time, it is held to give enough time for pupils to attain a 'fair threshold' competence in English. However, because English medium is introduced at an earlier point, provision needs to be made for the maintenance of the status of local languages.

Option C envisages a mixed-medium approach throughout the nine-year basic education cycle. This presupposes an integrated approach to the curriculum with some areas taught in English and others in the local language. The problems of this policy are: (a) the demands placed on teachers who need bilingual competence, and (b) the sophistication required in the design and implementation of an integrated curriculum. Nevertheless, it is held to be a "....potentially attractive curriculum approach."

It is worth noting here that a mixed-medium approach has been advocated by Nadkarni (1978:64) for the Indian context:

"...if we could use the three subjects that naturally relate to these languages, we would not only be taking care of the learning of these languages but also be using them as educational resources."

Option D is held to be an extreme one in that it places maximal emphasis on the official language English. Whilst the policy would be economical in terms of materials, it would still place heavy methodological demands on teachers. More seriously, it would block the advancement of local languages. If these were not used as media, they would not be studied seriously as subjects. Pedagogic or learning defects might then arise (eg. retardation of conceptual development, failure to achieve literacy in the home language).

In summary, three points arise from the study of this very restricted sample of language education strategies/policies. First, one can note how closely the selection of languages as subjects is linked to the choice of languages as media. Second, it seems clear that in devising a strategy for language education there is
a recurring tension between educational principle and practical constraint, between individual and societal needs, and between cultural and functional relevance. One manifestation of this tension in many countries is the change in medium during primary education. Third, in the language education policies described above, one can observe the strong influence of the national language situation.

3.2.5 Issues in the Choice of Medium: A Concluding Summary

Issues in the choice of medium are not identical at each level of the education system. Nevertheless, one can identify certain common pressures and constraints which language planners are obliged to recognise and, if possible, accommodate in policy-making. These are as follows:

1. Objectives relating to the strengthening of cultural identity, and emancipation from undue foreign influence.
   These point to the increased use in education of indigenous languages either as subjects or as media of instruction.

2. The needs of maintaining/strengthening membership of the international community and of securing access to science/technology in an increasingly interdependent world.
   These point to the teaching of world languages as subjects, or their use as media of instruction.

3. Social and political pressures from parents, students and the public who have a sharp awareness of socio-economic realities. These people see a world language as conferring socio-economic mobility. Accordingly, they demand its earliest possible introduction as a medium in the belief that maximal exposure is the best guarantor of examination and job success.

4. The needs of national unity, and of economy, in the face of diverse linguistic environments and financial stringency.
   These point to the establishment of one language medium, either a national (vehicular) or world language, to facilitate administration, lower costs and maintain uniformity (and equity).

5. The need to maximise internal educational efficiency, to promote academic achievement, and to provide the best learning environment for pupils.
   In some circles, this is interpreted as implying the greater use of local indigenous languages in education, particularly in the early stages. However, as argued earlier, this is not necessarily the case in the African context. Research evidence drawn from other geographical regions with very different social circumstances does not translate straightforwardly to
many Third World countries.
In view of the critical nature of this issue in the choice of medium, further Third World-specific research is needed to establish a firmer basis for policy-making.

6. Practical constraints relating to linguistic diversity, the costs of materials production in several languages, and the language proficiency and training of the teaching force.
These point away from curriculum diversification and toward a uniform national or world language medium.

Apart from the forces above, value issues also enter decisions on language education policy. Of particular importance are judgements on the value of linguistic diversity within the nation. Is such diversity to be viewed as a national liability or a national asset? (Ohannessian & Kashoki 1978). If the latter, what cost burdens are acceptably sustained in fostering this diversity?

Such, then, are some of the conflicting pressures on the language planner in education.

By way of conclusion, it may be useful to list (at a minimum level) the kinds of contextual information that would be helpful to the language planner in language education policy deliberations, particularly as they relate to the choice of media of instruction. These are:

1. Information on the national language situation (as detailed in Section 3.1.4).
2. Information on the state of linguistic development/standardisation of the various indigenous languages.
3. Information on the availability of materials in local languages and the world language, and on the relative costs of providing/developing such materials (bearing in mind foreign exchange, import problems).
4. Information on the quantity/type of academic literature published in national languages.
5. Information on the effectiveness of language teaching as evidenced by the language proficiency levels attained by pupils in primary and secondary school.
6. Information on educational aims/objectives and the structure of the education system (including significant indicators such as enrolment ratios, progression and attrition rates).
7. Information on the history and development of language education policy.
3.3 The Choice of Language ‘Norms’ in Language Education

The issue of ‘norms’ in language education is a topic that has been widely discussed and debated by such well-known writers as Bernstein (1970) and Labov (1969). It concerns mother tongue education in English as much as second/foreign language teaching. For the present purposes, however, the focus of attention is on the teaching of English as a second/foreign language.

The issue of ‘norms’ has a particular significance in relation to English because of the special status of the language. This, in turn, is due to (i) the language’s unprecedented degree of use as an international lingua franca, and (ii) its wide geographical spread, both of which features are documented by Fishman et al (1977).

The advantages for international communication arising from the world-wide spread of English have been widely acclaimed. However, fears have also been expressed (see Prator 1968) that variation in the forms of English in use may proceed at such a rate as to lead to the dissolution of the language, thereby vitiating its use as a vehicle for international communication.

Concern here is directed not so much at native varieties of English, whose status is long since acknowledged, nor at foreign language teaching situations (eg. Italy), which are exonormative in character (ie. teachers/learners take external (British/American) norms as points of reference) but at countries where English is non-native but functions as a second language for internal communication. It is in these countries that stable, indigenous varieties of English have arisen to call into question the ‘norms’ hitherto accepted in English language teaching. It is on this specific area that attention is focussed.

The main concern here, however, is not to document or discuss the characteristics of these non-native varieties, nor how they have developed, nor sub-varieties within varieties. These are subjects which have been ably and interestingly discussed by a variety of writers (eg. Kachru 1981, 1983; Strevens 1980; Richards & Tay 1981; Quirk 1981). The concern rather is to examine the implications for language education policy of the emergence of these non-native varieties. In other words, at what point and how, if at all, should they be given formal recognition in the education system (cf. Africa 1983).
3.3.1 Educational Implications of the Emergence of Non-Native Varieties of English

One of the main arguments against the recognition of non-native varieties as models for teaching purposes arises from the fear that these varieties may in time become mutually incomprehensible, undermining English's usefulness as an instrument for international communication.

Prator (1968), for example, sees such recognition as the thin end of a wedge leading to loss of 'widespread intercomprehensibility'. He, therefore, proposes that only a native British or American standard be recognised as an adequate model for teaching.

"...if teachers in many parts of the world aim at the same stable, well-documented model, the effect of their instruction will be convergent;...if many diverse models are chosen,...the overall effect is bound to be divergent. Widespread intercomprehensibility will be lost with no corresponding gain in intelligibility." (Prator 1968:469)

In support of this position, Prator claims that second language varieties are inherently more unstable than mother tongue varieties, that every concession to non-native models has a multiplier effect, and that it is unwise to tolerate deviation at one level of a language because of its effect on other levels.

There are, however, according to Quirk (1981), counter-balancing unifying forces at work. These are: (i) the influence of broadcasting; (ii) popular music; (iii) more widespread opportunities for travel. Also, variation in the written language is less marked than in spoken English, and this helps "....transcend the vagaries of pronunciation" (1981:154).

Nevertheless, worries remain about the consequences of diversification in English, and about the mass teaching of English by non-native teachers of limited proficiency. These lead Quirk (1981) to propose a variety called 'Nuclear English'; a truncated form of English (like Ogden's 'Basic English') which is held to be culture-free, communicatively adequate, amenable to extension, and, "....easier and faster to learn than any variety of natural, 'full' English" (1981:155).

There are two principal objections to 'Nuclear English'. The first concerns its acceptability. Since it 'belongs' to no-one, and is a truncated version of English, it might not prove acceptable to learners and educational authorities. Second, there is no guarantee that it would in fact be easier to use for certain communicative purposes. The explanation of complex concepts in linguistically
controlled (or simplified) language is notoriously difficult even for sophisticated, educated native-speakers.

In opposition to Prator, there is a growing number of commentators who believe that it is now appropriate to teach a non-native variety of English rather than a British or American standard. This, for example, is essentially the view of Kachru (1981), and Richards & Tay (1981).

Kachru (1981,1983) argues that non-native Englishes are stable and efficient varieties capable of expressing culture-specific meanings. He also points out that they are non-monolithic. Within most varieties there is 'a cline of varieties'. For example, in Indian English one can distinguish 'educated Indian English' from other sub-varieties (eg. 'Babu English' or 'Pidgin English'). These sub-varieties are held to perform complementary (non-competitive) roles. This, in Kachru's view (1981), suggests the need for a polymodel rather than monomodel approach to the teaching of English, an approach which will reflect the different functions and levels of use of the various forms of English.

Similar points are made by Richards & Tay (1981), who argue that the institutionalisation of English within a new cultural environment has meant that the language has come to exhibit variability according to users' educational and socio-economic background. Accordingly, they distinguish three functionally differentiated sub-varieties; a basilect (low), a mesolect (mid) and acrolect (high). Not all speakers of English control the full range of lectal varieties.

Like Kachru, Richards & Tay (1981) argue for a polymodel approach to the teaching of English. Thus, in teacher-training improving teachers' English is seen as a task of "...lectal expansion (from mesolect to acrolect) but not of making it more like British English" (1981:55). As regards school teaching, the 'norms' employed should vary with the channel (speaking or writing). In written English and syntax the target standard should not deviate substantially from 'standard British English'. Speaking and vocabulary are different, however. It is phonology and vocabulary that identify a speaker as distinctively Singaporean. Therefore, "...in matters of pronunciation, stress, rhythm and intonation, the acrolect would serve as a teaching model" (1981:55).
3.3.1.1 An Assessment of the Arguments

It seems clear that in urging the use of non-native varieties of English as models for teaching, many writers are influenced by nationalistic or authenticity-related motives, by a wish to achieve a linguistic independence commensurate with other forms of independence. There are, however, other practical factors which lend justification to these claims for recognition. These are:

1. The Indigenisation of the Teaching Force:
   With the gradual withdrawal of expatriate teachers, the character of the teaching force in many developing countries has changed considerably. The teaching of English now lies mainly in the hands of non-native teachers who speak a local variety of English. In these circumstances, it may be unrealistic to teach with reference to external norms which few teachers can in fact model, at least in the spoken form.

2. The Democratisation of Education:
   In most developing countries the school population has expanded enormously since independence. This has meant that English is taught/learnt on a much wider scale, and by many more students than hitherto. For most of these students, language learning serves the purposes of intranational not international communication, the latter being the province of the privileged few.
   In these circumstances one may question again whether it is appropriate to teach with reference to an external standard form of the language.

3. The Documentation of Non-Native Varieties
   Increased interest in non-native varieties of English, as evidenced in the growing literature on the field, has led to a greater awareness of their characteristics. Whilst this has enhanced the feasibility of their use as teaching models, there are, as yet, few materials, texts or descriptive grammars widely available to teachers. In their absence, difficulties may arise in distinguishing consistently between acceptable deviations from external norms and errors, or in identifying what is or is not in fact an interlanguage form.
   A second difficulty is more one of teaching principle than of description. It concerns what is to be done about the few who require English for international communication. Are they, Wong (1981) asks, to unlearn some of the rules governing indigenous varieties in order to master native-speaker English rules? There is here a tension between the international and intranational functions of English and the 'norms' which
may be appropriate for one but not the other. One may note in passing that the polymodel approach suggested by Kachru and Richards & Tay could be a possible solution. However, it might be difficult to implement in the classroom, requiring as it does a high level of training and sensitivity on the part of teachers.

In summary, there are difficult choices to be made. On the one hand nationalistic forces and the practical circumstances of much English teaching point to the recognition of non-native varieties as models for teaching purposes. The resulting differentiation in target models would at least acknowledge the different purposes for which English is used. At the same time it might free the teaching of English from residual ethno-centric overtones, and allow for the valid expression of national distinctiveness.

On the other hand, there is a need to preserve intercomprehensibility between varieties so that English continues to fulfil the international functions on which its wider utility is based. There is a need to give learners access to other English-speaking speech communities, and there is the obligation on the educator to avoid undue concession to normative fashions whose long-term implications are as yet unclear.

In the choice of 'norms' in language education the language planner may, then, as ever, have difficulty in finding an optimal balance between conflicting pressures.

3.4 Conclusion

In this chapter attention has been focussed on two central policy issues in language education: (i) the choice of languages as media or as subjects of instruction; (ii) the choice of 'norms' in language education. The first of these is, as previously noted, highly political in nature with policy potentially serving several political goals, eg. to strengthen the unity of the nation, to stress cultural identity, to democratise educational opportunities, to enhance (or restrict) social and educational mobility.

In this emphasis on political goals there is, however, an exaggeration of the power of language education policy to solve educational and social problems. There is consequently a tendency to reverse or change language policy in the belief that this by itself will overcome problems. This is what Treffgame (1985) refers to as a 'scapegoat-panacea syndrome' in respect of policy.
A difficulty here is that excessive emphasis on policy-making, and a misplaced belief in its potency, can lead to a neglect of the importance of implementation, and of small-scale incremental improvements in education at a 'micro' level. Clearly, appropriate policies are important for educational and socio-economic progress. Progress and change cannot, however, be achieved without detailed and careful implementation of policy.

Indeed, it is sometimes forgotten that the apparent failure of policy can be explained in two ways. There may be some inappropriacy or defect in policy itself. Alternatively, the policy may never have been properly implemented. Implementation is, in other words, logically prior to any evaluation. It is also central to effecting real change. The first task, then, of the evaluator is to establish that implementation has occurred.

For these reasons we move to the subject of implementation in language planning in education in the next chapter.
CHAPTER 4
LANGUAGE PLANNING IN EDUCATION:
THE CURRICULUM LEVEL

Language education policies are normally implemented through the school curriculum. Consequently, this chapter focusses on implementation realised at the level of curriculum planning.

It aims, in particular, to provide an overview of curriculum theory and curriculum processes with reference to the language education curriculum. Two justifications can be advanced for this content.

First, to concur with the view taken by Clark (1987:xii), the development of the language curriculum is not influenced only by applied linguistic theories or practices. It is rather the outcome of:

"...the inter-relationships that hold between subject-specific concerns and other broader factors embracing socio-political and philosophical matters, educational value systems, theory and practice in curriculum design, teacher experiential wisdom and learner motivation." (Clark 1987:xii)

The interpretation and understanding of particular language education curricula therefore requires an understanding of these underlying influences and their relationship. A review of curriculum theory and processes may, then, assist the language (curriculum) planner identify significant contextual influences, in particular the educational values and assumptions underpinning the particular curricula he encounters.

A second justification arises from Stern's (1984:10) lament of "...a lack of contact among applied linguists with curriculum theory in general educational issues."

The present focus on general curriculum theory takes heed of, but does not remedy, Stern's complaint. However, it may throw light on a neglected area which is of relevance to the problems of language curriculum/syllabus design.

4.1 Conceptions of Education as Inputs to Curriculum Design

As no curriculum can be all-encompassing, selections are required from culture and from knowledge. These choices are influenced by the values held by teachers and educationists. To understand the meaning of a given curriculum, it
is, therefore, necessary to appreciate what conceptions of education inform its design.

Taylor & Richards (1985) identify several constituent components of such conceptions; namely, a view of the ends of education, a view of the nature of knowledge, a view of the nature of children and of teaching. These components are briefly discussed in the following sections. First, however, it is necessary to clarify the meaning of the term 'curriculum'.

4.1.1 Definitions and Senses of 'curriculum'

The term 'curriculum' has traditionally been used to refer to the content of a course of study or to the entire range of educational experiences planned for students in educational institutions.

Kelly (1982:7) argues, however, that the curriculum should not be viewed merely as an array of educational experiences, or a collection of subjects, but as the "....overall rationale for the educational programme of an institution." The term in this sense has a more abstract reference, denoting a justification, rationale or plan, in addition to content.

Taylor & Richards (1985) point out that no one definition is necessarily preferable to another since much depends on the context in which the term is used. Therefore, as long as the term is used with consistency, its meaning can be left indeterminate. For the present purposes, then, we will use the term 'curriculum' to mean roughly the content of education and the means of its delivery.

Senses of Curriculum

Various senses of the term 'curriculum' can be identified. For example, some commentators distinguish between the 'overt' and the 'hidden' curriculum. The latter term is used to refer to the incidental (or covert) learning which takes place in institutions arising from their organisational and social arrangements in which values and assumptions are embedded.

The more useful distinction for the present purposes is that between the 'intended' and the 'operational' curriculum. This embodies the plausible claim that the curriculum as planned is rarely the same as that operationalised in the classroom. The two may in fact be quite different.
Referring to the language syllabus, Breen (1984:50), for example, claims that:

"The predesigned syllabus is .... a paradox, for it serves to .... render itself redundant. It is always replaced in its implementation by that syllabus which is jointly discovered and created in the classroom."

The operational curriculum may also diverge from the intended because there are intervening factors constraining or frustrating the achievement of curricular aims. Whatever the case, the essential point is that in translating intent into action, the curriculum, in Hamilton's words (1974a:194), ".... undergoes modifications that are rarely trivial".

The above distinction is important for the planner. Through an understanding of the factors that affect the operationalisation of the intended curriculum, or make its realisation problematic, planning may become more sensitive, though it may finally be unable to pre-empt any mismatch between intent and reality.

4.1.2 The Ends of Education

A major influence on the design and content of the curriculum are views about the proper ends of education. These may very roughly be categorised in three ways: (i) those which centre the ends of education on society and its needs, (ii) those which centre the ends of education on the individual, and (iii) those which see education more as an end in itself, as initiating individuals into intrinsically worthwhile activities, beliefs and meanings.

The first set of views (the ends of education reside in society) derive from conceptions of what a just/good society is, and what attributes individuals require for participation in it. There are numerous articulations of visions of the good society and of the implications for education.

Plato, for example, conceived of the just and harmonious society as hierarchically ordered into different social castes. This dictated a differentiated curriculum with only the elite 'guardians' being initiated into the more abstract 'knowledge forms' (see Plato: 'The Republic').

In Marxist-Leninist thought education is a means to building 'communist man', and the furtherance of socialist consciousness. Individual aspirations are subordinated to collective requirements.

The image of a particular kind of society is again influential in the definition
of the content/form of education in some third world countries. Nyerere (1967:15), for instance, says that education should involve the transmission of:

"...the skills (a pupil) ought to acquire and the values he ought to cherish if he or she is to live happily and well in a socialist and predominantly rural society, and to contribute to the improvement of life there."

In terms of Skilbeck's (1982) framework of educational ideologies, adopted by Clark (1987), the above views may be characterised as 'reconstructionist' in nature. They see education as a means to effecting social change, and they exhibit a faith in the efficacy of planning to bring about social advance.

As regards the language curriculum 'reconstructionist' ideology would tend to emphasise the practical and socially useful aspects of foreign language learning. In other words, language learning would be valued primarily for its contribution to improved communication. Clark (1987:15) sees the 'reconstructionist' outlook exhibited in the 1982 declaration of the Council of Europe which encourages the teaching of European languages to enable pupils:

"...to use the language effectively for communication with other speakers of that language, both in transacting the business of everyday living, and in building social and personal relations...."

The second category of views sees the ends of education as residing in the individual. Historically, they may be traced back to Rousseau (see: 'Emile') who believed that education should cultivate the natural goodness of children, enabling them to take their place in a 'democratic' society governed through the 'general will' of its members. Later conceptions in the Rousseauesque tradition see education as leading to individual 'self-realisation', or 'self-actualisation'.

In terms of the Skilbeck/Clark (1987) framework, such views can be characterised as 'progressivist'.

'Progressivism' emphasises education as a means to promoting the development of the individual as a whole person. As regards the language curriculum, it favours an emphasis on learners' needs. It would also be sympathetic to natural learning processes and stages of development. In terms of curricular objectives, it values 'language awareness' as well as communicative proficiency.

The third set of views above conceives education to be an initiation into
worthwhile knowledge and culture, and as concerned to promote general intellectual capacities. The Skilbeck/Clark (1987) analysis characterises these views as belonging to a tradition of 'classical humanism'. The central concern of 'classical humanism' is, they argue, the transmission of accumulated wisdom and culture, and the maintenance of cultural/intellectual standards. In practice, this may require a differentiated curriculum, - one embracing 'high culture' and abstract knowledge for an elite, another to serve the more practical needs and interests of the mass (Bantock 1971).

As regards the language curriculum, classical humanism accords a high status to languages with a reputation for literary and cultural achievement (eg. Latin, Greek, French, German). Language learning is viewed as a rigorous intellectual exercise. Proficiency in reading and writing is especially valued for the access it provides to works of literature. In methodology great emphasis is laid on conscious reflection, analysis and memorisation. As Clark (1987:8) observes, there is a close association between classical humanism and the 'grammar-translation' method.

### 4.1.3 Knowledge and the Curriculum

A second crucial influence on the curriculum is views about knowledge. These concern the nature of knowledge itself as well as the different forms of knowledge and their status.

#### 4.1.3.1 The Nature of Knowledge

For convenience one can roughly distinguish two conceptions of the nature of knowledge. The first essentially takes knowledge to be objective, to exist independently of human cognition. It is thus reified. The learner’s task is to grasp or assimilate independently existing bodies of knowledge.

The second view more subtly holds that knowledge is the outcome of the interaction between an external world and human cognition. It is a series of constructs developed by individuals as they strive to organise, categorise and interpret their experience of reality. Thus, knowledge loses its objective status. Some sociologists develop the argument further. They claim that knowledge is 'socially constructed', that is, a set of constructions placed on human experience by social classes or professions.

A consequence of this view, Kelly (1982) points out, is that decisions on curriculum content become ideological in nature. It is difficult, therefore, to
justify curriculum content solely by reference to epistemological considerations.

Abstruse though these conceptions of knowledge may seem, traces of them can arguably be detected in language education practices. The notion of 'objective' knowledge is, in particular, quite common.

Rutherford (1987), for example, characterises the conventional view of language learning as entailing "....the successive mastery of steadily accumulating structural entities ....language teaching brings the entities to the learner's attention." (1987:4).

These entities, the products of a prior linguistic analysis, exist, independently, of the learner whose task is revealingly described as one of 'internalising' them.

In a critique of the 'accumulated entities' view, Rutherford (1987) develops an alternative account which more closely approximates a conception of knowledge as a mediating construct between the individual mind and an external reality. The learner does not embark on second language learning as a 'tabula rasa', but brings to the task two forms of knowledge; knowledge that – (prior knowledge of the possible forms of organisation a target language may or may not assume), and knowledge how – (the ability to 'bend' the language for rudimentary communication). Furthermore, the learner is engaged in a process of 'grammaticisation' by which a maximally direct form-meaning relationship is progressively rendered more indirect (ie. it is more 'grammaticised'). This is "....akin to the growth of cells in the human body, where the cells are regenerated over time but still carry the same genetic code." (Rutherford 1987:40).

4.1.3.2 The Forms of Knowledge and their Status

Another matter that concerns curriculum theorists is distinctions within knowledge.

Hirst (1969) argues for seven distinct forms of knowledge on the grounds that these forms apply different tests for truth and have different ways of validating their concepts. Since they all provide distinct ways to rationality, they should all feature in the curriculum.

The notion of differentiation within knowledge (a la Hirst) has sometimes been exploited to justify existing subject divisions. However, some commentators have pointed to the dangers of compartmentalising knowledge within a traditional subject-based curriculum; namely that it constrains lines of enquiry and
misrepresents the nature of problems in the world. One result has been attempts to develop integrated curricula that are held to facilitate enquiry-based learning and make possible the study of issues not falling within any one subject area.

The distinction between subject-based and integrated curricula is touched on by Bernstein (1975), who distinguishes two basic types of curricula; the 'collection' type and the 'integrated' type. Related to this distinction are two further concepts; classification and framing.

Classification refers to "...the degree of boundary maintenance between (curriculum) contents." Framing refers to "...the degree of control teacher and pupils possess over the selection, organisation, pacing, and timing of the knowledge transmitted and received in the pedagogical relationship." (Bernstein 1975:159).

Bernstein (1975) argues that in the English educational system a 'collection' type of 'educational knowledge code' prevails (ie. contents are well insulated from each other). Relative to other European educational systems, the English system has stronger classification but weaker framing. In other words, the curriculum subjects are well insulated from each other but owing to the lesser degree of central control and the less explicit definition of the curriculum, there are:

"...more options available to (teachers and) pupils within the pedagogical relationship." (Bernstein 1975:162)

Bernstein’s analysis is arguably a potentially useful instrument to the curriculum planner for the interpretation and categorisation of particular curricula.6

It is also of potential relevance to curriculum change strategies. Bernstein argues that the type of ‘knowledge code’ influences the identities and relationships of teaching staff, and patterns of power distribution. Thus, a shift from a 'collection' to an 'integrated' code may, as Bernstein (1971:162) puts it:

"...bring about a disturbance in the structure and distribution of

6One may voice here the suspicion that the curricula of many developing countries have both strong classification and strong framing.
power, in property relationships and in existing educational institutions."

Imagine here the difficulties of implementing a policy of teaching English through the medium of other subjects (as suggested by Widdowson 1968) in a situation where subjects were well insulated from each other, and where teachers’ professional identities were closely bound to those subjects.

Apart from distinctions within knowledge, there is also disputation over the status of the different forms of knowledge.

Hirst (1969) argues that the several (7) forms of understanding should be available to all children as they are necessary for balanced development. Others, however, suspect these views. They point to the difficulty of identifying ‘intrinsically worthwhile’ activities that have an unqualified right of entry into the curriculum. Neither, they claim, is it easy to distinguish ‘intrinsically worthwhile’ activities from others requiring a more instrumental justification.

Another criticism of ‘intrinsically worthwhile’ areas of knowledge is that it can lead to curricula emphasising high status, abstract knowledge that may be unsuitable for some children. Bantock (1971), for example, argues that in England existing curricula tend to be too abstract for many children. They should, therefore, be modified to give more attention to the affective, the practical and the concrete.

Whether such a curriculum would include a foreign curriculum is unclear. The main point is, however, that the debate over the status of different forms of knowledge has potential significance for the language curriculum. In particular, it affects decisions on whether a foreign language is included in the curriculum, and, if so, to what categories of pupils it is offered. Should there be a common curriculum for all, or different curricula for different kinds of pupil? If there is to be a ‘core’ curriculum, should a foreign language be included in it? The current answer in the UK in 1987 appears to be that it should.

4.1.4 Views on Childhood and Children

Another important influence on the curriculum is views about childhood and children. These, as Taylor & Richards (1985:28) point out, are not often explicitly acknowledged but are "...influential in shaping how teachers transact curricula...." They may be divided into several categories: viz, views on the status of
childhood, on the moral quality of children, and on the psychological/intellectual development of children.

4.1.4.1 The Status of Childhood

There are different conceptions or images of what childhood is. Some see it as simply a developmental stage on the way to adulthood, as something incomplete. Others view it as having some intrinsic value, as being qualitatively self-contained. Some cultures (particularly in the Third World) do not actually possess a concept of childhood.

The different views of childhood imply different curricula. To uphold the first view implies a preparatory orientation towards education. Children are to be prepared for their future adult roles.

The second view encourages the child to pursue self-expression with less regard to future roles. In terms of the language curriculum this could presumably mean greater emphasis on the mother tongue. The preparatory orientation by contrast, would give greater importance to languages of wider communication.

4.1.4.2 The Moral Quality of Children

A second matter is the moral quality of children. One idea, still common, is that children are inevitably implicated in sin, and are troublesome and erring. They, therefore, need control and restraint. The contrary view is that children are by nature good and benign beings. This encourages an 'optimistic' view of self-development in a facilitating environment.

Clearly, the different attitudes imply very different ways of teaching children. The first suggests a custodial attitude to discipline. A paramount consideration in the classroom is the maintenance of discipline and control. This, in turn, affects the learning environment. Attitudes to innovative language teaching methods will also be affected.

4.1.4.3 The Intellectual Development of Children

There are different views regarding the intellectual development of children.

Some contend that intellectual ability is largely a matter of genetic endowment, and fixed within certain limits. Children require external motivation/stimulation to progress within those limits.
Others operate with a more flexible notion of ability, point to the self-fulfilling dangers of early labelling and are optimistic about the continued acquisition of intelligence into adulthood. Children are not assumed to need external motivation/stimulation as they necessarily seek meaning from their experience of the world.

Again, the influences of these different conceptions can be detected in the transaction of language education curricula. The first would suggest a greater stress on habit-formation in language learning, the second a greater emphasis on active inferencing and hypothesis-formation. In the first conception it is also likely that language teaching will be restricted to children identified as 'intellectually capable'.

4.1.5 Views on Teaching and the Teacher

Closely related to views about children are different conceptions of teaching. These are frequently idiosyncratic but, as Taylor & Richards (1985:30) suggest, certain 'ideal' models can be identified.

In one model teaching is an encounter between a high status individual in possession of knowledge and a lower status individual without knowledge. Knowledge is transmitted from knower to pupil. The teacher's function is to provide order so that initiation into 'objective' knowledge may proceed smoothly. The mode of instruction is, therefore, didactic and the pacing of learning is controlled by the teacher.

In Barnes' (1976) terms, this is a 'transmission' model of teaching. The teacher sees his job as transmitting knowledge to pupils and as correcting pupils so that they meet the standards of the subject. In terms of language teaching methodology this implies the 'lockstep' teaching of the structures and vocabulary of the target language, and a sharp focus on the accuracy of pupils' language production. There are limited opportunities for the communicative use of the target language through group/pair work.

In a second, sharply contrasting model, teacher and learner encounter each other in a more symmetrical, equal relationship. The learner assumes a more active role in the initiation and direction of learning. Likewise, the teacher takes more account of learners' interests and cognitive processes. All this implies less emphasis on didactic instruction and more on the active engagement of the learner in enquiry-based activities.
In Barnes' (1976) terms, again, this is an 'interpretation' model of teaching. The teacher sees himself not so much as authority or 'knower' but as a facilitator or manager of interactions through which pupils advance their own understanding of the subject. In language teaching methodology, this suggests a greater emphasis on exposing pupils to language data/texts and on encouraging them to make inferences on that basis. There is also likely to be more problem-solving, exploratory activity and more opportunities for communication through group/pair work.

4.1.6 Educational Ideologies: A Summary

In the preceding sections the constituent components of conceptions of education have been briefly discussed. These components are often combined in such a way as to produce idiosyncratic conceptions of education. It is possible, however, to reduce the great variety of individual conceptions to a smaller range of educational ideologies. These 'ideologies' act as idealising or summarising devices.

Different writers (eg. Davies 1969; Scrimshaw 1983; Skilbeck 1982) have suggested various typologies of educational ideologies. For the present purposes, however, it may be sufficient to note Clark's (1987) exploitation of Skilbeck's (1982) framework to discuss features of contrasting foreign language curricula.

For Clark (1987), there are three broad systems of influence on foreign language curricula. Summarised in ideological terms, these are (a) classical humanism, (b) reconstructionism, (c) progressivism.

A possible criticism of Clark's (1987) scheme is that it sometimes seems difficult to trace the associations between particular teaching methods and classroom activities, and the three ideologies above. The ideologies in question are perhaps better understood in relation to curricular objectives rather than the detailed means for their attainment. Nevertheless, the scheme is a useful means of categorising language teaching approaches with reference to underlying value systems.

In view of the influence of these value systems (or conceptions of education) on curriculum design and on the transaction of curricula, it is important that the curricular planner strive to identify the conceptions prevailing in a given situation, whether these are explicitly documented or are implicit in teaching practice. By
so doing, he will be better placed to understand what motivates existing practice, and to judge whether the changes he proposes are congruent with prevailing values.

4.2 Models of Curriculum Design

Apart from the conceptions of education referred to above, another significant influence on the shape of the curriculum is models of the design process itself. In the following sections a variety of models and their relevance to the language curriculum will be discussed. An additional motivation for the discussion is Stern's (1983:442) comment that:

"...language pedagogy has not yet made use of the available collective wisdom in curriculum theory to cope with curriculum decisions in an economical and effective way."

4.2.1 The 'Objectives' Model of Curriculum Design

The 'objectives' model is closely associated with Tyler (1949) who identified four stages in curriculum design, and articulated the relationship holding between them. These stages are reproduced in the diagram below:

\[
\text{Figure 5: The 'Objectives' Model of Curriculum Design (Tyler 1949)}
\]

As the name suggests, the first step in the design cycle is the formulation of clear objectives. Only when these are known can appropriate learning experiences be selected. Thereafter, the learning experiences must be so sequenced as to reinforce each other. Finally, evaluation determines to what extent objectives are being met, and indicates what modifications are necessary.

Since Tyler's original formulation, much work has gone into the refinement and clarification of the process of specifying objectives. In the 1950s Bloom, Krathwohl and others developed taxonomies of educational objectives in the cognitive and affective domains. (An intended taxonomy for the psycho-motor domain was not completed). One of their aims was to provide a clearer
framework than hitherto for the discussion of objectives.

They spoke of objectives as ‘intended learning outcomes’, specified as behaviours the student should manifest as a result of undergoing instruction. In this respect, they agreed with Tyler who argued that to be maximally clear an objective should be stated in behavioural terms:

"....the most useful form for stating objectives is to express them in terms which identify both the kind of behaviour to be developed in the students and the context or area of life in which this behaviour is to operate." (Tyler 1949:46-47)

Over the years the ‘objectives’ model of curriculum design has been influential in many curriculum projects. Some of the arguments deployed in its favour are as follows:

1. It is suggested that proper evaluation can only be carried out where objectives are unambiguously pre-specified. The concern of testers and evaluators to measure educational attainment has historically been a powerful inducement for the pre-specification of objectives. Evaluation, in turn, is held to be necessary on two counts: (a) to provide accountability, and (b) to facilitate the improvement of curricula and of teaching.
2. Objectives have been defended on logical grounds (Hirst 1969). A characteristic of rational activity is that it is goal-directed. Thus, if education is to be rationally conducted, it must state its goals and take note of them in deciding on appropriate means. If it does not, teaching may become aimless.
3. The pre-specification of objectives is held to make education more precise, more efficient. It brings a rational, ‘scientific’ approach to teaching, and encourages reflection on its purposes.

4.2.1.1 A Critique of the ‘Objectives’ Model

In recent years the ‘objectives’ model has been the subject of much criticism. The principal criticisms are summarised below:

1. The use of behavioural objectives tends to give undue emphasis to lower level skills at the expense of other important educational outcomes (eg. appreciation and understanding) which are not so easily rendered in behavioural form.
2. The notion that high level skills may be atomised into discrete items of behaviour (or subsets of micro skills) raises epistemological difficulties
that are sometimes overlooked in a behavioural objectives approach.

3. On philosophical grounds (Kelly 1983) it has been argued that the objectives approach misconceives the nature of education. Content is regarded as instrumental to the attainment of pre-specified objectives. There is a danger here that an important distinction may be blurred; that between training for some further end and education conceived of as induction into 'intrinsically worthwhile activities'.

To approach certain areas of education with pre-specified objectives in mind is, Stenhouse (1975) suggests, to misunderstand the educational process. The essential point is that:

"...education as induction into knowledge is successful to the extent that it makes the behavioural outcomes of students unpredictable." (Stenhouse 1975:82)

4. A related criticism is that the pre-specification of 'intended learning outcomes' denies autonomy to teacher and pupil. It precludes the constant modification and negotiation that is central to the activity of teaching.

Finally, in design there are practical difficulties of separating ends and means. Aims and content, it is argued, necessarily inform each other and must be examined simultaneously not linearly.

4.2.1.2 The 'Objectives' Model and the Language Curriculum

The 'objectives' model has been very influential in language curriculum design, perhaps because language teaching/learning as a skill area appears to lend itself to the pre-specification of objectives.

These objectives may, as Richards (1984b) points out, assume different forms. For example, objectives can be specified in terms of the proficiency level to be attained at the end of the course. The trouble with this, Richards (1984) notes, is that at lower levels the objective begins to resemble a profile of incompetence.

Another common form of objective is the 'content-related' objective, a statement of the grammatical structures, notions or functions to be covered in a course of instruction. More common still, perhaps, are objectives assuming a classical behavioural form. This is the type of specification employed, for
"The aim of learning is to change the learner's behaviour potential. Learning-objectives should reflect this aim and consequently specify what the learners will be able to do after having completed the learning process. In other words, objectives should be described in behavioural terms." (Van Ek 1984; Van Ek & Trim 1984)

Van Ek (1984) adds that these behavioural objectives should be stated with maximal explicitness so that "....only one single interpretation is possible." However, there is some scope for flexibility since, according to Van Ek (1984), all learners (at certain levels) "....reach the same general behavioural objectives...." but manifest different degrees of communicative skill in doing so.

With the growth of interest in learner-centered pedagogical approaches a common method of determining appropriate course objectives has been a prior needs analysis. The function of needs analysis in language teaching, especially specific purpose language teaching, is the identification of the future communicative needs/situation of the learner. This analysis is subsequently used, in many conceptions at least, to specify directly the objectives and content of the language programme. Munby (1978:218), a leading exponent of the needs analysis approach, presents the issue in these terms:

"....the contention has been that when the purpose for which the target language is required can be identified, the syllabus specification is directly derivable from the prior identification of the communication needs of that particular participant or participant stereotype."

The Munby claim has been questioned by several writers, notably Widdowson (1983,1984a). Widdowson's (1984a:178) argument is that one should distinguish two interpretations of learners' needs; one concerns what the learner eventually needs to do with the language and the other "....what the learner needs to do to actually acquire the language."

The first is a 'goal-orientated' definition of needs and the second a 'process-orientated' definition.

One might add here that a further distinction is not made clear; that between

---

In another context it is also the approach adopted in Zambian secondary school English syllabuses.
the objective needs of the learner, as externally perceived by teachers and others, and 'felt' needs, what the learner himself feels he needs ('Bedarf' and Bedürfnisse in Clark's terms 1987:36). Also, there is little recognition given in conventional, once and for all needs analysis of the possibility of a changing perception of needs.

Widdowson (1984a) points out that the determination of course content by a focus on eventual purposes is not particularly helpful since it neglects to clarify what activities the learner should engage in as a means to acquiring sufficient proficiency to perform the tasks he will have to cope with.

This last point goes to the heart of the main criticism of the objectives model as applied to language curriculum design. Objectives can be helpful to teachers in setting out explicitly the general direction of learning. However, a description of 'intended learning outcomes', or indeed of the product of learning in terms of structures or communicative functions, does not itself indicate what kinds of learning experience will bring those outcomes about. What teachers need, arguably, are not so much statements of objectives, or ever more refined descriptive categories of language, but principles of procedure on how to promote language development and greater proficiency.

Language-centered syllabus specifications (ie. in terms of structures or notions-functions) deriving from a prior specification of objectives, may be useful as a summary of the language content to which learners will be exposed. However, the resulting categories of functions or structures are only "a static inventory of parts", a series of "conceptual artefacts." The problem for the teacher, as Widdowson (1984) and Clark (1987) observe, is to recharge these 'inert categories' with life, to enable learners to participate in discourse, in the communication of personal meanings, rather than to display the language forms or functions they are taught. It is this problem, the problem of methodological procedure that the 'objectives' approach does not address.

In reaction to the defects of the 'objectives' approach, 'process' models of curriculum design have emerged, and it is to these that attention is now turned.

4.2.2 'Process' Models of Curriculum Design

The 'process' approach to curriculum design is associated with Stenhouse (1975). It may be seen as an attempt to overcome some of the disadvantages of the 'objectives' model. The specification of behavioural objectives is thus
eschewed. Instead, design is based on (i) the specification of content, and (ii) principles of procedure appropriate to that content.

Central, then, is a concern with content. This springs from the belief which Stenhouse (1975) shares with Peters (1966) that education is properly participation in 'intrinsically worthwhile activities'. Content thus has its own intrinsic justification and does not have to be regarded as a means to an objective beyond itself. Content for learning can then be selected on the grounds that it represents the concepts and procedures inherent in an area of knowledge. Design becomes a matter of devising teaching procedures and materials which are consistent with the concepts, procedures and criteria inherent in the chosen content. It is thus the process to be undergone rather than the intended product that is the object of specification.

Perhaps the best known operationalisation of such a 'process' approach is in the Schools Council Humanities Project (Stenhouse 1975:92). The project’s content was the study of social situations involving controversial value issues. Following specification of content, a number of procedural principles consistent with this content were laid forth.

The teacher's role was to be that of neutral chairman and 'resource person'. Teaching was to be discussion-based. The protection of divergence of opinion and a critical concern for evidence were further central operating principles.

The merits of Stenhouse's 'process' approach have been seen as follows:

(i) it gives greater scope for teacher autonomy, and seems to reflect more faithfully the ongoing negotiation and improvisation that teaching involves.
(ii) it does not, in Taylor & Richards (1985:58) words, "...presuppose linear treatment of its components."
(iii) it has greater fidelity to the nature of the educational process.

It encourages an open, provisional view of knowledge rather than the more determinate, fixed view encapsulated in the 'objectives' approach.

The 'process' model is, however, also criticised on the grounds that:

(i) it makes objective assessment and evaluation more difficult.
(ii) it assumes a high level of teacher expertise and competence.
(iii) there is still a concern with ends though these are not expressed in behavioural form.
4.2.2.1 'Process' Models and the Language Curriculum

As previously noted, dissatisfaction with the 'objectives' approach has led to an increased emphasis on 'process' approaches to language curriculum design. To some extent these developments parallel those in general curriculum design theory.

The essence of the 'process' approach is the emphasis on methodological principles of procedure, on activities for learning. To exemplify, let us again refer to Widdowson.

In place of a Munby-style 'goal-oriented' approach to course design, Widdowson proposes his own 'process-oriented' approach in which the means rather than the ends guide the design. In other words, selection of course content is justified by reference to notions of how people learn rather than by reference to ends.

"....the language content of the course is selected not because it is representative of what the learner will have to deal with after the course is over but because it is likely to activate strategies for learning while the course is in progress." (1984a:182)

In these proposals one can detect an affinity with Stenhouse's 'process' approach. Both focus attention on the learning process not the outcome. Both see the articulation of methodological principles and procedures as central to design. A linear progression from objectives to content selection to sequencing of that content is seen as problematic. In short, methodology is installed as a priority in design.

"....thus methodology was placed at the very heart of the operation, with course design directed at servicing its requirements and not the reverse." (Widdowson 1983:107)

The Bangalore procedural syllabus associated with Prabhu (1987), can be seen as another form of 'process' design. A distinctive characteristic of the syllabus is the avoidance of any pre-specification of linguistic content, or of behaviourally couched objectives. Instead, the learner is invited to engage in problem-solving tasks which are held to facilitate an unconscious process of grammar construction. Thus, a methodological procedure, or principle, lies at the centre of the syllabus design.

Yet more radical in their determination to avoid any pre-specification of
objectives, or of a fixed inventory of language items, are the 'process' syllabuses described by Candlin (1984a) and Breen (1984).

In Candlin's (1984a:32) view, conventional syllabuses of the means-ends type are "... centralized, management-orientated and predictive." They are "static and imposed" concepts. On the assumption that all this is undesirable, he proposes a second type of syllabus which is 'interactive' and 'problem-solving'.

"We become preoccupied with the negotiation of content/experience and evaluation, as a reflection of participants' long-term and short-term purposes, needs and wants, and in so doing concern ourselves necessarily less with the syllabus as tactical blueprint and more with it as tactical account. Syllabuses .... take on the character of retrospective record rather than a prospective plan." (1984a:35)

For Breen (1984), the syllabus can be understood through the metaphor of a route map. In conventional syllabus design the map begins from the destination. Breen, however, proposes an alternative orientation which:

"...would prioritize the route itself: a focussing upon the means toward the learning of a new language. Here the designer would give priority to the changing process of learning and the potential of the classroom - to the psychological and social resources applied to a new language by learners in the classroom context." (Breen 1984:52)

One may question here the practicality of these forms of 'process' syllabus. In institutionalised education in most contexts pre-planned syllabuses are thought to be necessary guarantors of a degree of essential uniformity and continuity. The strong form of 'negotiated' syllabus proposed above is also likely to be culturally unacceptable in many situations.

The charge of impracticality is in fact a more serious one than might first appear, given Brumfit's (1984b:76) point that a syllabus is primarily a document of 'practical and administrative' convenience rather than one to be justified on theoretical grounds. For Brumfit (1984b), it functions as a public statement of intended activity and is thus available for scrutiny and criticism. It also sets out a common frame of reference which enables continuity to be maintained between classes. It helps teachers be aware of the responsibilities of other teachers. Not to have a syllabus is, in Brumfit's (1984a:76) view, "...to refuse to allow one's assumptions to be scrutinized or to enable different teachers to relate their work to each other."
In short, proposals for 'process' syllabuses of the type above (Candlin 1984) pay insufficient heed to the institutionalised, public, accountable aspects of education. That said, the 'process' approach draws welcome attention to methodology and principles of procedure.

4.2.3 'Situational' Models of Curriculum Design

The 'situational' model as developed by Skilbeck (1976), does not exclude a 'process' or 'objectives' approach but may encompass either. Its distinguishing feature is its provision for a systematic analysis of contextual factors that need to be taken into account in design.

The five main components of the model can be summarised as follows:

(i) Situational Analysis: (involving analysis of external and internal factors that may affect the curriculum process. External factors include community expectations and resources contributed by society. Internal factors include teachers' and pupils' interests and skills, school ethos and school resources).

(ii) Goal Formulation.

(iii) Programme Building: (involving the selection and sequencing of learning content).

(iv) Interpretation and Implementation: (involving the anticipation of practical difficulties of implementation).

(v) Monitoring, assessment, feedback, reconstruction.

One significant assumption of the model should be noted. This is that curriculum development is best prosecuted at school level, hence the emphasis in 'situational analysis' on factors internal to the school.

This feature would appear to somewhat limit the model's applicability to national level curriculum projects. On the other hand, the sensible point is made that in introducing curricular change the first priority is to understand the perceptions, influences and constraints that shape the current curricular situation.

Apart from needs analysis or 'target situation' analysis (Chambers 1980), there is little direct evidence, to my knowledge, of any influence of this model on discussions of language curriculum design.
4.2.4 A 'Naturalistic' Model of Curriculum Design

The models hitherto mentioned have been abstract, idealised and prescriptive. Their substantive metaphor in Taylor & Richard's (1985:180) words is that of 'the blueprint'. They all belong to the rational, systematic paradigm of curriculum theory.

An alternative perspective, is, however, offered by 'naturalistic' curriculum theory. As propounded by writers such as Schwab (1969) or Walker (1971), this approach maintains that there is no general blueprint which can account for all the intricate complexity of factors involved in the curriculum process. Curriculum design is essentially a matter of practical reasoning, of balancing constraints and opportunities to achieve the best solution in a given context. The initial task of curriculum theory is, then, not to present prescriptive models to guide curriculum design but to strive to describe, understand and illuminate existing practice.

In line with this approach, models (eg. Walker's 1971) have been developed to describe how curriculum development takes place in practice. Such a model is presented in the diagram below:

*Figure 6: A Naturalistic Model of Curriculum Development (Walker 1971:58)*

As can be seen, a key feature of Walker's (1971) 'naturalistic' model is the deliberation stage to which there are two key inputs; a platform of basic educational principles/values and data about the educational situation. Reference is also made to curriculum policy precedents. In deliberating, the curriculum development team assigns values to facts, considers options and hears arguments. The resulting decisions constitute a curriculum design which is embodied in curriculum materials.

Whether or not this model faithfully represents how curriculum development actually takes place is a matter for empirical investigation (of which there in fact appears to have been little (Taylor & Richards 1985)). It does, however, at least
offer a reasonably plausible account of how curriculum development may proceed. It usefully indicates that practical reasoning about resources and procedures is a more likely mode of operation than a linear progression through various design stages from the specification of objectives to the sequencing of learning experiences. A further merit is that it makes explicit the contributions of conceptions of education to the design process.

In language curriculum design there is also a need for descriptions of how syllabus design actually takes place. These would be a useful supplement to the prescriptive models referred to above.

4.2.5 Models of Curriculum Design: Conclusion

The preceding remarks do not constitute a review of issues in language curriculum design. The intent rather is to throw some critical light on relationships holding between language curriculum design and general models of curriculum design/development. It has been shown here that two broad approaches in general curriculum design, the 'objectives' and the 'process' approach, have their parallels in the language curriculum.

A further purpose has been to assist the planner understand and interpret particular curricula. Such understanding, as previously argued, requires insight into underlying theoretical and ideological influences. One of these is models of the curriculum design process itself.

4.3 Curriculum Evaluation

It is through evaluation that quality control is exercised over the curriculum. Evaluation is also a means to the identification of areas of weakness where reform/innovation may be needed. For these reasons it is of importance to the curriculum planner and it may, hence, be useful to review some basic concepts in the field.

4.3.1 Definitions of Educational Evaluation

Tyler (1949) saw educational evaluation as essentially a process of determining to what extent educational objectives were being met.

"The process of evaluation is essentially the process of determining to what extent the educational objectives are actually being realized by the program of curriculum and instruction." (1949:105)
Subsequent writers (eg. Cronbach 1963), perhaps aware of the narrow scope afforded evaluation in this definition, have preferred to view it as a process by which information is provided for decision-making. Three basic types of decision are said to be served: (i) course improvement, (ii) decisions about individuals (eg. diagnosis, placement, selection etc) and (iii) administrative regulation.

In contrast to Cronbach (1963), some evaluators have preferred to stress what they see as the intrinsically judgemental character of evaluation. Nevo (1983), for example, reports a growing consensus that evaluation should be defined as "...the systematic investigation of the worth or merit of some object" (1983). It seems that here the evaluator's role is stretched beyond that of information-gatherer to encompass in addition that of judge.

4.3.2 'Objects' and Functions of Evaluation

It is sometimes assumed that curriculum evaluation is synonymous with the assessment of individuals' learning attainment. In fact, though this may be one facet of evaluation, its scope is much wider.

In principle, it is possible for many different ‘educational objects’ (eg. materials, methods, teaching style) to become the subject of evaluation. Depending on the nature of the ‘object’, different evaluation methods will be called for, some quantitative and others ethnographic or observational.

In recent years greater attention has been given to the evaluation of the wider curricular experience, lessening the preoccupation with the ‘achieved curriculum’, learning outcomes. This, in turn, has meant that methods other than those appropriate to the measurement of individuals’ learning have come into favour. Before discussing these methods, one needs to refer to the functions of evaluation.

Following Scriven (1967), two common functions of evaluation can be identified: formative evaluation and summative evaluation. Formative evaluation is the process of gathering information (and forming judgements) about an ongoing programme with a view to providing feedback to planners, enabling them to make necessary modifications. Summative evaluation, on the other hand, refers to the appraisal of the completed programme, and is concerned to determine whether objectives have been met. As applied to the whole programme, it helps planners decide on renewal or disbandment; as applied to individuals, it may serve selection or certification purposes.
Summative evaluation is more likely to be undertaken by an external evaluator because its accountability function creates greater demand for objectivity and independence of judgement. Formative evaluation, on the other hand, may be conducted by persons within the curriculum development team because its function is to identify scope for improvement in an ongoing programme.

Further functions of evaluation have been noted by Nevo (1983). These are what he calls 'socio-political' and 'administrative' uses. In its 'socio-political' role evaluation may be used for public relations purposes, to secure assent to additional expenditure on particular programmes, or to motivate evaluatees to greater effort. In its 'administrative' function evaluation may be undertaken to exercise authority or to demonstrate power.

4.3.3 Processes and Methodologies in Curriculum Evaluation

Early approaches to evaluation (eg. Tyler 1949) focussed on curriculum outcomes, on what students had learnt. The task of the evaluator was, therefore, to (a) measure attainment (reliably and validly), (b) clarify the nature of curriculum objectives, (c) compare outcomes against objectives, and note the observed degree of fit. Goal-achievement became in effect the principal criterion of a curriculum's effectiveness.

To improve evaluation, energy was expended in two directions. First, through the work of Bloom et al (1956) taxonomies of educational objectives were developed to make the task of specifying objectives more precise, more scientific. Second, work proceeded on more effective (quantitative) measures of educational attainment.

4.3.3.1 Decision-making Models of Evaluation

Though influenced by the above-mentioned approach to evaluation, later evaluation specialists (eg. Cronbach, Stufflebeam) were aware of its limitations. A common criticism was that goal-achievement could not serve as a sufficient criterion of a curriculum's value since the goals themselves might be worthless.

Accordingly, the analysis of curriculum goals was brought within the purview of the evaluator. Stufflebeam (1971), for example, considered that an evaluation should make explicit the values underlying curriculum goals, thus allowing their critical scrutiny.

As regards the design itself, the evaluator could identify alternative
strategies/means for attaining curricular objectives. He might also seek to determine the extent to which the adopted strategy was in fact consistent with goals.

The scope of evaluation is, then, here extended beyond a concern with the fit of outcomes to objectives ('pay-off' evaluation) to other curriculum variables ('intrinsic' evaluation: Scriven 1967).

4.3.3.2 The 'Countenance' Model of Evaluation

The scope of evaluation variables, is, if anything, further extended in Stake's influential 'countenance' model. This exemplifies the wide range of data that may be incorporated in an evaluation.

Stake (1967) suggests that two types of data should be collected in respect of the evaluated 'object'; descriptive and judgemental. The descriptive data should be drawn from three bodies of information: (i) antecedents, (ii) transactions, and (iii) outcomes. Antecedents refer to conditions obtaining prior to the implementation of the curriculum through teaching/learning activities, transactions to encounters and events occurring during the curriculum's enactment, and outcomes to the effects of the curricular experience on participants. This data would further be classified along two dimensions, that of 'intents' and that of 'observations'. 'Intents' refers to what is hoped for, anticipated and even feared. It is, thus, broader in scope than intended learning outcomes. 'Observations', on the other hand, refers simply to what is actually observed. The resulting matrix of descriptive data is indicated in the diagram below:
Following collection of data for each matrix cell, the evaluator's task is to establish the degree of congruence between 'intents' and 'observations', which acts as a measure of the curriculum's success in meeting expectations.

A similar data matrix would also be employed for the collection of judgemental data in respect of antecedents, transactions, and outcomes. Judgemental statements, elicited from suitably qualified persons, would be classified, in Stake's words (1967:156):

"...either as general standards of quality or as judgements specific to the given programme."

For Stake (1967), then, evaluation is a multi-faceted enterprise encompassing judgement and descriptions, and taking account of antecedents and transactions in addition to outcomes. Given the range of data to be collected, it is evident that instruments other than tests may be required. These may include questionnaires, interviews, and structured observation schedules.

4.3.4 Paradigms of Educational Evaluation

'Rational' or 'scientific' approaches to evaluation with their focus on hard data (ie. facts and events) and with their concern to measure the products of the curricular experience have not met with universal approval. They have been criticised in particular for neglecting qualitative aspects of the curriculum, for ignoring the meanings of the curricular experience as perceived by various participants. In support of this viewpoint, Parlett & Hamilton (1977) distinguish
two paradigms of evaluation research; what they call 'an agricultural–botanical' paradigm and an 'anthropological' paradigm.

4.3.4.1 The 'Agricultural–Botanical' Paradigm

In this paradigm, according to Parlett & Hamilton (1977), the effectiveness of an educational programme is determined by 'examining whether or not it has reached required standards on pre-specified criteria'. In a typical evaluation procedure students are given pre-tests, submitted to different treatments, and their subsequent attainments measured to determine the efficacy of the different treatments.

The trouble with this, in Parlett & Hamilton's (1977) view, is that (a) it can lead to the neglect of certain kinds of data (impressionistic and subjective) that may offer insight into the transaction of the curriculum, (b) that it tends to be insensitive to unexpected or atypical results which are of great potential interest, (c) that it is not responsive to the varied concerns of clients and participants, and (d) that attempts to control variables in such a complex area as education are unrealistic, even distorting.

4.3.4.2 The 'Anthropological' Paradigm

Falling within the 'anthropological' paradigm is Parlett & Hamilton's (1977) alternative model of evaluation, which they term 'illuminative evaluation'. In this, the methods of the physical sciences are eschewed, and an anthropological rather than empiricist stance adopted.

The aim, in Parlett & Hamilton's (1977:10) words, is to:

"....discover and document what it is like to be participating in the scheme, whether as pupil or teacher; and in addition to discern and discuss the innovation's most significant features, recurring concomitants and critical processes."

Central, then, is a concern with the meanings attached to curriculum transactions by various participants, and with the operationalisation of the curriculum in the 'learning milieu'. In terms of methods, 'illuminative' evaluation aims to be 'adaptable' and 'eclectic'. However, being within the anthropological paradigm, particular emphasis is placed on structured and unstructured observation.

Other theorists have developed a variety of similar evaluation approaches.
Included among these are ‘holistic’ (Macdonald 1976) and ‘portrayal’ (Stake 1976) approaches as well as evaluation as a form of ‘connoisseurship’ (Eisner 1979). Though differing in their emphases and metaphors, these approaches share some basic characteristics.

Their primary focus is on the operational curriculum rather than on curriculum outcomes. They are concerned to cast light on the meanings attached to the curricular experience, to understand rather than measure. They aspire, like the critic, to offer an appreciative account of the quality of the whole curricular process, and are less concerned to estimate in quantitative fashion the amount of learning resulting from exposure to the curriculum.

In anticipation of criticism that this style of evaluation could be dangerously subjective, Parlett & Hamilton (1977) argue that (a) ‘illuminative’ evaluation remains subject to the discipline of evidence, and (b) that, in any case, ‘traditional’ evaluation is not free from subjectivity (eg. in the construction of tests, the mode of analysis of the results).

Taylor & Richards (1985) point out, however, that such approaches have not been fully worked out or explored in practice. They represent a largely ideological stance toward evaluation issues. One may add here that though they add an additional dimension to the evaluation enterprise, they do not supersede ‘traditional’ approaches which retain the merits of exactitude and objectivity, and indicate the final ‘pay-off’.

4.3.5 Political Dimensions of Curriculum Evaluation

Curriculum evaluation may serve a variety of audiences, each of whom has a legitimate interest in the curriculum and education, eg. administrators, politicians and government, parents and employers, educationists, teachers and researchers.

In view of this variety of audiences, each with different interests to control, or values to promote, evaluation has an inevitable political dimension. As Macdonald (1975:132) puts it, evaluators “...live in the real world of educational politics. Their work produces information which functions as a resource for the promotion of particular interests and values.”

The evaluator is committed to some political stance because, from a spectrum of interest groups with different values and information needs, he decides whose information needs have priority. The response of the evaluator on this issue defines, according to Macdonald (1976:133), several political styles that
an evaluation may assume. These are:

(i) Bureaucratic evaluation: ("unconditional service to government agencies").
(ii) Autocratic evaluation: ("a conditional service to government agencies").
(iii) Democratic evaluation: ("an information service to the whole community").

Macdonald’s (1976) typology need not be discussed further. Its significance in the present context is that it draws attention to the political dimensions of evaluation. An appreciation of this dimension might be helpful in evaluations of language curricula since in multilingual states language education issues tend to be politically sensitive.

4.4 Conclusion

In this chapter attention has been paid to three aspects of the curriculum: underlying conceptions of education, models of curriculum design, and curriculum evaluation. The relevance of the first two of these to language education has been made explicit. The relevance of the third has been left implicit. However, the principles of curriculum evaluation apply to language education as much as any area of the curriculum.

The argument for this content has been that in order to understand (and interpret) a given curriculum, as a preliminary to its reform, the planner requires an appreciation of the value systems underlying the curriculum and the design models that may have influenced its construction. In order to assess the limitations and merits of that curriculum, he also requires some appreciation of evaluation principles, and possible approaches. In order to renew the curriculum he also needs an awareness of design options.

In summary, the kinds of information that may be helpful in the interpretation of a given curriculum are briefly enumerated.

A. Conceptions of Education
1. Information on educational aims and objectives.
2. Information on/interpretations of:
   (i) prevailing conceptions of knowledge.
   (ii) the type of ‘educational knowledge code’ in use. (eg. ‘collection’ verses ‘integrated’).
   (iii) attitudes to different ‘forms’ of knowledge.
3. Information on prevailing attitudes towards:
the status of childhood

discipline and children

intellectual development in children

4. Information on commonly-held views of teaching.

B. Models of Curriculum Design

1. Information on the models/theories of design that underly or inform the language education curriculum/syllabuses.

Since many of the above conceptions are typically implicit rather than explicitly documented, one may wonder how such information can be collected. The answer is that, where they are implicit one can only make inferences from a study of curriculum documents or, better still, from observation of teaching practices.

In conclusion, it may be helpful to refer to a version of Taylor and Richards' (1985:192) diagram/model of the curriculum. This will indicate the curricular influences already discussed and those yet to be covered.
As may be evident, the concern of this chapter has primarily been the influences on the intended curriculum; underlying value systems and models of the design process. In the next chapter attention is turned to the situational factors that affect the 'operational curriculum', or render problematic the realisation of the 'intended curriculum'.
CHAPTER 5
SITUATIONAL ANALYSIS IN LANGUAGE CURRICULUM PLANNING

The main purpose of this chapter is to identify and articulate some of the contextual factors which affect the implementation/operationalisation of the curriculum, and which accordingly need to be taken into account by language planners/curriculum developers.

Apart from its intrinsic theoretical interest, the identification of relevant contextual factors is also intended to provide a systematic basis for subsequent information-gathering. It is believed that this information can facilitate more sensitive planning and decision-taking.

The notion of situational analysis is not, of course, an unfamiliar one in Applied Linguistics. Munby (1978), Mackey (1977), Maley (1984), Yalden (1987), Chambers (1980), Dubin & Olshtain (1986) and many others have argued the need for, and applied, needs/constraints/situational analyses in the construction of language curricula. The underlying axiomatic justification is essentially the same: there is no one ideal curricular approach to language teaching/learning which can be universally or timelessly applied. Therefore, it is necessary to adopt an approach which is sensitive to the cultural/educational context and to relevant characteristics of teachers and learners.

The present analysis does not depart from this assumption nor from the general tradition. What is different, however, is the range of factors identified, the rationale for their identification and the way in which they are articulated.

For the majority of the following contextual factors there is either a theoretical or common sense basis for identification. The factors are in a sense hypotheses which require further empirical testing. There is, however, a class of factors whose identification is grounded in empirical studies, and it is with these that the discussion begins.

5.1 Factors affecting Educational Achievement: An Overview of Input–Output Studies

We begin, as indicated, with an overview of studies of factors believed to affect educational achievement on the presumption that this is of interest to the curriculum planner. These studies analyse the relationship between the inputs
and the outputs of education, a relationship sometimes referred to as the 'education production function' (Psacharopoulos & Woodhall 1985:215).

A 'production function' is of the form $A = f(a,b,c,d,...,z)$ where $A$=achievement (output) and $a,b,c,d,...,z$ the variables determining level of achievement (ie. output). Output here refers not to the number of school graduates produced but to educational achievement; ie. the knowledge and skills learned in school as measured by such proxies as examination scores, or scores on cognitive/non-cognitive tests.

A number of input-output studies have been conducted under World Bank auspices in order to guide policy decisions on investment or lending. Through them, it is hoped to identify the most cost-effective ways of raising the quality of educational output, or of maintaining the same (level) quality of output at least cost in resources.

The scope for improving output (sometimes defined as the 'internal efficiency of education') depends, however, on the extent to which school variables actually determine output (achievement). This is because non-school variables are less easily modified by policy action. A crucial initial question, then, concerns the relative influence of school and non-school variables on educational achievement.

5.1.1 Educational Achievement: The Influence of School and Non-School Variables

Though the 'production function' for education is imperfectly understood, it is clear that many variables other than school variables determine educational achievement (eg. family background, socio-economic background, individual intelligence and personality). What is of interest to the planner is how much of the variance in output (achievement) may be attributed to these non-school variables.

Psacharopoulos & Woodhall (1985:215) report that early input-output studies conducted in the United States pessimistically concluded that school variables (eg. teacher qualifications, expenditure on books) had little effect on educational outcome in comparison with socio-economic and family background factors. Indeed, Jencks (1972:256) went as far as to conclude that:

"....the characteristics of a school's output depend very largely on a single input, namely the characteristics of the entering children. Everything else, the school budget, its policies, the characteristics of the teachers is either secondary or completely irrelevant."
Similar negative conclusions are also reported in Alexander & Simmons' (1975) review of input-output relationships in nine developing countries. They found that relative to such influences as home background and individual personality, school variables had only a weak effect on achievement. The only school variable found to contribute to variations in output was teacher motivation, not teacher experience or qualification.

Later studies did, however, modify the pessimism of these findings. Schiefelbein & Simmons (1978), for example, found an inverse relationship between GNP per capita (as a measure of economic development) and the influence of school variables on achievement. In a sample of 29 countries, it was shown that the less developed the society, the greater the proportion of explained academic achievement variance that was attributable to school quality variables. Thus, whereas in Sweden, Australia and New Zealand, only 20–30% of such variance could be attributed to school quality, the corresponding figure for such countries as India, Colombia and Thailand was 80–90%.

The general conclusion, then, is that school quality variables do make a difference, at least in developing countries. This is corroborated by evaluation studies of World Bank projects (Heyneman & Loxely 1983), as well as by IEA comparative studies of achievement in mathematics (Husen 1967), science (Comber & Keeves 1973) and reading comprehension (Thorndike 1973).

Psacharopoulos & Woodhall (1985:219) point out that as a result the issues addressed in World Bank research have changed. The question is no longer whether investment in school inputs improves output but what are the most cost-effective ways of increasing output through changing school inputs. In other words, are levels of achievement more effectively raised, say, by more textbooks and materials, or by improvements in teacher-training?

5.1.2 Educational Achievement: The Influence of School Variables

Teacher-training, teacher motivation, class size, textbook availability and expenditure on teachers' salaries are among the variables investigated for their effect on achievement. Let us begin with teachers.

5.1.2.1 The Effect of Teacher-Training and Other Teacher Effects

The emphasis on teacher-training facilities in World Bank lending policy during the 1950s and 1960s was guided by the assumption that investment in teacher-training leads to improvements in pupil achievements. Some studies did,
however, call the assumption into question. For example, a Latin-American Study (World Bank 1974) purported to show that achievement levels of students taught by teachers trained in ‘normal schools’ were little different from those taught by university graduates.

In response to this increased scepticism, the World Bank commissioned a review of research on the relationship between teacher quality (experience and qualifications) and training, and pupil achievement (Husen, Saha & Noonan 1978). This found that trained and qualified teachers did indeed make a positive difference. Corroboration was supplied by the IEA study of pupil achievement in science in 19 countries (Comber & Keeves 1973). This suggested that increased investment in teacher-training programmes would improve secondary school students’ test scores.

Whilst a useful confirmation of common sense, received assumptions, this finding does, as Psacharopoulos & Woodhall (1985:220) observe, have unclear policy implications. A number of crucial and specific questions remain unanswered.

First, there is the matter of the most efficient way of upgrading teacher quality. Is this best achieved through (i) better pre-service training, (ii) in-service training for poorly qualified teachers, or (iii) in-service training for all teachers at a particular level? Clearly, research is needed into alternative ways of upgrading teacher quality.

Second, there is the question of whether teacher-training has differential effects on achievement at different education levels and in different subjects. For instance, is the effect of increased teacher-training (qualification) more marked at the higher grades of secondary school than it is in the primary grades, and is it more significant in mathematics than foreign languages?

Husen, Saha & Noonan (1978:47) call for more research on these issues to find out in what contexts and under what conditions trained teachers make the most difference.

5.1.2.2 The Influence of Textbooks, Class Size and Other School Variables

Research has indicated no clearcut association between class size (or teacher:pupil ratio) and achievement (Haddad 1978). There is, however, evidence of a positive relationship between the provision of textbooks and pupil achievement levels. A review of studies conducted in ten developing countries
(Heyneman, Farrell & Sepulveda-Stuardo 1981) concluded that not only was the relationship positive but that it was more consistent than with other variables such as class size, teacher-training, teacher salaries and boarding facilities.

Confirmation has come from other country-specific studies. For instance, in 1977–78 a textbook project (assisted by the World Bank) was initiated in the Philippines with the aim of raising the textbook:pupil ratio from 1:10 to 1:2. Teachers were also trained in the use of the textbooks. The effect of additional textbooks (specifically mathematics, science and language textbooks) was then evaluated by means of pre- and post-attainment tests. These showed substantial gains in test scores in many different parts of the country. However, there were no further improvements in test scores when a 1:1 textbook:pupil ratio was implemented (Heyneman, Jamison & Montenegro 1984).

Interesting though these findings are, there remain a number of unanswered questions concerning, in particular, the interaction of textbooks with other variables. For example, are textbooks more important in some subjects than others and with certain types of pupil or teacher (eg. the inexperienced teacher)? Are they most beneficial in large classes?

Some light is shed on these questions by the Philippines study and a survey in Chile (Schiefelbein, Farrell & Sepulveda-Stuardo 1983). The Philippines study, indicated that gains in academic achievement (resulting from greater textbook availability) were particularly marked among disadvantaged pupils. The Chilean survey found, perhaps surprisingly, that experienced teachers made greater use of textbooks than the inexperienced. There were also differences between subject areas with English teachers, predictably, making more use of textbooks than science and maths teachers.

The general picture emerging is that investment in textbooks is likely to produce gains in pupil achievement. Moreover, it is suggested that a more consistent relationship holds between textbook availability and achievement than between class size or expenditure on teachers’ salaries (Heyneman, Farrell & Sepulveda-Stuardo 1981) and achievement. The cost-effectiveness of investment in textbooks relative to investment in other inputs is, thus, suggested.

That there is scope for increased investment in textbooks is evident from figures cited by Psacharopoulos & Woodhall (1985:224). These show that only a small proportion of school expenditure in developing countries is allocated to teaching resources. Whereas in the developed, industrial countries 14% of
primary school recurrent costs are allocated to books (and other classroom resources) and 86% to teachers' salaries. In Africa and Asia the average figures are 9% and 91%, and 4% and 96% respectively.

The need (perhaps scope) for greater investment in textbooks, indicated in these figures, has been recognised in World Bank lending policy. Since 1976, several projects have included specific support for classroom materials. Heyneman et al (1984) argue, however, that more investment of this kind is needed. They suggest at least 10% of public recurrent educational expenditure should be allocated to classroom materials.

5.1.3 Input–Output Studies: Implications for the Present Study

In applying the results of input–output studies to policy-making, caution is needed. There are, after all, considerable methodological difficulties involved: eg. in identifying the right independent variables, in defining variables (eg. teacher motivation), in measuring independent variables, in isolating the effect of one variable from another, in devising appropriate and valid dependent variable measures.

Nevertheless, the studies above provide some evidence that textbooks and teacher quality (in terms of training, experience and motivation) make more of a difference to levels of pupil achievement than many other school variables.

In general, the empirical identification of school variables affecting achievement is of value to the curriculum planner because it is precisely through the manipulation of these variables that output may be maximised in the most cost–effective ways. Thus, although factors affecting achievement are only a part of the range that the planner needs to consider in deciding on the most appropriate form of curriculum change, they are an important sub-set.

5.2 Professional/Teacher Factors in Language Curriculum Planning

The characteristics of the teaching force are one of the most important influences in curriculum renewal. Indeed, since teachers are the ultimate implementors of change, their attitudes, morale, motivation and competence are fundamental planning considerations. These characteristics and their relevance to curriculum development are, accordingly, discussed in the following sections.
5.2.1 Teacher Language Proficiency and Competence

A crucial factor in language education is the language proficiency of teachers. Clearly, where this is low, there is every likelihood that learning will be impeded for a variety of possible reasons: eg. lack of an adequate model resulting in impoverishment of ‘input’ for students; an inability to use the target language to “...generate the kind of classroom interaction in which learning can flourish.” (Ellis 1985:173).

Low proficiency levels will also preclude curricular changes involving more fluency/discussion-based activity because these tend to impose greater language demands on the teacher than more traditional activities.

Also important is the level of pedagogical competence of the teaching force. Lack of understanding of procedures and principles in second/foreign language teaching is clearly likely to impair the effectiveness of the language education programme.

In some developing countries low levels of language proficiency and pedagogical competence are particularly acute problems at primary level. Various solutions have been suggested, some of which are listed below:

1. An extensive programme of in-service education and teacher upgrading. Unfortunately, this ideal solution is often precluded by a scarcity of resources.
2. The postponement of foreign/second language instruction to a later educational stage. This has the merit of husbanding and concentrating scarce teaching resources. However, it may be opposed by parents (and the public) who feel that any delay in the introduction of foreign language instruction may vitiate the changes of their child succeeding at secondary level where a foreign language medium may be used (see Section 3.2.3.3).
3. The preparation of a ‘teacher-proof’ curriculum. This is a package of language teaching materials so designed as to minimise the contribution required from the teacher. He/she simply follows a sequence of explicitly detailed procedures.

Though a potentially useful short-term expedient for dealing with acute problems, this solution is, in principle, a curious one to adopt in respect of one of the most expensive resources in language education. It is, in any case,
doubtful whether the involvement of the teacher can be effaced for long, for as Hoyle (1971:390) points out, "...solutions to educational problems cannot be fully standardized and require the flexibility, adaptability and insight of the professional."

There is little dispute, then, that teachers' language proficiency and pedagogical competence are important factors in language education. The real problem arises with their measurement and assessment. Since there are logistical and technical difficulties in measuring these attributes across an entire teaching force, it may be necessary to rely on the following proxy measures:

1. the number of years schooling teachers at various levels have completed.
2. the educational, professional and language qualifications held by teachers – as well as those required for teaching at different levels.
3. the number of years experience teachers have had in schools, and in language teaching in particular.
4. the age structure of the teaching force. (Apart from being an approximate indicator of teaching experience, this may offer some clues as to language proficiency. In some countries where there has been a change from world to national language medium, it is sometimes the older teacher who has the higher proficiency in the world language. Alternatively, if training standards have improved, it may be that the older the teacher, the less well-acquainted he/she is with recent language teaching approaches).

5.2.2 Teacher Education

Teacher-training is an important influence on teacher effectiveness and competence. The planner will, therefore, need to enquire into the provisions made for teacher-training both in terms of quantity (duration of courses) and quality. One relevant indicator of quality is the qualifications and experience of teacher-trainers. Perhaps more important, however, is the teacher-training curriculum. Details which need investigation include:

1. the amount of course time allocated to practical studies in methodology/classroom practice, compared with time for academic study.
2. the provisions made for teaching practice (duration and supervision).
3. the presence/absence of a language improvement component in the course.
4. the methodology employed in training sessions.

The last item is important, for it has been argued that trainees should experience the kinds of instruction they themselves are supposed to implement in their own
teaching practice. Teacher educators should, in other words, model as far as possible the methodology they preach. Ellis' (1985:185) comments on the training experience of students at the University of Zululand (S. Africa) bears out this point. He remarks that observation revealed "a predominance of lecturing with little opportunity during class time for any exploratory learning." He concludes that:

"...it was apparent that the methodology of the university instruction these students experienced was the mirror image of the kind of instruction that graduate teachers were providing in secondary schools. Teachers were teaching as they were taught at University (and probably as they had been taught at schools themselves)."

The picture of a language classroom in which lecturing predominates is not unfamiliar (see Criper & Dodd 1984:88). No doubt there are many reasons for this pattern of classroom communication, eg. scarce teaching resources, large classes. A significant factor, however, is the experience many teachers have of how they were once taught. If the cycle is to be broken, trainee teachers should be exposed to alternative methodological practices and procedures.

Teacher education curricula have also been criticised, in some countries at least, for giving too little attention to practical studies in methodology and too much to academic studies (Thompson 1983; Harrison, Prator, Tucker 1975 on Jordan).

One possible reason for this excessive focus on academic studies is the inadequate standard of general education trainees bring to the training college; a deficiency which requires considerable expenditure of time on remedial programmes (Thompson 1981). There is also, however, a tendency to accord greater prestige to theoretical/academic educational issues than to practical methodology training. The latter, accordingly, receives less emphasis.

5.2.2.1 In-Service Education

Several writers have commented on the importance of in-service education to the implementation of curricular innovation. Kelly (1982:43), for example, notes that the more successful projects have been those which have included in-service training, enabling teachers to acquire a familiarity with the project's ideas and a facility in the handling of the project materials.

In view of its key role in curriculum innovation, it is advisable that the planner
ascertain what facilities and provisions exist for in-service education. At the same time, however, he should be aware of some of the problems that may arise in the operation of such courses.

If, for example, courses are linked to improved certification (as sometimes happens), then teachers may become eligible for higher salaries with the result that unit costs rise. Alternatively, the improvement in qualification may enable teachers to leave for better jobs outside the education system (Bray, Clarke, Stephens 1986:173).

Another issue (more fully addressed in Chapter 6) is the precise form in-service training should take. It may suffice to note here that the conventional practice of withdrawing individual teachers from school to attend in-service training workshops/courses is not necessarily the best. Hoyle (1971) points out that on return to school the teacher bearing new ideas may be met by the scepticism or indifference of colleagues. Following Miles (1965), he suggests that it is the department or group that is the key unit of change, and that it is, therefore, preferable to involve the whole department "...by having them meet away from the normal work setting with its pressures, vested interests and specific power relationships." (Hoyle 1971:393).

5.2.3 Teacher Morale and Motivation

As Hawes (1979:17) points out, it can be unwise and misleading to base comparisons of the teacher force in different countries on statistics of teacher education and training. Such statistics say something about the potential of individual teachers but they reveal little about their actual value in the classroom. A well-qualified but drunken, disillusioned teacher, will, as Hawes says, be:

"...of considerably less value to the children under his care than a man or woman with humbler qualifications but greater maturity, integrity and interest in children." (1979:17)

The importance of teacher morale and motivation as a determinant of the quality of the 'operational' curriculum is also attested to in research into the determinants of school achievement (Alexander & Simmons 1975).

It is also a highly important factor in curriculum innovation. Experience of curricular reform in the UK and elsewhere has shown that curriculum renewal is difficult where teacher morale is low (Kelly 1982). Given the extra effort and energy that innovation requires, this is hardly surprising, however.
In an investigation of the state of teacher morale, the planner may wish to consider the possible sources of low morale. He might then be placed to decide if it lies in his power to create conditions leading to its improvement.

A useful starting point might be an analysis of the routes by which individuals enter the teaching profession, the criteria for selecting training college entrants, and the proportion of mature age trainees. These are significant because motivation is in part dependent on the level of commitment the teacher brings to the job.

An unfortunate aspect of teacher education in some developing countries is that many individuals enter teacher-training not through a desire to teach but because they have failed to gain admission to some higher level of education (Bray et al 1986; Thompson 1981). In the meantime, teacher-training offers the opportunity of a further education essential for entry to white collar employment. Clearly, the presence of teachers without any vocational commitment impedes the development of a more professional teacher force.

Such a situation is more likely to arise in an era of educational expansion when increasing the supply of teachers takes precedence over the raising of teacher quality through greater selectivity in recruitment.

An advantage of a higher proportion of mature age entrants to teaching is that such individuals are at least likely to have a positive desire to teach. Also, because of their wider experience, this kind of teacher does not belong to the school-college-school cycle that can in some cases lead to the perpetuation of outmoded or inefficient practices.

Apart from personal commitment to teaching, morale may also be affected by the following factors:

1. **Salary Levels**
   Salaries that are low absolutely, or low in relation to comparable professions, are likely to depress morale, and have a detrimental effect on recruitment and the attrition rate among teachers. Curriculum planners traditionally, however, have little or no control over salaries. In any case, because teachers' salaries in many developing countries typically account for a high proportion of educational expenditure, there is limited scope for any increase.

2. **The Career Structure of the Profession**
   Where there are few opportunities for teachers to upgrade their
qualifications and limited in-service training facilities, the teacher may lose interest in acquiring a greater degree of professionalism. Also, in many countries teacher grades, carrying different salary scales, are based on initial qualifications and length of service (Thompson 1981). There are few or no mechanisms for identifying effective teachers and rewarding them for the quality of their classroom work. Consequently, the able, committed teacher may be trapped on the same scale as the idle one, or the one who is more intent on studying for higher academic qualifications in order to escape from his job. Even where effective classroom teaching is recognised (it is difficult to establish criteria for this), it is often rewarded by promotion outside the classroom. Apart from removing effective teachers from the classroom, this implicitly devalues the status and work of those who remain there. Unfortunately, curriculum planners again have little control over the career structure of teaching. Nonetheless, since current structures are often ill-suited to promoting the quality of classroom teaching and have an inhibitory effect on morale, it is an issue worth raising.

3. Working Conditions

Poor working/recreational facilities and professional or social isolation may depress morale. This can be significant in some developing countries where posting to a remote rural area may be an unattractive prospect. The relative unattractiveness of service in rural areas may also act to keep the quality of schooling in rural areas below that in urban areas which tend to attract and retain better quality staff (Bray et al 1986:62). Again, however, the curriculum planner has limited scope for action in this area.

In summary, morale and motivation are important forces. It is necessary, therefore, that the planner acquaint himself with prevailing levels of morale and motivation. The latter attribute is individual rather than social in nature, however. Because of individual variation, it may, thus, be difficult to estimate with reliability across an entire teaching force.

5.2.4 Advisory and Teacher Support Services

Used effectively, advisory/support services can do much to maintain teacher morale. They also have an important function in the implementation of curriculum change by virtue of their potential to deliver help or advice to teachers during the critical early stages of implementation.
The importance of external support for change efforts is highlighted in Wastnedge's comments on the failure of Nuffield Junior Science to achieve long-term institutionalisation in UK schools (Wastnedge in Hoyle 1972). He notes that the project was received with initial enthusiasm but that the impetus was not maintained following withdrawal of project support. As a result the innovation withered. The lesson drawn is that there remains a need for external assistance in the period following initial implementation.

Deficiencies in communication are also cited as a source of failure. Wastnedge claims, in particular, that there was an over-reliance on written communication at the expense of personal contact and the demonstration of project materials - the problem with written communications (guides, handbooks, notes) being that they too easily remain unread or are simply misunderstood.

Referring to Africa, Hawes (1979:121) identifies four approaches which have been developed in different countries to deliver help and assistance to the teacher in school. These are (i) increased investment in supervision through inspectors, curriculum advisors, and mobile teacher-trainers (ii) the encouragement of teachers' groups (iii) the development of teachers' centres and (iv) strengthening the professional role of the headmaster and senior staff. It may be worth commenting on these briefly.

5.2.4.1 Increased Supervision (1) - Innovative Developments

The inspectorate has traditionally been the principal instrument for providing assistance to teachers in schools and for supervising curriculum implementation. There are instances, however, where its work has been hampered by (a) an insufficiency of properly qualified, trained staff and (b) a shortage of funds and transport to enable inspectors to actually visit schools, particularly those in remoter, outlying districts (eg. in Zambia).

It is interesting, therefore, to note, that in some developing countries new types of supervisors or 'curriculum implementors' have emerged alongside the inspectorate. Hawes (1979:127) cites the examples of mobile teacher trainers (MTTs) in northern Nigeria.

These individuals tour schools to introduce new materials, train teachers and provide feedback on their implementation efforts. Their success is attributed to the quality of the trainers, the scale of staffing and the limited number (6) of schools that each MTT has to work with. Also, because they are not inspectors,
they are better able to gain the confidence of teachers.

5.2.4.2 Teachers’ Associations and Teachers’ Centres (2 and 3)

Teachers’ subject associations often play a valuable role in the implementation of curriculum change. They provide a forum for the exchange of ideas and experiences – a process which, as Fullan (1982) observes, encourages a sense of professionalism, and strengthens morale. Another useful aspect of their work is their involvement in the writing or modification of new materials.

Less common in the African context, but not in the UK, is the idea of the teachers’ centre. Hawes (1979:129) argues that such centres have a rich potential as a local professional base and as an instrument for curriculum development/implementation. He cites the Siriba and Machakos teachers’ centres in Kenya as particularly successful examples in the range of services they provide: a library service, a workshop for production of teaching aids, the production of pamphlets, the running of courses/workshops, the provision of advice. The most successful centres are apparently those based on training colleges.

5.2.4.3 The Professional Role of Headteachers/Senior Staff

Perhaps the most valuable potential source of help for teachers lies in the schools themselves, in the headteacher and senior staff. However, if headteachers are to play such a role, this implies training in professional as well as administrative leadership (Hawes 1979:131). It also means that schools should be so staffed that experienced teachers can be released from classroom duties to help their junior colleagues – a major constraint where teachers are in scarce supply.

It has been argued against this idea that the extra time and responsibility might be misused. Perhaps, however, this is unduly pessimistic. If teachers are not given the opportunity to act professionally, it is difficult to see how a greater degree of teacher professionalism can evolve.

In view of the crucial role of advisory/support services in curriculum development and implementation, it is important that the planner ascertain what services are available. Thus, information is needed on the following:

1. Professional associations of language teachers
2. Subject Conferences
3. Teachers’ Centres
4. Opportunities available for informal contacts between teachers.
5. The frequency, scale and nature of communication between schools, inspectors, advisors or other ‘curriculum implementors’.

Where such instruments of communication or support are absent, or lacking in vitality, curriculum change is likely to be more difficult to implement.

5.3 Resource Factors in Language Curriculum Planning: The Material Context

Educational thinking in the West currently places stress on the benefits accruing to enquiry-based methods of learning. These, it is argued, lead to a deeper understanding of the concepts under study and promote greater powers of thought and initiative.

It is doubtful, however, whether such methods are feasible where essential resources (books, paper, materials) are lacking, and where critical enquiry is not culturally valued. The material (and cultural) context has, then, a potentially significant influence on curriculum plans or possibilities.

Three aspects of the material context of teaching/learning can be identified:
(i) the physical/social environment of the school
(ii) school buildings and furniture
(iii) teaching/learning equipment/materials

Their relevance to the curriculum is briefly discussed below.

5.3.1 The Environment of the School

There is obvious geographical (physical) variation in the settings in which schools are located. There is also variation in the social environment of schools. These differences mean that pupils have different learning opportunities.

For example, children in an urban area/school typically have greater exposure to a second/foreign language. This is partly an effect of advertising, the media and associated phenomena of ‘modernity’ and partly because the greater linguistic heterogeneity of urban areas leads to greater exposure to a second language ‘lingua franca’. Because of this, it is likely that urban children will be
advantaged in learning the second language compared to their rural counterparts.

Rural pupils are sometimes also disadvantaged by the urban frames of reference employed in syllabus designs. For example, they may encounter study activities organised unfamiliar topics belonging to a more prosperous, urbanised world, eg. the railway station, the airport, the game park. (Kenya: 'New Primary Approach for African Schools').

However, biases of this kind are, as Hawes (1979:20) remarks, difficult to overcome. It would be absurd to base a national curriculum on 'the lowest common denominator' of the poorest, most isolated rural school. Nevertheless, if poor rural schools are in the majority, curriculum content and objectives need to be framed with them in mind.

5.3.2 School Buildings and Furnishing

There is often considerable variation both between countries and within a single country with regard to school buildings and furniture. Conditions can range from adequate to the most basic; that is, classrooms without windows or doors, classrooms that let in the rain, classrooms without furniture where pupils sit on the floor, schools with no storage rooms for equipment.

As an example of these extreme sort of conditions, Hawes (1979:20) cites some 1975 statistics from Lesotho. These show that 40.9% of all primary pupils were seated on the floor with a further 25.9% seated on benches.

It is obvious that facilities of this degree of inadequacy, or slightly better, impose restrictions on what can be done in the language classroom. It is difficult to imagine, for instance, how group-work activities could be undertaken. The curriculum planner should, therefore, take note of physical conditions in schools (eg. the state of classrooms, storage rooms, furniture, electricity supply, etc) and adjust his plans accordingly.

5.3.3 Teaching Materials and Equipment

The third aspect of the material context is teaching/learning materials and equipment (eg. textbooks, paper, pens, posters, duplicating facilities, tape-recorders, extension leads etc). Again, there is often considerable variation between schools in this respect. Variability in resource availability may be attributed to the following factors:

1. The nature and efficiency of the supply/distribution system. (The centralised
and highly bureaucratic distribution systems common in Africa are often inefficient in reaching outlying schools).

2. The voluntary contributions of materials to schools by parents and local communities. (Wealthier communities are clearly better placed to purchase/donate educational materials for/to schools).

3. The initiative of teachers in seeking out new sources of material.

4. Differential loss or wastage of school equipment.

In some schools the officially determined life expectancy of books and other equipment is unrealistic in view of the demands placed on them. It is also true, unfortunately, that in some schools materials are inadequately maintained or cared for - though a shortage of secure storage space does not help.

For these reasons it is difficult to make accurate generalisations about resource levels in schools. Nevertheless, it is important that the planner try to keep in mind the typical or average school because the scale of resources available has clear implications for curriculum development and implementation.

At a simple, practical level, for example, it would be futile to include tape-recorded listening activities in the syllabus if there were no such machines available or, more probably, none of the accessories to run them (eg. batteries, leads, electricity). Equally, there is little point in syllabus prescriptions of a given quantity of reading if there are only three books or readers for a class of forty.

The right kind and quantity of resources is also vital in the implementation of curricular reforms. Many programmes of curriculum innovation require the input of additional resources, and these need to be so organised as to be readily accessible. Macdonald & Rudduck (1971) point out that in the general stress of innovation teachers’ morale can easily be eroded by peripheral anxieties over the availability and location of particular resource items. Thus, such things can have disproportionate and adverse effects on implementation efforts.

The importance of materials and equipment is further illustrated in a study of the constraints on the achievement of curricular aims in the primary school (Taylor et al 1974). This found that teachers identified limitations in equipment/facilities as one of the principal constraining factors.

Finally, as shown in Section 5.1.2.2, there is evidence of a positive relationship between textbook availability (per pupil) and levels of achievement.
Attention, then, to the scale of teaching resources available in schools, particularly textbooks, is likely to have beneficial effects on curriculum development and implementation.

5.4 Organisational Factors in Language Curriculum Planning

In the following sections a number of organisational/administrative factors relevant to language curriculum planning will be discussed. These are:

1. Time allocation to language teaching.
2. Class size and composition.
3. Links between sub-systems of education.

5.4.1 Time Allocations to Language Teaching

The length of the school year, the number of weeks in the term, the number of study hours each day, and the amount of time allocated to language teaching as against other subjects are fundamental considerations in curriculum/syllabus planning. It seems obvious that not as much can be taught (or learnt) in four hours as five, yet it is surprising how often the basic constraints of time are overlooked.

As Hawes (1975:95) observes, syllabuses in the upper classes of the African primary school, and indeed in secondary school, are frequently overloaded and overambitious. Sometimes syllabus planners are guided more by notions of what content cannot be sacrificed, or by what is contained in the 'textbook', than they are by what can be taught, or effectively absorbed, in the time available.

Similarly, when syllabus innovations are introduced, further content (eg. pronunciation teaching) is often added without any corresponding increase in available teaching time, or without any corresponding subtraction of other content. Reductions in time allocations are rarely matched by sacrifices of content. The result, often, is an overcrowded syllabus, a teacher under time pressure, and incomplete/ineffective mastery of skills or concepts.

The problem may be compounded by mismatches between official time allocations and the time actually available for teaching.

In many developing countries (in Africa and elsewhere) unanticipated interruptions to the school programme are common. For example, pupils arrive after the official beginning of term; there are absences of teachers (to collect
salaries, to look after sick children); there are days off for festivals, parades, political meetings, agricultural shows.

These erosions of 'official time' (with their detrimental effect on the pacing of learning) become more serious still in situations where the syllabus (and materials) is tied to a system of class by class progression from textbook 1 to textbook 4, and where teachers are obliged to 'cover' the assigned textbook for the year in the time officially assumed to be available.

In response to such problems Hawes (1979:111) suggests 'a shorter and more manageable' syllabus core with optional elements added.

Apart from investigating the amount of time pupils actually spend in language classes, and tailoring the syllabus plan accordingly, the planner needs to consider how the allocated time is timetabled. For example, are language classes customarily given double or single timetable sessions? Is this dependent on the policy of the headteacher? The relevance of this is that some classroom activities (eg. roleplays) can be more effectively staged in a double lesson.

5.4.1.1 Time as a Resource in Curriculum Innovation

The resource of time is important in curriculum innovation allowing teachers the opportunity to become familiar with, and perhaps adapt, new materials, to discuss problems with colleagues, and to attend training workshops. Denied a sufficiency of time, the strain of innovation on teachers can be great especially when much of their time tends to be absorbed in the maintenance of the existing system.

In his review of the Schools Council Integrated Studies Project (UK), Shipman (in Hoyle 1972) points out that the project's success was related to the level of investment made by the school - the most successfully innovative schools being those in which teachers made heavy investments of time and energy. These schools also tended to attract a higher level of external support. Commenting on the load borne by project teachers, Shipman remarks illuminatively:

"...Planning meant meetings not only in the morning, lunch and afternoon breaks, but also in the evenings, after school and in the holidays. It was always a combination of extra effort with extra exposure, for being in the trial meant being on trial." (Hoyle 1972:61)

Enthusiastic, committed teachers may be willing to create additional time
resources out of their leisure periods. It should not be assumed, however, that all participants in innovation will be willing to do so—especially when the innovation in question emanates from an agency external to the school.

To alleviate the strain of innovation it may be necessary, therefore, to free teachers from classroom duties. But, if teachers are to be so released, substitutes will need to be employed and paid—a fact which bears out Hoyle's (1972) point that the resource of time is ultimately a function of financial resources.

5.4.2 Class Size and Composition

In this section we take the class as a unit of analysis. First, the issue of class size.

5.4.2.1 Class Size

Research has produced no evidence for a straightforward relationship between class size and pupil achievement (Haddad 1978: see Section 5.1.2.2). Presumably, though, there is a threshold level above which marginal increases in size make no difference and below which they do, (i.e. class size is a non-continuous variable).

It is evident, nonetheless, that class size is an important determinant of what is, or is not, possible in the language classroom. Typically, the larger the class, the greater the constraints.

For example, it is far more difficult for the teacher to provide adequate feedback in a class of fifty than in one of twenty-five. A large class may discourage any experimentation with group or pair work. It is also possible that very large classes are more disadvantageous in language subjects where the objective is the acquisition and practice of a skill than they are in content-subjects where one of the goals is the transmission of information.

Because of its implications for classroom management, class size is, then, a variable of interest to the curriculum planner. It is, however, not usually under his control. Administrative/organisational arrangements at school level have a limited role in the matter. The principal determining factor of class size is, of course, the ratio of teachers to enrolments, and at school level the number of subject teachers in relation to pupils taking those subjects.
5.4.2.2 Class Composition

Under the term 'class composition', reference is made to the homogeneity, or otherwise, of classes in terms of (i) ability, (ii) age and sex, (iii) language background. Heterogeneity in any of these dimensions tends to complicate teaching.

Whether or not a class is heterogeneous in ability makes a difference in teaching terms. In general, the management of mixed ability classes requires a higher degree of teaching skill. The material has to be paced appropriately. The motivation of the weaker and stronger members has to be maintained. The selection/introduction of appropriate learning materials (eg. class readers) becomes more problematic.

Also important is composition in terms of age (and sex). Owing to undeclaration of ages (to be suitable for secondary school entry), repetition of grades (especially the last primary grade) and other factors, it is common in Africa to find classes at both primary and secondary level containing pupils of widely varying ages. This contributes, presumably, to differences in motivation, interest and rate of language learning - differences which the teacher needs to cater for.

Sex is significant for its relation to language ability. The tendency in the UK for females to exhibit greater ability (and interest) in language learning is for cultural and social reasons reversed in some African situations (eg. Zambia).

Homogeneity of pupil language background is significant not just for its implications for choice of instructional medium (see Section 3.2.3.2), and for the language of classroom management, but in direct teaching/learning terms.

If, for example, one accepts that the first language has a role in the learning of a second language (positive and negative transfer), then it is possible that differences in language background will translate into differences in the ease with which some items in the second language are learned. Teaching may need to accommodate this. A class of mixed language background may, however, be advantageous for the management of group work activity in that participants have less temptation to fall back on the first language.

For these reasons, then, the typical composition of language classes is of interest to the curriculum planner.
5.4.3 Links between the Sub-systems of Education

Little need be said here on this matter as it has previously been discussed in another context (see Section 3.2.2.3).

It suffices to say that most education systems are composed of interlocking sub-systems; namely, the primary, secondary and tertiary sectors. This is relevant to curriculum reform where changes of scale are involved; say, an increase in the supply of teachers to a particular sector.

If, for example, there is a need for more secondary school teachers, expansion in the capacity of training colleges may be required and this may mean the recruitment of additional teacher–trainers, who will themselves be the products of lower educational levels. The point illustrated is that a change at one educational level may necessitate change at other levels.

Outside of manpower planning, similar principles apply to curriculum development. As previously noted, higher levels of the education system tend to exert an influence over the curricular structure of the lower levels (see Section 3.2). Thus, the more academic and literary focus of secondary school studies sometimes thwarts attempts to make the primary school curriculum more practical or vocational in its orientation. The last two years of primary school tend to be dominated, in particular, by the leaving examination which selects for secondary school.

Curriculum developments at one educational level are, then, often constrained by the demands of study at the next level. In practice, these constraints largely operate through, or are mediated by, the public examination system, a crucial curricular influence.

5.5 The Role of Examinations in Language Curriculum Planning

The public examination system is one of the most significant influences on the ‘intended’ and ‘operational’ curriculum. It is sometimes argued, indeed, that it controls the curriculum, determining course content and styles of teaching in immediately preceding years. To explain why this is so, it is necessary to take a step back to consider the wider role of examinations in society.
5.5.1 The Socio–Economic Functions/Meanings of Examinations

The importance of examinations in the eyes of teachers, pupils, parents, employers, officials and the general public can be attributed to a number of underlying socio–economic factors. Following Dore (1976), and Dore & Oxenham (1984), these may be described as follows:

1. ‘Economic Dualism’
In developing countries the economy is often sharply divided into two sectors; a large ‘traditional’ sector with low earnings and poor working/living conditions, and a small ‘modern’ sector with reasonable wages and better working conditions. There is, accordingly, a strong preference for employment in the ‘modern’ sector. Eligibility for these jobs is determined almost exclusively by educational attainment.

2. The Schedule of Correspondence between Jobs and Educational Qualification
The link between salaried employment and educational qualifications has developed over time into a schedule of correspondence according to which job level is calibrated to level of qualification. In other words, the better paid, more responsible jobs are reserved for the better qualified. In Tanzania, for example, a Grade 7 certificate holder may become a security officer, but not a costing clerk, for which Form 2 status is required (Dore 1976).

3. Qualification Escalation: (the ‘Diploma’ Disease)
Unfortunately for the school leaver the level of qualifications required for the same job has escalated over time leading to greater demand for more education and ever higher qualifications. A combination of ‘supply–led’ and ‘demand–led’ factors explains this process.

On the ‘supply’ side the causes are as follows:

(i) The perception that education is the key to salaried employment in the ‘modern’ sector leads to increased public demand for education at all levels.

(ii) Responding to this demand for political reasons (and also because it accords with the ideals of equality of opportunity and socio–economic mobility) the government expands education.

(iii) The resulting growth in the number of school leavers soon outpaces the growth in modern sector job opportunities with the result that there is a surplus of educated people relative to available jobs.
Well-qualified individuals are obliged to accept lower status jobs than they would previously. Employers raise job qualifications to simplify the task of selecting from a surplus of candidates.

On the 'demand' side, the increase in the numbers of educated school leavers encourages employers to protect their profession from a slippage of their recruitment range down the ability distribution. They do this by raising their entry qualifications in the hope that they will thereby tap the 'right pool of ability' and maintain the prestige of their professions.

The raising of entrance qualifications is the outcome, then, of competitive bidding between employers for access to a 'pool of ability'. What motivates the employer is not a belief in the virtues of education per se, but a view of education as an 'ability-filtering' or sorting device.

Three consequences of qualification escalation can be identified. First, demand for schooling at higher levels is intensified. Second, this, in turn, produces pressure for a re-allocation of resources toward secondary and tertiary education at the expense of basic education. Finally, the pressure to obtain good qualifications increases. For parents and pupils, examination success is reinforced as the primary, if not only, objective of school attendance.

5.5.2 Examinations and the Curriculum

Because they are crucial determinants of life chances, examinations have powerful backwash effects on the curriculum. The primary-school leaving examination, an instrument of selection for secondary school, influences the primary school curriculum. The examination for entry to senior secondary school influences the junior secondary school curriculum, and so on.

Other mechanisms reinforce this influence. Many administrators, and the public, assess the performance of teachers and schools on the basis of examination passes. Primary school heads incur parental wrath if they fail to get many pupils into secondary school. Pupils resent any straying from the examination syllabus.

It is unsurprising, therefore, that teachers tend to teach to the examination, that they analyse the content of past papers and devise drills to help students cope with anticipated questions. In general, any content (eg. oral skills) that is not examinable (or examined) tends not to be treated seriously.
Curricular innovations that are not reflected in, or seen to be relevant to, the examination are also unlikely to be implemented effectively, even if they are perceived to be educationally desirable on other grounds. Teachers will not risk affecting their pupils’ examination chances. Curriculum innovation, therefore, often needs an accompanying programme of examination reform.

5.5.2.1 Proposals for Reform of Examinations

Concern over the distorting effects of examinations on the curriculum has prompted several reform proposals (Dore 1976; Dore & Oxenham 1984).

The most radical of these call for the use of alternative instruments (and criteria) for job allocation so as to free education from the pernicious influence of examinations. Such proposals seem unrealistic, however, without a major social revolution. In present circumstances it is difficult to imagine employers/administrators abandoning examination certificates as instruments of job allocation/educational selection. It is worth noting here that a Tanzanian attempt to make moral/ideological qualities a criterion for university entrance has been largely ineffective. Very few students have actually been excluded on this basis.

A less radical alternative is reform of the content and format of examinations to mitigate the more adverse backwash effects and to encourage better teaching habits. That there is scope for improvement in this respect is evident from the research of Somerset (1974), Little (1982) and others.

In a survey of examination papers in eight African countries, Little (1982) found that a high proportion of questions (42%) were ‘knowledge’ items requiring only recall of factual information. In secondary school examinations the proportion was even higher, especially in geography and biology. Given these figures, it is unsurprising that the transmission of factual information through lecturing or note-dictation is a salient feature of many African classrooms. It might be beneficial, then, to include more items testing a greater range of intellectual skills.

Reasoning along these lines, Somerset (in Court & Ghāi 1974:182) argues that if the Certificate of Primary Education...

"...tested the ability to reason and understand relationships of cause and effect; and if, above all, it tested relevant and practical knowledge, it would be at the same time both a more efficient and equitable instrument for selecting secondary school entrants and..."
also a more useful preparation for those for whom primary education is terminal. The two goals are not incompatible.*

Apart from reform of content, modifications to assessment procedures have also been suggested. Some writers (eg. Hawes 1979) advocate continuous assessment on the grounds that it permits the evaluation of a wider range of skills and capabilities. A disadvantage, however, is that it requires efficient and time-consuming administration - for the proper marking of assignments and the accurate, unbiased maintenance of cumulative records of performance. Where teachers have inadequate resources, little time and poor motivation, these are not matters that can be guaranteed, as is apparently the case in Tanzania (Criper & Dodd 1984:63).

Criper & Dodd (1984) also argue that continuous assessment is inappropriate in language subjects because the purpose in language examining should be "...to assess the final level of proficiency reached..." rather than "...the areas covered by the pupil or his effort...." (1984:63).

5.5.2.2 Problems of Examination Reform

Because the content and form of public examinations are a major constraint on curriculum change, planners acknowledge the need for close links between the machinery for curriculum development and that for public assessment. They also recognise that changing the examination syllabus is one method of bringing about curricular change. There are, however, administrative and technical problems in examination reform. Here, we concentrate primarily on the administrative problems.

First, examination reform makes additional demands on human, material and financial resources. For example, the writing of good multiple-choice items which test more than simply factual recall (or in reading, say, test more than direct/factual reference to the text), and which have only one correct answer and plausible distractors is a skill requiring considerable expertise. If this is not available locally, local staff may need to be trained in examination (test) setting, or construction, as well as in administration and marking.

Second, what is desirable for its positive backwash effects may be difficult to implement for logistical reasons. For example, to encourage the teaching of oral skills, it may be desirable to include an assessed oral interview in the examination. This may, however, be both costly and difficult to organise where
there are thousands of candidates. Also, the involvement of hundreds of examiners and examining centres may lead to an unacceptable decrease in reliability.

The machine-marked multiple-choice format of many primary school leaving examinations has also been criticised for the constraints it imposes on the content of what is taught and how it is taught. It largely precludes, for example, the testing of language production either in speech or in (continuous) writing with the result that the teaching of these skills is neglected.

The criticism is perhaps unrealistic, however. Machine-marking may be the only viable and reliable option where there are thousands of candidates, a shortage of trained markers, and limited time to mark and despatch results.

In short, with national examinations there are rigorous limitations on what it is feasible to test within the bounds of cost, time and reliability. These constraints do not, however, render impossible improvement in the quality of items and the range of intellectual skills tested.

5.5.3 Examinations and Curriculum Reform: Conclusion

By virtue of the functions they serve in society and the education system, examinations exert a powerful influence over the curriculum and styles of teaching. It is essential, therefore, that the curriculum planner analyse the content, style and format of examinations, their congruence with curricular aims, and administrative and marking procedures before embarking on any programme of reform.

5.6 The Machinery for Curriculum Development

Problems in the development, dissemination and implementation of curricula are likely to vary according to the institutional/administrative framework of education. Centralised systems will, for example, pose different problems of curriculum implementation from those where local units have some autonomy in curricular matters. An important variable for investigation is, then, the degree of central control over the curriculum. Also important is the status and powers of the various agencies of curriculum development and implementation (eg. the ministry, the curriculum development unit, teacher training colleges, the university department, the regional inspectorate etc.) and the way in which their work is coordinated.
5.6.1 Control over the Curriculum

Most educational systems are characterised by a high degree of centralisation. Curricula are, in other words, specified in detail by a central ministry of education. Individual schools are left with little scope for introducing their own curriculum variants. An exception is the United Kingdom, but even here pressure is building for an increased measure of centralisation.

For the planner, it may be useful to gauge the degree of central control in terms of specifications in five areas (Nicholas, 1980).

(i) the subjects to be taught; per hour, per week.
(ii) the syllabus for each subject; also the sequence of topics to be covered.
(iii) the textbooks to be used.
(iv) the teaching methods to be used.
(v) the tests or examinations to be used for assessment purposes.

Different countries exhibit different degrees of control in respect of these areas. In the Soviet Union, for instance, central control is exercised in all five areas. A similar but not so pervasive level of control operates in France and Sweden. Most Third World countries also operate a centrally controlled curriculum though the level of detail so determined varies.

5.6.1.1 Curriculum Control: Issues of Centralisation and Diversification

Before considering agencies of curriculum development, a brief investigation of the issues of curriculum centralisation versus diversification/decentralisation may be useful.

The disadvantages of a highly centralised curriculum system are fairly well-documented. Hawes (1979), for example, draws attention to the inflexibility and unsuitability of many centralised curriculum instruments (eg. the national syllabus, the ‘national’ textbook) given the very varied conditions in which teaching takes place (ie. variation in class size, pupil language background, ages of children, levels of school resourcing, teachers’ capabilities, the different interests and abilities of learners).

Too often, he argues, the national curriculum plan is designed with semi-ideal conditions in mind, and exhibits little awareness of teachers working in more difficult conditions:

"....if you have forty children and desks for all of them, a set of
recommended texts and a full complement of teaching time the syllabus is for you and the texts help you." (Hawes 1979:100)

Not so, however, if you have few books, poor equipment and a large, heterogeneous class.

The results of syllabus and materials rigidity in the face of variability are aptly rendered in Hawes' (1979:15) picture of a primary school class. There are:

"...those who lost the battle at Book 2 but are confronting Book 4 'because it is there', those who can mouth Book 4...but do not understand the concepts in it; those who know Book 4 by heart already."

Increased awareness of the disadvantages of centralisation and the failure of some centrally-led projects to achieve effective dissemination and institutionalisation in schools has led, in the West at least, to a growth of interest in school-based curriculum development. This, it is argued, affords greater scope for the adaptation of the curriculum to individual and school needs. It also circumvents the problems of dissemination by returning responsibility for innovation to the school. As Stenhouse (1975) remarks:

"...Communication is less effective than community in the utilisation of knowledge."

That said, school-based curriculum development is probably inappropriate in a developing countries context. Decentralisation, as Hurst (1983) remarks, does not itself guarantee more effective curriculum development. Much depends on the level of resources and expertise in schools, and in developing countries this can be quite low. In any case, simply maintaining the existing system is often quite enough of a struggle.

Apart from practical considerations, there is also the political argument: the state has the right to expect that its citizens achieve mastery over a basic core of knowledge (for economic and cohesion reasons). In developing countries education is also regarded as too crucial an investment in national development to be left to the potentially idiosyncratic decisions of local officials or individual headteachers.

Given the impracticality of school-based curriculum development on the one hand, the often inflexible rigidity of many centralised curriculum instruments on
the other, yet the need for some standardisation and consistency in the curriculum (for administrative, staffing and equity reasons), what can the curriculum planner do?

An initial step, Hawes (1979) suggests, is for the planner to be aware of the variety of teaching/learning conditions. This may encourage greater tolerance for flexibility in the design and application of syllabuses (and materials) to suit different contexts. Flexibility might be enhanced in the following ways:

1. The encouragement of a limited decentralisation of curriculum development – allowing for the production of local materials to be set alongside nationally designed and prescribed materials.
2. The creation of a national core curriculum with a system of options to be chosen by schools in accordance with their suitability to the local context. This implies some localisation of examinations.
3. The establishment of broad national guidelines which may be interpreted in varied ways at the local level.
4. Teachers’ handbooks/guides which provide sufficient guidance for the inexperienced teacher but which also contain suggestions for optional/enrichment activities that the more experienced/able/confident teacher might wish to pursue.

(Incidentally, the readability of teachers’ guides for the average teacher requires monitoring. In some cases it is questionable).

Hawes (1979:64) cites Botswana as a possible model for an intermediate level of localised curriculum development. Here, local curriculum development committees have been established. Among their functions are:

1. Identification of problem areas in the current syllabuses;
2. Suggestions as to the necessary modifications
3. Advice on the programme of work to be done in schools

5.6.2 Agencies of Curriculum Development and Implementation

In Africa the machinery for curriculum development has evolved over the years.

Initially, many governments were preoccupied with programmes of quantitative expansion, and were thus content to let responsibility for curriculum development fall to university institutes of education (eg. Tanzania, Uganda).
These suffered the disadvantage of being isolated from the implementation machinery of the ministry of education.

In subsequent years, however, the trend has been for ministries of education to assume greater control over curriculum planning units. Thus, in several countries curriculum development centres have been established under ministry control, though separately housed (eg. Ghana 1967, Zambia 1970, Uganda 1973). In others (eg. some Nigerian states - Oyo), curriculum units are housed within ministry buildings. The latter arrangement has the advantage of overcoming the physical separation of personnel that can obstruct effective coordination.

Ministry-controlled curriculum development units are usually not the only bodies involved in curriculum work. It is common, for example, to find teacher-training colleges assisting with in-service training, an Inspectorate monitoring (and advising on) the implementation of innovation in the schools, a University Department conducting curriculum research, and an Examinations Board administering national examinations.

To exemplify the range of agencies involved in curriculum work, it may be useful to refer to two countries: Zambia and Ghana.

In Zambia the following are involved in work on the (primary) curriculum:

1. A Curriculum Development Centre within the Ministry is responsible to the Inspectorate which also controls examinations under a separate department.
2. Teacher-training colleges take responsibility for in-service training linked to curriculum development. The colleges are advised by the Inspectorate on the dissemination of new curricula.
3. An Audio-Visual Services Department produces some teaching/learning material. The University Department of Education has little part in curriculum development.

It is evident, then, that in Zambia the inspectorate plays a crucial pivotal role, linking schools, training colleges and the curriculum development centre.

By contrast, the situation in Ghana is as follows (Hawes 1979:49):

1. One of five divisions of the Ghana Education Service is concerned with curriculum research and development.
2. The Faculty of Education at Cape Coast University liaises with the
curriculum development division.
3. The National Training Council in charge of in-service training disseminates ideas and materials.
4. The Bureau of Ghanian Languages produces mother tongue materials. District Teachers’ Resource Centres are responsible for diffusion of materials.
5. Parts of primary school leaving examinations are shared with Sierra Leone and Gambia.

As compared with Zambia, one notices here the more active role of District Teachers’ Resource Centres and the University Faculty of Education.

Apart from ascertaining the powers and responsibilities of the various bodies involved in curriculum work, the planner should also investigate the links between them. An absence of proper coordination can be an impediment to the implementation of change. It is unhelpful, for instance, if the machinery for curriculum development is isolated from that of the examination/assessment boards. Equally unfortunate, as Hawes (1979:5) points out, is any rigid division between the professional and administrative aspects of curriculum planning (ie. between syllabus/materials development and the implementation machinery).

5.7 Background Factors in Language Curriculum Planning

So far only contextual factors of direct and immediate relevance to curriculum planning have been discussed. It should be remembered, however, that these, in turn, are influenced by what one may term ‘background societal factors’ which define the wider context of curriculum planning. In the following sections these factors are briefly enumerated and their relevance to curriculum planning indicated. A fuller treatment of them is beyond the scope of the present work.

5.7.1 Politics

The objectives, content and administration of education is often influenced by, or determined through, political decisions. It is useful, then, for the planner to have some knowledge of the political system and prevailing ideology.

It is worth noting that in some countries the political lead provided to curriculum planners is strong and explicit, in others less so. One kind of influence arises through the application of a national philosophy to the education system (eg. ‘Education for Self-Reliance/Ujamaa’ in Tanzania; ‘Humanism’ in
5.7.2 The Economy

Information on the economy has relevance for the curriculum planner because the state of the economy directly or indirectly determines the level of resources that are available for education (e.g. teachers’ salaries, textbooks and materials, school libraries, equipment, etc).

The structure of the economy, trading patterns, and the allocation of the labour force between different economic sectors is also of interest in so far as it offers an approximate indication of the forms of employment in which school leavers are likely to be engaged – a starting-point for an analysis of the language demands of those forms of employment.

Finally, because qualitative change often requires change in quantitative inputs, it may be useful for the planner to have basic information on educational finance (e.g. unit costs per pupil, proportion of expenditure allocated to teachers’ salaries as against books/equipment etc).

5.7.3 Culture and Religion

Cultural values/traditions inform nearly all educational practices (e.g. the attitudes of teachers to pupils, to teaching, to discipline, to learning; the expectations of pupils in their role as learners).

For this reason it is useful for the planner to have some knowledge of such cultural features as child-rearing and socialisation patterns, the roles of children in family and community as well as of religious beliefs and practices. These all influence attitudes to authority and education, and the view taken of causal relationships.

5.7.4 The History of Education

Educational traditions exert a significant influence on curriculum plans, teaching styles and the attitudes of administrators/teachers to reform. It is useful, then, for the planner to identify the nature and source of these traditions. Among those to consider are:

(i) traditional (indigenous) forms of education.
(ii) missionary and religious influences.
(iii) legacies of colonial education patterns.
borrowing from metropolitan education systems (eg. in Britain or France).

5.7.5 Demography

Demographic data on rates of population growth, distributions of population by age, sex and geographical region are typically of greater interest to the educational rather than the curriculum planner.

Nevertheless, they have some significance in that the problems of introducing qualitative change are different and (greater) in educational systems undergoing expansion in step with rapid population growth.

It should be noted, finally, that the importance of information on the language situation and on general features of the educational system (eg. pupil progression, attrition rates, enrolment ratios, teacher-pupil ratios, the school calendar) has previously been mentioned.

5.8 Situational Analysis - A Concluding Rationale

Two kinds of information are needed in curriculum planning. The first is research evidence drawn from fundamental psychological, linguistic, pedagogical and sociolinguistic enquiry. This provides a platform of principles to guide/inform language teaching activity and curriculum design.

The second, more prosaic but no less important, is information about the educational context. This provides a basis for curriculum decision in the interpretation of fundamental principles, and in the effort to achieve a goodness of fit between the curriculum and the context in which it is to be enacted. Prabhu (1987:4) makes a related point:

"Developing feasible classroom procedures based on a given perception of pedagogy involves a reconciliation with the constraints of the teaching context..."

Accurate and detailed descriptions of educational contexts are useful for a further reason. Observation of education systems in Africa and elsewhere frequently reveals inconsistencies between policy and practice, between the official 'intended' curriculum and that actually pursued in schools (see Hawes 1979).

For example, the official teachers' guide may emphasise a certain kind of
activity (eg. fluency practice), while the official examination tests different kinds of language skill. The official syllabus may prescribe the reading of a large number of books/readers, whereas schools possess few or none of these books. The same syllabus (or teachers' guide) may suggest role-play or project work (or another pedagogic activity), while official timetables may preclude this by segmenting the school day into short, single lessons. Yet again, the English language syllabus for Form 1 of secondary school may make unrealistic assumptions about the proficiency in English of pupils entering from primary school. The result of all this is an increasing divergence between what is supposed to happen and what actually does.

How do such mismatches arise? Wishful thinking and a lack of coordination between curriculum agencies may play a part. Perhaps at root, however, there is in many cases a lack of awareness of the realities of schools, teachers and learners. This can best be remedied through surveys and descriptions of conditions in schools.

Specific contextual information is useful for a third reason. It provides a basis for making illuminating comparisons between language teaching situations, for drawing on the experience of other countries when the similarities are sufficient to justify doing so, or for rejecting the relevance of that experience when the magnitude of the differences warrants.

Given the value of contextual information, an initial step is the identification and articulation of precisely those situational factors/features that are of significance. It is this that has been the main function of this chapter.
"Progress comes as we deploy in the face of a new puzzle, what we learned from our intelligent failure to solve the old. Success is a fiction: the distinction is between intelligent and contained treatment of the problems of action and the disasters of incompetence." (Stenhouse 1980:244)

In applied linguistics, and particularly language curriculum planning, considerable attention has been paid to the content of change, whether this be in pedagogy (methodology), syllabus, or materials. By contrast, little consideration has been given to the conceptual and organisational aspects of accomplishing change\(^8\). In other words, how is change best implemented and managed?

A purpose of this chapter is to remedy this neglect by drawing attention to an existing literature on the implementation process, the factors that affect it, and how it might be conceptualised and managed. A further justification is that the planner who is interested in accomplishing change should ideally not only possess expertise pertinent to the substantive content area of the change but also skills and knowledge about how to actually implement that change.

As Fullan (1982:96) puts it:

"....the practitioner interested in....bringing about educational change requires a theory of changing."

A useful starting point for a discussion of the problems of implementation is a review of theoretical approaches to the adoption/rejection of innovations.

### 6.1 The Adoption/Rejection of Innovations: An Overview of Theoretical Approaches

In the following sections attention is focussed on theoretical accounts of the factors thought to influence the adoption or rejection of innovations in the belief that a better understanding of these holds the promise of more effective strategies of implementation. The review makes use of a framework suggested

\(^8\)At the end of his account of the Bangalore 'communicational' project, Prabhu (1987) adds some reflections on pedagogic innovation.
by Hurst (1983) who identifies five categories of hypothesis about receptivity to change.

First, however, it is necessary to step back to locate these hypotheses with respect to two broad approaches (or paradigms) to social and educational change.

6.1.1 Theoretical Paradigms and Approaches in the Study of Social Change

Two general approaches to social/educational change can be identified which, in turn, relate to two theoretical paradigms. Let us consider the approaches first.

6.1.1.1 Systems Analysis and Phenomenological Approaches to Change

The systems analysis approach holds that the structural and systemic properties of institutions, organisations, or groups determine their ability to accept and implement change. Emphasis is thus placed on organisational and situational factors as determinants of innovative capacity. Implementation difficulties are, consequently, attributed to non-rational (system) causes, for example, inadequate resources. In this respect, the systems approach implicitly plays down what Hurst (1981:186) refers to as:

"....the possibility that potential adopters choose...to adopt or reject innovations....basing their decisions on logical considerations."

The attractiveness of the systems approach for administrators and planners may be explained in several ways. First, it has inherent plausibility. Inadequate resources, or timetabling arrangements clearly can obstruct attempts at change. Second, the traditional role of administrators inclines them to give system factors a dominant causal role in determining an innovation's fate. Third, it is more convenient for administrators to think in terms of systems or 'feedback channels' because these seem more subject to control than autonomous individuals adhering to complex value/belief systems.

The phenomenological approach does not denigrate the importance of system factors (eg. organisational arrangements, the characteristics of schools as social systems, resources) in the implementation of educational change. It argues, however, that the system view errs in seeing these system (or contextual) factors as directly and causally determining the outcome of attempts at innovation instead of seeing them as influences on teachers' responses to innovation.
In the phenomenological approach, then, it is the individual view taken of an innovation that is crucial. In other words, the teacher’s subjective world and values crucially inform his view of the worth of an innovation, and hence his willingness to implement it. Therefore, successful implementation is more likely in the context of an effort to understand the subjective world of the teacher as well as the situational constraints acting on him.

The need for greater awareness of teachers’ subjective perceptions of, and reasoning toward, innovations is increasingly argued by a number of writers; Fullan & Pomfret (1977), Doyle & Ponder (1977), Hurst (1981, 1983), Fullan (1982), Hoyle (1982).

Fullan (1982:4), for example, asserts that:

“Neglect of the phenomenology of change — that is how people actually experience change as distinct from how it might have been intended — is at the heart of the spectacular lack of success of most social reforms.”

Hurst (1981:185), likewise, argues for greater emphasis on teachers’ reasoning in relation to change. He criticises, in particular, the simplistic and misleading tendency to attribute difficulties in implementing change to teacher resistance, or to non-rational (system) causes. Instead, he claims that:

“...greater success will accrue to strategies which postulate rational or logical factors and which consist of analyses of and response to the internal cognitive styles and strategies of those who are expected to change their practice.”

Similar points are made by Doyle & Ponder (1977:1) who focus on the logic employed by the teacher involved in change.

“The present analysis is focussed on...the decision-making processes which appear to underlie teacher reaction to change proposals. We contend that the practicality ethic is a key link in the knowledge utilization chain.”

Increased attention to the phenomenological aspects of educational change is also consonant, one may note, with epistemological trends in the social sciences. In these, Hoyle (1985:206) points out, there is greater emphasis on:

“...the active role of the recipient of a communication ... whereby the recipient brings meaning to the information which is thus neither neutral nor accepted passively in terms of the meaning attached by the reader.”
6.1.1.2 Two Paradigms of Social Change

The systems analysis and phenomenological approaches have affinities to two different theoretical paradigms of social change. Hurst (1983) refers to these as:

a) the 'control' paradigm to which systems analysis and 'diffusionism' belong;

b) the 'change' paradigm within which the phenomenological approach is located. This includes what are termed 'conflict/dependency' approaches to change.

In brief, innovation in the 'control' paradigm is viewed mainly as a reactive mechanism by which the social system restores equilibrium. It is, in other words, one way of regaining control of events. The existing social framework is, thus, taken as given.

In the 'change' paradigm, by contrast, change is an underlying constant and stability exceptional. The existing social framework is seen as the temporary triumph of one ideology, or one set of interest groups, over others. Innovation is, accordingly, viewed as a political process involving struggle between competing values and interest groups.

Because they operate with different conceptions of the nature of the social order and of social change, the two paradigms imply quite different approaches to the implementation of change. In the 'control' paradigm, for example, it is assumed that planning (and management) are the keys to the successful implementation of change. In the 'change' paradigm, by contrast, change is the product of conflict between opposing values, beliefs and interests. There is the implication, then, social change can only marginally be affected by planning.

Little further need be said about these two paradigms. The main point has been to allude to assumptions underlying belief in planning, and to show how the two paradigms imply different attitudes to implementation. It should be noted, however, that the hypotheses now to be considered fall mainly within the 'control' paradigm.

6.1.2 Hypotheses concerning the Adoption/Rejection of Innovations

Following Hurst's (1983) framework, five categories of hypothesis about conditions governing the adoption/rejection of innovation are identified. They are critically reviewed below.
6.1.2.1 Endemic Conservatism

The thesis of endemic conservatism is that human beings are, individually or collectively, inherently conservative. There are two versions of the thesis: the first is psychological in nature predicating conservative tendencies of individual personalities; the second is structural-functionalist predicating the same tendencies of social structures.

In its psychological guise, the thesis argues that individuals have an innate equilibrium-seeking propensity. Thus, when external pressures threaten disequilibrium, the natural response is resistance to change followed, where necessary, by modification which is just sufficient to restore equilibrium.

To the above thesis several objections, both empirical and logical, can be made. The empirical argument is simple: endemic conservatism may explain resistance to change (eg. in terms of entrenched habits) but it cannot, and does not, explain why some innovations (eg. word processors) are enthusiastically adopted.

Logically, endemic conservatism is deficient as explanation because it is circular. Resistance to change is explained by reference to some equilibrium-seeking impulse (ie. a 'desire' not to change). This, however, is tantamount to saying that resistance to change causes itself.

6.1.2.2 Variable Conservatism

Hypotheses of variable conservatism maintain that some individuals or societies are more resistant to change (ie. conservative) than others. The question then is which. Many studies have attempted to identify those characteristics of individuals or social systems which are correlated with (and allegedly determine) innovativeness, and which can therefore be used to predict receptivity to change.

The large number of predictor variables proposed in these studies are grouped by Hurst (1983:32) into three categories: (a) psycho-cultural characteristics (pertaining to individuals or cultures), (b) social structure characteristics, and (c) economic or environmental characteristics. Reference can only be made here to a few examples from each category.

a) Psycho-Cultural Characteristics

The sex of the would-be adopter and authoritarianism have been investigated as possible correlates of innovativeness. In both cases,
however, no clear relationship has been found — neither femaleness nor authoritarianism predict resistance to change (national socialists can hardly be considered conservative).

More interesting from an educational perspective is Beeby's (1966) hypothesis that the higher the level of a teacher's education, knowledge and training, the more receptive he is to innovation. According to Hurst (1983:35), however, there is little empirical evidence to show that resistance to change is greater in educational systems where teachers are less educated. If this is so, it is damaging to Beeby's entire hypothesis about stages of educational development.

Another cultural characteristic used to predict receptivity to change is found in the distinction between 'traditional' and 'modern' societies. Because 'traditional' societies are seen as 'custom-bound', 'hierarchical', 'fatalistic', with little 'vertical social mobility' (Rostow 1960; Hagen 1962), they are also claimed to be resistant to change. 'Modern' societies, by contrast, are allegedly 'achievement-oriented', 'competitive', with greater 'vertical social mobility'. Thus, they are seen as more open to change. Critics of this view claim, however, that it is factually inaccurate. Teachers in developing countries are willing to learn and to experiment. They are, however, impeded sometimes by a lack of guidance or resources. Peasants, likewise, will respond to innovation when they can perceive a clear economic incentive to do so.

The 'traditional'/"modern" dichotomy is also seen as questionable in itself. It encourages reification, the perception that the two 'social systems' have a real, independent existence. In fact, however, they are only descriptive constructs abstracted from the behaviour of individual members. Finally, to say a society is 'traditional' and therefore resistant to change is relatively unilluminating. It does not, for one thing, permit reliable prediction about the behaviour of individuals.

b) Social Structure Characteristics

There is a considerable literature (following the work of Weber) on bureaucracy and organisational style in relation to innovation. It is impossible here, however, to offer a proper evaluation. Therefore, only a few variables of especial interest will be singled out. One of these is centralisation. Hage & Aitken (1970) argue that highly centralised organisations are less likely to adopt innovations than less centralised ones. In support, they cite the work of Cillie (1940) on innovation adoption in New York school districts. Cillie had found that in
12% of cases of innovation there was a difference in favour of adoption by centralised districts and in 30% of cases a difference in favour of decentralised districts. In 58% of cases there was no difference.

Other empirical studies (eg. Corwin 1972; Hurst 1983:39) do not, however, bear out the same finding. If centralisation is both positively and negatively related to innovation adoption, depending on the study, it cannot reliably be acclaimed as a cause of resistance to change. Also, as Hurst (1983) points out, historical evidence discloses instances of centralised systems successfully accomplishing major change (eg Stalin’s Russia). Finally, there is no sure way of establishing whether Cillie’s sample of innovations is truly representative since the population of innovations, past and future, is itself unknowable.

Another variable of interest is that of organisational climate (Hoyle 1971; Miles 1965; Halpin 1967). Hoyle (1971) links innovativeness with a healthy organisational climate.

The argument is circular, however; for a willingness to examine its procedures, an awareness of innovation, and a capacity for innovation are themselves cited as defining characteristics of a ‘healthy climate’. Nonetheless, Hoyle (1971) and Halpin’s (1967) emphasis on the importance of the headteacher’s leadership to innovation at school level is useful.

A positive correlation between the implementation of educational innovation and a ‘good’ organisational climate is also reported in Berman & McLaughlin’s (1974–78) Rand change agent studies. However, climate is here taken to refer more narrowly to the ‘quality and openness’ of staff relationships.

The finding of such a positive association is not surprising. There are, after all, sensible grounds for believing that a trusting, supportive set of staff relationships may make the risks and disincentives inevitably attached to innovation seem less formidable.

In summary, good human relationships in an organisation are likely to facilitate change. It has not been shown, however, that innovation cannot be successfully introduced in what Halpin (1967) refers to as a ‘closed climate’.

c) Economic and Environmental Characteristics

The third category of predictor variables has mainly been the province of economists who are interested in the question of how innovation is initiated, and in those economic conditions that are conducive to economic development/change. Consequently, they focus on innovation in
industrial and technological areas, drawing attention to economic factors such as rates of, and returns to, investment, savings and operational costs. The role of economic incentives and constraints in innovation adoption is also mentioned.

An interesting suggestion of some writers, also found in anthropological studies (Bailey 1973), is that potential adopters assess innovations according to some cost–benefit calculus. The benefits accruing from adoption are weighed against the costs incurred (or resources expended). What precisely constitutes a benefit or cost may, however, vary with differences in the value-systems of those undertaking the assessment. The problem, then, is to understand the life of potential adopters sufficiently well to be able to identify what for them is likely to be a benefit or a cost, and what are the determining factors.

Conclusion:

Those studies which attempt to identify the determinants of innovativeness in persons or institutions have several limitations.

First, most identify correlations not causes. Few of these correlations are sufficiently strong or stable to provide a reliable basis for an implementation strategy.

Second, significance tests for reported correlations are problematic because it cannot be assumed that the sample of innovations studied is truly representative of the total population of innovations, past or future.

Finally, Hurst (1983:43) points out that the dependent variable, a stable propensity to adopt or reject innovations, is probably mythical. People, institutions or cultures do not conveniently divide into two categories, one habitually adopting and the other rejecting innovations. One and the same individual may be both resistant to, and welcoming of, change, depending on its nature. Thus, it is necessary to consider the characteristics of innovations as determinants of their acceptability.

6.1.2.3 Properties of Innovations as Determinants of their Acceptability

Rogers & Shoemaker (1971) are well-known exponents of the view that adoption decisions are closely associated with characteristics of innovations. They isolate five characteristics as having a particular effect on rate of adoption.
These are:

a) Relative advantage over existing practice

Innovations are more readily adopted to the extent that they are compatible/congruent with existing values.

A similar point is made by Macdonald & Rudduck (1971) with reference to the Humanities Curriculum project (UK). They show how its unfamiliar design principles (teacher as neutral chairman, not pedagogue) rendered its dissemination more difficult, thereby illustrating the general notion that if an innovation embodies unfamiliar values, or requires some reconceptualisation of teaching style, its chances of successful diffusion are correspondingly diminished.

Another relevant distinction is that between innovations that are additive to the stock of received ideas and those that displace those ideas. It is argued (Hurst 1983) that the latter are less likely to be adopted.

b) Compatibility with existing values/practices

Innovations are more readily adopted to the extent that they are compatible/congruent with existing values.

c) Complexity

The complexity attribute relates partly to the one above. An innovation may be said to be more complex than another if it poses greater problems of understanding and if it requires a greater amount of unlearning-relearning.

In another sense, it may be deemed more complex if its implementation necessitates the cooperation of a greater number of people, and if its maintenance is more time-consuming/elaborate.

d) Trialability/Divisibility

Innovations are held to have a greater likelihood of successful diffusion if they are capable of being adopted on a trial basis.

This is because potential adopters, sensitive to the risks of innovation, welcome the opportunity to try out a new idea on a limited basis.

Not all innovations permit such trials, however; either because they must be adopted wholesale or not at all, or because considerable initial investment is required before it becomes meaningful to conduct any trial (eg. a new audio-visual system).

e) Observability/Communicability

Some ideas are easier to explain or demonstrate than others ('communicability'). Some also have greater 'observability' in the sense that they yield 'visible' results (a more common feature, perhaps, of agricultural than educational innovations). Where these conditions obtain, adoption is more likely.
Huberman (1973) also observes that teachers tend to be more favourable to innovation when they can see the new techniques/devices actually put to work in classrooms. Finally, it is suggested that innovations embodied in materials or technology diffuse more easily than those pertaining to methodological principles. Is this why video or CALL has enjoyed relatively rapid acceptance in language teaching?

**Conclusion**

The above group of hypotheses has both strengths and limitations. One limitation is the problematic nature of the 'compatibility' variable. If only 'value-compatible' innovations are adopted, to what extent can values ever change as a result of innovation adoption? It may be, however, that incompatibility slows adoption rather than precludes its occurrence.

The fact that a given innovation is sometimes adopted by some individuals and rejected by others constitutes a second objection. It means that it is invalid to explain adoption/rejection decisions solely in terms of characteristics of the innovation. Other variables must enter.

Finally, there is no reason, in principle, to stop at the five characteristics above. Perhaps there are other, more important, variables yet to be identified.

All that said, the notion that adoption decisions are related to characteristics of the innovation possesses greater plausibility than the supposition that some individuals are inherently and consistently conservative and others not. For one thing, it allows greater rationality of decision to potential adopters, and is hence less reductionist.

**6.1.2.4 Communication Hypotheses**

The essential characteristic of this category is that response to innovation is seen as determined by variables of the communication/transmission process. The issue then is to identify how 'knowledge dissemination and utilisation' is best brought about.

A major figure in the field is Havelock (1969). From a review of the literature on the varied nature of the links between 'knowledge-producers' ('resource systems') and potential consumers of this knowledge ('user systems'), Havelock
identifies and systematises four dissemination models (or perspectives). These are described briefly below:

a) **The Research, Development and Dissemination Model (R.D.& D)**

The R.D.& D model is a common, even conventional, one in curriculum development circles. It envisages a rational, logical sequence of innovation starting from research, proceeding to development, and then to dissemination to schools. It is also 'centre-periphery' in its orientation (Schon 1971:81); that is, emphasis is placed on the careful preparation and packaging of the innovation in a central agency prior to dissemination. Dissemination itself is centrally managed and resourced. On this account the model is sometimes criticised for its assumption of a passive consumer faithfully implementing the innovation. Also, little scope is allowed, it is argued, for adaptation of the innovation to local circumstances.

b) **The Social Interaction Model**

This model is more descriptive than prescriptive. It holds roughly that dissemination takes place by way of the unplanned spread of knowledge through social networks of communication. These are mainly constituted by informal contact between individuals and by such forums as teachers' workshops, conferences, publications and the media. For the planner, the model is not very useful in that it yields no definite prescription for more effective dissemination strategies. The kind of dissemination depicted is seen as too haphazard and unreliable.

c) **The Problem-Solving Model**

The third model stresses the active role of the school (institution) at the periphery. It proposes that schools first identify and define a problem, and then call on various resources in the effort to find a solution. Some of these will be external to the school, including, for example, the advice of outside experts, and reports on the experiences of other schools. Innovation is, thus, not externally initiated but occurs as a response to perceived problems at the level of the school. In its emphasis on the active potential of the periphery, the problem-solving model is seen as a useful corrective to the centre-periphery assumptions of the other two. However, its principal weakness is viewed as the dubious assumption that schools not only have the expertise to identify problems correctly but also the capacity to mobilise sufficient intellectual and implementational resources to find an
effective solution (see Section 5.6.1.1).

d) The Linkage Model

This model is Havelock's (1969) attempt to synthesise and overcome the deficiencies of the three models above. Its principal feature is the emphasis on two-way communication (linkage) between practitioners in schools and external 'resource systems'. The role of the latter is primarily to provide expert advice or assistance. Successful linkage, according to Havelock (1969), requires not only continuous interaction but an understanding of each others' 'modus operandi'.

"....the resource system must appreciate the users' internal needs and problem-solving patterns, and the user, in turn, must be able to appreciate the invention, solution formulation, and evaluation processes of the resource systems. This type of collaborative interaction will not only make solutions more relevant and effective but will build relationships of trust ...." (Havelock 1969)

Innovation in this model, then, is the product of collaboration between schools and external agencies (eg. universities, colleges of education, the inspectorate).

Conclusion:

A weakness of the 'diffusionist' approach characterised above is the assumption that innovation adoption is determined by some antecedent process of dissemination. An implication is that if only the innovation is properly communicated/disseminated, then adoption and implementation will be secured.

However, this is not so. The target audience may be fully informed about the innovation but still refrain from adoption/implementation either because structural reasons prevent it, or because it chooses to reject the innovation. By supposing that effective dissemination is both a necessary and sufficient condition for innovation adoption, communication models implicitly undervalue the critical reasoning capacities of target audiences.

Another weakness is the assumption that all innovation is exogenous and therefore needs dissemination to users. Clearly, much is, but there are instances of endogenous innovation.

Alternatives to Dissemination

In an attempt to meet the perennial problems of dissemination (ie. of bridging
the gap between researcher/developer and practitioner) several writers have proposed alternative approaches to research. A characteristic of these is their encouragement of a weakening (blurring) of boundaries between practitioners and researchers such that dissemination ceases to be a problem.

One such approach is found in the notion of 'teacher-researcher', advocated by Stenhouse (1975) on the grounds that action research is critically important to professional self-development. Another is located in the 'school-based curriculum development movement' discussed in Section 5.6.1.1.

A further solution to the dissemination problem is advanced by Hoyle (1985). This involves:

"....the creation of contexts in which both practitioners and researchers are active participants and in which the meaning of research findings are negotiated." (Hoyle 1985:203)

One of Hoyle's points seems to be that too much reliance has been placed on print as a medium for the dissemination of educational research. More interactive forums for participation and negotiation are required. A model example cited is the provision of membership service by the National Foundation for Educational Research (NFER: UK). Another is the establishment by some universities of 'teacher research groups' that determine the problems to be investigated under the guidance of university staff.

The tendency to a blurring of the roles of researcher and practitioner has been precipitated, Hoyle (1985) believes, by wider developments. These are:

(i) Technological: (the emergence of large-scale computerised data-bases (eg. ERIC) giving easier access to research data and materials).

(ii) Epistemological: (epistemological challenges to the objectivity of research findings, whose meaning is thus not 'objectively given' but requires negotiation/exploration).

(iii) Professional: (new patterns of professional development whereby student teachers are encouraged to reflect on particulars of their own experience rather than attempt the assimilation of a pre-defined body of theoretical knowledge).

Interesting though these developments are, one must question, for reasons already indicated (Section 5.6.1.1), the viability of these alternative research/innovation styles in the cultural/economic context of many Third World
countries.

The problem of dissemination, therefore, remains. A virtue of the communication hypotheses is that they draw attention to the importance of effective dissemination/communication as a necessary, if not sufficient, condition for the adoption of innovations.

6.1.2.5 Situational/Decision Analysis

Situational or Decision Analysis is essentially phenomenological in approach. It sees innovation adoption as the outcome of choice and, accordingly, seeks to model the decision-making logic employed by the adopter. The role of information in innovation is not neglected, however. The status of such information in the eyes of the adopter, and its means of acquisition, influence the final choice. The main focus, though, is on the logic by which information about innovation is processed.

For some writers this logic can be represented as a sort of cost-benefit calculus according to which 'alternative streams of benefits and opportunity costs' are assessed (Hurst 1983:47).

Such cost-benefit models have been most commonly employed in the study of agricultural innovation (eg. for peasant farmers' decisions), but there are instances of their application to educational innovation. For example, Adams with Chen (1981) argue that innovations are more likely to be accepted where the resultant benefits are thought to exceed the costs. Here, benefits and costs are social, psychological and cultural in character and are thus not straightforwardly quantifiable in the manner of conventional cost-benefit analysis.

Other attempts to describe the reasoning employed by potential adopters are made by Loucks & Hall (1977) and Doyle & Ponder (1977).

The latter propose that teachers judge innovations in terms of 'a practicality ethic' defined by three criteria: 'instrumentality', 'congruence', 'cost'. These will be considered later (Section 6.3.1.2).

For Loucks & Hall (1977), the adoption/rejection process comprises a series of stages during which there is an evolution in teachers' concerns regarding the innovation. The initial preoccupation is with information about the proposed change. This is followed by concerns regarding the personal consequences of adoption (what does this innovation imply for me personally?). Subsequently,
teachers become concerned successively with the logistics of the change, consequences for students, and collaboration with colleagues. Finally, there is a 'refocussing' on other innovations.

Corresponding to this sequence of concerns, a further sequence of changes in the levels of use of an innovation is proposed. These are shown in the following diagram.

Figure 9: Changing Levels of Use of an Innovation (Hall et al 1977; Loucks & Hall 1977)

- Non Use
- Orientation
- Preparation
- Mechanical Use
- Routine Use
- Refinement
- Integration
- Renewal

These levels of use provide, it is claimed, the basis of an instrument for measuring the degree of implementation of an innovation. Once degree of implementation has been ascertained, it is possible to make a more reliable evaluation of the effects (e.g. on learning) of the innovation.

Conclusion:

Situational/Decision Analysis makes a useful contribution to the study of innovation adoption or rejection. First, in attributing critical rationality to the actors in the adoption/implementation process, it avoids the unproductive reductionism of some other approaches. Second, by seeking to understand the mental world of these actors and the reasoning they pursue, it holds out the promise of implementation strategies that better address their subjective concerns.
There are problems, however. A major one, described by Hurst (1983:47), is that of modelling the logic of the potential adopter at an appropriate level of abstraction such that:

"....it captures the specifics of situation, context .... of an individual decision; and simultaneously the abstract and general features of the logic of the whole class of decisions to which it belongs."

The analyses above appear to offer a plausible description of some general features of the logic employed by adopters. It is not clear, on the other hand, whether they capture the specifics of the situation of individual decisions and the particular factors that enter into them.

6.1.3 Conclusion

Though a practical business, the implementation of change is best pursued on the basis of sound theoretical knowledge of the conditions under which educational innovations are likely to be accepted or rejected. How far do the studies/hypotheses above provide such a basis?

The conclusion has to be that they do not account for the full complexity of adoption/rejection behaviour. True, some correlates of innovativeness are identified, and other factors relevant to adoption indicated. These do not, however, add up to a proper causal explanation of the range of adoption/rejection phenomena.

For example, hypotheses proposing that it is the properties of an innovation that determine its reception do not explain why one and the same innovation may be accepted by some and rejected by others. Similarly, hypotheses associating adoption/rejection with variables of the dissemination process overlook other factors which may precipitate innovation rejection notwithstanding an exemplary process of dissemination.

That said, it would be unwise to conclude that the studies/hypotheses tell us little or nothing. Collectively, if not singly, they are suggestive of a range of factors that need to be considered in building a strategy of implementation. For example, the planner may do well to heed the intrinsic properties of an innovation as an implementation factor, also the mode of dissemination, the criteria on which potential adopters base their decisions, and the structural properties of organisations expected to change their practice.
There is left, then, not a theoretically reliable basis for a strategy but insights and clues which may usefully inform the practice of implementation.

6.2 Strategies of Implementation

In the following review of strategies of implementation (defined as courses of action intended to bring about adoption/implementation of innovations) it is necessary to impose some classification on the various strategies described in the literature. This involves some idealisation from an untidy reality where elements of putatively different approaches are blended in efforts to secure change.

In fact, a number of schemes for classifying strategies of implementation are suggested in the literature. One, focussing on dissemination, is that of Marsh & Humberman (1984). They argue for two categories distinguished by the degree of input and control exercised by senior educationists working out of central agencies. These are:

a) a 'top-down' or 'high control' category which comprises several variants; viz. Havelock's (1969) R.D. & D Model (Section 6.1.2.4), Schon's (1971) Centre-Periphery Model, Rogers & Shoemaker's (1971) Authority-Innovation-Decision Making System; and

b) a 'bottom-up' or 'low-control' category including, for example, school-based approaches to curriculum development.

Hurst (1983) suggests, in similar vein, that strategies may be located on a continuum ranging from the highly directive to the highly non-directive.

Another classification of a different kind is provided by Fullan (1982). He identifies two orientations to educational change; a 'fidelity' orientation and a 'mutual adaptation' orientation.

In the former, the implementer sees his task as one of persuading the target population to implement an already developed innovation with fidelity, that is, as closely as possible to the intentions of the original design. In the 'mutual adaptation' orientation, by contrast, it is acknowledged that implementation of change requires adaptations of the innovative programme, technique, or policy by users.

The two orientations seem, then, to resemble Hurst's (1983) directive and
non-directive strategies in that the 'fidelity' approach requires compliance with authority whereas the 'mutual adaptation' approach allows a measure of discretion to users.

A further classification of change strategies is Chin & Benne's (Bennis, Benne & Chin 1969) three-fold typology of the power-coercive, the rational-empirical and the normative-re-educative. Since the criteria for these categories are wide-ranging, taking account of assumptions that underlie various strategies, the typology provides a convenient framework for discussion.

6.2.1 Power-Coercive Strategies

Power-coercive strategies have widespread use. They rely primarily on extrinsic benefits or penalties to secure changes of practice, and draw theoretical support from the work of some sociologists and behavioural scientists (eg. Skinner - who advances the notion of 'positive' and 'negative reinforcement' as instruments of behaviour modification).

In education, a variety of instruments is available to exert pressure for change. At their most brutally explicit, teachers can, for example, be threatened with dismissal (or transfer) if they fail to comply with reform instructions. Alternatively, if rewards are emphasised, promotion or salary increments may be promised to the obedient.

A more subtle, impersonal instrument for imposing curriculum change is the examination system. Because examinations have such enormous importance, particularly in developing countries (see Section 5.5.1), changes in their content, style or format have proved an effective means of enforcing change, even of inducing teachers to alter their teaching methods.

Also common are quasi-legal approaches to curriculum reform; what Prabhu (1987) refers to as 'statutory implementation'. In other words, policy statements, official syllabuses, ministry circulars prescribe what is to be done. There is no room for further argument.

Power-coercive strategies work - but only up to a point. While they may ensure the rapid installation of exogenous innovation, they cannot guarantee the 'internalisation' of the innovation by adopters. A result may be the phenomenon of 'disonnant adoption' (Rogers & Shoemaker 1971), where the visible but not essential elements of the innovation are adopted for display purposes. In education there is scope for this because teachers work in private settings and
are consequently not the objects of continued, close supervision. Another possibility is the discontinuation of implementation when the threat of sanctions is withdrawn, or when the preoccupations of the central authorities change.

Power-coercive strategies are, then, unreliable. They can work in some instances but may also produce resentment leading to perverse rejection of even beneficial innovations.

6.2.2 Rational-Empirical Strategies

Rational-empirical strategies assume that man is a rational creature who acts in accordance with self-interest once the benefits of a course of action are revealed. The main task of the innovator, then, is to demonstrate or to communicate the superiority of the proposed change over existing practice.

Because information is seen as a key factor, there is an emphasis on the dissemination process. Arising from this concern, several models of communication/dissemination have been developed. Of these, Havelock's R.D.&D Model (Section 6.1.2.4) probably most closely corresponds to the assumptions of the rational-empirical approach.

Another feature of some rational-empirical strategies is the notion of the 'change-agent'; a person who acts as a 'messenger' of innovation, conveying information to target groups and dispelling misconceptions.

One weakness of rational-empirical strategies is their implicit assumption that the values and beliefs of the innovating agency are correct and rational while those of the target population are potentially irrational. The value of the innovation tends to be assumed as a matter of course. Thus, when 'resistance' is encountered, it is attributed either to a failure in dissemination or to irrationality (or perversity) on the part of would-be adopters. What is overlooked is the possibility that users/adopters may, rationally, take a different view of the supposed benefits of the innovation. There is, then, an implicit tendency to downplay the critical capacities of target audiences.

Another weakness is the unrealistic 'consensus' assumption that a set of benefits can be objectively identified and assented to. More plausible, perhaps, is the supposition that innovation typically involves value-conflicts (Section 6.1.1.2). Where an innovation is incompatible with target group values, rational-empirical strategies are of little avail because they are not designed to bring about normative changes.
6.2.3 Normative–Re-educative Strategies

Normative-re-educative strategies assume that existing educational practices are supported not only by intellectual rationales but by norms and attitudes to which individuals consciously or unconsciously subscribe. The promotion of change, therefore, requires not merely a change in understanding but a shift in attitudes, relationships and normative orientations.

One device for accomplishing this is, once again, the 'change-agent'. Here, however, the change-agent is not so much a communicator as therapist. His role is to assist institutions in the identification of problems and in the selection of appropriate solutions. Two schools of thought inform this task. The first is described by Hurst (1983:16) as the 'human relations' school of Elton Mayo, and the second the 'group dynamics' school associated with Kurt Lewin.

The 'human relations' school is concerned to investigate the discrepancies between overt institution objectives and the covert, informal objectives of institution members; between official roles and actual relationships. Making these discrepancies explicit, and harmonising the personal objectives of institution members with the formal institutional objectives can, it is believed, enhance the likelihood of successful change.

In the 'group dynamics' school, attention is drawn to the psychological forces that cause the behaviour of groups to differ from that of their constituent individuals. In some circumstances, these forces cause rejection of change that might otherwise be tolerated. Therefore, if they can be understood and refocussed, one obstacle to adoption might be overcome.

The normative-re-educative approach has been criticised for its over-optimistic assumption that conflicts of interest can, in principle, be overcome. Some argue that differences of viewpoint may, on the contrary, reflect fundamental, irreconcilable divergences of interest.

Doubts are also entertained concerning the effectiveness of change-agents (Hurst 1983). Whilst helpful in some situations, they are, it is argued, a less significant factor in adoption than the quality of the innovation itself. If the target population takes an unfavourable view of the innovation itself, there is little the change agent can do.
6.2.4 Participatory Planning

A further implementation strategy which has gained popularity in western countries over recent years is that known as 'participatory planning'.

A number of empirical studies can be cited (eg. Lewin 1951; Coch & French 1948; Hurst 1983) in support of the principle of participation. Mainly based on industry, these purport to show that the participation of workers in decision-making helps create favourable attitudes to productivity-promoting innovations.

Such experimental findings can, however, be criticised on several grounds. First, not all studies report positive effects of participation. Second, variables are difficult to control. Therefore, even where positive attitudes to innovation are observed, it is not clear that it is participation in decision-making per se that is responsible.

There are other non-experimental criticisms. For example, participation can sometimes be more illusory than real - decisions may be manipulated through control of information. In education, there is also evidence (eg. the Smith & Keith 1971 case study of an elementary school's innovation) that participatory methods are ineffective. In Hurst's words (1982:19) they are ".... inefficient because they are excessively time-consuming and socially divisive because they exacerbate and polarise differences of opinion."

It is not obvious, also, that participatory methods are necessarily more democratic. The CERI/OECD (Vol 4:1974) studies on innovation suggest that the involvement of local groups in decision-making may in fact confer power on a narrow local elite; the power being used to obstruct changes others feel are desirable.

Similarly, with decentralisation. The potential of decentralisation to bring about more effective, responsive and flexible decision-making depends crucially on the quality of local administration. Where it lacks expertise, wrong decisions may be taken or change incompetently implemented. A mere change in the level at which decisions are taken does not per se guarantee an improvement in the quality of those decisions.

Despite these defects, participatory methods do have some advantages. First, they permit overt opposition to change, and this may, in fact, eliminate inappropriate innovations. Second, consultation with those affected by change
may be useful in the identification of implementation difficulties. Third, participatory decision-making encourages better relationships and more comprehensive appraisal of innovations. This may facilitate their long-term ‘institutionalisation’ as only those changes mutually agreed to be of benefit will be adopted.

6.3 Factors in the Implementation of Educational Change

From a review of strategies of implementation, and of theoretical approaches to the study of adoption/rejection decisions, we turn to a discussion of factors affecting implementation. These, again, are extracted from the relevant literature. The intention here, however, is to identify and articulate the factors in such a way as to generate a number of principles (or prescriptive guidelines) to guide the practical business of implementing change.

For convenience the factors are grouped into several categories. We start with teacher-centered factors.

6.3.1 Teacher-Centered Factors

Compatibility of an innovation with existing values has already been mentioned (Section 6.1.2.3) as a potentially important determinant of successful adoption/implementation. It is, however, a notion with different interpretations. Hurst’s (1983:58) is, perhaps, the most useful. For a change proposal to be favourably received, he argues:

“....the alleged outcomes of adoption must coincide with the participant’s value systems in such a way that they are perceived to be beneficial, either to the participants themselves or some group in which they take an altruistic interest.”

What, however, are the ‘participant’s value systems’? An account of the value-systems to which teachers typically adhere seems indicated; and this implies some understanding of the teacher’s subjective world and modes of thought.

6.3.1.1 The World of the Teacher: Implications for Implementation

Several writers (eg. Lortie 1975; Jackson 1967; Bennett 1976) have attempted descriptions of the teacher’s world. A few resulting observations are summarised below:
1. A major preoccupation of many teachers is discipline and classroom control.
2. Teachers largely work in isolation and, therefore, tend to struggle with problems in private. This inhibits the growth of an 'analytic orientation' toward teaching and impedes the evolution of a shared language through which criteria as to good practice can be established. The result is a sense of ambiguity and 'ad-hocness'. (Lortie 1975:136).
3. Teachers frequently experience uncertainty - basically, about what difference they make to learning.
4. Teachers refer to colleagues more often than other specialists for assistance, advice and information. However, this occurs rarely, and talk centres more on teaching tips than underlying principles.
5. Teachers often report a sense of a shortage of time.

From the above, a few implications can be educed. First, the preoccupation with issues of control implies that innovations are often assessed for their likely impact on classroom discipline. Second, the fact that teachers turn mostly to colleagues for help suggests that a greater degree of peer interaction may be a sound basis for an implementation strategy. Several research studies bear this out, as Fullan (1982:12) notes:

“Within the school, collegiality among teachers as measured by the frequency of communication, mutual support, help etc, was a strong indicator of implementation success. Virtually, every research study .... has found this to be the case.”

Noting the absence of an 'analytic orientation' among teachers, Doyle & Ponder (1977) suggest that teachers take an essentially pragmatic view (ie. they stress the uniqueness of individual classrooms, their concern is with immediate contingencies, they focus on the 'concrete and procedural rather than the abstract and general' (1977:5)). In particular, however, they assess change proposals in the light of what Doyle & Ponder (1977) refer to as 'a practicality ethic'.

6.3.1.2 The 'Practicality Ethic': The Teacher's View of Innovation

Practicality has three dimensions, all relating to perceived attributes of the innovation.

1. Instrumentality: To be 'practical', a proposal must have instrumental content; that is, it must contain descriptions of procedures that have a direct and realistic classroom application. Statements of principles, or of
intended outcomes, are non-instrumental because they do not refer to procedures, and do not address 'how-to' concerns.

2. **Congruence**: This has three aspects:
   a) the degree of fit between the procedures suggested and those normally employed in the classroom;
   b) perceptions of the experiential credentials of the proposer. A new procedure known to work in an urban school and proposed, say, by a university consultant may be rejected by the rural school teacher because the experiential credentials of the proposer are insufficiently compelling.
   c) the degree to which the change will affect prevailing teacher–student relationships. Substantial modification may be unacceptable.

3. **Cost** (or efficiency, Hurst 1983): This may be defined as a ratio between amount of return and amount of investment. For a given amount of time and effort an innovation should promise a better yield of a valued outcome than existing practice offers - a point sometimes overlooked by planners.

Hurst (1983) points out, for example, how condemnations of rote-learning methods ignore such cost–benefit perceptions. These methods are ineffective but work up to a point. In overcrowded, poorly equipped classrooms with ill-fed pupils, they may ensure some learning - more, perhaps, than discovery methods with their reliance on plentiful learning resources.

The same with audio–visual aids. Their use may require considerable effort in terms of booking, scheduling, setting up for returns little better than those yielded by conventional aids. In these circumstances it would be rational to reject the new aids as 'impractical'.

6.3.1.3 **In-Service Education and Professional Development**

Educational change demands the learning of new skills and the acquisition of new knowledge and attitudes. For this reason in-service education has commonly been identified as a key factor in the implementation of change. This much is not controversial. What is, however, is the form it should take.

Conventional styles of in-service education (e.g. the university course, the 'one-off' conference/workshop, the pre-implementation workshop) have been criticised for being 'ad-hoc' affairs, for not being systematically integrated into a programme of follow-up support, for a mistaken conceptualisation of the problem
of change (Fullan 1982).

For example, the university extension course is often criticised for being too theoretical. Even where it is 'practical', however, the ideas may be difficult to translate into practice because of course attendance patterns. Courses are commonly attended by single individuals from different schools rather than whole school departments. As a result, the enthusiastic but solitary messenger may have a difficult task convincing colleagues of the merits of the new idea, and persuading them to take on the risk of innovation.

Another in-service vehicle, the teacher's workshop, is useful in spreading awareness of new ideas but less so in assisting the translation of new knowledge into practice. This is partly because follow-through support is rarely built into the arrangements of such workshops, a common reason being shortage of funds.

The value of the pre-implementation workshop, the most common form of support to innovatory programmes, is not disputed. The problem is their timing and duration. Evidence from Berman & McLaughlin (1978) and Smith & Keith (1971) suggest that training confined to the pre-implementation stage is largely ineffective. It is only when teachers actually begin to implement the innovation that the most specific doubts and questions present themselves. Anxiety is also then at its greatest.

It is important, therefore, that support is readily available during, as well as prior to, initial implementation.

A further argument for continued in-service activity during implementation lies in Fullan's (1982:67) view of educational change. For him, major change requires a modification of role behaviour which, in turn, involves 'a process of resocialisation'. As the basis of 'resocialisation' is interaction (Fullan 1982), maximal opportunities for interaction not only with trainers but with peers should be maintained during the implementation period.

The importance of peer interaction is also mentioned by Elliot (1980:21). He sees access to each others' classrooms as an effective way of developing teachers' abilities to reflect on their work and to change their practice.

"....The more access teachers have to other teachers' classroom problems, the more they are able to bring about fundamental changes in their practice."
This does not imply that advice from external consultants is unwelcome. It is particularly helpful, it is suggested, when it focusses on 'the practical and the concrete'.

Elliot (1980) does not deny the importance of a theoretical component in in-service training. Without it, implementation may become mechanistic. Teachers may not understand the reasons for the change, which consequently may not endure. He says, however, that attempts at putting the new approach into practice are a necessary preliminary to theoretical reflection. Theory, in other words, is best appreciated in the light of practical experience.

6.3.1.4 Trialling Innovations

Innovation inevitably entails risks; risks that costs will outrun benefits and risks of unforeseen undesirable consequences. It also imposes what Macdonald & Rudduck (1971) refer to as 'a burden of initial incompetence', brought on as teachers struggle to master new practices.

It is helpful, then, if trial adoption of an innovation can be arranged (as is common in health and agriculture). Such trials can alleviate uncertainty, permit more realistic estimates of risks, and reveal areas where adaptation of the innovation is needed.

The importance of trial and experimentation is reflected in the increased use of first phase 'pilot projects' in innovative programmes. These are of value for the reasons indicated. However, there are some drawbacks.

The principal one is that pilot/experimental projects are often, in Crossley's (1984:84) words, "doomed to success". In other words, they are so carefully nurtured with attention and resources, that they turn out not to be replicable. In more routine environments the same degree of care cannot be sustained. Also, the Hawthorne effect is missing.

The public relations advantages of 'pilot projects' also cannot be guaranteed. The success of a pilot project in region x, impressive though it may seem, will not necessarily carry weight with teachers in region y. The differences they perceive between regions may make them doubt the practicality of the proposal in their specific circumstances.

The implication here is not that pilot trials are valueless. Rather that they do not obviate the need for all adopters to be given the opportunity to make their
own trials of an innovation. Where this is impossible, as it is with some innovations (see Section 6.1.2.3), then 'low levels of acceptance may ensue' (Hurst 1983:59).

6.3.1.5 The Complexity of an Innovation

Complexity is an attribute often associated with ease of implementation (Section 6.1.2.3). The association can, however, turn out to be tautologous or self-evident. It depends on how 'complexity' is conceptualised.

Fullan (1982:58) sees complexity as referring to ".... the difficulty and extent of change required of the individual responsible for change". Relevant here is Fullan's (1982) identification of three levels of educational change: (i) a change in instructional materials/technologies, (ii) a change in teaching style/activity, (iii) a modification in pedagogic beliefs/assumptions. Implementation may take place at one or all three levels.

Presumably, then, a change involving more dimensions (levels) may be deemed more complex than one involving fewer. Thus, if both new materials and a modification of teacher role behaviour are required, the change is more complex than one simply involving the introduction of new materials without corresponding role behaviour modification.

'Complexity' can also be interpreted with reference to communication. In general, it has been found that innovations involving reconceptualisation of teaching roles or modification of pedagogic assumptions are more difficult to implement than those concretely embodied in new materials or technologies. This is partly because they 'go deeper' (see above) but partly because they are less amenable to easy clarification and pose greater problems of understanding.

In this sense, complexity is a function of what Fullan (1982) refers to as 'clarity'. Not surprisingly, most studies indicate that where the goals of an innovation and its means of implementation are difficult to understand, unclear or vague, teachers have difficulties putting it into practice. Complex changes, then, are more difficult to implement because they are less easily clarified. This does not mean that they are undesirable. It simply reflects the fact that in complex innovations more is usually attempted.
6.3.2 School-and-System-Centered Factors

Many innovations are either school-wide in their application, or are adopted at school level. In the study of implementation it is, therefore, relevant to take the school as well as the individual adopter as a unit of analysis. In the following sections factors operating at school level are considered.

6.3.2.1 The Role of the Principal

Research indicates that the principal (or headteacher) plays an important role in innovation.

Berman & Mclaughlin (1978), for example, report that innovative projects enjoying the active support of the principal were the most likely to succeed. Hall et al (1977), likewise, suggest that variability in degree of implementation between schools is due to ‘the actions and concerns of principals’. For Fullan (1982:71), these actions are important because they ‘... serve to legitimate whether a change is to be taken seriously and to support teachers both psychologically and with resources.’

Hoyle (1969,1972) attributes the importance of the principal in innovation to the following factors:

1. his traditional authority in school policy and organisation.
2. his position, which grants an overview of the school and enables him to perceive where change is needed.
3. his contact with ‘messengers of innovation’ (eg. advisors/inspectors)
4. his accountability to higher authority who expect him to be a ‘prime mover’ in the implementation of change.

He also offers the following propositions to elucidate the relationship between the principal’s leadership style and the potential innovativeness of the school.

1. “The successfully innovative head will use persuasion rather than issue instructions.”
2. “The successfully innovative head will establish administrative procedures which emphasise flexibility rather than bureaucratic control.” (Hoyle 1972b).

It seems plausible, then, that the principal’s actions, and the quality and style of his leadership, significantly influence the likelihood of successful change. It is difficult, however, to manipulate this factor through planning as it is unclear how
leadership styles can be modified to enhance schools’ innovative capacity.

One possibility, suggested by Fullan (1982), is the prior training of principals to equip them with ‘knowledge and conceptions of the change process’. Besides the improvement of interpersonal skills, this might include information on ways in which successful principals had brought about change in their schools.

6.3.2.2 School Climate

The principal’s leadership style is also said to be of importance in shaping the ‘organisational climate’ of the school and in setting the tone for professional and administrative relationships. Climate, in turn, is held to be related to the innovative potential of the school, as Hoyle (1971:386) observes:

“Any appreciation of the innovative potential of a school is dependent on an understanding of its nature as a social system which includes such dimensions as its formal structure, administrative processes, informal structures and activities, and culture.”

It is difficult, however, to give substance to the notion of climate or culture. Miles (1965) mentions high morale and good communication as indicators of a ‘healthy climate’. Ultimately, though, it appears to boil down to the quality/openness of staff relationships. Where these are good, innovative potential is enhanced. This, as Hurst (1983) points out, is not surprising for interaction and openness between staff helps minimise the risks and anxieties that attach to innovation.

Halpin (1967) identifies types of ‘organisational climate’, ranging on a continuum from ‘open’ to ‘closed’, the open being the most favourable to innovation. Here, the principal establishes flexible administrative procedures and allows ‘leadership acts to emerge from his staff’.

Though interesting, this kind of description is of little assistance to the planner. It does not explain satisfactorily what determines variation in climate and consequently it does not indicate how ‘organisational climate’ might be modified.

The metaphor of climate is also somewhat vague in itself. Nevertheless, it may, Hoyle (1971) suggests, help the planner develop an image of the kind of school that is likely to be innovative.
6.3.2.3 Staff Turnover

High rates of staff turnover are held to be negatively related to the implementation, and in particular, institutionalisation, of innovations (Fullan 1982). Identification of the reasons is not difficult.

First, high turnover rates create an air of uncertainty and instability in which 'ad hoc' decisions or solutions hold sway. Second, the interaction between staff that is so important in implementation (Section 6.3.1.3) is impeded by the removal and replacement of members of the innovating team. Third, newcomers are unfamiliar with the innovation. In Fullan's (1982) terms, they “have not yet acquired a sense of meaning in relation to the change". Moreover, they often receive only a perfunctory orientation to the new programme.

6.3.2.4 Historical Antecedents of Attempts at Innovation

When a given innovation is introduced, many teachers/administrators will have already accumulated experience of previous attempts at reform. This psychological history is likely to influence attitudes toward subsequent innovation attempts. In particular, if past experience is negative, teachers may evince cynical or indifferent attitudes towards current proposals.

For this reason the planner needs to ascertain what the history of innovation has been. If it is unfavourable, the onus is on him to explain how the current attempt differs from previous failures.

Another relevant factor affecting implementation/institutionalisation is the motivation underlying initial adoption decisions. Fullan (1982) distinguishes two kinds of motivation: 'bureaucratically-oriented' decisions and 'problem-orientated' decisions.

In the former, symbolic, political, careerist or opportunistic (the social cachet of innovation) reasons motivate adoption. In the second, there is a genuine desire to address educational problems.

Clearly, 'bureaucratically-oriented' decisions have a negative effect on implementation. Those responsible may not make a serious effort to provide the requisite resources and support to follow through the decision. Also, the rank and file, sensing the motivation for adoption, may become indifferent to implementation.
6.3.3 The Management of Innovation: Management Factors

According to Hurst (1983:53), innovations are "... seldom, if ever, fully adapted to fit and function in the contexts for which they are proposed when they first emerge." Long periods of trial and error, experimentation and adaptation are, therefore, often necessary before the new ideas can be translated into practice. Even then, they may ultimately turn out to be worthless.

This process of trial and adaptation is also stressed by Fullan (1982). Fullan argues that the management of educational change requires an understanding of the multiple, subjective worlds of the participants in innovation. It also means being open to the ideas of others, allowing them to suggest alterations that may improve on the original design. This openness becomes more difficult, however, if the precise form a change should take has already been presupposed. Indeed, evidence is cited (Fullan 1982) that strong commitment to a particular version of an innovation may relate negatively to the ability to implement it. The argument, then, is against the fidelity approach to change and in favour of the 'mutual adaptation' perspective (see Section 6.2). In other words, gradual transformation of an initial idea is essential.

Because innovation involves trial and adaptation, and necessarily brings difficulties that cannot be fully determined in advance, innovative projects assume, in Hurst's (1983) view, the character of an experiment. It is this that sets them apart from quantitative projects whose aim is the expansion of educational infrastructure, and where the significant factors (eg. projections of populations, enrolments, salary, building costs) are determinable in advance. A further distinguishing feature is that in qualitative innovation it is the subjective perceptions of the change that are important.

These differences between quantitative and innovative projects mean that different managerial approaches are required. What is needed in innovation, in particular, is 'project monitoring' or 'implementation analysis'.

6.3.3.1 Project Monitoring

Hurst (1983:56) argues that in educational innovation too much emphasis has customarily been placed on the design and dissemination of the innovation. Implementation has usually been left to take care of itself.

"... people are led to believe that if only they take sufficient forethought, innovations can be implemented successfully."
This, he suggests, is "a profound mistake". Because innovation is experimental in character, continued implementation monitoring ("project monitoring") is needed. Monitoring here means the continued assessment of participants' reactions to the innovation, of the rate of adoption and level of use, as well as an analysis of difficulties in implementation. By this means, it is possible to take corrective action to overcome the inevitable difficulties and disincentives that arise in innovation.

Corrective action, Hurst (1983) suggests, can take three basic forms:

1. **Improving Communications**
   This may involve improving participants' knowledge/understanding of the innovation in various ways, or it may mean arranging better facilities for participants to feedback their experiences to project managers.

2. **Modifying the Innovation**
   This involves the redesign of the innovation to match users' requirements. Several versions of the innovation may be necessary. These may be produced centrally or in collaboration with users.

3. **Adaptation by Users**
   This may involve changes in the value-systems of participants such that they come to view the innovation differently, or it may mean supplementing the resource base of users (with materials, textbooks, time, money). Changes in value-systems are generally difficult to bring about in the short-term. It may therefore be necessary, Hurst (1983) suggests, to exclude those participants who do not share the innovation's perspective.

Whatever the form of corrective action indicated, the general principle is the same. It is to restore those conditions that make acceptance and implementation feasible, that minimise the risks to participants and that strengthen the perception that a change in practice will probably be an improvement.

### 6.3.3.2 Contingency Reserves

Corrective action is not possible, however, without substantial contingency reserves. Hurst (1983:61) points out that in conventional accounting arrangements it is customary to identify in advance the heads of expenditure and allow little modification in allocations. The ensuing, financial rigidity is, however, detrimental in innovation in that it inhibits new outlays of expenditure for swift, corrective action with respect to unforeseen implementation difficulties.
Hurst therefore proposes an alternative costing system which retains contingency reserves and permits the rapid reallocation of funds but without the loss of proper auditing control.

6.3.3.3 Managerial Training for Innovation

Both Fullan (1982) and Hurst (1983) note that most systems of educational management are better adapted to the routine maintenance of existing infrastructure (and facilities) than they are to the management of innovative projects.

In such systems hierarchies of decision-taking and communication are extensive, and there is frequent reference to higher authority for ratification of decisions. In the best innovative organisations, by contrast, chains of communication are short, and administrators enjoy considerable powers of discretion. This facilitates implementation analysis and swift, flexible response to difficulties.

Fullan and Hurst also point out that in conventional administrative systems planners usually have little, or no, training in the managerial skills required for innovation. They see their role as restricted to the provision of resources and the creation of the initial conditions for change. What is needed, then, is training in the special characteristics of innovative projects and in the appropriate managerial skills.

For Hurst (1983) this means training in 'implementation analysis' or 'project monitoring' (see Section 6.3.3.1). Fullan (1982), by contrast, identifies three types of knowledge/skills which are essential to the management of change, and which should therefore feature in training.

1. technical expertise in the content area of the change.
2. interpersonal skills (ie. the abilities to communicate, listen, motivate and gain trust).
3. "conceptual and technical skills pertaining to planning and implementation" (1982:92).

Of these, the last is most crucial, for, in Fullan's view, the ability to conceptualise the processes of educational change constitutes ".... the most generative resource for dealing with change." There has been, he argues, a neglect of the interpersonal and conceptual/organisational aspects of planning;
this neglect is an obstacle to the better management of the change process.

6.3.3.4 Time Horizons in Innovative Projects

One of the ways in which unfamiliarity with the change process can manifest itself is in the imposition of unrealistic time horizons on innovative projects. Some of the reasons for neglect of the time factor are summarised below.

Senior administrators are more closely involved in adoption decisions than in the implementation process. Their main concern is with project initiation and its final outcomes. They are, in short, more result- than implementation-orientated.

As a consequence, they are less likely to conceptualise implementation as a time-consuming process involving the gradual acquisition and internalisation by teachers of the meaning of a change. Even where there is recognition of the time needed for implementation, it can be politically unwise to admit a project will take years to come to fruition. In political/administrative circles there is often pressure for quick results.

For some writers (eg. Fullan 1982), unrealistic time horizons are a significant barrier to the implementation of change. They may, for example, result in inadequate logistical support as the transport and communication infrastructure struggles to keep up with delivery dates that always seem to arrive too quickly. Other problems may develop: perfunctory training programmes, hasty decisions, misinterpreted communications, and exhaustion occasioned by the effort of coping with innovation on top of continuing routine work.

It is important, then, that there be sufficient time for implementation and that schedules be flexible enough to accommodate the overcoming of unforeseen difficulties. At the same time, however, open-ended time horizons are inadvisable, for, as Fullan (1982:69) points out, they can "... create ambiguity about what is expected and when, and a lack of clarity about what constitutes progress." In short, what is needed is an accurate gauging of the time required for implementation. But this involves a proper conceptualisation of what the implementation of change involves - loss, anxiety and struggle and the gradual, individual discovery of a sense of meaning in relation to the change (Fullan 1982).
6.4 Conclusion: Guidelines for the Implementation of Change

It may be helpful to conclude with an enumeration of some prescriptive guidelines for the implementation of change arising from the preceding discussion. Their worth should, of course, be tested against practice.

1. A critical attitude should be adopted toward innovation proposals. The term 'innovation' has a seductive connotation, implying that change is necessarily for the better. This, however, is clearly not the case. Some innovations are not beneficial, others turn out to be worthless. The motivations underlying innovation proposals should also be scrutinised. Some are opportunistically motivated. In addition, exaggeration of the benefits accruing from innovation is common. As Fullan (1982:20) remarks:

"....the political economy of obtaining resources for the development and spread of the innovation requires overselling."

2. It is simplistic to attribute implementation difficulties to 'teacher resistance'. First, such a phrase is value-loaded. Second, strategies which allow rationality to the key actors, and seek to model their reasoning processes are more likely to reveal the true nature of implementation difficulties. Hence, they hold out the promise of greater implementation success.

3. Innovations are rarely fully adapted to the contexts of their proposed use. Trial and adaptation is, therefore, usually necessary. It is to be expected that unforeseen difficulties will emerge. In short, innovation is experimental in character. All this implies abandonment of the notion of faithful implementation, and tolerance for different versions of the innovation arising from adaptation by users.

4. For a change to be accepted, certain conditions should obtain; viz:

i) the innovation should be perceived as beneficial in terms of adopters' value-systems.

ii) it should be perceived as 'practical' (Doyle & Ponder 1977), and as feasible in its context of use.

iii) the probability of the alleged benefits accruing should be fairly high (ie. risks should be minimised).

iv) there should be a relative advantage over existing practice in terms of the returns yielded for a given investment of time, effort and other costs.

v) the credentials of the proposer should be credible. Also, the innovation
should be understood by adopters.
Where any of these conditions remain unfulfilled, the responsibility of the innovating manager is to bring about their establishment or their restoration. (Hurst 1983)

5. Innovation involves adopters acquiring 'a sense of meaning in relation to change', of coming to a gradual understanding of it, of overcoming feelings of anxiety and loss. Implementation is, then, as Fullan (1982:91) puts it, "... a process of clarification". This implies that implementation can be a time-consuming process. Thus, realistic amounts of time should be allocated to implementation.

6. In-service education is essential in most programmes of innovation. However, it should not be confined to the pre-implementation stage. Continued interaction with peers and advisors is necessary during implementation itself. One reason is that role behaviour change involves 'resocialisation', and the basis for resocialisation is interaction (Fullan 1982).

7. Because innovation is experimental in character, a different managerial style is needed. The essence of this is 'project monitoring', and the taking of 'corrective action' to overcome difficulties and disincentives as they arise. Corrective action, however, requires contingency reserves. Finally, many educational managers are unfamiliar with the skills required for the management of innovation. Therefore, they may need training in 'the conceptual and technical skills pertaining to ... implementation' (Fullan 1982:92).
CHAPTER 7
A DATA-COLLECTION INSTRUMENT
AND ITS APPLICATION

The case for contextual information as an essential resource in language planning in education has already been argued (Chapters 4 & 5), and need not be reiterated. Given this premise, the next step is to identify (and at the same time articulate a rationale for such identification) precisely those situational factors about which information is needed. It is this that has been an important purpose of preceding chapters. The result, to which we now come, is a framework (or instrument) intended to serve as a principled basis for information-gathering.

The emphasis here is on 'a principled basis'. There have been attempts through the form of British Council Educational and ELT Profiles to document contextual features of language teaching situations, and to so provide an information resource of service to curriculum developers, KELT officers and the like. The impression derived, however, from a reading of such profiles is that they are constructed on a largely 'ad-hoc' basis. They seem to be intuitively rather than theoretically inspired, to have no formally realised rationale. Furthermore, though perhaps not intended for such a purpose, they are generally insufficiently detailed to function realistically as a resource for curriculum planning; nor do they provide an adequate basis for comparative research.

The claim made here is not that the present framework (instrument) is wholly adequate but that it is an improvement on the existing situation because it has an underlying, explicitly argued rationale (derived from a reading of a wide range of literature), and it thus provides a 'principled basis' for the collection of relevant information on, in principle, any teaching situation.

7.1 Description of the Instrument

The instrument (framework) in question is nothing more than a taxonomy of situational factors. It cannot be described as a model as no attempt has been made to 'weight' the factors, or to specify a process whose undergoing might generate predictions or lead to definite conclusions. To do so would require a general, integrated theory of language teaching, culture and society that is manifestly lacking. In these circumstances a 'model' would only constitute a spurious claim to a greater degree of knowledge, precision and objectivity than is available, or perhaps attainable. One should also remember that in language planning in education, as in other social science endeavours, judgement,
interpretation and insight have a role that cannot as yet be substituted by calculation or computation.

Presented below, then is an instrument setting out the range of situational factors on which planners need information:

1. **Background Factors:**
   - demography (population, urban/rural, growth rates, age distribution)
   - politics (political system, structure, ideology, stability)
   - economy and society (GNP, economic structure characteristics and conditions, trading patterns, labour force distribution)
   - religion and culture (influence on education)

2. **Language Situation:**
   - language demography
   - language functions and status
   - language attitudes and usage
   - language planning activities and agencies
   - language history

3. **The Education System:**
   - the overall structure of education
   - educational aims/objectives and philosophy
   - the structure of education at primary, secondary, tertiary level, (eg. enrolments, pupil:teacher ratios, progression and attrition rates, number of schools, regional distribution of schools/enrolments, structure of the general curriculum)
   - educational expenditure
   - the history of education

4. **The Language Curriculum:**
   - evolution of language education policy
   - official (and actual) time allocations for language teaching
   - aims/objectives of language instruction
   - official syllabuses (design and content)
   - textbook availability/textbooks used
   - officially prescribed/recommended teaching methodology
   - supplementary materials/equipment
   - exposure to language outside subject classes

5. **The Examination System:**
   - outline of major school examinations
   - functions of examinations
   - setting, administration and marking patterns
   - content, design of language examinations

6. **Learners:**
- academic attainment levels (general)
- language proficiency/achievement
- ages
- motivation and attitude
- learning styles/expectations
- class size/composition
- learners outside the formal education system

7. Teachers:
- qualifications/education
- age and experience
- pedagogic competence
- language proficiency
- teaching style and methods
- teaching load
- morale and motivation (housing, salaries, working conditions)
- teacher-training (the curriculum, the tutors)
- in-service training provision
- teacher support facilities
- teacher supply

8. The Material Context:
- school buildings
- classroom accommodation/furnishing
- textbooks/teaching materials

9. The Machinery for Curriculum Development:
- control over the curriculum
- agencies of curriculum development/implementation
  (their organisation, functions, status)

Having specified the range of factors, we can now describe the relationship obtaining between them. In part, but only in part, this has been done through the argument of the preceding chapters. The fact is that such is the complexity of the web of interactions that a succinct, accurate description is difficult to achieve. Nevertheless, it seems desirable to attempt a depiction at a gross level of the relationship of major factors. This is done through the following simple diagram – an effort at visual clarification.
Figure 10: Contextual Factors in Language Curriculum Planning

The outer circle of the diagram represents the background factors of language situation, politics, economy etc. These are pervasive, directly or indirectly affecting the curriculum, teaching and learning. As Kennedy (1987:166) puts it:

"...views on the educational process and what happens or should happen in classrooms between teacher and student are ultimately context-specific, and derived from the culture and society in which the learning takes place."
machinery for curriculum development, the examination system and material resources) which, for reasons already discussed (Chapter 5), has a significant influence on the implementation of the language curriculum.

Finally, in the inner circle are the factors which have the most direct impact on language teaching, but which are themselves subject to wider societal influences - learners, teachers and the language curriculum itself.

The curriculum planner has no control over the factors in the outer circle, whose influence, though powerful, is mediated by factors more immediately related to the language curriculum. For this reason the level of informative detail required will be less than that needed in respect of factors in the inner circle, whose impact is most direct, and over which the planner has greater control. The general pattern is, then, that as one moves inwards, there is a need for greater specificity of information.

7.2 Application of the Instrument

We now come to an application of the above framework (instrument) to the description of a language teaching situation. Several reasons can be advanced for such an enterprise.

First, it is necessary simply in order to find out what the resulting description will look like. Does it in fact facilitate the gathering of relevant information which provides an illuminating, useful description of the situation? Is the way the information is structured helpful or confusing? The description may also help indicate points at which the framework needs refinement or revision. For example, are any significant factors omitted?

Second, the process of information-gathering provides an opportunity for an investigation of the amount, or level of detail, of information that seems appropriate with respect to each factor. It also permits a check on the practicality of the framework. Are there, for example, simply too many factors such that the information gathered becomes unwieldy or confusing?

Third, (for a quite different reason) the description based on the framework will establish a firm context for the illustration/discussion of some of the principles of innovation/change management raised in Chapter 6.

Finally, if the framework is useful, the resulting description should stand on its own merits as a worthwhile information resource. It is worth noting here that by
information-gathering one does not simply mean the passive recording of 'objective facts' (if that is possible) but the application of interpretation to data. The profile assumes in some respects, then, the character of an 'illuminative evaluation', the object of which, in Parlett and Hamilton's (1977) terms is to "... provide a comprehensive understanding of the complex reality (realities) surrounding the (teaching) programme."

The country chosen for this exercise is Tanzania. Again, one should cite reasons for the choice.

The first group are pragmatic. The language teaching situation in Tanzania is reasonably, if not prolifically, documented. It is also a country of which I have no personal teaching experience. There is no question, then, of basing the description on personal impressions. In fact, the profile is based entirely on library resources. The last point is important for cost-benefit reasons. If a useful profile can be constructed, it demonstrates that in one instance at least the framework can be applied without a great input of resources.

Second, Tanzania is itself an interesting subject for a case study. It has a language situation that is in some respects unique in Africa. At the same time it faces a wide range of language teaching problems, some country-specific, others illustrative of the type of problems encountered in many Third World countries. It, therefore, provides a useful context for the discussion of planning principles at the level of curriculum change/renewal.

The profile of Tanzania is presented in Appendix 1. The main focus is on English language education in the formal school system.

7.3 Conclusions/Discussion

The conclusions fall into two parts: those relating specifically to the language education situation in Tanzania described in the profile in Appendix 1, and those relating to the framework described in 7.1. Let us take Tanzania first.

7.3.1 The Language Education Situation in Tanzania: A Discussion

As revealed in the profile (Appendix 1), all education in Tanzania, not merely English language education, is in a dismal condition. The following appear to be among the main factors responsible:

- economic crisis (see profile: Section One) resulting in a breakdown of the
education infrastructure (eg. no books, materials; badly maintained facilities/buildings; inadequate transport for inspectors, for delivery of supplies; poor training facilities; ill-paid teachers).

- confusion and vacillation in language education policy, particularly over the medium at secondary level. This has contributed to a decline in the standard of English over and above that which might have been anticipated given the change to Swahili medium at primary level, and the reduced societal status/role of English.

- ineffective teaching (caused in part by language problems, inadequate books/facilities, poor training) – exacerbated by inappropriate syllabuses and examinations (see profile: Sections 4,5,6,7).

- weaknesses/inefficiencies in the administrative structure of education, in educational policy and its implementation (eg. curriculum diversification, ESR), and in management (see profile: Sections 3,4,9).

The point here, however, is not to elaborate on the reasons for the crisis in English language education, let alone the wider crisis of Tanzanian socialism, but to discuss some possible corrective measures in the light of the recommendations/analysis of the Criper/Dodd report (1984), the planning principles introduced in Chapter 6, and the information contained in the profile (Appendix 1). The discussion will have to be brief, and the comments made tentative and exploratory rather than conclusive.

7.3.1.1 Guidelines for the Management/Implementation of Educational Change

Before discussing any corrective measures, it is useful to restate a number of principles that may inform change recommendations. There are as follows:

1. As far as possible, existing administrative structures should be utilised for the implementation of change. New structures should only be created where absolutely necessary.

   "Better to take what already exists, what is already under way, and try to render it more effective." (Hayes 1983:18)

2. Innovations/changes are rarely fully adapted to the context of their proposed use. Trial, adaptation, and tolerance for resulting modification is, therefore, necessary.

3. Exercising foresight prior to implementation is necessary and proper but it will not prevent difficulties and disincentives arising. Corrective action, is, thus, invariably necessary, and this means the retention of contingency
reserves (of money, time, etc).
Difficulties more often arise as a result of 'micro' factors – small, but crucial details – than of 'macro' factors. 'Macro' strategic planning is thus often easier than tactical implementation).

4. If training is required, it should be applied directly to the target population, the teachers themselves.
(This implies the abandonment of the training of trainers of trainers – the 'pyramid model' of aid for teacher education. Multiplier effects do not work because of dilution of expertise, erosion of commitment, leakage of time, wastage of personnel (transfer to other posts); as one moves down the pyramid)⁹.

5. The change programme (project) should have the capacity to become self-sustaining, independent.
(Very high levels of external support in the initial stages of a project/programme are negatively related to long-term institutionalisation of change).

6. The objectives of change should be clear and communicated directly to participants.

7. The outcomes of proposed change should be perceived as desirable and feasible in terms of participants’ value systems and working conditions respectively.

8. The risk of innovation/change should be reasonable to participants. (One way of reducing perceived risks is to provide opportunities for trial of the innovation). There should also be rewards for participation.

9. The change proposals should have instrumental content – they must describe procedures that are seen to have a direct, realistic classroom application.
(Teachers usually learn more from observations of procedures in real classrooms than they do from talks or written instructions on principles/objectives.)

10. Pre-implementation training is necessary but not sufficient. The most specific doubts and difficulties arise during acts of implementation. Therefore, on-going support and training during implementation is necessary. Also, role behaviour change requires 'resocialisation' and this means sustained interaction not only with trainers but within the peer

⁹I am indebted to a talk by Patricia Ahrens on 'A Mass Teacher Training Project in West Bengal' for helping to clarify this idea.
group.
11. The experiential credentials of trainers (change advocates) should be credible/plausible to participants.

7.3.1.2 An Appraisal of Reform Proposals for Tanzania

Change proposals are now appraised in the light of the above guidelines. They are briefly discussed under the headings below.

First, however, there is a general point to be made: if English language education in Tanzania is to improve, there is a need both for increased inputs and more effective exploitation of existing ones. Severe economic constraints, a growing population and expansion in schooling (see profile: Sections 1.3) preclude a major allocation of new inputs. Therefore, the main emphasis has to fall on more effective utilisation of existing resources/structures.

1. Policy:
The Criper/Dodd report (1984) points out the damaging effects of uncertainty/speculation about policy on English medium education. It is clearly sensible, then, that this uncertainty be ended with a clear policy commitment. English language instruction from Standard 3 (primary) is a clear case of inefficient use of resources. However, a policy change here would not only be politically problematic but complicate and confuse an already difficult situation. Thus, things are best left as they are.

2. Administration:
The Criper/Dodd report recommends the integration of the Institute of Education (now the ICD) into the Ministry of Education. It is desirable that this process of integration encompass the National Examinations Council and the Inspectorate. It is inefficient for the machinery for curriculum development to be institutionally separate from the machinery for examinations development. The two should work in tandem, and be co-ordinated with the implementation machinery of the Ministry (see Section 5.6.2).
A further priority is to increase the efficiency of the existing implementation machinery. This means providing the existing inspectorate with the capacity (better transport) to deliver support to teachers in schools, as well as strengthening the expertise available in the ICD. An investigation of the efficiency (or lack of it) or the distribution of educational supplies (through Tanzania Elimu Supplies), and of possible
corrective measures, is also indicated.

3. The Language Curriculum:

(i) Books: The provision of more textbooks of all kinds is urgently needed, and would perhaps be the greatest single contribution to the raising of standards (see Section 5.1.2.2). Book provision would have to be externally funded.

Very detailed consideration needs to be given to the safe storage/maintenance of new book stocks.

The Extended Reading Programme, proposed by Criper/Dodd (1984), is a potentially important contributor to the raising of standards. However, its implementation could be problematic for the following reason.

For the scheme to operate as intended it is necessary that books be released for reading outside classroom hours. But, in a situation where books are scarce, they become a valued commodity. This increases the likelihood of serious attrition from the stock. Teachers may react by disallowing book-borrowing outside classroom hours (thus maintaining control over the stock). However, if books can only be read in the classroom, valuable time will be diverted from other teaching areas, in particular examinable topics. Teachers may, therefore, resist the implementation of the scheme.

What seems needed, then, are (i) reserves of replacement books (contingency reserves), and, perhaps, (ii) adaptations to the scheme to fit it to its context of proposed use.

(ii) Syllabuses/Examinations: Syllabus change is clearly needed at secondary level (Cycle 1 & 2). Current syllabuses are inappropriate to the level of students' English. Moreover, there is too great an emphasis on literature (Form 4 syllabus), and on stylistics/language analysis (Form 6 syllabus) to the detriment of the development of students' proficiency in using the language (see profile: Section 4).

Notwithstanding the need, immediate investment in large scale syllabus revision, or textbook writing projects, would be an inefficient use of resources. It would be a long time before the investment showed a return. It would divert resources from the implementation of immediate improvements in a situation that calls for a swift response. Additionally, there is little evidence that it is the most cost-effective way of raising standards where it counts, at school level.

A (power-coercive) measure of more immediate effect might be the revision and improvement of existing examinations at primary, Form 4 and
Form 6 levels. For a start, the continuous assessment component should be abandoned, as Criper & Dodd suggest. A further step might be the replacement of the Language 3 (literature) CSE paper with one aimed at the assessment of proficiency in reading/writing/grammar skills. This would have the effect of encouraging greater teaching emphasis on language skills, not literature content. At the same time the quality of the examinations (and their suitability to the level of the pupils) needs to be improved.

In general, examination reform is one of the most potent instruments for bringing about immediate change in syllabus content and emphasis, if not teaching skill (see Section 5.5).

(iii) **English medium 'conversion' course:** The Criper/Dodd (1984) recommendations of (i) a six-month conversion course to English medium for Form 1 entrants and (ii) a compulsory study skills in English course for all Form 5/6 students are sensible.

The implementation of the conversion course (involving participation by subject teachers) is possibly problematic, however. It requires not only an improvement in subject teachers’ confidence and competence in using English, in-service training, and the design of a new ‘integrated’ course but also attitude change in the form of a re-appraisal of teachers’ professional identities and loyalties in the context of a subject-oriented, ‘collection-code’ curriculum (see Section 4.1.3.2). In short, the scope of change that is envisaged is considerable.

A more modest alternative might be to increase significantly the number of periods allocated to Form 1 English (say, to 15 periods per week), and to involve a few selected, competent subject teachers from two or three departments only. These would function for the period of the ‘conversion’ course as auxiliary English teachers.

4. **Teachers, Teacher Education and Teaching:**

Criper and Dodd (1984) recommend a number of much-needed changes to pre-service teacher education curricula at both university and college level. The main thrust is toward:

(i) the improvement of trainees’ language proficiency (a three-month intensive English course for all Diploma trainees, language improvement exclusively for Grade A trainees), and

(ii) a greater emphasis on practical classroom methodology in the professional component of university/diploma courses.

The intention here is not to comment on the details of these proposals...
but rather to consider the crucial matter of in-service training provision. An initial consideration is the content and objectives of in-service training for secondary level teachers. And, second, the form in which such training should be delivered.

As regards content, the aim in my opinion should be to inculcate sound methods of language teaching within an overall structural approach, taking the existing syllabus, imperfect as it is, as a point of departure. There should be no attempt to train teachers in a communicative methodology. The following are the reasons:

(a) a 'communicative' approach is (paradoxically) difficult to explain/communicate to teachers outside of a first world training context. In any case, the criteria of 'communicativism' remain unclear and are the subject of on-going dispute.

(b) a 'communicative' methodology presupposes a sufficiency of learning resources and a high level of communicative proficiency on the part of teachers.

(c) 'communicativism' is not congruent with the prevailing teaching milieu. Most teaching across the curriculum emphasises the transmission of 'objective' knowledge by an authoritative 'knower'. Teacher-student relationships are formal, and there is a predominance of teacher-centered teaching (see profile: Sections 6,7).

It would be unrealistic, then, to expect instruction in the English lesson to diverge sharply from the practices and expectations which are entrenched in other curricular subjects. The process of change in pedagogy and role behaviour is very slow (involving a resocialisation of learners and teachers).

Structural language teaching, however, is more easily assimilated to the dominant model of 'objective' knowledge transmitted by an authoritative teacher (see Section 4.1.3.1). Accordingly, it possesses greater congruence, and would be perceived as more 'practical' in the Tanzanian school context.

Whilst not absolutely the most efficient teaching approach, structural language teaching can, given good practice within its framework, accomplish a good deal. What matters most is the way teachers exploit established techniques and their clarity about what they are doing, rather than the overall bias of the approach.

(d) In what is theoretically an English medium (though we know this is not actually the case in Tanzania at present) there should be opportunities to
use the language for communication in other subject classes. The aim in the English class, therefore, should be to explicitly and directly facilitate the 'grammar construction' process through structural teaching.

We now turn to the crucial question of how in-service education might be delivered. Residential, college-based, pre-implementation courses are of restricted usefulness for reasons already indicated. Greater emphasis should be placed, then, on on-site training, in schools and regional teachers' centres. This implies a cadre of 'resource teachers' or semi-mobile teacher trainers.

One idea would be to use selected teachers plus, at the outset, a substantial number of expatriate (VSO) volunteers. These persons would be attached to particular secondary schools (perhaps one/two in each region) where they would function as part-time English teachers. For the greater part of their time, however, they would tour secondary schools in the same region (not more than four per trainer) on a rotating basis conducting 2/3 week courses during normal teaching hours.

Training would take the form of collaborative work with teachers translating the syllabus into lesson plans, and then executing the plan through team-teaching in the classroom. The result would be jointly evaluated and feed into subsequent lesson plans. It would be unrealistic, of course, to expect all teachers to participate with equal enthusiasm. Therefore, the greatest training effort would be directed at those exhibiting interest and commitment. In time, these teachers might exert a beneficial influence on their more reluctant colleagues.

It is obvious that the 'resource teachers' above would carry a heavy burden of responsibility. Therefore, there would have to be rewards in the form of scholarships for further UK-based training for successful or committed trainers. Furthermore, salaries would have to be commensurate with their duties. They would have to have access to reasonable transport. Becoming a 'resource teacher' should be seen as promotion. All this would be costly (but not unduly so) and would, therefore, require the commitment of external aid funds.

Alongside 'resource teachers', greater emphasis should be placed (on the lines

---

10 A similar scheme could, in principle, operate at primary level.
suggested in the Presidential Commission Report 1982) on the creation of teachers' centres – at least one per region at secondary level. Almost any building could serve. Ideal would be one located near an existing school or college. The function of such centres would be to act as:

(i) a recreational/social meeting place.
(ii) a place for organising meetings, discussion groups, ‘ad-hoc’ seminars. In particular, a meeting place for regional/district teachers' associations.
(iii) a resource centre where textbooks or learning aids might be available for consultation.

Of course, such centres would not initially be able to serve all teachers because of factors of distance and transport. Nevertheless, a start would be made, and such centres could play an important role in strengthening the professional interaction that is an ingredient of successful change.

While on the subject of interaction, it is worth remarking that funding for the establishment of classroom-oriented teacher newsletters/journals, and for the administration of associations of teachers of English, could be a highly cost-effective investment.

In summary, there is a clear need for the revision of pre-service teacher education curricula both to improve pedagogic skills in second language teaching, and, above all, to raise trainees' proficiency in English. Also necessary, as Criper & Dodd suggest, is a greater output of specialist teachers of English language (not literature graduates), and their more efficient deployment. This should not, however, distract attention from the need for continuing in-service support to sustain teachers' morale and to strengthen their professional skills.

The purpose of this last section has been to make some suggestions as to how this support might best be delivered. They are clearly informed by the principles previously introduced (Section 7.3.1.1). Their obvious and unavoidable limitation is that they are based on second not first-hand experience. The point, however, has not been to do planning but to illustrate in context how some principles of curriculum change/renewal might be applied to remedying the dismal situation indicated in the profile of Tanzania (Appendix 1).
7.3.2 The Data-Collection Framework: An Appraisal

The claim made for the data-collection framework was that it provides a principled basis for the collection of relevant information on language teaching situations. The information so collected should function as a resource for curriculum planning, and be a basis for comparing language teaching situations. Given the available evidence (profile in Appendix 1), can this claim be sustained?

In answer, we observe that the framework has provided an adequate basis for the construction of a profile of the language education situation in Tanzania. The profile is reasonably comprehensive in its coverage, and level of detail. It discloses the areas of weakness in English language education, remedies for which have been discussed in Section 7.3.1.3. As such, it could claim to offer an adequate introductory guide to English language education in the Tanzanian context.

That said, there are shortcomings. These concern not so much the framework (instrument) itself whose merits, or otherwise, rest on the underlying theoretical argumentation, but the structuring of information within the profile.

First, there is a need at various points for greater economy of description. Helpful in this regard would be the development of summary measures, or typologies, of various contextual variables, standardised so as to facilitate international comparisons of language teaching situations. In the absence of standardised measures and consistency of definition, rigorous comparative study becomes difficult (a key conceptual problem of comparative study being the stability/consistency of the entity/trait compared – like with like). In this regard, the framework by virtue of its identification of relevant contextual variables, affords the opportunity for approximate comparisons but does not, without further processes of standardisation, permit more rigorous comparative investigation. The problems involved in constructing these standardised, summarising devices, and interpreting them, cannot be dwelt on here but are significant.

A second issue is the need to improve the architecture of the profile to permit greater ease in retrieving specific information, and in cross-referencing.

\[11^\text{After all, a major problem of educational research is that measures of broad phenomena (e.g. teacher quality, home background quality) lack a meaningful, independent scale.}\]
This, however, is perhaps best accomplished in the context of an effort to establish a computerised database system for the storage of information on language teaching situations. A design for, or description of, such a system lies outside the scope of the present piece of work. It can only be said that a utilisation of available information technology would permit easier retrieval of information, thereby assisting comparative study of language teaching situations. It would also allow easier updating of information – a perennial problem of profiles being that the course of events swiftly renders them outdated. This, then, is perhaps the next step forward.
CHAPTER 8
CONCLUSIONS AND IMPLICATIONS

This thesis is primarily a non-empirical work of synthesis and evaluative
reflection which takes as its guiding principle the notion that in order to
construct a defensible, functionally effective curriculum detailed consideration of
context is essential. Here, the thesis draws inspiration from 'naturalistic'
curriculum theory, as expounded by its leading figure, Schwab (1969, 1971, 1973,
1983).

Naturalistic curriculum theory, in contrast to 'rational systematic theory', sees
curriculum development as largely a matter of practical reasoning, of 'deliberative
judgement' in which means (resources) and ends (values) must be treated
simultaneously as mutually determining each other. What Schwab (1973) refers
to as 'the four commonplaces of education' (subject-matter, teacher, student and
milieu) are of intrinsically equal importance. None should be allowed to dominate
curriculum deliberation unless, in Schwab's words (1973:509), ".....that domination
is conscious and capable of defense in terms of the circumstances." The upshot
is that there is no right curriculum solution, only a more efficient one relative to
other alternatives available in the situation.

Working on this basis, the thesis describes contextual factors that need to be
encompassed in curriculum deliberation. A framework of contextual factors is
then devised permitting the principled gathering of information (Chapter 7).

Future work should proceed in two directions. First, there is a need for
refinement of the framework - the devising of standardised summary measures,
standardised definitions, typologies, allowing more precise international
comparisons - and the storage of information so collected in an appropriately
engineered computer data bank. The aim here would be to create an information
resource for comparative study of language teaching policies and their
implementation, eg. languages taught, methods and materials used, teacher
education and in-service training programmes, teacher proficiency and
competence, student proficiency levels and so on.

Second, empirical investigation of some of the contextual variables discussed
in Chapter 5 seems indicated. Textbook availability, for example, emerges as
particularly significant. There is evidence of a stable, direct effect on student
achievement (Heyneman, Farrell, Sepulveda-Stuardo (1981). An indirect effect is
also hypothesised through the influence on teacher behaviour. Where students
have few textbooks, teachers may spend more time lecturing, writing on the blackboard, dictating from the textbook, all practices which can be wasteful of time and energy. In other words, more textbooks may be a necessary condition for more effective teaching techniques. What is called for, therefore, is a study of the effect of textbook availability on student achievement in language subjects. Investigation might proceed through a combination of:

(i) Survey research using multivariate analyses (eg. regression analysis, or where this is too coarse, path analysis) - to eliminate spurious correlations.

(ii) Small-scale experimental interventions.

(iii) Process studies (ie. classroom observation).

Similar research could be conducted into other variables which are subject to policy manipulation, eg. teacher language proficiency and class size. We need, for instance, to know more about the relative contributions of teacher language proficiency and training in pedagogy to student achievement.

Class size is important for its implications for costs. If, for example, it can be raised by 5% without detriment to achievement, there is obvious potential for savings. It may be that there are threshold levels between, say, 20 and 40 pupils, within which increases in numbers have no effects on quality. At present, we just do not know. Again, therefore, one recommends research to investigate these and related matters.

Finally, one should not forget the crucial influence of examinations on the curriculum, as detailed in Chapter 5. There is ample justification, then, for investment in examination research and development. In most developing countries one cannot expect curricular reform to achieve success without an accompanying programme of examination reform. Examinations are a crucial pressure point for change.

A related area for research is that of cost-effectiveness. As Obura (1985:418) notes, there is "...a dearth of studies which relate issues of language in education directly and overtly to costs." There appear, indeed, to be few which even raise the basic economic concept of opportunity cost (that in a world of scarcity a given allocation of resources entails the foregoing of other possible allocations).

We do not really know, for instance, if, and in what circumstances, language
improvement for teachers has a better pay-off than methodology training. We do not know if residential in-service teacher training with its high unit costs is more or less cost-effective than on-site training, and under what conditions. We do not know much about the relative costs of primary education in a vernacular as against a world or national language. Are textbook writing projects a more effective channel for aid than other alternatives?

If language planning in education is to make progress over the long term, it is desirable that these matters be investigated as a complementary to contextual analysis. The question is how.

The first step might be to conduct studies into the effect of selected variables on student achievement along the lines outlined above. The second would be investigate the cost implications of changes to the inputs hypothesised as related to achievement. The overall analytical framework, then, is that of cost-effectiveness analysis (see Chapter 5).

Broadly, this is a method for exploring the costs of alternative ways of delivering the same quantity of output (achievement), or for comparing the output levels attained with different combinations of inputs, thus allowing the identification of the greatest level of output attainable at a given cost.

It is important, however, to be aware of the limitations of cost-effectiveness analysis. In education, alternative projects usually differ in both costs and output levels, and in this situation cost-effectiveness analysis does not by itself provide a basis for choice. It also does not prove that one form of teacher education is superior to another, or that supplying more textbooks is better than in-service training. That is not its function. Many other assumptions and judgements about quality need to be taken into consideration. There are also the methodological difficulties of devising sensitive measures of output quality and incorporating them into cost-effectiveness analysis. Measures, or estimates, of costs and output are rarely precise.

That said, cost-effectiveness analysis provides a framework for the systematic comparison of the costs of alternative ways of delivering a given level of output. It imposes a discipline on judgements about which course of action is preferable. It obliges the planner to quantify arguments in terms of the effect on cost and output levels (achievement). It might also, as Obura (1985:418) hints, "stimulate thinking along new lines and provoke a review of current policies and practices in the light of new information."
Such new thinking is particularly needed in relation to the medium of initial education and the role of the mother tongue where the debate has acquired a certain sterility – perhaps because the quantitative implications of the various arguments have not been fully investigated. Too often they are detached from considerations of costs, from wider goals of social and national development, and from the context of implementation.

In summary, cost-effectiveness analysis could be usefully applied in all those situations where demographic pressures and the associated strain on resources demand the identification of the least costly ways of delivering effective language education.

There are, however, practical problems in applying the framework to language education concerns. The kind of research referred to is large-scale and expensive. There is also the question of training. Most language planners have little familiarity with the quantitative techniques of cost-effectiveness analysis and would presumably, therefore, require some instruction. The need speaks for the interdisciplinary character of language planning in education.

Another guiding idea in the thesis is the need for applied linguists involved in planning to give greater attention to the conceptualisation and management of change in education. This is necessary because applied linguists are often involved in the administration of aided curriculum development projects in ELT in Third World countries (see Hayes 1983; Bowers 1983). Their expertise, however, lies primarily in the substantive content area of change rather than in the 'conceptual and technical skills pertaining to planning and implementation' (Fullan 1982:92).

What is required, therefore, is an increased emphasis on training in the management of innovation so as to impart the ability to better conceptualise the process of educational change, and hence deal with it more effectively. In this regard, it is pleasing to note that in the last year a small, but publicly available literature has grown up within applied linguistics on educational innovation and its management (ELT Journal, 41,3: Kennedy 1987; Kourago 1987; White 1987).

It is now necessary that this literature be expanded in size, range, and sophistication. More detailed reports on the implementation of aided ELT projects, and illuminative evaluations of implementation strategies related to a broader conceptual framework of planning implementation would be useful.
Illustrated here once again is the interdisciplinary character of language planning in education. If this brings complexity to the field, and increases the risk of incompetence, it also adds to its interest.
GENERAL BIBLIOGRAPHY


Alexander, L & Simmons, J (1975) The Determinants of School Achievement in Developing Countries: The Educational Production Function. World Bank Staff Working Paper No 201: Washington DC.


Cronbach, L J (1963) Course Improvement through Evaluation. Teachers College Record. 64, pp672–83.


Eicholz, G & Rogers, E (1964) Resistance to the Adoption of Audio–Visual Aids by


Fishman, J A (1977d) The Spread of English as a new Perspective for the Study


Oxford: Oxford University Press.


Heyneman, S; Farrell, J & Sepulveda-Stuardo, A (1981) Textbooks and


Kloss, H (1969) *Research Possibilities on Group Bilingualism*. Quebec:
International Center for Research on Bilingualism.


Rubin, J (1977c) Indonesian Language Planning and Education. In Rubin, J et al


Saville, M R & Troike, R C A Handbook of Bilingual Education. Washington: TESOL.


Spolsky, B (1977) The Establishment of Language Education in Multilingual


CONTENTS

Section One: Background Factors
- Land and People
- Demography
- Politics
- Economy and Society
- Religion and Culture

Section Two: Language Situation
- Language Demography
- Language Functions and Status
- Language Attitudes and Usage
- Language Planning Activities and Agencies
- Language History

Section Three: Education System
- An Outline of the National Education System
- Level 1 Schooling: Basic Structure
- Level 2 Schooling: Basic Structure
- Level 3 Education: Basic Structure
- Educational Expenditure: An Outline
- The History of Education in Tanzania

Section Four: The Language Curriculum (English)
- The Evolution of Language Education Policy
- The Language Curriculum at Level 1
- The Language Curriculum at Level 2 Cycle 1
- The Language Curriculum at Level 2 Cycle 2
Section Five: The Examination System
- Introduction
- The Primary School Leaving Examination (PSLE)
- The Form 4 Examination (CSE)
- The Form 6 Examination (ACSE)

Section Six: Learners
- Learners at Level 1
- Learners at Level 2
- Learners Outside the Formal Education System

Section Seven: Teachers
- Teachers at Level 1
- Teachers at Level 2

Section Eight: The Material Context of Education (Resources)
- Level 1 Schools
- Level 2 Schools

Section Nine: The Machinery for Curriculum Development
- Control over the Curriculum
- Agencies of Curriculum Development

Section Ten: General List of References
A.1 BACKGROUND FACTORS

Land and People
Demography
Politics
Economy and Society
Religion and Culture
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area (Sq Km)</th>
<th>945,087</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Population (1984: Mid-year)</td>
<td>21,714,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inhabitants per sq km</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban Population (1985)</td>
<td>3,821,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of total population (1985)</td>
<td>17.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political Status</td>
<td>Republic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>President (from October 1985)</td>
<td>Ali Hassan Mwinyi</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Tanzania: Demography

Key Facts

1. Population (total 1984: mid-year) 21,714,000
2. Population Growth (1974-84) 3.2% per annum (average)
   % of total population (1985) 17.6%
   % of total population (1978) 13.8%
   urban population growth rate (1978-85) 9%
   Dar-es-Salaam 900,000 (approx)
   Zanzibar City 270,000
   *Dodoma 160,000
   Mwanza 171,000
   Tanga 143,000
   Arusha 88,000
   *Dodoma designated as new Capital City.
5. Crude Birth Rate (per 1000 of pop) (1984) 47 per 1000
   Crude Death Rate (per 1000) N/A
## Tanzania: Demography

### Key Facts


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Population</th>
<th>% of total population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0-4</td>
<td>4,377,000</td>
<td>20.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-9</td>
<td>3,317,000</td>
<td>15.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10-14</td>
<td>2,704,000</td>
<td>12.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15-19</td>
<td>2,305,000</td>
<td>10.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20-24</td>
<td>1,627,000</td>
<td>7.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Age 0-24</td>
<td>14,330,000</td>
<td>68%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cumulative % of total population</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Tanzania: Politics

AN OUTLINE OF POLITICAL SYSTEM AND STRUCTURE

1. **Constitutional Structure**
   The United Republic of Tanzania was formed in 1964 out of the Union between Tanganyika and Zanzibar. Tanganyika attained independence from Britain in 1962. Tanzania itself is a one party state ruled by Chama Cha Mapinduzi (CCM: The Revolutionary Party of Tanzania).

2. **Legislature**
   The main legislative authority is the National Assembly (unicameral) which has 239 members of Parliament. Of these, 111 are elected and the remainder nominated or ex officio members. MPs are elected for five years, the last election being held in October 1985.

3. **Presidency**
   In October 1985, Julius Nyerere, President for 24 years, retired and handed over the Presidency to Ali Hassan Mwinyi, formerly President of Zanzibar and Vice-President of the United Republic. Mwinyi received 92% of the vote in the 1985 elections. Nyerere retains chairmanship of the CCM and, therefore, continues to exert a strong political influence.

4. **Political Policy/Philosophy**
   Tanzania remains committed to socialist and egalitarian policies. The Arusha Declaration 1967 launched Tanzania on its path toward socialism and 'self-reliance'. Since then, every important industry has been nationalised. The government continues to view ownership of the means of production as an important part of its socialist programme. In agriculture, the government has pursued a policy of 'villagisation', known as 'ujamaa'.
Tanzania: Politics

5. Political Stability: Comments
Since independence Tanzania has enjoyed relative political stability, due in part to the respected leadership of Julius Nyerere. Whether such stability will continue is unclear. The severe economic crisis of recent years and the resulting austerity has increased dissatisfaction with government. In addition, the Presidency has only recently changed hands.

6. Political History: An Outline Chronology

1887  German colony (Deutsch-Ostafrika) established in Tanganyika. Zanzibar – a British Protectorate.

1905-07  Maj-Maji rebellion against German colonisation.

1914-18  First World War: East African Campaign.

1919  British Administration established.

1920  Britain – Mandatory Power under League of Nations.


1954  Establishment of TANU (Tanganyika African National Union) under leadership of Nyerere.

1960  TANU wins 1st general election.


1964  Union of Tanganyika and Zanzibar to form Tanzania.

1967  Arusha Declaration.

1985  Transfer of Presidency: Mwinyi replaces Nyerere.
1. **Key Economic Indicators**

a) GNP (1984) = US$ 4.9 billion  
   GNP (per capita:1984) = US$ 239

b) **Economic Growth (%)**

\[
\begin{array}{cccc}
\hline 
\text{GDP} & 1.3 & -0.4 & 2.5 & 0.6 \\
\text{GDP (per capita)} & -1.8 & -3.5 & -0.7 & -2.5 \\
\end{array}
\]

(c) **Fiscal Policy: Central Government Budget (% of GDP)**

\[
\begin{array}{ccc}
1982 & 1983 & 1984 \\
\hline 
\text{Expenditure} & 31.4 & 32.5 & 32.6 \\
\text{Revenue} & 20.0 & 24.6 & 25.7 \\
\text{Financial Deficit} & 11.4 & 7.9 & 6.9 \\
\end{array}
\]

* Large budget deficits since 1980 financed by borrowing from domestic banks

1985 cuts in government expenditure  
Dismissal of 12,360 civil servants  
" " 14,177 parastatal employees
### Monetary Situation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Inflation Rate (annual average %)</th>
<th>1982</th>
<th>1983</th>
<th>1984</th>
<th>1980–84</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Consumer Prices</td>
<td>28.9</td>
<td>27.1</td>
<td>35.8</td>
<td>29.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Economic Structure:

**GDP by Sector (1982)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>% share 1982</th>
<th>% share 1978–82</th>
<th>increases pa 1978–82</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture, forestry and fishing</td>
<td>45.4</td>
<td>10.2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mining</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>5.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>10.1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utilities</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>18.4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>14.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commerce</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport and Communications</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>30.3</td>
<td>13.8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total GDP</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>10.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Note: Agriculture is easily the biggest sector providing 83% of total employment (as against 6% for industry, and 11% for services), 80% of export earnings, and 45% of GDP.*
Tanzania: Economy and Society

f) External Trade: Balance of Payments ($m)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1981</th>
<th>1982</th>
<th>% increase average 1978–1982 av</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Exports (fob)</td>
<td>688</td>
<td>444</td>
<td>-3.8% pa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Imports (fob)</td>
<td>1038</td>
<td>1110</td>
<td>11.3% pa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visible Trade</td>
<td>-350</td>
<td>-666</td>
<td>-2,511 (cumulative)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Services (net)</td>
<td>-6.8</td>
<td>-59</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Transfers</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Official Transfers</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current Account</td>
<td>-297</td>
<td>-606</td>
<td>-2,244 (cumulative)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

g) External Debt

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1983</th>
<th>1984 (estimate)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total External Debt (US$ bn)</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>3.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of GNP</td>
<td>71.5</td>
<td>84.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Debt Service (US$ m)</td>
<td>65.4</td>
<td>71.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of foreign exchange receipts (pa)</td>
<td>14.1</td>
<td>16.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Exchange Rate: 1986 devaluation of Tanzanian shilling now 1 US$ = 40 T. shillings

Foreign Exchange Reserves (1984): $12.5 million (enough for six days imports)
[*Import of goods requires licence through National Bank of Commerce]

AID Receipts (1984): $515 million (one of largest aid recipients in Africa)
- UK aid (1984) - 22 million pounds
## Tanzania: Economy and Society

### Trading Partners

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sources of Imports</th>
<th>1985 (%share)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>13.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>9.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>9.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W.Germany</td>
<td>9.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td>3.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA</td>
<td>3.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* UK is Tanzania's most important trading partner both as source of imports and destination for exports.

### TOURISM:

1985: 60,000 tourists (capacity for 400,000 tourists pa)
Tourism potential is good but infrastructure is very poor.

### Transport and Communications

1984

- 35,000 km of roads but only 2,500 bitumenised
- 2,477 km of railways (+ 1,860 km rail link Tanzania–Zambia)
- 2 International Airports (Dar-es-Salaam and Kilimanjaro)

Transport infrastructure is in very poor condition. Deficiencies in transport network reported as major constraint on economic growth.

eg. TAZARA line

1976 - 5 millions of freight pa
1982/83 - only 700,000 tons of freight carried.
Tanzania: Economy and Society

j) Tanzania's Economy: Comments
As the figures above indicate, Tanzania's economy has been in severe crisis throughout most of the 1980s. Gross domestic product has contracted. There has been a fall in GDP per head. There are severe balance of payments difficulties (import payments treble export earnings) and a chronic severe shortage of foreign exchange. There is, in addition, a large external debt (3.2 bm US$, 84.8% of GNP). All this has caused a sharp decline in productive capacity (most industrial inputs are imported) such that in 1983 utilisation of industrial capacity fell to 30%.

In agriculture also there have been falls in productivity - particularly in the cash crop sector. Many farmers have returned to subsistence farming. Even so, there have been shortfalls in domestic food production. In 1983 the import of 130,000 tonnes of maize, 50,000 tonnes of wheat and 37,000 tonnes of rice was needed.

In recent years there have been increasingly large government budget deficits financed by borrowing from domestic banks. This has been a significant factor in rapid monetary growth and increasing rates of inflation. There have been significant falls in consumer purchasing power.

The above economic problems are attributed variously to the following:

- poor agricultural export prices
- the Ugandan invasion 1979 and the 1979 oil crisis
- the drought of 1984
- disruption to agriculture caused by the 'villagisation' programme
- managerial inefficiency in industrial parastatals
- bad marketing policy by crop marketing boards
- poor price incentives for agricultural producers

In 1986 an Economic Recovery Programme was presented to donors.

The main objectives were:

- increasing domestic production
- increasing foreign exchange earnings
- reduction of inflation and growth in money supply
Tanzania: Economy and Society

j) (continued)

These were to be achieved through:

- increased incentives for agricultural production
  (in 1986 budget agricultural producer prices were increased by 30–80%)
- improved agricultural marketing structures.
- rehabilitation of physical infrastructure
  (transport, energy, water)
- prudent monetary, fiscal and trade policies*

* in 1986 the shilling was devalued by 35%
  public sector wage increases of 4–28% were accepted (as against the 200–300% demanded by unions)

Education as much as any other sector has been affected by Tanzania’s economic problems. Indeed, it is essential to bear the country’s serious economic situation in mind in a consideration of education.
2. Some Socio–Economic Indicators

(i) Life Expectancy at Birth (1982) 52 years

(ii) Illiterate population (% of total pop) 53.7%
    (%) male 37.8%
    (%) female 68.6%

(iii) Infant mortality rates (1983) 98 per 1000

(iv) Educational Attainment (population aged 10+: 1978)
    No schooling 48.6%
    Primary Level - Incomplete 40.7%
    Complete 8.7%
    Second Level
        - S1 1.6%
        S2 0.1%
    Third Level - 0.2%
Tanzania: Religion and Culture

a) Religion

According to rather old data (the 1967 Census) the following were the proportions of population adhering to major religions:

- Christianity ..................32.4%
- Islam .........................29.5%

The remainder are recorded as either adherents of animist cults or as non-adherents of any distinct religion.

Most of the Muslim population live on or near the coast.

In general, religion is not a point of political conflict in Tanzania but it remains a significant source of identity and cultural mobilisation. In particular, there is, Barton (1971) reports, a strong identification between the Muslim community and the Swahili language. Most literature in Swahili has been written by Muslims.

It is also true that the Muslim population tends to be somewhat under-represented in the upper levels of education when compared with Christians. This may partly be attributed to a tradition of Islamic education in Koranic schools, and to a resulting resistance to secular, western-style education.

Education in Tanzania is broadly secular. Thus, religion has only a limited influence on the nationally regulated curriculum. It is important to remember, however, that a significant number of schools (primary and secondary) are run by missionary orders (both Catholic and Protestant). For example, there are 21 Catholic seminaries currently listed among the private secondary schools in Tanzania. These are reported to have the best examination results (10 of the best 14 schools) in Tanzania in terms of Form 4 passes and entry into Form 5. (Cooksey & Ishumi 1986:38).

Though religious orders make an important contribution to educational provision in Tanzania, one cannot conclude that religion itself significantly shapes the curriculum or pattern of education.
Tanzania: Religion and Culture

b) **Culture**

Very little of value can be said about culture in the present context. It suffices to mention that in Tanzania as in other African societies responsibility for the upbringing and welfare of the child tends (through the extended family/kinship system) to be more widely distributed than in European society. There also tends traditionally to be deference to authority, to received wisdom. Respect for elders is highly valued. In perceptions of the world and of causality within it, greater emphasis is placed on animate agency than in some other 'scientific' conceptions.

As regards traditional, informal education, there are varying descriptions – some more idealised than others. Nyerere (1968) himself emphasises learning through observation (of elders), emulation and practice.

"....They learned, the kinds of grasses which were suitable for which purposes, the work that had to be done on crops, or the care which had to be given to animals, by joining with their elders in this work."

He also speaks of listening to elders (again the emphasis is on respect for traditional authority and the internalisation of received wisdoms).

"....They learned the tribal history, and the tribe's relationship with other tribes and with the spirits, by listening to the stories of their elders."
Sources:


**Cameron & Dodd** (1970) *Society, Schools and Progress in Tanzania.*


**Hinzen et al** (eds) (1979) *The Tanzanian Experience.*


A.2 LANGUAGE SITUATION

Language Situation
Language Functions and Status: An Outline
Language Attitudes and Usage: An Outline
Language Planning Activities and Agencies
Language History: An Outline
Tanzania: Language Situation

a) Language Demography

There are reported to be approximately 100 different ethno-linguistic groups in Tanzania (different sources give slightly different figures). None of these groups is sufficiently populous to assert itself as a politically predominant force. The largest group (Sukuma) has just over a million speakers and the smallest (Dorobo) only 2,000 speakers (1971 figures). The numbers of speakers in the six largest groups are given below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language</th>
<th>Speakers</th>
<th>% of Total Population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sukuma</td>
<td>1,903,767</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nyamwezi</td>
<td>363,258</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Makonde</td>
<td>333,897</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haya</td>
<td>325,539</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chaga</td>
<td>318,167</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ha</td>
<td>289,792</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(1971 figures)

95 of the 102 Tanzanian languages (including all the major ones) are classified as Bantu, 5 as Nilotic (eg. Iraqw), 5 as Cushitic and 2 Khoisan.

It is evident, then, that there is a high degree of ethno-linguistic diversity in Tanzania. These demographic facts have been one factor in compelling the formation of territory-wide, supra-tribal organisations using a dominant, indigenous lingua franca, Swahili.

The geographical location of the heartlands of the major vernaculars are shown on the map below.
Tanzania: Language Situation

a) (continued)

GEOGRAPHICAL LOCATION OF MAJOR VERNACULARS
b) Language Functions and Status: An Outline

Tanzania has, in Ohannessian & Ansre's (1975) terms, a three-language pattern of complementation. The three classes of language are:

- the indigenous vernaculars (of which there are about 100)
- Swahili (the main language of 'wider communication, a national lingua franca, and also the national-official language)
- English (the major world language and language of international communication)

The major functions of these languages are described below.

i) Swahili:

Since 1961 Kiswahili has been the national language of Tanzania, and from 1967 the official language also (replacing English).

It is, therefore, the language of government, administration and the civil service (Swahili is used in civil service meetings and most official correspondence). It is also the predominant language of Parliament though the Standing Orders allow the use of both English and Swahili. Most government bills are still drafted in English.

In the Law Courts, Swahili is also widely used though the process of Swahilisation, particularly in the higher courts, has been slower than in the political field. The language used in the Police and Army is Swahili.

In education Swahili has been the medium of primary education since 1967. There have been many calls to implement Swahili as an educational medium at secondary and tertiary levels but so far no decisive action has been taken, and English is therefore retained as medium at those levels. Swahili is, however, taught as a subject in secondary schools, colleges and the university.

In industry, commerce, agriculture and other areas of work Swahili is again the main language used – among workers and for labour-management relations especially. In the upper echelons of parastatal enterprises and nationalised industries English is still, however, fairly widely used.
Tanzania: Language Situation

b) (continued)

As regards the media, there is one major daily paper published in Swahili (Uhuru). Nearly all weekly and monthly magazines/papers/journals published by government, private and religious agencies are in Swahili (e.g. 'Ushirika', 'Ukulima wa Kisasa' and 'Nchi Yetu'). Swahili, again, is the dominant language of radio broadcasting – having the greatest proportion of broadcasting hours. In the cinema, however, it is mainly imported foreign films that are shown (in 1981 162 films were imported in Tanzania, 37.6% of USA/UK origin and 32.1% of Indian origin). It should be remembered, though, that there are only 34 cinemas in Tanzania (0.8 seats per 1,000 inhabitants: 1981) and that cinema attendance opportunities are accordingly restricted.

Advertising (through signboards) is now mostly conducted through Swahili. In public recreation (football matches, bars) Swahili again is reported to be the most dominant language.

In summary, Swahili is the dominant language in most, if not all, public domains. It is also the language most frequently and widely used in everyday communication between Tanzanians.

ii) English

English retains a significant though considerably diminished role in Tanzania. Its principal domain of use is in education where it serves as the official medium of secondary education and as the language of higher education. The vast majority of books used in secondary and higher education are in English.

In law and government there is still a limited role for English. Government Bills are printed in English, a few official forms (mainly of relevance to foreigners are in English, and the higher law courts use English in their proceedings.

In the media there is one national daily newspaper published in English, but with a limited circulation. Radio broadcasting in English also continues though the number of hours broadcast is considerably less than in Swahili. Around 30% of all long films exhibited in Tanzania are in English.
Tanzania: Language Situation

b) (continued)

Apart from education, the other principal function of English in Tanzania is in the area of international relations. English is the main language used with expatriate workers (in business/commerce, in education and in aid agencies) and with tourists.

Two facts should be noted here: (1) In 1985 Tanzania received only 60,000 tourists. However, in recognition of the country’s tourist potential, a target of over a million visitors has been set, and the Tanzania Tourist Corporation (TTC) with World Bank aid is implementing a US$ 40 million infrastructure development programme: (2) the UK is still Tanzania’s largest trading partner, being the source of 13.2% of all imports (1985).

In the diplomatic, inter-governmental field Tanzania is a member of several international organisations that use English as a major language, eg. the Commonwealth, the OAU, the IMF, SADCC (Southern African Development Coordination Conference). It is also a signatory to the 3rd Lome convention, regulating trade with the EEC. It should also be noted that Tanzania is heavily dependent on external aid for development spending.

In relations with the international community (to which Tanzania has close links and on which, it has to be said, it is heavily dependent) and in education English has, then, a significant and strong role in Tanzania. By contrast, it is a language very rarely used in everyday communication between Tanzanians outside a few, very restricted public domains.

iii) Vernacular Languages

The vernacular languages have no role in government, administration or education. There are also few publications and little broadcasting in vernaculars.

Their main use appears to be confined to the home and family, and to local interactions in rural areas. They are also employed in rural church services and on mission stations.
In general, vernaculars have a stronger position in non-coastal, rural areas, though even here there has been a gradual shift to Swahili - more marked among younger generations. For historical reasons (a strong ethnic tradition) and because of a tradition of vernacular literacy, there are some groups that have a greater commitment to vernacular maintenance (eg. the Sukuma, Nyamwezi, Chaga, Nyakusa). Non-Bantu language groups (eg. the Iraqw) are also reported to be less disposed to the use of Swahili. It is said that an Iraqw child may enter primary school with very little or no knowledge of Swahili.

Polome (1980) has produced a useful grid displaying the extent of usage of Swahili versus vernaculars in urban and rural areas. This is shown below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Urban</th>
<th>Rural</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Work</td>
<td>Swahili</td>
<td>Vernacular</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Shopping</td>
<td>Swahili &amp; Vernaculars</td>
<td>Swahili &amp; Vernaculars</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Market:</td>
<td>Swahili</td>
<td>Swahili</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shops:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Recreation</td>
<td>Swahili &amp; Vernaculars</td>
<td>Mainly vernaculars</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bar:</td>
<td>Swahili</td>
<td>Swahili</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sports:</td>
<td>Swahili</td>
<td>Swahili</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Radio:</td>
<td>Swahili</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Health</td>
<td>Swahili</td>
<td>Vernaculars</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(at mission stations)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As an approximate generalisation, then, one can say that the vernacular languages have a very limited role (and no official status) in public, formal domains. On the other hand, they still have a significant place in informal communication at home, at work (among members of the same community) and in recreation. They are more widely used, as one might expect, in rural as opposed to urban areas. Even here, however, they are gradually giving ground to Swahili.
Tanzania: Language Situation

Language Attitudes and Usage: An Outline

Usage:
Most Tanzanians are either bilingual or multilingual and exploit this repertoire to satisfy their communication needs. Hill (1980, 1985) reports that in a sample of Form 1 secondary school students the average number of languages claimed to be known was five (Swahili, English and 2/3 vernaculars or French). Polome (1980) reports the following patterns of bilingual/multilingual proficiency among different occupational groups.

Farmers:
Limited bilingualism. They mainly use the vernacular and have a poor to fair command of Swahili which they use at market.

Unskilled Labourers:
Limited bilingualism. Beside a vernacular, they use Swahili as a lingua franca for communication with workers from other areas.

Clerks:
Trilingual or quadrilingual. Their own vernacular, plus another acquired by migration, along with Swahili and a limited degree of English.

Professionals and Administrators:
Trilingual in a vernacular, Swahili and English.

Teachers:
Mainly trilingual/quadrilingual in a vernacular, Swahili and English.

Polome (1980) also reports on diary studies (a sample of 25) which show (unsurprisingly) a much greater frequency of usage of Swahili than either English or a vernacular.

Code-switching and code-mixing are also reported to be common, more common into Swahili than out of Swahili. Mlay & Mkindi’s (1970) study concludes that in 44% of cases switching seemed to be arbitrary, in 23% of cases it was motivated by a desire to achieve better expression, in 11% of cases to accommodate a 3rd party joining the conversation, and in 10% of cases it was enforced by the interlocutor. In general, switching to vernaculars is associated with kinship and social familiarity and is also triggered by recognition of ethnic identity.
Tanzania: Language Situation

(iii) Attitudes

Vernaculars:
There is still, Polome (1980) reports, considerable linguistic loyalty to vernacular languages especially among groups with strong traditional cultures (eg. Ha, Chaga, Sukuma). In general, vernaculars are valued as repositories of traditional values and culture (in dance, song, story-telling). There is a policy of drawing on the indigenous languages for purposes for Swahili lexical elaboration in preference to other sources.

Whilst sentimental attachments to vernaculars remain strong, they are, however, not well regarded instrumentally. Upwardly mobile individuals tend to shift to Swahili in their personal and professional lives as a symbol of their enhanced socio-economic status. Among younger generations a shift to Swahili is taking place (including among Chagas).

Swahili:
In general, attitudes to Swahili are very positive. There is pride in its national status, in its use as a lingua franca in much of East Africa, and in the fact that Tanzania is one of the few African countries to have an indigenous national language.

In part, favourable attitudes to Swahili may be attributed to the political campaigns conducted from the 1960s to promote Swahili as a national language, as a symbol of national and African identity, and as an instrument for building an egalitarian society. That these campaigns have been successful in mobilising patriotic sentiment concerning Swahili is partly evidenced by a small scale study of students at Morogoro TTC (Polome 1980). This showed that by 1967 64.2% of students preferred Swahili over the vernacular, a reversal of the situation a few years previously.

In connection with attitudes to Swahili, one should also mention the role played by the growth of a literature in Swahili, especially since independence (eg. the plays of Ebrahim Hussein, the poetry of Abdilatif Abdulla and novels of Kezilahabi – cited by Abdulaziz 1980).

In summary, then, Swahili has gained prestige and status (for nationalist and ideological reasons). There remains a strong desire to implement a Swahili medium in secondary and higher education, and it is largely because of practical constraints that this aspiration has so far been frustrated.
Tanzania: Language Situation

c) (continued)

English:
Reflecting official policy, attitudes to English are often ambivalent. As Swahili has gained in status and importance since independence so that of English has declined. Its role is now considerably circumscribed, a process which has meant a corresponding loss of social prestige. For some years (1960s–1970) English was regarded as a language of the past, a language of colonialism. At the height of the political drive to consolidate Swahili as the national language, there was considerable popular feeling against the use of English (to speak English was to exhibit a colonial mentality: 'Kasumba'). Despite patriotic and nationalistic feeling against English (now apparently on the wane) there has been a persisting recognition of the value of English as an instrument of socio-economic and educational opportunity. Parents have been keen for their children to be taught English. Wealthier individuals often seek to enrol their children in private English medium, or international, schools. There is also recognition of the need for English in international relations and as a reading/library language. In these respects, then, English is valued for strictly instrumental reasons. For some, finally, there is a kind of mystique about English. Rubagumya reports that like Arabic in the mosque, English has acquired an aura of holiness. "Some believe that university academics are impossible without the English language." (1984:3).

d) Language Planning (Corpus) Activities and Agencies
Considerable effort has been expended on the standardisation and development of the Swahili language.
In 1930 an Interterritorial Language Committee (for East Africa) was established with the aim of 'promoting the standardisation and development of Swahili language.' This body selected the Unguja dialect as the basis for the standard form of the language. It was also responsible for the production of a major Swahili–English dictionary and for pioneer studies in Swahili grammar. All books appearing in Swahili were standardised and a regular Swahili Bulletin was published.
On independence (1961) the Interterritorial Language Committee was transformed into the Institute of Swahili Research and transferred to the University of Dar-es-Salaam under its first director, W H Whiteley. The Institute is currently a major agency in the development of Swahili along
Tanzania: Language Situation

with the National Swahili Council (Baraza la Kiswahili), established in 1967 by Act of Parliament.

Among the official aims of the latter body are:

- 'to promote the development and usage of the Swahili language throughout the United Republic'
- 'to encourage the achievement of high standards in the use of the Swahili language and to discourage its misuse'
- 'to cooperate with the authorities concerned with establishing standard Swahili translations of technical terms'
- 'to publish a Swahili newspaper or magazine concerned with the Swahili language and literature' (Mlama & Mvungi 1980)

The Swahili Council is a governmental organisation under the direction of the Ministry of Culture and Youth.

Together, the National Swahili Council and the Institute of Swahili Research have made substantial contributions to the development of Swahili. The Council has published the journal 'Lugha Yetu', and the Institute produces a bi-annual journal of Swahili research –, 'Kiswahili' (Abdulaziz 1980). Grammars and word-lists have been published but perhaps most important has been the production of a major Swahili-Swahili dictionary.

Currently, the main focus of language planning activity appears to be on vocabulary elaboration in order to equip Swahili as a viable medium in secondary and higher education, and in industrial/commercial fields.

Ohly & Gibbe (1980) estimate that at least 10,000 new words are required in the immediate future. They point out that the Council in 1976 accepted terminologies for political education, geography and commerce as adequate for secondary education. Terminologies for mathematics, domestic science, history and agriculture were at an advanced stage whilst in the natural sciences (chemistry, physics, biology) and economics terminology coining was at an early stage.

The same authors point out that in Tanzanian factories, Swahili neologisms are gradually replacing English technical terms (eg. Shuttle-Ngalawa) - often as a result as informal coining by workers.
Tanzania: Language Situation

d) (continued)
In general, then, there appears to be some way to go in the elaboration of Swahili vocabulary in technical, scientific and some academic fields. Nevertheless, Swahili has emerged as a (young) standard language and there seems to be little serious linguistic impediment to its use as a medium in secondary education. Several commentators make the point that putting the language to use in academic, scientific and technical domains actually contributes to the linguistic development of the language, 'firming up' the process of terminology elaboration.

e) Language History: An Outline
The emergence of Swahili as Tanzania's national language (and as a national lingua franca) can be attributed to a number of factors, some demographic (ethno-linguistic diversity and the absence of a predominant group), some political-ideological. History is, however, also significant. In the present context only the barest outline is possible.

The Pre-Colonial Period
By the early 11th century, Swahili was spoken along a considerable length of the East African coast. Though a Bantu language, it was influenced by Arabic (there was/is a tradition of trade across the Indian Ocean between Oman/Southern Arabia and East Africa) - this feature distinguishing it from the more isolated vernacular languages of the interior.
During the 19th century Swahili began to spread into the interior mainly along trading routes and in trading centres developed by Arab/Swahili traders – conducting an extensive trade in ivory, slaves and other commodities. The main use of Swahili, then, was as a trading lingua franca.

The German Period: 1886-1918
At the time of the establishment of a German Protectorate in East Africa in 1886 Swahili already held a strong position for two reasons: it was the language of an influential segment of society and it was already used in the administrative centres that the Germans established.
Throughout the period of German rule, different pressure groups urged different language policies: the authorities in Berlin urged the introduction of German as an official language, the missions advocated the vernaculars, and the local administration in Dar-es-Salaam strove to appease both groups. Despite these policy vacillations, Swahili gradually consolidated its position. In the small education system, Swahili was used as a medium of education with German taught as a subject. It also became the language of low level administration. By 1914 most administrative correspondence was carried out in Swahili, and the missions had produced and sold a large number of religious/educational booklets in Swahili. A further factor favouring the spread of Swahili was the greater ease with which it was learnt relative to German.


Under British rule, the consolidation of Swahili as an important language in education and administration continued. A 1928 Education Ordinance, defining conditions for schools to receive government financial support, reinforced the policy of employing Swahili as a medium in early education with a switch later to English. The essentials of this policy were maintained into the 1940s (Swahili as a medium, with English as a subject). When the first secondary schools were introduced, English became the medium of education and Swahili a subject. In the meantime, the missions gradually began to accept the greater educational use of Swahili moving away from their previous advocacy of the role of vernaculars. By 1945, indeed the vernaculars had largely disappeared from the educational system.

In administration also, the use of Swahili was further consolidated. It became, for example, the language of many 'sponsored native associations and organisations (e.g. The Tanganyika Territory Civil Servant Association (TTCSA)).
Tanzania: Language Situation

(continued)

In the late colonial period movements of mass nationalism emerged. Being a supra-tribal, national-wide lingua franca and a language well-established in education and administration, Swahili was the natural language for political mobilisation. Thus, it became the language of TANU – being used for meetings, debates, organisations and written minutes. The conditions were in place for Swahili to become Tanzania’s national language.


Tanzanian government policy since independence has been explicitly dedicated to the promotion and consolidation of Swahili as a national language. In 1961 Swahili was officially declared the national language and in 1967 became the official language, replacing English. In the same year a Swahili medium in primary education was implemented. The then Vice-president made a pronouncement to the effect that Swahili was to be used as much as possible in government and parastatal bodies. At the time aspirations were expressed that Swahili might in time become the medium in secondary and higher education. So far these have not been realised. Nevertheless, Swahili has become the predominant language in most public domains and is firmly secure in its status as national–official language.
Tanzania: Language Situation

Sources:


A.3 EDUCATION SYSTEM

An Outline of the National Education System (1985)

Level 1 Schooling: Basic Structure
Level 2 Schooling: Basic Structure
Level 3 Education: Basic Structure
Educational Expenditure: An Outline
The History of Education in Tanzania: An Outline Chronology
**Tanzania: Education System**

1. **Outline of the National Education System (1985)**
   a) Compulsory Education .......... 7 to 14 years.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age</th>
<th>School Level</th>
<th>Language Medium</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>P</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>P</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>P</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>P</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>P</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>P</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>P</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age</th>
<th>School Level</th>
<th>Language Medium</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>S₁</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>S₁</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>S₁</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>S₁</td>
<td>English</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age</th>
<th>School Level</th>
<th>Language Medium</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>S₂</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>S₂</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

P=Primary School  S=Secondary School  
S₁=Secondary School, Level 1 (junior)  
S₂=Secondary School, Level 2 (senior)

The school year is from January to December. Three terms of 13 weeks each.
Tanzania: Education System

2. **Level 1 (Primary) Schooling: Basic Structure**

a) Total number of pupils (1983) 3,552,923

b) Total number of teachers (1983) 85,308
   % female 49%

c) Pupil: Teacher Ratio (1983) 42:1

d) Gross Enrolment Ratio (1983) 87

e) Survival Rate to Grade 7 Primary (1978) 0.84

f) Progression Rate from Grade 7 to Secondary School Form 1 (1983)
   4.2% Govt Schools
   2% Private Schools

G) Distribution by Grade and Repeaters by Grade (1982)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>Distribution by Grade &amp;</th>
<th>Repeaters by Grade &amp;</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Gross Number of Repeaters=42,928

h) Total number of schools 9,980
Tanzania: Education System

i) Fees (1981) - Free schooling but small nominal contribution from parents of 20 shillings.

j) Legal Position on Schooling - Primary schooling 'compulsory'.
Normal age of entry - 7 years.
Duration - 7 years.

k) Notes on Expansion of Primary Schooling

Since 1962 there has been an enormous expansion in primary schooling.
This was particularly marked in the period 1976–83 in the wake of the UPE year of 1977 (declared as a target at Musoma 1974).
The dimensions of the expansion are indicated in the following figures:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Pupils</th>
<th>Teachers</th>
<th>Schools</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1976</td>
<td>1,874,357</td>
<td>38,199</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1979</td>
<td>3,197,395</td>
<td>79,129</td>
<td>9,837</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1982</td>
<td>3,512,799</td>
<td>83,782</td>
<td>10,035</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The drive for UPE necessitated several emergency measures. Most notable was the Distance Learning Scheme which aimed at the production of 45,000 UPE teachers in three years.
Some commentators (eg. King 1984) have noted, however, that Grade 1 enrolments have declined steadily from their 1978 UPE peak. This has led to talk of a 'one year UPE phenomenon'.
In spite of the rapid expansion above, a 1981 sector review reported that the 1980 gross enrolment ratio was 96.57% and the net enrolment ratio only 70–73% of the 7–13 age population.
Notes on the Regional Distribution of Educational Provision

The Kilimanjaro region has historically had a higher rate of primary enrolments than less developed regions. (In 1969, 120.4 per 1,000 compared with 65.2 per 1000 for mainland Tanzania as a whole).

Since then, however, as Carr–Hill (1984) points out, those districts with a historically low net enrolment rate have experienced faster increases in enrolments than 'richer' regions.

Using a Gini coefficient to measure inequality in the regional distribution of primary school places, Maas & Criel (1982) place Tanzania near the bottom of a range of 16 Eastern African countries (Tanzania=0.086: overall range=0.043–0.489). What is indicated, in other words, is a minor degree of regional inequality.

As regards teachers, there is a slight tendency for the better qualified to be over-represented in Dar-es-Salaam and Kilimanjaro regions.

In terms of pupil:teacher ratios, the highest is found in Shinyanga (60:1) and the lowest in Lindi and Mara (32:1).

Notes on the Overall Direction of Primary Education in Historical Perspective

Primary education in Tanzania remains a highly political issue. Before 1967 emphasis was placed on secondary/higher education as education itself was largely viewed as an 'infra-structural' rather than 'social' investment.

Following the Arusha Declaration 1967 and the enunciation of the doctrine of education for Self-Reliance (ESR), however, greater attention was paid to primary education. ESR policy envisaged the following changes in the content/nature of primary education:

- primary education to be a complete, self-contained package in itself, not merely a preparation for secondary school.
- integration of school activities with production work in community
- respect for practical skills as well as book-learning
- curriculum to help every child be 'a productive member of society'
The next major evolution in primary education arrived with the 1974 Musoma Declaration, the main thrusts of which were:

- universal primary education (UPE) – partially implemented in 1978
- no direct entry to university studies
- schooling combining mental and manual labour
- shift from ‘ambush’ examinations (ie. toward forms of continuous assessment)

Commentators (eg. Carr-Hill 1984) have argued that ESR has only been partially implemented, one problem being that it is difficult to understand precisely what ‘self-reliance’ means in education.

It is noted that:

- the balance of the curriculum has remained the same; emphasis on the 3 Rs
- English retains a prominent place in the curriculum
- little emphasis on agriculture in the curriculum
- self-reliance (production) activities small and poorly organised

The Structure of the Primary School Curriculum: An Outline

1. The School Day: Grades I & IV=4 hours long, 6 x 40 minute periods Grades V–VII=5 1/2 hours long, 8 x 40 minute periods

2. Curriculum Balance: Essentially the same in 1983 as prior to Arusha Declaration, except from 1980 the teaching of English has been deferred to Grade 3.

Main subjects: Kiswahili: 6–12 periods a week (12 in Grade 1, 6 in Grade 7) English: 6 periods a week (Grade 3–7) Arithmetic: 9–7 periods a week Agriculture: 2 periods a week (Grade 5–7)
Tanzania: Education System

n) (continued)

3. **Curricular Aims:**

"- to give pupils a permanent ability in literacy ...
- to help the pupils develop an enquiring mind and ability to think and solve problems independently.
- to impart the socialist values, attitudes, and knowledge ...
- to provide pupils with an education which is complete in itself ....
- to help pupils to accept the values appropriate to Tanzania’s future."

O) **Future Developments**

The aim for the future is essentially to consolidate primary education. It is recommended, that by 1985 no more than 35 children will be allowed in one class. By the year 2000 the number of pupils shall not exceed 30 per class. (1982 Presidential Commission of Education).
3. **Level 2 (Secondary) Schooling: Basic Structure**

   a) **Introduction**

   The secondary cycle is divided into two:
   - a basic four-year course (Forms 1–4) completed by a Certificate of Secondary Education (CSE) examination which determines entry to a further two-year higher course (Forms 5–6). At the end of this, students sit the Form 6 examination (the National Higher School Certificate, equivalent to East Africa 'A' Level Certificate).

   b) Total number of pupils (1984) (UNESCO) 81,787
      %female 35%

   c) Total number of teachers (1982) 4,162
      % female 27%

   d) Average Pupil:Teacher Ratio (1981) 21:1

   e) Gross Enrolment Ratio (1980) 3.6
      male 4.8
      female 2.4

   f) Overall Progression Rate from Grade 7 (Primary) to Form 1 Secondary (1984) 4.2%

   Overall Progression Rate from Form 4 (Level 2 cycle 1) to Form 5 (Level 2 cycle 2) (1984) 13%

   (*government schools only: 20%)*
Tanzania: Education System

3. (continued)
g) % Distribution of Pupils by Form (1981)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Form</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>24%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

h) Total number of schools (1984) 169

- Government public schools (1984) 84
- Private schools 85*

(* includes 21 Catholic seminaries)

i) Pupil Enrolments by Type of School (1981)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Government</th>
<th>Private</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Forms 1-4</td>
<td>34,748</td>
<td>29,078</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Forms 5-6</td>
<td>3,544</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>38,292</td>
<td>29,310</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: (1) By 1984 48.3% of all Form 1 enrolments were in private secondary schools. (2) Notice the small numbers of Form 5-6 pupils in private schools.

j) Fees

Private schools charge substantial fees on a schedule determined by the government.

Until 1984 government schooling was free but from that year (1984/85) a charge of 1,500 Tanzanian shillings per pupil per annum was introduced.
Tanzania: Education System

k) Nominal Age of Entry to Form I: 14 years
   Duration of 1st cycle  4 years
   Duration of 2nd cycle  2 years

l) Notes on Expansion of Secondary Schooling
   In the early years after independence (1962–70) there was a rapid increase
   in the number of secondary enrolments from a low base figure of 12,000.
   Since 1970, however, there has been a stagnation in the number of
   enrolments in government secondary schools. One consequence has been
   a rapid expansion of private secondary schools (fee-charging) to satisfy
   continuing private demand.
   During the same period (1970–84), but especially after 1977, there has
   been a rapid rise in primary school enrolments. The divergent trends at
   primary and secondary school have meant that promotion rates from
   Grade 7 primary to Form I secondary have fallen to very low levels (in
   1985 about 4.4%). It is estimated that by 1985 the gross enrolment rate in
   government schools will have fallen below 2%. This means that Tanzania
   will have the smallest public secondary system relative to (age) population
   in the world.
   It is worth taking note of King’s (1984) point, however, that in a number of
   government schools there now operates a school within a school. This is
   a system of afternoon/evening classes attended by young adults who have
   failed to gain secondary school entry through normal channels, taught by
   the same teachers using the same textbooks as in regular classes. The
   numbers involved are not known precisely, but in Kilimanjaro region it is
   estimated that there are more than 10 Form I streams operating under this
   new dispensation (King 1984:29).
Notes on the Regional Distribution of Educational Provision

It has been government policy to build public secondary schools in such a way as to ensure a reasonable regional distribution of school facilities. However, the rapid growth of private secondary school, which are located according to private demand, has somewhat undermined attempts to achieve an equitable regional distribution. The gap between ‘well-off’ and ‘poorer’ regions in terms of secondary school opportunities has thus tended to widen.

1980 figures (MNE) show that 21.4% of all secondary school (9 public, 24 private) were located in Kilimanjaro region, the next most favoured regions being Morogoro (7.8%) and Dar-es-Salaam (7.1%). By contrast, Rukwa, Lindi and Kigoma regions had only 1.3%, 1.9% and 1.9% of secondary schools respectively.

In 1982 Kilimanjaro region accounted for 11% of government and 30% of private secondary school students respectively. However, if merit were the sole criterion of entry to government secondary school (a regional quota system is in fact in operation) Kilimanjaro primary pupils would secure yet more government school places.

In Form 5 the regional representation pattern changes again. Kilimanjaro accounts for 25% of all government students. Five regions (Kilimanjaro, Iringa, Kagera, Mara and Mbeya) account for 60% of all students.

Notes on the Overall Direction of Secondary Education in Historical Perspective

The Arusha Declaration 1967 and the enunciation of the ESR doctrine, marked the introduction of a number of government policy initiatives regarding secondary education. These included the following:
- Restriction in the expansion of secondary enrolments to keep student numbers in line with manpower requirements. Attention was switched to increasing the number of primary enrolments (UPE 1978). Ever since secondary places have been 'quantitatively stagnant.'
- Introducing political education and self-reliance activities into the curriculum. By 'self-reliance activities' is meant productive work in agriculture, homecraft etc. These are expected to defray some of the school running costs and to teach the dignity and value of manual work.
- Diversification of the school curriculum away from the general and towards the vocational/technical. This is an attempt to make secondary education more vocationally relevant and to equip school-leavers for employment in rural areas. Schools now follow a 'common-core' curriculum of basic subjects and are expected in Forms 1-4 to adopt one of four curricular biases in commercial, agricultural, technical or homecraft subjects.
- Change in the criteria for Form 1 entry. A complex system of regional and district quotas now operates for the allocation of Form 1 places. In addition, headteachers are permitted to 'pre-select' a number of promising pupils (on grounds of leadership, self-reliance and academic work). The aim is to achieve a reasonable equitable regional distribution of secondary school places and to de-emphasise purely academic criteria for selection in favour of 'character' and 'self-reliance' criteria.

The above policy initiatives were reinforced by the Musoma Declaration 1974 which also put forward the following resolutions concerning secondary education.

- secondary education, like primary, should be a complete cycle of education in itself.
- all secondary leavers should be trained for productive work.
- no direct entry to university (work performance and academic ability taken into consideration in university selection).
- reform of examination system to reflect 'self-reliance' principles.
n) (continued)

It should be noted finally that negative evaluations have subsequently been made of the impact of the following key policies.

- curriculum diversification
- self-reliance activities
- quota systems of Form 1 selection
- restriction on government school places

o) The Structure of the Secondary School Curriculum: An Outline

1. The School Day/Week

There are normally 40 subject periods a week, each of 40/45 minutes. In addition 10 hours per week are set aside for self-reliance activities and 2 hours for games and sports.

2. Curriculum Balance: The following core subjects are studied throughout Forms 1-4.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>Periods</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Politics</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Swahili</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mathematics</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Biology</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geography</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religion</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Other subjects (eg. physics, chemistry, foreign languages) are allocated further periods according to the curriculum bias of the school.

3. Curricular Aims

"Secondary education is terminal and aims at equipping the pupils with skills and knowledge ..., which will enable them and the nation as a whole to be self-reliant ...."

"Biasing of schools aims at:

a) putting emphasis on manual work ....
b) preparing pupils for work in villages and towns.
c) making pupils love and appreciate the importance of manual labour.
d) marrying theory and practice ...." (MNE 1980)
4. The Forms 5–6 Curriculum
Students in Forms 5 and 6 are allocated to either an Arts or Science stream (the ratio is about 1:3 respectively). The most able are, it is claimed, allocated to Science and the less able to Arts. Those taking Arts have 8–10 periods a week in English.

p) Manpower and Tanzanianisation
Tanzania has moved swiftly to localise educational manpower. By 1970 all headships of public secondary schools and teachers’ colleges were held by Tanzanians. By 1970 also 60% of all secondary level teachers were Tanzanian. The trend has continued (1986) to almost complete Tanzanianisation.

q) Future Developments
The 1982 Presidential Commission made the following recommendations with respect to secondary education:

- That secondary education be expanded (using both ‘social demand’ and ‘manpower needs’ planning approaches). The target is a 15% progression rate from Grade 7 to Form 1 by the year 2000.
- That there be an increased emphasis on Day Secondary Schools (currently there is a preponderance of boarding schools (82% of public school enrolment Forms 1–4:1982). A UNESCO study (1981) has shown that boarding schools are not only very expensive to maintain but that they do not have an advantage over day schools in academic terms).
- That private secondary schools be permitted to continue provided they follow the regulations of the Ministry.

4. Level 3 Education (University and Higher Institutes): An Outline of Basic Structure
There is one university in Tanzania comprising seven faculties located at three campuses:

- One 15 kilometres from Dar-es-Salaam town
- One (the Medical Faculty) in Dar-es-Salaam town
- The Faculty of Agriculture/Veterinary Science at Morogoro (now Sokoine University)
4. (continued)

Unlike schools, the university year runs from July. Admission to university is dependent on satisfactory performance in the Form 6 examination, and on completion of a period of National Service after leaving school.

Apart from the university, there are various other higher education institutions. These include the Colleges of National Education (for teacher-training), the Institute of Development Management (IDM), the Institute of Finance Management (IFM), the Ardhi Institute, and the Dar-es-Salaam Technical College offering diploma courses in engineering. Most university-level courses (not all) have a three-year duration. English is the medium of instruction in most subjects.

Enrolments at University and Equivalent Institutions

Total enrolment (1981) - 3,662 university students
(1983) - 974 university teachers

Number of students per 100,000 population

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>1981</th>
<th>1984</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>29</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

% Distribution of Students by Broad Fields of Study (1981)

- Education: 31.8%
- Humanities/Social Science: 10.0%
- Natural Science/Engineering: 17.4%
- Medicine: 13.7%
- Law: 8.3%
- Agriculture: 8.3%
- Business Administration: 10.0%
Tanzania: Education System

5. Educational Expenditure: An Outline

a) Educational Expenditure as % of GNP (1983) – 5.8%

b) Educational Expenditure as % of Government Expenditure (1983)
- 15.3%

c) Total Recurrent Expenditure on Education – 1,871.3 (millions of shillings) (1980/81 estimates)

Total Capital Expenditure on Education – 581.5 *(millions of shillings) (1980/81 estimates)

* 71% of capital expenditure in 1980/81 was externally financed (ie. by aid)

d) Percentage Distribution of Government Recurrent Expenditure by Educational Sub-sector

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1975/76</th>
<th>1980/81</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Admin</td>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>4.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>37.3</td>
<td>45.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary</td>
<td>17.1*</td>
<td>10.5*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher Training</td>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>4.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Higher Education</td>
<td>12.8</td>
<td>11.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adult Education</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>5.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specialised Training</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>–</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outside MNE</td>
<td>17.8</td>
<td>18.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Note growth in share allocated to primary education and % fall in allocation to secondary education.
Tanzania: Education System

e) Distribution of Educational Expenditure by Level and Purpose

Data not available.

f) Planning Unit Costs per Pupil per Year (1979)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Cost</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Primary pupil</td>
<td>600 shillings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary pupil</td>
<td>6,567.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNE student</td>
<td>13,360.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical college student</td>
<td>17,781.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University student</td>
<td>57,056.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*University and College students are paid a living allowance. 82% of government secondary school pupils are boarders whose subsistence (food and accommodation) requirements are taken care of by the government.
Tanzania: Education System

6. The History of Education in Tanzania: An Outline Chronology

The Pre-Colonial Period

Teaching through vernaculars.
Aims:
(i) Literacy for religious study
(ii) Moral education
(iii) Training for craftsmen.

The German Period: (1886–1918)

1893: Opening of first government school at Tanga.

1903: By 1903, 20 government schools established.
Aims – education for clerks, interpreters, etc to serve colonial administration.

1914: By 1914, 100 government-aided schools with 6,000 pupils – mainly on coast and in larger towns. 1,800 mission schools with 110,000 pupils.


The British Period: (1916–1961)

1920: Appointment of Director of Education.

1924: Visit of Phelps-Stokes Commission: (advocates value of vernaculars).
By 1924, 72 government-aided schools with 5,000 pupils.
Mission schools – 162,000 pupils.

1925: Reorganisation of schooling: ‘village’ schools with four-year course through Swahili and vernaculars. Emphasis on agriculture.
Introduction of ‘Central’ schools.

1930–33: Great Depression. Decline of Funding for Education.
1931: Enlarging of Makerere College, Uganda.

1939: By 1939, total of 85,000 in schools (four-year primary education).
Four junior secondary schools.

1939–45: Second World War.

schools.


1952–59 Implementation of middle school system: partial success but emphasis on practical agriculture disliked. English consolidated as a medium in education. (Offence to use Swahili or vernacular in classroom hours in many schools).

1961: By 1961 primary education for about 50% of children. - 700 pupils sitting for secondary school certificate - Very few African graduates or professionals - School curricula mainly based on British prototypes - Racially segregated schools for Africans, Europeans, Asians.

The Post-independence Period (1961– )


1964: Reform of schooling structure to a 4:4 system. Standards 1–4 (Lower Primary) Standards 5–8 (Upper Primary) Curricular emphasis on agriculture downgraded.

1966: Student riots at University College over National Service.


1969: Education Act: integration of primary school administration under a system of LEAs but responsibility for funding retained by Central Government.
6. (continued)


1978: Introduction of UPE.
Repeal of 1969 Education Act.

Sources:


The Evolution of Language Education Policy: An Outline

The Language Curriculum at Level 1 (English)

The Language Curriculum at Level 2 Cycle 1 (English)

The Language Curriculum at Level 2 Cycle 2 (English)
1. **The Evolution of Language Education Policy: An Outline**

The historical evolution of language education policy in Tanzania is ably summarised in Criper & Dodd's (1984) report. The main facts are as follows:

- **The German Period (1886–1918)**
  
  In the small secular system of education established under German rule Kiswahili was employed as a medium for elementary education with German taught as a subject. In most Christian missions, on the other hand, education was conducted through the vernaculars.

- **The British Period (1919–1961)**
  
  The early British administration essentially followed German policy – Kiswahili as medium but with English taught as a subject. In the 1940s English was introduced as a medium in the newly-opened secondary schools.
  
  The position of English was consolidated during the 1950s with the opening of Middle Schools (Standards 5–8). It was decided that English should be taught as a subject from Standard 5 and used as a medium from Standard 7.
  
  Later, in 1958, as a result of public pressure, English was introduced as a subject from Standard 3. During the rest of the colonial period Kiswahili was retained as medium up to Standard 6, at which point (Standard 7) there was a switch to English medium through secondary and higher education.

- **The Post–Independence Period (1961–)**
  
  In 1967 Kiswahili became both the official and national language. At the same time, it was declared the medium of instruction throughout the newly reorganised primary system (Standards 1–7). English was to be taught as a subject from Standard 1. In 1981, however, it was decided to postpone the introduction of English as subject to Standard 3 and to reduce its allocation of periods. Kiswahili continued as medium through primary education and in many Colleges of National Education. English was retained on the medium of secondary and higher education.
Tanzania: The Language Curriculum

1. (continued)

From 1967 hopes had been expressed that Kiswahili might replace English as medium in secondary and higher education. Indeed, in 1969 a Ministry circular suggested the gradual phasing-out of English through a range of official subjects. One official report called for a transition to Swahili medium in secondary school by 1985 and in higher education by 1992. The general expectation was that English would soon be replaced as a medium. For example, Mbunda et al's article of 1971 (Polome & Hill 1980:329) states with assurance: "The future of English as a medium of instruction in Tanzanian secondary schools is likely to be brief."

A 1982 Presidential Commission Report seemed to fulfil these expectations with a pronouncement of an imminent transition to Swahili medium. However, this was soon cancelled by further statements emphasising the importance of retaining English. The current position appears to be that English is retained as a medium in secondary and higher education for the foreseeable future. Criper & Dodd's comment is apt:

"... There was a prolonged period of ambivalence and even confusion about the respective roles of Kiswahili and English in education, a period in which the status of English, the quality of its teaching and its effectiveness as a medium all declined." (1984:4)

What are the reasons for the failure to achieve a transition to Swahili medium? Different problems and constraints appear to have been advanced at different times, for example:

- the presence of expatriate teachers
- the linguistic development of Swahili
- the administrative costs and problems of the transition
- the availability of subject materials in Swahili

The latter is perhaps the major constraint, and it seems relevant, therefore, to refer to Batibo & Katigula's (1982) comments.
Tanzania: The Language Curriculum

1. (continued)

The Availability of Swahili Books/Materials

They point out that of books translated into Swahili the majority are in history, politics and literature. Two reasons are given:

i) commercial (a larger and more secure market for these as opposed to more specialised technical and scientific books).

ii) linguistic (the translation of general arts books poses lesser problems with terminology than with science/technical subjects).

As regards the production of new books in Swahili, they again note that the majority are in such fields as history, politics, home economics and literature. Few science books in Swahili have been published.

Production of books in Swahili is, they argue, held back by two factors:

a) Lack of incentives for authors (small royalties and insufficient time for writing).

b) Publishing problems: - uncertainty over the market; technical problems of production.

It is pointed out that there are few Swahili publishing houses (15:8 in Nairobi), and even fewer printing companies (3). In Tanzania a book of 100 pages takes two years to come to publication as against three months in the UK. The printing technology is old, and the printing firms are overloaded with work.

A further problem, not mentioned by Batibo, is simply one of paper. Tanzania has a pulp and paper mill at Mufindi (opened in 1985) with an output capacity of 750,000 tonnes per annum. However, operations were suspended in April 1986 owing to financial and technical problems. In 1983, 7,000 tonnes of general paper and 3,500 tonnes of newsprint paper were imported — barely enough to satisfy demand and a heavy drain on foreign exchange.

A possible solution is, of course, external publishing and printing of educational books. This again, would entail the expenditure of scarce foreign exchange.
2. **The Language Curriculum at Level 1 (Primary School): (English)**

   a) **Position of English in the Curriculum**

   English is currently (1986) taught as a subject from its introduction in Grade 3 through to Grade 7. It is compulsory for all pupils, and is examined in the Primary School Leaving Examination (PSLE). The medium of instruction in other subjects throughout primary school is Kiswahili.

   b) **Official Time Allocation for English Language Teaching**

   Grades 3–7 (1981–84) - 5/6 periods of 40 minutes per week. Almost certainly, the actual time available is less owing to interruptions, teacher absences, late arrival of pupils, etc. Carr–Hill (1984).

   c) **General Aims/Goals of English Language Instruction**

   As officially detailed, they are:

   - 'to give primary school leavers a permanent reading knowledge of English'
   - '... to develop through learning English language skills, the pupils' education for self-reliance, politically, technically, socially, culturally.'


   The main focus, then, is on developing a reading knowledge of English. These aims are apparently derived from an appraisal of pupil needs in relation to English and from a consideration of the function of primary schooling in the light of the ESR philosophy (Nyerere 1967).

   d) **Official Syllabus and Textbooks**

   According to Criper & Dodd (1984:20) there is at present (1984) no official syllabus used in schools. The actual syllabus is in fact the textbook.

   The textbook situation is as follows (1984):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grades</th>
<th>Textbook</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3–7</td>
<td>PET Book 1–3 (&quot;Primary English for Tanzania&quot;) have recently been introduced into schools. The series is, however, incomplete as yet.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>In these grades, the old book &quot;English for Tanzanian Schools&quot; is used where available, in particular Books 6 &amp; 7.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Tanzania: The Language Curriculum

(continued)

Content of books

Books 1 & 2 of the ETS Series contain a series of related structures incorporating lexis of familiar objects/concepts to enable children to practice structures. There are teachers' books to accompany the series. Teachers are assumed to need very explicit guidance. Thus, material is set out in great detail giving pupils' expected responses and teachers' utterances. ((Mbunda & Brown 1978) in Polome & Hill (eds) 1980).

The ETS series has been heavily criticised on the following grounds:

- inappropriateness of content - (unsuitable for new conception of primary schooling)
- level inappropriate and too difficult for most pupils
- passages too long
- lessons assumed to require 30/40 minutes actually require more time
- lack of exercises for pupils
- lack of accompanying material (eg. charts, etc)
- lack of sequential progression from one book to the next

(Batibo 1983, Criper & Dodd 1984).

PET

It has been difficult to obtain information on the content of the PET books. They have, however, been criticised on the following grounds:

- lack of support provided to teachers
- written by panels with a resulting lack of coherence and imagination
- beyond the level of most pupils
- contain errors of English and of design

(Criper & Dodd 1984:20)
Tanzania: The Language Curriculum

d) (continued)
- lack of space between one unit and the next
- colours not used in spite of being mentioned (Dosi 1983)

Textbook Availability
This is reported to be poor. Criper & Dodd (1984) mention a book:pupil ratio of 1:2 for PET books.
Dosi (1983) reports that the distribution of PET books 1 & 2 began in 1982/83. In 1983 Book 3 was with the publishers. Owing to a national shortage of paper, the Ministry only managed to print 250,000 copies instead of the required 1 million. In some schools, he adds, language teachers were issued with only seven copies, one book for ten pupils. Too many of the books in circulation had already been torn/damaged. Many of the CNE colleges responsible for training primary teachers had no PET copies.
Batibo (1983) reports that primary teachers cite the acute shortage of textbooks as their greatest problem. The shortage of books is, he argues, responsible for:
- 'lack of visual conceptualization and memorization of structures and vocabulary'
- 'difficulty in practising or reinforcing what has been learnt'
- 'difficulty in creating reading habits in English'
- 'difficulty in motivating pupils' (1983:3)

Batibo (1983) adds that in several rural schools there are no English language textbooks apart from one or two copies of ETS books and Oxford Concise Grammar Books.

e) Prescribed/Recommended Teaching Methodology
A systematised lesson pattern has been recommended consisting of the following standard set of stages.

i) Revision

ii) Presentation

iii) Group Imitation (limited work to practice noises given in presentation. Practice of questions/answers. Opportunity for teacher to correct pronunciation mistakes).
Tanzania: The Language Curriculum

(continued)

iv) Group Demonstration (gives children a model for group practice)

v) Group practice (children from ‘demonstration groups’ return to practice groups and lead other children through the practice).

(Brown 1978)

There is, then, a fairly rigid, systematised lesson pattern recommended – which is intended to embody desirable methodological practices (with an audio-lingual/structural flavour).

f) Actual Teaching Methods (The ‘Operational Curriculum’)

See Section on ‘Teachers’.

g) Supplementary Teaching Materials/Equipment

None. (Criper & Dodd 1984).

h) Exposure to English Outside Subject Classes

English has no function or use in the school environment outside subject classes. In the community (especially in rural areas) Swahili and local languages are the principal means of everyday communication. There is also little exposure to English through the media (radio, newspapers, film) in most rural areas. The average pupil, therefore, has little opportunity to gain exposure to English in or out of school. For him, English is most definitely a foreign language.
3. **The Language Curriculum at Level 2 Cycle 1: (Secondary School: Forms 1-4)**

a) **Position of English in the Curriculum**

English is taught as a compulsory subject from Form 1 to Form 4 in all types of secondary school following different curricular biases. It is also examined as a compulsory subject in CSE (Form 4) examination. Additionally, English is the official medium of instruction for all subjects except Kiswahili and Politics. Unofficially, owing to low standards of English, Kiswahili is used as an instructional medium for much of the time — especially in Form 1. One estimate puts Kiswahili usage in Form 1 at about 75% of available classroom time.

b) **Official Time Allocation for English Language Teaching**

Forms 1-4. Five periods (of 45 minutes) per week in all biases. The actual time available is probably significantly less for reasons already alluded to. There are reports that Form 1 students frequently arrive after the official beginning of the first term of the year.

c) **General Aims/Goals of English Language Instruction**

As officially detailed, they fall into two categories: socio-political objectives and 'competence' objectives.

i) **Socio-political:** "During their study of English students should grow to appreciate the cultural and political values of Tanzania and to develop socialist attitudes ... they should be able to express these values and attitudes in both national and international situations." (MNE syllabus 1979).

ii) **Competence:** "The objectives of the English course are to develop in all students by the end of Form 4 competence in:

   (i) oral expression using basic structures
   (ii) listening skills
   (iii) reading comprehension
   (iv) summary writing
   (v) writing English (for various defined purposes)
   (vi) handling situations that call for the use of English (eg. telephone conversations
   (vii) the use of language skills to investigate areas of personal or community interest"

(MNE syllabus 1979)
Tanzania: The Language Curriculum

As is evident above, there is an attempt at an objectives approach to syllabus/curriculum construction. However, the objectives are imprecisely stated and are not expressed in behavioural form.

d) Official Syllabus and Textbooks

1. The current syllabus dates from 1979 and is divided into eight parts as follows:
   i) Aims and Objectives: (as above)
   ii) Structures: (essentially a long list of structures to be taught. The teaching of each structure is said to involve writing exercises, readings, aural/oral approaches, spelling and preposition work).
   iii) Reading Programme: (Forms 1 & 2 a mixture of extensive and intensive reading based around the class library and class reader. The syllabus calls for the circulation of 50 books of at least 35 titles! Forms 3 and 4 reading programme is based on reading of set books (literature) grouped into thematic areas. These are examined at CSE).
   iv) Writing Programme: (A list of purposes for writing and genres is provided (eg. business letters, letters to editors) as a basis for class writing activity. A gradual progression from controlled to free writing is envisaged).
   v) Oral/Aural Programme: (A list of suggested activities for the development of listening/speaking skills (eg. debates/discussions)).
   vi) Project Work: (Suggested project activities involving the integration of language skills are listed (eg. class newspapers))
   vii) Particular Problems: (A list of common problem areas/errors for Tanzanian learners of English).
   viii) Evaluation: (details of the CSE English examination)

Though it contains some useful ideas, the syllabus does not offer sufficient practical and detailed guidance to the teacher (especially on grading, sequencing, presentation, contextualisation of structures). It is more an inventory than a syllabus.
Tanzania: The Language Curriculum

d) (continued)

2. Textbooks

There is apparently no one coursebook used for the Form 1–4 English programme. Therefore, teachers use a variety of books, as available, to cover the different parts of the syllabus. Little information is available about which books are used but it is known that they include the following:

Isaacs - 'Learning through Language'
Mackin - 'Exercises in English Patterns and Usage'
Hindmarsh - 'Understand and Write'
Munby - 'Read and Think'

For the reading programme (Language 3: Forms 3–4) the syllabus lists a number of set books under various themes. These are mainly novels by African writers, for example:

- Tradition and the Family: Camara Laye - "The African Child"
- Conflict: Chinua Achebe - "No Longer at Ease"
- Building the Future: Ngugi, J - "Weep Not Child"
- Protest: Abrahams - "Mine Boy"
- Self-Awareness & Personality: Amadi - "The Concubine"

3. Textbook Availability

There is an acute shortage of textbooks. Criper & Dodd (1984:28) report that most schools have insufficient copies of any textbook/supplementary book to issue to a class. There are almost none of the class library/class reader books referred to in the Reading Programme (Forms 1–3), and there is a shortage of set books for the Language 3 programme.

4. Teacher's Handbook

A rather old teacher's handbook dating from 1973 (MNE 1973) is in existence. The extent of its availability in schools is unknown, however. The handbook contains suggestions/advice on how to teach the various parts of the syllabus above. This advice is recorded in the following section (e).
Tanzania: The Language Curriculum

e) Prescribed/Recommended Teaching Methodology

The 1973 Teacher's Handbook makes a number of methodological suggestions as follows:

Structures:
A variety of ways of presenting and contextualising structures are suggested (eg. dialogues, substitution tables). Also proposed are different exercises and drills (eg. gap-filling, sentence completion).

Reading:
The handbook lists titles of class readers, suggests various class reading activities and illustrates the various kinds of questions that may be set to test reading comprehension.

Writing:
The progression from controlled to guided to free writing is illustrated, writing activities for different purposes are suggested, and actual writing exercises provided.

Oral/Aural:
There are very few suggestions relating to this component. The handbook simply states that 'every aspect of the 4 year programme should stress an oral response.' Thus, the guidance given to the teacher is minimal.

Projects:
A very 'thin' list of project activities/topics is provided along with hints on evaluation of projects.

Particular Problems:
Greatest attention is given to spelling problems, and large amounts of space are occupied by lists of words likely to cause difficulty.

The language teaching methodology recommended in the handbook is by current standards old-fashioned. It is clearly informed by behaviourist approaches to learning, structural approaches to language description and audio-lingual/situational teaching techniques. Great emphasis, for example, is placed on:

i) Control: the handbook states that input and output should be carefully controlled and monitored.

"... students are not permitted the chance to offer incorrect .... responses because the professional language teacher controls the stimuli." (1973:2)
"... control is released little by little" (ie. programmed teaching/learning)
Tanzania: The Language Curriculum

e) (continued)
What are now referred to as ‘fluency activities’ (Brumfit 1984) are thus apparently excluded.

ii) Reinforcement
The handbook states that the taught item should be ....

"used over and over again, in a variety of interesting ways."

Here, behaviourist principles of reinforcement and habit formation seem implicit. The handbook does, however, make a general appeal for ‘variety and ‘interest’ in the language class.

f) Actual Teaching Methods (The ‘Operational Curriculum’)
See section on ‘Teachers’.

Supplementary Teaching Materials/Equipment
Criper & Dodd (1984:29) report that no schools had equipment assumed by the syllabus, eg. tape-recorders and tapes.

There are also apparently no other kinds of audio-visual/technological aids available (eg. radio, television, etc).

h) Exposure to English Outside Subject Classes
English is, in theory, the medium of instruction at secondary school. In fact, however, most teaching, especially in Form 1, takes place through Kiswahili. Thus, pupils have reduced exposure to English in other subject classes. In the school environment as a whole there is, apparently, little use of English (Criper & Dodd 1984:35). Formal school business (eg. assemblies) is conducted in Swahili as is most student-staff, student-student communication outside the classroom. Additionally, books/materials in English are in a very scarce supply.
The extent to which English is used in extra-curricular activities (eg. English clubs, debating or drama societies) is unclear. However, Criper & Dodd (1984) imply that it is low.
Tanzania: The Language Curriculum

h) (continued)
In the community outside the school the principal means of everyday communication is, again, Kiswahili or local languages. Thus, most pupils experience English as a foreign not as a second language. Criper & Dodd (1984) recommend that exposure to English be increased through:

i) greater use of English in formal school business.
ii) more extra-curricular activities in English.
iii) encouraging English use outside the classroom.
iv) a six-month intensive English 'conversion course' for Form 1 arrivals - to raise proficiency in English and make English medium education possible.
v) an Extensive Reading Programme.
4. The Language Curriculum at Level 2 Cycle 2: Secondary School (Forms 5-6)

a) Position of English in the Curriculum

English continues to be used as a medium of instruction for all Form 5/6 students. However, it is only taught as a subject to those taking Arts courses. Students in science streams do not receive any further English language instruction.

Students entering University have a study-skills course in English. There is, at present, no requirement for English for university entry though (from 1985) a pass in English at CSE will become a condition of entry.

b) Official Time Allocation for English Language Teaching

For those following the English language syllabus in Forms 5/6: Eight periods of 45 minutes per week (five hours and 20 minutes).

The actual time available is most probably less than this.

c) Aims/Goals of English Language Instruction

As officially detailed, they are as follows:

General Aims:
1. to give students some basic knowledge about the English Language.
2. to make the students more competent in the use of the English Language so that they can use it as a tool for self expression and international communication.
3. to develop in students the following attitudes:
   - commitment to the Socialist development of Tanzania and the world-wide liberation struggle.
   - respect for African and Tanzanian culture.” (MNE 1982)

Course Objectives:
1. to make the students aware of how the English language is organized so that they can provide simple description at its phonological, lexical and syntactical level.
2. to develop communicative competence in the language (in listening, speaking, reading, writing).
3. to develop students’ appreciation of language in its literary function and enable them to respond to the form and content of various literary works.” (MNE 1982)
c) (continued)
The objectives above are content/proficiency objectives rather than behavioural objectives. They are not specified in great detail - and thus do not provide in themselves a sufficient basis for evaluation.

d) Official Syllabus and Textbooks
The current syllabus dates from 1982 and divides into six 'topic' areas as follows:
i) Topic 1: Language: Its Nature and Use
This primarily involves the study of sociolinguistic concepts and patterns (eg. national languages, role of English in Tanzania, language policy, etc).

ii) Topic 2: Phonology
This covers the study of the English sound system, stress and intonation, rhythm etc. The study of punctuation is also placed in this category.

iii) Topic 3: Syntax
This involves the study of:
- words and their parts
- word classes (major and minor)
- clause structure
- the noun phrase
- the verb phrase
- the prepositional phrase

iv) Topic 4: Lexis
This covers the study of word-formation (affixes, prefixes, suffixes) and 'similarities and differences' of meaning.

v) Topic 5: Stylistics
This involves the study of varieties of English and different genres - as well as linguistic style markers.
Tanzania: The Language Curriculum

vi) Topic 6: Communication Skills
This is easily the largest topic area. It includes a complete reading programme of literary works (plays, novels, non-fiction, poetry) mainly by African authors.
Apart from this literature programme, the topic area also includes the development of:
→ listening skills (a few listening comprehension activities are listed)
→ speaking skills (various forms of speaking are listed: spontaneous, dramatic, prepared)
→ writing skills (different forms of writing are listed - along with literary, cohesive, rhetorical devices which should be mastered)
→ reading skills (mention is made of different types/purposes of reading).

The syllabus ends with a statement on evaluation. Assessment takes the following form:

i) continuous assessment
ii) oral examination aural comprehension controlled production conversation
iii) written examination (two papers for school candidates).

Textbooks
Criper & Dodd (1984:33) state that there are no textbooks available for the Form 5-6 English syllabus and that teachers use whatever is available. The syllabus (at the end) does, however, recommend certain grammar books, - for use (presumably) by teachers and students. These include:

- Svartvik & Leech - 'A Communicative Grammar of English'
- Quirk, Greenbaum et al - 'A University Grammar of English'
- Leech - 'Meaning and the English Verb'
For the literature reading part of the course, the syllabus prescribes a number of set books. These include (for example):

- Soyinka, W - 'The Jero Plays' (Drama)
- Wright, R - 'Native Son' (Novel)
- Fanon, F - 'The Wretched of the Earth' (Non-Fiction)
- Jackson, G - 'Soledad Brother' (Non-Fiction)

**Textbook Availability**

Little information is available about the extent of textbook availability. Criper & Dodd (1984:33) imply that textbooks are very scarce. On the basis of the situation in Forms 1-4 (and taking into account the severe shortage of foreign exchange), one can fairly safely assume that textbooks are in very short supply.

**Teachers' Handbook**

As far as is possible to determine, there is no teachers' handbook specifically directed at the Form 5/6 course. The syllabus itself contains very little guidance on teaching procedures.

**Syllabus Evaluation**

As may be evident, the syllabus has more the character of an undergraduate linguistics/stylistics course than of a school level proficiency course. The emphasis appears to be on understanding the structure of the English language and on literature/stylistic analysis. There is little concern evident for developing students' ability to use English fluently and accurately in communication as opposed to the ability to talk about the language in an informed way.

The syllabus itself is mainly an inventory of topics to be covered. There are few (or no) suggestions as to grading, sequencing, presentation of the material, and there is no guidance given to the teacher regarding teaching procedures.

Criper & Dodd (1984) point out the syllabus assumes a basic competence in English; yet, as they show, by the end of Form 4 students' proficiency in English remains low. There is a mismatch then, between the level of competence actually possessed by students and that assumed by the syllabus. A change of focus, away from linguistic analysis and towards improving students' basic proficiency is recommended (Criper & Dodd 1984).
Tanzania: The Language Curriculum

e) Prescribed/Recommended Teaching Methodology
There appears to be no teachers' handbook. Therefore, there is no methodology prescribed/recommended. The syllabus contains no advice on teaching procedures, other than naming a number of language skills activities. However, group-work is advocated in order "... to develop attitudes of cooperation and self-reliance in the students." (MNE 1982)
f) Actual Teaching Methods
See section on 'Teachers'.
g) Supplementary Teaching Materials/Equipment
Very little. There are almost no audio–visual aids (eg. radio, video, OHP) available.
h) Exposure to English outside Subject Classes
Essentially, the same comments apply to Form 5/6 students as were made with regard to Form 1-4 students. Students have little exposure to English because the language of formal/informal communication in the school is predominantly Swahili. Little information is available about extra-curricular activities conducted in English.
Tanzania: The Language Curriculum

Sources:


(1979) *English Language Syllabus (Forms 5-6)*. University of Dar-es-Salaam.

(1979) *English Language Syllabus (Revised)*. Dar-es-Salaam.


National Examinations Council (1984) *Advanced Certificate of Secondary Education: English Language Papers 1,2,3*.


A.5 THE EXAMINATION SYSTEM

Introduction (Outline)

The Primary School Leaving Examination (PSLE): An Outline

The Form 4 Examination (CSE): An Outline

The Form 6 Examination (ACSE): An Outline
Tanzania: The Examination System

Introduction: Outline

The National Examinations Council of Tanzania (established in 1971) administers, sets and marks the major public examinations at school and teacher college level. (The university and some higher education institutions examine autonomously). In the marking and setting of examinations some assistance is provided by the teaching force who are also required to maintain continuous assessment records. These have constituted one form of student assessment since 1975.

The main school examinations are as follows:

- the Primary School Leaving Examination (PSLE) at end of Grade 7. (Certificates are issued by Regional Education Authorities).
- the Certificate of Secondary Education (CSE) – the examination at the end of Form 4 (secondary). Classified in Divisions 1-4. (Equivalent to East Africa O'Level examination).
- the National Form 6 Examinations at end of Form 6 Secondary. Classified in Divisions 1-4. (Equivalent to East Africa A'Level examination).

Examinations in Tanzania are an important determinant of life-chances and of entry to higher levels of education. They are therefore of vital interest and concern to pupils, teachers, parents and the public.
Tanzania: The Examination System

b) The Primary School Leaving Examination (PSLE): An Outline

1. Function of the PSLE
The PSLE functions almost exclusively as an instrument for selection to Form 1 of secondary school. Results are not available to individual pupils/parents/teachers. There is no feedback of results to headteachers and no analysis of attainment levels is made publicly available. (King 1984). It is important to note that PSLE results do not straightforwardly determine Form 1 selection. A district regional quota system for Form 1 places operates.

2. Setting/Administration/Marking
The NEC has responsibility for the examination. From 1983/84 all marking and setting is done centrally.

3. Language of Examination
Swahili in all papers except for the English language paper.

4. Subjects and Number of Papers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Swahili</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mathematics</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Science</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General Knowledge</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The change to centralised marking in 1983/84 has meant a reduction in the number of papers to three: - Languages; - Mathematics; - General Knowledge.

5. Type of Examination
All examinations are of objective, multiple-choice type including language papers.

6. Other Notes
Abuses in the PSLE are widely noted and reported. For example, a 1985 newspaper report that 3,300 Form 1 entrants had their PSLE results nullified after discovery of irregularities.
Tanzania: The Examination System

6.

(continued)

- It is also reported that during examinations teachers/invigilators were involved in: writing answers; giving answers orally; allowing pupils to help each other.
- Stealing and selling examination papers is a fairly common occurrence.
- Switching of examination numbers from bright pupils to help teachers' relatives is also reported.

One of the motivations for the 1983/84 centralisation was to reduce corrupt practices among local education officials.

Cooksey & Ishumi (1986) report that in recent years different versions of the PSLE have been administered in different regions. Results/marks are not published, however. Therefore, they wonder if raw scores rather than standardised scores are used. If so, it is doubtful whether examinations are comparable in discriminating powers. Overall, the PSLE is an unreliable selection instrument.

Doubt is also cast on the quality of the PSLE.

Little's (1981) JASPA report alleges technical problems of good item writing. It also claims that the English and Mathematics papers have a large proportion of items testing 'application of rules'.

7.

The English Language Examination

Duration: 1 hour paper (1)

Format: 40 multiple-choice questions

Content: Sections on grammar/structure; sentence completion/gap filling; reading comprehension

Criper & Dodd (1984) make the following observations about the examination:

- in many instances it is unclear what is being tested
- difficult areas of lexis/grammar tested
- reading comprehension passage too difficult for pupils
- reading questions can be answered without reference to the passage
- errors of English in the examination paper

It is clear, then, that the existing examination is unsuitable and of low quality.
Tanzania: The Examination System
c) The Form 4 Examination (CSE): An Outline

1. The Function of the CSE
   The CSE is used both for certification (there are four classes or divisions (1-4) of certificate) and for selection into Form 5 of secondary school.

2. Setting/Administration/Marking
   The NEC has responsibility for the examination.

3. Language of Examination
   English in most subjects (not in Kiswahili, Siasa (politics)).

4. Subjects
   Nearly all curricular subjects are examined.

5. Type of Examination
   Mixed. Multiple-choice type questions, essays and short-answer formats.

6. Other Notes
   Attainment in the Form 4 examination is reported to be low and falling. Four out of five 'fail' in that their grades are inadequate for Form 5 entry.

7. The English Language Examination
   Duration: Paper 1 3 1/4 hours.
   Format: Variable. Multiple-choice and short-answer as well as compositions/essays and continuous assessment during the course.
   Content
   - reading comprehension (10 questions)
   - summary
   - structure (10-15 questions)
   - writing (one essay, letter or other composition)
   - writing on literature (Section B of CSEE)

Two essays on socio-political themes from set books
7. (continued)

Criper & Dodd (1984) make the following observations about the examination:

- variation in format over the years (sometimes multiple-choice, sometimes other, eg. open-ended, sentence transformations)
- inconsistency about what should be tested and how
- mismatch between level of the examination and level of the pupils (ie. paper is too difficult and the resulting 'pass mark' is reputed to be as low as 20-25%)
- Section B essay questions more about content, therefore do not test competence in English.

They conclude (1984:37) that the "... current format and content of the examination requires drastic improvement."

They recommend: the abandonment of continuous assessment, and the introduction of an oral component.

d) The Form 6 Examination (ACSE): An Outline

1. The Function of the ACSE (Advanced Certificate of Secondary Education)

The ACSE has a dual certification and selection function. It certifies attainment over the two-year Form 5-6 course. It is also used to select students for entry to university and higher education. There are four classes or Divisions of Certificate (1-4).

2. Setting/Administration/Marking

The NEC is responsible for the examination.

3. Language of Examination

English (not for Kiswahili).

4. Subjects

N/A (data).

5. Type of Examination

Dependent on subject. In English, questions requiring essay-type answers predominate.
6. Other Notes

7. The English Language Examination (ACSE)

Duration

Paper 1: 3 hours (compulsory) (language structure)
Paper 2: 3 hours (compulsory) (stylistics/literature)
Paper 3: 3 hours for private candidates only:
         (language proficiency)

Format: predominantly essays or short notes required.

Content

Paper 1: Analysis of Language Structure
         eg.
         - parsing and naming of word classes
         - notes on sociolinguistic concepts
           (eg. a standard language)
         - constituent analysis
         - lexical morphology: analysis
         - lexical semantics: use of antonyms, hyponyms etc.

Paper 1 (1984) Sample Question:

3(c) "State, with examples, four functions which a noun phrase
     fulfils in sentence structure."
Tanzania: The Examination System

7. (continued)

Paper 2: Stylistics/Literature

- Five essays, one from each section
  i) Stylistics
  ii) Plays
  iii) Novels and Short Stories prescribed
  iv) Non-Fiction set books
  v) Poetry

Paper 2 (1984) Sample Question:

(6) "Choose one novel or short story which you would consider to be a successful work of art. What is the central problem underlying the work? How has the writer successfully used language, characterization, organization of the episodes etc? Use extensive examples from the work of your choice to illustrate the answer."

Paper 3 (Private candidates only): Language Proficiency

Section A: Essay Writing, eg. "What do you understand by cultural liberation?"

Section B: Comprehension: open-ended questions on a literary passage/literary appreciation.

Section C: Response to readings (essays on set books)

Criper & Dodd (1984:38) make the following observations about the examination:

- questions resemble undergraduate linguistics/stylistics examination papers
- questions do not test use of English or proficiency. The emphasis is on linguistic/stylistic analysis of English.
- there is a mismatch between the level of the examination (high) and the level of the students (low).

They, therefore, recommend revision of the ACSE English paper to "bring it into line with the actual level of the pupils in Form 5/6"
Sources:


(1984) ACSE English Language 1984

Paper 1 Paper 2 Paper 3
A.6 LEARNERS

Learners at Level 1

Learners at Level 2

Learners Outside the Formal Education System

(Attainment, Language Proficiency, Ages, Class Size/Composition, Motivation, Learning Styles)
1. **Learners at Level 1 (Primary School)**

a) **Levels of Academic Attainment**

According to Carr—Hill (1984) and King (1984), PSLE results are not made available to pupils, parents or teachers, nor is there any analysis of average attainment. It is, therefore, difficult to make estimates of the academic attainment levels of primary school leavers—though anecdotal evidence and inspectors' reports (cf. Carr—Hill 1984) suggest low and declining attainment levels.

One study by Haule (1979) of literacy achievement in the Mbeya region (sample: 305 pupils, using Kiswahili tests) concluded that ".... about half the pupils will leave school without a good foundation in literacy skills at the functional level."

b) **English Language Proficiency**

Criper & Dodd (1984) used a cloze test to assess the English language proficiency of Standard 7 primary school pupils (non-random sample). They found that:

- 68% of sampled pupils were incapable of reading the most basic, simplified reader (300 headwords and present tense).
- no pupils were at a high enough level to carry out independent reading.

In other words, ".... most children in Standard 7 are still unable to understand and answer simple questions, to ask questions themselves, to read with understanding or to write simple sentences." (1984:17)

It has to be said, then, that English language education in primary schools is a failure.

c) **Pupils Ages**

The nominal age of entry to Grade 1 primary school is seven years. In fact, pupils enter Grade 1 at any age between 5 and 15. Many enter at the ages of 10 and 11\(^\text{12}\). The Primary School Sub-sector Review (1981) estimated that in their sample one third of children were outside the official school enrolment age and around 20% of 14 years or over.

\(^\text{12}\)King (1984) suggests that many parents delay entry in order to enhance their childrens' examination prospects.
Tanzania: Learners

(c) (continued)
This means that classes contain pupils of different ages. In other words, they are of heterogeneous composition in terms of age.

d) Class Size and Composition
Classes are generally of mixed ability. The average size of class varies between districts. However, a typical size is of between 40-50 pupils (the UPE programme increased class size overall). In terms of language background, rural classes tend to be relatively homogenous, urban classes less so.

e) Pupil Motivation and Attitude
There is very little reliable evidence as to primary pupils motivation and attitude toward schooling.
Some possible indicators of motivation/attitude are attendance/drop-out rates, disciplinary/truancy problems.
The national primary attendance rate (MNE 1984) is fairly satisfactory at between 85-90% though there is, of course, substantial variation, and some 'problem' schools.
The national drop-out rate from primary education is low by African standards at 3.24% overall at the national level (1980). Again, though there is substantial variation between districts. Drop-out rates are said to be higher among UPE children and girls. Omari (1982) cites the following reasons for higher drop-out rates:
- parental apathy
- outside employment
- long home-school distances
- dull teaching
- poor classroom conditions
- nutrition and ill-health
- lack of uniform

No substantial disciplinary problems are reported.
Tanzania: Learners

f) Pupil Learning Styles/Expectations

Very little evidence is available. However, from what is known of teaching, it is possible to assert that pupils are accustomed to formal teacher-centred teaching/learning methods and fairly harsh discipline. Lecturing, note-giving and rote-learning are common. Learners are not asked, or expected, to take much initiative in learning. Classes are firmly teacher-led, and learners are expected to respect the teacher as an authority figure.
Tanzania: Learners

2. **Learners at Level 2 (Secondary School)**

a) **Levels of Academic Attainment**

Because Tanzania has one of the most selective secondary school populations in the world, it might be expected that levels of academic attainment might be correspondingly high. The available evidence suggests, however, that this is not the case. The following evidence can be cited:

i) Failure rates (1977-1979) of between 40-60% are common in the Forms 4 and 6 final examinations in mathematics, physics and chemistry.

ii) A World Bank/UNESCO study (1981) used IEA tests in reading and mathematics as well as mathematics and reading questions from an earlier World Bank survey (1980) to assess attainment levels among secondary school pupils. A randomly selected sample of 986 students from Form 1 and Form 3 in twelve secondary schools was tested. All test questions were in English.

The Form 1 and 3 results of the IEA mathematics questions were compared with results of 13-year olds in twelve developed countries. Overall, results indicate that Tanzanians (17 years or older) performed at the same level as 13-year olds in developed countries.

As regards reading, Tanzanian Form 1 and 3 results were compared with results in four other developing countries (Chile, Iran, India and Thailand). The performance of the Tanzanians in reading falls below the bottom range of these countries in all populations under study (ie. population 1=10 year olds, population 2=14 year olds, population 4=senior secondary school pupils).

Overall, then, Tanzanian pupils in Forms 1-3 perform at the same level in reading and mathematics as those in the upper primary cycle of developed countries.
Tanzania: Learners

a) (continued)
The effect of English versus Swahili on reading was tested by administering non-L EA reading questions to three randomly divided sub-samples: Group A receiving questions in English only, Group B questions in Swahili only, Group C questions in both languages. Students were drawn from Forms 1 and 3. In both forms the group taking the English-only version scored markedly lower than those taking the Swahili-only version. Although the above study was cross-sectional not longitudinal in nature, it was possible to ascertain the cognitive yield of 2/3 years secondary education by comparing Form 3 results with the PSLE results of the same pupils as well as with other Form 1 pupils' scores. The results indicate that "... the increments to performance ascribable to two more years of secondary schooling are plainly disappointing in mathematics and reading."

b) English Language Proficiency
Criper & Dodd (1984) (on the basis of the cloze proficiency test results) report that in Form 1 25% of all pupils are unable to read connected texts while 60% are still only able to read 500 word picture books. By Form 4 less than 10% are able to read easy, unsimplified texts. 33% are still at the picture book reading level. Only about 10% are at a level "... at which one might expect English medium education to begin." (1984:14)
The general picture, then, is one of low levels of English language proficiency. The situation improves a little in Form 5 where the proportion of pupils near an independent reading level is 17%.

c) Pupils' Ages
The nominal age of entry into Form 1 is 14 years. In fact, however, because pupils often enter primary school at later than the official age (7 years), it is quite common for pupils to be older than 14 years. The age range at Form 1 entry can, then, be quite wide (15-21 years). Some studies report cases of students over 21 years entering Form I. The result is heterogeneity in terms of class age composition.
Tanzania: Learners

d) Class Size and Composition
The 1981 pupil:teacher ratio overall at a national level was 21:1, indicating an overall typical class size of about 20. More detailed breakdown figures for regions and subjects are not available. The officially permitted ceiling for class size is 35 students.

It is reported that class sizes tend to be larger in private schools. Samoff (1985:11) mentions classes with as many as 45 students.

Nearly all classes are of mixed ability. Streaming of classes by ability is a rare or non-existent practice (for ideological reasons). Criper & Dodd (1984:28) note that many classes contain pupils of very different proficiency levels. They point out the difficulties this poses for teachers and recommend that by 1986 classes in Form 1 should be streamed or set according to ability in English.

No data is available on the composition of secondary classes in terms of language background.

e) Pupil Motivation and Attitude
Little evidence is available (eg. on drop-out, attendance rates). However, the strong private demand for secondary schooling as indicated in the growth of private schools and in the expansion of evening classes (King 1984) suggests that students are favourably motivated toward schooling – perhaps not so much toward education per se but towards the examination certificates and enhanced life-chances that education confers.

Attitudes to English language learning are unclear. There are indications that students value English learning for instrumental reasons (eg. ‘getting on’, ‘getting a job’ etc) but are unhappy for political/ ideological/ nationalistic reasons to be seen to be too enthusiastic about English and its use.

Bhaiji (1976) and Mvungi (1982) found that 2/3 of sampled secondary school students were opposed to the introduction of Swahili as medium of instruction. Rubagumya (1984) reports that given a choice between two daily newspapers – ‘Daily News’ and ‘Uhuru’ – most Tanzanians, including himself would prefer the former.

Katigula’s study (1976) finds that most pupils have a positive attitude toward English and are highly motivated learners though their proficiency is low.
Tanzania: Learners

f) Pupil Learning Styles/Expectations
Little direct evidence is available. From what is known of teaching, (Mbilinyi (1978)), it is possible, however, to say that pupils are accustomed, as in primary school, to formal teaching methods and harsh discipline. They typically have a passive role assimilating/copying information transmitted by the teacher. There is very little discovery/experimental work or active participation on the part of learners. Mbilinyi (1978) says, moreover, that "... it is often the students who object to more creative, problem-solving and co-operative approaches to instruction, on the grounds that they will not have time to finish the syllabus and do well in final examinations." (1978:104).
The teacher is also, according to normative expectation (Mbilinyi 1978), meant to have "almost absolute power over students."

3. Learners Outside the Formal Education System
Criper & Dodd (1984:8) make the important point that there are more Tanzanians studying English outside the formal secondary school system than in it – a point also alluded to by King (1984:29).
The main agencies involved here are:
i) The Institute of Adult Education (Eight English language courses with 5,800 students).
ii) Adult education evening classes run mainly at secondary schools (6,300 students).
iii) The National Correspondence Institution (Four English language courses with 5,000 students).
They also note that about 300 institutions offer further education/training for primary and secondary school leavers mainly through the medium of English.
Sources:


A.7 TEACHERS AND TEACHING

Teachers at Level 1

Teachers at Level 2

(Numbers, education/qualification, age/experience, competence, language proficiency, teaching style/methods, teaching load, morale/motivation, teacher-training, in-service training, teacher support facilities, teacher supply)
Tanzania: Teachers and Teaching

1. **Teachers at Level 1 (Primary School)**
   a) Total Number of Teachers (1983) 85,308
      % female 49% (1983)
   b) Overall Pupil:Teacher Ratio (1983) 42:1
   c) Teacher Qualification/Education

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Qualifications</th>
<th>Male %</th>
<th>Female %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Grade II b,c,d (ie. Form 6 and two years' teacher-training college or university graduate)</td>
<td>8.6</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Grade IIIa (Grade A) (ie. Form 4 leavers and two years' teacher-training)</td>
<td>19.4</td>
<td>18.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade IIIb (ie. old standard 10 leavers and two years' teacher-training)</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>7.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade IIIc (Grade C) (Standard 7 leavers and three years of teacher-training)</td>
<td>32.4</td>
<td>34.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Grade IIIa (Grade A) Second year teaching practice students</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade IIIc (Grade C) Third year teaching practice students</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>4.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DLS Distance Learning trained teachers (Standard 7 leavers)</td>
<td>29.2</td>
<td>26.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Tanzania: Teachers and Teaching

(continued)

The basic pattern of teacher education/qualification (as described by Carr-Hill (1984) is fairly clear. There is:

- a small proportion (Grades II b,c,d) of Form 6 leavers with university degrees or two years’ teacher-training
- a slightly larger proportion (Grade III A) of Form 4 leavers with two years’ teacher-training
- the majority, about half, (Grade III C) - Standard 7 leavers with three years’ teacher-training

In addition, since 1977 and the introduction of UPE, there has been a Distance Learning Scheme to train large numbers of primary teachers - mostly Standard 7 leavers. The aim was to produce about 45,000 DLS teachers by 1980. In fact, statistics show 22,868 such teachers in post by 1980 - around 28% of the total stock of teachers.

1980 statistics yield the following breakdown of the total primary teaching stock.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grade II</td>
<td>6,427</td>
<td>7.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade III</td>
<td>48,002</td>
<td>59.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distance Learning</td>
<td>22,868</td>
<td>28.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teaching Practice</td>
<td>3,856</td>
<td>4.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>81,153</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is worth noting that during the 'UPE expansion emergency' the MNE reduced the length of training of Grade C teachers from three to two years and that of Grade A teachers from two years to one.
Tanzania: Teachers and Teaching

(c) (continued)

Future Plans
The 1982 Presidential Commission made the following recommendations/plans with respect to teacher education/qualification:

- In 1983-1993 training for present Grade C teachers will be extended to four years. Teachers will then be certified Grade B teachers.
- From 1997 Grade C training courses will be phased out.
- From 1993 the minimum qualification for enrolment into TTC will be CSE (O' Level) Form 4
- In-service training to upgrade Grade C and B teachers to Grade A
- Increased number of TTCs

English Language Teachers
There has been a policy that primary teachers should teach all subjects and that there should be no specialisation. (Batibo 1983; Criper & Dodd 1984). Criper & Dodd (1984) estimate that one third of primary teachers were teaching English (ie. 30,000) whether or not they were trained or competent to do so.

They recommend a policy of employing English specialists - ie. teachers who would teach English only.

Age and Experience of Teachers
Reliable data is hard to come by. In the Primary School Sub-sector Review (1981) sample of teachers, the mean age of teachers was found to be 23 years. Their mean teaching experience was five years and their mean length of stay in the ‘old’ primary schools was 18 months. (It is worth noting here that this is the wrong statistic to use: the median would have been better).

The same report cites a national attrition rate among primary teachers of around 3%.
Tanzania: Teachers and Teaching

d) (continued)
The stereotypical picture, then, of a Tanzanian primary teacher is of a Standard 7 leaver with three years' teacher-training who is young (around 23) and has about four/five years' teaching experience. 18 months of which will have been in his/her current school.

e) Teacher Competence (Pedagogic)
Teachers' competence in the classroom is invariably hard to assess with reliability. In Tanzania there have been relatively few observational studies. One study by Chale (1983) investigated the performance of a sample of 82 teachers (divided into two groups: DLS and TTC trained) on a range of pedagogic criteria (eg. adaptability, clarity in communication, self-confidence, and interest in child, class management etc). Performance was graded on a three-point nominal scale: competence - not demonstrated, fair, well-demonstrated. It was found that most teachers on most criteria were only fair.

As regards the comparison between DLS teachers and those regularly trained, it was found, surprisingly, that the DLS performed better on most criteria. This is perhaps suggestive of the poor quality of training provided in the colleges.

In general, anecdotal and other evidence suggests that on the whole the level of competence of primary teachers is rather low. Given the low educational attainment (Standard 7) of most teachers and the dubious quality of training, this, however, is perhaps not surprising.
Teachers and Teaching

e) (continued)

**English Language Teachers**

**Teaching Competence:** Both Batibo (1983) and Criper & Dodd (1984) report that those teaching English had a low level of competence in methodology. Batibo (1983:5) says that most "... were half-baked in terms of training in English language methods and teaching."

Criper & Dodd (1984) say that the majority were "... not well trained in English language method."

**Language Proficiency (English)**

It is evident that the English Language proficiency of most primary school teachers is very low.

Batibo (1983) says that less than one third of primary teachers impressed him as having adequate proficiency in the language.

Criper & Dodd (1984), on the basis of the cloze test results, conclude that most teachers now qualifying "... do not even approach the level of fluency and accuracy in the language needed to teach even Primary children."

f) **Teaching Style and Teaching Methods**

The general style of teaching is formal and fairly rigid. There is a considerable amount of lecturing and role-learning/copying. Little exploratory activity takes place - not surprisingly given the low level of resources. Discipline tends to be harsh: there are indications that recourse to beating occurs quite often. Teaching tends, then, to be 'transmission-dominated'.

**English Language Teaching**

Batibo (1983) reports that teachers commonly employ 'translation methods' or oblige students to chant structures listed on the blackboard. They make little effort to check the students' understanding of what they are chanting.

Criper & Dodd (1984) report that teachers frequently lecture about the grammar of the language, or ask students to read aloud from the blackboard or the textbook. Little opportunity is given for pupils to practice using the language in meaningful contexts.
Tanzania: Teachers and Teaching

Teaching Load
The average number of periods taught per week per teacher fluctuates around 30. There is considerable variation between districts. In a study of five districts (Micro Planning Studies 1982/83 in Carr-Hill 1984:31) Sumbawanga had the lowest average (28.0) and Hai the largest (35.7).

Teacher Morale and Motivation
Estimates of teacher motivation are difficult because of lack of reliable data and individual variability.
As regards English language teaching, both Batibo (1983) and Criper & Dodd (1984) report low motivation on the part of teachers. Batibo says that teachers are poorly motivated because of their low proficiency. They only teach English because they are required to do so. There is a general air of lack of confidence. Criper & Dodd attribute poor motivation to teachers' recognition of their lack of competence, the low status of English, and high failure rates in English.
Morale and motivation in general may be linked to working conditions, housing, salary levels. It is, therefore, relevant to consider these.

Working Conditions
As already indicated, working conditions are poor (shortage of textbooks, buildings in bad condition, furniture unavailable). Teachers are also reported as having to spend considerable time on securing basic necessities for their families and themselves (ie. food and household commodities in short supply).

Housing
The Primary School Sub-sector Review (1981) reports that only 21% of primary teachers stay in school houses - the remainder occupy their own homes or rent rooms in the local community. The majority of school houses are shared between teachers 2/3 to a house. Thus, the ordinary teacher has one room "... which serves as the sitting, bedroom and as a reading room where he also prepares his lessons." (1981:16).
Tanzania: Teachers and Teaching

h) (continued)
The Presidential Commission Report 1982 calls for an action plan "to provide .... decent houses for teachers such that by the year 2000 all teachers should have suitable housing accommodation." (1984:37)
One can, therefore, assume that housing accommodation is less than adequate, perhaps unsatisfactory.

iii) Salaries
The basic salary of an (average) Grade IIIc Teacher is indicated below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Monthly Salary</th>
<th>GNP per capita</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1971/76</td>
<td>600 (T shillings)</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1977/78</td>
<td>600</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1981/82</td>
<td>720*</td>
<td>1400</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

("US$ 56 approximately)

It is noticeable that Grade IIIc teachers' salaries are low in relation to GNP per capita (about half). They are also said to be low compared with salaries in other countries of the region. Carr-Hill (1984) concludes that given these salary levels, ".... the continuing commitment of the teachers in post is noteworthy and the temptation for them to engage in private tuition remarkable." (1984:60)

Referring to salaries/schemes of service, the 1982 Presidential Commission Report says that "... the attitude to the role of teachers has grossly discouraged academically able young men and women from enrolling in teacher training courses." (1984:36)

On the basis of these factors (working conditions, housing, salaries), then, it would be surprising if teachers' morale/motivation was anything other than low.
Tanzania: Teachers and Teaching

i) Teaching-Training (Primary School Teachers)

1. The Structure of Teacher-Training

There are 35 colleges of National Education (CNEs) providing teacher-training:

- 19 (Grade C) CNEs training Standard 7 leavers (originally these were boarding primary schools converted into TTCs)
- 16 (Grade A) CNEs training Form 4 leavers to become 'Grade A' teachers and Form 6 leavers as 'Diploma' teachers. (These are purpose-built colleges)

Nearly all colleges are residential. Marangu and a few other colleges specialise in preparing English language teachers.

The Distance Learning Scheme: It should be noted that during the 'UPE emergency' a large number of teachers were trained under the Distance Learning Scheme. This is a three-year non-residential course. Trainees learn through correspondence, radio and six weeks' residence in a CNE. They attend 2,000 centres (primary schools) three times a week for instruction by tutors. Facilities at the centres are poor or non-existent (same as in primary schools). At the end of the course trainees graduate as Grade C teachers.

2. Conditions in the CNEs

In the Grade C colleges conditions are grim. Dormitory facilities are very poor, originally being designed for primary school children. Libraries, laboratories, workshops, audio-visual facilities are unevenly spread or completely unavailable. The lack of practical facilities and the resulting narrow range of learning experiences is a serious problem in training teachers, and enabling them to avoid the predominant lecturing mode of teaching. Almost all Grade C colleges need total rebuilding (UNESCO 1981).

Conditions in the Grade A CNEs are slightly better but still poor. Many need partial renovation.
The language of instruction in most subjects in nearly all CNEs is Kiswahili. Current policy is to train generalist teachers. However, arrangements have been made to train specialised teachers in six colleges (including English teachers at Marangu).

The curriculum of the CNEs contains all subjects taught in the primary school plus professional education.

The total number of periods is 46. This includes four periods for English language (no distinction between proficiency and methodology training) and eight periods for professional education courses.

In general, the curriculum is overcrowded and ill thought out. Trainees' time is thinly spread between many subjects.

Additional problems as regards English are:

i) the shortage or complete absence in CNEs of PET books upon which to base training for English teaching in primary schools.

ii) the low language proficiency of the intake (including Grade A teachers). The intake of Grade A colleges has a lower proficiency than the average level of Form 4 pupils (Criper & Dodd 1984).

Teaching Practice

All CNEs have demonstration schools attached to them in which some trainees undertake teaching practice.

Teaching practice is begun in Term 2 of the first year and continues then for three weeks in each term. Proper supervision of teaching practice is very difficult owing to transport problems and the wide dispersal of trainees.

Examinations

Trainees are evaluated on a continual assessment basis and through final examinations. Very few fail to graduate and the drop-out rate is low – around 5%. CNE graduates are supposed to accept service anywhere in the country but most are offered a preference.
Tanzania: Teachers and Teaching

4. The Training Tutors

There is little data available on the qualifications and quality of tutors in CNE colleges. Criper & Dodd (1984:51) state that their quality as a whole is mixed, some good, others bad.

Carr-Hill (1984:51) reports on a sample of DLS tutors. These (150 in sample) had an average of 10 years’ of schooling, teaching experience of six years. Most had previously been head teachers.

j) In-Service Training

Apart from pre-service training facilities, there is an in-service training college at Bagamoyo which provides nine-month refresher courses.

Long Courses

From 1980 an in-service programme has been launched to upgrade all primary teachers below diploma level. The programme has two phases:

- a nine-month correspondence course
- a residential course of three months in 13 in-service training colleges.

Colleges which now provide llc type training are gradually being converted into in-service colleges.

It is estimated that upgrading will need to cover 100,000 teachers over 12.5 years.

Present in-service courses have been criticised for being too theoretical in their emphasis, for leaving participating teachers too much on their own during the nine-month correspondence phase, and for not distinguishing between the needs of Grade A and Grade C teachers.

Short Courses

Short in-service courses are infrequent. It has been suggested (UNESCO 1981) that teachers’ centres be established along the lines of the one in Moshi. These could then provide short in-service ‘refresher’ courses as required. Current arrangements for short in-service training are unsatisfactory and ‘ad-hoc’.
Tanzania: Teachers and Teaching

k) Teacher Support Facilities: (Teacher Associations, Centres, Publications)

The Presidential Commission Report 1982 states that there is in fact no professional association of teachers in Tanzania (it recommends the establishment of one) and very few subject clubs/associations. At primary level there are few or no publications produced for or by teachers. There is one teachers' centre in Moshi (established in 1979) which is located in a primary school. Its functions are to:

- make available books not found in the primary schools.
- to serve as centres/meeting places for short in-service training courses/workshops
- to act as a social centre

There are no other teachers' centres. However, there are a number of 'academic centres' with similar functions. These are formed through the initiative of local teachers and carry out the following activities:

- display of locally produced learning aids
- discussion of specific teaching problems
- the holding of social functions.

In some centres (eg. Kagera: Lake Zone) teachers' notes/handbooks have been produced in subjects where no textbook has been available.

l) Overall Teacher Supply

The UPE programme has, as indicated previously, placed great strain on teacher supply. The 1982 Presidential Commission Report estimates for 1982 a shortage of primary teachers of 39.94%. Tutors in colleges of education are also in short supply (29.63% short).
Tanzania: Teachers and Teaching

2. Teachers at Level 2: (Secondary School)

a) Total Number of Teachers (1984)  
   4,162

   % female (1984) 27%

b) Overall Pupil:Teacher Ratio (1981)  
   21:1

c) Teacher Education/Qualification

% Distribution of Secondary School Teachers by Qualification and Type of School (1981)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Qualification</th>
<th>Public Schools</th>
<th>Private Schools</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Degree in Science with education</td>
<td>18.5%</td>
<td>14.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Degree in Science without education</td>
<td>0.5%</td>
<td>3.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Degree in Arts with or without education</td>
<td>16.9%</td>
<td>15.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Sub-total degree-holders</td>
<td>35.9%</td>
<td>32.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Diploma in Science subjects</td>
<td>31.6%</td>
<td>7.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Diploma in Arts subjects</td>
<td>24.6%</td>
<td>15.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Sub-total diploma-holders</td>
<td>56.2%</td>
<td>22.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Grade ‘A’ diplomas</td>
<td>4.1%</td>
<td>8.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Other qualifications</td>
<td>3.8%</td>
<td>36.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Total</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The data on staffing in private schools is difficult to interpret in view of the fact that as many as 36.6% of all teachers are listed under 'other qualifications'. However, the table offers evidence that teachers in private schools are less well qualified than those in public schools. Perhaps, this is one factor accounting for the poorer examination results of private schools.

The table also corroborates reports (eg. UNESCO 1981) that about 40% of teachers in public schools are graduates – though the proportion is said to be declining (Cooksey & Ishumi 1986).

English Language Teachers
Criper & Dodd (1984:26) report that in schools visited nearly 40% of English language teachers were graduates, the rest being diploma holders.

It is worth noting here that by 1981 (UNESCO 1981) teaching staffs had been effectively ‘Tanzanianised’. Only very few expatriate teachers (volunteers) remained – a contrast with 1968 when 59% of staff were expatriate.

Future Plans
The 1982 Presidential Commission Report calls for all secondary school posts to be filled by graduates or diploma holders. To accomplish this, it proposes:

- a six months' teaching-training course for Form 6 leavers to meet the existing shortage of teachers
- encouraging religious organisations to establish training colleges
- expanding the University of Dar-es-Salaam, Department of Education and upgrading it to Faculty status.

Age and Experience of Teachers
Reliable data has been hard to trace. There are indications, however, that most secondary teachers are relatively young and presumably, therefore, have relatively little teaching experience.

The drive to recruit more school-leavers as teachers is likely to reduce the average age of the teaching force still further.
Tanzania: Teachers and Teaching

e) Teacher Competence - (Pedagogic)
As with primary teachers, reliable assessment of teachers' classroom competence is difficult. There appear to be few observational studies. Nevertheless, anecdotal and indirect evidence (from poor general levels of pupil attainment) does suggest there may be a problem of poor methodological competence among teachers. A proportion of graduates (and of other teachers at private schools) have apparently received little or no training in classroom methodology.

English Language Teachers
Teaching Competence: According to Criper & Dodd (1984:27) the general level is low. Most teachers are not satisfactorily trained in methodology (many graduates have received no serious methodology training) and most do not have access to a teacher's handbook. They are, therefore, unable to cope adequately with the shortage of textbooks/materials and the low level of students' English. Most have not attended any in-service courses on methodology.

Language Proficiency (English)
Criper & Dodd (1984:27) report that the proficiency of English teachers is varied: some have good English but many (especially recent trainees) are quite weak. Perhaps this is unsurprising given the low proficiency levels recorded among Form 4 and Form 6 students (Criper & Dodd 1984).

f) Teaching Style and Teaching Methods
In general teaching styles are formal, rigid and unimaginative. The dominant conception is of an authoritative teacher transmitting 'objective knowledge' to students. Teachers frequently rely on rote-memory teaching to match the demands of the Form 4 examination. Common teaching methods are:

- the 'copy-copy' method: teacher copies notes onto the blackboard, the students copy these into their exercise-books and learn them by heart.
- the 'copy-copy-question/answer' method: the teacher revises previous material by asking questions, he copies notes on the board, students copy these into their books and there then follows a final question/answer session in which the teacher checks understanding of the notes (Mbilinyi 1978:107).
Tanzania: Teachers and Teaching

f) (continued)

Teacher-student relationships tend to be very formal and discipline is harsh. Mbilinyi (1978) reports that beating of students with canes is common. Cooksey & Ishumi (1986:44) quote one headmaster as saying:

"... students who performed well ... were given cash prizes while students who performed poorly in term exams were given strokes of the cane to ensure that they performed better in future."

The harsh discipline and authoritarian relationship between teacher and student is reflected in the authoritarian and hierarchical administrative structure of the school. This forms a pyramid. The headteacher at the top has 'de jure' power over the subjects taught by each teacher and their non-teaching duties. The teachers themselves are stratified according to academic background. This stratification is perceived by students and affects staff-student relationships. Science teachers are frequently perceived as having greater prestige/status. Consequently, they sometimes constitute a socially separate group from Arts teachers. Under a prefectorial system, a set of hierarchical relationships also prevails among students themselves. At the bottom of the pyramid, 'bossed' by teachers and students alike, are the ancillary workers – cooks, messengers and clerical staff. In short, the 'hidden' curriculum is of a formal, authoritarian, hierarchical school culture which is at odds with publicly avowed norms of egalitarianism and self-reliance (see Mbilinyi 1978).

English Language Teaching

Criper & Dodd (1984:28) report that, as in primary school, teaching is mechanical and unimaginative. Teachers lecture about grammar and get pupils to do mechanical exercises. There is little opportunity for meaningful practice/use of the language and oral work tends to be neglected. Reading aloud and question/answer sessions are common. In the literature component (language 3) a common approach is for teachers to give out summary notes and lecture on the themes. Therefore, pupils do not learn to read and interpret as originally intended.
g) **Teaching Load**

Data on teachers' teaching loads has not been traced. The 1982 Presidential Commission Report recommends that every teacher (except the Head and Deputy) should teach 28–35 periods per week. It is not known whether this corresponds to the load actually borne in schools at present. There is likely to be some variation between schools depending on teacher supply in particular subjects.

h) **Teacher Morale and Motivation**

It has to be recognised that estimates of morale/motivation are inevitably difficult and subjective. Various sources (eg. Cooksey & Ishumi) do, however, refer to low levels of motivation/morale among the secondary school teaching force.

As regards English language teachers, Criper & Dodd (1984:27) also mention low morale. They attribute this to such factors as:

- lack of books and equipment
- low status of English nationally
- the mismatch between pupils' language proficiency and level assumed in the syllabus
- teachers' lack of confidence/expertise in their own language teaching.

Under morale, it is necessary to examine working conditions, housing, salaries:

i) **Working Conditions**

As already suggested, these are generally poor (lack of books, equipment, buildings in need of repair).

ii) **Housing**

A World Bank survey (1981) speaks of a lack of housing for secondary teachers. The 1982 Presidential Commission report calls for the provision of decent housing for teaching staff. It can be assumed, then, that existing housing is unsatisfactory.
Tanzania: Teachers and Teaching

h) (continued)

iii) Salaries

It has not been possible to obtain data on secondary teacher salaries, and in particular on the level of salaries in relation to GNP per capita. It is not possible, therefore, to conclude whether teachers are well paid in relation to comparable groups. (In 1974: a graduate secondary school teacher might expect a salary of 1420 T Shillings in his first job).

It seems likely, however, given the adverse economic conditions in Tanzania, the sharp fall in consumer purchasing power (Lloyds Bank Economic Report 1986) and recent freezes in public sector wages/salaries, that teachers' salaries are at a low level. Certainly, Cooksey & Ishumi (1986:38), Criper & Dodd (1984:27), Carr-Hill (1984) all cite low salaries as a possible factor contributing to generally low morale/motivation. Cooksey & Ishumi (1986:37) report an annual attrition rate of 10% among graduate teachers.

(i) TEACHER TRAINING

1. The Structure of Teacher Training

The majority of secondary school teachers are either diploma-holders or university graduates. They are trained in different ways.

Diploma Holders

These are Form 6 leavers who undergo two years' teacher-training in nine CNE Diploma colleges (two colleges Marangu and Changombe are English specialist colleges). The medium of training is English. All trainees must specialise in two subjects which they are then entitled to teach in Forms 1-4. Those following a specialist English option are selected for the course on the basis of their school examination results. The English proficiency of the English Diploma trainees is slightly higher than the average for Form 6 (Criper & Dodd 1984:15).

Graduates

The pattern of training at the University of Dar-es-Salaam, where graduate teachers are produced, is confused. Those students taking the BEd degree (qualifying them to teach in Forms 5/6) with English as one of their special subjects divide their time between two departments: the Department of Education which is responsible for training in methods/methodology and professional education topics, and the Department of Foreign Languages and Linguistics which is responsible for the content aspects of the students' major subject (ie. English linguistics). The BEd course as a
1. (continued)

whole lasts just over three years.

It should be noted that as far as teaching qualification in English is concerned, no distinction is made between a course in literature (run by a separate department) and a course in English language. Those students who opt for English literature (taught as an independent separate subject as a major/minor subject (along with a non-English teaching subject)) are considered to be qualified to teach English language at secondary school. A substantial proportion of those teaching English at school level, therefore, are in fact literature rather than language graduates.

One should also mention the existence within the Department of Foreign Languages and Linguistics of the Communication Skills Unit (CSU), established in 1978. This has primarily a remedial and compensatory function. It assesses the English proficiency of incomers to all Faculties and provides remedial English courses for those deemed to require such instruction.

2. Conditions in the Colleges (CNEs) and University

Conditions in the Diploma Colleges are again not very good (shortages of books, materials and practical facilities) but considerably better than in the Grade C colleges (see above).

Though conditions at the University are far from ideal, they are relatively privileged in comparison with those obtaining in some colleges and secondary schools.

It should be noted that students at university and colleges receive an allowance to cover basic living expenses.

3. The Teacher-Training Curriculum

Diploma Courses

There appears to be no uniform curriculum covering all colleges. For example, the syllabus for the English Diploma specialisation at the Dar-es-Salaam CNE (MNE 1976) differs from that at Marangu (MNE 1978).
Tanzania: Teachers and Teaching

(continued)

Hill (1979) reports that both the DSM and Marangu programmes distinguishes between language skills (proficiency) and professional skills (methodology), both of which feature in the curriculum. The Marangu syllabus, however, mentions intensive reading, library organisation and teaching practice as important components whilst the DSM syllabus does not. Both courses require trainees to familiarise themselves with the Handbook for Teachers of English (1973), the syllabus for secondary schools (1976) and the Primary School Syllabus (1976), (Hill 1979:389).

Criper & Dodd (1984:51) report that the syllabus for English specialist trainees (Marangu) is over-theoretical for their level. There is a substantial applied linguistics component, but this is not related closely to methodology. They also note the anomalous practice of teaching Form 6 leavers and experienced teachers on upgrading courses (ex-Grade A teachers) in the same way using the same syllabus.

Diploma students taking an English specialisation are theoretically supposed to spend 15 hours per week on the English option (they also study other subjects, eg. political education, general educational theory). However, Criper & Dodd (1984:56) report that at Marangu CNE a shortage of teachers has meant that the actual number of periods of English has fallen below the official number. They also point out that non-English specialists are being admitted to Marangu though it is supposedly a specialist college, and that English is not always used throughout the campus.

Diploma trainees not specialising in English receive no English tuition in college though they are expected to study their subjects through English. This contrasts with the situation at the University of DSM where students are given remedial instruction. Criper & Dodd (1984:51), therefore, recommend an initial three-month intensive English course for all diploma trainees, including English specialists.

Teaching Practice

All diploma trainees are required to undertake teaching practice. It has not been possible to find out for how long and in what conditions.
Examinations/Assessment

Trainees are evaluated on a continual assessment basis (assignments and term examinations) (50% of the overall evaluation), and through a final examination. In addition, grade letters are awarded in the assessment of teaching practice. Apparently, few trainees fail. The overall drop-out rate from Diploma courses is unknown.

University Courses

As previously mentioned, candidates for a Bed degree with an English subject specialisation divide their time between two (or three) departments: The Department of Education for methods training, the Department of Foreign Languages and Linguistics for content (English Linguistics), and a Literature Department for literature. There is, thus, an institutional separation of the teaching of methodology from the teaching of English language content (linguistics), and from the teaching of literature.

Criper & Dodd (1984:53) point out that the three-year course is crowded (four years crammed into three). Only 30 hours' methodology training per subject is catered for. The English Language Methods Course (two hours per week for 15 weeks), organised by the Department of Education, provides only thin coverage of teaching skills/principles.

As regards the content aspect, organised by the Department of Foreign Languages and Linguistics, courses are provided on structure and usage of English (4) (covering phonology, syntax and semantics), on applied linguistics (1), and on general linguistics (3) (covering structural, systemic and generative-transformational schools). The courses are not, however, designed with a pedagogical application in mind or a relationship to pedagogy evident (Criper & Dodd 1984:57).

Apart from (English) linguistics, courses are also run on literature by a separate department. Students who have taken a literature course are considered as qualified to teach English even if they have not followed courses in English language (and linguistics).

To remedy the above deficiencies, Criper & Dodd (1984:55) recommend a greater institutional integration of language and literature, and of methods with content under one department ('English Language and Literature in Education'). They also call for English specialists to take both English language and literature with no other combination permissible.
Finally, there should be greater emphasis in all courses on pedagogic application, on practical English language teaching methods and techniques.

Teaching Practice
All BEd candidates are required to undertake teaching practice in April/May at the end of years 1, 2 and 3. The Year 1 teaching practice takes place before the Year 2 Methods Course. The duration of teaching practice, conditions and details of supervision are unknown.

Examinations/Assessment
Students are evaluated through a combination of continuous assessment and examinations. The university itself takes responsibility for its examinations.

4. The Training Tutors
As previously indicated, there is little data available on the qualifications and quality of the tutors in CNE colleges at Diploma level. Criper & Dodd (1984:51) state the quality is mixed: some good, others of doubtful calibre. The quality of university tutors is again somewhat unclear. However, on the basis of their qualifications and publications, it seems safe to assume that it is satisfactory.

In-service Training
There is little evidence of the systematic provision of in-service training (both short and long courses) for either diploma or graduate teachers. There are very occasional short courses arranged on an 'ad-hoc' basis. Criper & Dodd (1984:56) state that there is a particular need for in-service methodology courses for literature graduates who have received no training in English language.

In addition to short methodology courses, they suggest (1984:56) that the university run six-month diploma/certificate courses for graduates in the 'Teaching of English as a Second or Foreign Language'.
Tanzania: Teachers and Teaching

k) Teacher Support Facilities: (Teacher Associations, Centres, Publications)

The 1982 Presidential Commission Report points out that there is at present no professional association of teachers in Tanzania. There are also very few subject associations/clubs either nationally or regionally. One English Language Teaching Association (DELTA) in Dodoma is reported. The others are defunct.

There are no indications of publications produced for or by English language teachers at secondary level. Similarly, there appears to be no regional or national conference. There are, however, quite a few publications on the subject of language and language medium produced by the university. How widely these circulate is unknown.

At primary level one teachers’ centre (Moshi) and a number of ‘academic centres’ have been established, mainly through local initiative. It is unclear whether such centres exist for secondary teachers. The 1982 Presidential Commission Report recommends the establishment of such centres following the model of Teachers’ Centres in England. These function as bases for in-service courses, as resource centres, and as neutral places for free discussion/exchange.

l) Overall Teacher Supply

The 1982 Presidential Commission Report mentions a 29.81% overall teacher shortage at secondary level.

A UNESCO 1981 report estimated that by 1985 (partly owing to the small secondary school sector) there could be a shortage of 700 teachers in mathematics and science subjects. The shortage of science and technical teachers is claimed to be more serious than in arts subjects. A high attrition rate among graduate mathematics/science teachers is noted.
Criper & Dodd (1984:26) in a survey of seven educational zones estimate an overall shortage of 52 English teachers. Some regions are particularly badly affected (eg. Mtwara and Mwanza 50% short; Iringa, Coast and Mara 30% short).

To alleviate these problems, they call for the better distribution of English teachers between regions and for the specialisation of qualified English teachers in English teaching alone. (Only 40% of teachers surveyed were found to be teaching English exclusively).

The low numbers of English teachers produced by the University of Dar-es-Salaam are also noted (four graduates in 1984, eight graduates in 1983). The numbers of graduates produced do not match those being lost to the profession. (Perhaps this situation testifies to the low popularity, status of English language teaching in the schools). Criper & Dodd (1984:55) call for an increase to around 30 in the numbers graduating as English majors each year.
Tanzania: Teachers and Teaching

Sources:


A.8 THE MATERIAL CONTEXT OF EDUCATION

Level 1 Schools

Level 2 Schools
1. **Level 1 (Primary) Schools: The Material Context**

   a) **School Buildings**
   
   The standard and condition of primary school buildings is reported to be generally very poor.

   The Primary School Sub-Sector Review (1981) reports that 77% of classroom buildings are of permanent materials and the remainder of basic, non-permanent materials.

   Only 21% of primary school staff live in staff houses. The majority of staff houses are shared quarters (a mean ratio of two teachers to a house: each teacher having one room).

   b) **Classroom Accommodation/Furnishing**

   Classroom accommodation is inadequate and under increasing strain following UPE (1978).

   The Primary School Sub-Sector Review (MNE 1981) estimates that schools provided 67% of classroom accommodation, leaving a shortfall of 33%. This meant, they note, that "... 33% of the pupils had to be taught in improvised shelters or in the open." (1981:15)

   In addition, many classrooms were noticeably incomplete. "The majority had no doors or windows, the walls were not plastered ..., the floor was not cemented and there was no ceiling." (1981:15).

   In Ulanga district, the DEO estimated that classroom conditions were bad in 35 schools and very bad in four schools out of a total of 79. (Carr-Hill 1984). Hygiene is also reported to be poor.

   Classroom furniture is also inadequate. The Primary School Sub-Sector Review (1981) reports a mean pupil:desk ratio of 3.7:1. In general, conditions are more difficult in lower grades.

   c) **Textbooks and Teaching Materials**

   In nearly all schools there is an acute and serious shortage of textbooks and teaching materials.
The Material Context of Education

(continued)

The Primary School Sub-Sector Review (1981) reports on pupils’ textbooks that ".... they are inadequate in all the subjects and in all the grades."

In the case of English, there is reported to be a pupil:textbook ratio in the lower grades of 2:1, and in the higher grades a ratio of 4:1. Criper & Dodd (1984) report in most schools a ratio of 2:1 for PET books, but "few of anything else". There are no supplementary materials.

As regards exercise books, each pupil used on average two exercise books per subject per year – an inadequate number.

In the case of teachers' guides, the Primary School Sub-Sector Review (MNE 1981) also reports an unsatisfactory situation in that ".... in nearly all the subjects, sharing of teachers' guides is inevitable." In English, there are typically three to four guides per five streams.

Other teaching equipment is technologically of the most basic kind. There are no audio-visual aids.

The distribution of educational materials (by Tanzania Elimu Supplies) is also reported to be very unequal and inefficient. Inequality between schools as regards the receipt of textbooks, exercise books and other materials is particularly marked (Gini coefficients as high as 0.8). Inefficiency of distribution may be attributed partly to transport problems and partly to poor management. The Sector Review (1981) recommends that ".... Tanzania Elimu Supplies .... make a thorough study of the school needs in terms of instructional materials and start working seriously on the priorities".
2. **Level 2 (Secondary) Schools: The Material Context**

a) **School Buildings**

Less data is available than for primary schools. However, it is known that the condition of school buildings/facilities is generally very poor. A World Bank-financed survey of secondary schools and TTCs found that "... all institutions are in urgent need of maintenance and repair; buildings as well as technical installations, furniture and equipment. Lack of funds, material and personnel has up till now hampered the planned maintenance activities (1981:5). The generally poor physical condition of schools and lack of teacher housing hamper quality improvement." (Ibid) (quoted in Cooksey & Ishumi 1986:38). US$ 6 million of a current World Bank education loan (1984:88) has been set aside for carrying out major repairs on 15 secondary schools.

b) **Classroom Accommodation/Furnishing**

Detailed figures/evidence is not available. It is known, however, that conditions are generally poor though not as severe as in primary schools.

c) **Textbooks and Teaching Materials**

There is evidently a serious shortage of textbooks/teaching materials in secondary schools. Referring to English, Criper & Dodd (1984:29) report that most schools "... do not possess any single textbook or supplementary textbook in sufficient quantities to issue to a class. In some instances a school may have a set of comprehension books or something similar (often too advanced) but usually copies are too limited and teachers have to use the blackboard for all presentation."

They also note that schools had none of the facilities assumed by the English syllabus: tape-recorders, tapes, class libraries and class readers.
c) (continued)

A 1981 survey, likewise, found "... acute shortages of textbooks (one set per four students), materials and library stock affect the quality of both public and private schools."

Detailed evidence on conditions in private schools is not available. However, it seems likely to be equally bad, perhaps worse in many instances (given the generally poorer results in private schools). In a few cases, where private schools (eg. Catholic seminaries) have access to external funds, supplies may, however, be better.

Distribution of education supplies is, as with primary schools, patchy, uneven and inefficient. A point of note here (acknowledged in the 1982 Presidential Commission Report) is the small amount of foreign exchange allocated to Tanzania Elimu Supplies for the import of textbooks/materials. A promise is made of greater foreign exchange allocations in future.

In considering material conditions in secondary schools, it is also necessary to reflect on the fact that expenditure on secondary education as a proportion of total expenditure has declined over recent years. In addition, it is reasonable to assume that some of the remaining allocation has been allocated to the very expensive programme of curriculum diversification and vocationalisation for the building/maintenance of technical workshops etc. (Omari 1984:3) reports that recurrent costs were a quarter greater for schools with biases than for traditional academic schools). Large amounts of foreign aid have been dedicated to the diversification (D&V) programme. Cooksey & Ishumi (1986:540 conclude that D&V "... can be written off as a .... (expensive) experiment which failed."
The Material Context of Education: Resources

Sources:


Control over the Curriculum

Agencies of Curriculum Development
The Machinery for Curriculum Development

1. Control over the Curriculum
In common with many other African countries, the Tanzanian education system is essentially a centralised one.

- the curriculum itself is decided centrally and follows the national philosophy/policy of education (ESR)
- syllabuses are developed centrally and implemented uniformly
- official time allocations for curricular subjects are determined centrally
- there is a system of centrally-devised national examinations
- inspectors and other educational administrators follow national guidelines and report ultimately to a central Ministry headquarters
- the administration of secondary, teacher and higher education is centralised. Primary education is partially decentralised in that some power devolves to Local Education Authorities though financial responsibility for primary schools is retained by the central government.

The 1982 Presidential Commission Report does, however, call for a small degree of decentralisation in respect of the following areas:

- heads of schools and colleges are to be authorised to take most day-to-day administrative decisions and to provide essential services to teachers and pupils
- they are to be authorised to recruit non-teaching staff
- they are to be authorised to deal with disciplinary matters affecting students and staff

Note: The administrative structure of education in Tanzania is shown in the diagram overleaf.
2. Agencies of Curriculum Development
The main agencies involved in curriculum development/implementation are the Inspectorate, the Institute for Education and the National Examinations Council. Lesser roles are played by the University, the CNE colleges and such bodies as the Swahili Council (Baraza la Kiswahili).

a) The Administrative/Organisational Structure of the Ministry of Education
The organisational structure of MNE is shown in the diagram below:

**Major Sections of Administrative Structure**

**MINISTRY OF NATIONAL EDUCATION—TANZANIA**

- **MINISTER**
  - **ADVISORY COMMITTEE TO THE MINISTER**
  - **DEPUTY MINISTER**
  - **PRINCIPAL SECRETARY**
  - **UNESCO NATIONAL COMMISSION SECRETARY**
  - **TANZANIA SLOHU SUPPLIES**
  - **UNIVERSITY OF DAR ES SALAAM**
  - **TANZANIA LIBRARY SERVICES**

- **CHIEF DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION COMMISSIONER**
  - **INSTITUTE OF ADULT EDUCATION DIRECTOR**
  - **INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION DIRECTOR**
  - **NATIONAL EXAMINATION BUREAUX DIRECTOR**
  - **INSPECTORATE DEPARTMENT CHIEF INSPECTOR**
  - **DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATIONAL PLANNING DIRECTOR**
  - **DEPARTMENT OF SECONDARY EDUCATION DIRECTOR**
  - **DEPARTMENT OF TECHNICAL EDUCATION COORDINATION DIRECTOR**
  - **DEPARTMENT OF HIGHER EDUCATION DIRECTOR**
  - **DEPARTMENT OF ADULT EDUCATION, DIRECTOR**
  - **DEPARTMENT OF TEACHER EDUCATION DIRECTOR**

Source: MNE (1980) - 'Basic Facts about Education in Tanzania'

*DSM*
The Machinery for Curriculum Development

a) (continued)
As can be seen in the diagram, there are essentially seven professional departments within the Ministry (the inspectorate, primary, secondary, technical, higher education, adult education and teacher education departments). Directors of the seven departments are responsible to the Commissioner of National Education who is in turn responsible to the Minister of National Education through the Principal Secretary.

b) The Inspectorate

i) Structure
Before 1977, school inspection was the function of each of the professional directorates of the MNE. This arrangement was unsatisfactory as directors had insufficient administrative time to give attention to inspectors' recommendations. Therefore, an Inspectorate Department was established under a Chief Inspector and a Deputy Chief Inspector for primary schools. The current structure (1982) is as follows:

- **At Ministry Level** (DSM): there is a chief inspector, a deputy chief inspector for primary education and a group of inspectors coordinating zonal inspection activities (including three English specialists).

- **At Zone Level**: Administratively, the country is divided into seven zones, each containing three regions (except Central Zone). These are as follows:

1. Southern Zone (Lindi, Mtware, Ruvuma)
2. Southern Highlands Zone (Iringa, Mbeya, Rukwa)
3. Central Zone (Dodoma and Singida)
4. Western Zone (Kigoma, Shinyanga, Tabora)
5. Eastern Zone (Dar-es-Salaam, Morogoro, Coast)
6. Northern Zone (Arusha, Kilimanjaro, Tanga)
7. Lake Zone (Mara, Mwanza, Kagera)

At zonal level there is a chief local inspector. Subject-specialist inspectors operate from zonal headquarters visiting all post-primary institutions.

- **At District Level**: Primary and adult education inspectors operate at district level. They are responsible to the chief local inspector of the zone who sends summaries of reports to the chief inspector in the Ministry.
The Machinery for Curriculum Development

ii) Functions:
The Inspectorate are officially charged with:

- evaluating the education system
- advising on the best ways of implementing education
- maintaining high standards of academic achievement

It has been pointed out (UNESCO 1981) that the role of inspector in Tanzania goes beyond that of the traditional conception. They have at various times been expected to act as field teacher-trainers and as monitors in long or short in-service courses.

Qualifications

- primary school inspectors must have five years' teaching experience and should have at least a Diploma in Education
- secondary/teacher education inspectors are required to be university graduates.

Inspectors are given a three-month initial training course in educational management, curriculum development and evaluation, and techniques of inspection.

In theory, each primary inspector is responsible for the inspection of 30 primary schools. Secondary/teacher education inspectors have an average of 156 streams to inspect. Schools are supposed to have one annual inspection.

iii) Supply

There is apparently a shortage of inspectors. In 1981 there were 277 primary inspectors as against a required number of 393 (an official inspector:teacher ratio of 1:203) giving a shortfall of 30%. Data on secondary school inspectors has not been traced.

iv) Problems

Criper & Dodd (1984:62) report that they were on the whole impressed by the knowledge and motivation of the inspectors they met.

Their potential has, however, been undermined by a lack of adequate transport and failures of communication. This has been a major handicap and in consequence many schools and teachers are not inspected. In fact, inspectors spend much of their time in their offices instead of touring schools.
b) (continued)
The 1982 Presidential Commission Report also mentions problems of a lack of staff houses, inadequacy of office space and shortages of office equipment. It calls for the better provision of the necessary facilities. It also recommends that:

- inspectors be given the authority to take ".... immediate steps to rectify irregularities .... they find during inspection tours ...."
- "school inspectors be given the opportunity to improve their academic knowledge and that they should return to school teaching after every 5 years of service." (1984:44)

c) The Institute of Education
The main responsibility for the development of primary school, secondary school and teacher education curricula falls to the Institute of Education. This is a parastatal body (established in 1964) which is located near the University of Dar-es-Salaam but is actually autonomous of it. Though falling under its overall supervision, the Institute is also semi-independent from the Ministry. It prepares materials and curricula and then submits them to Ministry officials for approval. Inspectors (or directors of education departments) may make suggestions on the revision of syllabuses to the Institute but they cannot force the Institute to give priority to the proposed changes.

Within the Institute itself, there are a number of resident curriculum developers for each subject. These have the power to convene subject panels composed of teachers, ministry officials and lecturers from CNEs and the university – who meet to discuss and devise syllabuses, textbooks and teachers’ guides.

Cripes & Dodd (1984:61) report that in 1984 there were three staff in the English section of the Institute – an inadequate number.
The Machinery for Curriculum Development

c) (continued)
Problems
Apart from inadequate staff, a major problem is the institutional separation of the Institute from the Ministry of Education. This inevitably impedes communication and cooperation (Criper & Dodd 1984:61). It also cuts the Institute off from the implementation machinery of the Ministry. The 1982 Presidential Commission Report mentions further problems: a general inadequacy of funds and facilities, and a shortage of trained and competent curriculum developers. It promises remedies in these areas. The Report also renames the Institute - the 'Institute of Curriculum Development' (ICD). The ICD is recognised as the sole agency "... empowered by law to develop, test and revise the curricula for Nursery, Primary and Secondary Schools." (1984:19)
No mention is made, however, of the institutional links between the ICD and the Ministry.

d) The National Examination Council
Because examinations have such a powerful influence on the curriculum, the National Examinations Council is an important curriculum development/implementation agency. Established in 1971 (replacing the former East African Examining Board) the National Examination Council has responsibility for public examinations at primary and secondary school and in teachers' colleges. (The university and some colleges examine autonomously). It sets and marks all subject examinations and awards certificates (graded into divisions 1-4 at Form 4 and Form 6 level). Recently, the Examinations Council has assumed greater centralised control over the administration and marking of the PSLE (Primary School Leaving Examination) in order to reduce the corrupt practices that became evident when control over the examination was somewhat decentralised.
d) (continued)
At present the National Examinations Council is part of the administrative structure of the MNE but it does not have the same status as, nor is it integrated with, other directorates of education. Again this inhibits collaboration and impedes better curriculum development. As Criper & Dodd (1984:62) point out, "... A closer integration would assist in the interchange of staff and greater collaboration in the design of examination syllabuses."

The 1982 Presidential Commission Report does, however, recommend an upgrading of the status of the Tanzania Examinations Council.
As regards examinations in English, Criper & Dodd (1984:62) point to a lack of expertise. The technical quality of test items is poor as is the design of papers. There are errors of English in the examination papers. Also there is a mismatch between the level of the papers and the level of pupils. In 1984 there was only one subject officer for English. Criper & Dodd (1984) recommend an increase in the testing expertise available to the Ministry, and also an abolition of continuous assessment in English, a system which is subject to abuse.

e) Other Agencies
The Institute of Education, the Inspectorate and the Examinations Council are the main agencies involved in curriculum development/implementation work, but there are other bodies which play a lesser part.
The University (Departments of Education, and Languages and Linguistics) conducts and publishes research on language and language education issues. It provides specialist advice to the Institute and Ministry.
The Teachers' Colleges (CNEs) are involved in testing and modifying materials produced by the Institute. They are also involved in pre-service training of teachers in new materials and in some in-service training.
The Machinery for Curriculum Development

Sources:


References and Sources


